



THE OXFORD HISTORY OF ANGLICANISM

VOLUME V

Global Anglicanism, c.1910–2000

EDITED BY
WILLIAM L. SACHS

THE OXFORD HISTORY OF ANGLICANISM

General Editor: Rowan Strong

The Oxford History of Anglicanism, Volume I

Reformation and Identity, c.1520–1662

Edited by Anthony Milton

The Oxford History of Anglicanism, Volume II

Establishment and Empire, 1662–1829

Edited by Jeremy Gregory

The Oxford History of Anglicanism, Volume III

Partisan Anglicanism and its Global Expansion, 1829–c.1914

Edited by Rowan Strong

The Oxford History of Anglicanism, Volume IV

Global Western Anglicanism, c.1910–present

Edited by Jeremy Morris

The Oxford History of Anglicanism, Volume V

Global Anglicanism, c.1910–2000

Edited by William L. Sachs

The Oxford History of Anglicanism, Volume V

Global Anglicanism, c.1910–2000

Edited by
WILLIAM L. SACHS

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

OXFORD

UNIVERSITY PRESS

Great Clarendon Street, Oxford, OX2 6DP,
United Kingdom

Oxford University Press is a department of the University of Oxford.
It furthers the University's objective of excellence in research, scholarship,
and education by publishing worldwide. Oxford is a registered trade mark of
Oxford University Press in the UK and in certain other countries

© Oxford University Press 2018

The moral rights of the authors have been asserted

First Edition published in 2018

Impression: 1

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in
a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, without the
prior permission in writing of Oxford University Press, or as expressly permitted
by law, by licence or under terms agreed with the appropriate reprographics
rights organization. Enquiries concerning reproduction outside the scope of the
above should be sent to the Rights Department, Oxford University Press, at the
address above

You must not circulate this work in any other form
and you must impose this same condition on any acquirer

Published in the United States of America by Oxford University Press
198 Madison Avenue, New York, NY 10016, United States of America

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data

Data available

Library of Congress Control Number: 2017940872

ISBN 978-0-19-964301-1

Printed and bound by
CPI Group (UK) Ltd, Croydon, CR0 4YY

Links to third party websites are provided by Oxford in good faith and
for information only. Oxford disclaims any responsibility for the materials
contained in any third party website referenced in this work.

Acknowledgements

Over the course of the lengthy and complex writing and editing process this volume represents, unforeseen benefits have appeared. The various authors became friends as well as colleagues, especially those who live in some proximity. Their perspectives on Anglicanism and its history broadened the editor's perspective, as they will expand readers' outlooks. St. Stephen's Church in Richmond, Virginia has been both a place to serve and a source of lively faith community for much of the past three decades. It embodies the local, contextual emphasis that Anglicans prize. I am also grateful for the resources of Virginia Theological Seminary, a reliably two-hour drive away. Its excellent library is matched by the welcome of faculty and students. Ian Markham, president, and Barney Hawkins, vice-president, have been especially encouraging in several initiatives. I also join the other editors of *The Oxford History of Anglicanism* in appreciation for the general editor, Rowan Strong, whose vision and persistence brought these volumes to fruition. Throughout he has been friend and colleague. His efforts to assess Anglicanism's history have embodied the ideal of my doctoral alma mater, the University of Chicago: *crescat scientia; vita excolatur*.

William L. Sachs

Contents

<i>List of Contributors</i>	ix
<i>Series Introduction</i>	xv
Introduction: A Century of Anglican Transition <i>William L. Sachs</i>	1
PART I. THE GROWTH OF GLOBAL ANGLICANISM	
1. The Dialectics of Empire, Race, and Diocese <i>Jeffrey Cox</i>	25
2. Anglicanism in Oceania since 1914 <i>Michael Gladwin</i>	50
3. Anglican Inter-Faith Relations from 1910 to the Twenty-First Century <i>Paul Hedges</i>	76
4. Latin American Anglicanism in the Twentieth Century <i>John L. Kater</i>	98
5. Anglicanism in West Africa <i>Femi James Kolapo</i>	124
6. The Vicissitudes of Anglicanism in China, 1912–Present <i>Philip L. Wickeri</i>	148
PART II. BUILDING THE CHURCH CULTURALLY	
7. The Cultural Origins of the Anglican Church in Kenya <i>John Karanja</i>	171
8. Anglicans in the Horn of Africa: From Missionaries and Chaplains to a Missionary Church <i>Grant LeMarquand</i>	196
9. The East African Revival <i>Derek R. Peterson</i>	211
10. Anglican Mission in Twentieth-Century Africa <i>Elizabeth E. Prevost</i>	232

11. Anglican Liturgical Developments in New Contexts: The Challenges of Inculturation <i>Louis Weil</i>	258
12. An Exilic Church: The Episcopal Church of South Sudan and Sudan, 1899–2014 <i>Jesse A. Zink</i>	276
PART III. CONTEXTUAL AND RELIGIOUS CHALLENGES	
13. Relations between the Churches of the Anglican Communion and the Churches of Eastern Christianity <i>Peter Eaton</i>	301
14. Anglicanism in Southern Africa during the Twentieth Century <i>Robert S. Heaney</i>	321
15. Anglican Schools in Muslim-Majority Societies, 1910–2010 <i>Richard J. Jones</i>	345
16. Anglican Mission amongst Muslims, 1900–1940 <i>Catriona Laing</i>	367
17. Witness, Advocacy, and Union: Anglicanism’s Twentieth-Century Contribution to Minority Christianity in South Asia <i>Titus Presler</i>	391
18. Anglican Social Ministries in East Asia <i>John Y. H. Yieh</i>	417
<i>Index</i>	439

List of Contributors

Jeffrey Cox is Professor of History at the University of Iowa. His publications include *The English Churches in a Secular Society: Lambeth, 1870–1930* (Oxford, 1982), *Imperial Fault Lines: Christianity and Colonial Power in India, 1818–1940* (Stanford, CA, 2002), and *The British Missionary Enterprise since 1700* (New York and London, 2008). He is currently at work on a book entitled *The Age of Liberal Religion*.

Peter Eaton has been involved in ecumenical relations since his student days, and throughout his ordained life has been particularly committed to dialogue between the Anglican Communion and the Churches of the Christian East. He was a contributor to *The Oxford Dictionary of the Christian Church* (3rd edn., Oxford, 1997), and to *Feasting on the Word* (Louisville, KY, 2009) and *Feasting on the Gospels* (Louisville, KY, 2015). He was a member of the Standing Commission on Ecumenical and Inter-Religious Relations of the Episcopal Church from 2009 to 2015, and is currently engaged in research on the first three phases of Anglican–Orthodox dialogue. He has been the Bishop of Southeast Florida (TEC) since January 2015.

Michael Gladwin is Lecturer in History at St Mark’s National Theological Centre, Charles Sturt University, Canberra. A graduate of the Australian National University and the University of Cambridge, he has written widely on the religious and cultural history of Australia and the British world, as well as the relationship between religion and war in Australian history. He is the author of *Anglican Clergy in Australia, 1788–1850: Building a British World* (London, 2015) and *Captains of the Soul: A History of Australian Army Chaplains* (Newport, NSW, 2013).

Robert S. Heaney is Associate Professor of Christian Mission and Director of the Center for Anglican Communion Studies, Virginia Theological Seminary, USA. He holds a PhD in Philosophical Theology from the Milltown Institute of Theology and Philosophy, Dublin and a DPhil in Theology from the University of Oxford. Previously, he was Senior Lecturer in the School of Theology and Religion and Director of Postgraduate Studies and Research at St John’s University of Tanzania. As well as numerous articles and contributions to books, he is the author of *From Historical to Critical Post-Colonial Theology* (Eugene, OR, 2015) and chief editor of *Faithful Neighbors: Christian–Muslim Vision and Practice* (New York, 2016).

Paul Hedges is Associate Professor in Interreligious Studies at the Studies in Interreligious Relations in Plural Societies Programme, S. Rajaratnam School of International Studies, Nanyang Technological University, Singapore. He has previously worked for other British, Canadian, and Chinese universities. He has published ten books and well over fifty academic papers. Recent books include *Towards Better Disagreement: Religion and Atheism in Dialogue* (London, 2017), *Twenty-First Century Theologies of Religions* (co-edited, Leiden, 2016), and *Contemporary Muslim-Christian Encounters* (edited, London, 2015).

Richard J. Jones is the retired Professor of Mission & World Religions at Virginia Theological Seminary, Alexandria, Virginia, USA and retired Taha Jabir al-Alwani Chair of Muslim-Christian Studies in the Washington Theological Consortium. A native of Washington, DC, he studied at Oberlin College and the University of Toronto. He served in Ecuador from 1972 to 1975 as an ordained missionary of the Episcopal Church in the USA. He is the author of *How to Talk With Your Muslim Neighbor* (Cincinnati, OH, 1997) and an article on Wilfred Cantwell Smith in the *Biographical Dictionary of Christian Missions* (ed. Gerald H. Anderson, Grand Rapids, MI, 1999).

John Karanja is an ordained priest of the Anglican Church of Kenya. He is currently Professor of Church History and African Studies at Trinity Lutheran Seminary in Columbus, Ohio, USA. His publications include *Founding an African Faith* (Nairobi, 1999), 'Evangelical Attitudes toward Democracy in Kenya', in *Evangelical Christianity and Democracy in Africa* (Oxford, 2008), and 'Confession and Cultural Dynamism in The East African Revival', in *The East African Revival: History and Legacies* (New York, 2012).

John L. Kater, a priest of the Episcopal Church, is a graduate of Columbia University, the General Theological Seminary in New York City, and McGill University in Montreal, Quebec, Canada. He has worked as a parish priest in the USA, Canada, and Panama, and served as the Education Officer for the Diocese of Panama from 1984 to 1990. He has served as Visiting Professor of Anglican Studies at Sungkonghoe University in Seoul, Korea and for ten years at Ming Hua Theological College in Hong Kong. His publications include *Christians on the Right: The Moral Majority in Perspective* (New York, 1982), *A Faith for Teenagers: Making Sense of Life* (Cambridge, MA, 1987), and *Finding Our Way: American Christians in Search of the City of God* (Cambridge, MA, 1991).

Femi James Kolapo is Associate Professor of African History at the University of Guelph, Ontario, Canada. He received his Master's and doctoral degrees in history respectively from the Ahmadu Bello University, Zaria and York

University, Toronto, Canada. He has previously taught as an assistant lecturer at the Ahmadu Bello University, Zaria, Nigeria. He is currently finalizing a study on the religious interaction between Nigerian peoples and the Church Missionary Society's all-African-run mission at Gbebe and Lokoja on the confluence of the rivers Niger and Benue in Nigeria. His publications include *The Journals of Church Missionary Society Agent, James Thomas, in Mid-Nineteenth Century Nigeria* (Lewiston, NY, 2012), *Immigrant Academics and Cultural Challenges in a Global Environment* (Amherst, NY, 2009), *The Aftermath of Slavery: Transitions and Transformations in Southeastern Nigeria* (Trenton, NJ, 2007, edited with Chima Korieh), and *African Agency and European Colonialism: Latitudes of Negotiations and Containment* (Lanham, MD, 2007, edited with Kwabena Akurang-Parry).

Catriona Laing is Associate Rector at Church of the Epiphany, Washington, DC. Prior to ordination in the Church of England, she worked as Project Manager for the Cambridge Interfaith Programme at the University of Cambridge. Her academic work is in the field of Muslim-Christian relations and the history of Christian mission in the Muslim world, with a focus on prayer.

Grant LeMarquand, born in 1954 in Montreal, Canada, is a graduate of McGill University and Montreal Diocesan Theological College. He was ordained deacon (1983) and priest (1984) in the Anglican Church of Canada, the Diocese of Montreal. He taught biblical studies and theology at St Paul's United Theological College, Limuru, Kenya from 1987 to 1989 before doing doctoral work in New Testament studies at Wycliffe College in the University of Toronto, where he also taught homiletics and mission. In 1998 he moved to Pittsburgh in the USA where he was Professor of Biblical Studies and Mission. In 2012 he was consecrated bishop to serve as the Area Bishop for the Horn of Africa within the Diocese of Egypt with North Africa and the Horn of Africa and now lives in Gambella, Ethiopia. For many years he served as the International Editor for the journal *Anglican and Episcopal History*. He is the author/editor of four books and numerous articles in biblical studies, mission, and African church history. He is married to Wendy LeMarquand, a family physician. They have two children and one grandchild.

Derek R. Peterson is Professor of African History at the University of Michigan. His most recent book, *Ethnic Patriotism and the East African Revival: A History of Dissent* (Cambridge, 2012) won the Herskovits Prize of the African Studies Association and the Martin Klein Prize of the American Historical Association. He is the editor or co-editor of seven books, most recently *African Print Cultures: Newspapers and their Publics in Modern Africa* (Ann Arbor, MI, 2016, with S. Newell and E. Hunter). In 2016 he was elected

Fellow of the British Academy and awarded a Guggenheim Fellowship in African Studies. He is currently writing a book about Idi Amin.

Titus Presler is a priest of the Episcopal Church USA and principal-in-exile of Edwardes College in Peshawar, Pakistan. He has served as academic dean at General Seminary and president of the Seminary of the Southwest, and has taught at Episcopal Divinity School and Harvard Divinity School. He has mission experience in India, Zimbabwe, and Pakistan and chaired the Episcopal Church's Standing Commission on World Mission. His publications include *Transfigured Night: Mission and Culture in Zimbabwe's Vigil Movement* (Pretoria, 1999), *Horizons of Mission* (Cambridge, 2001), and *Going Global with God: Reconciling Mission in a World of Difference* (New York, 2010).

Elizabeth E. Prevost holds a PhD from Northwestern University and is currently Associate Professor of History at Grinnell College, where she teaches British and African history. Her research interests include gender and feminism, mission Christianity, imperial knowledge production, and decolonization. She is the author of *The Communion of Women: Missions and Gender in Colonial Africa and the British Metropole* (Oxford, 2010), and her work has also appeared in the *Journal of British Studies*, the *Journal of Modern History*, the *Journal of Imperial and Commonwealth History*, *History Compass*, and various edited collections. Currently she is working on a new project about Agatha Christie and imperial readership.

William L. Sachs is a teacher, writer, and Episcopal priest. He has served churches and taught in seminaries and colleges in Virginia, Connecticut, and Chicago. He is the author of seven books including *The Transformation of Anglicanism* (Cambridge, 1993, 2002) and *Homosexuality and the Crisis of Anglicanism* (Cambridge, 2009, 2014). He is also the author of over 200 articles, reviews, editorials, and book chapters. He lives in Richmond, Virginia.

Louis Weil is the Hodges-Haynes Professor Emeritus of Liturgics at the Church Divinity School of the Pacific, where he began teaching in 1988. Prior to that, he taught for seventeen years at Nashotah House in Wisconsin. He is a priest of the Episcopal Diocese of California. In the field of liturgical studies, Weil's published books include: *Liturgy for Living*, co-authored with the late Charles P. Price (New York, 1979; revised second edition, Harrisburg, PA, 2000; third edition in process), *Sacraments and Liturgy: The Outward Signs* (Oxford, 1983), *Gathered to Pray* (Cambridge, MA, 1986; second edition in process), and *A Theology of Worship* (Cambridge, MA, 2001). His most recent book, *Liturgical Sense*, was published by Church Publishing in 2013. In 2013, at its meeting in Montreal, the North American Academy of Liturgy named Weil the recipient of its Berakah Award for his contributions to liturgical studies both within the Anglican Communion and ecumenically.

Professor Weil is a founding member of *Societas Liturgica* (1969), of the North American Academy of Liturgy (1973), and of the International Anglican Liturgical Consultation (1989). He served on the Board of Examining Chaplains for six years (1982–8), and has served for four terms on the Standing Liturgical Commission beginning in 1985.

Philip L. Wickeri is Advisor to the Archbishop on Historical and Theological Studies, Anglican Diocese of Hong Kong, and Professor of the History of Christianity at Ming Hua Theological College.

John Y. H. Yieh is The Molly Laird Downs Professor of New Testament at Virginia Theological Seminary in Alexandria, VA, USA. He earned his PhD in Religious Studies from Yale University and has previously taught at Bangor Theological Seminary and Andover Newton Theological School. Among his published books are *One Teacher: Jesus' Teaching Role in Matthew's Gospel Report* (Berlin, 2004), *Conversations with Scripture: The Gospel of Matthew* (New York, 2012), and *The Sermon on the Mount: New Covenant and History of Effects* (in Chinese; Hong Kong, 2015). He has also published several articles on the history and hermeneutics of Chinese biblical interpretation.

Jesse A. Zink is a priest in the Episcopal Diocese of Western Massachusetts and principal of Montreal Diocesan Theological College. A former missionary in South Africa, he is the author of *Grace at the Garbage Dump* (Eugene, OR, 2012), *Backpacking through the Anglican Communion* (Harrisburg, PA, 2014), and a forthcoming book entitled *Christianity and Catastrophe: Sudan's Civil Wars and Religious Change among the Dinka* (Waco, TX, 2018).

Series Introduction

Rowan Strong

Even Henry VIII at his autocratic best could hardly have imagined that his Church of England would, nearly five centuries after he had replaced papal authority with his own, become a global Christian communion encompassing people and languages far beyond the English. Formally, Henry asserted his royal power over the national Church on a more global scale—on the imperial theory that ‘this realm of England is an empire’ asserted the Act in Restraint of Appeals (to Rome) in 1533. Yet this was sixteenth-century imperial theory serving a national end. England was an empire and therefore King Henry was an emperor, that is, a ruler who was the paramount earthly authority and consequently superior to the papacy. So Henry’s Church of England was always a national project, meant first and foremost to be the Church of the English—all the English—who would, if necessary, be compelled to come in. That national politico-religious agenda—a Church of all the English with the monarchy as its supreme head—formed the thrust of the policy of all but one of the succeeding Tudor monarchs. However, that royal agenda of the inclusion of all the English lay at the heart of the problem of this national ecclesiastical project.

At no time since Henry VIII ushered in his religious revolution did all the English wish to be part of this Church of England, though for over two centuries the monarchy and the English ruling classes attempted to encourage, cajole, or compel everyone in England to at least attend their parish church on Sunday. In Henry’s reign, religious dissent from this monarchical Church was disparate and small, partly because Henry ensured it was dangerous. So some advanced Evangelicals (as early Protestants were called), such as Robert Barnes and William Tyndale, were executed by the regime in the early years of the religious revolution. Later, some prominent conservatives influenced by Catholic reform, such as Bishop John Fisher, Sir Thomas More, and some members of particular observant religious orders, followed their Evangelical enemies to the scaffold or the block. As the Protestant Reformation unfolded, and Catholic reform began to gather definition, from the reign of Edward VI onwards, those among the English who dissented from, or who were dissatisfied with, this national Church began to increase in numbers. Even those within it argued among themselves as to what the Church of England stood for.

Consequently, the Church of England, and its later global Anglican expansion, was always a contested identity throughout its history. It was contested

both by its own adherents and by its leadership. This series looks at the history of that contestation and how it contributed to an evolving religious identity eventually known as Anglican. The major question it seeks to address is: what were the characteristics, carriers, shapers, and expressions of an Anglican identity in the various historical periods and geographic locations investigated by the volumes in the series? The series proposes that Anglicanism was not a version of Christianity that emerged entire and distinct by the end of the so-called Elizabethan Settlement. Rather, the disputed and developing identity of the Church developed from Henry VIII's religious revolution began to be worked out in the various countries of the British Isles from the early sixteenth century, went into a transatlantic environment in the seventeenth century, and then evolved in an increasing global context from the eighteenth century onwards. The series proposes that the answer to 'what is an Anglican?' was always debated. Moreover, Anglican identity over time experienced change and contradiction as well as continuities. Carriers of this developing identity included formal ecclesiastical dimensions such as clergy, Prayer Books, theology, universities, and theological colleges. Also among such formal carriers of Anglican identity was the English (then the British) state, so this series also investigates ways in which that state connection influenced Anglicanism. But the evolution of Anglicanism was also maintained, changed, and expressed in various cultural dimensions, such as architecture, art, and music. In addition, the series pays attention to how Anglicanism interacted with national identities, helping to form some, and being shaped itself by others. Each volume in the series devotes some explicit attention to these formal dimensions, by setting out the various Anglican identities expressed in their historical periods by theology, liturgy, architecture, religious experience and the practice of piety, and its interactions with wider society and politics.

A word needs to be said about the use of the term 'Anglicanism' to cover a religious identity whose origins lie in the sixteenth century when the name was not known. While recognizing the anachronism of the term Anglicanism, it is the 'least-worst' appellation to describe this religious phenomenon throughout the centuries of its existence. It is a fallacy that there was no use of the term Anglicanism to describe the Church of England and its global offshoots before John Henry Newman and the Oxford Movement in the 1830s. Newman and his Tractarian *confreres* certainly gave wider publicity to the name by using it to describe the separate Catholic culture of their Church. However, its usage predates the Tractarians because French Catholic writers were using it in the eighteenth century. It has become acceptable scholarly usage to describe this version of Christianity for the centuries prior to the nineteenth, notwithstanding its admittedly anachronistic nature.¹ Into the nineteenth century

¹ John Spurr, *The Restoration Church of England* (New Haven, CT, 1991), pp. xiii–xiv; John Walsh, Colin Haydon, and Stephen Taylor (eds.), *The Church of England c.1689–c.1833*

contemporaries used the terms ‘Church of England’ or ‘Churchmen’ to encompass their Church, even in countries and colonies beyond England. However, these names are not acceptable or understood today with their formerly inclusive meaning. The latter is objectionable on gender terms; and the former, while used by Anglicans in a variety of different lands and cultures, only leads to confusion when addressing the Church of England beyond England itself. Consequently, it has long been recognized in the scholarly literature that there is a need for some term that enshrines both the Church of England in England, its presence beyond that nation, and for that denomination over its entire historical existence. The most commonly adopted term is Anglicanism, and has been used by a number of recent scholars for periods prior to the nineteenth century.² A less Anglo-centric term—‘Episcopal’ or ‘Episcopalianism’—is widely used in some parts of the world for the same ecclesiastical phenomenon—Scotland, North America, and Brazil. However, that term does not figure as widely as Anglican or Anglicanism in the historical literature, so it is the predominant usage in this series.

Consequently, Anglicanism is understood in this series as originating as a mixed and ambiguous ecclesiastical identity, largely as a result of its foundation by the Tudor monarchs of the sixteenth century who were determined to embrace the whole of the English nation within their national Church. It is, consequently, a religious community that brings together aspects of ecclesiastical identity that other Western Churches have separated. From an English Church that was predominantly Reformed Protestant in the sixteenth century, emerging Anglicanism developed a liturgical and episcopal identity alongside its Protestant emphasis on the Bible as the sole criterion for religious truth. The series therefore views Anglicanism as a Church in tension. Developing within Anglicanism over centuries was a creative but also divisive tension between Protestantism and Catholicism, between the Bible and tradition, between the Christian past and contemporary thought and society, that has meant Anglicanism has not only been a contested, but also at times an inconsistent Christian identity.

Within England itself, the Tudor project of a Church for the English nation became increasingly unrealistic as that Church encompassed people who were not English, or people who thought of themselves less as English than as different nationalities. But it has proved to have a surprisingly long life for the English themselves. The series demonstrates various ways in which the

(Cambridge, 1993), ch. 1; J. C. D. Clark, *English Society 1660–1832* (Cambridge, 2000 edn.), p. 256; Nigel Voak, *Richard Hooker, and Reformed Theology: A Study of Reason, Will, and Grace* (Oxford, 2003), pp. 1–5; Patricia U. Bonomi, *Under the Cope of Heaven: Religion, Society, and Politics in Colonial America* (Oxford, 2003 edn.), pp. 40–61.

² John Frederick Woolverton, *Colonial Anglicanism in North America* (Detroit, 1984); Thomas Bartlett, ‘Ireland and the British Empire’, in P. J. Marshall (ed.), *The Oxford History of the British Empire: The Eighteenth Century* (Oxford, 1998), p. 270.

Church over the centuries attempted to enforce, encourage, or cling to its national identity in England, with some degree of success, not least in retaining an enduring cultural appeal for some English who were only loosely connected to its institutional life, or barely to its theological or religious claims. Even today English cathedrals often attract audiences to daily Evensong that otherwise would not be there.

But for those in England and beyond for whom their Church was more central, contestation, and the evolution of identity it prompted, was probably inevitable in a Church that, after its first two supreme heads, was deliberately re-founded by Elizabeth I to be ambiguous enough in certain key areas to give a Church for all the English a pragmatic chance of being accomplished. But this was a loaded gun. A basically Protestant Church, aligned with the Swiss Reformation, but with sufficient traditional aspects to irritate convinced Protestants at home (though less so major European Reformers); but insufficiently Catholic to pull in reformed Catholics for whom papal authority was non-negotiable, simply pleased no one for quite a while. It was neither Catholic fish nor properly Protestant fowl, at least according to those English that wanted the Church of England to conform completely to the worship and polity of Geneva, by the later sixteenth century the pre-eminent centre of international Protestantism. Even Elizabeth's bishops were not entirely comfortable with the Church they led, and some of them tried to push the boundaries towards a properly Reformed Church modelled on that of the New Testament. Until, that is, they realized Elizabeth was having none of it, and made it clear she would not deviate beyond the Church and worship enacted by Parliament in 1558–9. In her mind, though probably in no one else's, those years constituted 'the settlement' of religion. When her archbishop of Canterbury, Edmund Grindal, refused to suppress the so-called 'prophesyings' of local clergy meeting for what would now be termed professional development, the queen simply suspended him for the rest of his life and put his functions into the hands of an appointed committee. Royal Supremacy was an undoubted component of the Church of England's identity, and Elizabeth and her successors for many years were not about to let anyone forget it, be they bishops or religiously-interfering Members of Parliament.

The fact that Elizabeth emulated the long reigns of her father and grandfather, and not the short ones of her half brother and half sister, meant that her Church of England had time to put down local roots, notwithstanding the 'Anglican' puritans who sought to remake it in Geneva's image; or the zealous Catholic mission priests who hoped to dismantle it by taking Catholics out of it completely.

Where the English went their Church was bound to follow, though this intensified the unhappy situation of Ireland where the English had for centuries sought political domination undergirded by settlement. The consequence of legally establishing a Protestant Church of Ireland was to add

religious difference to the centuries-old colonial condition of that island, whose Gaelic-speaking population remained stubbornly Catholic, in part because the Catholic Church was not English. Generally, the Irish wanted no part of this Church, aside from a small percentage of Irish who stood to gain from alliance with the prevailing Protestant power.

The following century saw the contest for the Church of England become more militant and polarized, until the English went to war to settle the issue among themselves. Perhaps the most surprising development was the emergence of a group of Anglicans who began to publicly advocate for the conservative aspects of the Church of England, a group that coalesced and became another sort of Anglican to the usual sort of Calvinist. This new variety of Anglican was particularly encouraged by specific royal patronage under the first two Stuart kings, James I and Charles I. These new contestants for the identity of the Church have been called by various names—Arminians, Laudians, avant-garde conformists—partly because they were not tightly defined but represented various agendas. Some sought, with the support of Charles I (the first Supreme Governor to be born into the Church of England), to bolster the independence and wealth of the Church; others, to oppose the Church's Calvinist theology and particularly the doctrine of predestination; others, to redress the lack of attention given to the sacraments and sacramental grace compared with the fervour for preaching among the more devout. But all were more or less agreed that the worship of the Church and the performance of the liturgy were woeful and needed to be better ordered, and churches should be more beautiful as aids to devotion and the fundamental significance of the sacraments.

But whether their agenda was liturgical, theological, or sacramental, to their puritan opponents this new Anglicanism looked like Catholicism, and that was the Antichrist from whose idolatrous and superstitious clutches the Protestant Reformation had released the English into true Christianity. They were not prepared to hand over the Church of England to a Catholic fifth-column. But while James I was cautious in his support for these avant-garde Anglicans, liking their support for divine-right monarchy but not their anti-Calvinism, his aesthetic, devout, and imperious son was markedly less so. The religious ball was in the royal court, particularly when Charles pulled off, in the 1630s, a decade of ruling without calling a Parliament, thereby silencing that body's uncomfortable and intolerable demands for royal accountability and religious reform.

The export in 1637 of Charles's particular version of the Church of England to his other kingdom of Scotland, in the form of a Scottish Prayer Book, not only stoked the fires of Scottish Presbyterian nationalism, but also released the pent-up energies of those within the Church of England who wanted an end to what they saw as royal absolutism and religious renovation by would-be papists. The rapid result of this intensification of political and religious

contestation was the outbreak in 1642 of years of civil war in the royal Supreme Governor's three kingdoms. The internal Anglican quarrel, part of wider political differences, ended with the demise of the revolution begun by Henry VIII—the legal abolition of the Church of England, sealed in 1645 in the blood of the beheaded archbishop of Canterbury, William Laud; and followed by that of his Church's head, Charles I, in 1649. For the first time in its legal existence the Church of England (and the Church of Ireland) no longer officially existed.

Then an unexpected thing happened—some people continued to worship and practise their devotional lives according to the use of the defunct Church of England, demonstrating that its identity, though contested, was by this time a genuine reality in the lives of at least some of the English. They did this despite it being illegal, though the republican regime under Oliver Cromwell was not particularly zealous in its proscription of such activities. However, the diarist John Evelyn was present one Christmas Day when a covert congregation in London was dispersed by soldiers while keeping the holy day (proscribed by the regime) by gathering for Holy Communion according to the Book of Common Prayer.³ Evelyn and others worshipped this way, and numbers of clergy used as much of the Prayer Book as they could in the parishes, notwithstanding that their leaders, the bishops, did little to set an example or to ensure the continuation of their illegal order. Anglican identity through worship and the ordering of the week and the year according to the Prayer Book and the Calendar of the Church of England was now being maintained, not by the state, but at the clerical and lay grassroots.

When Charles II landed in Dover in 1660 as the recognized king of England, after the rapid demise of the republican regime with its non-episcopal quasi-congregationalist Church following the death in 1658 of Lord Protector Oliver Cromwell, one outcome was the restoration of the legal monopoly of the Church of England. What that legal restoration did not do was to restore the spirituality, devotion, practice, and belief of the Church of England, because these had been ongoing in the period of the Church's official demise. Nevertheless, the legislation that brought back the establishment of the Church of England did newly define some ingredients of Anglican identity.

Before the Commonwealth the Church of England had not made ordination by bishops a non-negotiable aspect of Anglicanism. While it was certainly normal, there were exceptions made for some ministers who had been ordained in non-episcopal Churches elsewhere to minister in the Church of England without re-ordination. Now all clergy in the Church had to be episcopally ordained, with the sole exception of those clergy who came from Churches with a long historic tradition of episcopacy—the Roman Catholic,

³ William Bray (ed.), *Diary and Correspondence of John Evelyn FRS* (1878, 4 vols.), I, p. 341 (25 Dec. 1657).

Orthodox, and the Church of Sweden. So from 1660 episcopacy became a basic characteristic of Anglicanism. The result was the expulsion of hundreds of clergy who would not conform to the requirement and to that of using only the Book of Common Prayer in worship. These dissenting clergy and laity, most of whom came from the previous Calvinist and puritan groups, now became permanent Nonconformists outside the Church of England. In 1662 a slightly revised Book of Common Prayer was passed by Parliament as the only authorized liturgy for the Church therefore reinforcing liturgical worship as a fundamental criterion of Anglican identity. Parliament again passed an Act of Uniformity and various other acts against Nonconformist worship. Uniformity was restored as an aspect of Anglicanism. So also was the royal supremacy.

However, while episcopacy has remained virtually unquestioned, and uniform liturgical worship remained uncontested within Anglicanism until the late twentieth century, the same could not be said for the other dimensions of the 1662 resettlement of Anglicanism—legal establishment, the royal supremacy, and uniformity. These identifiers were to be victims of the global success of Anglicanism from the eighteenth century, as the Church of England expanded; first across the Atlantic into North American colonies, and then globally within and beyond the British Empire. The first to go was legal establishment when the Americans successfully ushered in their republic after their War of Independence with Britain and some Anglicans remained in the new state. No longer could these Anglicans be subject to the British crown, or be legally privileged in a country in which they were a decided minority, when the Americans had gone to so much trouble to jettison these things. So an Anglicanism—known after the Scottish precedent as Episcopalianism—came into existence for the first time in history without monarchical headship, but rather as a voluntary association. Even within the British Empire these legal and political aspects of Anglicanism, so much a part of its foundation in the sixteenth century, were in trouble by the 1840s. It was then that the bishop of a very new colony, almost as far away from England as you could get, started acting as though the monarchy and establishment were Anglican optional extras. Inspired by the United States precedent, Bishop Augustus Selwyn began unilaterally calling synods of his clergy just four years after New Zealand had been annexed in 1840 as a crown colony, and a few years later he was leading his Church into a constitution which made authoritative synods of laymen, clergy, and bishops. Voluntaryism was catching on in international Anglicanism.

Contestation and evolution continued to be a part of Anglicanism. One of its most enduring characteristics, the sole use of an authorized liturgical form for public worship, began to be challenged by two mutually hostile internal parties—Evangelicals and Anglo-Catholics. In some dioceses the latter succumbed to the temptation to use the Roman missal with the permission of

sympathetic diocesan bishops. In contrast, encouraged by the global ambitions of the wealthy diocese of Sydney, some of the former had *de facto* abandoned the use of an authorized Prayer Book entirely. Into this recent Anglican contest has been thrown issues of human sexuality which have conflicted wider society, particularly in the West, but which have been accentuated for Anglicans by questions of how varieties of human sexuality conform or do not conform to the authority of Scripture. So these historical forces have not ceased to play their part within the dynamic of Anglican identity. The post-colonial era following the retraction of the British Empire has brought further criticism, from Anglicans themselves, about the extent to which their denomination was complicit in British imperialism, and that therefore their identity suffers from being an imperial construct. For such Anglican critics, necessary deconstruction has to occur which allows English markers of identity, even as basic as liturgical worship or episcopacy, to be questioned or even relinquished.

Since the nineteenth century and the effective end of the royal supremacy—whether that was exercised by the monarch or the British Parliament—emerging global Anglicanism was increasingly beset into the twenty-first century by the issue of authority. There has been no effective replacement for the royal supremacy, in part because of Anglicanism's historical origins in anti-papal national royalism. Beyond the purely diocesan level, the Anglican Communion struggled to find an operative replacement for the authority of the royal supremacy. Various attempts at authority by moral consensus, all bedevilled by anxiety that something akin to a centralized (i.e. papal) authority was being constructed, were tried. But all such central organizations of an emerging international communion were saddled with the original limitations imposed by Archbishop Longley when he agreed to call the first Lambeth Conference of diocesan bishops in 1867. By repudiating any real global authority, and opting for the consultative label of 'conference' rather than 'synod', Longley found a way to bring opposing parties of Anglicans together. But the emerging Anglican Communion, with its so-called 'Instruments of Unity'—be they the Anglican Consultative Council, or Primates' Meeting—tried to emulate Longley and both avoid the devil—papal centralism—and the deep blue sea—myriad manifestations that belied the claim to unity. True to its origins, Anglicanism perhaps remained more comfortable with its various national existences, than with its international one.

However, the history of Anglicanism is not merely the tracing of the evolution of a now global form of Western Christianity, important though that may be to tens of millions of contemporary Anglican adherents. As part of the historical turn to religion in recent academic interest, in the past two decades there has been a great increase of interest in the history and development of both the Church of England and its global offshoots. Scholars have investigated a plethora of facets of these religious phenomena, from the institutional to the popular, from formal theological belief and worship to

informal, more diffusive faith. Other historians have looked at seminal Anglican figures and movements. As well as specifically religious history, other historians have been recapturing the pivotal importance of Anglicanism in wider social and political contexts.

There has been a general historiographical revision which might broadly be described as moving the Church of England (and religion generally) from the margins to the centre of major economic social, political, and cultural development in English, British, imperial, and global history from the sixteenth to the twentieth centuries. The Church of England, Anglicanism, and religion more generally are now seen to be seminal dimensions of these various historical periods. So, for example, the significance of religion in the British Empire has now been recognized by a number of important scholars.⁴ However, the major religious denomination in that empire, the Church of England, has been only sparsely studied compared to Nonconformity and is just now beginning to be critically examined.⁵ Belatedly religion is moving up the scale of historical importance in British, imperial, and global history, but it still lags behind the significance and attention that it has received from historians of England. There have been various studies of the Church of England in its national context, but these have not always been integrated into wider British and global studies.⁶

A number of studies of historical Anglicanism have focused on the narrative of the institutional and theological history of Anglicanism, either as the Church of England or as an Anglican Communion. These include Stephen Neil's now very dated *Anglicanism*, originally published in 1958. More recently, there have been William L. Sachs's *The Transformation of Anglicanism: From State Church to Global Communion* (1993), and Kevin Ward's *A History of Global Anglicanism* (2006). However, these scholarly histories are single-volume histories that inevitably provide insufficient depth to do justice to the breadth of scholarship on their subject. Anglicanism is now a subject of such complexity as both an institutional Church and a religious culture that sufficient justice cannot be done to it in a single-volume historical treatment.

But there is now sufficient international historical interest and extant scholarship to make an extensive, analytical investigation into the history of

⁴ Andrew Porter, *Religion versus Empire? British Protestant Missionaries and Overseas Expansion, 1700–1914* (Manchester, 2004); Catherine Hall, *Civilising Subjects: Metropole and Colony in the English Imagination 1830–1867* (Chicago, 2002); Jeffrey Cox, *The British Missionary Enterprise since 1700* (Abingdon, 2008).

⁵ Rowan Strong, *Anglicanism and the British Empire 1700–c.1850* (Oxford, 2007); Steven S. Maughan, *Mighty England Do Good: Culture, Faith, Empire, and World in the Foreign Missions of the Church of England, 1850–1915* (Grand Rapids, MI, 2014).

⁶ Nancy L. Rhoden, *Revolutionary Anglicanism: The Colonial Church of England Clergy during the American Revolution* (Basingstoke, 2007); Rowan Strong, *Episcopalianism in Nineteenth-Century Scotland: Religious Responses to a Modernizing Society* (Oxford, 2000); Bruce Kaye (ed.), *Anglicanism in Australia* (Melbourne, 2002).

Anglicanism a feasible intellectual project. In undertaking such a challenge the scholars who embarked on the project back in 2012 understand that not only was Anglicanism a religious identity shaped by theological and ecclesiastical understandings, but Anglicans were also formed by non-religious forces such as social class, politics, gender, and economics. Anglicanism has, therefore, been an expression of the Christianity of diverse social groups situated in the differing contexts of the past five centuries—monarchs, political elites, and lower orders; landowners and landless; slave-owners and slaves; missionaries, settlers, and indigenous peoples; colonizers and colonized—and by their enemies and opponents, both within and without their Church.

Introduction

A Century of Anglican Transition

William L. Sachs

FROM ENGLISH ESTABLISHMENT TO GLOBAL COMMUNION

By the beginning of the twentieth century the Church of England had become more than English. What emerged in the sixteenth century as England's Established Church, with Irish, Scottish, and Welsh variations, had spread to every continent. By sheer numbers, the Church encompassed some thirty million people, twenty-four million of them in Britain. Of the remaining six million, over half could be found in North America, Australia, and New Zealand. The English imprint upon the Church was indelible even as its further expansion seemed assured. Early twentieth-century participants in mission discussions, notably at the Pan-Anglican Congress of 1908, presumed the Church's extension was their task. Heartened by signs of growth, they could not foresee accurately how this would happen or what it would mean.

In terms of numbers alone, the intentions of mission succeeded abundantly. By the early twenty-first century there were nearly eighty million people claiming adherence to Churches derived from the Church of England, and this could be a conservative estimate. In every region of the globe, including Britain and North America, the Church's population had grown. In some parts of the world, the growth had been dramatic. Adherents in Australia and New Zealand had nearly tripled to almost five million. In the Asia-Pacific region, the numbers had nearly doubled to well over one million.¹

The most striking instance of the Church's growth and its diversification occurred in sub-Saharan Africa. There, over the course of the twentieth

¹ 'Global Anglicanism at a Crossroads', Pew Forum, 19 June 2008.

century, the Church's following increased nearly one hundredfold, from barely half a million to almost fifty million people. Although the number is striking, it is no longer surprising. The growth of African Christianity has become a much discussed phenomenon. The creation of distinctively African Churches, derived from European and North American influences but seeking their own casts, has been analysed often, importantly from the perspectives of those impacted by mission as well as from the viewpoints of those who initiated it. In varied ways befitting different contexts, complex cultural, economic, and political as well as religious factors intersected. Viewed over the course of the twentieth century the result was that Christianity grew dramatically, especially in Africa. Churches that bore the imprint of the Church of England proved especially vibrant.

By the early twenty-first century, Anglicanism's distribution, as much as its numerical growth, had changed its character. In 1900 over 80 per cent of adherents lived in Britain; by 2005 only one-third were found there while over half were African.² At a superficial level it can be said that the Church's mission succeeded, if success is defined as sustained growth. But the mention of success raises questions and begs for clarification. A variety of Christian traditions have grown dramatically across Africa, and on every continent, some claiming the religious legacy of their European sources, some representing original, contextual religious expressions. In each case, similar patterns of the translation of religious tradition into circumstances new to it appear. Adaptive processes to balance contextual accommodation with consistency of religious identity prove inevitable. Building new Churches in novel settings presses core questions of belief and practice. There is a dynamism that assumes localized form but follows consistent patterns. The Church of England became a prime instance of this process as missions transitioned to Churches.

This volume in the series considers the global experience of the Church of England in mission and in the transitions of its mission Churches towards autonomy in the twentieth century. The Church developed institutionally, yet more than the institutional history of the Church of England and its spheres of influence is probed. The authors of this book's chapters focus on what it has meant to be Anglican in diverse contexts. What spread from England was not simply a religious institution but the religious tradition it intended to implant. Accordingly, this volume addresses questions of the conduct of mission, its intended and unintended consequences. For instance, in what ways did mission organizations present Christian faith in a distinctly Anglican way? What has it meant to be Anglican as part of a lived tradition in various contexts during the twentieth century? By what paths and in what ways did

² 'Global Anglicanism at a Crossroads', Pew Forum, 19 June 2008.

mission by Anglicans advance and autonomous Churches emerge? More specifically, how has Anglicanism as a faith tradition taken root, becoming enculturated, as I shall explain, in a variety of settings? How has Anglicanism's advance in mission occurred in the late stages of colonialism and then during the rise of new nations from former colonies? The questions multiply and mark the twentieth century as one of significant Anglican transition.

The intention of mission by Christians has always been the translation of the faith, in the form of the Church, into contexts unfamiliar to it. However, the advance of mission has never been straightforward or free of tensions. The achievement of making converts, building the Church, and securing its sustainability has entailed inherent challenges. The faith has rarely been heard as it has been declared or appropriated in fledgling faith communities as missionaries envisioned. Contingencies and contextual realities of various sorts have intruded, highlighting the cultural divide between those who proclaimed and those who heard. Issues of the integrity of Church life, defined variously, have been rife in the history of mission.³ Tensions over what it means to be Anglican now have a complex history of their own. The Church's growth seemingly enshrined fault-lines that by the early twenty-first century seemed to divide Anglicans as much as their sense of shared tradition united them.

By broad strokes the history of what became known as Anglicanism seems well established. A set of Churches arose around the globe, stamped by English religious and cultural precedent. They faced the challenges of mission, not necessarily triumphing over them but finding means to survive and even thrive. Anglican mission initiatives often drew English religious frictions into new contexts. Tensions between Church parties affected how mission was conducted. Debates in the Western world over biblical interpretation and the appropriate relation between new scientific theories such as evolution and historic tenets of Christian faith found echoes in the mission field, though rarely with the same vigour.⁴ Transplantation of the Church could not be accomplished whole though the influences of its origins were ineradicable.

Yet Anglicans found local footing in various places by similar means. As the twentieth century began, Anglicans already had founded schools and colleges across their mission fields. Church-run schools conveyed more than sufficient clarity to read the Bible, or specialized training to become a Church worker, or even a candidate for ordination, as we shall discover in the chapters included here. Anglicans had also begun, and would develop extensively, social service

³ David Bosch, *Transforming Mission: Paradigm Shifts in Theology of Mission* (Maryknoll, NY, 1991); Andrew Walls, *The Missionary Movement in Christian History: Studies in the Transmission of Faith* (Maryknoll, NY, 1996); Andrew Walls, *The Cross-Cultural Process in Christian History: Studies in the Transmission and Appropriation of Faith* (Maryknoll, NY, 2002).

⁴ Jeff Guy, *The Heretic: A Study in the Life of John William Colenso, 1814–1863* (Scottsville, South Africa, 1983).

institutions including clinics and hospitals, charities and philanthropies, and particular initiatives to benefit poor and marginalized peoples. While Anglicans could not readily transform the cultures that were new to them, much less the societies where they were rooted historically, they sought to ameliorate distressed circumstances and to offer pathways of personal and social advance. Mission became elaborate as cultural and social realities in various contexts became plain and strategies to address them on the basis of the Church's faith took shape.

Such realities and the tasks they inspired had become apparent and were much discussed among Anglicans by the beginning of the twentieth century. Over the course of the century, as I have described elsewhere, the nature and shape of Anglicanism was transformed.⁵ We shall gain new insight into what this meant from the authors whose works are included here. But the implications of this transformation have been apparent, at least to a certain degree. At one level the transformation of Anglicanism concerned what it meant to speak of a family of Churches of English origin. By growth in numbers of Anglicans, the shift towards a global Communion of Churches has been striking. The chapters in this volume explore the global nature and impact of Anglicanism's expansion. The focus is on the results of what Western missionaries intended, the dynamics of mission and its consequences in multiple contexts. By the early twentieth century, it was clear that the mission Churches organized by the Church of England had become a dynamic cluster which functioned at some remove from England and one another. A religious tradition of English beginnings had taken distinctive forms in the mission field. In part this was because missionaries from England and elsewhere often took pains to distance themselves and their intentions from the modes of imperial life. Already early mission sites such as Australia, Canada, New Zealand, South Africa, and the United States had developed a capacity for self-direction. They also became sources of Anglican mission themselves, with American influence becoming notable in Latin American and Asian sites. Beginning in North America, they had created synods to govern the Church in a manner that transcended English precedent. Not surprisingly there had been tensions over the proper locus of religious authority. But the impulse to create synods, and thus to begin to shift authority, had gained ground. The eventual end of control from beyond could be envisioned.

Even in places that retained a clear direction by missionaries from overseas, the ordination of indigenous peoples had begun, albeit slowly. The tenor of discussion about mission in the early twentieth century centred on how and when to declare that authentic branches of the Church of England had gained sufficient capacity to direct their own affairs. Thus there were signs of

⁵ William L. Sachs, *The Transformation of Anglicanism: From State Church to Global Communion* (Cambridge, 1993).

movement towards the goal articulated by Henry Venn of the Church Missionary Society in the nineteenth century, namely the rise of 'self-supporting', autonomous Churches. Some mission leaders from the industrialized nations had begun to speak of the 'euthanasia' of mission.⁶ They anticipated the withdrawal of missionaries as indigenous Churches coalesced and local leadership took hold.

However, at the beginning of the twentieth century, the leaders of mission from Europe and North America concurred that this translation of the Church and its ongoing mission into local hands was not imminent. Nevertheless, as branches of the Church of England arose, albeit fitfully, it was no longer possible to speak simply of an English Church. It had become clear that the family of Churches born of England's Established Church was being defined more broadly on the one hand and more particularly on the other. It was possible to speak of 'Anglicanism', a Christian tradition whose branches were both clearly English and specifically contextual.⁷ It was also necessary to speak of its varied contextual expressions. The effort to articulate a distinctive Anglican identity, transcending without dismissing its English foundations, held two implications. First, mission for Anglicans entailed conveying basic truths of Christian faith while explaining its English idiosyncrasies. Second, the success of mission in creating Churches in diverse settings meant that Anglicanism became a variegated quilt. Accounting for unity of Anglican belief and practice while allowing for its variations became a primary challenge during the twentieth century.

The ideal of Anglican unity, and the manner of seeking it, reflected the influence of those who inspired mission's inception. Embracing Anglicanism's varieties while securing its identity became the role of what would be known as 'Instruments of Communion'. The office of the archbishop of Canterbury was enhanced internationally in the nineteenth century by creation of a decennial meeting of all of the Church's bishops, the Lambeth Conference. It has seemed to embody Anglicanism's expanse, its English heritage, and images of the imperial past. In the twentieth century it would be supplemented by periodic meetings of the primates of Anglican provinces and by the Anglican Consultative Council, a body in which laity and clergy other than bishops could participate.

During the twentieth century the idea of an Anglican Communion took concrete form. The Lambeth Conference of 1930 offered a definition of the Communion as a fellowship of Churches, following the ideal of 'the one Holy Catholic and Apostolic Church', in communion with the see of Canterbury

⁶ Wilbert Shenk, *Henry Venn—Missionary Statesman* (Maryknoll, NY, 1983); Jehu Hanciles, *Euthanasia of a Mission: African Church Autonomy in a Colonial Context* (Westport, CT, 2002).

⁷ Paul D. L. Avis, *Anglicanism and the Christian Church: Theological Resources in Historical Perspective* (London and New York, 2002).

and being 'particular or national Churches' which are 'bound together not by a central legislative or executive authority, but by mutual loyalty sustained through the common counsel of the bishops in conference'.⁸ Anglicans emphasized mission and sacramental fellowship. They prized local initiative and the integrity of Churches in cultural context. But the idea of Anglicanism which predominated in the twentieth century centred on the ordering of various particular expressions into a unity organized along Western institutional lines. The consolidation of international Church gatherings seemed to stamp the character of Anglicanism until fault-lines appeared to split it irreparably late in the century.

Though Anglicans sought a central means of regularizing their identity, no authoritative governing body emerged. Diversity of outlooks seemingly triumphed over their consensual union. Even the office of the archbishop of Canterbury holds symbolic influence but wields no compelling power of global scope. Images of centralized power are belied by the reality that Anglicans have required consensus-building as the mode of exerting authority. For over a century international gatherings have served as important forums in the search for consensus as Anglicans have faced such vexing issues as polygamy, political transition and conflict, and economic disparity. The issue of the Anglican relation to culture is a recurring one, but it is not the only difficult one. Anglicans have debated, and even divided, over such religious issues as the ordination of women and the place of homosexual persons in the Church. Beneath such fault-lines, basic differences over how to read the Bible and interpret Christian tradition appear. The effort to forge Anglican unity in a 'Communion' of Churches has stumbled over the challenge of blending myriad grassroots realities from various contexts into one religious body.

The pursuit of unity across diverse contexts was not unique to Anglicanism, nor was the means of seeking unity distinctive. The Anglican organizational impulse which arose out of Britain and North America compared favourably with the organizational style of other Protestant Churches and their mission initiatives. It is not surprising that Anglicans interacted significantly with such efforts, as the extent of Anglican participation in the World Missionary Conference at Edinburgh in 1910 attested.⁹ The Anglican mission emphasis had been clear at the Pan-Anglican Congress of 1908 that helped to inspire Edinburgh. In both events there was informed scrutiny of the conduct of mission in varied contexts. Years of mission experience produced sophistication about the challenges of implanting the gospel in new settings. Anglicans emphasized the apostolic parameters of belief and practice in the creation of

⁸ Resolutions of the Lambeth Conference, 1930, in *The Lambeth Conferences, 1867-1930* (London, 1948).

⁹ Brian Stanley (ed.), *The World Missionary Conference, Edinburgh 1910* (Grand Rapids, MI, 2009).

mission Churches. Though such emphasis was not unique to Anglicans, they gave it distinctive form. The Anglican intention was to create localized expressions of Christian belief and worship that reflected both catholic and evangelical influences of English origin.

Yet the English Church could not be transmitted whole into the mission field. Nor could its autonomous counterparts, notably from North America, fully achieve the mission Churches they envisioned. Mission was a complex process of translation and adaptation that assumed broadly comparable forms across otherwise disparate contexts. By the twentieth century the cultural features that shaped mission loomed large. The Anglican intention was to build 'self-supporting', faithful Churches that joined the English paradigm to contextual ministry. Over the twentieth century the Anglican capacity to become rooted in disparate contexts became the Church's hallmark and its challenge.

SHAPING ANGLICAN IDENTITY

As the century began, the fruits of Anglicanism's proclivity for contextual adaptation and growth across varied cultures seemed apparent. The direction of Anglican life as the creation of a global Communion seemed clear. Anglicans seemed to have forged widespread consensus about mission, and this consensus translated into large-scale organization. Church life, spurred by the influence of the industrialized world, coalesced around the mobilization and dissemination of resources needed to advance mission. Not surprisingly the capacity to generate and bequeath resources gave Anglicans in the West, especially in Britain, but also in the United States, the presumption of authority to direct Church life elsewhere. The symbolic authority of the Church of England, and its counterparts in other wealthy nations, exerted defining influence. Consensus among Anglicans for much of the twentieth century arose on the basis of disproportionate influence, economic and institutional as well as religious. Then consensus faltered as challenges to such influence arose across what had been the Anglican mission field, especially in Africa. The nature and dynamism of Anglican identity comes into focus in the chapters of this book. During the twentieth century Anglicanism proved to be a form of Christianity that was in continuous transition while attempting to gain new coherence and unity.

At the beginning of the twentieth century, it appeared that Anglicans had succeeded in framing their identity as a mission Church. On every continent, branches of the Church of England had arisen and, to differing degrees, become self-governing. They were paralleled by offshoots of the Episcopal Church in Latin America, the Philippines, Japan, and China. From the

perspective of those who managed mission, institutional clarity and coordination with Anglicans elsewhere continued to be mission priorities. It would prove to be an elusive goal as the century proceeded. The meaning of being Anglican was in transition across disparate contexts while the fact of English and Western influence remained clear. Anglicanism was being organized institutionally and forged religiously along lines that emphasized contextual vitality and wider affiliation without loss of oversight from the Church in the industrialized world. Even as mission Churches grew and adapted contextually their dependence upon Western resources remained profound.

Thus the historiography of Anglicanism has centred on the spread of the Church as an institution.¹⁰ In part this has meant that historians have organized their narratives chronologically and geographically. They have had to account for dynamic development that assumed both local and general patterns even beyond the bounds of British imperial influence and North American cultural impact. At the same time historians have had to take account of how Anglicanism, as a Church, took root and proved sustainable across diverse cultural contexts. Informed by larger studies of Christianity's entry into settings new to it, the best histories have balanced attention to contextual distinctiveness with efforts to identify consistent, distinguishing marks of being Anglican. More than a Church history focused institutionally, the study of Anglicanism has suggested the need for attention to a religious tradition expanding beyond its origins into myriad cultural settings.¹¹

Yet attention to Anglicanism as a religious institution has been sustained. The chapters in this book presume the importance of this aspect of Anglican life. What missionaries sought to build, and what proves easiest to trace by historians, is the growth of an institution and its institutional offshoots. Such growth can readily be described and measured numerically. But other sorts of transitions also must be cited and have drawn the attention of historians. The first is the Church's turn towards indigenous forms of Christian worship and life. The Bible, the Book of Common Prayer, and materials for Christian education had to be made available in local languages with sensitivity to cultural values and idioms.¹² Such translations of the faith, an inherent aspect of mission at all times, had advanced noticeably for Anglicans by the start of the twentieth century and would continue through the century. Similarly, the Church's organizational infrastructure grew, notably in terms of governance in context while structures of Communion would develop through much of the century.

¹⁰ Bruce Kaye, *An Introduction to World Anglicanism* (Cambridge, 2008); Kevin Ward, *A History of Global Anglicanism* (Cambridge, 2006).

¹¹ E.g. Bruce Kaye (ed.), *Anglicanism in Australia* (Carlton, Victoria, 2002).

¹² Lamin Sanneh, *Translating the Message: The Missionary Impact on Culture* (Maryknoll, NY, 2009).

Far less accomplished, though discussed and presumed as an eventual fact, the transition of the Church's leadership from missionary to indigenous hands loomed during the twentieth century. Historians rightly have viewed such a transition as a leading measure of Anglicanism gaining contextual integrity as well as sustainability, and the chapters in this book evince such sensibility.¹³ However, more than the extension of the Church, the theme of an indigenous Anglicanism which is central to these chapters reveals the elaboration of a religious tradition, a body of Christian belief and practice transcending its origins by becoming enculturated in myriad contexts. This volume points beyond institutional categories and numerical growth alone, towards the development of a religious tradition with particular emphasis on its contextual grounding. The theme is the transition of Anglicanism as a religious tradition beyond its point of origin to fresh expression and influence in various settings. In this sense, Anglicanism was transformed during the twentieth century. How this happened, using various global sites and themes that arose beyond Western Church life as lenses, is our focus.

One doorway to the emphasis upon Anglicanism as religious tradition is the most obvious transition of the twentieth century: 'decolonization'.¹⁴ By the mid-century a widespread withdrawal of missionaries and the resources they could secure had begun. It represented the Church's version of the end of colonial status across most of what had been the British Empire. Gradually over several decades, colonial territories gained independence and assumed the status of nations. In some areas, such as India, the issue was forced by social pressures that had been building for decades and then required reconfiguration of colonial boundaries into national ones. In some instances, notably Kenya, social revolution forced the issue of political independence. A different sort of political turnover occurred in South Africa, where one form of white minority rule succeeded another for nearly fifty years. The fact of decolonization occurred unevenly and without resolving all political and social tensions. Extant frictions, including religious ones, surfaced afresh. The end of empire challenged colonialism without erasing its imprint, and posed new issues of social organization and political direction. Religious life also faced this vortex.

Not surprisingly various forms of connection, and even dependence, continued to link the former colonies to the diminished imperial power, the most apparent being disparities of material and economic resources. It became clear that new nations could require guidance in building their infrastructures.

¹³ Cf. Susan Billington Harper, *In The Shadow of the Mahatma: Bishop V. S. Azariah and the Travails of Christianity in British India* (Grand Rapids, MI, 2000).

¹⁴ Sarah Stockwell, 'Anglicanism in the Era of Decolonization', in Jeremy Morris (ed.), *The Oxford History of Anglicanism*, vol. IV: *Global Western Anglicanism, c.1900–present* (Oxford, 2017), pp. 160–85.

Basic social institutions including education and social service, economic development, transportation and communication often demanded external influences as new nations pursued plans of development. It could be argued that colonial life bred continued dependence. The transition to national identity based on political independence did not occur immediately but required processes of translating external direction into internal definition. The Church shared in such challenges and in the ways of addressing them.

The prevailing historical assessments of Christianity's relation to colonialism have gained nuance. To be sure, missionary intentions and conduct frequently abetted the presence of colonial power. Often such influence was asserted informally, as persuasive, cultural patterns of morality and decorum. Yet, increasingly, historians have discovered distinctions between empire's influence that could restrict or slow social development and Christianity's role in creating modernity. Missionary work by Anglicans and missionaries of other traditions encouraged local agency and the rise of national identity. The Church was a principal influence in setting the stage for the end of colonialism.¹⁵ Nevertheless, for Anglicans as for other missionary-based Churches, the end of colonialism proved to be one of the twentieth century's most difficult transitions. Just as the Church and empire related in varied ways, so the movement away from colonialism occurred variously.¹⁶ It entailed diverse transitions in different locales, all moving towards self-direction. These chapters reveal that empire and its conclusion meant different things in different places. Even its manner of concluding occurred variously, in some places abruptly and loudly, in other places quietly and gradually. The Church's relation to the rise of national independence wore different faces. Opposition to political revolution, illustrated by missionary criticism of the Mau Mau movement in Kenya, contrasted with subsequent widespread Church support for opposition to apartheid in South Africa.¹⁷ It is difficult to generalize about the Anglican relation to the politics of decolonization. The historical record is complex and made more diffuse because Anglicanism also took root beyond British imperial influence, notably in Latin America. It is too simple to say either that the Church was an arm of empire or an agent of political liberation. The Church's story does not mimic the political one in all respects, and these chapters surface important distinctions.

¹⁵ Olufemi Taiwo, *How Colonialism Preempted Modernity in Africa* (Bloomington, IN, 2010).

¹⁶ Jeffrey Cox, *The British Missionary Enterprise since 1700* (London, 2008); Andrew Porter, *Religion Versus Empire? British Protestant Missionaries and Overseas Expansion, 1700–1914* (Manchester, 2004); Andrew Porter, *The Imperial Horizons of British Protestant Missions, 1880–1914* (Grand Rapids, MI, 2003).

¹⁷ Caroline Elkins, *Imperial Reckoning: The Untold Story of Britain's Gulag in Kenya* (New York, 2005); Peter John Lee, *Compromise and Courage: Anglicans in Johannesburg, 1864–1999* (Pietermaritzburg, 2005).

To be sure, as an institution the Church's experience of decolonization reflected the course of the political transfer of authority. Similarly Churches in former colonies, many of which had gained measures of self-direction during the colonial era, acquired the full measure of direction as control from beyond ended. In new nations, Anglicans moved to secure their own Church synods, and other channels of Church authority, to raise funds and generate resources, to create their own versions of the Book of Common Prayer, and to implement modes of education and faith formation beyond what existed under colonialism. For these aspects of Church life there was precedent, though the fact of self-direction demanded that they expand.

This volume offers important insights on what decolonization meant for Anglicans as the mission Church in various global locations became self-reliant. It is not enough to speak of the end of the colonial empire, as much as some historians have proven obsessed with it. It is just as important to speak of what happened next to Anglicans and Anglicanism on the basis of diverse contextual experiences. Thus these chapters portray forms of Anglican experience that are more than simply post-colonial. Indeed, as some authors argue, the fact of colonial influence lingers.¹⁸ The continued dependence of the Church in former colonies, especially for funding and material resources, seemingly confirms that Anglican life in many places retains post-colonial dynamics. It is not sufficient to depict an Anglicanism shorn of colonial influence because important legacies of the colonial era remain, notably in terms of economic and cultural influences. But this volume describes efforts to secure an Anglican identity beyond colonialism. The authors of these chapters break new ground in describing the emergence of an Anglicanism shaped more contextually than externally.

The Anglican conflict over homosexuality, which I have analysed elsewhere,¹⁹ focused debate on lingering forms of colonial influence. The debate became pronounced late in the twentieth century and seemed to enshrine Anglican fault-lines over the nature of Christian faith and its appropriate relation to culture. In doing so, the conflict gathered up images of the colonial past and compelled renewed rejections of it. Vigorous opposition to any form of acceptance of homosexuality by Anglicans, especially in Africa and Asia, united them with like-minded clusters of Anglicans in the Western world. With some irony, traditionalist coalitions fostered a shared critique of homosexuality's legitimization as a surrender of the Church to depraved aspects of Western life and the legacy of imposing Western social values upon subject peoples. With further irony, supporters of the acceptance of homosexual persons often advocated political and social liberation broadly, claiming to

¹⁸ Ian T. Douglas and Kwok Pui-lan (eds.), *Beyond Colonial Anglicanism* (New York, 2001).

¹⁹ William L. Sachs, *Homosexuality and the Crisis of Anglicanism* (Cambridge, 2009).

see inherent links between Christian faith and the rights of native peoples who had been under colonial control.

The Anglican conflict over human sexuality, including differences over polygamy in Africa for much of the twentieth century and homosexuality latterly, consumed the attention of the Church's structures of governance and consultation. Interweaving such conflicts with the Church's continuing assessment of its colonial past lends welcome complexity to considerations of Anglican history and identity. However, the real story of twentieth-century Anglicanism does not concern the strained circumstances of Church structures, which were intent upon finding theological and pastoral coherence. Conflicts over human sexuality as such are not focal either, though they have called attention to the heart of Anglican experience, especially as colonialism eroded and the Church worked to move beyond it. During the twentieth century Anglicanism became as much the contextual embodiment of a faith tradition as it was a global family of religious institutions. The contextual elaboration of Anglican life is the deeper story of this religious tradition.

As various historians have suggested, and as all factions in the debates over sexuality have echoed, Anglicanism has mirrored the multiplicity of cultures in which it has become rooted. Yet how it became rooted to where it could both identify with various cultural contexts and also claim to be distinctively Christian and Anglican has not been fully understood. This is even more the case for the twentieth century, marking the last phase of colonialism, 'decolonization', and a turn towards contextual autonomy. The intention of becoming indigenous or inculturated, as frequently used terms depict, has been apparent, from the earliest phases of Anglican mission before the twentieth century. But how did the process of achieving growth and gaining contextual identity occur in the twentieth century?

'Indigenous' generally means occurring naturally in a particular place. The term is readily used in the literature of Christian mission as well as historical and cultural studies grounded in ethnography. The term suggests a fixed social order inherent in a given setting. Being indigenous bespeaks a social identity that is given and entails a powerful sense of belonging. For Anglicans, as well as other religious traditions that seek to engage an unfamiliar cultural context, to become indigenous means that mission must secure authentic social footing. But simply intending to be indigenous does not suggest a religious or social process to achieve it. Nor is there a sense of dynamism to accompany a strong emphasis on cultural stability. Studies of indigenous cultures tend to see them as forced to take defensive measures against outside forces in order to survive.²⁰

²⁰ Cf. Marshall Sahlins, *Culture in Practice* (New York, 2000); James Clifford, *Returns: Becoming Indigenous in the Twenty-First Century* (Cambridge, MA and London, 2013).

'Inculturation' also is a term that is applied to Christian adaptation to a non-Christian setting, especially in regard to liturgy and religious ritual. The term is often used in Roman Catholic discussions to suggest that the task of mission is the faithful translation of core expressions of Church life into new cultural contexts. More of a sense of religious and social process is suggested; but it is essentially a one-way process, in effect instilling liturgy and belief into new settings in ways that replicate religious practice elsewhere.²¹ The goal is religious authenticity defined largely externally. In contrast, the chapters in this book reveal that processes of 'enculturation' occurred in Anglican experience during the twentieth century. The experience has not been unique to Anglicans. In fact, through this methodological lens, one can readily understand Christian mission as an interactive process in which a host culture and the one that is arriving adapt to each other.²²

Although the contributors to this volume speak variously, themselves using such terms as 'indigenous' and 'inculturation', they point towards processes of what I prefer to call 'enculturation'. To speak of 'enculturation' in Anglican life, especially in the twentieth century, is to claim that in diverse contexts Anglicans learned to adapt to basic cultural knowledge and roles. Even as they attempted to exert defining influence religiously, they learned to function in social contexts new to them in ways that proved to be ongoing and dialogical. Anglicans did not simply become enmeshed in cultures, nor could they simply transform them. By religious and social processes, they found ways to exist constructively in disparate cultural contexts, i.e. they became enculturated. As we shall see, this means they gained cultural footing while solidifying basic marks of Christian belief and Church worship and ministry. 'Enculturation' also denotes an ongoing, dynamic, dialogical process of cross-cultural exchange. This means that Anglicanism proved to be an adaptable expression of Christian tradition, marked by variation but stamped by consistent ways of melding faith with patterns of local life. No end-point of mission was reached; 'enculturation' has been marked by ongoing learning and application, by continuing development and expression. The term is frequently applied to pathways of individual development, but it has ready application to social groups and organizations. Thus I apply it to Anglican experience in the twentieth century.

The Anglican capacity to become rooted contextually, which I term enculturation, was apparent at the beginning of the twentieth century. Over the course of the century it became definitive of Anglicanism globally. This capacity was not a result of decolonization per se, but the end of empire intensified contextual challenges. The advance of enculturated forms of

²¹ Cf. R. C. McCarron, 'Inculturation, Liturgical', and A. E. Shorter, 'Theology of Inculturation', in *New Catholic Encyclopedia* (Detroit and Washington, 2003).

²² Cf. Kent G. Lightfoot, *Indians, Missionaries, and Merchants* (Berkeley, CA, 2005).

Anglicanism exacerbated the conflict over sexuality, but such conflict was not its trajectory. The enculturation of Anglicanism represented the creation of religious life based on appropriations of contextual influences that would reframe English precedent, as these chapters explain. The consistent intention was to build the Church as an expression of the biblical ideal of the kingdom of God. It could be claimed that beyond Western influence, Anglicanism's Christian intentions could find genuine realization. The admixture of contextual influence and English precedent proved fecund.

PATTERNS OF ENCULTURATION

The authors of this volume's chapters handle the fact of Anglicanism taking contextual root in various ways. Obviously the volume presents Anglican experience in diverse settings across various segments of the twentieth century. In the process the contributors reveal that enculturation was marked by dynamic processes that promised to solidify Anglican life around the biblical and sacramental ideal of the kingdom of God. Taken as a whole these chapters describe the enculturation of Anglicanism as a process marked by four points of emphasis. First, and most obvious, Anglicans have laboured to extend the Christian faith and the Church. Second, the Anglican emphasis upon education has posed new means of personal and social development. Third, there have been repeated instances of Anglican efforts to transform regional and national life along moral lines by elaboration of Church-inspired social service and activism. Fourth, Anglicans have laboured amid forms of faith and spirituality more historic to certain contexts. Faced with other faiths, Anglicans often have sought ecclesiastical and personal, official and unofficial encounters in ways that have fostered common ground. Thus the marks of Anglican patterns of enculturation are: *extension, education, elaboration, and encounter*.

The question of Anglican distinctiveness cannot be resolved by this volume. But in their own ways the authors of these chapters affirm it. The four themes of extension, education, elaboration, and encounter are not unique to Anglicans, and the tasks inherent in facing them have not been singular. But how Anglicans have framed and addressed the tasks of enculturation suggest distinctive and even innovative approaches. In the chapters that follow, the authors show how various themes have interwoven across Anglican global experience. Anglicanism emerges as a unity of religious ideals and practices, forging community based on historic precedent, readings of cultural contexts, and adaptive strategies that reflect appreciative approaches.

The theme that appears most consistently in these chapters is the Anglican extension of Christian faith and the Church. Amid various twentieth-century

transitions in Church life, notably decolonization and conflict over sexuality, extension has remained in the forefront of Anglican life. The sheer growth of Anglicanism, especially in what is termed the 'global South', has been dramatic. As John Kater describes, Anglicanism's emergence in Latin America defies familiar assumptions about the Church's relation to British colonialism. Here the impact of the Episcopal Church of the United States has been profound, with surprising growth occurring in the second half of the twentieth century. Adverting to mission's advance in various contexts, and tapping his own work in the Caribbean as well as Latin America, Louis Weil probes the adaptation of Anglican liturgy to new settings and altered circumstances. Weil's chapter enhances our insights into Anglicanism in the Caribbean. Less known than other settings on that continent, the Horn of Africa affords Grant LeMarquand a fascinating context for tracing the Church's extension. Even under colonialism, Somalia was not easily reached or resourced, yet mission persisted with striking results. He takes care to note the cross-cultural dimensions of Anglican mission there.

Mission strategy is explicitly and implicitly treated from diverse perspectives by the authors assembled here. Femi Kolapo is alert to what Anglicans intended and what resulted in the crucial region of West Africa. The Church's growth there has been the most dramatic of any global region. Kolapo enhances our understanding of how this happened and what it has meant. Kolapo also explains the rise and impact of anti-colonial sentiment in Church and society. The process of enculturation there has been striking. Interaction with prophetic movements of local origin has been a formative factor. Similarly Jesse Zink traces Anglican experience amid repeated conflicts in Sudan. How conflict shaped self-understanding there proves to be an invaluable case study, as I shall explain shortly.

Anglicanism's capacity to present itself as a distinctive and adaptive religious tradition is a key aspect of Michael Gladwin's treatment of the Church in Melanesia and Polynesia. He makes the crucial point that Anglicanism has functioned as a religious culture in encounters with contextual social and religious realities in ways that often have been mutually appreciative. The rise of the Melanesian Brotherhood is an important example. Gladwin shows sensitivity to contextual tensions between tradition and modernity, and the Church's relation to emerging nationalism. Enculturation has proven to be a multi-faceted process in which the boundaries between Church, society, and political change have proven porous.

Such developments have been integral to mission, as Elizabeth Prevost demonstrates in her treatment of missionaries in East Africa. Her analysis reinforces the point that Anglicanism has both shaped and been shaped by the settings in which it has developed mission. The contingencies inherent in proclaiming the faith repeatedly outpaced mission strategies developed from afar. Missionaries often were at odds with colonial powers, though missionaries

proved more adept at protest than at decisive change from colonial policies. Over the twentieth century, as she and others in this volume show, the goal of mission shifted from sole emphasis on cultural transformation to the realization of an African Christianity in Anglican thought and practice. Where cultural change remained a priority, it took on a different character, often joined to new forms of nationalism. Theoretical depictions of Anglicanism benefit from the concrete assessment Prevost offers.

During the twentieth century Anglicans both broadened and deepened their encounters with other faith traditions and the social worlds in which they were rooted. The experience of religious difference occurred in various ways. Peter Eaton describes how, formally and informally, relations with Orthodox Churches developed, especially with the Armenian and Russian Churches. As much as formal dialogue, informal conversation highlighted the two traditions' views of ministry and the sacraments. Mutually informative relations resulted even in the absence of official recognition and agreement. From a different perspective, Catriona Laing traces how mission became the discovery of mutual affirmation between Anglicans and Muslims in North Africa, especially in patterns of spirituality and religious practice. There was a shift in missiological thinking during the first half of the twentieth century that was seen in the Middle East as an Anglican turn to collaboration with the cultural and religious environments. As she describes, this entailed appreciative encounters with Islam. Elizabeth Prevost enhances this view with her study of how mission in Africa was influenced by encounters with religious difference.

In a variety of cultural settings, a basic shift in mission strategy occurred as Anglican presence deepened. Anglicans never lost an intention to make converts to the Christian faith, and energies for evangelism have been pronounced, especially in Africa. At the same time, Anglicans learned to appreciate and coexist with a variety of religious traditions, often out of respect and often as political and social necessity. For Paul Hedges this is a prominent theme and other authors echo it. Thus, several chapters describe how Anglicans eased their emphasis on proselytism in favour of forms of Christian witness. One manner, to which Catriona Laing and Philip Wickeri are alert, is the development of a Christian literature to speak to a culture's educated elites. Another manner, as several authors assess, has been the development of Church schools and social service institutions. During the twentieth century, in varied sites, Anglican mission became demonstrative, depicting forms of social benefit as witness to Christian belief. By this means, Anglicans generally intended to deepen their roots in different cultures.

The theme of cross-cultural encounter is central for John Karanja as he considers how Anglicanism became rooted in Kenya, especially among the Kikuyu. For Karanja, the story of mission there concerned less institution-building and more the rise of an Anglican capacity to engage grassroots life constructively. For example, he notes that mission stations could serve as

mediating centres in addressing local family conflicts. Yet Anglicans did not simply endorse local culture; opposition to female circumcision was mobilized to a significant degree by Anglican initiative. Similarly, Derek Peterson considers the phenomenon of the East African Revival, amid broad patterns of contextual spirituality. His writing affords evidence that Christianity in general and Anglicanism in particular assumed contextual form while holding to its core affirmations. Formally and informally, Anglican mission bore the imprint of Western influence. But more than collusion with imperial power resulted. Anglicanism proved generative of new, contextually influential forms of Christian life. A consistent Anglican capacity to interact appreciatively with various cultures is apparent in these chapters.

From a broad outlook, Paul Hedges considers Anglicanism and inter-faith relations. He draws important conclusions about the impact of such encounters upon Anglican sensibilities and priorities. Hedges adeptly considers both contextual developments and the changing positions of international Anglican bodies, especially the Lambeth Conference. The focus of mission gradually shifted from outright proselytism to religious and cultural adaptation. In that shift, enculturation proved to be a dialogical process in which Anglicans made converts to Christian belief and the fellowship of the Church while finding that their own way of framing faith and life were sharpened by the experience. The process of enculturation never concluded, but has continued amid social and political changes.

Nevertheless, Anglicans have attempted to exert transformative influences upon hospitable cultural contexts. As appreciative as Anglicans have been of the social and cultural settings they have encountered, they have also tried to remake them in strategic ways by elaborating Church influence. The familiar images of schools and colleges founded by missionaries are reinforced in these chapters. By the beginning of the twentieth century there already were a number of such institutions. How they changed during the twentieth century, especially in South Asia, is the focus of Richard Jones's chapter, which traces how Anglican education responded to the end of colonialism and the rise of nationalism. Repeatedly, as Jones describes in relation to Islam, Anglicans were a missionary faith shorn of the advantages of empire and functioning with profoundly diminished social status. Even so, Anglicans believed they could serve as catalysts for personal and social development in the Middle East and South Asia.

Education was not the only avenue of development. John Yieh describes the centrality of social ministries sponsored by Anglicans in East Asia, both in what was the British colony of Hong Kong as well as in Japan and Korea, which were beyond the British colonial orb. Whether in colonial contexts or not, the intention and the strategy were the same. Recognizing their minority status even as they made converts and built the Church, Anglicans created social influence disproportionate to their numbers. Their emphasis upon

service, including health care and education, was the vehicle. The chapter by Philip Wickeri gives particular attention to Chinese Anglicanism, especially in Hong Kong. Deftly he joins the theme of the Church's development to the emphasis it placed on ministries of social service. During the twentieth century the Anglican Church became the manager of an inordinate share of Hong Kong's educational institutions, for example. A similar instinct was apparent on the Chinese mainland. Late in the twentieth century the Church helped to facilitate the transition from British colonial rule in Hong Kong to Chinese political control. Beyond the influence their small numbers imply, Anglicans have had notable impact on Chinese, and especially Hong Kong, society. Similarly, Femi Kolapo links Anglican growth in West Africa to a consistent capacity to deliver social service at the grassroots, and to portray social service as practical embodiment of the Christian faith and the life of the Church.

Across such varied settings the intention often was national transformation along moral lines, as well as amelioration of distress and personal development. Anglicans acted on the basis of their legacy as England's religious establishment without necessarily seeking accommodation with the cultural or political status quo. Rather, guided by the biblical ideal of the kingdom of God and the centrality of sacramental worship and ministry, Anglicans witnessed to a different society, which they could not impose but to which they alluded as they responded to social need. Thus Titus Presler echoes Yieh and Jones as he describes the Church's ministries to dispossessed groups of persons in South Asia. In the twentieth century Anglicanism became rooted in mass movements and mission initiatives launched by Indian Christians. A different sort of Anglican ethos posed a different sort of nationalism that challenged cultural patterns enshrining haves and have-nots. Anglican ministries embodied moral witness in efforts to redeem social relations.

Robert Heaney describes how in southern Africa moral witness, and even political activism, encouraged a different nationalism. The struggle to overturn white minority rule, whether locally or from beyond was the same; the bitter reality of apartheid reflected the turn of Anglicanism itself to an African majority and predominantly African leadership. As Heaney has shown in his chapter here and in publication elsewhere, one of the most notable transitions for Anglicanism in Africa has been its acquisition of contextual character and authority.²³ Jesse Zink draws a similar conclusion in his chapter on the Sudan. There Anglicanism has become rooted in the lives of displaced peoples, not social and political elites. Not always able to retain the ideals associated with its establishment past, Anglicanism nevertheless has found novel and diverse cultural footings and has repeatedly emphasized faith as the natural basis for the life of a people.

²³ Robert S. Heaney, *From Historical to Critical Post-Colonial Theology: The Contribution of John S. Mbiti and Jesse N. K. Mugambi* (Eugene, OR, 2005).

In his chapter, Jeffrey Cox offers a constructive argument about the process of ‘enculturation’ as I have termed it. Pursuing a similar approach, Cox moves beyond static depictions of how Anglicanism took root in new contexts. He concludes that a more dynamic sense than simply becoming ‘indigenous’ is required. To that end, he applies the phrase ‘zones of contact’, an appropriation from the work of Mary Louise Pratt. Encounters between Western Anglicans and peoples they sought to evangelize occurred in myriad locales. Concluding that transmission of the faith and extension of the Church were intertwined, Cox locates Anglican distinctiveness, and a primary ‘zone of contact’, in the organizing of dioceses and the consecration of bishops in mission settings. In new cultural contexts, Anglicans thus extended the work of the Church, Cox finds. The logic of creating diocesan life overseen by bishops challenged latent racist sentiments, and forced the issue of training local people as clergy and lay leaders. Not merely the extension of mission, but the process of enculturation could be measured by the rise of diocesan life.

CONCLUSIONS

What conclusions can be drawn from these chapters about the twentieth-century Anglican experience of global development? First, it is important to observe that despite the breadth of the chapters, there are gaps in what this volume covers. Little attention is paid to the development of Anglicanism as a global network, other than to trace its outline. Titus Presler’s description of union churches in South Asia enhances the depiction of Anglican variety, but more could be said about the Church’s institutional development in its creative variations. More could be said about Anglican life in Africa and the Middle East in this regard. There is little or no reference to some parts of the Anglican world, such as the Philippines and the Caribbean where discussions of the end of colonialism could prove insightful. Nor does this volume follow the track of Philip Jenkins who has depicted Christianity’s growth in the global South in tendentious theological terms.²⁴ These chapters readily identify grassroots theological variations: among the authors various perspectives are apparent and various conclusions about the shape of belief surface. These differences prove more enriching of the Anglican story in the twentieth century than confirming of its conflicted tendencies. More important, the volume portrays a broad unity of practice in Anglican mission featuring appreciative engagements with local cultures.

²⁴ Philip Jenkins, *The New Faces of Christianity: Believing the Bible in the Global South* (Oxford, 2008). Also see his *The Next Christendom: The Coming of Global Christianity* (Oxford, 2011).

Second, what does it mean to engage local cultures appreciatively and why should that question loom large? I have used such terms as 'local', 'contextual', and, above all, 'enculturation' to encompass what the authors of these chapters describe. Over the twentieth century Anglicanism grew because it consistently displayed a capacity to adapt Christian faith and English precedent to diverse social particularities. Increasingly unwieldy as a global Communion, Anglicanism proved flexible amid circumstantial realities. Appreciative, yet also distinctive and prophetic ministries marked its witness in varied settings. Indeed, building capacities for local witness is an evident theme in this book. Repeatedly one finds instances of Anglican resilience, initiative, persistence, and courage, as well as sheer faithfulness. The force of contextual realities, such as political conflict, injustice, and poverty has compelled Anglicans to be clear about who they are as Christians and what they intend as a Church. Such clarity, as we read in this book, reflects the necessity of Anglicans living amid other faiths as a religious minority even where Anglicans show relative numerical strength. The religious conservatism of Anglicans in portions of Africa and Asia is encouraged by having to achieve clarity of conviction in pluralist circumstances. A conservative instinct, by Western standards, can serve to distance local Anglicans from Western counterparts whose initiatives may offend sensibilities and bring lingering hints of colonialism.

Third, as a result, Anglicanism as a Church has assumed distinct or enhanced social characteristics in the contexts this volume considers. Often, as we have seen, there has been little recognition of what membership in the Church has meant in the Western world, for in the settings where it has become enculturated, new kinds of social bonds have emerged. As a profound religious minority, Anglicans have experienced the Church not only as a source of mission and ministry, but as a fellowship. Often in such disparate regions as the Middle East and East Asia, for example, Anglican parishes have gathered as virtual families. Extended time for meals and other social gatherings have accompanied an emphasis on worship. The Church's liturgies, especially rites of passage, have created remarkable social bonds. A similar bond arose among students in Church-run schools, linking students and even families of different faiths. The graduates of Anglican schools often have carried this sense of bond into their careers, even when Christianity, and Anglicanism in particular, has been a religious minority. The chapters in the volume show that Anglicanism has been a source of resilient social bonds, even in the absence of family or amid its dysfunctions. The power of the Church as social fellowship has proven transcendent of empire, at times in spite of missionary influence.

Finally, these pages reveal that during the twentieth century Anglicanism was reconfigured in practice in various global contexts beyond where it originated. As a process of enculturation this has meant ongoing, contextual adaptation. The upshot has been that the influence of Anglicanism as lived,

Christian faith has extended beyond the councils of the Church or its organizational corridors. The Anglican impact on contextual life has tended to outweigh the Church's actual membership, and even its presence as a religious fellowship. Anglicanism has left a broad imprint reflective of more than the intentions of mission or the bounds of empire. Nor were Anglicans, over the course of the twentieth century, defined simply by theological or cultural fault-lines. Instead Anglicans cast a vision of redeemed social life rooted in sacramental Christianity while engaging varied faiths and cultures constructively, often as mediators, often also as critics. Thus the chapters of this volume describe how, across a broad swathe of cultural contexts, Anglicanism became enculturated. The influence of context, and the challenge of adaptation to it, framed Anglicanism's twentieth-century experience.

SELECT BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Avis, Paul D. L., *Anglicanism and the Christian Church: Theological Resources in Historical Perspective* (London and New York, 2002).
- Bosch, David, *Transforming Mission: Paradigm Shifts in Theology of Mission* (Maryknoll, NY, 1991).
- Clifford, James, *Returns: Becoming Indigenous in the Twenty-First Century* (Cambridge, MA and London, 2013).
- Cox, Jeffrey, *The British Missionary Enterprise since 1700* (London, 2008).
- Douglas, Ian T. and Kwok Pui-lan (eds.), *Beyond Colonial Anglicanism* (New York, 2001).
- 'Global Anglicanism at a Crossroads', Pew Forum, 19 June 2008. <<http://www.pewforum.org>>.
- Hanciles, Jehu, *Euthanasia of a Mission: African Church Autonomy in a Colonial Context* (Westport, CT, 2002).
- Harper, Susan Billington, *In the Shadow of the Mahatma: Bishop V. S. Azariah and the Travails of Christianity in British India* (Grand Rapids, MI, 2000).
- Heaney, Robert S., *From Historical to Critical Post-Colonial Theology: The Contribution of John S. Mbiti and Jesse N. K. Mugambi* (Eugene, OR, 2005).
- Jenkins, Philip, *The New Faces of Christianity: Believing the Bible in the Global South* (Oxford, 2008).
- Jenkins, Philip, *The Next Christendom: The Coming of Global Christianity* (Oxford, 2011).
- Kaye, Bruce (ed.), *Anglicanism in Australia* (Carlton, Victoria, 2002).
- Kaye, Bruce, *An Introduction to World Anglicanism* (Cambridge, 2008).
- Lee, Peter John, *Compromise and Courage: Anglicans in Johannesburg, 1864-1999* (Pietermaritzburg, 2005).
- Lightfoot, Kent G., *Indians, Missionaries, and Merchants* (Berkeley, CA, 2005).
- McCarron, R. C., 'Inculturation, Liturgical', in *New Catholic Encyclopedia* (Detroit and Washington, 2003).

- Porter, Andrew, *Religion Versus Empire? British Protestant Missionaries and Overseas Expansion, 1700–1914* (Manchester, 2004).
- Resolutions of the Lambeth Conference, 1930, in *The Lambeth Conferences, 1867–1930* (London, 1948).
- Sachs, William L., *Homosexuality and the Crisis of Anglicanism* (Cambridge, 2009).
- Sachs, William L., *The Transformation of Anglicanism: From State Church to Global Communion* (Cambridge, 1993).
- Sahlins, Marshall, *Culture in Practice* (New York, 2000).
- Sanneh, Lamin, *Translating the Message: The Missionary Impact on Culture* (Maryknoll, NY, 2009).
- Shenk, Wilbert, *Henry Venn—Missionary Statesman* (Maryknoll, NY, 1983).
- Shorter, A. E., ‘Theology of Inculturation’, in *New Catholic Encyclopedia* (Detroit and Washington, 2003).
- Stanley, Brian (ed.), *The World Missionary Conference, Edinburgh 1910* (Grand Rapids, MI, 2009).
- Stockwell, Sarah, ‘Anglicanism in the Era of Decolonization’, in Jeremy Morris (ed.), *The Oxford History of Anglicanism*, vol. IV: *Global Western Anglicanism, c.1900–present* (Oxford, 2017), pp. 160–85.
- Taiwo, Olufemi, *How Colonialism Preempted Modernity in Africa* (Bloomington, IN, 2010).
- Walls, Andrew, *The Cross-Cultural Process in Christian History: Studies in the Transmission and Appropriation of Faith* (Maryknoll, NY, 2002).
- Ward, Kevin, *A History of Global Anglicanism* (Cambridge, 2006).

Part I

The Growth of Global Anglicanism

The Dialectics of Empire, Race, and Diocese

Jeffrey Cox

The story of the growth of global Anglicanism is dominated by large master narratives inherited from the past. One is the celebratory narrative of male missionary heroism that accompanied the emergence of the new profession of 'foreign missionary' in the nineteenth century. Many people still regard the typical missionary as an itinerant male evangelist in a pith helmet preaching under a palm tree. There is little role in this story for the missionary wife, an essential part of the missionary enterprise long before missionary societies began to recruit a new kind of missionary hero in the late nineteenth century, the unmarried professional woman. An alternative story is the anti-imperialist master narrative in which missionaries, male and female, are simply assumed to be uncritical supporters of British imperialism. If not politically engaged with empire, they were nonetheless cultural imperialists whose primary goal was to civilize the uncivilized and impose Western cultural forms (whether patriarchal, or individualist, or Anglican) on Christian converts and students in mission schools. Finally, there is a new heroic master narrative in recent mission studies, designed to rescue the Church from the discredited mothballs of colonialism by focusing on a celebratory third world Church growth narrative. The heroes are indigenous Christian agents, who ignore or transcend the Christian cultural imperialism of both missionaries and colonial bishops. Here the role of missionaries is marginalized. They are 'detonators' of church growth which is largely the result of indigenous agency. A church is usually defined as an indigenous rather than a colonial or missionary church when it has non-Western leadership. The Bible is defined as an indigenous rather than a foreign text when it is translated into a new language. These are linear narratives, shaped into parables of growth and decline: the rise and fall of British imperialism and its imperial Church, the rise and fall of the Anglican missionary society in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries, the linear upward

slope of indigenous Anglican Christianity with its centre of gravity in Africa rather than England.

The history of Anglicanism during the last century is part of a broader triumphalist history of the expansion of global Christianity. If conventional Christian institutions are declining in the Christian heartland of Europe, they are nonetheless expanding rapidly in other parts of the world. If the Church of England is struggling to keep the doors open, the Anglican Churches of Nigeria, Kenya, and South Sudan have difficulty finding room for their worshippers. The triumphalism of Church growth history serves a number of rhetorical purposes. It is an answer to the secularist triumphalism rooted in the master narrative of secularization, which assumes that there is a hidden hand at work in history causing the decline of all religions in the face of the relentless, global advance of science and rationality. Secularist historians such as Callum Brown believe that history is on the side of the secular, not the religious, and that the task of the historian of religion is to document how secularization works in different times and places.¹ The Church growth story suggests that history might be on the side of Christianity, and holds out the prospect of further Christian advance in the future if, for instance, religious freedom is instituted in China.

The third world Church growth narrative serves another important theological and political purpose in a post-colonial age, and that is to extricate non-Western Churches from the taint of imperialism. This has been important to all non-Western Churches, and in particular for Anglican Churches because of the close and highly visible association of Anglicanism with empire. In China, India, and some Muslim countries, the Western and imperial associations of Christianity can be a matter of life and death. The key word in this narrative is 'indigenous', and the most influential text is Lamin Sanneh's *Translating the Message: The Missionary Impact on Culture* (1989).² Sanneh's work has played a role in mission studies and the history of global Christianity similar to that of Edward Said's *Orientalism* (1978) in the largely secular field of post-colonial studies.³ Both are based on a binary distinction between the West and the Other. Where Said concentrates on the West and its cultural definition of the Other, the 'Orient', in his analysis, Sanneh concentrates on the other side of the binary. The Other is the indigenous, and the history of global Christianity is a search for the indigenous.

It is difficult to overestimate the influence of the binary distinction 'foreign and indigenous' on global Christian history. In the best recent history of global

¹ Callum G. Brown, *The Death of Christian Britain: Understanding Secularisation 1800–2000* (London and New York, 2001).

² Lamin O. Sanneh, *Translating the Message: The Missionary Impact on Culture* (Maryknoll, NY, 1989).

³ Edward W. Said, *Orientalism* (New York, 1978).

Anglicanism, Kevin Ward, 'taking the strictures of Lamin Sanneh to heart', focuses on the growth of forms of Anglicanism that 'become so thoroughly incorporated in the local environment that its superficial resemblance to the Church of England may, on further investigation, be highly misleading'.⁴ Ward recognizes that the story is a complicated one, but the guiding principle, rooted in both mission studies and post-imperial politics, is to search for ways in which non-Western Christianity is indigenous rather than foreign. An example of the extremes to which this approach can be taken is Robert Frykenberg's history of Christianity in India, in which he argues that the foreign influence during half a millennium of foreign Christian intervention in India was largely superficial.⁵

Historians like Ward and Frykenberg, whose work is guided by the search for an indigenous Church, provide an essential counterweight to influential and sophisticated works of post-colonial history and anthropology that unmask the missionary role in history in the imposition of Western, civilizing values on non-Western peoples. Examples of a large body of literature include T. O. Beidelman's highly critical work on Church Missionary Society (CMS) missionaries in East Africa, the influential work of John and Jean Comaroff on South Africa, and Catherine Hall's work on missions in Jamaica.⁶ All of these works document the ways in which missionaries impose Western values—puritanical, individualist, patriarchal—on non-Western Christians, men and women, whose role in the story is almost entirely passive. While post-colonial scholars focus on one side of the binary, the foreign-church growth scholars focus on the other—the indigenous—bringing non-Western Christians to the centre of the story. Following in the secular traditions of Orientalism, post-colonial scholars of Christian missions pay little attention to the theology of missions. Following the theological orientation of *Translating the Message*, the Church growth historians focus on the indigenous side of the binary. It is striking that in the history of global Christianity, the worlds of post-colonial scholarship and global Christian history are ships passing in the night, communicating with each other hardly at all.

The search for the indigenous is rooted in nineteenth-century Protestant theological thought about the nature of a Church in the non-Western world. The most influential theologian of missions was an Anglican, Henry Venn,

⁴ Kevin Ward, *A History of Global Anglicanism* (Cambridge, 2006), p. 10.

⁵ Robert Eric Frykenberg, *A History of Christianity in India: From Beginnings to the Present* (Oxford, 2008).

⁶ T. O. (Thomas O.) Beidelman, *Colonial Evangelism: A Socio-Historical Study of an East African Mission at the Grassroots* (Bloomington, IN, 1982); John L. Comaroff and Jean Comaroff, *Of Revelation and Revolution: Christianity, Colonialism, and Consciousness in South Africa*, 2 vols. (Chicago, 1991–7); Catherine Hall, *Civilising Subjects: Colony and Metropole in the English Imagination, 1830–1867* (Chicago, 2002).

Honorary Secretary of the most important Anglican missionary society, the CMS. Venn is rarely recognized as a theologian of imperialism, but that is what he was. Venn recognized the imperial nature of mission Churches, not as part of an imperialism that comes from the barrel of a gun, but an imperialism that comes from differences in power—the power of professional expertise, and most of all, the power that comes from the possession of knowledge. As an Evangelical Protestant and heir to the Reformation, Venn believed in national Churches. When considering empire, he came face to face with race. He recognized that if the Niger Delta were to have a national Church, it would have to be a black Church, or in the language of the day, a native Church. He recognized that a native Church would have to be, in a phrase well known in mission studies, self-supporting, self-propagating, and self-governing, a phrase that governed official CMS policy in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. He believed that the voluntary society was God's chosen instrument to spread the gospel, but as an Anglican he also believed in episcopal authority and with it an institution that existed side by side with the voluntary society abroad, the diocese. Venn did not regard the diocese as an essential element of a Christian Church. For Venn the diocese was not primarily apostolic but, like the voluntary society, providential, one of the instruments that God had chosen to establish the gospel in England and, later, around the world. It is the tension in global Anglicanism between the institutional principles of society and diocese that creates a history of almost impenetrable complexity.

The linear history of the triumph of the indigenous smooths out that complexity. For Sanneh the heart of global Christian history lies in translation, mainly of the Christian Bible. When non-Western people have a text in their own language, the work of the missionary translator is done. As indigenous Christians spread the word, creating indigenous institutions based on the indigenous Christian language, Christian history becomes the history of the indigenous. Meanwhile the Church of England is consigned to the dustbin of history under the heading of 'secularization'. It is possible to see the global Anglican Communion through a more complicated lens, though, as one in which the Western, imperial, missionary inheritance of the past holds a strong grip on the Anglican Communion everywhere in the world in the twenty-first century. It is necessary, though, to conceptualize the story in a way that avoids the re-imposition of old stories of male missionary triumph, and avoids conceding the anti-imperialist critique that non-Western Christians are in some essential way foreign, i.e. not national.

Perhaps it is possible to draw on some of the insights of post-colonial scholarship to find a way around conceptually simplistic binarism. Mary Louise Pratt's *Imperial Eyes: Travel Writing and Transculturation* (1992) was published fourteen years after Said's *Orientalism*. With the publication of a twenty-fifth anniversary edition of *Imperial Eyes*, Pratt's work is receiving

attention as an alternative to Said as a general approach to imperialism.⁷ Many critics have complained that Said focused on only one side of the binary, i.e. the Western view of 'the Other', failing to recognize that his analysis of the West was never intended to do anything else. Behind those complaints, though, lay unease with the binarism of 'the West and the Other', a concept that Pratt attempts to address in a more sophisticated way. Pratt introduces the concept of a 'contact zone' where Western and non-Western peoples interact with each other on the basis of mutual respect if not of equal power, working to create cultural formations that were neither Western nor indigenous, but hybrid, synthetic, creole, transcultural. She calls this a process of 'transculturation', one that is very different from 'indigenization'. Although Pratt, like Said, exhibits a relentlessly secular point of view based on the presumption of the marginality of religion in the history of the modern age, her idea of a 'contact zone' has been taken up by historians of missions as one that opens up new possibilities for the study of the expansion of global Christianity.⁸

Following Pratt, we can think of the history of global Anglicanism, not as a linear march towards the indigenous, but as a history of human interactions between Western Christians working in contact zones with non-Western Christians, and non-Christians, to create new kinds of Christian institutions. Transcultural is a better word for those institutions than indigenous (a term originally used primarily to label flora and fauna that grow naturally in a particular place). In *Imperial Eyes*, Pratt pays no attention to the contact zones of the foreign missionary enterprise, focusing for the most part on the universalist rhetoric of science. Said does pay attention, but only once, briefly, in the entire body of his scholarship. Relentlessly secular in his scholarship, Said was raised as an Anglican, at one point being sent to Sunday school at the Anglican cathedral in Cairo. Referring to members of his own family who were negotiating ecumenical denominational mergers in Middle Eastern Protestantism, negotiations that included Western church officials, he describes the nature of the contact zone: 'One should note that this touching story concerns an experience of imperialism that is essentially one of sympathy and congruence, not of antagonism, resentment or resistance. The appeal by one of the parties was to the value of mutual experience. True, there had once been a principal and a subordinate, but there had also been dialogue and communication.'⁹

⁷ Mary Louise Pratt, *Imperial Eyes: Travel Writing and Transculturation* (2nd edn., London and New York, 2008).

⁸ Judith Becker (ed.), *European Missions in Contact Zones: Transformation Through Interaction in a (Post-)Colonial World* (Göttingen, 2015).

⁹ Edward W. Said, *Culture and Imperialism* (New York, 1993), p. 40.

Anyone who has devoted time to the study of the missionary enterprise will recognize the accuracy of Said's description of the endless negotiations between foreign Christians and non-Western Christians that went into the collaborative building of transcultural Christian institutions. This history of cooperation, collaboration, conflict, and betrayal, of church planting, church schism, and church unity, began when the white Anglicans in the Society for Promoting Christian Knowledge (SPCK, 1698) and the Society for the Propagation of the Gospel (SPG, 1701) attempted to create Anglican institutions for Native Americans in North America, African slaves in the West Indies, and Hindus in areas under the influence of the East India Company. It continued in the Church Missionary Society founded in 1799 and a model for voluntary Anglican mission societies that proliferated in the nineteenth century, all of which built institutions that required the cooperation of non-Western people. It continued in the large and increasingly multi-racial missionary conferences of the early twentieth century, beginning with the Pan-Anglican Congress (1908) and the 1910 World Missionary Conference in Edinburgh. It continues today in the anguished debates at the Lambeth Conferences over whether the Churches of Nigeria and Uganda can remain in communion with the Churches of Canada and the United States. These are the contact zones of transcultural global Anglicanism.

All Christian bodies require institutions to exist, even if they are institutions as basic as the family or the broadcasting studio. Distinctive to the Anglican Communion is the focus on the diocese as the principle of organizational and theological unity. Looking at the diocese as a human invention, as a historian must, it is difficult to envisage a more inefficient instrument for spreading the Christian faith around the world. It was so inefficient that for most of Anglican history the voluntary society superseded the diocese as the most important institution, and the most important contact zone. The Church of England was a territorial, confessional, parochial, geographical Church, as ill-adapted for transfer to the British Empire as it was for adaptation to rapid industrial and population growth at home. However, as an established Church that combined political and ecclesiastical obligations to minister to everyone within its geographical reach, and as an episcopal Church that took seriously the theological principle of historical continuity as the basis of its spiritual authority, the Church of England could no more do without the diocese than it could act with it. Running throughout the three hundred years of Anglican history is a dialectical conflict between the principle of the episcopal diocese and the principle of the voluntary society, a distinctively Anglican version of the conflict identified by Ernst Troeltsch as the church type on the one hand and the sect type on the other. However committed the SPG was to the diocese, it was a missionary society. However committed the CMS was to the voluntary model, it was committed to the Church of England and the principle of episcopal authority in spiritual matters.

Debates about empire and race then were central to Anglican global expansion from the first. The SPG was founded by royal charter in 1701 as the Society for the Propagation of the Gospel in Foreign Parts, but it was nearly a century before a new diocese was created in those foreign parts (Nova Scotia in 1787). The SPG and its sister society, the Society for Promoting Christian Knowledge, founded even earlier in 1698, functioned as missionary societies throughout the eighteenth century. The SPG recruited 400 ordained English clergymen for parochial work among English settlers in North America and the West Indies, under the spiritual authority of the diocese of London. The SPCK, although initially committed to providing Christian teaching in one of the dark corners of the land, i.e. Wales, through a series of historical accidents took responsibility for the maintenance of fifty German Lutheran missionaries to the Tamil-speaking people of India.

Having assumed imperial obligations, and accepted responsibility for providing Christian teaching beyond the Atlantic islands where it was an established Church except in Scotland, the Church then confronted the issue of race. Although the Church frequently acted as if it were a Church for white people only, no Church officials to my knowledge ever argued that point in principle. The theological principle of Christian universalism triumphed over European racism, although the overwhelming practice of white privilege and white supremacy in the Church created permanent tension that has not been resolved to this day. The 1662 Book of Common Prayer contained a provision for baptizing natives in 'our plantations', and the enthusiastic ecclesiastical entrepreneur Thomas Bray, who played a role in the founding of both the SPCK and the SPG, set both bodies on the only ecclesiastical path that he knew, that of European confessional and territorial Christianity. Native Americans and African Americans alike were to be brought into the institutions of the Church—educated, catechized, baptized, and buried in the Christian faith.

The net effect of all of this work was virtually non-existent, with the one exception of the adoption of Anglican faith by many Mohawks of New York who fled to Ontario after the American Revolution. Bray himself early in the century explained that the reasons for Anglican failure lay in the confessional and parochial nature of the Church itself. He found it impossible to imagine that any people could be Christian unless they lived in settled communities. Almost all missionaries begin their work drawing on the ecclesiastical models familiar to them, and the SPG was familiar with the territorial Church ministering to civilized people. For the most part Anglicans working with non-Western peoples did not accept the view that Christian faith was unavailable to a non-civilized person, but they did not understand how anyone could be baptized, catechized, and confirmed unless they were willing to remain in one place for an extended period of time.

As the SPG confronted the realities of race and empire in North America, the SPCK confronted them in India. This came about due to German Pietist

influence at the courts of both Denmark and England. The court chaplain to Prince George of Denmark, prince consort to Queen Anne, persuaded the SPCK to provide financial support to a small Lutheran mission at the Danish-controlled trading port in Tranquebar. Throughout the eighteenth century the SPCK supported this mission, and a later one established in East India Company regions in Madras. In this large, mostly Tamil-speaking region, non-Western Christians came into a contact zone, and the experience demonstrates a number of characteristics of later Anglican institution-building. They funded the building of Lutheran-style confessional institutions in which the white pastor translated the Bible into Tamil, and built churches and schools. At first, tiny groups of Christians huddled around the imposing and expensive Christian institutions. Later in Madras the SPCK mission began to experience what we now recognize as Church growth, when Christianity began to spread beyond the confines of mission institutions. Faced with thousands of new baptized Christians beyond the shadow of large churches and schools, the Tamil mission began ordaining a class of clergy, catechists who were referred to as 'native priests'. Something new was being created, a new class of clergy, created to meet new conditions of multi-racial Christian institution-building, but one in which Tamil Christians themselves were eager to conform to what was essentially a foreign institution, the clergy. Although subordinate in fundamental ways to foreign clergy, the native catechists had enough independence to make those clergy dependent on them. Foreign missionary clergy could not run Christian institutions without them.

The SPCK annual report for 1791 praises the progress of Christianity in India with a passage that demonstrates (1) their own sense of the relationship between Christianity and empire, i.e. that it was ephemeral and providential rather than essential and permanent; (2) that the aspirations for a native Church that was self-supporting, self-propagating, and self-governing was not invented by nineteenth-century Evangelicals; and (3) that Anglicans intended to return to the diocesan principle of episcopal authority with a territorial bishop, no matter how much expediency might force them to a temporary resort to other methods.

How long it may be in the power of the Society to maintain Missionaries; how long the fluctuations in the affairs of this world will afford duration to the Mission itself, is beyond our calculation; but if we wish to establish the Gospel in India, we ought to look beyond the casualties of war, or the revolutions of empires; we ought in time to give the natives a Church of their own, independent of our support; we ought to have suffragan Bishops in the country, who might ordain Deacons and Priests, and secure a regular succession of truly apostolical Pastors, even if all communications with their parent Church should be annihilated.¹⁰

¹⁰ Cited in Hans Cnatingius, *Bishops and Societies: A Study of Anglican Colonial and Missionary Expansion 1698–1850*. Published for the Church Historical Society (London, 1952), p. 110.

If Anglican experiments in building multi-racial, transcultural institutions in India could be declared a success, the SPG's attempts to foster Christian institutions among the indigenous peoples of North America could only be treated as a failure. An even greater failure lay in the third British imperial field of Anglican work, the West Indies. Anglican complicity in the Atlantic system of slavery is with hindsight one of the great moral and spiritual failures in Christian history, and it is not because Anglicans accepted slavery as compatible with Christianity. Almost all eighteenth-century Christians in the Atlantic world accepted the compatibility of slavery with Christianity (the few exceptions include John Wesley). The failure lay with the abdication of parochial responsibility for slaves by a Church that was committed in principle to provide the sacraments of baptism, confirmation, and Christian marriage to African slaves. The virtually complete neglect of their obligations could only be achieved by a kind of doublespeak, or cognitive dissonance, on the part of the Anglican clergy. Although they could and did claim racial inferiority on the part of slaves, based either on stadial theories of civilization or in rare cases the Hamitic theory of racial difference, they could not deny (as some scientific racists did) that black people were humans with souls and therefore capable of Christian faith.

One person who saw through the cognitive dissonance was the archbishop of Canterbury, Thomas Secker, who in 1764 in the course of a pamphlet advocating the establishment of a bishopric in the American colonies, defended the failure of the SPG to provide Christian teaching to several hundred thousand West Indian slaves.¹¹ He shifted the blame to slave-owners, 'hard men' who as proprietors often endowed parishes in the West Indies, and became patrons of clerical appointments. In a Church that was entirely dependent on landowners and lay patrons who appointed the clergy at home, Secker explained that they were powerless to countermand the authority of lay patrons abroad. SPG annual sermons in the eighteenth century are littered with condemnations of slave-owners, not for their cruelty to slaves, but for their neglect of their obligations as Christian patrons. This has led some historians to treat the SPG as a liberal, anti-racist force. The hypocrisy of the bishops is laid bare when one examines the treatment of the SPG's own slaves on the Codrington Estate in Barbados, where they were forced to work on Sunday, see members of their families sold, and whipped as mercilessly as if they were owned by 'hard men'.

SPG justifications for slavery were based on an assumption of the essential spiritual unity of mankind. They supported schools for African American children in North America, and sponsored and trained an African, Philip

¹¹ Thomas Secker, Archbishop of Canterbury, attrib., *An Answer to Dr. Mayhew's Observations on the Charter and Conduct of the Society for the Propagation of the Gospel in Foreign Parts* (London, 1764).

Quaque, to be a missionary. Ordained in 1765 by the bishop of London at the Royal Chapel of St James's Palace, Quaque was sent out as a missionary to his own people and chaplain to the slave trading fort at Cape Castle. Trained as a clergyman in a confessional church, he remained there until 1811, baptized and buried white and black alike, held prayers in his rooms which white people sometimes attended, and opened a school for mixed-race girls. Like the bishops in England, he complained about the harsh treatment of the slaves passing through the fort, but he never condemned slavery itself. The SPG, having established their good faith in ordaining one black man, neglected to organize a programme to train and ordain more black clergy.

Philip Quaque created a kind of contact zone at the Cape Castle, where white military officers attended prayers conducted by a black clergyman. The Mohawks carried their Anglican faith with them to Ontario, and later an SPG missionary began rebuilding Anglican institutions among them. A much larger contact zone could be found among the Tamil-speaking Christians in India, with native pastors ministering to their own people. When low-caste Tamils began to adopt Christianity it was a way of setting themselves apart from their elites. Compelled to create a class of clergy and teachers in order to provide pastoral care that was beyond the ability of SPCK missionaries, they created a class of non-Western religious leaders that was inevitably beyond the control of the mission. In India, as was the case almost everywhere that Christianity grew under Anglican auspices, non-Western Christian leaders were as eager to incorporate the foreign as they were to maintain the indigenous in their institutions. The stereotype of missionaries as imposing foreign forms on indigenous Christians misrepresents the very widespread enthusiasm for the foreign among non-Western Christians, particularly the forms of authority wrapped up in ordination, which in Anglican terms led to the formation of dioceses with bishops. When the SPG assumed responsibility for the pastoral supervision of SPCK Tamil Christians in the early nineteenth century, the first thing they did was provide regularly constituted (i.e. not Lutheran) ordinations for Tamil clergy.

When Evangelical Anglicans founded the 'Society for Missions to Africa and the East instituted by Members of the Established Church' in 1799, later renamed the Church Missionary Society (CMS), they were responding to a round of denominational growth on the part of Nonconformists—Methodists, Moravians, Congregationalists, and Baptists—mostly Evangelicals who were experimenting with new methods of spreading the gospel to India and the West Indies through the creation of voluntary societies. A century of Anglican missionary work by the SPCK and SPG had little to show for it, especially after the expulsion or voluntary departure of SPG clergy and teachers from the United States of America. The founders of the CMS, as their original title indicates, were less interested than the SPG in ministering to white settlers in the empire than to non-whites, and it appeared that a voluntary society made

sense. They were committed to episcopacy and the diocese, but were unwilling to allow the bureaucratic inefficiencies of bishops at home or abroad to interfere with the urgent task of spreading the gospel to all peoples, especially when those who could read the signs of the times saw new providential openings in Africa, India, and the South Pacific. The CMS set out to create a new profession, the ordained missionary without a university degree, trained if possible at the new Church Missionary College opened in Islington in 1825, and ordained if possible if bishops could be found who would ordain men who were not quite gentlemen.¹²

At the heart of the missionary enterprise was institution-building. Missionaries everywhere built institutions of one kind or another, depending on local circumstances and the shifting strategies of the sending society. Even the 'faith missions' of the late nineteenth century such as the China Inland Mission, while claiming to reject mission institutions, built an alternative set of institutions to train non-Western clergy and teachers. The emergence of the CMS as the largest and most successful Anglican mission society heightened the tension evident from the earliest days of Anglican missions between the voluntary society and the territorial diocese. They had no intention, though, of waiting on the creation of episcopal dioceses before attempting to build multi-racial institutions to jump-start, if possible, the emergence of a native, i.e. non-white Church, one that would ultimately feature a non-white clergy and a non-white episcopate. The CMS acted in good faith in fostering multi-racial institutions, but their success led to interminable confusion and conflict over accountability and authority.¹³

The problems of success in working out the problems of empire and race first became apparent in Sierra Leone, where Evangelicals had been at work since the founding of the colony to create institutions for the free slaves settled there, known as 'creoles' to distinguish them from original inhabitants. The CMS opened its Fourah Bay Institute in 1827 to train Christian creoles as teachers, and in the 1840s opened a grammar school for boys and later one for girls. Training was later provided by the CMS for catechists, an inferior level of clergy. Teachers in mission schools, and catechists in mission churches, were in effect employees of the CMS, a society not a Church. Like bureaucracies everywhere, the CMS in Sierra Leone and later throughout the world was jealous to maintain control of what it funded. Teachers and catechists became distinguished figures in the emergence of a creole Christianity in Freetown,

¹² C. Peter Williams, *The Ideal of the Self-Governing Church: A Study in Victorian Missionary Strategy*. Studies in Christian Mission, vol. 1 (Leiden and New York, 1990).

¹³ T. E. Yates, *Venn and Victorian Bishops Abroad: The Missionary Policies of Henry Venn and Their Repercussions Upon the Anglican Episcopate of the Colonial Period, 1841-1872* (Uppsala, 1978).

a contact zone where something new and unfamiliar was built, a black church with a high level of dependence upon a foreign mission.

Eager to foster what Henry Venn referred to as ‘the euthanasia of the mission’, the CMS pressed forward with ordinations under a white missionary bishop created in 1852. Within a decade there was a body of ordained creoles with even more prestige in the Christian community than teachers, followed by a predictable struggle for control of resources between white missionaries and black church leaders.¹⁴ The transcultural community had characteristics that made it impossible for the creole church to become self-supporting, self-propagating, and self-governing. It could not become self-supporting without employment in mission institutions. Furthermore, creole Christians were creating a society that placed a very high importance on Western-style English education and Christian marriage, i.e. monogamy, complete with expensive wedding celebrations. Missionaries began to regard creole Christians as unready for independence because of the laxity of their Christian faith. Missionaries were themselves virtuoso Christians, heroes of the Church at home because of the sacrifices they made to bring the gospel to Africa. The spiritual gap between missionary and creole Christian was even greater than that between an ordinary parish clergyman at home and his spiritually lax parishioners.

The conflict between institution-building and CMS aspirations resulted, not in an indigenous native Church, but a hybrid Church that was in a permanent state of conflict between the local community and society missionaries. It is important though to look at the nature of the conflict, which was replicated in different forms during the period of British missionary expansion. Some early African nationalists in Sierra Leone began to argue for complete separation of the Church from missionaries, but there is little reason to believe that most creole Christians or African clergy wanted that. They were as committed to Anglican forms of Christian expression as the missionaries—perhaps more so, since their status as a Christian community was defined in part by their relationship with diocese and society. They were picking and choosing elements of the foreign presence to adopt, but they often chose the least indigenous of those elements, especially in terms of forms of worship and the adoption of the highly attractive patriarchal Victorian family. African Christian clergy did not want to send white missionaries or bishops home. They wanted instead to strengthen their own bargaining power in the struggle to shape the character of the Church.

As these tensions proliferated in other parts of the world, the CMS aspirations for a self-governing native Church were not abandoned but postponed. Henry Venn wanted to euthanize a mission that continued to grow, but he was

¹⁴ Ward, *A History of Global Anglicanism*, ch. 7.

determined to make one last effort in West Africa to establish, not merely an African priesthood, but an African episcopate. The story of Samuel Ajayi Crowther has been told many times, usually as a means of indicting Victorian CMS missionaries for their racism, hypocrisy, and arrogance (of which there was plenty on display) but also for lamenting the CMS's abandonment, after the death of Henry Venn in 1873, of its high hopes for a non-white episcopate. Consecrated in Canterbury Cathedral in 1864, Crowther was given the title of Bishop in West Africa beyond the queen's dominions, segregating him from authority over the urban centres of Lagos and Abeokuta, but also from the growing CMS Church in the Yoruba lands of western Nigeria, Crowther's original homeland. When he died in 1891 he was replaced with a white bishop, after CMS missionaries persuaded the CMS in London that the native Church was not up to the standards required for self-government.

On the one hand this is a story of the assertion of white privilege, based on clerical and spiritual superiority, and the abandonment of CMS aspirations for an African Church based on black episcopal authority. On the other hand, an exclusive focus on that story diverts attention from another one, the development of a transcultural, multi-racial Nigerian Church that would eventually become the largest Anglican Church in the world. At the heart of that story is the emergence of a class of Yoruba catechists, documented in John Peel's *Religious Encounter and the Making of the Yoruba* (2000).¹⁵ Bishop Crowther devoted much of his time and energy to translation of the Bible into the Yoruba language, and he and other translators provided the texts that both missionaries and catechists used to create Christian institutions among the Yoruba people. The relationship of missionaries and catechists was not one of merely providing translations that detonated an indigenous Nigerian Church. Catechists (and their wives) worked closely with missionaries in a relationship that was paternalistic but also, in Edward Said's words, 'an experience of imperialism that is essentially one of sympathy and congruence, not of antagonism, resentment or resistance'.¹⁶

Peel refers to a process, not of 'indigenization', but of 'inculturation', i.e. the embodiment of Christianity in a particular local culture.¹⁷ Perhaps a better word is Pratt's 'transculturation', a word that perfectly describes the central text produced by the new Christian intelligentsia of Nigeria, Samuel Johnson's *The History of the Yorubas from the Earliest Times to the Beginning of the British Protectorate* (1921). First drafted in the 1890s, *The History of the Yorubas* treated the Yoruba people as a new Israel, a people chosen by God

¹⁵ J. D. Y. Peel, *Religious Encounter and the Making of the Yoruba: African Systems of Thought* (Bloomington, IN, 2000).

¹⁶ Said, *Culture and Imperialism*, p. 40.

¹⁷ Peel, *Religious Encounter and the Making of the Yoruba*, p. 278.

for a special place in world history.¹⁸ A post-colonial scholar such as Partha Chatterjee would no doubt classify this text as a ‘derivative discourse’, while a Church growth historian in the Sannehian tradition would see it as ‘indigenous’, but it is in fact something entirely new, an instance of ‘transculturation’.¹⁹

As the CMS grew to become the largest Anglican mission society in the nineteenth century, other Anglican mission societies were formed, some Evangelical and some moderately High Church. The CMS’s goal was to create a native Church, and then supply it with a bishop. The SPG, along with the Episcopal Church in the United States of America, began to argue for ‘missionary bishops’, who would build a Church from above. The sheer power of the episcopal ideal appeared in the first bishop to officially be designated a ‘missionary bishop’, i.e. a bishop without a Church, an American, Jackson Kemper, with a special mission to Native Americans in the American West. At his consecration George Washington Doane outlined the high concept of the ideal of sending a bishop to places where there was no Church.

If obedient to the Saviour’s mandate, to preach the Gospel to every creature, we send out heralds of the Cross to China, Texas, Persia, Georgia, or Armenia—upon what principle can we neglect, or on what ground can we refuse—since from their own feebleness and poverty they cannot have a Bishop of their own, or in their ignorant blindness, they do not desire it—to send to them at our own cost and charge, and in the Saviour’s name, a Missionary Bishop?²⁰

The practice of sending missionary bishops to areas where bishops were not welcome created episcopal martyrs for the Church of England in the nineteenth century, providing a counterpart to the Presbyterian and Nonconformist hagiography surrounding David Livingstone. The deaths of Charles Frederick Mackenzie, the ‘Bishop of Central Africa’, who died in 1862 as part of the moderately High Church Universities Mission to Central Africa, and John Coleridge Patteson, the ‘Bishop of Melanesia’, who died in a hail of arrows in 1871, generated a vast body of Sunday school literature and one of the classics of episcopal hagiography.²¹ The High Church bishops sent by the SPG had this in common with CMS-affiliated bishops such as Samuel Crowther of the Niger Delta, and the scholar-bishop of Lahore, Thomas Valpy French: they were institution builders presiding over a territorial diocese, working out the contradictions of race and empire.

¹⁸ The Rev. Samuel Johnson, ed. by Dr O. Johnson, *The History of the Yorubas from the Earliest Times to the Beginning of the British Protectorate* (London, 1921).

¹⁹ Partha Chatterjee, *Nationalist Thought and the Colonial World: A Derivative Discourse* (London, 1986).

²⁰ Cnattinijus, *Bishops and Societies*, p. 201.

²¹ Charlotte Mary Yonge, *Life of John Coleridge Patteson, Missionary Bishop of the Melanesian Islands, in Two Volumes* (London, 1874).

Henry Venn found the concept of a bishop without a Church absurd, but he never challenged the spiritual authority of a bishop to ordain, nor did he challenge the inevitability of a geographical diocese. It was all a matter of timing.

The CMS experimented in various places with Native Church Councils, operating independently of diocese and bishops. Ultimately, sometimes after decades, the Native Church Councils were brought under the umbrella of the diocese and the bishop. Some dioceses in Africa and India experimented with separate diocesan organizations for white and non-white Anglicans, hoping in some cases (e.g. Lahore) to provide for some non-Western autonomy in the Church and in other places (e.g. Kenya) to protect white settlers from falling under the ecclesiastical supervision of non-whites. In a Church that was formally if not practically anti-racist, these structures could not long survive decolonization, but white privilege survived in the episcopate. Diocese and bishop provided the principle of unity in the Anglican Communion, usually with the consent of non-white Anglicans, who simultaneously complained about and consented to white episcopal authority. The experience of white episcopal privilege in dioceses with overwhelmingly non-white laity continued well after decolonization. In the diocese of Lahore, with its grand nineteenth-century Gothic cathedral, it was nearly twenty years after Pakistani independence that a non-white bishop was consecrated (1968). Throughout the decolonization struggles in Africa white bishops could be found, either taken by surprise or negotiating a path for the diocese and its institutional structures, especially Anglican schools.²² The resulting post-colonial dioceses, regardless of their theological orientation, are heavily marked with the legacy of episcopal authority and prestige, which non-white bishops appreciated and wished to retain.

The shared passion for institution-building overseas created contact zones that were inevitably dominated by white missionaries, whether in the cathedral or the mission station, with hierarchies of race based on the superior ecclesiastical and educational and medical credentials of white professionals. The SPG focused on parochial expansion in areas of white settlement, but they were always committed to a multi-racial Church, and despite their commitment to the territorial diocese, their institutions were often accountable to the SPG in London rather than to the bishop. In the 1890s, the SPG sent 240 ordained missionaries to Canada, 560 to South Africa, 460 to Australia and Tasmania, and 100 to New Zealand. Six hundred though went to India, and by 1900 one half of SPG funding was directed to India. The progress of non-white ordinations was glacial, but reached a critical mass by 1900, when 8 per cent of SPG ordained missionaries were defined as non-white.²³

²² John Stuart, *British Missionaries and the End of Empire: East, Central, and Southern Africa, 1939–1964* (Grand Rapids, MI, 2011).

²³ Daniel O'Connor and others, *Three Centuries of Mission: The United Society for the Propagation of the Gospel 1701–2000* (London and New York, 2000), pp. 68, 72.

In the history of foreign missions, the Edinburgh Conference of 1910 holds pride of place as the apogee of the Anglo-American Protestant missionary enterprise.²⁴ More important for the future of global Anglicanism, though, was the Pan-Anglican Congress of 1908. After two centuries of Anglican expansion around the world, the Congress was based on the principle that the institutional building block of a global Church was the territorial diocese presided over by a bishop. Edinburgh 1910 was a conference dominated by the missionary society, the characteristic nineteenth-century institutional improvisation that provided a way for British and Irish Protestants to relate to Christians in the rest of the world, in the empire and beyond. These contrasting principles were reflected in the differential levels of participation in the two conferences by the two most important Anglican missionary societies, the SPG and the CMS. Mission activists in the early twentieth century often commented that the CMS was actually a ‘society for propagating the gospel’, and the SPG a ‘Church missionary society’. The tension between the confessional and voluntarist approaches to foreign missions, and between the institutions of the diocese and the voluntary society, ran not merely between but through both the SPG and the CMS. The Pan-Anglican Congress had been organized by the head of the SPG, Bishop H. H. Montgomery, who believed that all foreign mission funds should be directed through an overseas diocese, a position rejected by the CMS at the time.²⁵ Enthusiastic participants in the Pan-Anglican Congress, the SPG kept the Edinburgh Conference at a distance, deciding only at the last moment to participate officially. The CMS, who regarded themselves as part of a global Anglo-American multi-denominational Christian offensive around the world, played a central role in Edinburgh.²⁶

Many of the unresolved contradictions and failures of global Anglican expansion evident in the eighteenth century were on display at the Pan-Anglican Congress and Edinburgh 1910, although they were papered over by an almost uniform sense of providential geo-religious triumphalism. The early twentieth century marked the peak of missionary growth in Britain, with nearly 9,000 Protestant missionaries stationed abroad by 1925 (over 60 per cent of them women) presiding over a multi-racial staff nearly ten times that size.²⁷ For Anglicans, many parts of the world were now provided with a bishop and a diocese, and some parts of the world saw the beginnings of the twentieth-century phenomenon of Church growth spilling over into Anglican missions even while creating institutional chaos at the diocesan level.

²⁴ Brian Stanley, *The World Missionary Conference, Edinburgh 1910* (Grand Rapids, MI, 2009).

²⁵ Steven S. Maughan, *Mighty England Do Good: Culture, Faith, Empire, and World in the Foreign Missions of the Church of England, 1850–1915* (Grand Rapids, MI, 2014).

²⁶ Stanley, *The World Missionary Conference, Edinburgh 1910*.

²⁷ Jeffrey Cox, *The British Missionary Enterprise since 1700* (London and New York, 2008), p. 270.

It is telling that the issue of race received more attention at the Pan-Anglican Congress than at Edinburgh 1910, in part because of the presence of black clergy, and in part because the nature of the diocese provided a strong barrier to the creation of separated non-white churches. A special session focusing on the Mission in Christendom was devoted largely to the role of race in the Anglican Church. There were open expressions of racism at the Congress, the most emphatic coming from Lt. Col. R. Chester-Master, Resident Commissioner of Rhodesia, who claimed that separation of the races had to be maintained indefinitely, as the alternatives of extermination, transportation, and absorption are impossible to think of. He envisaged non-territorial racial segregation as in the American south, which will 'probably necessitate the . . . development of the Church's organization in that country along racial lines', a view echoed by bishops from the American south. He admitted that segregation may be impossible under a 'purely territorial system', and questioned how the 'white man's burden . . . can be scientifically borne in the spirit of Christianity'.²⁸

What Chester-Master brought into the open was the incompatibility of Anglicanism with scientific racism, and the inability to conceive of the Church organized along racial rather than diocesan lines. That is, white racial privilege was widely evident among Anglicans globally. But Chester-Master's racist frustration with Anglican diocesan structure was based on the historical inability of Anglicans to institutionalize racial privilege. In a global church, consecration to the episcopate was not and could not be based on race, and ordination to the priesthood was not and could not be based on race. Race-based improvisations such as the gerrymandered diocese in the Niger Delta, or synodical governance within dioceses such as Lahore, lacked theological adequate justification.

Speakers not from South Africa or the American south generally echoed the contrasting views of the bishop-elect of Zanzibar, Frank Weston, who conceded that whites were more advanced in the arts of civilization than Africans, but anticipated the increasingly common pulpit rhetoric of twentieth-century Anglicanism, arguing that 'our fallen nature is impregnated with prejudice against the black man' and 'Colour prejudice is evil: Christ was a "coloured" man. She [the Church] must refuse to legislate on the basis of colour prejudice.'²⁹ By 1908 there was a critical mass of black Christians, some of whom were delegates and whose comments met with sustained applause. Mr. J. A. Buckle, a native delegate from Sierra Leone, argued that racism was a white man's

²⁸ Pan-Anglican Congress, *Church Work as Affected by Race Problems*, vol. S. E. Group 3 of *Pan-Anglican Papers, Being Problems for Consideration at the Pan-Anglican Congress* (London, 1908), pp. 158, 161.

²⁹ Pan-Anglican Congress, *The Church's Mission in Christendom*, vol. VI. Section E of *Official Report*, Speeches and discussions together with the papers published for the consideration of the Congress (London, 1908), p. 134.

problem. 'As a member of one of the subject races he felt that they wanted sympathy and cooperation and that they wanted teaching. Our Saviour, when on earth, touched the leper; surely if He did that there could be no objection to a white man touching a Zulu. Our Lord himself was a member of a subject race, and as a member of that he was liable to all the disabilities of a subject race. There were cardinal events in His life from which they all hoped for eternal salvation [Applause]... They wanted to be taken into partnership in the organization of their native Church, so that the day might come when there would be an African Church in full communion with the Anglican Church.'³⁰

How this was to be done within a diocesan structure was unclear. The bishop of Cape Town described the enormous confusion surrounding his role as Acting Provincial of the Order of Ethiopia, an African independent Church with ministers ordained in the African Methodist Episcopal Church of the United States of America, that was incorporated into the Anglican Church in 1900, with former ministers licensed by the bishop as readers, catechists, and subdeacons. The bishop hoped that this would be a model for an autonomous black Church, one appropriate for South Africa, within the Anglican Church, but he admitted that there was no precedent in Church history for a racial episcopate except as an exceptional expedient. 'If we adhere strictly to the territorial delimitation of dioceses and parishes, we must adopt one of two alternatives: either no Native can be appointed to any position of authority at all, whether as Bishop, Archdeacon, or Rector; or Natives must be given authority over Europeans.'³¹

Other speakers suggested without much enthusiasm a 'uniate' model for separate racial Churches, and others described schemes for separate racial 'synods' within a diocese, an experiment that was tried under one name or another at one time or another in Hong Kong, Kenya, and Lahore, but arguments returned to one principle: the unity of the diocese. Lurking behind all of the arguments was a recognition that if non-whites are to be brought into the Anglican Communion, racism had to be recognized as a problem. The Revd C. R. G. Thomas of Jamaica perhaps inadvertently answered the question of why a black person would attend a church that was only seventy-five years before deeply implicated in the evil of slavery. He claimed that

The Colour Question as it exists in the Southern States of North America and in South Africa is unknown in this island. The problem of black, coloured, and white people learning to live together in amity may be said to be solving itself on common-sense lines. There seems no need to debate possible methods of solving that problem, as the methods already in use are working out well... No colour

³⁰ Pan-Anglican Congress, *The Church's Mission in Christendom*, p. 140.

³¹ Pan-Anglican Congress, *Church Work as Affected by Race Problems*, pp. 7-8.

distinctions are made in the order in which people go to receive Holy Communion. The better class folk, of whatever colour, usually occupy the front seats much as they would in any ordinary English church. The humbler folk, again irrespective of colour, usually occupy the back seats. All the occupants of the front seats go to the altar before those in the back seats.³²

The most snobbish Church in Christendom was discovering that the structures of parish and diocesan hierarchy could be a recruiting tool, as they have been in many parts of the world.

Two black African bishops who spoke on the nature of the emerging African Church were both from the CMS, which nominated them to be 'assistant bishops' in the wake of the failure to appoint a bishop to replace Crowther. Isaac Oluwole, an assistant bishop of Western Equatorial Africa, spoke with self-confidence that combined resentment of white domination of the Church with prescriptive advice to the white audience about what he assumed was a shared goal of fostering a transcultural form of Christianity suitable for West Africa. He expressed scepticism about whether the Book of Common Prayer could be adapted for the African Church, but enthusiasm about the prospects for developing an African hymnody with tunes that matched the lyrics. Oluwole predicted correctly the central role of music in African Church growth. He also complained about one of the pillars of white domination of non-white Churches everywhere, the inappropriate standards applied for ordination. The CMS catechists in Nigeria were the pastors for the large majority of Christians, but were held to professional standards that prevented them from celebrating Holy Communion. These comments were echoed by Bishop James Johnson, also assistant bishop of Western Equatorial Africa, who went further in putting a direct challenge to white domination of the Church: the liturgy of the Church was not suitable for Africans, neither were the hymns. 'How it was that the Mohammedans were able to govern their own churches, while they, the Christians, had always to be supervised from abroad. He left the answer to that question to the Congress.'³³

Note that these were appeals for sympathy and cooperation from within the Anglican family, not threats to form an independent African Church not in communion with the Church of England. Oluwole called for Europeans to overcome their racism and 'to identify themselves with the native Church life, and not to stand aloof from it as they did at present'.³⁴ These discussions had been going on in mission circles for decades, but white missionaries and clergy often found themselves shocked to confront them. When the Revd Samuel Azariah

³² Pan-Anglican Congress, *Church Work as Affected by Race Problems*, p. 3.

³³ Pan-Anglican Congress, *The Church's Missions in Non-Christian Lands*, vol. V. Section D of *Official Report*. Speeches and discussions together with the papers published for the consideration of the Congress (London, 1908), pp. 65, 66.

³⁴ Pan-Anglican Congress, *The Church's Missions in Non-Christian Lands*, p. 65.

travelled from India to address the World Missionary Conference at Edinburgh, he threw down a similar challenge to the trans-denominational gathering that was met with murmurs of disapproval from the white church officials in the audience: 'Through all the ages to come the Indian Church will rise up in gratitude to attest the heroism and self-denying labours of the missionary body. You have given your goods to feed the poor. You have given your bodies to be burned. We also ask for Love. Give us Friends.'³⁵

Two years later Azariah who, like Oluwole and Johnson, came from the CMS Evangelical tradition, was consecrated bishop of the new diocese of Dornakal in St Paul's Cathedral in Calcutta. As the first non-white Anglican bishop in South Asia, Azariah was regarded like Crowther before him as evidence of the good faith of white missionaries and clergy in their support for a multi-racial Church. Azariah then set out to build a cathedral, for what is a diocese without one? By the time Epiphany Cathedral was consecrated in 1936 Azariah had ordained several hundred Indians. His commitment to ordination and episcopacy was a two-edged sword, though, for it was the diocesan principle of episcopal control of ordination that reinforced the bulwark of white privilege in the Anglican Communion: clerical professionalism. Like Crowther's diocese, Dornakal was created as an 'indigenous' bishopric, gerrymandered to make sure that white Anglicans were not under the spiritual care of a non-white bishop. At the time of his death in 1945 Azariah remained the only non-white bishop in India with full episcopal authority; like Crowther before him he was replaced by a white bishop. Azariah though remained committed to the principles of the Anglican Communion. He devoted his life to working within that contact zone to create an Indian Church, one that was neither foreign nor indigenous, but transcultural. Azariah's appeal for 'friendship' in 1910 anticipated E. M. Forster's indictment of imperialism in *A Passage to India* (1924). 'Why can't we be friends', asks one of characters in the famous end of the novel, where a white and an Indian man have found that to be impossible across the massive and impenetrable imperial divide. Azariah like many other non-white Anglicans, especially clergy, had found a contact zone where it was possible to respond to his appeal for friendship.

It was not obvious in 1910 that the historical relationship of the Anglican Churches to non-Western Anglicans would be through the missionary society or through the diocese. Azariah came from a CMS tradition of cooperation with interdenominational voluntary societies, serving as a staffer for the Indian YMCA before his ordination, and as he built up the diocese of Dornakal, he also worked to create a multi-denominational Church of South India. Edinburgh 1910 led to the creation of a multi-denominational global set

³⁵ W. H. T. Gairdner, 'Edinburgh 1910', in *An Account and Interpretation of the World Missionary Conference* (Edinburgh and London, 1910), p. 110.

of institutional contact zones in which Anglicans participated, including the International Missionary Council and the International Missionary Conferences in Jerusalem in 1928 and Madras in 1938. Both conferences saw an increasing participation by non-white clergy and ministers, and the adoption of an increasingly emphatic anti-racism as a core value of interdenominational cooperation. These mission conferences laid the groundwork for the twentieth-century ecumenical movement, and the foundation of the World Council of Churches. The missionary societies themselves suffered from financial retrenchment after the First World War but continued to recruit and send white staff overseas, a majority of them women. The SPG reached its peak staffing year in 1926.

Given the widespread idealism surrounding the ecumenical movement in the mid-twentieth century, it was not at all clear that the Anglican Communion's relationship with non-Western Churches would be governed by the diocesan principle. The Kikuyu crisis of 1913, though, was a kind of warning shot across the bow of the looming demand for ecumenical cooperation and even unity. Frank Weston, the bishop of Zanzibar, complained to the archbishop of Canterbury that Anglican clergy in East Africa had participated in a shared communion service with ministers of other denominations. The controversy dragged on for months, but the upshot was the inability of Anglicans to find any principle that would allow anyone to preside over Holy Communion unless first ordained by a bishop. Even longer lasting were the interminable negotiations to forge, at the peak of ecumenical enthusiasm, a multi-denominational Church of South India, which was finally created in 1947. While recognizing that the Church of South India had been outfitted with an episcopate, defenders of Anglican orthodoxy believed that a principle had been breached by recognizing the orders of non-episcopal denominations. In 1943 T. S. Eliot called the negotiations for a trans-denominational Church 'the greatest crisis in the Church of England since the Reformation'.³⁶ The complexity of the compromise and the hard feelings generated meant that the infringements on episcopal authority in the Church of South India prevented it from being a model to be followed widely outside of South Asia. The Church of South India was only accepted as a full member of the Lambeth Conference in 1998.

The 'diocesanization' of Anglicanism combined with the continued recruitment of white staff meant that the Anglican Communion would remain top-heavy with white foreigners at the diocesan level. Azariah's vigorous programme of ordaining non-white clergy meant that Anglicanism would be heavily male-dominated in comparison to the staff of the missionary societies. Catechists could be elevated to the priesthood; Bible Women, many of them married to

³⁶ Ward, *A History of Global Anglicanism*, p. 235.

catechists, would remain Bible Women. The Mothers' Union was one of the largest Anglican missionary societies in the twentieth century, and had an enormous influence in shaping the nature of African Anglicanism.³⁷ Mothers' Union officials, though, presided over what amounted to a women's auxiliary within the diocesan structure. The ordination and consecration of non-whites was accepted in principle, if not observed in practice, by the mid-twentieth century. The ordination and consecration of women was not even accepted in principle. When the bishop of Victoria (Hong Kong) ordained Li Tim-Oi as the first female priest in the Anglican Communion, it was regarded as a wartime expedient and was not repeated anywhere for another thirty years. Her ordination, though, was not the first time that overseas bishops generated controversies that reverberated through the Church of England.

Azariah's commitment to the Anglican diocese had political consequences. He was extremely ambivalent, as were many Christians in the British Empire, about the growth of nationalism, which he believed would put Christians in a compromised position. India was not the only place where the imperial associations of non-white Anglicans would leave them vulnerable and exposed after the end of empire, whether formal as in India or informal as in China. After the end of empire, the contact zone for white and non-white Anglicans became the decennial Lambeth Conferences, which acted as a kind of spiritual Commonwealth of Churches, dominated by bishops.

As international mission conferences became less important, and enthusiasm for the ecumenical movement waned, this dialectical tension between non-Western deference, not to mention respect for the good will of the Western bishops and the archbishop of Canterbury on the one hand, and the assertion of episcopal authority on matters of scriptural authority on the other, provided the central story of the late twentieth-century Lambeth Conferences.

In the second half of the twentieth century the number of non-white bishops grew slowly but steadily as the decennial Lambeth Conference provided a contact zone where white and non-white Christians could meet as spiritual equals. Imperialism did not disappear with empire. Inequality and racism and the lethal power of Western militarism confront Anglicans around the world, and create fault-lines among the Churches in the Anglican Communion. These disagreements, though, were for the most part among friends, who were for the most part bishops. The SPG writer in the eighteenth century who urged his readers to 'look beyond the casualties of war, or the revolutions of empires' to a post-imperial Church might have had the Lambeth Conferences in mind.³⁸ The largest contingent at the 1998 Lambeth Conference was

³⁷ Elizabeth Prevost, *The Communion of Women: Missions and Gender in Colonial Africa and the British Metropole* (Oxford, 2010).

³⁸ Cnattingius, *Bishops and Societies*, p. 110.

from Africa (224), followed by the United States and Canada (177), the United Kingdom and Europe (139), Asia (95), Australia (56), Central and South America (41), and the Middle East (4).³⁹

Azariah's appeal to white Christians in 1910 for friendship was answered in the course of the twentieth century with the racial integration of the Church. The patience of non-white Anglicans in the face of this often infuriating pace of change can only be explained by their confidence in the commitment of an imperial Church to the forging of a multi-racial Church. The same could be said of the patience of Anglican women in the long, slow struggle for the ordination of women and their consecration as bishops. It is difficult to explain how that could be done without a common appeal to the spiritual importance of the historic episcopate, to a Church whose authority is rooted in history. In one sense the triumph of the diocese is testimony to the power of a theological ideal. The divisions within Anglicanism over the ordination and consecration of women, over homosexual ordination and consecration, are fought out in that context. In the dialectical conflict between the indigenous and the foreign, global Anglicanism has become something new.

The late twentieth-century Lambeth Conferences, like the early twentieth-century mission societies before them, and the global bureaucracies of the mid-century ecumenical movement, are human inventions, subject to the revolutions of history. It was at the 1998 Conference that the tension between episcopal authority and sexuality might have reached a limit beyond which dialectical reconciliation became impossible in this particular contact zone. It was there that the bishop of Enugu in Nigeria confronted in public and attempted an exorcism of a representative of the Lesbian and Gay Christian Movement in front of television cameras. More important was the inability of the attenders to reach any resolution of the status of homosexual priests and bishops, or the practice of recognizing same-sex marriages by the Episcopal Church in the United States and the Anglican Church of Canada. By 2008 a rival to the Lambeth Conference was organized, the Global Anglican Future Conference (GAFCON), which created a transcultural organization dominated by bishops, mostly from Africa, who believed that many of the Churches in the Anglican Communion had fallen away from the true Christian faith. GAFCON's founding conference was attended by 291 bishops. Nevertheless, the resemblance of the Anglican Churches in this new global structure to the Church of England could never be called superficial.

This can only be called a schism, a painful one for many people who still ask with Bishop Azariah why we can't be friends. What the relationship between GAFCON and Lambeth will be remains to be seen, but Anglicanism is remaking itself again. All sides continue to appeal to the spiritual authority

³⁹ Andrew Brown and Linda Woodhead, *That Was the Church That Was: How the Church of England Lost the English People* (London, 2016), p. 237.

of the historical episcopate, with its bishops and cathedrals, and incorporating many forms of worship including those drawing on the heritage of the Book of Common Prayer.

SELECT BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Becker, Judith (ed.), *European Missions in Contact Zones: Transformation Through Interaction in a (Post-)Colonial World* (Göttingen, 2015).
- Becker, Judith and Brian Stanley (eds.), *Europe as the Other: External Perspectives on European Christianity* (Göttingen, 2014).
- Beidelman, T. O., *Colonial Evangelism: A Socio-Historical Study of an East African Mission at the Grassroots* (Bloomington, IN, 1982).
- Brown, Andrew and Linda Woodhead, *That Was the Church That Was: How the Church of England Lost the English People* (London, 2016).
- Brown, Callum G., *The Death of Christian Britain: Understanding Secularisation 1800–2000* (London and New York, 2001).
- Carey, Hilary M., *God's Empire: Religion and Colonialism in the British World, c.1801–1908* (Cambridge, 2011).
- Chatterjee, Partha, *Nationalist Thought and the Colonial World: A Derivative Discourse* (London, 1986).
- Cnattingius, Hans, *Bishops and Societies: A Study of Anglican Colonial and Missionary Expansion 1698–1850*. Published for the Church Historical Society (London, 1952).
- Comaroff, John L. and Jean Comaroff, *Of Revelation and Revolution: Christianity, Colonialism, and Consciousness in South Africa*, 2 vols. (Chicago, 1991–7).
- Cox, Jeffrey, *The British Missionary Enterprise since 1700* (London and New York, 2008).
- Cox, Jeffrey, *Imperial Fault Lines: Christianity and Colonial Power in India, 1818–1940* (Stanford, CA, 2002).
- Elbourne, Elizabeth, *Blood Ground: Colonialism, Missions, and the Contest for Christianity in the Cape Colony and Britain, 1799–1853* (Toronto, 2002).
- Frykenberg, Robert Eric, *A History of Christianity in India* (Oxford, 2008).
- Hall, Catherine, *Civilising Subjects: Colony and Metropole in the English Imagination, 1830–1867* (Chicago, 2002).
- Harper, Susan Billington, *In the Shadow of the Mahatma: Bishop V. S. Azariah and the Travails of Christianity in British India* (Grand Rapids, MI, 2000).
- Maughan, Steven S., *Mighty England Do Good: Culture, Faith, Empire, and World in the Foreign Missions of the Church of England, 1850–1915* (Grand Rapids, MI, 2014).
- O'Connor, Daniel and others, *Three Centuries of Mission: The United Society for the Propagation of the Gospel 1701–2000* (London and New York, 2000).
- Peel, J. D. Y., *Religious Encounter and the Making of the Yoruba* (Bloomington, IN, 2000).
- Porter, Andrew, *Religion Versus Empire? British Protestant Missionaries and Overseas Expansion, 1700–1914* (Manchester, 2004).
- Pratt, Mary Louise, *Imperial Eyes: Travel Writing and Transculturation* (2nd edn., London, 2008).

- Prevost, Elizabeth, *The Communion of Women: Missions and Gender in Colonial Africa and the British Metropole* (Oxford, 2010).
- Said, Edward, *Culture and Imperialism* (New York, 1993).
- Said, Edward, *Orientalism* (New York, 1978).
- Sanneh, Lamin O., *Translating the Message: The Missionary Impact on Culture* (Maryknoll, NY, 1989).
- Stanley, Brian, *The World Missionary Conference, Edinburgh 1910* (Grand Rapids, MI, 2009).
- Stuart, John, *British Missionaries and the End of Empire: East, Central, and Southern Africa, 1939–1964* (Grand Rapids, MI, 2011).
- Ward, Kevin, *A History of Global Anglicanism* (Cambridge, 2006).
- Williams, C. Peter, *The Ideal of the Self-Governing Church: A Study in Victorian Missionary Strategy*. Studies in Christian Mission, vol. 1 (Leiden, 1990).
- Yates, T. E., *Venn and Victorian Bishops Abroad: The Missionary Policies of Henry Venn and Their Repercussions Upon the Anglican Episcopate of the Colonial Period, 1841–1872* (Uppsala, 1978).

Anglicanism in Oceania since 1914

Michael Gladwin

In the opening sequence of Terence Malick's *The Thin Red Line* (1998), a cinematic portrayal of the Pacific war on Guadalcanal island in 1942, two absconding American soldiers marvel at the gentle rhythms of Melanesian community amid the beauty of a Guadalcanal coastal village. The shimmering triads of Fauré's ethereal 'In Paradisum' give way to a Melanesian chant, 'Jisas yu holem hand blong mi', sung in rich multi-part harmony by a procession of villagers.¹ They clap in unison, led by an indigenous catechist with a Bible reverently clasped to his chest. The Arcadian mood is shattered suddenly by the appearance of an American patrol boat offshore, on a mission to return the absconding soldiers to the Guadalcanal battlefield.

The scene is richly suggestive for the themes of this chapter on Anglicanism in Oceania since 1914. It raises the question of how Anglicanism came to be embraced and adapted by the peoples of the western Pacific, such that by the twentieth century local leadership was in Melanesian hands, and liturgy and worship inculturated into Melanesian forms. The interplay of Fauré's 'In Paradisum', from his choral/orchestral setting of the traditional Roman Catholic requiem mass (first performed in Paris in 1888), and the Melanesian chant, 'Jisas yu holem hand blong mi', sung by the choir of Guadalcanal's All Saints' Anglican parish church, gestures towards ways in which a Catholic Anglican identity and expression of Christianity was transposed to a Melanesian context. Finally, the ominous presence of the American patrol boat gestures towards ways in which forces of modernity—in this case taking the form of a global clash of empires—broke in and irrevocably transformed political life in Oceania after 1942. The period 1914–80, in particular, marked a decisive shift from colonial dependency to independent nationhood in places where Anglicanism had taken root. How Anglicans in the region negotiated

¹ Pidgin for 'Jesus, you hold my hand'.

tensions between tradition and modernity—in Church, society, and state—is another theme of this chapter.

Oceania refers here to the South Pacific Ocean's island and ethnic groups of Melanesia and Polynesia (acknowledging that such labels, while useful for generalization, reflect 'misleadingly unitive' identities constructed by European observers). Melanesia stretches from Papua New Guinea to Fiji, with the Solomon Islands and Vanuatu located centrally between them. Polynesia, the largest cultural grouping, is bounded by New Zealand in the south, Hawai'i in the north, and Easter Island in the east. Melanesia comprises the largest concentration of Anglicans in the region, with smaller numbers in Polynesia (mainly on Tonga, Samoa, and the Cook Islands). Anglican Melanesians and Polynesian Māori are present in varying numbers in New Zealand. A third region, Micronesia, lies outside the scope of this chapter.²

THE ANGLICAN CHURCH OF MELANESIA

The Anglican Church of Melanesia first took root in Vanuatu and Banks and Torres Islands, but most substantially in the Solomons, a mountainous archipelago of stunning natural beauty comprising around seventy ethno-linguistic areas.³ Sixteenth-century Spanish explorers made landfall, but not until the mid-nineteenth century did European missionaries (Anglican and Roman Catholic), whalers, and traders make significant contact with Solomon Islanders. French Marist missionaries arrived in the 1840s, but abandoned their mission. The aspirations of mid-century High Churchmen for missions in the region are reflected in the desire of bishop of Sydney, William Grant Broughton, for the establishment of a 'Magdalen Tower on the shores of the Pacific'.⁴ The Anglicans' Melanesian Mission was founded in 1849 by George Selwyn (1809–78), first bishop of New Zealand from 1841.

Selwyn envisaged initially the conversion to Anglican Christianity of a vast region stretching from New Caledonia to Papua New Guinea. By the later nineteenth century, however, Selwyn's ambitions had been circumscribed to

² Ian Breward, *The Churches in Australasia* (Oxford, 2001), pp. 20–1.

³ Garry Trompf, *Melanesian Religion* (Cambridge, 1991), pp. 3–5; Garry Trompf, 'Solomon Islands', in *Worldmark Encyclopedia of Religious Practices* (Detroit, 2014), vol. III, pp. 341–4; Leslie Fugui and Simeon Butu, 'Religion', in Hugh Laracy (ed.), *Ples Blong Iumi: Solomon Islands—The Past Four Thousand Years* (Suva, 1989), pp. 73–93; David Hilliard, 'The God of the Melanesian Mission', in Phyllis Herda, Michael Reilly, and David Hilliard (eds.), *Vision and Reality in Pacific Religion* (Canberra, 2005), pp. 195–295.

⁴ W. G. Broughton to Edward Coleridge, 15 Aug. 1844, W. G. Broughton Papers, Sydney, Moore Theological College. Broughton's vision was realized in a stream of Oxbridge-educated missionaries.

more realistic spheres of endeavour: the northern New Hebrides (now Vanuatu) and the eastern and central Solomon Islands. John Coleridge Patteson (1827–71) became the first bishop of Melanesia. His death at the hands of Nukapu Islanders (who were resisting forced-labour recruitment) spurred missionary recruiting. Patteson's death also prompted British and colonial governments to curb forced-labour recruiting or 'blackbirding', which channelled male islanders to Australia and Fiji as indentured labourers. Pressure from the small expatriate community led to Great Britain's declaration of a protectorate over the islands from 1893. Other missions followed thereafter: returning French Marists (1898); Australian Methodists (1902); the South Seas Evangelical Mission (1904); and Seventh-Day Adventists (1914).

Pioneer Anglican missionaries encountered peoples who lived in dispersed villages and hamlets, directed by a 'village headman', and divided between bush and coastal settlements. Bush people were gardeners, gatherers, and hunters; coastal people subsisted on fishing. Headhunting and cannibalism were curtailed by a combination of Christianization and colonial government 'pacification'. Spirits were believed to exist in close proximity to human beings, hence a pervasive belief in sorcery and spiritual power. Anglican missionary-anthropologist Robert Codrington (1830–1922) identified elements within traditional religion that enabled Christianity to gain traction in Melanesian hearts and minds: belief in a pervading sacred power (which Codrington influentially defined as '*mana*') associated with holy places, objects, or persons; notions of a creator god; systems of priestly sacrifice that echoed the Eucharist; a universal moral sense that welcomed notions of forgiveness and salvation; and belief in a future state in which not all departed spirits fared alike.

The Oxbridge-educated High Church, liberal, and eventually Anglo-Catholic outlooks of the first three generations of English missionaries created the template for the Melanesian Mission's tradition of accommodation, valuing Christianity's universality alongside human cultural diversity. Missionaries placed 'no blanket prohibition of betel-nut chewing, smoking, traditional dancing, mourning rites, Christian attendance at pagan feasts or bride price'.⁵ In the place of pagan religious rituals, Anglican missionaries blessed canoes, nets, houses, gardens, and porpoise hunts. Indigenous handcrafts and motifs were incorporated in church architecture. Nevertheless, liturgical conservatism eschewed traditional music, drama, and dance in favour of the Prayer Book. Several traditional practices—including dances, secret societies, and meeting houses—declined as villages were Christianized.⁶

The mission's European staff was relatively small (around thirty-five in 1911), but strong in corporate spirit and tradition that had been fostered by

⁵ David Hilliard, *God's Gentlemen: A History of the Melanesian Mission, 1849–1942* (Brisbane, 1978), p. 196.

⁶ Hilliard, *God's Gentlemen*, pp. 198–200.

isolation and independence as a self-governing missionary diocese. European missionaries in the pre-1942 period also were united by English backgrounds and, in many cases, university education.⁷

By 1918 the mission was administering the sacraments to 14,000 communicants scattered over thirty-six islands. English sources of missionary recruits dried up, however, during the Great War. Numbers were further depleted by resignations, deaths, and occasional sexual scandals. Bishop John Manwaring Steward (1874–1937) relocated the mission's headquarters from Norfolk Island to Siota in the Solomon Islands (a long-delayed move) and prioritized the creation of an indigenous Melanesian ministry. This latter decision reflected wider trends in international missionary thinking in the wake of the 1910 Edinburgh Missionary Conference, which sought to turn missions into self-governing 'younger Churches' under indigenous leadership. In 1918 the first Solomon Islands priest, Jack Talofuila of Malaita, was ordained (George Sarawia of Mota had been deaconed in 1868). By 1942 there were eighty-one indigenous priests. Inter-war Melanesian Anglican clergy were given increasing freedom of action. Men like Matthias Tarileo on Pentecost, Martin Marau on Ulawa, and Hugo Hembala and Ben Hageria on Santa Isabel, were the undisputed leaders of the Church on their islands.⁸

Some older white missionaries were nevertheless slow in sloughing off a paternalistic ethos and leadership structure. Selwyn had been fond of the analogy of a 'black net floated by white corks' to describe the development of indigenous lay teachers and clergy under the guiding hand of European missionaries. But he had envisaged the 'white corks' as only a temporary measure until Melanesians filled that role. Well before the inter-war years, however, European missionaries were reluctant to cede overall authority.⁹

THE MELANESIAN BROTHERHOOD

A crucial development during the inter-war years was the establishment of the Melanesian Brotherhood by Ini Kopuria, a Solomon Islander. Born on Guadalcanal in 1900, Kopuria attended an Anglican missionary school and St Barnabas College on Norfolk Island. Rejecting mentors' expectations that he would be a catechist to his own people, Kopuria instead joined the colonial government's native police force. His work took him all over Guadalcanal,

⁷ Hilliard, *God's Gentlemen*, pp. 144–5.

⁸ Hilliard, *God's Gentlemen*, pp. 196–8, 214–19; *Southern Cross Log* (June 1946), pp. 21–4, esp. p. 21.

⁹ Hilliard, *God's Gentlemen*, p. 219; Darrell L. Whiteman, *Melanesians and Missionaries: An Ethnohistorical Study* (Pasadena, CA, 1983), p. 199.

around coastal areas and into bush hamlets. On one occasion in 1925, while making an arrest, his knee was damaged. During several months of recuperation, Kopuria recounted a Loyolan moment: a vision of Christ led him to embrace a missionary vocation inspired by early Church and Franciscan monasticism.¹⁰ For Kopuria monasticism reflected Melanesian aspirations for an indigenous mode of mission that lay outside a European-dominated framework.¹¹

Kopuria approached his bishop. 'I have visited all the villages as a police sergeant', he pointed out, 'and they all know me: why not go to them now as a missionary?'¹² Steward was supportive, helping Kopuria to draw up a rule. *Ira Retatasiu* ('Company of Brothers' in the Mota language) was founded in 1926. Kopuria became head brother over six members from various islands. The self-described aim of the Brotherhood was evangelistic: 'to declare the way of Jesus Christ among the heathen, not to minister to those who have already received the law'. It was not an order along traditional Western lines with members committed to life vows, but a looser association in which promises were taken one year at a time.¹³

The Brotherhood established schools in Guadalcanal villages. After 1927 the brothers went further afield, travelling as far as the New Hebrides and Fiji. Numbers grew to 128 in 1933. The Brotherhood's appeal lay in the force and magnetism of Kopuria's personality and the romance associated with itinerant evangelism.¹⁴ It also reflected Melanesian social patterns, in which boys were set apart for several years in 'young men's houses' as initiation into manhood.¹⁵

The *Tasiu* ('Brothers') soon acquired unique prestige among island Christians because of their dedication, simplicity of approach in living self-supported among the people, and courage in the face of opposition. Their *mana* was equated with that of the bishop, while a mythology began to develop around them. Stories circulated of dramatic healings by means of Christian prayers and traditional medicines; of power encounters with hostile pagans and demonic forces; and of visible tokens of divine protection as they parted rivers with walking sticks, stopped cyclones, defeated magic with holy collects, and even rode on the backs of crocodiles. A recurring theme was the application of power for the purposes of healing and protection. The brothers were

¹⁰ Richard Carter, *In Search of the Lost* (London, 2006), p. 22; Brian Macdonald-Milne, *The True Way of Service: The Pacific Story of the Melanesian Brotherhood, 1925–2000* (Leicester, 2003).

¹¹ *Southern Cross Log* (June 1946), pp. 21–4, esp. p. 23.

¹² *Southern Cross Log* (June 1946), pp. 22–3.

¹³ *Southern Cross Log* (June 1946), p. 21; *Southern Cross Log* (Oct. 1926), pp. 8–12; Hilliard, *God's Gentlemen*, pp. 228–30.

¹⁴ *Southern Cross Log* (Oct. 1926), p. 230.

¹⁵ F. W. Coaldrake, *Flood Tide in the Pacific: Church and Community Cascade into a New Age* (Sydney, 1964), pp. 48–9; Brian Macdonald-Milne, *Spearhead: The Story of the Melanesian Brotherhood* (Watford, 1975), p. 9; Macdonald-Milne, *The True Way*, p. 154.

bridging the gap between the old *kastom* religion of ancestral spirits and magic, and a Christian faith grounded in love, service, and Christ's victory over the powers of evil.¹⁶

Armed with a knapsack containing only the Prayer Book, a Bible, and a few essentials, they travelled apostolically in twos. Men from different islands were often paired together, a powerful witness in islands with strong tribal rivalries. The brothers offered prayer, simple teaching, and strove to learn local languages.¹⁷ European missionary Charles Fox recounted one such mission:

I remember coasting along the shores of New Britain in the mission ship looking for somewhere to land two brothers and receiving a 'refusal' at each 'heathen' village until we found one where the people allowed them to stay. I took them ashore and I rowed back to the ship. I watched these two young men standing there with nothing but their haversacks, among a heathen people of whose language they knew not a word, who might easily kill or starve them after we had gone. They were a thousand miles from their own homes and knew that the mission ship would not be back for a year. A year later we called again and found them standing there once more, this time with twenty of the people prepared for baptism. After some years there were several hundred Christians there.¹⁸

The Brotherhood soon became self-supporting, aided by the finances and prayers of an 'Order of Companions'. Brothers contributed significantly to the mission's expansion. By 1942 the number of Anglicans in the region had risen to an estimated 35,000. The mission also extended medical services through hospitals, nursing training, dispensaries, leper colonies, and visits by doctors and nurses on the mission ship *Gwen* (bought in 1933). Medical missionaries combated high infant mortality, tuberculosis, and widespread tropical diseases like malaria.¹⁹

THE SECOND WORLD WAR

Before the Second World War the Solomons were considered a sleepy colonial backwater. By 1942, however, after the Japanese capture of Rabaul in New Guinea, Guadalcanal lay in the path of Japan's southward advance. Japan soon occupied the strategically important western Solomons and northern Guadalcanal. Fighting climaxed in the subsequent American-led invasion of Tulagi

¹⁶ Macdonald-Milne, *The True Way*, pp. 154–5; Macdonald-Milne, *Spearhead*, p. 9; Carter, *In Search of the Lost*, pp. 25–6.

¹⁷ Macdonald-Milne, *Spearhead*, pp. 9–11.

¹⁸ Charles Fox, quoted in Carter, *In Search of the Lost*, p. 24.

¹⁹ Charles Fox, *Lord of the Southern Isles* (London, 1958), pp. 249–54.

and Guadalcanal in November 1942, in which an estimated 80,000 took part. Massive Allied offensives expelled the Japanese by 1944.²⁰

Anglican mission fortunes were bolstered by the refusal of Walter Baddeley (bishop of Melanesia, 1932–47, and a decorated Great War veteran) and fifteen staff to leave the Solomons in the face of Japanese invasion. The Anglicans remained in hiding in the mountains, as did the Roman Catholic Bishop Aubin and his Marist priests, brothers, and nuns (four of whom were murdered by the Japanese).

Melanesian brothers and missionaries served with the Coastwatchers, an organization that spied on enemy activity and rescued downed Allied pilots. Brothers such as Bartholomew Beve visited Japanese-occupied villages under the pretext of selling bananas, returning with intelligence on troop numbers, dispositions, and gun emplacements. Japanese patrols and strafing by aeroplanes broke up the brothers' houses, however, forcing most to flee for their lives. Some, including Simon Sigai of San Cristoval, were shot and killed.²¹

Post-war anti-colonial sentiment was fuelled by the wartime exodus of expatriates to Australia to escape danger and the arrival of militarily powerful Americans with their own stories of emancipation from British rule. Discontent had surfaced in 1939 when an unlicensed Anglican missionary on Ysabel, Richard Fallows, organized a political council known as the Chair and Rule Movement, which held mass meetings and lobbied the resident commissioner. Fallows was soon deported and the movement disintegrated, but it sowed the seeds for the proto-nationalist Maasina Rule movement (named after the Areare term for 'brotherhood'). Maasina Rule flourished during 1944–52, urging an alternative government and encouraging Malaitans to refuse payment of colonial taxes. Anglican clergy were both proponents and opponents. A nascent millenarian 'cargo cult' strain within the movement also built arks and sheds to house goods anticipated from an impending American invasion. The movement capitulated in 1952 under British pressure, but not before extracting concessions from Britain for better economic, educational, and health provisions. In turn, the movement inspired later moves towards independence. Starting with a Legislative Assembly in 1960, Britain ceded power progressively to Solomon Islanders, finally granting independence on 7 July 1978.²²

²⁰ Judith A. Bennett, *Wealth of the Solomons: A History* (Honolulu, 1987), pp. 286–7; Stewart Firth, 'The War in the Pacific', in Donald Denoon and others (eds.), *The Cambridge History of the Pacific Islanders* (Cambridge, 1997), pp. 291–323.

²¹ Bennett, *Wealth of the Solomons*, pp. 288–9; Macdonald-Milne, *The True Way*, pp. 141–2; Whiteman, *Melanesians and Missionaries*, p. 303.

²² Richard Fallows Papers, National Library of Australia (NLA), Canberra, MS/2478; Hugh Laracy, *Pacific Protest: The Maasina Rule Movement* (Suva, 1983), pp. 122–4; Alexander Mamak and Ahmed Ali (eds.), *Race, Class and Rebellion in the South Pacific* (Sydney, 1979), pp. 26–35, 98–107; Hilliard, *God's Gentlemen*, pp. 282–5.

Further afield, Melanesians' nationalist aspirations culminated in independence for Papua New Guinea in 1975 and the New Hebrides (Vanuatu) in 1980. Yet nowhere was Anglican political influence felt more strongly than in the latter archipelago, the former Anglo-French Condominium. Located 500 miles west of Fiji, Vanuatu was home to 150,000 people with 113 local languages, spread over 80 coral and volcanic islands. In 2000 around 18 per cent of the population was Anglican. The Melanesian Mission had begun sustained missionary work in the region in the 1870s. By the 1960s, indigenous Anglican, Presbyterian, and Catholic clergymen had assumed considerable power as community leaders. Many were educated overseas, where their political consciousness was catalysed by exposure to African and pan-Pacific decolonization movements, French nuclear testing in Mururoa Atoll, and liberation theologies. This accompanied a growing regional and ecumenical Pacific identity—a 'lifting of the coconut curtain' in Church and state—backed by the Pacific Conference of Churches and the World Council of Churches (WCC). In the vanguard of New Hebrides independence movements were young Anglican priests Walter Lini and John Bani. Drawing on his experience of student activism in Auckland, Lini provided a journalistic mouthpiece during the 1970s for the National Party (later Vanua'aku Pati) he formed with several Anglican and Presbyterian clergy. On 30 July 1980 the 38-year-old Lini became first prime minister of the new Republic of Vanuatu, a position he retained for eleven years as he sought to integrate British and French communities, and forge a modern and economically independent Vanuatu. Bani later became president.²³

These journeys towards political independence paralleled the post-war creation of a Melanesian-led Church. In 1955 a system of rural deaneries (in reality 'marine deaneries') was created, devolving pastoral oversight and administration to each region within the diocese. These deaneries, which reflected old Melanesian structures of chiefs and head chiefs, became proving grounds for local leaders. In November 1963 two New Zealand-educated rural deans, Leonard Alufurai and Dudley Tuti, were raised to the episcopate to assist the ninth English-born diocesan bishop.²⁴ In January 1975 they were consecrated bishops of the fledgling dioceses of Malaita and Ysabel. Both men played key roles in the spiritual, social, and economic development of their regions. Tuti was made 'paramount chief' of Ysabel, which melded traditional

²³ Walter Lini, *Beyond Pandemonium: From the New Hebrides to Vanuatu* (Wellington, 1980), pp. 3–55; Walter Lini, 'Christians in Politics', in Garry Trompf (ed.), *The Gospel is not Western* (New York, 1987), pp. 183–5; Terry M. Brown, 'The Anglican Church and the Vanuatu Independence Movement: Solidarity and Ambiguity', ADRI Working Paper 7 (2010), pp. 6, 18; Helen Gardner, 'Praying for Independence', *Journal of Pacific History*, 48 (2013): 122–43, esp. pp. 126–9, 135–8.

²⁴ Ellison L. Pogo, 'Ministry and Mission in Melanesia: Yesterday, Today and Tomorrow', in A. K. Davidson (ed.), *The Church of Melanesia, 1849–1999* (Auckland, 2000), pp. 36–53.

and spiritual leadership structures. In the same year the diocese of Melanesia became a province in its own right, initially with four dioceses: three in the Solomons, and one encompassing Vanuatu and New Caledonia. Compared with the Anglican Church in other developing countries, however, the 125-year transition to indigenous leadership was a very slow one.²⁵

The post-war decades witnessed significant consolidation and change. The Church rebuilt its hospitals, founded teacher training institutions, increased village school numbers, trained nurses, raised secondary education standards, and prepared a class of Melanesians for service in the Church, the professions, commerce, and national life. Increased inter-island mobility forged national and Church unity.²⁶ By the early 1960s Anglicans represented one-third of the total population of 150,000. The diocesan headquarters was moved to the new capital, Honiara, in Guadalcanal. In Honiara, All Saints' Cathedral was constructed out of two semi-cylindrical Quonset huts with expansive verandas and native post carvings. It was replaced by St Barnabas' Cathedral in 1968–9.²⁷

The Church contended with rapid social change, hastened by a post-war exodus from village life—with its traditional rule by elders and dependence on the 'garden'—and the growth of a cash economy, semi-skilled and professional occupations, and increasing numbers of landless urban workers concentrated in the capitals, Honiara and Port Vila (Vanuatu).²⁸

AFTER 1975: INDIGENIZATION AND INDEPENDENCE

The period after independence in Church (1975) and state (1978) has been viewed as one of 'cultural indigenization'. In the Solomons and Vanuatu there began a revaluing of the indigenous cultural heritage and life-ways, and a questioning of the superiority of European modernization through education and economic development. Both the Church and cultural nationalist ideologies drew on traditional customs (*kastom*), searching for a 'Melanesian way' to reshape 'imported institutional structures in light of Melanesian designs for living'.²⁹ This was evident in renewed efforts after the 1970s to inculcate both the liturgy and its liturgical settings. On festival and saints' days, for example, traditional dancing began to take place around the altar at the *Kyrie*, *Gloria*, and *Sanctus*. Elaborate gospel and offertory processions involved

²⁵ Pogo, 'Ministry and Mission', p. 51.

²⁶ Pogo, 'Ministry and Mission', pp. 50–1.

²⁷ Breward, *Churches in Australasia*, p. 334; C. L. Mountfort, *Long Dark Island*, ed. R. D. Mountfort (Wellington, 1994), pp. 81–105.

²⁸ Pogo, 'Ministry and Mission', pp. 54–7; Whiteman, *Melanesians and Missionaries*, pp. 422–4.

²⁹ Whiteman, *Melanesians and Missionaries*, p. 424.

traditional dances, drumming, bamboo panpipes, offering bowls of incense, and dramatic gospel presentations, while traditional polyphonic chants and tunes accompanied the Eucharist. Nevertheless, the embrace of Melanesian traditions was tentative and gradual, a result of an internalized veneration for Western Anglo-Catholic ways.³⁰

Another post-independence adjustment was the Church's almost complete withdrawal from its traditional responsibility for education and health, initiated in part by post-independence governments and by the Church's financial constraints. Nevertheless, the Church managed to expand to eight dioceses within twenty-five years. Melanesian clergy and the Melanesian Brotherhood adjusted to team ministry models and chaplaincy as some parishes moved away from the old priest-centred ministry model of previous generations, and encountered increasing numbers of nominal and lapsed Christians.³¹ New methods were worked out for mission in growing towns, including Bible studies, and counselling and discussion groups for young men as an alternative to gambling or drinking. The Brotherhood was joined during these years by more traditional Anglican religious communities: the Society of St Francis (for men) and the Community of the Sisters of the Church (for women). Wider networks of lay companions, associates, and third orders infused the Church with new energy.³²

A new emphasis on women's ministry accompanied independence. The Community of the Sisters of Melanesia was formed in 1979 as a counterpart to the Brotherhood, building on the focus of previous female missionary nurses and teachers on women and families in both villages and towns, which Melanesian custom prohibited men from doing effectively. Together the women's religious communities established a Christian Care Centre near Honiara, for women and children affected by a rise in domestic violence and abuse. Mothers' Unions provided important avenues for literacy and leadership at both village and national level, particularly among young educated women advocating for women's equality in Church and society. In 2012 Mothers' Unions claimed some 16,000 members. Although the Church of Melanesia's constitution recognizes women priests' ordination outside Melanesia, the Church has never ordained women, a reflection of traditional local and Anglo-Catholic conservatism. Changing attitudes were evident in 1999, however, when the Council of Bishops signalled unanimous support for women's ordination.

³⁰ Whiteman, *Melanesians and Missionaries*, pp. 423–4; Terry Brown, 'The Church of Melanesia', in Charles Hefling and Cynthia Shattuck (eds.), *The Oxford Guide to the Book of Common Prayer: A Worldwide Survey* (New York, 2006), pp. 348–58, esp. pp. 352–3; David Yunagi, 'Liturgical Spirituality under the Southern Cross', MTh thesis, Vancouver School of Theology, 2006, pp. 153–5.

³¹ Pogo, 'Ministry and Mission', pp. 52–4.

³² John Garrett, *Where Nets were Cast: Christianity in Oceania since World War II* (Suva, 1997), pp. 198–201; Pogo, 'Ministry and Mission', p. 55.

Nevertheless, formal approval was withheld due to the potential for division and secession over the issue. One sister, Veronica of Ysabel, was priested and served in Southwark diocese. She was allowed to officiate selectively on her visits to the Solomons.³³

The Melanesian Brotherhood retained its missionary temper in the post-war period. In 1955 brothers began work in New Guinea's highlands. Some converts became brothers, including the first priest from the Siame Valley.³⁴ In 1975 the Brotherhood accepted a request to work among Australian Aborigines and Torres Strait Islanders in northern Queensland. During the 1990s the Brotherhood set up households in Palawan, Philippines. By 2000 the Brotherhood numbered 450 brothers and 180 novices. Several thousand companions support them, making the Brotherhood the Anglican Communion's largest religious order.³⁵

The Church of Melanesia was also involved in regional ecumenical endeavours as Pacific Churches and missions grappled with the post-war world 'beyond the reef'. Anglicans were key participants at ecumenical conferences of Protestant Churches after 1961, culminating in the formation of the Pacific Conference of Churches (PCC) in 1966. The trade winds of change blowing from the Second Vatican Council wafted Roman Catholics into this ecumenical lagoon in 1976. This fostered increasingly cordial relations between the Solomons' three largest Churches: the (Anglican) Church of Melanesia, which by 2006 represented 31 per cent of the population of 600,000; Catholics, 19 per cent; and the South Seas Evangelical Church (Evangelical with Baptist polity and practice), 17 per cent. The larger mainstream Christian groups have been more wary of smaller Protestant denominations, including Pentecostal Churches. Nevertheless, Pentecostals' emphasis on the immediacy of spiritual experience and charismatic gifts have found adherents among Anglicans in the Solomons and Vanuatu. Only pockets of traditional religion and cargo cults (like the John Frum Movement) remain in the region.³⁶

During 1999–2003 the Solomons were embroiled in violent conflict over problems resulting from excessive logging, corruption, and ethnic tension between Guadalcanal locals and Malaitan immigrants. In 2000 the conflict erupted into a militant-organized civil war. An Australian-led peacekeeping mission brokered a fragile peace in 2003. Although an amnesty was offered to opposing factions, grievances were not addressed and guns stayed in the militants' hands, despite a disarmament agreement. During the conflict Churches temporarily took over some of the collapsed state's functions such as health,

³³ Macdonald-Milne, *Spearhead*, p. 13; Breward, *Churches in Australasia*, p. 334; Mountfort, *Long Dark Island*, pp. 81–105; Pogo, 'Ministry and Mission', pp. 57–8.

³⁴ Macdonald-Milne, *Spearhead*, p. 16; T. W. Campbell, *Religious Communities of the Anglican Communion: Australia, New Zealand and the South Pacific* (Canberra, 2007), p. 156.

³⁵ Carter, *In Search of the Lost*, p. 26.

³⁶ Garrett, *Where Nets were Cast*, pp. 362–3; Brown, 'Solidarity and Ambiguity', pp. 18–22.

education, police protection, and transportation. With the state's gradual recovery, the Churches expanded their central social role in Solomons' society, addressing the lingering effects of social breakdown, land disputes, and political corruption.³⁷

Anglican religious communities, comprised of both Malaitans and Guadalcanal islanders, offered a powerful witness that bridged both war zone and ethnic divide. Melanesian brothers provided humanitarian assistance, brokered reconciliation, and initiated campaigns to disarm militia. The latter efforts resulted in the torture and murder of seven brothers by the deranged Harold Keke's outlaw militia in 2003. Two years later more than 10,000 gathered at Tabalia on Guadalcanal, the Melanesian Brotherhood headquarters and burial place of the 'seven peacemakers', to acknowledge the crucial role of indigenous Anglicans as mediators and peacemakers in Solomons' society.³⁸

PAPUA NEW GUINEA

The other significant area of Anglican influence in Melanesia was in British New Guinea, which in 1906 became the Australian colony of Papua.³⁹ From the late nineteenth century, British power had imposed relative order among communities riven by warfare and cannibalism. During the 1890s a few Australian Anglicans combined missionary aspirations for Papuans with fears that European hegemony would replicate the devastation meted out to Australian Aborigines. Yet missions were delayed by several factors: the relative poverty of Australian dioceses, worsened by economic depression after 1890; a mission board (Australian Board of Missions) with no permanent chairman or secretariat; and lay attitudes ranging from parochial self-interest to blatant racism.⁴⁰

Two Anglican priests, Albert Maclaren and Copland King, nevertheless managed to raise sufficient support to pioneer a mission. They arrived on the eastern mainland beach plateau of Dogura in 1891. The Anglican mission

³⁷ Kevin Ward, *A History of Global Anglicanism* (Cambridge, 2006), pp. 293–4; Carter, *In Search of the Lost*, pp. 41–5.

³⁸ Carter, *In Search of the Lost*, pp. 45–50, 237.

³⁹ David Wetherell, *Reluctant Mission: The Anglican Church in Papua New Guinea, 1891–1942* (St Lucia, Queensland, 1977), p. xiii. PNG was officially Papua before 1975.

⁴⁰ The following paragraphs on the pre-1942 period rely on Wetherell, *Reluctant Mission*, pp. 28, 34, 40–1, 44–51, 54–9, 78–93, 99–121, 124–54, 126, 165–75, 186, 194–7, 272, 288, 314–17; David Wetherell, 'Creating an Indigenous Christian Leadership in Papua', *Journal of Pacific History*, 42 (2012): 163–85 (pp. 163, 166).

was one of three established in eastern Papua in the same year (the others were Methodist and Kwato, a London Missionary Society offshoot).

The Anglican mission's cultural area was relatively homogeneous. The Massim people shared certain ethnic and cultural traits: matrilineal and matrilineal social structures; distinctive forms of totemism and decorative art employing scrolls and spirals; and common links by means of the *kula* trade, which circulated valuables throughout the archipelago. This unusual social structure, lacking an institution of chieftainship, was one reason why mission work proved harder there than in Polynesian island groups like Tonga and Samoa, where hereditary chiefs exerted top-down influence over subjects' religious adherence. Moreover, Papua's dense jungles and sheer mountain ranges were almost impenetrable, and there was no common language.

Early Anglican missionaries were imbued by Anglo-Catholic reverence for both Catholic liturgical traditions and the sacramental functions of the episcopate and the priesthood. Like their Melanesian Mission counterparts, they conceived Massim conversion as absorption into the visible Church's fabric, disturbing only those traditional customs (namely infanticide, sorcery, tribal warfare, and cannibalism) that explicitly contradicted the Christian teachings. Long feuds invariably ensued between some early clergy and local sorcerers. At Uiaku Stephen Maiorot, after being threatened by a sorcerer, threw the sorcerer's magic lime pots into a fire, while Gregory Aqwi chanted the *Te Deum* over the flames.

Unlike neighbouring Protestant missions, Anglicans in Papua repudiated any 'inherent connection' between Christianity and the commercial-technological culture in which it was embedded. Traditional village life could be 'consecrated into the idea of the Church', observed Montagu Stone-Wigg, the first Anglican bishop (1898-1908). Missionaries brokered reconciliation between hostile villages at the same time that Papuans became conscious of the pacifying imperatives of British military power. Anglicans were nevertheless reluctant to identify closely with imperial appearance or sentiment. The Oxford Movement's heirs were no friends of Erastianism, and there was no question of subordinating Church to state.

In 1905 Stone-Wigg declared his desire 'to make the Church in New Guinea a Native Church, manned by a Native ministry'. Rapid strides were made in that direction: village councils were established and Papuan ordinands recruited from the local schools that proliferated after 1906. By 1912 the mission claimed some 2,000 Papuan members. The first Papuan clergy were ordained in 1914. Able teachers also generated among the people a desire for a priest. By 1916 a class of six Anglican students, meeting in the house of the mission printer, Edward Guise, was christened St Aidan's College. The college trained ninety students in its first ten years and, over time, became a nursery for Papuan Church leaders. By 1942 there were seventeen Papuan priests, yet a cautious paternalism, coupled with several

leadership failures among Papuan clergy and catechists, delayed the creation of an indigenous leadership.

The mission developed a legendary reputation during its first fifty years, coming to be ranked with Zanzibar, Alaska, and the Yukon as a glory of the Anglican Communion. That reputation rested on the muscular Christian vigour and semi-monastic self-abnegation demanded of the 186 poorly paid, under-resourced, and fever-ridden missionaries who served in Papua before 1942. The 'vague halo of Franciscan beauty' that hung about the Papuan priesthood reflected a neo-monastic revival within the Church's Catholic wing. In a climate of ideological polarization and religious decline in Western Europe, archbishops such as Cosmo Gordon Lang invoked Papuan missionaries as evidence that the Church could still produce saints as of old.⁴¹ Some of these missionaries represented a scholarly elite, sensitive to contemporarily intellectual currents. Stone-Wigg carried Gore's *Lux Mundi* (1890) on his visitations and knew linguist Max Müller personally. Missionaries also recorded remarkable achievements in Bible and Prayer Book translation, ethnography, and even botany. Yet sexual temptation ended the careers of several missionaries, just as occasional homosexual scandals had blighted the Melanesian Mission from its early years until the 1950s.

One of the most remarkable mission priests was Romney Gill, a diminutive bespectacled eccentric with extraordinary gifts in carpentry, engineering, and medicine (including amateur dentistry that included self-treatment!). Gifted and fiercely independent, Gill formed a community at Boianai that was remarkable for fostering devotional depth and Papuan initiative—spiritual, social, and economic—by means of village councils.⁴² Several women missionaries carved out key roles before 1942, a reflection of missionary trends worldwide. Women such as the larger-than-life matriarch Nellie Hullett (weighing nearly 140 kilograms), worked tirelessly in nursing and education among women, orphans, village girls, and children.⁴³ Forty-five Melanesian missionaries, many of whom had been emigrant sugar workers in Queensland, played a crucial role among coastal villagers, developing an affinity with their converts that no European or Polynesian was able to replicate.⁴⁴

The enthronement of the energetic Philip Strong as bishop in 1937 marked a new phase in the Church's life. Dogura Cathedral, with twin Romanesque towers fashioned out of concrete made from ground local coral, was consecrated in October 1939. News of Japan's invasion of Malaya reached Strong in December 1941. A government radio message on 25 January 1942 ordered

⁴¹ Wetherell, *Reluctant Mission*, pp. 28, 41, 55–9, 78–93, 99–121, 194–7, 272, 317.

⁴² Wetherell, *Reluctant Mission*, pp. 78–86, 194–7; Dorothea Tomkins and Brian Hughes, *The Road from Gona* (Sydney, 1969), p. 94.

⁴³ Wetherell, *Reluctant Mission*, pp. 86–93.

⁴⁴ Wetherell, *Reluctant Mission*, pp. 99–121.

evacuation of non-indigenous personnel from eastern Papua, but Strong struck a Churchillian note of defiance in his broadcast on 31 January. ‘We shall not leave’, declared Strong. ‘We could never hold up our faces again, if, for our own safety, we all forsook Him and fled when the shadows of the Passion began to gather around Him in His Spiritual Body, the Church in Papua.’ All missionaries except one—a pregnant missionary wife—remained.⁴⁵ In mid-1942 Japanese troops established beachheads around the mission at Buna, Gona, and Sanananda. Later Allied attempts to recapture the beachheads during August–December 1942 ranked among the fiercest battles of the war in New Guinea.

On 21 July 1942 shells landed in the Gona mission compound, forcing residents inland into the jungle and swamps, where they narrowly evaded Japanese patrols for several days before being captured. Anglican priest John Barge served his people around Pomete for more than a year before being executed by a Japanese landing-force.⁴⁶ Barge was one of twelve Anglicans and more than 300 Christians martyred in Papua during the war: six were priests, two mission nursing sisters, two female mission sisters, one a mission builder, one a Papuan teacher-evangelist, and one a Papuan evangelist. Most were bayoneted or beheaded. Two lost their lives after their ship was attacked by a Japanese submarine. Among the martyrs was Lucian Tapiedi, a young Papuan teacher who refused to forsake the mission’s sick and young. Tapiedi was hacked to death by cargo-cultist villagers who believed the Japanese were ancestors returning to oust Europeans. Tapiedi’s statue is among the ten statues of modern martyrs in niches overlooking the west front of Westminster Abbey. Many other Anglican Papuans and missionaries risked their lives as spies, carriers, stretcher-bearers, medical orderlies, scouts, and soldiers. They also sheltered refugees, missionaries, and troops, and smuggled food to Japanese prisoners.⁴⁷

The mission remained intact throughout the war, in no small part due to the resolution and commitment of Papuan Anglicans under Strong’s dogged leadership. Post-war recovery was rapid, with education proving a key tool. Secondary schools prepared future leaders and pioneered technical education in agriculture, carpentry, and traditional building methods.⁴⁸ Teachers such as Nancy White and Peggy de Bibra taught in primitive conditions, skilfully

⁴⁵ David Wetherell, ‘Strong, Philip Nigel (1899–1983)’, *Australian Dictionary of Biography*, Canberra, <<http://adb.anu.edu.au/biography/strong-philip-nigel-15782/text26974>> (accessed 5 May 2014); Philip Strong, diary entries, 26 Jan., 10 Mar. 1942, in David Wetherell (ed.), *The New Guinea Diaries of Philip Strong, 1936–1945* (Melbourne, 1981), pp. 74–5, 89–91; Errol Hodge, *Seed of the Church* (Sydney, 1992), p. 8.

⁴⁶ Tomkins, *Road from Gona*, pp. 35, 38; Hodge, *Seed of the Church*, pp. 23–4.

⁴⁷ Hodge, *Seed of the Church*, pp. 6–7, 17–18; Breward, *Churches in Australasia*, p. 296; J. W. S Tomlin, *Awakening: A History of the New Guinea Mission* (London, 1951), pp. 167–9.

⁴⁸ Hodge, *Seed of the Church*, pp. 19, 25.

countering local sorcerers by instilling deep faith within their students, who in turn disciplined successive generations. Paramedical training began in 1950, followed by the establishment of a new theological college at Dogura in 1951 (theological classes had been running since 1905). A recruitment drive resulted in the arrival of David Hand (bishop 1950–77; archbishop 1977–83), an outstanding missionary leader who helped Papuan evangelists pioneer missions in the newly opened highlands.

The mission suffered a crippling blow on 21 January 1951 when the volcanic eruption of Mount Lamington killed around 3,400 people by burning and suffocation. In one day the majority of the mission's indigenous and expatriate leaders (attending a conference nearby) were wiped out. Australian and English Churches contributed generously to rebuilding, but the task of replacing a generation of indigenous leaders took much longer.⁴⁹ A further challenge was the encroachment of the post-war government on education. Anglican resistance led to a cooling of relations between Church and state.⁵⁰

In 1960 George Ambo, the first Papuan bishop—and first indigenous bishop in Oceania—was consecrated. Descended from a long line of cannibal warrior chiefs (Ambo's grandfather had informed him that the palm of the human hand was the tastiest part to eat), Ambo was baptized while attending the mission school near Gona, before serving as a bush priest. He was one of only two teacher-evangelists to survive the Mount Lamington eruption. Although Ambo lacked secondary education, Strong had detected in him an 'indefinable quality' of spiritual depth, humility, and leadership ability. Strong's judgement was vindicated during Ambo's long episcopate (1983–90). Ambo became a valued mentor and adviser to brother bishops and clergy, an intuitive and statesmanlike leader among laypeople, and an influential advocate of the inculturation of traditional music, dance, and art in the Church's liturgy and worship.⁵¹

The establishment of an indigenous leadership coincided with pan-Pacific moves towards independence and self-government, not least among Papuans. From the 1960s the future of Anglicanism was bound up with the recognition that Papua and New Guinea (as the territory was known during 1949–72) would become a self-governing nation. Pressure for constitutional change intensified from 1961 until the achievement of independent nationhood in

⁴⁹ Hodge, *Seed of the Church*, pp. 25–6; Breward, *Churches in Australasia*, pp. 338–9; Tomkins, *Road from Gona*, ch. 8.

⁵⁰ David Wetherell, 'The Anglicans in New Guinea and the Torres Strait Islands', in Herda et al. (eds.), *Vision and Reality*, pp. 216–42 (p. 234); Donald James Dickson, 'Government and Missions in Education in Papua and New Guinea, with Special Reference to the New Guinea Anglican Mission, 1891–1970', MA thesis, University of Papua New Guinea, 1971.

⁵¹ Breward, *Churches in Australasia*, p. 339; Elin Johnston, *Bishop George: Man of Two Worlds* (Point Lonsdale, Victoria, 2003), pp. 5, 14–16, 123–5; David Hand, *Modawa: Papua New Guinea and Me, 1946–2002* (Port Moresby, 2002), pp. 176–7.

March 1975.⁵² As in other post-colonial contexts, the Anglican influence on national life was felt in its schooling and preparation of many indigenous government leaders.⁵³

Within eighteen months of political independence the Anglican mission followed suit, becoming an autonomous province and cutting legal ties to the Australian Church. The new Anglican Church of Papua New Guinea (ACPNG) was divided into five dioceses.⁵⁴ Not all Papuan leaders agreed on the readiness for independence in both Church and state. Ambo feared it was premature, citing internal problems in ensuing decades such as a slackening of discipline and misappropriation of funds. He advocated the continuing influence of expatriate clergy. Hand averred, however, that 'it was better that [independence] came too soon rather than too late'. By 2002 only eight of the Church's 254 staff were expatriates.⁵⁵ The Church's traditional reluctance to engage in self-supporting commercial ventures was tempered by its need to secure financial independence. In 1972 the 'Garamut Appeal' established investments in nationally accepted ventures from which annual incomes were drawn for specific works of the Church, lessening reliance on overseas partner-Churches for funding.⁵⁶ By 2000 around 7 per cent of Papua New Guinea's population of six million self-identified as Anglicans, although in some provinces (such as Oro) the figure was as high as 60 per cent.

The ACPNG was tested by the many challenges facing the young Church and nation. 'Detribalization', social dislocation, and an individualistic ethos characterized urban centres after the 1960s as increasing numbers of people drifted from villages to towns such as Lae and Port Moresby in search of the material wealth of Western civilization. Church, society, and state were further threatened by corruption, clan payback, provincial separatism, and crime waves of 'rascalism'. After the late 1980s the increasing spread of prostitution, venereal disease, and an HIV/AIDS 'epidemic' were linked to a 'crisis in moral values'.⁵⁷

As in the Solomons, religious communities formed important adjuncts to the Church's attempts to meet these challenges in towns and rural areas, particularly the Melanesian Brotherhood, the Anglican Society of St Francis (for men), and the Community of Visitation (for women). Following the Second World War the Church had expanded its education division to cover teacher-training, high schools, and community schools. Its medical division

⁵² Wetherell, 'The Anglicans'.

⁵³ Nancy White, *Sharing the Climb* (Melbourne, 1991), p. 118.

⁵⁴ John Waiko, *Papua New Guinea: A History of our Times* (Melbourne, 2003), pp. 116–31; Wetherell, 'The Anglicans', pp. 234–5.

⁵⁵ Hand, *Modawa*, p. 176; Johnston, *Bishop George*, pp. 241–2.

⁵⁶ Tomkins, *Road from Gona*, pp. 134–40; Garrett, *Where Nets were Cast*, pp. 344–5; Wetherell, *Reluctant Mission*, p. 328.

⁵⁷ 'ACPNG HIV and AIDS Policy', *Catalyst*, 39 (2009), p. 259.

oversaw centres, aid-posts, and training schools for nurses and other health workers. Community development initiatives included an HIV/AIDS department and Anglicare's 'StopAIDS' education programme, which contributed to HIV/AIDS education nationally. Newton Theological College, Popondetta, offered post-secondary theological education, including the first Papuan staff appointment in 1984. Kerina Evangelists' College, a school for catechists, was established at Tsendiap in the remote Western Highlands Province.

A strong, well-knit Mothers' Union, begun in 1949 and under Papuan leadership by the 1970s, established adult literacy programmes (40 per cent of women remain illiterate), and partnerships with similar organizations to address issues such as HIV/AIDS awareness, gender equality, domestic violence, parenting and marriage support, and income generation. In 2016 the Mothers' Union's estimated membership stood at 21,000, with a voice on the Church's decision-making body, the provincial council. Women have not been ordained, but some have theological training and roles in lay ministry.⁵⁸

The Church has always contended with forces of religious reaction, most notably in the form of primal religions, cargo cults, new religious movements, sorcery, and syncretism. One such movement during the 1960s was a millenarian cult led by a former sorcerer, Copland Tumanap, that constructed 'arks' in anticipation of a prophesied flood. Tumanap was eventually excommunicated by Bishop Ambo during a dramatic public burning of carved fertility idols. Ambo himself went in the direction of these primal religions after retirement, but was reconciled with the ACPNG on his deathbed.⁵⁹

The Papuan Church has been marked by a commitment to ecumenism, which in turn has fostered national unity. Leaders such as Hand and Ambo contributed to the Malua Conference of 1961 and the Melanesian Council of Churches (later renamed the Papua New Guinea Council of Churches), founded in 1965 to link the nascent nation's major Churches. The ACPNG's Anglo-Catholic ethos has nurtured cordial relations with Roman Catholic bishops and mutual cooperation where possible. There has been a high level of ecumenical cooperation in the areas of health and education, where Churches provide more than half the nation's rural health work and nearly all training of nurses and community health workers.⁶⁰

⁵⁸ Tomkins, *Road from Gona*, pp. 134–40; Garrett, *Where Nets were Cast*, pp. 344–5; John Titterington (ed.), *Strongly Grows the Modawa Tree: Factual Essays Outlining the Growth of the Anglican Church of Papua New Guinea* (Dogura, 1991), pp. 20, 37; <<http://www.mothersunion.org/about-us/where-we-work/worldwide/PapuaNew-guinea>> (accessed 29 Apr. 2016).

⁵⁹ Garrett, *Where Nets were Cast*, pp. 339–40; Miriam Kahn, 'Sunday Christians, Monday Sorcerers: Selective Adaptation to Missionization in Wamira', *Journal of Pacific History*, 28 (1983): 96–112 (pp. 96–7); Hand, *Modawa*, p. 150.

⁶⁰ Garrett, *Where Nets were Cast*, pp. 339–40; Titterington, *Modawa*, p. 40; 'Provincial Directory', <<http://www.anglicancommunion.org/tour/province.cfm?ID=P1>> (accessed 17 Feb. 2014).

While the Anglo-Catholic ethos remained an ecclesiological and theological touchstone, after the 1960s the Church was forced to adapt its traditional Franciscan model of austerity and religious socialism, firmly grounded in the agricultural mores of Papua, to the encroaching demands of modernity. Nevertheless, an indigenous Anglican leadership has enabled the Church to thrive in the villages, where most people still live.⁶¹

POLYNESIA: HAWAI'I, FIJI, AND TONGA

In contrast with the significant presence of Anglicans among Melanesians, Anglican influence among Polynesians outside Aotearoa/New Zealand has been modest, partly because Polynesian societies such as those in Hawai'i and Tonga had been heavily evangelized by Methodists and Congregationalists for decades before Anglicans arrived. Yet in these places, as well as in Fiji where Polynesian influence has been significant, Catholic Anglican spirituality has carved out a niche in counterpoise to the predominantly Evangelical Christianity planted in the region.

Anglicans arrived in Hawai'i in 1862 at the behest of King Kamehameha IV, whose London visit in 1849 inspired the creation of the 'rather exotic' Reformed Catholic Church. The king and his queen, Emma, supported the Church's establishment throughout their islands with gifts of land for cathedral foundation, a hospital, and schools. Alfred Willis, an English High Churchman, was consecrated bishop in 1872. The Americans overthrew the monarchy and annexed the islands during 1892–3. In 1900, when Hawai'i became a United States dependency, the American Episcopal Church assumed responsibility for Hawai'ian Anglicans.⁶²

The predominantly Melanesian Fiji had a strong Methodist population of 145,000 by 1914. William Floyd, an Irish chaplain to white settlers, brought Anglicanism to Levuka, Fiji, nine years earlier. He promised not to seek Fijian converts, but a few chiefly families became Anglicans. Linked closely to colonial officials and benefiting from indirect rule, chiefs like Ratu (Sir) Lala Sukuna were attracted to the Anglicans' moderate High Church tone, liberal attitudes to alcohol and Sabbath-keeping, and emphasis on British loyalty that was reinforced culturally in sports like rugby and cricket. Paternalist British governors and missionaries supported the import of Melanesian and Indian plantation labourers (first introduced to Fiji in 1865) to develop the cotton and

⁶¹ Ward, *History of Global Anglicanism*, p. 274; Wetherell, *Reluctant Mission*, pp. 329–30.

⁶² Ward, *History of Global Anglicanism*, pp. 290–1; National Council of the Protestant Episcopal Church, *Handbooks on the Missions of the Episcopal Church: No. VIII. Hawaiian Islands* (New York, 1927), pp. 23–7.

sugar industries. Here Anglicans carved out a small but important pastoral role among marginalized minorities such as the Solomon Islander descendants of plantation labourers, and Chinese traders and storekeepers.⁶³

Anglicans played a similar role in Tongan society, where Methodism's dominance since the mid-nineteenth century made it virtually a national Church.⁶⁴ Bishop Selwyn had visited Tonga in 1848, but Anglican interest in the archipelago was delayed until the late nineteenth century by a comity agreement with Methodists and jurisdiction disputes between New Zealand and Fijian churchmen over who should superintend the Fijian Church. A major catalyst for the creation of an Anglican Church in Tonga was the visit of Alfred Willis, bishop of Honolulu, in 1897, during which he confirmed four people. Willis, who was also mired in a Trollopean power struggle with clergy and laity, later refused to join the American Episcopal Church. Shirley Baker, founder of a Free Church breakaway from Tongan Methodism, attempted to set up a branch of the Church of England in Tonga. Anglican petitioners invited Willis, however, and he was recognized as bishop of Tonga in 1902 by New Zealand's acting primate, Samuel Nevill. Yim San Mark, a Chinese-born protégé of Willis from Hawai'i, was ordained in 1909 and became the driving force behind Anglicanism in Tonga, establishing schools up to secondary level, planting churches, and cultivating networks of lay readers. A visiting clergyman, R. T. Matthews, depicted the Anglo-Catholic complexion of Anglican worship in Nuku'alofa in 1911:

I attended a celebration of the [Holy Communion] in Tongan. The Bishop was priest and Ying [*sic*] Mark deacon. Full [v]estments were worn and the service was fully choral and excellently sung. The congregation numbers 50 native and there were 30 communicants... I never saw a more devout congregation. The white people are not church goers but I preached at midday to about seven local white people to whom were added my fellow voyagers.⁶⁵

The first Tongan ordinand, Filipe Ve'a, was deaconed in 1912 but died prematurely from pneumonia. It would be over forty years before another Tongan was ordained. The first church, built from coral rocks gathered at low tide, was consecrated in these years, while the secondary school, St Andrew's, became a leading school and seedbed for future Church leaders. During the inter-war years the Church received patronage from Tonga's European elite, including consuls and chief justices. Anglicans' accommodating temper was evident in the innovative 'Fai Kava' or *kava* party, a monthly evening meeting in which Tongan men sat on the vicarage floor and passed around the *kava*

⁶³ Beward, *Churches in Australasia*, pp. 158, 278–9; C. W. Whonsbon-Aston, *Pacific Irishman* (Sydney, 1970), p. i; Winston Halapua, *Living on the Fringe: Melanesians in Fiji* (Suva, 2001).

⁶⁴ Ward, *History of Global Anglicanism*, p. 290.

⁶⁵ A. K. Davidson (ed.), *Tongan Anglicans, 1902–2002* (Auckland, 2002), p. 36.

cup (a traditional drink with a soporific effect, made from the *kava* plant), while discussing questions of Christian teaching and custom.⁶⁶

By virtue of its geography, Tonga remained relatively untouched by the Second World War. A post-war baby boom enabled expansion of Anglican schools and men's and women's guilds. A succession of expatriate clergy, including Evangelicals from Melbourne's Ridley College, fostered an indigenous priesthood. From 1957 some younger Tongan clergy undertook further theological training at St John's College, Auckland. An indigenous Church began to transcend its missionary origins in 1967 with the consecration of a Tongan bishop (Halapua Fine), an archdeacon (Jabez Bryce), and six Tongans. Clergy such as Fine and John Tamahori galvanized the Church through missions to remote communities and the establishment of guilds and youth clubs.⁶⁷

Women's participation was channelled through the expanding Mothers' Union, the introduction of female lay readers, and a Tongan branch of the Association of Anglican Women (AAW); counselling services and outreach to divorcees and unmarried mothers became important parts of women's ministry as Tonga underwent significant social change after the 1960s. In 1985 Sister Betty Slader, a nurse-evangelist working among the poor in Fiji, became the diocese's first female priest.

Increasing outward migration to New Zealand, urbanization, and an economic downturn during the 1970s created social problems of family breakdown, poverty, sexually transmitted disease, and substance abuse. In these social contexts, both inside and outside Tonga, the Anglican Church's impact was out of proportion to its numbers, principally in terms of the numbers of indigenous leaders the Church was able to produce. By 2002 some thirty-nine Tongan men had been ordained, including three bishops. Many had served in parishes and theological education outside Tonga in Fiji, outlying Tongan islands, Eastern Samoa, Papua New Guinea, Bougainville, New Zealand, and Australia.⁶⁸

Similar social challenges faced Anglicans in Fiji, which declared independence in 1970. Profound ethnic-political divisions emerged in the wake of political coups during 1987–2006, accompanied by economic depression. The rapid expansion of Hinduism, Islam, Pentecostals, and new religious movements altered the religious landscape. Anglicans retained their traditional focus on Europeans, Indians, Chinese, and Solomon Islander descendants in Fiji, while seeking to be a force for reconciliation that transcended tribal loyalties. Like other Anglicans in Oceania, Fijians have been active in ecumenism and inter-faith dialogue. Bishop Jabez Bryce chaired the Pacific Conference

⁶⁶ Davidson (ed.), *Tongan Anglicans*, pp. 38–55.

⁶⁷ Davidson (ed.), *Tongan Anglicans*, p. 89.

⁶⁸ Davidson (ed.), *Tongan Anglicans*, pp. 104–20.

of Churches during 1976–86 and served as president of the WCC's Oceania region from 1999.

These small Anglican groups in Fiji, Tonga, and Samoa (where a permanent chaplain to the European Anglican community was first appointed in 1932) had justified the creation of the diocese of Polynesia in 1908. In 1975 the first indigenous bishop of Polynesia, Jabez Bryce, was consecrated. Growth in the diocese by 2005 warranted the appointment of three assistant bishops (an indigenous Fijian, an Indo-Fijian, and an Auckland-based Tongan), as well as the ordination of Tongan ministers to serve Tongans in Auckland, where some Auckland suburbs are called 'Brotown' on account of the Polynesian presence. Diocesan diversity is reflected in provision made for eucharistic services in Fijian and Tongan for the diocese of Polynesia. Baptism, marriage, and funeral services are published in Fijian, Tongan, Hindi, and Samoan.⁶⁹

THEOLOGY AND CULTURE

Anglican contributions to theology and intellectual life in Oceania have been modest but nevertheless important.⁷⁰ Anglican missionaries such as Robert Codrington (1830–1922), Walter Ivens (1871–1940), and Charles Fox (1878–1977) were front-rank anthropologists, linguists, and ethnologists of a region comprising over a thousand distinct cultures. During the post-war period indigenous Anglicans studied at local institutions like Bishop Patteson Theological College (Solomons), Newton Theological College (Papua New Guinea), Pacific Theological College (Fiji), and St John's (Auckland). From the 1960s they also began to study theology in Australia, the United Kingdom, Canada, and the United States, returning to take up leadership positions in both the Church and local theological colleges. These local institutions, in addition to new intellectual fora such as the *Pacific Journal of Theology* (1961) and the *Melanesian Journal of Theology* (1985), fostered the growth of indigenous theologies and worship practices. Notable Anglican theologians include Leslie Fugui (1942–95), chaplain at the University of the South Pacific in Fiji; Sir Ellison Pogo (1948–2013), Anglican archbishop of Melanesia, and his successor, David Vunagi; Sam Ata, Anglican chair of the Truth and

⁶⁹ Breward, *Churches in Australasia*, pp. 278–9; Diocese of Polynesia, *A History of the Diocese of Polynesia* (Suva, 2008), pp. 27–33; Kenneth Booth, 'The Anglican Church in Aotearoa, New Zealand and Polynesia', in Hefling and Shattuck (eds.), *Book of Common Prayer*, pp. 333–42 (p. 340).

⁷⁰ I am grateful to Bishop Terry Brown (bishop of Malaita, 1996–2008), for his insights into Anglican theology in the region. See Terry Brown, 'Christian Contextual Theology: A Pacific Example', *Pacific Journal of Theology*, 33 (2005): 5–35; Terry Brown to author, personal communications, 24 May, 1 June 2014.

Reconciliation Commission in the Solomons during 2010–12; and Winston Halapua, bishop of Polynesia since 2010.⁷¹

Social and political themes have been important to Anglicans in the region. The intellectual cane matting of activist clergymen like Walter Lini, who searched for a 'Pacific way' both politically and theologically, in the era of decolonization, reveals diverse influences: Dietrich Bonhoeffer, the Niebuhr brothers, African and Latin American liberation theologians, and Franz Fanon's visceral critique of French colonialism in Algeria. Lini's 'Melanesian socialism', inspired by Julius Nyerere's African socialism in Tanzania, fused Christian socialism with the communal, reciprocal nature of Melanesian customs and societies. Lini envisioned a prophetic role for Churches in 'tearing down' 'evil and unjust' political and economic structures and, in solidarity with the exploited, fashioning new and just structures. Just as controversial were his authoritarianism and alliances once in power.

Bishop Halapua offered a later critique of Fiji's political coups, stressing the need for both Church and state to reclaim values of *vanua* (land, people, and custom), grounded in traditional notions of hospitality and reciprocity rather than in the militarism that beset post-independence Fiji.⁷² In 2006 Jabez Bryce likewise observed that because of their leadership roles in both urban and rural communities, the region's theologians and Churches needed to make issues of 'justice, peace and integrity of creation' as important as worship, Bible teaching, and moral and ethical guidance. Theologians and educators have played a crucial role in equipping clergy and laity to engage creatively with issues of importance in the region, including political instability, globalization, the impact of global warming and climate change, technological impacts, HIV/AIDS, youth culture, human sexuality, and terrorism.⁷³

Polynesian theologians have tended to dominate regional theology. Most Anglican theological thinking in Oceania, moreover, has been local and corporate in character, happening at the village or provincial level. Local Anglican 'ethno-theologies' have been produced by local priests out of their own inculturated experience.⁷⁴ These are theologies that negotiate the complex relationship between Christianity and culture at the grassroots. Numerous topics recur in this theological discussion: reconciliation and *mana* (power), particularly in the wake of ethnic conflict; related issues of land policy and eco-theology; polygamy, mixed marriages, and the question of

⁷¹ E.g. Leslie Fugui, 'Melanesian Sacrifice and Christianity', in Leslie Fugui and Cliff Wright (eds.), *Christ in South Pacific Cultures* (Suva, 1985), pp. 36–41; Fugui and Butu, 'Religion'; Vunagi, 'Liturgical Spirituality'; Pogo, 'Ministry and Mission'.

⁷² Lini, *Beyond Pandemonium*, p. 19; Lini, 'Christians in Politics', pp. 184–5.

⁷³ Jabez Bryce, 'Towards a Pacific Community', in Michael Powles (ed.), *Pacific Futures* (Canberra, 2006), pp. 231–2.

⁷⁴ E.g. Michael W. Scott, *The Severed Snake: Matrilineages, Making Place, and a Melanesian Christianity in Southeast Solomon Islands* (Durham, NC, 2007).

bride-price, with its complex role in mutual obligation between Melanesian communities; interdenominational drift, which can be a source of community tension, especially when involving re-baptism; and expressions of spiritual power such as magic, sorcery, and shamanism. The perennial challenge of syncretism is defined in terms of a person who wears two masks or has two hearts. Should Jesus be regarded, for example, as a substitute for the spirits of the ancestors, or should he be included among them? A key task, observed Anglican priest Leslie Fugui, is to 'discard what is deemed to be bad and to Christianize what is in accordance with the Gospel. It is a worthy task and one that is conducive to the emergence of an authentic Solomon Islands Christianity.'⁷⁵

CONCLUSIONS

Like the woven cane matting used for the flooring and walling of houses and churches in the Solomons, Anglicanism has been deeply woven into the life of a significant proportion of the peoples of Oceania. That the same matting has often been woven in intricate patterns of black and white is further suggestive of ways in which the weaving together of indigenous and European Anglicans in the region has, since the mid-nineteenth century, produced a unique and evolving set of identities and practices. Although attempts to replace the ecclesiastical net's white missionary corks with the black corks of an indigenous ministry bore early fruit, a paternalistic ethos in the Solomons and Papua New Guinea delayed the creation of an indigenous Church and leadership until after the 1960s. The Church in Tonga differed, however, in being led by a Chinese-born Anglican priest in its formative stages.

Anglo-Catholic Anglicanism's emphasis on an identity grounded in apostolic succession and spiritual authority, rather than in privileged ties to state or colonial government, resulted in an independent posture towards the colonial and imperial state in the Solomons and Papua New Guinea. This posture, along with the creation of indigenous leadership, helped smooth the Church's path after political independence. Likewise the Church's focus on the marginalized in Fiji and Tonga made it difficult to associate the Church exclusively with state power and its excesses, ensuring the Church's ability to speak truth prophetically to state power, as it has in the Solomons and Fiji. Vanuatu is a different case again, where clergy have consistently led the country. Although Lini insisted that religion and politics were two sides of the same *vatu* (coin), there was no question in his mind of any subordination of Church to state.

⁷⁵ Fugui and Butu, 'Religion', pp. 75–7. E.g. Bishop Patteson Theological College's student theses, Pacific Manuscripts Bureau, Australian National University (ANU), Canberra, PMB/1361, ff. 1–325.

Anglo-Catholic missionaries' veneration for ritual and tradition fostered an accommodating approach to traditional culture that fit well with local notions of sacred power (*mana*) and practices. Ironically, that same veneration for tradition, in this case for Western Anglo-Catholicism, diminished indigenous leaders' enthusiasm for the inculturation of local ritual and worship after independence. Likewise missionaries' deep-seated preference for the Romantic pastoral ideal—of a 'green and pleasant land' over 'dark satanic mills'—delayed the Church's economic self-sufficiency and adjustments to modernity after 1942, while nevertheless preserving the cultural resources of a 'Melanesian way' that would be drawn upon after independence in Church and state. Meanwhile, the devotion and self-sacrifice of many European and Oceanian Anglicans—poignantly commemorated in the Papuan martyr Lucian Tapiedi's niche in Westminster Abbey—has supplied a powerful witness to the impact of a consecrated Christian life.

Creative but controversial synergies of indigenization and local agency are evident in the syncretistic approaches of cargo cultists and those who are Sunday Christians and Monday sorcerers, as well as in inculturated liturgies and worship practices. The uplift and advocacy of women and families in the region has been an important legacy of Mothers' Unions and religious sisterhoods, who have reached women in ways that are culturally appropriate only for women. Perhaps most influential has been the success of the Melanesian Brotherhood in melding Western monastic traditions with Melanesian culture. The Brotherhood has adapted Melanesian methods and values to the demands of developing a faithful Christian witness in both pre-modern villages and expanding urban populations from Port Moresby to Port Vila. The Brotherhood's success, like that of Solomon Islands labourers among pre-war coastal Papuans, underscores the indigenous evangelist is most effective in reaching his or her people. In the twenty-first century, that effectiveness appears to be extending to the original missionary-sending country. In 2005 and 2013 contingents from the Melanesian Brotherhood conducted missions—combining Melanesian dances, chants, and original gospel dramas—in churches, schools, community centres, and prisons throughout the dioceses of Chester and Exeter. The mission to Melanesians—sending Melanesian missionaries to evangelize an increasingly post-Christian England—came full circle.

SELECT BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Bennett, Judith A., *Wealth of the Solomons: A History of a Pacific Archipelago, 1800–1978* (Honolulu, 1987).
 Beward, Ian, *The Churches in Australasia* (Oxford, 2001).
 Davidson, Allan K. (ed.), *The Church of Melanesia, 1849–1999* (Auckland, 2000).

- Davidson, Allan K. (ed.), *Tongan Anglicans, 1902–2002* (Auckland, 2002).
- Ernst, Manfred, *Globalization and the Re-shaping of Christianity in the Pacific Islands* (Suva, 2006).
- Fugui, Leslie and Simeon Butu, 'Religion', in Hugh Laracy (ed.), *Ples Blong Lumi: Solomon Islands—The Past Four Thousand Years* (Suva, 1989), pp. 73–93.
- Garrett, John, *Footsteps in the Sea: Christianity in Oceania to World War II* (Suva, 1992).
- Garrett, John, *To Live Among the Stars: Christian Origins in Oceania* (Geneva, 1982).
- Garrett, John, *Where Nets were Cast: Christianity in Oceania since World War II* (Suva, 1997).
- Hilliard, David, *God's Gentlemen: A History of the Melanesian Mission, 1849–1942* (St Lucia, Queensland, 1978).
- Macdonald-Milne, Brian, *The True Way of Service: The Pacific Story of the Melanesian Brotherhood, 1925–2000* (Leicester, 2003).
- Tippet, Alan R., *Solomon Islands Christianity: A Study in Growth and Obstruction* (London, 1967).
- Trompf, Garry, *Melanesian Religion* (Cambridge, 1991).
- Wetherell, David, *Reluctant Mission: The Anglican Church in Papua New Guinea, 1891–1942* (St Lucia, Queensland, 1977).
- Whiteman, Darrell L., *Melanesians and Missionaries: An Ethnohistorical Study* (Pasadena, CA, 1983).

Anglican Inter-Faith Relations from 1910 to the Twenty-First Century

Paul Hedges

INTRODUCTION

The story of Anglican inter-faith relations from 1910 to the twenty-first century could be told in different ways: it could emphasize the move from mission to dialogue as the primary way of interacting with those of different religious traditions; it could chart a move from a context of empire and colonies to a global communion with indigenous Church leadership; it could place the narrative within a wider ecumenical context. All three of these, and other perspectives, would help us understand and chart the history of Anglican inter-faith relations in this period. However, none is the main narrative and, importantly, the changes and developments are far from linear. Rather we see in different places and at different times a host of factors, some local, others global, impacting the way that inter-faith relations have taken place across the Anglican Communion.

Certainly, the wider ecumenical developments cannot be ignored. Therefore, I will discuss Roman Catholic and Protestant developments as part of the historical context of Anglicanism's story. Much of this context relates to wider trends which may be put under broad categories such as colonialism, post-colonialism, globalization, the missionary imperative, immigration, and multiculturalism. As such, the story of Anglican inter-faith relations is also about historical developments within local and global society and politics. Importantly, in this chapter, I am focusing on inter-faith relations in the sense of attempts to dialogue and maintain harmonious relations with people from other religions. While mission and the desire for conversion cannot be disentangled from this I will focus on the pathways and impetus towards such exchanges, although not ignoring contrary movements.

I will draw heavily on the British context and the Church of England, but also take account of developments in the wider, global Anglican Communion. There are several reasons for this approach. First, within the scope of this chapter it would be superficial to overview developments across the entire tradition. As such, taking the 'home Church' as a focus will provide more depth. Second, until relatively recently, the Church in Britain has provided something of a sense of leadership and centrality to the tradition.¹ It is impossible, though, to focus solely on it, and again we may cite two reasons. First, for the earlier part of the twentieth century a large part of inter-faith relations concerned the mission field: the growing global Church. Second, in recent decades much impetus to reflection has been driven by the 'global South' and its experience of religious diversity. Nevertheless, considerable theological reflection also has occurred from those within Britain, or strongly associated with it. For instance, Kenneth Cragg, discussed later in this chapter, was perhaps the most significant Anglican theologian and bishop to engage with Islam. While speaking from a position of working within the global tradition he nevertheless often wrote and reflected as an English Anglican.

This chapter divides into four sections. The first is a historical prolegomenon to thinking about twentieth-century inter-faith relations. This will focus on the missionary imperative of the nineteenth century and how it affected Anglican thought. This missionary work led to the development of ecumenical relations amongst the Protestant traditions and so informs many twentieth-century developments. India plays a vital role in this story and so Britain's colonial interests cannot be separated out. The second section starts with the landmark 1910 Edinburgh Missionary Conference. I will show that both ecumenical reflection and missionary encounters were central to the development of thinking in this area. As the twentieth century unfolded other ecumenical events occurred; crucially in the latter half of the twentieth century the work of the World Council of Churches (WCC) and the Roman Catholic Church in the wake of the Second Vatican Council (Vatican II) will be noted. The relationship to both Judaism and Islam were key drivers here. However, for Britain, immigration also played a key role where inter-faith reflection moved from being a matter of missionary policy in the field (i.e. distant and remote) to becoming a matter of reflection on the home front: in schools, with neighbours, and at the supermarket. As such, migration and population flows in a globalized world proved to be central. We will also consider some specific Anglican landmark events, particularly the Lambeth Conferences of 1988, 1998, and 2008, alongside the work of the Anglican Network for Inter Faith Concerns (NIFCON), founded in 1993. The third section will put some theological issues and reflections of

¹ Mark Chapman, 'Anglicanism, Japan, and the Perception of a Higher Civilization in the Early Twentieth Century', *Anglican and Episcopal History*, 84 (2015): 298–320.

individuals into historical context, noting the external social, political, and intellectual trends that are part of the development of Anglican thought. The final section focuses on two case studies. One of these is Anglican relations with Buddhism in Sri Lanka. The second focuses on Anglican relations with Islam in the Middle East, noting Kenneth Cragg as an exemplary figure.

BEFORE, AND INTO, THE TWENTIETH CENTURY: THE MISSIONARY IMPERATIVE

Early Anglican encounters with other religious traditions were somewhat haphazard and patchy. Judaism had long been present in Western Europe, including the British Isles, as a small and often persecuted minority. Notably for the concerns of this chapter, the winds of reform that saw Roman Catholics included within the British system (gaining the right to vote, hold parliamentary seats, enter the universities, etc.) also affected Judaism through the emerging notion of citizenship as part of a nation state. As such, the Jewish community entered the twentieth century as a broadly respected and integrated part of British life.² In terms of inter-faith relations, it was as yet hardly significant. But we shall return to the importance of Judaism for the growing concern with what is termed (following terminology inspired by the ethical philosopher Emmanuel Levinas) the 'religious Other' in the post-Holocaust context. While Jews were seen by some as a particular target for evangelism, especially from the Evangelical pre-millennial wing, this was not widespread in Anglicanism as a whole. Islam, meanwhile, emerged quite early into the Anglican consciousness as, following the political fallout of the English Reformation, an alliance was sought with the Ottoman Empire. The sight of Muslims performing their prayers on the streets of London was thus a phenomenon known to Elizabethan England.³ The presence of an Ottoman ambassador, though, was not lasting; and while Muslims continued to be a presence in the ports of England in the following centuries, with the United Kingdom's first purpose-built mosque appearing in Liverpool in the nineteenth century, the impact on inter-faith awareness was limited and insubstantial.⁴ It was rather the colonial expansion of the eighteenth and, primarily,

² For an overview of Judaism in the United Kingdom see David Graham, 'Judaism', in Linda Woodhead and Rebecca Catto (eds.), *Religion and Change in Modern Britain* (London and New York, 2012), pp. 110–21.

³ N. I. Matar, 'Muslims in Seventeenth-Century England', *Journal of Islamic Studies*, 8 (1997): 63–82; Diarmaid McCulloch, *Reformation: Europe's House Divided 1490–1700* (London, 2004), pp. 53–7, 550–5.

⁴ For an overview of Islam in the United Kingdom see Sophie Gilliat-Ray, 'Islam', in Woodhead and Catto (eds.), *Religion and Change in Modern Britain*, pp. 110–21.

the nineteenth centuries that saw reflection on other religions becoming a matter of concern for the Anglican tradition.

That this period was marked by the missionary imperative, which has even been termed its defining characteristic, is well documented and need not detain us here except for noting some twentieth-century foundations resulting from that mission development. First, inter-faith reflection was essentially a matter of the foreign and exotic; it concerned what happened overseas and not at home (notwithstanding that the home front was also seen as a place for a parallel missionary endeavour, but in this case to the unchurched urban masses⁵). Second, the question was largely about conversion—the issue of what we may term inter-faith dialogue and therefore relations with the religious Other in their own right simply did not arise. Third, Anglican reflection broadly mirrored wider ecumenical Protestant concerns, which as the nineteenth century gave way to the twentieth century would focus on what is termed ‘fulfilment theology’. We discuss this in the third section; in brief, it is the notion that non-Christian religions should lead their devotees to accept Christianity as the ‘fulfilment’ of their ideals. Fourth, despite the missionary and colonial context, the religious Other did not leave the wider society, or Anglican reflection, untouched. I will deal with this further as a final discussion on these preliminary matters.

The Anglican relationship with other religions has been described as one which is very textual.⁶ This can be exemplified by a range of notable Anglican theologians, bishops, and scholars. Reflection on non-Christian religions was a matter of considerable concern to Anglican thinkers in the context of empire, especially in the Indian context. Such notable nineteenth-century figures as Edward White Benson, Charles Gore, Frederick Denison Maurice, Arthur Penhryn Stanley, Brooke Foss Westcott, and Rowland Williams all spoke or wrote about the issue. The strength and depth of later nineteenth-century Anglican concern with this issue can be seen partly through this list. Primarily their concern was missionary. Williams wrote an essay for a prize competition on ways to convert educated Hindus, while Westcott, alongside Lightfoot, Stanton, and Hort, helped establish and support the Cambridge Mission to Delhi.⁷ The aim was to show the superiority of Christianity, often in its specifically Anglican manifestation, to the heathen or pagan. However, such

⁵ Alison Twells, *The Civilising Mission and the English Middle Class, 1792–1850* (Basingstoke, 2009).

⁶ NIFCON, *Generous Love: The Truth of the Gospel and the Call to Dialogue—An Anglican Theology of Inter Faith Relations* (London: Anglican Consultative Council, 2008), p. 7.

⁷ Paul Hedges, ‘Rowland Williams and Missions to the Hindu’, in Marion Eggert, Hans-Martin Krämer, Björn Bentlage, and Stefan Reichmuth (eds.), *Religious Dynamics Under the Impact of Imperialism and Colonialism: A Sourcebook* (Leiden, 2016), pp. 197–211; Paul Hedges, ‘Architecture, Inculturation and Christian Mission: The Buildings of the Cambridge Mission to Delhi, and Their Meaning for the Church Today’, *International Review of Mission*, 89 (2002): 180–9.

engagement also brought a growing awareness that many of the religious traditions Anglicans encountered were sophisticated and powerful systems of thought that were entwined with highly developed and advanced cultures. This was particularly significant because in the work of missionaries and others we see a change in the attitude of the Anglican and wider British regard for these other religions. Of particular note is the German Anglican convert Max Müller, often spoken of as the Father of Religious Studies, whose translations of the ‘scriptural texts’ of the ‘world religions’ (a phrase shaped by Christian discourse and interests) made a knowledge and awareness of them more common.⁸ The attitude of such nineteenth-century Anglicans towards these religious traditions was deeply affected by their study which often led to appreciation. As such, the colonial situation in India, the textual study of Anglican priests (especially missionaries), and the influence this had on Anglican appreciation cannot be underestimated. This is especially true of Buddhism, where texts like Edward Arnold’s *The Light of Asia* (1879) perhaps played a larger role than many more academic studies and texts in bringing a greater acceptance of non-Christian religions,⁹ as part of a wider pattern in which knowledge of, and empathy for, the religious Other entered parts at least of the Anglican Communion.

ECUMENICAL PATHWAYS AND ANGLICAN LANDMARKS IN THE TWENTIETH CENTURY

The landmark event in the early twentieth century was the Edinburgh Missionary Conference of 1910, which while concerning mission rather than inter-faith dialogue signalled a new seriousness in considering other religions. This conference drew Protestants from many denominations for a global reflection on the missionary endeavour, and led directly into the ecumenical movement.¹⁰ It is also significant that an entire commission of the conference was given over to reflection on non-Christian religions. (Notably, of the seven volumes of the Pan-Anglican Congress of 1908 one of them—volume five—was

⁸ On ‘religion’ and ‘world religions’, see Tomoko Masuzawa, *The Invention of World Religions* (Chicago and London, 2005); Anna S. King and Paul Hedges, ‘What is Religion? Or, What Is It We Are Talking About?’, in Paul Hedges (ed.), *Controversies in Contemporary Religion: Education, Law, Politics, Society, and Spirituality*, vol. I: *Theoretical and Academic Debates* (Santa Barbara, CA, 2014), pp. 1–30; Paul Hedges, ‘Post-Colonialism, Orientalism, and Understanding: Religious Studies and the Christian Missionary Imperative’, *Journal of Religious History*, 32 (2008): 55–75.

⁹ J. Jeffrey Franklin, *The Lotus and the Lion: Buddhism and the British Empire* (Ithaca, NY, 2008).

¹⁰ R. Rouse and S. C. Neill, *A History of the Ecumenical Movement 1517–1948* (London, 1948).

devoted wholly to this issue and so in a sense anticipated Edinburgh 1910.) Commission Four can be seen as broadly endorsing fulfilment theology as the stance to be taken.¹¹ It is worthwhile considering this because, while very much a speculative theological endeavour, it reveals much about the dynamics and historical and social situation, and we address it in the third section. We will not dwell further on Edinburgh 1910 here as it was not an explicitly Anglican affair. Nevertheless, it highlights three central issues (two of which we have already noted): Anglican reflection on inter-faith relations throughout this period was always ecumenical; mission and inter-faith reflection were deeply intertwined; and, a point explored further in the following, while inter-faith reflection was prominent in ecumenical trends, Anglican voices often were significant in these discussions.

Globalization has never been simply a one-way flow of Western colonial expansion; ideas from Asia and elsewhere influenced Europe.¹² Related to this we must mention the World Parliament of Faiths of 1893 in Chicago as an important catalyst for global interest and initiatives in inter-faith relations, especially in the Christian West.¹³ While Edward White Benson as archbishop of Canterbury refused Anglican involvement the same was not true of many US Episcopalians.¹⁴ But from the 1950s and 1960s onwards inter-faith encounter was spurred by many new immigrants to the West from places like East Africa, India, Nepal, Pakistan, and Sri Lanka arriving in Britain.¹⁵ This context is important because for Anglicans in Britain the non-Christian religion issue was no longer simply a question for the mission field but rather a matter of meeting neighbours, colleagues, or friends—whether they were immigrants or indigenous converts. (Something equally true, but with different dynamics and emigrant nationalities and ethnicities, in places such as the United States, Australia, and New Zealand.)

This trend encouraged new Anglican reflection on this issue. Anglican theological or ecclesial inter-faith reflection though, was quite slow in coming and ecumenical developments were key. This can be contrasted with the nineteenth century when many Anglican theological and ecclesiastical heavy-weights engaged the issue. Nevertheless, from the 1960s to the 1980s the question of relationships with other religions became central not just to

¹¹ Paul Hedges, *Preparation and Fulfilment: A History and Study of Fulfilment Theology in Modern British Thought in the Indian Context* (Bern, 2001).

¹² J. J. Clarke, *Oriental Enlightenment: The Encounter Between Asian and Western Thought* (London and New York, 1997).

¹³ Anna Halafoff, *The Multifaith Movement: Global Risks and Cosmopolitan Solutions* (Dordrecht, 2013).

¹⁴ Clare Amos and Michael Iprgrave, 'An Untidy Generosity: Anglicans and the Challenge of Other Religions', in Mark Chapman, Sathianathan Clarke, and Martyn Percy (eds.), *The Oxford Handbook of Anglican Studies* (Oxford, 2016), pp. 427–47.

¹⁵ Paul Hedges and Anna Halafoff, 'Globalisation and Multifaith Societies', *Studies in Inter-religious Dialogue*, 25 (2015): 135–61.

individuals but to institutional Church structures.¹⁶ However, in Britain at least, it was often not about dialogue per se, or inter-faith relations, but arose in the context of social concerns or race relations. Meanwhile the continued relationship of mission and dialogue remained part of the mix. This reflects something of what Clare Amos and Michael Ipgrave describe as the structural untidiness of Anglicanism's inter-faith relations; it can sit alongside community concerns, ecumenism, mission, or social activism.

For twentieth-century inter-faith relations prompted by ecumenism we begin in what may seem the unlikely starting point of the Roman Catholic Church. The reflections of the Second Vatican Council (Vatican II) of that Church were milestones and a genuine trailblazer for all Christian denominations, at least within a Western context. The theological implications of conciliar texts such as *Nostra Aetate* (NA) and *Lumen Gentium* (LG) were of fundamental importance in validating and allowing moves towards greater openness to the religious Other. NA ('In Our Age') is a very brief document of only two paragraphs but displays the positive light in which non-Christian religions are seen, and has been understood as fundamental in setting out the Catholic stance in this regard. LG ('Light of the Nations') is a longer and much more widely ranging document that sought to put Catholicism in relation to the wider world, but notes the close relationship to both Judaism and Islam.¹⁷ For our purposes, however, two issues stand out. The first is the question of Judaism. While a familiar neighbour, Judaism had not been a matter of inter-faith reflection for Christians in the West. Much of this disconnection was theological, because of the particular fulfilment theological model applied to Judaism. Often termed 'supersessionism', this theology made Judaism in effect a failed form of Christianity. Jews were those who had killed their Messiah and failed to realize that they should become Christians. The theological and social consequences of this theology can arguably be traced through two thousand years to the Holocaust.¹⁸ Indeed, the trauma of that event is what led first the Roman Catholic Church and then others to admit their complicity in the anti-Semitism which led to the Holocaust. As a result, Judaism became, for Roman Catholics, a subject for ecumenical dialogue. Today, the Commission of the Holy See for Religious Relations with the Jews sits within the Pontifical Council for Promoting Christian Unity (PCID) (although in some dioceses relations with Judaism still fall under the remit of inter-religious dialogue

¹⁶ Alan Race, *Christians and Religious Pluralism: Patterns in the Christian Theology of Religions* (London, 1983), pp. 1–5.

¹⁷ For a more detailed account, see Gerald Collins, *The Second Vatican Council on Other Religions* (Oxford, 2013), pp. 60–108, while he also addresses other important conciliar documents.

¹⁸ See Ron Miller, 'Judaism: Siblings in Strife', in Paul Hedges and Alan Race (eds.), *Christian Approaches to Other Faiths* (London, 2008), pp. 176–90.

rather than ecumenism). The relationship of the two traditions was acknowledged and the attitude of supersession and missionary outreach was replaced by one encouraging engagement as heirs of the same tradition.

The epochal shift this marked is hard to overstate. However, as worked out in Vatican II this led to further changes. Once the engagement with Judaism was acknowledged it raised the question about the other tradition which also traces its roots to Abraham: Islam. In the texts of Vatican II both Judaism and Islam are given special mention, although a connection to other religions is also discussed. The further direct result of this was a move from mission to dialogue, with what is now known as the Pontifical Council for Interreligious Dialogue being founded in the wake of this (1964, as the Secretariat for Non-Christians, renamed in 1988).

It may seem we have strayed from our discussion of the history of Anglicanism's inter-faith relations. But the outcomes of Vatican II were to impact not just the Roman Catholic Church but the major Protestant denominations as well. Following the lead given by Vatican II, the WCC in a series of meetings also moved to establish its own department dealing with inter-faith dialogue. From the 1970s to the 1980s the WCC moved from seeing mission as the main way of dealing with the non-Christian religions to seeing dialogue with the religious Other as the preferred approach. These movements in the WCC were reflected in various member Churches. In Britain, the British Council of Churches would first adopt resolutions on the matter and establish guidelines for dialogue, much of this led by former missionaries.

ANGLICANISM EMBRACES INTER-FAITH REFLECTION: THE LATE TWENTIETH TO THE EARLY TWENTY-FIRST CENTURY

In the mid to late twentieth century, apart from the writings of individual British theologians, Anglican inter-faith reflection was often sparse and tended to be superficial—certainly in comparison to what was coming out of the Catholic Church and the WCC. One example would be the 1996 document *The Mystery of Salvation* which endorsed a form of fulfilment theology, despite its avowed intention to distance itself from past theological attempts to categorize religious Others. Importantly, within the Anglican context, no individual or document had authoritative teaching or doctrinal weight, which contrasted strongly with the Roman Catholic magisterium. As such, we cannot speak about a definitive Anglican position based upon this or any other document, although such documents are important to show how Anglicanism developed institutionally in its stance on inter-religious relations.

Significant markers for the Church of England and wider Anglicanism are the Lambeth Conferences of 1988, 1998, and 2008. Like much else in Anglicanism a book proved pivotal. *Towards a Theology of Interfaith Dialogue*, attributed to the Board of Church Commissioners, was written by two bishops and former missionaries, Kenneth Cragg and David Brown.¹⁹ It was considered by the General Synod of the Church of England in 1984, and came to the Lambeth Conference in 1988. However, the main impetus to put it securely on the agenda was pressure from the global South; for those living in situations where other religions might be either a majority, or at least a significant part of the population, the issue of inter-faith relations was a contextual imperative.

Two important consequences followed from the Lambeth Conference. One of them was the foundation of the Anglican Network for Inter Faith Concerns in 1993. As such, the Anglican tradition now had a body within its structures with direct responsibility for reflection on inter-faith relations. It did not have the significance or role of either the Dialogue Unit of the WCC or the Vatican's PCID, which is partly related to the Anglican Communion's more diverse and less authoritative structures. It is directly tied to reflection on mission and not formed simply as a dialogue unit. However, at the Lambeth Conference of 1988, inter-faith issues were seen for the first time as a priority for the Anglican Communion as a whole. This was reflected in the fact that inter-faith themes were included in all four sections of the conference discussions. A result of this conference was the document *Jews, Christians, and Muslims: The Way of Dialogue* (Appendix 6). The prominence of inter-faith relations remained at the Lambeth Conference of 1998, which both noted the ecumenical context of much work and featured a paper by Bishop Michael Nazir-Ali. The Lambeth Conference of 2008 also saw inter-faith relations remain on the agenda, and according to Douglas Pratt it was now simply embedded so that discussion of dialogue and religious diversity was in some senses business as usual.²⁰

It should be noted that during this period wider global events also played a role in pushing the inter-faith relations agenda into a higher priority for Anglican Churches. Inter-religious dialogue has attained wider prominence since the events of 11 September 2001 when it moved from being a matter of concerned individuals to become a wider concern for churches, civic society, and politicians. For various reasons, Islam has become an especially hot topic in the debates with questions of social cohesion and terrorism forming part of

¹⁹ Board of Church Commissioners [Kenneth Cragg and David Brown], *Towards a Theology of Interfaith Dialogue* (London, 1984); see Myrtle S. Langley, 'One More Step in a Journey of Many Miles', in Peter C. Phan (ed.), *The Wider Ecumenism* (New York, 1990), pp. 221–32.

²⁰ Douglas Pratt, 'From Edinburgh to Georgetown: Anglican Interfaith Bridge-Building', *Anglican Theological Review*, 96 (2014): 15–37.

the discussion. Anglican leaders, along with others, have often been prominent voices in stressing in this context that Islam itself should not be seen as the problem, and offering hospitality to, for instance, Muslim refugees. In specific communities, Anglican and ecumenical networks have sought to counter Islamophobia and show that Christians and Muslims are united together against intolerance.²¹

While these developments from 1988 to 2008 show that inter-faith relations, initially through the prompting of Churches from the global South, has become part of the general discussion of the Anglican tradition, it has been dependent on the ecumenical context. Nothing new from Anglicans is specifically added to the statements of the Roman Catholic Church and the WCC and it is largely derivative of this ecumenical context. Nevertheless, two statements in the early twenty-first century have tried to articulate a specific Anglican stance in these discussions. The first is *Generous Love* produced by NIFCON in 2008, which involved input from all parts of the Communion; and the second from the US Episcopal Church in 2009 is 'Toward our Mutual Flourishing: The Theological Statement on Interreligious Relations'. Alongside this, some recent theological arguments have been made about the nature of an Anglican stance. This is not the place to discuss the fine points of the theological case; however, the present author is not convinced that a distinctively Anglican theology of religions, or concept of inter-religious relations, currently exists.

It should be noted that while inter-faith relations had become a firmly established area of Anglican theological concern in the twenty-first century it is far from central. The concerns of the global Anglican Communion have moved from the imperative of dealing with inter-faith relations to other issues; for instance, internal squabbles over the question of sexuality. We can say, therefore, that the question of inter-faith relations remains for the tradition as a whole somewhat marginal. However, this does not mean that inter-faith relations are not contextually important. For some individual Anglican Churches across the Anglican Communion the issue has been, and remains, a matter of imperative importance. Moreover, for particular dioceses within the Communion it has great significance. For instance, the experience of religious diversity and therefore questions of inter-faith relations loom larger for Anglicans in many parts of the diocese of London than they do (on the whole) in the diocese of Winchester across large swathes of rural Hampshire. Again, in Singapore, Calcutta, Jerusalem, or Nairobi inter-faith relations and concerns are prominent. Further, we can say that the dearth of reflection noted in the mid to late twentieth century, compared at least to the nineteenth, is no

²¹ See Ray Gaston, 'Christian Responses to Islamophobia', in Paul Hedges (ed.), *Contemporary Muslim-Christian Encounters: Developments, Diversity and Dialogues* (London and New York, 2015), pp. 135–50.

longer evident in the twenty-first century, with both ecclesiastical institutions and major theologians and prelates devoting time and texts to the issue. To help exemplify some of these issues we will address more detailed cases studies in the final section. First, though, we will address theological developments.

THEOLOGICAL TRENDS: FULFILMENT AND OTHER PARADIGMS

If one theological position has dominated Anglican inter-faith thinking across the period from 1910 to the present it has been fulfilment theology. In essence, fulfilment theology takes the stance that non-Christian religions are paths ordained by God to lead their followers to Christianity. Much as the Hebrew prophets had historically been understood as pointing towards Christianity, it is argued that something similar applies to other religions. The term 'fulfilment theology' is based on Matthew 5:17: 'Think not that I have come to abolish the law and the prophets; I have come not to abolish them but to fulfil them.' Indeed, from the mid nineteenth to the late twentieth century, it can almost be spoken of as the normative and default Anglican inter-faith theological position, at least amongst those who do not veer to either exclusivist or pluralist positions.

In an early twentieth-century context where Christian leaders spoke of 'the evangelization of the world in this generation' we can say several things about what fulfilment theology revealed. First, it highlighted the colonial context for there was a belief that Christianity was wholly superior to, and would replace, all other religions; much as Western civilization, languages, etc. were seen to be superior to their non-Western counterparts. Second, despite this, it was mixed with a certain respect for the religions of the Other. The earlier missionary tactic of condemning the 'heathen' as demonic had proved ineffective. Also, it did not resonate with the complex and sophisticated cultures and philosophies encountered. Third, fulfilment theology was a pointer to some general trends, both in theology and society. It has been described as reflecting a liberal belief in progress and human goodness, ideas that many see as shattered by the First World War.²² It therefore reflected the late nineteenth- and early twentieth-century epoch when it flourished. (As a theological idea, fulfilment theology is much older and goes back in Anglican thought to at least the early nineteenth century, and was inspired by ancient figures such as Justin Martyr and the New Testament text.) Fourth, fulfilment theology was deeply patronizing. This returns to a theme picked up in our first point about

²² See Hedges, *Preparation and Fulfilment*.

the assumption of Western superiority, which reflects imperial power (military, economic, cultural) and a concomitant lack of respect for the non-Christian, or non-Westerner. As has been argued in Edward Said's well-known Orientalism thesis, and picked up by others, the 'oriental' was seen as childlike, feminine, or weak. As such, this tempers also our second point. The respect which existed was partial and always held in a balance with a sense of (religious, if not also cultural) superiority. We may note, though, that colonial arguments about the inferiority of non-Western races (as they were termed) were sometimes most vociferously criticized by Evangelical missionaries within the field who believed in the equality of all human beings (as capable of salvation), notwithstanding much complicity and shared mindsets between missionaries and the colonial powers.

The liberal theology that was influential in the fulfilment paradigm was dramatically challenged by Karl Barth's dialectical theology. In essence, whereas fulfilment theology saw the continuities between the non-Christian and Christian religions, dialectical theological approaches emphasized the differences. There was either Revelation or sinful human nature and its reflections (i.e. human religious traditions). No relation could exist between these two. In an ecumenical perspective we see this in changes in missionary thought about the non-Christian religions. The most notable work in this trend was Hendrik Kraemer's *The Christian Message in a Non-Christian World* (1937), while a follow-up ecumenical conference at Tambaram in India in 1938 largely adopted this dialectical stance.

In this context, I reiterate the point that while in the nineteenth century almost every major theologian, including influential bishops, wrote often at length on the non-Christian, the topic almost falls off the agenda during the first decades of the twentieth century; it would be hard to date exactly but by about the 1930s onwards it is unusual to find significant and lengthy Anglican theological reflections on the issue.

The fact that fewer British Anglicans were writing about inter-faith relations may also be traceable to another trend from the late nineteenth into the twentieth century: to move control of churches from Western priests and bishops to indigenous leaders. However, a number of significant individual theologians have engaged with inter-religious issues, particularly from around the 1960s, and it is worth noting one prominent late twentieth-century theologian, Maurice Wiles. Reflecting the broadly liberal theological trends that were dominant in his period, but also looking back to nineteenth-century liberal themes, he asked how engagement with the religious Other may affect Christianity:

May we perhaps look forward in the long run to the emergence of distinctively Buddhist or Islamic forms of Christian theology? By those terms I envisage forms of Christian theology in which insights central to Buddhism and

Islam—and only fully accessible and expressed within those faiths—will have been allowed to mould and modify Christian belief in a way which will illuminate and deepen aspects of belief implied but only perfectly realized in other forms of Christian theology.²³

Alongside Wiles, probably the most significant Anglican theologian in terms of the global discussion was Alan Race whose introduction of the typology of exclusivisms–inclusivisms–pluralisms in *Christians and Religious Pluralism* (1983) has helped shape the terms of the debate.²⁴ Briefly stated, the typology suggests that Christian attitudes to those of other religions fall into one of three broad paradigms: exclusivists claim only Christianity is true and therefore all other religions must be false; inclusivists claim that while Christianity is true, elements of that truth or partial glimpses are seen in other religions; pluralists claim that potentially many religions point to the same divine source. However, while individual theologians have been quite influential figures in academic discussions they have had little effect on Anglicanism at large.

Alongside fulfilment theology, an incarnational and sacramental theological approach to being alongside religious Others as a witness to the Christian faith has been seen as a typical Anglican approach.²⁵ Historically this looks to the theology of *Lux Mundi*, and C. F. Andrews who was a friend of Mohandas Gandhi in India may be seen as an early missionary exponent. However, it is not necessarily distinctively Anglican, and it draws also from Vatican II resources. A development of such theological tendencies can nevertheless be seen throughout this period and became established in official Anglican statements. Contrarily, there is also a strong Evangelical thrust which is often more conversion focused, and has certainly drawn from figures like Kraemer. Anglicanism has often veered between the poles of an incarnational and sacramental approach of being with, and living alongside, the religious Other, and a more confrontational and directly proselytizing stance.

The hegemonic forces of Western Christianity, through colonial and neo-colonial agencies, have tempered theological reflection across the global Communion. Very few, if any, writings from Anglican theologians, priests, or bishops based in the global South have affected the discourse beyond their local area. In two recent, general surveys of inter-faith relations in the Anglican Communion, one by Ian Markham, and the other by Clare Amos and Michael Igrave, the only Anglican figure from the global South referenced is

²³ Maurice Wiles, *Explorations in Christian Theology* 4 (London, 1979), p. 39.

²⁴ See Race, *Christians and Religious Pluralism*; Paul Hedges, *Controversies in Interreligious Dialogue* (London, 2010), pp. 17–30.

²⁵ See Richard Sudworth, 'The Church of England and Islam: Contemporary Anglican Christian-Muslim Relations and the Politico-Theological Question, 1988–2012', PhD thesis, Heythrop College, London, 2013.

Lakshman Wickremesinghe (discussed shortly), and the only other global South theologian mentioned is the Methodist S. Wesley Ariarajah. The most visible figures associated with the global South tend to be based within a Western context—Michael Nazir-Ali, the former bishop of Rochester in Britain and often seen as a spokesperson on relations with Islam, is one example. Others, such as the Hong Kong Anglican theologian Kwok Pui-Lan, who works in an American seminary, have little resonance amongst the global Anglican Communion outside of specific academic theological contexts. As such, while the agenda of inter-faith relations has been pushed by the global South in recent decades, what remains mainstream Anglican theological reflection still largely displays Western theological trends, a matter discussed further in the first case study.

CASE STUDIES

Anglican Relations with Buddhism in Sri Lanka

James Chapman, the first Anglican bishop of Colombo (1845–61), described Buddhism as a religion of darkness, while statues of the Buddha were ‘idols’ which stood in place of God.²⁶ One nineteenth-century Anglican missionary characterized Buddhism as a ‘path prescribing the extinction of passion, including compassion, in order to reach annihilation’, meaning he could ‘see only despair in Buddhism’ which gave, to his mind, ‘ample arguments in proof of the superiority of Christianity’.²⁷ By way of contrast, recent Sri Lankan bishops, especially Lakshman Wickremesinghe, bishop of Kurunegala 1962–83, and Kenneth Fernando, bishop of Colombo 1992–2001, were more positive about Buddhism, partly in seeking to establish the Anglican Church there along ‘indigenous’ lines.

Wickremesinghe has been ‘credited with moving towards a truly Sri Lankan Anglicanism from the very heart of the Anglican establishment as a bishop’.²⁸ After a first degree in political science at the University of Ceylon, he studied at Keble College, Oxford, before training to be a priest in the diocese of Ely. After ordination in 1952 he served in a parish in London before returning to Sri Lanka in 1958. When he was made a bishop in 1962 he was just thirty-five years old, and at that time the youngest bishop in the Anglican Communion. He maintained that a Christian theology in Asia needed to embed itself in the

²⁶ Elizabeth Harris, *Theravāda Buddhism and the British Encounter* (London, 2006), pp. 55, 54.

²⁷ Harris, *Theravāda Buddhism and the British Encounter*, p. 57.

²⁸ Marc Bilimoria, ‘Sri Lanka’, in Chapman, Clarke, and Percy (eds.), *Oxford Handbook of Anglican Studies*, p. 228.

local context, which involved making positive usage of indigenous religious ideas and categories. An example of this can be seen in a speech he delivered in Oxford in 1983:

Many years ago I left Oxford and England, and taking the advice of the Buddha, I went in search of myself as a Christian who was rooted in the Sri Lankan ethos... By the grace of God I have been able to find my identity as a Sri Lankan Christian, and in doing so, to share the company of those who have been seeking the Indian face of Christianity. The result has been what Clement envisaged for the Gnostic Christian—a more mature and authentic faith in Christ.²⁹

He even preached a sermon on All Saints' Day in Keble College, Oxford in 1982 which suggested that the litany of saints should be extended to include the Buddha and Gandhi. Wickremesinghe sought to integrate mainly Buddhist, but also Hindu, elements into an inculturated Christianity in Sri Lanka, and to develop more cordial relations between the different religious communities. Both Wickremesinghe and Fernando have also spoken of common social and ethical injunctions that exist between Buddhism and Christianity.

But the work to inculturate Sri Lankan Christianity has not just been top-down from bishops. Yohan Devananda, who was ordained as an Anglican priest after training at Cuddesdon College in England, having been born to affluent Sinhalese Christian parents in 1928, followed the example of mainly Catholic exemplars in India by establishing an ashram near the centre of Sri Lanka at Hevativela in 1957. Devananda developed excellent relationships with the monastic Sangha (the community of monks) through this project and his personal work. This was against a backdrop of considerable suspicion of the Christian Churches in that country, a feature of the aggressive mission from the colonial period and more recent Evangelical missions often perceived by the Buddhists as hostile.

While the ashram movement is often associated with elite forms of religion, grassroots Anglican engagement can be seen in figures such as Vijaya Vidyasagara. Vidyasagara is a lay Anglican who has argued the Eucharist should be open to all (including non-Christians), and was one of the founders of the ecumenical Christian Workers Fellowship (CWF) in 1958. Inspired in part by Marxist principles, it sought to directly engage ordinary Christians while also developing a distinctly Sri Lankan form of Christianity. The CWF's daily office was radical in the way it drew directly from Buddhism to help found an indigenous liturgy. In one paper the CWF discussed the way that the Buddhist

²⁹ Quoted by Tissa Jayatilaka, 'My Memories of the Rt. Revd. Lakshman Wickremesinghe (1927–1983)', *Colombo Telegraph* (23 Sept. 2013), <<https://www.colombotelegraph.com/index.php/my-memories-of-the-rt-revd-lakshman-wickremesinghe-1927-1983>> (last accessed 5 Aug. 2016).

and the more broadly Indic term 'dharma' could be used to translate 'Logos'.³⁰ While not an Anglican movement, the significant participation in the CWF of figures like Vidyasagara shows the involvement of lay Anglicans in inculturation in Sri Lanka.

This case study exemplifies a number of trends we noted earlier. One of them has been the transition from seeing other religions as religions of darkness to appreciative engagement, something found in Asia particularly. Another is that despite the move from Churches dominated by colonial masters to indigenous leaders, within mainstream theological discussion it is still 'Western' theological voices that are mostly heard; the growth of Christianity in the global South has not had much effect on perceptions of what counts as 'important' Christian reflection. For example, Wickremesinghe's work is not generally known outside of Sri Lanka, and when cited tends to be given as an example of contextual Sri Lankan theology. Another issue which we have not dealt with earlier, although it could be seen implicitly, is the difference sometimes noted between Asian Christians and Western Christians in their receptiveness to learning from religious Others. This has been more discussed in the Catholic rather than the Anglican tradition, but we see these Sri Lankan figures being very receptive to Buddhism. That should not be seen as the whole picture, though. Globally, at the end of the twentieth century and into the twenty-first there has been a rise of more Evangelical and Pentecostal trends. Across the global South the key thinkers cited for such approaches still tend to be Westerners, such as John Stott, rather than indigenous theologians or leaders. This is not just in Anglicanism; these moves are often, but not always, prone to less irenic encounters with the native religious traditions. While Sri Lanka is a case where positive relations with the indigenous religions, especially Buddhism, have often been endorsed, such willingness to learn from religious others, adapt the liturgy, and so forth is not seen, for instance, in places like Singapore. There, the author's own research suggests that a clear distinction between Christian and non-Christian is drawn such that, while harmonious living in a context of diversity is endorsed, theological rapprochement with the religious Other is not.

Anglican Relations with Islam in the Middle East

As noted earlier, Islam has had a long history of encounter with Anglicanism stretching back to at least the Elizabethan era. Nevertheless, as with discussion of almost all religious Others the debate was primarily about the mission field.

³⁰ Christian Workers Fellowship, 'For a Real Sri Lankan Church!' (Colombo: Christian Worker's Fellowship, 1984), <http://anglicanhistory.org/asia/lk/real_church1984.html> (last accessed 5 Aug. 2016).

In the twentieth century, discussion of Islam as part of the Abrahamic triad became integral in Christian reflection in this area, led by the Catholic example.³¹ When we reach the early twenty-first century world events have seen inter-religious relations with Islam taking centre stage in many discussions. But, before this, the relative proximity of the Muslim-majority world to the Christian-majority world has meant that Islam has also been in some senses more prominent in the Christian imagining than other religions. In the case of Anglicanism this is seen in the Prayer Books of 1549, 1552, and 1662, all of which in one of the Good Friday collects contain the words: 'Have mercy on all Jews, Turks, infidels, and heretics'. (For much of the last few centuries, and until fairly recently, Turk and Muslim were more or less interchangeable terms.) This shows us that they were singled out as a particular type of 'infidel'.

As with the relationship with other religions, it was predominantly missionaries in Muslim lands who led the way in interpretation, and in the early twentieth century the most significant of these for the Anglican Church was Temple Gairdner. Indeed, it was through him and the Church Missionary Society that Islam was presented at the Edinburgh Missionary Conference in 1910. In both the nineteenth and twentieth centuries Islam proved a particular problem and issue for Christian missionaries and thinkers. This was both theological and political, although the two were intimately combined. Theologically, the fulfilment paradigm clearly did not work for Islam. Many religions (e.g. Buddhism, Hinduism, Confucianism) predated Christianity and so the analogue with Judaism as precursors ordained to be fulfilled made sense. Islam, on the contrary, not only came afterwards, but also seemed to explicitly reject Christianity. In the Qur'an and *hadith* it is asserted that Jesus was not God's son but only human, and Jesus was fitted into the Islamic tradition as a prophet. Meanwhile, in many parts of the world, especially Africa and South Asia, Islam was resurgent and until the collapse of the Ottoman Empire at the end of the First World War it existed as a political, military, and existential threat to the imagined Christendom of Europe.

Consequently, Christian writings on Islam often reflected this tension, resulting in over a thousand years of rhetoric and diatribe: starting from the early days of Islam, continuing through the crusades and with reformers like Luther, and also marked by the perceived threat to Christian Europe posed by the Ottomans. Indeed, Professor Douglas Pratt has suggested that one of the last crusades was the invasion of what could be seen as the Christian army on the beaches of the Dardanelles in 1915. More recent wars in places like Afghanistan and Iraq have also been viewed as continuing 'crusades' by many within the Muslim world. Certainly, the perception of centuries of

³¹ Clare Amos, 'Vatican and World Council of Churches Initiatives: Weaving Interreligious Threads on Ecumenical Looms', in Hedges (ed.), *Contemporary Muslim-Christian Encounters*, pp. 185–200.

Western/Christian aggression remains an aspect of the Islamic understanding when it relates to Anglicanism or other Christian traditions; just as many Westerners, and some Christians elsewhere, have a perception of Islamic aggression, while the Elizabethan flirtation with Ottoman Islam has been lost to the historical memory. All of this ideological baggage is part and parcel of understanding the history of twentieth-century Anglican relations with Islam. It is worth noting that the dynamics of the encounter vary very much from place to place, and that the history of Christian presence in Muslim-majority lands for centuries is a part of the story that is often ignored.³²

By far the most influential figure in the Anglican encounter with Islam in the late twentieth and early twenty-first centuries has been Kenneth Cragg, who has been seen as an Anglican version of the Catholic Islamist scholar Louis Massignon (1883–1962). Born in 1913, Cragg was a ‘missionary-scholar’ who helped in both what has been termed the ‘Arabization of the Jerusalem archbishopric’, as well as in forming Anglican inter-faith relations both generally and in relation to Islam specifically.³³

A large part of Cragg’s influence came through his writings, and his 1956 and 1959 books *The Call of the Minaret* and *Sandals at the Mosque: Christian Presence Amid Islam* are perhaps the most influential of them all. The former has subsequently been enlarged and expanded (1986) and remains in print. The latter was part of a famous series of books edited by Max Warren entitled ‘Christian Presence’.³⁴ Both books, as well as the ‘Christian Presence’ series as a whole, sought to give an empathetic and respectful account of the religious Other. Being amongst the best-known English language introductions to Islam, and readily available, they helped set the tone for British and Anglican reflection on Islam in the late twentieth century, at least for those with no first-hand experience of the religion.

As well as being a scholar—he held a professorship in Arabic and Islamics at Hartford Seminary, Connecticut, USA, and was a Reader in Religious Studies at Sussex University—Cragg was both a missionary and a bishop. Ordained in 1936 he served in Lebanon as part of the British Syria Mission during the Second World War and returned to the Middle East in the 1950s doing missionary work, especially in association with St George’s Cathedral in Jerusalem, before being appointed as assistant bishop of Jerusalem in 1970.

³² See Sidney H. Griffith, *The Church in the Shadow of the Mosque: Christians and Muslims in the World of Islam* (Princeton and Oxford, 2008).

³³ See Richard Sudworth, ‘Hospitality and Embassy: The Persistent Influence of Kenneth Cragg on Anglican Theologies of Interfaith Relations’, *Anglican Theological Review*, 96 (2014): 73–89; Hugh Goddard, ‘The Significance of *The Call of the Minaret* for Christian Thinking about Islam’, in Thomas David and Clare Amos (eds.), *A Faithful Presence: Essays for Kenneth Cragg* (London, 2003), pp. 78–94.

³⁴ J. N. K. Mugambi, ‘Missionary Presence in Interreligious Encounters and Relationships’, *Studies in World Christianity*, 19 (2013): 162–86.

He was given oversight of Egypt, staying there until 1973 when an Egyptian bishop was appointed. During the 1970s the Anglican Church in that region was reorganized as an autonomous province with a number of dioceses. Cragg was responsible in this development both for helping shape good relations with the Muslim community, and seeking to ensure that local bishops were in place. We can place this in a context where Arab Christians, especially Anglican Protestants, were often equated by local Muslims in Palestine with the colonial powers, so that it was noted in 1936 that 'A popular word for Protestant Christians is "Inglesi" [English]'.³⁵ On a more international front, Cragg was one of the representatives of the WCC consultation in 1967 on 'Living Faiths', where he was an important voice alongside other Protestant, Orthodox, and Catholic contributors. As such, his influence extends both through much of the global South as well as the Middle East and the West, especially through such ecumenical ventures.

At the end of the twentieth and into the twenty-first century, Anglican theologians have been part of some significant moves in inter-faith relations between Christianity and Islam. One of these is the tradition known as Scriptural Reasoning which seeks to bring together scholars, primarily from the three Abrahamic traditions, to closely read their Scriptures together, looking at ways that such reading can lead to new perspectives, as well as helping to understand the very different reading traditions involved. This began in the mid-1990s when some Christian scholars sat in at American Academy of Religion Conference meetings, on Jewish rabbinic text-reading sessions known as Textual Reasoning, which commenced in the early 1990s. The Christians suggested extending it to an inter-faith context and with the inclusion of Islamic scholars it became known as Scriptural Reasoning. Especially associated with Cambridge University, it has been noted that one of the most important texts in its early stages (*The Promise of Scriptural Reasoning*, 2006) brought together six Anglicans out of thirteen contributors, alongside three Jews and two Muslims. It is debatable to what extent it is a specifically Anglican practice or has any Anglican ethos; yet, the prominence of Anglican theologians in its genesis is significant.³⁶

The other strand of Anglican-Islam engagement is a more institutional one, which is the Building Bridges Seminar Series.³⁷ Established by George Carey

³⁵ Laura Robson, 'Church versus Country: Palestinian Arab Episcopalians, Nationalism, and Revolt, 1936-39', in Heather Sharkey (ed.), *Cultural Conversions: Unexpected Consequences of Christian Missionary Encounters in the Middle East, Africa, and South Asia* (Syracuse, NY, 2013), pp. 49-66 (p. 63), citing CMS Palestine Mission Report on Moslem Evangelism, conference 1936, CMS, G2/P/2.

³⁶ See David Ford, 'Scriptural Reasoning: Its Anglican Origins, Development, Practice and Significance', *Journal of Anglican Studies*, 11 (2013): 147-65.

³⁷ See Pratt, 'From Edinburgh to Georgetown'; Douglas Pratt, 'Initiative and Response: The Future of Muslim-Christian Dialogue', in Hedges (ed.), *Contemporary Muslim-Christian*

during his time as archbishop of Canterbury, it was also strongly advocated and supported by Archbishop Rowan Williams. The Seminar Series has been an annual event since 2002, where Christian and Muslim scholars have met for three days to discuss a theological topic. The venues have crossed from Christian-majority to Muslim-majority nations. It has always involved an ecumenical selection of Christian scholars and so is not distinctively Anglican, but it has its origins within Anglicanism, although for practical reasons is now mainly detached from its ecclesial roots. Nevertheless, it is an important part of the recent history of inter-faith relations between the Anglican tradition and the Islamic tradition.

CONCLUSION

Anglican inter-faith relations have changed dramatically since 1910. The period began with a sense of Christian supremacy and a belief in the evangelization of the world in this generation. It was a context of empire and mission. Today, dialogue tends to take precedence over mission, at least in official statements, while inter-faith relations has become a core issue in the Anglican Communion; although dialogue and mission remain related in official structures. For many Churches in the global South the concern has been a post-colonial context where relations with an often dominant non-Christian religious culture shape their context. For Anglicanism in Britain it has changed from a situation of mission fields to an encounter with neighbours. Schemes like 'Presence and Engagement' in 2005 and 'Near Neighbours' in 2011 make this clear. Some continuity can be seen over the past century in theological themes such as 'engagement' with the 'Living Faiths' of others, and especially in catchwords like 'presence' (whether this be the 'Christian Presence' book series or 'Presence and Engagement'). Also, both irenic and incarnationalist approaches and more confrontational and evangelical approaches have often coexisted in different strands of the Church. The current emphasis, at least from the institutional Church, while stressing dialogue and harmonious relations, still places an imperative on mission and confession as an important part of the relationship with religious Others. Yet, to aggressively proselytize is not generally seen as Anglicanism's contemporary way, and terms such as 'witness' and 'presence' may more be useful to give a sense of the way that mission is approached. However, among Anglicans, there is much difference in both local and individual emphasis.

Importantly, throughout the whole period we have not been able to isolate Anglican inter-faith relations from a wider ecumenical context. However, it would be wrong to see Anglican approaches in this area as derivative and lagging behind. While this is certainly the case with the institutional documents of, for instance, the Lambeth Conferences, Anglican theologians have often been key figures in shaping debates and discussions. We have noted the particular role of Kenneth Cragg, alongside many other missionaries, bishops, and scholars who have been part of deliberations which have shaped both Anglican and ecumenical stances globally. The historical trajectory, while generally moving from mission to dialogue, and with the centre of power (in numbers if not theological prestige) shifting from Britain to the global South, has not been one of clear progression, and very different outlooks prevail in particular contexts.

SELECT BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Amos, Clare and Michael Ipgrave, 'An Untidy Generosity: Anglicans and the Challenge of Other Religions', in Mark Chapman, Sathianathan Clarke, and Martyn Percy (eds.), *The Oxford Handbook of Anglican Studies* (Oxford, 2016), pp. 427–47.
- Bilimoria, Marc, 'Sri Lanka', in Mark Chapman, Sathianathan Clarke, and Martyn Percy (eds.), *The Oxford Handbook of Anglican Studies* (Oxford, 2016), pp. 205–18.
- Board of Church Commissioners [Kenneth Cragg and David Brown], *Towards a Theology of Interfaith Dialogue* (London, 1984).
- Cragg, Kenneth, *The Call of the Minaret* (London, 2001).
- Davison, Helen, 'The Church of England's Response to Religious Pluralism'. <http://www.anglicanism.org/admin/docs/davison_bio_abstract_web.pdf> (last accessed 8 Oct. 2015).
- Ford, David, 'Scriptural Reasoning: Its Anglican Origins, Development, Practice and Significance', *Journal of Anglican Studies*, 11 (2013): 147–65.
- Gaston, Ray, 'Christian Responses to Islamophobia', in Paul Hedges (ed.), *Contemporary Muslim-Christian Encounters: Developments, Diversity and Dialogues* (London and New York, 2015), pp. 135–50.
- Goddard, Hugh, 'The Significance of *The Call of the Minaret* for Christian Thinking about Islam', in Thomas David and Clare Amos (eds.), *A Faithful Presence: Essays for Kenneth Cragg* (London, 2003), pp. 78–94.
- Hedges, Paul, 'Architecture, Inculturation and Christian Mission: The Buildings of the Cambridge Mission to Delhi, and Their Meaning for the Church Today', *International Review of Mission*, 89 (2002): 180–9.
- Hedges, Paul, *Controversies in Interreligious Dialogue and the Theology of Religions* (London, 2010).
- Hedges, Paul, *Preparation and Fulfilment: A History and Study of Fulfilment Theology in Modern British Thought in the Indian Context* (Bern, 2001).

- Iprgrave, Michael, 'Remembering the Covenant: Judaism in an Anglican Theology of Interfaith Relations', *Anglican Theological Review*, 96 (2013): 39–55.
- Iprgrave, Michael (ed.), *The Road Ahead: A Christian–Muslim Dialogue* (London, 2002).
- Knight, Sydney, 'Lakshman Wikremesinghe (1927–1983)', *Sri Lanka Journal of Theological Reflection*, 3 (2007): 117–21.
- Kuin, T. H. N., 'Perfect Partners or Uneasy Bedfellows? Anglicans and Religious Pluralism in the Late 20th Century', *Studies in Interreligious Dialogue*, 7 (1997): 177–99.
- Mosher, Lucinda, 'The Episcopal Church Religious Manyness: Steps Toward a Theology', *Anglican Theological Review*, 96 (2014): 57–72.
- Pratt, Douglas, *The Church and Other Faiths: The World Council of Churches, the Vatican, and Interreligious Dialogue* (Bern, 2010).
- Pratt, Douglas, 'From Edinburgh to Georgetown: Anglican Interfaith Bridge-Building', *Anglican Theological Review*, 96 (2014): 15–37.
- Race, Alan, *Christians and Religious Pluralism: Patterns in the Christian Theology of Religions* (London, 1983).
- Robson, Laura, 'Church versus Country: Palestinian Arab Episcopalians, Nationalism, and Revolt, 1936–39', in Heather Sharkey (ed.), *Cultural Conversions: Unexpected Consequences of Christian Missionary Encounters in the Middle East, Africa, and South Asia* (Syracuse, NY, 2013), pp. 49–66.
- Sudworth, Richard, 'The Church of England and Islam: Contemporary Anglican Christian–Muslim Relations and the Politico-Theological Question, 1988–2012', PhD thesis, Heythrop College, London 2013. <<http://www.heythrop.ac.uk/sites/default/files/docs/publications/theses/Sudworth,%20R,%20Final%20Thesis.pdf>>.
- Thomas, David and Clare Amos (eds.), *A Faithful Presence: Essays for Kenneth Cragg* (London, 2003).
- Wickremesinghe, Lakshman, 'Living Faiths in Dialogue', *International Review of Mission*, 68 (1979): 385–93.

Latin American Anglicanism in the Twentieth Century

John L. Kater

HISTORICAL BACKGROUND

At the dawn of the twentieth century, Anglican Christianity was already established in many parts of Latin America. In most cases, its presence was directly related to British and American efforts to establish and develop an economic presence in the region. For most of its history, Latin American Anglicanism has evolved in dialogue with, and opposition to, the Spanish and Portuguese domination of Latin America and the Roman Catholicism which was an integral part of that hegemony.

As early as 1742 a lay missionary of the Society for the Propagation of the Gospel arrived on the Atlantic coast of Nicaragua, accompanied by thirty British soldiers intent on turning the Miskito people against the Spanish. Missionary activity was erratic until the nineteenth century, when large numbers of English settlers as well as slaves, ex-slaves, and mixed-race descendants of African and native peoples from British possessions in the West Indies began settling along the Atlantic coast of Central America. By the turn of the century, a number of chaplaincies dotted the Atlantic coast from Honduras to Panama, overseen by the bishop of British Honduras, whose see was established in 1883. In Panama, the American firm which responded to the California gold rush by building a railroad across the isthmus with the labour of thousands of West Indian workers built a church and paid for an American Episcopal priest to serve as its chaplain, but like so many of the early Anglican clergy in the region, he soon succumbed to yellow fever. The arrival of additional West Indian workers to build a canal prompted the arrival of two English missionaries, and Anglican ministry passed to the oversight of the bishop of Jamaica. In 1896, an ecumenical Protestant congregation based in the European business community of San José, Costa Rica, requested oversight

by the Anglican bishop of British Honduras but continued to function as an independent congregation for decades.

In South America, a British chaplaincy was established in Rio de Janeiro, Brazil, in 1818 and in 1825 a church was built in Buenos Aires, Argentina. These initiatives were followed by similar ministries in several cities in Chile and Brazil. In some cases, the existence of the chaplaincies depended upon formal agreements with local governments in which Anglicans promised to refrain from ministry to any native citizens; a number of other restrictions, such as the denial of *personería jurídica* (legal identity) and the prohibition of steeples and other architectural indications of the presence of a place of worship were common in many parts of Latin America. In 1869, the diocese of the Falkland Islands (known in Latin America as the Malvinas) was established to exercise ecclesiastical authority over the chaplaincies scattered throughout the continent.

Alone among the Anglican Churches of Latin America, the origins of Mexican Anglicanism are to be found in its own culture, dating to a movement with both religious and political dimensions supporting the secular constitution of 1857 which resulted in an autonomous *Iglesia de Jesús* composed of dissident Roman Catholic clergy and laity who sought an autonomous Mexican Catholic Church. The Church was supported financially by a group of interested laypeople in the diocese of New York, but by century's end mismanagement, financial problems, and continued local persecution had reduced the Church to a fraction of its earlier size.

At the beginning of the twentieth century, one flourishing missionary project undertaken by Anglican Evangelicals was already well established in the continent's southernmost reaches. Its roots lie in a failed effort by Robert FitzRoy, commander of the expedition of the *Beagle* on which Charles Darwin was a noteworthy passenger, to convert the tribes of hunters and gatherers with whom he came in contact in Tierra del Fuego. However, it came to fruition only after Allan Gardiner, a Royal Navy captain, established the 'Patagonian Mission' and died, along with six other lay missionaries, in the same area in 1851. Their deaths awoke interest in their venture among Evangelicals in the Church of England, and the South American Missionary Society (SAMS), in which Gardiner's son was an active participant, received official recognition when the first bishop of the Falklands was consecrated in 1869. By the turn of the century, the society had established a base among English residents in Chile, Peru, Brazil, Uruguay, and Argentina, as well as dispensaries, churches, and schools for the Mapuche and Araucanian peoples of southern Chile and initial contact with the peoples of the Chaco region of Paraguay. In 1910, the Church of England established the diocese of Argentina and Eastern South America with the Falkland Islands and the diocese of the Western Republics (Chile, Bolivia, and Peru), both of them independent of SAMS but working closely with its missionaries and with the society's financial support.

Three dioceses around the Caribbean Sea were set apart from their Spanish-speaking neighbours by language and culture: Haiti, the French-speaking nation which shares the island of Hispaniola with the Dominican Republic, and the English-speaking dioceses of Guyana (formerly British Guiana) and Belize (formerly British Honduras). The Episcopal Church's first black bishop, James Theodore Holly, founded an independent Anglican Church in Haiti in the 1860s, which entered a concordat relationship with the Episcopal Church in 1874 and became a missionary district of the Episcopal Church in 1913. Guyana became a diocese in 1842, while British Honduras was established in 1883; today both form part of the Church in the Province of the West Indies. Guyana has had little contact with its neighbours, but the diocese of British Honduras had jurisdiction over the northern part of South America until 1908 and over Central America until 1947, when the last of its extra-territorial responsibilities were ceded to the Episcopal Church in the United States.

A number of disparate events around the turn of the twentieth century proved to have permanent effects on the growth of Anglican Christianity throughout Latin America.

In 1890, Lucien Lee Kinsolving and James Watson Morris, two recent graduates of Virginia Theological Seminary, at the time a bastion of American Evangelical Anglicanism, established an Episcopal mission in Porto Alegre, Brazil. Unlike the English chaplaincies which limited their ministry to expatriates, the mission in Porto Alegre was intended to offer Brazilian Christians a clear alternative to Roman Catholicism. In its early decades, Anglican worship in Brazil consisted primarily of services of the word or evangelistic services with hymns, testimony, and preaching, often conducted without vestments, in spaces unadorned with crosses or altars. Kinsolving was consecrated the first Episcopal bishop of Brazil early in the century.

In 1898, the United States fought and defeated Spain and occupied the islands of Cuba and Puerto Rico. The Episcopal Church considered that both islands were potential areas for missionary activity which would provide an alternative to Roman Catholicism and also incorporate the population of both islands into American culture. American influence on the island of Cuba had begun well before the conquest, and the occupation made possible the expansion of the Church's work. Episcopal Church ministry in Puerto Rico was designed to counteract what was considered the deleterious effect not only of centuries of Roman Catholicism, but of a languid climate that did not induce the energetic activism which marked much of the Episcopal Church's life at the beginning of the century.

In 1901 the Episcopal Church's Board of Managers took the ministry of the Church in Mexico directly under its care, and in 1904 the General Convention established the Missionary District of Mexico to provide oversight for the English congregations in Mexico and elected Henry Aves as its first bishop. Two years later, the synod of the *Iglesia de Jesús* asked Aves to receive the

struggling Church into his diocese. The clergy, laypeople, and congregations of the Church accepted the doctrine, discipline, and worship of the Episcopal Church and were given full voice and vote in the Missionary District of Mexico.

The broad contours of Latin American Anglicanism as they appear at the beginning of the twentieth century continued to prevail for the next five decades and more. Chaplaincies overseen and financed by the Church of England and its missionary organizations provided ministry for expatriate English-speaking Anglicans with little reference to the local context. Racist and paternalist attitudes persisted among those supporting and, in many cases, those carrying out Anglican mission.

SAMS continued the expansion of its missionary work among the native peoples of South America's 'Southern Cone', adding not only churches but rural stations, hospitals, and agricultural-industrial schools. Its ministry, like that of Anglican mission among many indigenous peoples, was directed primarily towards the local chiefs and the education of their children, as well as efforts to make the Scriptures available in the native languages.

In 1903 support from a United States government intent on attempting a canal across the isthmus of Panama allowed local leaders to win their independence from Colombia, and to approve a treaty giving the American government control of a ten-mile swathe of land extending from the Atlantic to the Pacific and dividing the country in two. The construction of the canal was undertaken by a small army of West Indian labourers, and the Church of England ceded responsibility for their spiritual care to the Episcopal Church. Voluntarily limiting itself to English-speaking West Indian labourers and American managers, the Church accepted the rigid racial segregation of the Canal Zone and established a chain of white and black congregations stretching from Colón on the Atlantic to Panama City on the Pacific. In 1919, the Episcopal Church established the Missionary District of the Panama Canal Zone, and assigned its bishop responsibility for Anglicans in Panama, Colombia, Costa Rica, and Nicaragua.

While the Anglicanism of Latin America at the turn of the century was overwhelmingly Evangelical, it was inevitable that eventually tensions between Evangelicals and Anglo-Catholics would find their way to the region. In 1916, Protestants from throughout Latin America met together for the first time in Panama for a 'Congress on Christian Work in Latin America'. The question of the participation of Episcopal missionaries in this Congress of Panama became an important point of contention. While the Episcopal Church's Board of Missions approved support of the congress, other Episcopalians protested that the congress would increase conflict with the government of Panama and threaten conversations with the Roman Catholics and Orthodox. But while some Anglicans attempted to differentiate themselves from the Protestant Churches struggling to gain a foothold in Latin America, there is

no doubt that they benefited from the opening provided by the deepening rift between the Roman Catholic Church and advocates of the so-called 'liberal state', for whom religious freedom was considered indispensable to stifle the Roman Catholic opposition to modernization.

In 1923, João Yasoji Ito, a seminary-trained lay missionary from the Nippon Seikokai ('Holy Catholic [Anglican] Church of Japan') arrived in Brazil to offer pastoral care to Anglican and other Christian settlers who had emigrated to Brazil in large numbers. He established a Japanese mission in São Paulo, and several years later was ordained by Bishop Kinsolving. Ito's ministry flourished and as a result people of Japanese ancestry have always comprised a significant percentage of the diocese of São Paulo and two of its bishops were of Japanese descent.

The Second World War and its aftermath had a deep and permanent effect on the practice of Anglican ministry and mission around the world. Issues of colonialism and opposition to its assumptions had already been loudly voiced in Asia and Africa; now they found a ready audience in other parts of the world as well. The anti-apartheid movement in South Africa and the civil rights movement in the United States struck a responsive chord among other racial and ethnic minorities.

The right to express Christian faith in ways congruent with a people's values and culture was a principle enshrined in the Thirty-Nine Articles and invoked in defending the right of the Church of England to declare its independence from Rome in the sixteenth century. The same principle had permitted Anglicans in the newly independent United States to shape the polity and worship of the Episcopal Church to meet the realities of the new nation. A similar commitment to the principle of autonomy based on the realities of place and time shaped the practice of Anglicanism wherever large numbers of English settlers established the Church in a new setting. This principle was enshrined in the resolutions of the Lambeth Conference of 1930, which defined the 'true constitution of the Catholic Church' as based on 'the autonomy of particular churches based upon a common faith and order'. The Anglican Communion, it declared, consists of 'particular or national Churches', which 'promote within each of their territories a national expression of Christian faith'.¹ But Anglicanism in its colonial and missionary contexts had rarely given more than lip service to the principle. Now, as British and American colonies were gaining their independence and formerly colonial Churches were claiming their autonomy, the principle achieved new importance in Latin America as elsewhere.

¹ The Lambeth Conference 1930, Resolutions 48 and 49. <<http://www.lambethconference.org/resolutions/1930/1930-49.cfm>> (accessed 11 Dec. 2013).

THE RISE OF LATIN AMERICAN ANGLICANISM

Contemporary Latin American Anglicanism can be said to have been born—or re-born—in the aftermath of the deliberations of the Lambeth Conference of 1958. ‘So far as the Anglican Communion is concerned’, that conference affirmed, South America is “the neglected continent”, while it is equally a continent of increasing importance in the world today’. South America, it noted, ‘offers a challenge and opportunity to the Anglican Communion as a great field for evangelistic work. There is no reason why it should not strengthen and extend its work on the continent. There is every reason why it should assume larger responsibilities there.’² This decision represents an important shift from earlier reticence on the part of many Anglicans to evangelize actively among nominally Roman Catholic peoples. It was based in part on the awareness that rapid population growth throughout the region had rendered it impossible for the Roman Catholic Church to minister adequately, as well as the belief that its more ‘reasoned’ approach to Christian faith would appeal to a rapidly growing educated middle class.

In response to the Lambeth Conference’s mandate, Bishop Stephen Bayne, executive officer of the Anglican Communion, commissioned a study of the region by Columbia University’s Bureau of Applied Research. The study was followed by a consultation that took place in Cuernavaca, Mexico, in January 1963 which brought together the archbishop of York and the primates of the Episcopal Church and the Anglican Church of Canada, seven bishops from Latin America, and a number of representatives from churches and missionary organizations with special concern for the Church’s mission. The consultation’s report set out a number of objectives for the future development of Anglican mission and ministry in the region. All of them were in the service of its primary objective, which was ‘the development of Latin American churches, expressive of the genius of their own countries and of the unity of the Anglican Communion, and ministering alike to the needs of their societies and the wide brotherhood of the world community’. Towards meeting this objective, the Consultation urged ‘the provision of a first-quality program of theological education’, ‘the development of strong local congregations’, and ‘the encouragement of local and regional initiative and responsibility’. Its report also noted the importance of dioceses of manageable size, regional planning, and coordination, ‘secondary, normal school and university enterprises’, and the strategic role of laypeople in the expansion of the Church in Latin America. More specific recommendations proposed significant changes to the structural organization of Anglican churches in the region, the establishment of the authority of Brazilian bishops over the British chaplaincies in

² ‘The Lambeth Conference 1958’, 2.68–2.73. Cited in *The Anglican Communion and Latin America* (Province of the Caribbean of the Episcopal Church in the USA, undated), p. 1.

that country, and support for the efforts of the Anglican Church in Brazil to achieve autonomy. Finally, it urged that Anglican ministry be carried out with an eye to ecumenical relationships with other Churches, including, where possible, the Roman Catholic Church.³

Doubtless this fresh and comprehensive approach to Anglican ministry in Latin America also reflected the perception of changes effected by the Second Vatican Council, which met from 1962 to 1965. That council not only held out the possibility of more fruitful relationships with other Churches; it also provided the theological impetus for clergy and lay leaders in Latin America and elsewhere to take seriously the needs and demands of their own context. This impetus bore fruit in the watershed conference of the Roman Catholic bishops of Latin America in Medellín, Colombia, in 1968, which furthered the development of 'liberation theology' and endorsed 'basic Christian communities' (*comunidades eclesiales de base*), grassroots gatherings of poor lay-people organizing to address local issues of poverty and oppression.

Liberation theology was a response to the rapid social changes affecting Latin America in the period following the Second World War. It affirmed a 'preferential option for the poor' and the reclaiming of the 'reign of God' as a concept demanding economic justice and the satisfaction of the needs of the poor as a fundamental aspect of the Christian understanding of salvation. Throughout the region, rapid urbanization and mass poverty led many to seek social change through political movements, some of them violent, and often inspired by the successful Cuban Revolution led by Fidel Castro and by a Marxist interpretation of history and economics. Political polarization was reflected by deep divisions within the Churches of Latin America, as many clergy and local religious leaders sympathized with those struggling to end the injustice and oppression of everyday life. In country after country governments responded with military force and the establishment of dictatorial regimes. The subsequent development of Latin American Anglicanism took place against the backdrop of these strong passions in favour of justice for the poor and an end to oppressive regimes, often centred in the very universities which had been identified as an important arena for Anglican mission and in settings where military rule impeded personal freedoms and human rights.

Many Latin American Anglicans observed that the situation of the continent in the second half of the century called for a new examination of Anglican identity. The late Jaci Maraschin, a Brazilian Anglican theologian, argued in the 1980s that '[such] considerations bring us to the question of belonging to the place, the time, the history and culture... the most fundamental question of contextualization. The question of belonging to the place has been turned into

³ 'The Lambeth Conference 1958', pp. 4-10.

an important theme and has been one of the urgent matters of the current Anglican debate about mission.⁴

Viewed from the perspective of a growing desire to affirm the principle of self-determination that fuelled the struggle to end colonialism in settings around the world, it was inevitable that the issue of autonomy and the inherent right to a contextual expression of Christian faith should have dominated Latin American Anglicanism in the last decades of the twentieth century. Given the history of the process by which Anglican Christianity had become a global Communion and the role of colonialism and imperialism in that process, it was also inevitable that such issues would raise questions about Anglican identity—nowhere with more persistence than in the context of Latin America.

The first of the Churches in the region to gain independence was the Igreja Episcopal Anglicana do Brasil, which achieved autonomy in 1965. (Financial independence—and with it an ongoing struggle to support its ministries and the Church's future growth—came only in 1980.)⁵ Brazilian Anglican voices argued that true autonomy exists only when a Church is truly incarnate in its own context. It must be deeply and actively engaged in the political and social reality in which its people live and struggle; it must develop its own hermeneutic for reading the Bible; its worship must make use of liturgical forms that make it possible for its people to see themselves in the words, actions, and music of worship, perhaps drawing on popular musical expression and making use of the instruments associated with a people's culture; its pastoral ministry must reflect the style and nature of relationships that are rooted in the people's own experience; and it must be free to develop its own theology.⁶

An important part of the emergence of an Anglicanism genuinely rooted in the region depended on increasing the possibilities of communication and cooperation across geographical and ecclesiological boundaries. The initial meeting held in Cuernavaca in 1963 was followed by another consultation five years later, with several ecumenical observers in attendance. That group, which represented not the Churches of Latin America but those Churches of the Anglican Communion that in one way or another supported the missionary expansion of Anglican Christianity throughout the region, understood the primary priority as participation in Christ's own mission to the enormous numbers of people across Latin America who were either unchurched or, for whatever reason, no longer actively participated in the life of the Church.

⁴ Jaci C. Maraschin, 'Liturgy and Latin American Anglicanism', in John L. Kater (ed.), *We Are Anglicans: Essays on Latin American Anglicanism* (Panama, 1989), p. 35.

⁵ 'The Centenary of the Episcopal Church of Brazil', *Anglican Information* (Anglican Consultative Council, March 1990), pp. 1, 4.

⁶ Jaci Maraschin, 'Características de una iglesia indígena' ('Characteristics of an Indigenous Church'), *Anglicanos* (January–March 1985), pp. 10–11; Maraschin, 'Liturgy and Latin American Anglicanism', p. 37.

The consultation report noted that mission might involve different strategies depending on context, but 'on no account must it seem a colony of North America or Europe'. It also recognized the limitations of the liturgies currently being used and encouraged the development of 'radically new and freer forms'. Its participants looked towards the decreasing influence of foreign missionaries and the emergence of new, flexible, and creative forms of ministry by both clergy and laypeople; indeed, their report might be seen as a pioneering document in the awareness of the significance of shaping Church structures to immediate needs rather than copying inherited traditions. In 1968 the Anglican bishops of the region addressed a 'Letter to the Archbishop and Bishop of the Anglican Communion' in which they proposed the ultimate goal of an indigenous Church in each nation of the region, priority to be given to urban evangelism, a special emphasis on ministry in institutions of higher education, and ecumenical witness.⁷

In 1961, the 'Seminario Episcopal del Caribe', which depended heavily on North American models of theological education, was established to provide training for a new generation of Latin American clergy. In 1964, the General Convention of the Episcopal Church established its Province IX, comprising the dioceses of Mexico, Central America, Panama, Colombia, the Dominican Republic, and Puerto Rico. Over the next decade, Costa Rica and Puerto Rico were given autonomy as was the Missionary District of Cuba, released from its membership in the American Episcopal Church in order to avoid difficulties resulting from the conflict between the two countries. A *Centro de Publicaciones* located in San José, Costa Rica published a translation of Stephen Neill's book *Anglicanism* and several other studies of Anglican Christianity, and locally based theological education programmes for training clergy proliferated. These included diocesan tutorial programmes, as well as more formally established centres that attempted to offer instruction similar to the curriculum of a theological seminary. By 1972, members of the Episcopal Church's Province IX had indicated their intention to form an autonomous Church.

Under the continued oversight of missionaries of SAMS, including some from its Australian chapter, the Churches in the continent's 'Southern Cone' had continued to develop a network of missions serving the tribal peoples of the region, and the two dioceses established in the region had grown to six. By 1967, there were ninety-six missionaries at work, and the diocese of Chile established a *Centro Anglicano* in Santiago and for the first time began active evangelism among the urban population of the country. The society took over St Paul's English School in Viña del Mar and began a weekly radio programme. An extensive 'Bible Correspondence Course' was initiated, suburban ministries were begun in several cities, and ministry in both English and

⁷ *The Anglican Communion and Latin America*, pp. 11–20; 'Resolution'.

Spanish was begun in Asunción, Paraguay's capital. In Argentina, missionaries shifted their emphasis to the training and supervision of local evangelists.⁸ In 1983, the Anglican Church of the Southern Cone, comprising churches in Peru, Bolivia, Chile, Paraguay, Uruguay, and Argentina, received its autonomy. The extreme Evangelical heritage of the region had resulted in a Church distinct in theology, structure, and practice from other forms of Latin American Anglicanism. Aside from one Paraguayan assistant bishop soon removed from office, all the bishops were English-born or of English ancestry.⁹

While the diocese of Chile has its own Prayer Book, which includes a lengthy service of exorcism, most Anglican worship in the Southern Cone has more in common with the Free Church tradition than with translations of the American Book of Common Prayer used in other parts of Latin America. In many places, there has been a concerted effort to eliminate any trappings associated with Roman Catholicism such as crosses, images, and pictures of saints, from Anglican spiritual practice.

While the precipitous growth of Pentecostal Christianity across Latin America has been one of the most significant aspects of the religious history of the region in the second half of the century, it has had limited impact on Anglican worship and spirituality in most areas. The exception is the Church of the Southern Cone, where a strong Evangelical influence that nurtured close contact with other non-Roman Catholic churches and a preference for non-traditional Anglican worship has provided an opening for a more charismatic spirituality, especially among the native peoples of Chile and elsewhere; in southern Chile, itinerant Anglican evangelists travel to preach and heal the sick and charismatic prayer and praise abounds in many places.

The diocese of Chile has also been at the forefront of advocacy for a more flexible approach to traditional forms of Anglican ministry in the light of its pastoral needs and its theological perspective. It recognized the usefulness of a more dynamic concept of the role of the deacon, envisioning it as a separate order with a clear relationship to specific forms of ministry in the church, rather than a mere apprenticeship to the presbyterate. Similar movements have marked Anglican Churches in many other parts of the world. But at the same time, the diocese embraced a more controversial notion: granting to the bishops the right to license carefully selected and trained laypeople to celebrate Holy Communion in settings where the ministry of a presbyter could not be provided. Supporters pointed to the shortage of clergy, many of them non-stipendiary and lacking significant theological training; in 1990, none of the clergy serving the indigenous congregations of the diocese of Northern

⁸ Wendy Mann, *An Unquenched Flame: A Short History of the South American Missionary Society* (London, 1968), pp. 79–85.

⁹ 'Nace Provincia del Cono Sur' ('The Province of the Southern Cone Is Born'), *Estandarte Cristiano*, May 1983, Special Supplement.

Argentina, including the bishop, had a secondary school education. Support for lay presidency at the Eucharist reflected the shortage of clergy endemic to many parts of the Church of the Southern Cone, where congregations are often small and geographically isolated. It also reflected the Church's Evangelical mistrust of a doctrine of the Church that stressed the sacramental over the experiential and the ministry of the clergy over that of the laity. While supporters of lay presidency argued that the policy fell well within the bounds of the diversity which has always informed the Anglican ethos, in fact it became a highly controversial issue among Anglicans in the Southern Cone, and in 1986 the Synod of the Church of the Southern Cone narrowly rejected it.¹⁰

In other parts of Latin America, very different currents prevailed. Many Anglicans believed that the particular appeal of their tradition lay in the similarity of its Anglo-Catholic heritage to the Roman Catholicism of the vast majority. Many of its most articulate advocates emphasized the liturgical similarity to Roman Catholic worship, and stressed the devotion towards the Virgin Mary which reappeared within Anglicanism following the ritualist phase of the Oxford Movement. The Society of Mary, an English devotional society dedicated to Our Lady of Walsingham, established a Latin American presence, arguing that it was a particularly appropriate form of Anglican spiritual practice given the religious traditions of most Latin Americans.

ANGLICANS AND POLITICAL STRUGGLE

In the last three decades of the twentieth century, Anglican Churches were challenged to practise their ministry in countries where political struggles had created oppressive military regimes, and where active guerrilla movements had spawned civil war. Indeed, many of the countries of Latin America were troubled throughout much of the century by conflict between economic and social elites backed by the armed forces and a growing militant population base which lived in misery and which occasionally succeeded in electing governments with a populist agenda but which usually failed to carry out their programmes. Few areas escaped the violent conflict which wracked the region.

The Cuban Revolution, which brought Fidel Castro to power in 1959, fought insurgents in the mountains at the same time it was supporting

¹⁰ 'Ministerio en la Iglesia: Desafiantes Propuestas' ('Ministry in the Church: Challenging Proposals'), *Boletín del Cono Sur*, 2 (undated), p. 1, my translation; Alan Hargrave, *But Who Will Preside? A Review of Issues concerning 'Lay Presidency' in Parts of South America and in the Anglican Communion at Large* (Nottingham, 1990), pp. 5–9, 15, 23–4; Colin Buchanan, *Historical Dictionary of Anglicanism* (London, 2015), p. 373.

revolutionary movements in many other places. In Nicaragua, the Somoza dynasty succeeded in holding power from 1936 until its defeat by a Marxist-oriented guerrilla movement in 1979. A reformist regime elected to office in Guatemala in 1954 was overthrown with American aid and replaced by a succession of violent military regimes. In El Salvador, a military government which had been in power since the 1930s was challenged by an increasingly militant guerrilla movement, until civil war was ended and a fragile democracy was restored in 1992. In Panama, Omar Torrijos seized power in 1968 and established a nationalist military regime which successfully negotiated the return of the Panama Canal Zone through a process which began in 1979 but was not complete until the end of the century. (The armed forces were abolished and democracy restored after the American invasion of December 1989.) The Brazilian military staged a coup in 1964 and democracy was not restored until 1985. In Chile, the American government helped to overthrow the elected socialist government of Salvador Allende in 1973, and a military dictatorship controlled the country until 1990. Argentina's populist regime was ousted from power by a military junta in 1976; it gave up power in 1983 after its unsuccessful war to regain the Malvinas (Falklands) from Britain. These cataclysmic events formed the backdrop for Anglican mission and ministry throughout the second half of the twentieth century, and presented challenges for which the Churches were mostly unprepared.

The election of Salvador Allende as socialist president of Chile in 1971 ushered in a period of radical political changes influenced by Marxist principles. In the aftermath of his overthrow by General Augusto Pinochet, the Anglican Church in Chile opted to undertake a ministry of reconciliation by offering pastoral ministry to both participants in the military government and the large number of political prisoners who were its adversaries and victims.¹¹

The ongoing development of the Cuban Revolution gave a particular challenge to Anglicans in that conflicted country. Many went into exile, swelling the Cuban population of Florida and other southern American states. In 1980, a massive exodus of Cubans from their island country attracted the attention of a number of American Episcopalians who were concerned at the conditions under which people were fleeing and their fate once they reached the United States. Two Episcopal priests, Joseph Doss and Leopoldo Frade (himself of Cuban parentage) obtained a converted Second World War submarine and transported 437 Cubans, none of whom had permission to leave Cuba or to enter the United States, to safety. Although initial charges against

¹¹ Email from Colin Bazley to Guillermo Cavieses, quoted in '¡ANGLICANOS! Latin American Anglicanism: A Study of the Ecclesiology and Identity of the Anglican Churches of Latin America', thesis, Uppsala University, 2010, 31–2; Alfredo Cooper, 'The Use of Scripture in the Iglesia Anglicana de Chile', in John Stott et al. (eds.), *The Anglican Communion and Scripture: Papers from the First International Consultation of the Evangelical Fellowship in the Anglican Communion*, Canterbury UK, June 1993 (Oxford, 1996), p. 186.

them were dismissed, the following year the American government brought them to trial for 'trading with the enemy'. They enjoyed the support of the Presiding Bishop of the Episcopal Church, but they were convicted and sentenced to ten years in prison and a fine of \$50,000. Two years later, their sentence was overturned. Both were later elected to the episcopate; Doss became bishop of the American diocese of New Jersey, while Frade served as bishop of Honduras and later of Southeast Florida. At the time of the revolution the diocese of Cuba counted more than 66,000 baptized members in forty-three congregations served by twenty-nine clergy. Twenty-five years later, only eleven clergy remained. Its bishop was imprisoned for ten years early in his ministry. Church construction was prohibited and many old buildings were in a state of disrepair or collapse. Activity was restricted to the confines of Church property, and many members declined to attend church due to fear of consequences.¹²

In Nicaragua, the Marxist-led Sandinista government established when the Somoza dictatorship was overthrown in 1979 found itself in a civil war in which its opponents, the *contras*, were backed by the American government. Although the Sandinista Revolution had involved large numbers of Nicaraguans and enjoyed broad support from the Roman Catholic clergy (three of its government ministers were priests), the Episcopal Church in Nicaragua remained aloof from the struggle. While the diocese had opened clinics and schools in various parts of the country, it chose not to take an active part in either the revolution or the civil war against the *contras*, either of which would have required it to take sides; nor did it speak out against the injustice, poverty, and oppression which were hallmarks of the Somoza regime, preferring to maintain a posture of neutrality.¹³

In other settings Anglicans considered the call to participate actively in the struggle for justice as an essential element of the process by which the Church becomes an integral part of its own context. It was in the tiny Episcopal Church in El Salvador that Latin American Anglicans most actively identified with the struggle of the poor against a repressive government. Arriving in 1972, Luis Serrano, a native of Spain and a former Roman Catholic priest, led the Episcopal Church's mission in that country alone until joined by another priest in 1980. With his parish in the capital, San Salvador, as its headquarters, he began his work among the English-speaking expatriates in the city, but soon was moved by the situation of misery abounding throughout the country

¹² Episcopal News Service, 'Five Face Trial in Cuban Boatlift', Episcopal Press and News, 1962–2006, 10 Sept. 1981; Episcopal News Service, 'Missioner Finds Mature Faith in Cuba', Episcopal Press and News 1962–2006, 17 Mar. 1983; 'Cuban Consultation Finds Signs of Hope', Episcopal Press and News 1962–2006, 6 Dec. 1984.

¹³ Ennis Duffis, 'Capellanía en Centroamérica' ('Chaplaincy in Central America'), in Ashton Jacinto Brooks (ed.), *Eclesiología: Presencia anglicana en la Región Central de América* (San José, Costa Rica, 1990), pp. 42–5, my translation.

to establish CREDHO, a social service agency which began operating clinics to provide both health services and legal aid and also established a cooperative farm in the countryside to provide employment by growing grain and sugar cane. The Episcopal Church's ministry soon attracted the negative attention of the dictatorship, and several of CREDHO's staff workers were assassinated.

In spite of the atmosphere of tension and violence that prevailed in El Salvador, the Church grew steadily, and in 1986 four Salvadoran clergy were ordained. But as the civil war escalated, the government saw the Episcopal Church and other Christian bodies as focal points of opposition. In November 1990, National Guard soldiers detained Serrano and twenty other Episcopal Church workers. Most were soon released, but Serrano and six others were held, accused of knowingly allowing the FMLN, the guerrilla movement fighting the government, to hide weapons and ammunition in the grounds of Church headquarters. Within weeks, the Episcopal Church in the United States had mounted a campaign on their behalf. The Presiding Bishop sent four bishops to meet with the president of El Salvador and to demand their release. The National Council of Churches of the United States also sent a delegation to press for the release of Serrano and all imprisoned church workers, and the Spanish ambassador played an important part in the campaign. All but one of the Episcopal detainees were released early the following year.¹⁴

The civil war in El Salvador came to an end with peace accords signed in 1992. In 1994 Martín Barahona, the first diocesan bishop, returned from years of exile prompted by death threats to assume his post. He joined clergy and lay workers of the diocese in overseeing an extensive network of urban and rural social programmes to generate a positive attitude in the face of poverty and a culture of violence that was one of the fruits of decades of civil war. In the post-war period, Anglican pastoral and social ministry has continued to grow and to occupy an important role in the nationwide effort to turn the country away from its violent past and embrace development and reconciliation. From the beginning of a formal Anglican presence in the 1970s, and unlike its counterparts in some other parts of Central America, the Episcopal Church in El Salvador has practised a 'ministry of accompaniment' or solidarity, in which the Church makes an institutional and pastoral commitment to stand with those who are society's victims and to support them in their struggle for social, political, and economic change.¹⁵

¹⁴ Episcopal News Service, 'Church Leaders Condemn El Salvador Massacre', *Episcopal Press and News* 1962–2006, 9 Dec. 1982; Loren Gray, *Episcopal News Service*, 'Exiled Rector Says He Plans to Return to El Salvador', *Episcopal Press and News* 1962–2006, 29 Mar. 1990; 'Episcopal Church Workers in El Salvador Released After International Campaign', *Episcopal Press and News* 1962–2006, 10 Jan. 1990.

¹⁵ *Episcopal News Service*, 'The Episcopal Church in El Salvador: Keeping Hope Alive in a Troubled Land', *Episcopal Press and News* 1962–2006, 7 Apr. 1994.

While the Anglican presence in Panama had its roots in the English-speaking community of Americans who owned the railroad and established the Panama Canal, and the West Indian workers who built both, by the 1980s the diocesan leadership was eager to break out of the linguistic and geographic restraints which had kept it confined to the Canal Zone and marginalized regions of the isthmus. Under the leadership of the last American bishop, Reginald Gooden, and especially during the ministries of the first two Panamanian bishops of the diocese, Lemuel Shirley and James H. Ottley, extensive mission work was undertaken, new congregations were established throughout the country, and a significant number of Latino clergy were ordained. In 1985 the diocese changed its primary language from English to Spanish.

In Brazil as well as in other parts of Latin America, the priorities of liberation theology led to efforts to identify more fully with the plight of those people most affected by poverty and oppression. Glauco Soares de Lima, later Presiding Bishop of the Anglican Episcopal Church of Brazil, was a strong critic of the individualism and consumerism which he saw threatening Brazil and other peoples of Latin America. 'Why', he asked, 'is the gulf of acquisitive ability, wealth, knowledge and power between developed and under-developed Christians growing? Why do the same people who proclaim love and participation in the Eucharist deprive the poor of their own world of food, capital, employment, and even of lands?' Jaci Maraschin challenged the Church to consider that its ministry was directed to a specific context: 'The people of Latin America', he noted, 'are mostly poor and oppressed by unjust social, political and economic systems, people emerging from a long and painful history of invasions, conquests and submissions.'¹⁶

James Ottley, bishop of Panama after 1984 and President of the Episcopal Church's Province IX (comprising the Church's Latin American dioceses) after 1986, argued for Anglicans to take seriously the implications of liberation theology for their own mission. He became a strong advocate for a Church engaged with the realities of its context, not only by exercising its prophetic voice but also by actively listening to and supporting the poor and marginalized. Drawing on the insights of liberation theology, he urged Anglicans in Latin America to participate in the empowerment of the poor majorities, giving up the paternalism all too often associated with social ministry in favour of encouraging local initiative and creativity at the grassroots level.¹⁷

When General Manuel Noriega overthrew Panama's elected president in 1987 the United States instituted an embargo, and in December 1989 launched

¹⁶ Glauco Soares de Lima, 'The Sacrament of the Church', in Kater (ed.), *We Are Anglicans*, p. 56; Maraschin, 'Liturgy and Latin American Anglicanism', in Kater (ed.), *We Are Anglicans*, p. 43.

¹⁷ James H. Ottley, 'The Mission of Anglicanism in Latin America', in Kater (ed.), *We Are Anglicans*, p. 27; 'La expresión anglicana en la Región Central de América' ('Anglican Expression in the Central Region of America') in Brooks (ed.), *Eclesiología*, p. 90.

an invasion which led to Noriega's arrest and the occupation of Panama by American military forces. In the aftermath of the invasion, Ottley chaired the national Ecumenical Committee which assumed responsibility for distributing relief supplies to the 15,000 people left homeless by the American bombardment and to other areas where food was in short supply. Days after the extent of the consequences became known the committee issued a statement noting that while the invasion had ended an unpopular and feared military regime, it also resulted in the loss of Panama's independence and in devastation, loss of life and property, and a period of lawlessness in which vandalism and looting were unchecked. Panamanian Anglicans were instrumental in providing ministry to the more than 15,000 refugees made homeless by the invasion.¹⁸

Anglicans in other parts of Latin America also found the decade of the 1980s a time of challenge and stress. In Honduras, where most Episcopalians were members of isolated congregations scattered through the countryside where no other Churches existed, the Church's support for land reform through its programme 'Christian Solidarity' brought charges of 'subversion and thievery', and some of its leaders, including the diocesan development officer, were jailed without charges (though later released).

AUTONOMY AND IDENTITY

In spite of the social and political upheavals throughout Latin America, the last two decades of the twentieth century were marked for Anglicans by increasingly insistent concerns about autonomy, and the related issues of Anglican identity and the contextual dimension of Latin American Anglicanism. In 1986 the diocese of Panama sponsored a 'Symposium on Latin American Anglicanism', which brought together twelve participants—academics, clergy, and lay professional church workers—from Central and South America and the Caribbean to address issues related to identity in their context. Their presentations were published the following year in Spanish, and in English translation in 1989. In 1987, the first-ever Latin American Anglican Congress, also meeting in Panama, gathered bishops, clergy, and lay delegates from each diocese in the Episcopal Church's Province IX, the Anglican Episcopal Church of Brazil, the Anglican Church of the Southern Cone, and the Latino ministry of the Episcopal Church. (Nicaragua and Haiti were unrepresented because of political issues and civil unrest.)¹⁹

¹⁸ 'Comité Ecueménico de Panamá se pronuncia sobre los acontecimientos acaecidos en ese país' ('Ecumenical Committee of Panama speaks out on the events which have taken place in that country'), *Mundo Episcopal*, Jan.-Feb. 1990, pp. 1-2, my translation.

¹⁹ John L. Kater, 'Introduction', in Kater (ed.), *We Are Anglicans*, pp. 3-7.

A primary purpose of both the symposium and the congress was to affirm the right of Latin American Anglicans to practise their faith in contextually appropriate ways, and to provide opportunity for dialogue and mutual education across the many divides of culture, history, and language that shaped the experience of identity and ministry. Both events also highlighted the enormous diversity of Latin American Anglicanism, as a reality and as a challenge to people who had rarely had the opportunity to encounter Anglican expressions of faith, worship, and spirituality different from their own. Sunday worship with a variety of rural and urban congregations across the diocese of Panama was the first opportunity for Anglican leaders from other parts of Latin America to encounter the many and diverse faces of Anglican ministry in the context of Latin America. (Some of the delegates from the Church of the Southern Cone had never seen a Book of Common Prayer. Three of the clergy delegates were women; it was the first encounter for many participants with women in ordained ministry.)

In 1982, the dioceses of Province IX announced to the Episcopal Church their intention to form themselves into an autonomous Church within three years. But negotiations revealed a number of challenges and obstacles, and in 1984 the synod of Province IX decided to explore smaller regional alliances with the projected outcome of not one but four autonomous Churches: Mexico; the Central Region of America; the Caribbean Region (which would include Haiti, the Dominican Republic, Puerto Rico, and Cuba); and ARENSA, the Episcopal Regional Association of Northern South America, including the dioceses of Colombia, Central and Western Ecuador, and Venezuela (previously part of the Province of the West Indies). That decision was re-affirmed three years later and reflected in subsequent negotiations. In 1988 the Episcopal Church's Executive Council spent nine days in Central America discussing misconceptions and imperatives if autonomy was to be achieved. On one hand, the idea that autonomy required complete financial self-sufficiency was laid to rest; on the other, the American representatives considered that issues of contextualization had not been adequately addressed.²⁰

In fact, the contextualization of Anglicanism in various parts of Latin America had revealed not only challenges related to old issues like extremes of Evangelical and Anglo-Catholic traditions. It also brought to light what one Brazilian priest (later diocesan bishop and primate) called 'the chaplaincy virus', a tendency to ignore mission by focusing only on the needs and concerns of the immediate community of its members, particularly a danger where congregations were made up primarily of English-speaking expatriates and their descendants. In many cases chaplaincy congregations were exempt from diocesan canons and standards, looking to Britain or the United States

²⁰ 'Desarrollo histórico de la Novena Provincia' ('Historical Development of the Ninth Province'), *Mundo Episcopal* (July–Oct. 1992), pp. 7–8.

for their leadership and their sense of identity. Their continued presence could not help but inject tension into the search for a Latin American Anglican identity.

Another issue, often unspoken, that intruded on the process of contextualization was the racism associated with the broad spectrum of languages and ethnic groups comprising the Anglican community. Early Anglican mission in Nicaragua had engaged the Miskito people of the country's east coast; in the Southern Cone, SAMS had always directed its ministry primarily to the tribes of native peoples. But in the rest of Latin America, Anglicans had largely ignored the presence of tribal peoples whose language was not Spanish or Portuguese. It was only in the 1970s that Ecuador's Quechua-speaking bishop Adrián Cáceres responded to requests from the country's Oriente region by establishing training programmes for both clergy and laypeople. The decade of the 1970s saw remarkable growth throughout the country, with a tenfold multiplication of communicants in a period of five years, fifteen university ministries, parochial schools, urban and rural ministry centres, and an agricultural extension service. Under Cáceres's leadership, a model of ministry pioneered in Alaska known as 'total ministry', which emphasized the ordination of local clergy and the commissioning of lay leadership for a variety of ministries, was put in place in Ecuador. At the same time, in Guatemala, another country with a high percentage of native peoples, the diocese also began establishing missions among the tribal peoples under the leadership of Bishop Anselmo Carral, a project which continued in the following decades under his successor, Armando Guerra. In the 1980s the Episcopal Church in Panama joined with several other Churches, including the Roman Catholics, in supporting the rights of the Guaymí people to live according to their traditional ways and to control their traditional homeland (including its natural resources).²¹

Racism was also an important factor in those parts of Latin America that had experienced a large influx of African and Afro-Caribbean immigrants, and it figured in the development of Anglicanism in both the Caribbean (Cuba, Puerto Rico, and the Dominican Republic) and in Central America, especially Nicaragua, Costa Rica, and Panama. For much of the twentieth century, Anglicanism in both regions was identified with the English-speaking descendants of West Indians and the English and American presence. In Costa Rica, persons of African descent were required to live in the eastern region of the country, and when they were present in other areas they were subject to strict racial segregation. In Panama, the American Canal Zone imposed a legal system of segregation modelled on the southern state of Louisiana, with

²¹ Isabel Baumgartner, Episcopal News Service, 'Ecuador's Ministry Training Paying Off', Episcopal Press and News 1962–2006, 29 Sept. 1977; John L. Kater, Jr, 'Being in the Way... The Third World's Third World', *Jubilee*, 2 (Fall 1985): 28–9.

separate towns, schools, and churches for white and black residents. This discrimination was mirrored in Panama itself, where the short-lived constitution of 1941 defined Panamanian nationality in such a way that people of West Indian descent were often excluded. In those countries where Anglicans had been drawn primarily from the Afro-Caribbean population, context and identity became more complex. What, for example, was to be the place of English in Anglican churches where contextualization was understood to mean the use of Spanish or Portuguese? And what was involved in asking West Indian Anglicans, for whom English was a treasured part of their heritage and whose Church had provided a secure haven against the racism of the culture that surrounded them, to broaden their vision of Anglicanism to make room for those whose background was far different? In fact, the shift from English to Spanish as the primary language of worship and administration was a profoundly troubling experience for many Anglicans who traced their ancestry to the islands of the Caribbean. Race was a significant factor in several episcopal elections in the last decades of the twentieth century, and also affected relationships between English- and Spanish-speaking clergy and laity. Latino Anglicans sometimes felt that their recently adopted religious identity was questioned by those for whom Anglicanism was a treasured part of their family history, while at times English-speaking Anglicans felt that their prerogatives—especially the language that many considered their birthright—were being taken from them. The tension, often unspoken, between Afro-Caribbean English-speaking Anglicans and Spanish-speaking Latino Anglicans was one factor which impeded the achievement of autonomy in Central America for more than a decade.²²

At its meeting in 1988 the Episcopal Church's General Convention was able to look forward to the rapid establishment of four autonomous Churches encompassing all of Province IX. But the promise was fulfilled according to schedule for only one of the Churches. In 1994, the Episcopal Church released the dioceses of the Mexican Episcopal Church from its jurisdiction and ratified a covenant between the two Churches. The Anglican Church of Mexico came into being on 1 January 1995. But the convention felt unable to take similar action with regard to the other Churches of Central America, noting that all the conditions for autonomy had not been met. In 1998, four of the dioceses of Central America (Guatemala, El Salvador, Nicaragua, and Panama) joined at last with the autonomous diocese of Costa Rica to form the 'Anglican Church of the Central Region of America' (IARCA). Although it declined to join the new Church, citing other priorities, the diocese of Honduras declared its intention to cooperate with IARCA in regional planning and ministry, and

²² Alberto Smith, 'El Afropanameño antillano frente al concepto de la Panameñidad' ('The West Indian Afro-Panamanian before the Concept of Panamanian Identity'), *Revista Nacional de Cultura*, 5 (Oct.–Dec. 1976), p. 46, my translation.

the diocese of Belize also expressed interest in strengthening its relationships with its neighbours.²³

But plans dating from the 1980s to create two new autonomous Churches—one in northern South America and the other comprising Cuba, Puerto Rico, the Dominican Republic and Haiti—failed to be put into place. By the end of the century violence and political and economic realities had so impacted many of the countries involved that plans were quietly postponed or retired, and Colombia, Venezuela, Honduras, the Dominican Republic, and two dioceses in Ecuador continued to be part of the Episcopal Church's Province IX. Haiti remained as part of the Episcopal Church's Province II, along with the dioceses of the east coast states of New York and New Jersey. Haiti was the largest diocese in the Episcopal Church and sponsored more schools than any other American diocese, as well as a philharmonic orchestra, a university, a hospital and nursing school, and an art museum. But decades of dictatorship and political violence had taken an enormous toll; by the decade of the 1990s there were an estimated one million Haitian refugees in the Dominican Republic, with four Haitian Anglican priests at work among them.²⁴

FACING CHANGE

The latter years of the twentieth century were also marked by enormous social and economic changes across Latin America fuelled by the phenomenon of globalization, in which large numbers of jobs previously located in the United States were transferred to countries to its south, where wages were substantially lower and workers' rights either non-existent or often ignored. In 1994 the North American Free Trade Agreement, which eliminated most tariff barriers between the United States and Mexico, led to the establishment of thousands of *maquiladoras*, assembly plants for manufactured goods, near the border between the two countries, offering low-paying jobs to Mexican workers but also disrupting the social fabric of the border region. In Brazil and Ecuador, transnational corporations and private developers devastated the rainforest and caused terrible damage to the ecosystems of large sections of the continent. The international drug trade, which is an illegal dimension of

²³ General Convention Resolution 1994-C041, 'Approve Autonomy and Covenant with Mexican Episcopal Church', The Acts of Convention, Archives of the Episcopal Church; Jan Nunley, Episcopal News Service; '¡Viva la Provincia Anglicana de Mexico!'; 'Ecuador's Ministry Training Paying Off', Episcopal Press and News 1962–2006, 7 Sept. 1994; E. T. Malone, Jr, Episcopal News Service, 'Dioceses in Central America Launch New Anglican Province', Episcopal Press and News 1962–2006, 8 May 1998.

²⁴ George Lockwood, Episcopal News Service, 'Acute Challenges Confront the Church in the Dominican Republic', Episcopal Press and News 1962–2006, 28 July 1993.

twentieth-century globalization, created a culture of violence which affected not only Mexico but also Colombia and, to a lesser extent, a number of other countries in Central and South America. The climate of fear and widespread violence and the misery associated with these negative effects of globalization have drastically changed the context in which Anglican Churches in many parts of Latin America engage in mission and carry out their pastoral ministry.

By the last decades of the century issues which had proven to be highly divisive in other parts of the Anglican Communion were also affecting the life of the Anglican Churches of Latin America. The process of ordaining women to the priesthood, which had occurred in Hong Kong in 1944 and again in 1971, was followed by illicit ordinations in the United States in 1974 and the opening of ordination to women in the US Episcopal Church in 1976. As in many other parts of the Anglican Communion, the ordination of women encountered a mixed reaction among Anglicans in Latin America. On one hand, much folk religion—the *piedad popular* by which millions of people lived—was accustomed to women in the role of *curandera*, who provided pastoral counsel and performed rites of healing. However, many traditional elements of cultures across the region were highly patriarchal. The diocese of Panama ordained a woman to the priesthood in 1985. By the end of the century, women priests were serving in Puerto Rico, Cuba, all the dioceses of Province IX, and in the Anglican Churches of Mexico, Brazil, and the Central Region of America. In the Church of the Southern Cone, women were ordained to the diaconate.²⁵

The issue of homosexuality, which proved to be even more divisive within the Anglican Communion, also affected the Churches of Latin America, given strong cultural and religious biases shaped by centuries of Roman Catholicism. Actions in many dioceses of the Episcopal Church in the United States to eliminate traditional barriers to same-sex unions, and the ordination of gay and lesbian clergy, were widely criticized by Anglicans in many parts of Latin America. In preparation for the 1998 Lambeth Conference some Anglican leaders in Africa and Southeast Asia attempted to organize opponents of homosexuality through two ‘global South’ consultations, in which efforts were made to encourage Latin American Churches to join the opposition to any change in the traditional Anglican understanding of homosexuality. With the exception of the Anglican Church of the Southern Cone, which became an enthusiastic supporter of the global South consultations, most declined to participate actively, even when they shared concern about the issue. Shortly before the 1998 Lambeth Conference, the bishops of the Anglican Episcopal

²⁵ Episcopal News Service, ‘Additional Information on Women Clergy Shows a Mixed Picture in Latin America’, Episcopal Press and News 1962–2006, 15 Jan. 1993; ‘CHART: Ordination of Women in the Anglican Communion’, Episcopal Press and News 1962–2006, 4 Aug. 1999.

Church of Brazil issued a pastoral letter in which they noted the lack of consensus across the Communion with regard to the issue of homosexuality, and stated that for that reason they declined to adopt a definitive position with regard either to the place of homosexual persons in ordained ministry or to the appropriateness of same-sex marriage. However, the presiding bishop of the Church of the Southern Cone called for the Anglican Communion to adopt some sort of doctrinal guidelines that could prevent sexuality issues from leading to conflict among the Churches of the Communion. He argued that the principle of accountability among member Churches should permit the Communion itself to intervene in situations where innovation or stagnation were problematic. In a prologue to debates that would grow in volume in coming years, he argued for a restructured Anglican Consultative Council and a stronger role for the archbishop of Canterbury to halt what he saw as the increasing tendency of Churches to act independently without reference to the larger Communion.²⁶

In spite of dedicated ministry, often in difficult circumstances and marked by significant local impact, Latin American Anglicanism has failed to expand in the way its advocates hoped. While statistics depend on many factors and are difficult to evaluate, even a cursory review of the strength of the Anglican Churches at the end of the twentieth century reveals that their numbers remained very small. Of the four autonomous Churches in Latin America, only Brazil claimed more than 100,000 baptized members at century's end. The number for Mexico was 21,000, for the Southern Cone some 22,000, and for the five Central American dioceses of IARCA, less than 15,000. The autonomous diocese of Puerto Rico had 30,000, with the diocese of Cuba claiming some 3,000. Of the dioceses in the Episcopal Church's Province IX, the diocese of Colombia listed 25,000 members, while the diocese of Venezuela reported an average Sunday attendance of 1,300.²⁷

At the end of the twentieth century Anglicans across Latin America continued to struggle to define their identity and to articulate appropriate styles of ministry and mission. Issues of authority, born of the tension between more democratic forms of polity inherited from the Episcopal Church and the aspirations of many for increasing emphasis on the ministry of all the baptized on one hand, and traditional forms of hierarchical leadership on the other, gave rise to frequent conflicts which divided dioceses and shook the confidence of clergy and laity alike.

Related to the issue of authority was a broad concern for the education of clergy and lay leadership. In the course of the twentieth century, a number of

²⁶ Episcopal News Service, 'Anglican Struggles over Homosexuality Take to an International Stage', *Episcopal Press and News* 1962–2006, 9 May 1997.

²⁷ James Rosenthal, *The Essential Guide to the Anglican Communion* (Harrisburg, PA, 1998), pp. 1–26.

efforts were made to provide adequate training for these leaders. Seminaries in Brazil, Mexico, the Dominican Republic, and Puerto Rico struggled to maintain adequate programming in the face of scarce financial and human resources. Brazil's seminary in Porto Alegre closed several times in the course of the century, while the seminary in Puerto Rico permanently shut its doors in 1976. In some cases, dioceses have made use of ecumenical institutions in Costa Rica, Argentina, and Cuba. Others have relied on distance education or provided their own programmes of study, although these have often been short-lived. A central concern for the Anglican Churches of Latin America is the nature of theological education appropriate for a region where the Church must minister to both a growing educated middle class and large numbers of poor and sometimes illiterate parishioners in the countryside and urban slums.

A similar tension has affected the evolution of contextualized liturgy among Latin American Anglicans. In general, Churches have been reluctant to stray far from the Spanish or Portuguese translations of the American Book of Common Prayer, and much of the music of Latin American Anglicanism consists of hymns translated from English and American hymnals. In many places, Roman Catholic music (especially *coritos*, simple compositions with easily learned melodies and lyrics) supplements more traditional hymnody. Some Latin American liturgists argued that the time had come for Anglicans to create liturgical forms easily accessible to illiterate people, based on a transition from the highly verbal liturgical forms inherited from the English-speaking Church to worship drawing on movement, drama, dance, gestures, and symbolic elements from the natural world. Such worship would be augmented by the use of popular musical instruments, including those unknown in the English-speaking world but deeply identified with the local culture. Where implemented, such changes not only permit liturgical inculturation at a deep level but also allow both local and global social, political, and economic realities to be incorporated into worship.²⁸

Challenges to traditional Anglican worship imported from the English-speaking Churches are accompanied in many places by questions about the appropriateness of elements of popular religiosity with Roman Catholic overtones. While those Churches and regions with strong Evangelical roots have tended to resist such adaptation, in other parts of the Church traditional rituals and practices associated with *piedad popular* have become increasingly widespread. These include the *quinceañera*, the fifteenth birthday celebration in which a young woman was traditionally presented at mass and honoured with a highly stylized fiesta, formally indicating that she had reached adulthood and was of marriageable age. As adapted by Anglicans, it is conceived as

²⁸ Elias Meyer Vergara and Wesley Meyer Vergara, 'O Livro de Oração Comum e a Inculturação Brasileira' ('The Book of Common Prayer and Brazilian Inculturation'), *Inclusividade*, 8 (2009): 99–140.

a rite of passage but continues to include a special Eucharist and an elaborate party. Some Latin American Anglicans complain that adopting the custom has blurred the distinction between Roman Catholic and Anglican identity, and imposed expectations for increasingly costly and conspicuous consumption.

Another issue affecting the process of contextualization is the challenge to determine the place of traditional spirituality such as the cult of saints. In rural congregations throughout much of Latin America, devotion to the patron saint traditionally part of their Roman Catholic piety has been integrated into Anglican worship. Some Anglicans are troubled by what seems to be a way of approaching God not unlike that adopted when seeking favours from a local political leader. Others find that such practices reduce the perception of the saints from being noteworthy followers of Christ to the status of patrons with the ability to obtain mundane favours—advantages in business or personal relationships—for those who identify themselves as devotees.

None of the tensions surrounding the incorporation of elements of popular piety has been greater than that surrounding devotion to Our Lady of Guadalupe among Mexican Anglicans. For many years, the Episcopal Church resisted any mention of *la Guadalupeana*, considering the cult to be based on a legend born in the early days of the Spanish Conquest and the imposition of Roman Catholicism on the Nahuatl-speaking native peoples of Mexico. But in the late decades of the twentieth century, as issues of identity came to occupy the attention of a Church preparing for autonomy after nearly a century of domination by the Episcopal Church, the argument was increasingly made that *la Guadalupeana* is not only a figure of Roman Catholic piety but a central, indeed essential, part of Mexican identity who belongs to all Mexicans. Hence by the end of the century some churches in the Anglican Church of Mexico continued to ignore her cult; others adapted veneration of the figure of Our Lady of Guadalupe but were careful to depict her with the Christ Child, emphasizing her identity as the mother of Jesus; while still others installed traditional images in which the Virgin is depicted in the symbolic garb of the Aztec Mother-Goddess, standing on the moon dressed in a robe adorned with stars and celebrated with great fanfare on her feast day, 12 December.

CONCLUSION

Perhaps the tension surrounding the cult of Our Lady of Guadalupe can serve as a fitting conclusion to an overview of Latin American Anglicanism in the twentieth century: a story like that of the broader evolution of a global Anglican Communion struggling to comprehend its English-speaking heritage, the demands of autonomy and contextualization, and the unfinished business of resolving the tension between them. By the end of the twentieth

century, there was no doubt that Anglicanism in Latin America speaks Spanish and Portuguese along with British and American English, French, Meskito, and Quechua. But the struggle to become Churches deeply rooted in their own context—claiming and exercising the right to their own theological method, their own interpretations of scripture, their own structures and liturgies and music, and their own engagement with the deep realities of their homeland—goes on.

SELECT BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Bazley, Barbara, *Hearts Aflame: Stories from the Church in Chile* (Basingstoke, 1988).
- Bazley, Barbara, *Hidden Gold: A Spiritual Adventure in South America* (Basingstoke, 1985).
- Bazley, Barbara, *Somos Anglicanos: Hitos y anécdotas* (Iglesia Anglicana de Chile, 1995).
- Blanco-Beledo, Ricardo, 'Iglesia Anglicana de la Región Central de América', in Ian Markham, J. Barney Hawkins IV, Justyn Terry, and Leslie Nuñez Steffensen (eds.), *The Wiley-Blackwell Companion to the Anglican Communion* (Oxford, 2013), pp. 489–99.
- Blankingship, Hugo, Jr, 'The Episcopal Church of Cuba', in Ian Markham, J. Barney Hawkins IV, Justyn Terry, and Leslie Nuñez Steffensen (eds.), *The Wiley-Blackwell Companion to the Anglican Communion* (Oxford, 2013), pp. 526–37.
- Bower, Richard, *Cuentos Panameños: Stories of Struggle and Hope in Rural Panama* (New York, 1993).
- Branco, Gustavo and Marcus Throup, 'Igreja Episcopal Anglicana do Brasil', in Ian Markham, J. Barney Hawkins IV, Justyn Terry, and Leslie Nuñez Steffensen (eds.), *The Wiley-Blackwell Companion to the Anglican Communion* (Oxford, 2013), pp. 539–46.
- Brooks, Ashton Jacinto (ed.), *Eclesiología: Presencia anglicana en la Región Central de América* (San José, Costa Rica, 1990).
- Calvani, Carlos, 'Eucaristia e Eclesiología', *Inclusividade*, 6 (April 2007).
- Calvani, Carlos, 'From Modernity to Post-Modernity: Inclusiveness and Making the Myth of Anglican Communion Relevant Today', *Anglican Theological Review*, 90 (Winter 2008).
- Calvani, Carlos, 'Theological Education in the Brazilian Context', *Anglican Theological Review*, 90 (Spring 2008).
- Cavieses, Guillermo, '¡Anglicanos! Latin American Anglicanism: A Study of the Ecclesiology and Identity of the Anglican Churches of Latin America', thesis, Uppsala University, 2010.
- CETALC, *La Globalización y sus implicaciones en América Latina: Un desafío para la Iglesia Episcopal Anglicana* (Panamá, Congreso de Teología, 2005).
- DaSilva, 'Os desenvolvimentos e desafios da Comunhão Anglicana', *Inclusividade*, 9 (April 2010).
- Espiúca, Rodrigo, 'Anglicanismos no Brasil', *Inclusividade*, 9 (April 2010).

- Kater, John, 'A Construção de uma Comunhão: Tensões e Ilusões, Convergências e Contradições', *Inclusividade*, 7 (July 2008).
- Kater, John, 'Alternative Patterns for Ministry: North and Central America', in Andrew Wingate, Kevin Ward, Carrie Pemberton, and Wilson Sitshebo (eds.), *Anglicanism: A Global Communion* (New York, 1998).
- Kater, John, *Corrientes teológicas protestantes de Europa y Estados Unidos (Siglos XVII-XX)* (San José, Costa Rica, 1994).
- Kater, John, 'Há Futuro para o Anglicanismo? Caminhos, possibilidades e ameaças', *Inclusividade*, 7 (July 2008).
- Kater, John, 'Preaching in Latin America', in W. Willimon and R. Lischer (eds.), *Encyclopedia of Preaching* (Louisville, KY, 1995).
- Kater, John (ed.), *We Are Anglicans: Essays on Latin American Anglicanism* (Panama, Episcopal Church of Panama, 1989).
- Kater, John, 'Whatever Happened to Latin American Liberation Theology?', *Anglican Theological Review*, 83 (Fall 2001).
- Kater, John and Arturo Piedra, 'En Casa en América Latina: El anglicanismo en un Contexto Nuevo/At Home in Latin America: Anglicanism in a New Context', *Anglican and Episcopal History*, 57 (March 1988).
- MacDonald, John, 'The Anglican Church of Mexico (La Iglesia Anglicana de México)', in Ian Markham, J. Barney Hawkins IV, Justyn Terry, and Leslie Nuñez Steffensen (eds.), *The Wiley-Blackwell Companion to the Anglican Communion* (Oxford, 2013), pp. 500–7.
- MacDonald, John, 'La Iglesia Anglicana del Cono Sur (The Anglican Province of the Southern Cone)', in Ian Markham, J. Barney Hawkins IV, Justyn Terry, and Leslie Nuñez Steffensen (eds.), *The Wiley-Blackwell Companion to the Anglican Communion* (Oxford, 2013), pp. 547–52.
- Soares, Sebastião, 'Globalização e desafios à Comunhão Anglicana na América Latina e no Caribe', *Inclusividade*, 7 (April 2007).
- Vergara, Elias and Wesley Vergara, 'O Livro de Oração Comum e a Inculcuação Brasileira', *Inclusividade*, 8 (April 2009): 99–140.

Anglicanism in West Africa

Femi James Kolapo

NINETEENTH-CENTURY BEGINNINGS

Anglicanism was more than one hundred years old in the British colonies of Sierra Leone and Ghana and nearly seventy years old in Nigeria by the outbreak of the First World War. African Anglicans in the colonies expected that over five decades of the presence of Anglicanism in their midst would have produced a mature church. They were disappointed in their expectations, as those many years, at least to the educated elite, only came to highlight shortfalls in the development of the Church. Nonetheless, significant achievements had been recorded. The introduction of Evangelical Christianity, led by the Anglicans (and their Methodist and Baptist peers), had made considerable gains. More and more Anglican Church missions and eventually local church councils, parishes, and dioceses were established in places farther away from the initial urban centres such as Freetown, Abeokuta, Onitsha, Kumase, Accra, and Duke Town. Considerable changes driven by native leadership were happening in the translation of what was European churchmanship into the local context. This included such areas of Church life as scriptural language, liturgy, hymnody, and the spirituality associated with their Protestant profession. West Africans were rethinking and reconfiguring Anglican Christianity into native religion that was rooted in their local socio-cultural world, though not without dissension and variability among the champions of these developments. By 1914 West African Anglicans in Sierra Leone and Nigeria's Niger Delta had experienced auspicious development towards independence from mission tutelage and had felt its obstruction.

The outworking of social Darwinist ideas in Europe which coincided with increasing European imperialist activities produced in the colonies discrimination against educated Africans in spheres of Church, government, or commerce where Europeans had management. It produced the notion of Europeans bearing the 'white man's burden' of civilizing and developing the

Africans who must remain under European leadership for some time to come. Further improvement in the local elites' political and social-economic fortunes was largely reversed and blocked by this new European racialism; by partition, extension, and consolidation of European colonization of Africa; and by the subsequent flooding of the colonies with ever more European secular and ecclesiastical agents who replaced Africans.¹ This keenly felt humiliation produced the Ethiopian Church movement. Its goal was 'establishing Christian churches under the control of Africans themselves and in tune with African cultures and traditions'.² Hence, by 1914, many elites, mostly Church educated, were challenging their political exclusion from colonial governance.

Much of this early nationalist aspiration was born in the Churches but it also affected members' outlook on, and critique of, European monopoly of Church administration. During those years, West African Anglicans largely began to reconstitute the structure, texture, culture, and authority of their Church. Cities like Freetown in Sierra Leone, Accra in the Gold Coast, Bathurst in the Gambia, and Lagos, Abeokuta, Oyo, Onitsha, Calabar, and Duke Town in Nigeria were the first to experience this development.

DEVELOPMENTS DURING THE TWENTIETH CENTURY

By the First World War, Britain had entered the high noon of its imperialist activities in Africa, consolidating its newly annexed and conquered territories. More of African politics, economics, society, and culture were forcefully laid open to direct colonial control and to ever increasing numbers of European imperial agents. In the ecclesiastical sphere, the earlier transformative indigenizing dynamic in the Anglican Church clashed ever more sharply with the increasing influx of foreign missionary agents. By 1914, therefore, an Africanization trajectory earlier plotted for the Sierra Leone pastorate and the Niger Mission that would have established independence and indigeneity for the Anglican Church was blocked. The memory of Bishop Samuel Crowther's humiliation, when his all-African mission was taken over by young European agents and his authority undermined, continued to rankle, and the resentment felt over this and the subsequent refusal to replace him with another African after he died was felt acutely. All this produced the first schism in the Church

¹ Susan B. Kaplow, 'The Mudfish and the Crocodile: Underdevelopment of a West African Bourgeoisie', *Science & Society* 41 (1977): 317-33 (pp. 317-20).

² A. A. Boahen, 'New Trends and Processes in Africa in the Nineteenth Century', in J. F. Ade Ajayi (ed.), *UNESCO General History of Africa*, vol. VI: *Africa in the Nineteenth Century until the 1880s* (Berkeley and London, 1998), pp. 51-6.

and allowed others to follow. In Nigeria, it produced the United Native African Church, 'the first lay led secession within the Anglican church'.³

The strictures the West African elites felt regarding the Church overlapped with the general strictures produced by colonialism. This resulted in the formation in 1920 in Accra, Gold Coast, of the National Congress of British West Africa, which included delegates from Gambia, Sierra Leone, and Nigeria. They organized, petitioned and agitated for 'social, political and national rights which the representatives of Great Britain in the Colonies have not infrequently denied us'.⁴ At the Accra congress, they demanded 'that half the seats in the legislative councils should be kept for elected African members and that municipal councils, with four-fifths elected membership, should be set up in all the large towns'.⁵ The Sierra Leone branch consisted of 'a significant proportion of clergymen'.⁶ By 1914, on all fronts, secular or lay, religious or socio-political, rather than Africans finding themselves more in charge, allowed to own the structure and culture of the Church or of the government, it was more and more Europeans who were established over them.⁷

The period in West Africa between 1917 and 2000 was characterized by nationalism and decolonization, a rising up against foreign rule and exploitation, and demands for independence. The Anglican missions also had to divest themselves of the colonial-era claim to control over Africans' choices and manner of worship, and over Church governance, in most instances rather too tardily. Political independence produced a change in the rhetoric and instruments of the relationship between Britain and its former colonies; hence, the British Commonwealth was a new voluntary relationship of equals. Likewise, the Anglican Communion evolved a language and instituted structures to give voice to co-equal 'partnership', 'mutuality', 'appreciation', 'cooperation', and 'shared goals' among all Anglican members from both the missionary sending erstwhile colonizing countries and the countries newly independent from colonialism.⁸

Fast forwarding to the year 2000 reveals a picture of drastic changes but at the same time major continuity in the tendencies, tensions, and identity characteristics of the Anglican Church in West Africa. West Africans engaged

³ B. Sundkler and C. Steed, *A History of the Church in Africa* (Cambridge, 2000), p. 231; G. Hewitt, *The Problems of Success: A History of the Church Missionary Society 1910–1942*, vol. I: *In Tropical Africa. The Middle East. At Home* (London, 1971), pp. 35–7.

⁴ J. Ayodele Langley, 'The Gambia Section of the National Congress of British West Africa', *Africa: Journal of the International African Institute*, 39 (1969): 382–95 (p. 383).

⁵ Hewitt, *The Problems of Success*, p. 4.

⁶ See also Akintola J. G. Wyse, 'The Sierra Leone Branch of the National Congress of British West Africa, 1918–1946', *International Journal of African Historical Studies*, 18 (1985): 675–98.

⁷ Hewitt, *The Problems of Success*, p. 9.

⁸ Miranda K. Hassett, 'Episcopal Dissidents, African Allies: The Anglican Communion and the Globalization of Dissent', PhD thesis, Department of Anthropology, University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill, 2004, pp. 80, 90.

the Anglican Communion as a tool for investing themselves with agency and a powerful voice of orthodoxy in the context of globalization.⁹ By 2000, some African leaders were not only trenchantly criticizing the liberal tendencies of Euro-American Anglicanism, but also began to forge alliances across the two-thirds world and among a section of United States Anglicans to claim leadership rights and to pronounce on what the global Anglican identity should be.

African Anglicans in East and West Africa began to voice a view and create a new reality that inverted what used to be the colonial order. They entered a discourse that contested the conditions for leadership and that situated maintenance of orthodoxy against the danger of liberalism as key criteria of Anglican Christian authenticity.¹⁰ This allowed them to lay claim to a position of liturgical purity and dominance as the agents of a new Reformation. Europe which had spawned the first reformation of orthodoxy found itself on the receiving end of an African membership who consider themselves the disciplinary arm of the Church. Some even voiced the claim to be in the position to excommunicate Euro-American Anglicans from the Church for their deviation from orthodoxy.¹¹

THE MISSION, THE SCHOOLS, AND THE GROWTH OF ANGLICANISM

School establishment policy was critical to Christian proselytization in twentieth-century West Africa. Many studies have stressed the significant role played by missionary schools as a tool for conversion. K. Asare Opoku asserted that, 'it was through the innumerable schools established by missionaries that many Africans came into contact with Christianity, and in fact school was the church in many parts of Africa'.¹² 'Formal education', Felix Ekechi said, was the bait with which the young generation was 'enticed to Christianity'.¹³ It was the 'chief means of Christian expansion'.¹⁴ E. A. Ayande, a pioneer

⁹ Miranda K. Hassett, *Anglican Communion in Crisis: How Episcopal Dissidents and Their African Allies are Reshaping Anglicanism* (Princeton, NJ, 2009), pp. 47–8.

¹⁰ Hassett, *Anglican Communion in Crisis*, pp. 48–9.

¹¹ Hassett, 'Episcopal Dissidents', p. 88; Michael Marshall, *Church at the Crossroads: Lambeth 1988* (San Francisco, CA, 1988), p. 68.

¹² K. Asare Opoku, 'Religion in Africa during the Colonial Era', in A. Adu Boahen (ed.), *UNESCO General History of Africa*, vol. VII: *Africa under Colonial Domination, 1880–1935* (Berkeley and London, 1985), p. 526.

¹³ Felix K. Ekechi, *Missionary Enterprise and Rivalry in Igboland, 1857–1914* (New York, 1972), p. 176.

¹⁴ Jehu J. Hanciles, 'Conversion and Social Change: A Review of the "Unfinished Task" in West Africa', in Donald M. Lewis (ed.), *Christianity Reborn: The Global Expansion of Evangelicalism in the Twentieth Century* (Grand Rapids, MI, 2004), pp. 157–80.

scholar of West African Christianity, had observed that ‘the credit for the advent of Western education in Africa goes entirely to Christian missions’.¹⁵ All European Christian missions considered that some literacy was essential to Africans becoming Christians. Also, colonial governments with thin budget lines for education were happy to make use of missionary structures and resources, taking up some oversight and regulatory roles in return for grants which they extended to qualified mission schools.¹⁶

By the First World War, Fourah Bay College in Sierra Leone, the premier Church Missionary Society (CMS) training institution turned college had affiliated to Durham University (in 1876) and had trained over one hundred clergy, including the first Anglican bishop, Samuel Ajayi Crowther.¹⁷ As noted by Ayandele, who was otherwise critical of missionary enterprise, thanks to Fourah Bay College: ‘From 1876 onwards University education became available in West Africa, its graduates holding degrees of the University of Durham... Fourah Bay College became the nursery of high-level man-power deployed mainly in the Church, but also to the advantage of secondary schools and the civil service of former British West Africa.’¹⁸

In 1910, the Anglican mission in Sierra Leone was managing thirty-nine primary schools in addition to two secondary schools, one each for boys and girls, and the Fourah Bay College.¹⁹ In Nigeria, the CMS opened its first secondary school in 1859, followed by many more elementary and secondary schools. Though they were latecomers in Ghana, the Anglican missions established secondary schools much earlier than the Presbyterians, whose first secondary school was opened in 1938.²⁰ The Society for the Propagation of the Gospel (SPG) opened their first boys’ secondary school, Adisadel College, in 1910. By 1929, they had established secondary schools for girls at Sekondi, Accra, Kumase, and Mampong. They also opened St Augustine’s Theological College in Kumase in 1924.²¹ The Anglican Church’s role in the production of Ghanaian Western-educated elites who participated in anti-colonialist activities was significant. For instance, ‘300 students of Adisadel College... were reported by the Society as joining in the [Ghanaian] nationalist riot in 1948’.²²

The growth of the Anglican Church in West Africa remained uneven. Sierra Leone was a pioneer in the large numbers of converts produced in the early

¹⁵ E. A. Ayandele, *African Historical Studies* (London, 1979), p. 77.

¹⁶ Hewitt, *The Problems of Success*, pp. 4, 18; Obaro Ikime (ed.), *Groundwork of Nigerian History* (Ibadan, 1980), p. 574.

¹⁷ Hewitt, *The Problems of Success*, p. 19.

¹⁸ Ayandele, *African Historical Studies*, p. 83.

¹⁹ Sundkler and Steed, *A History of the Church in Africa*, p. 710.

²⁰ Sundkler and Steed, *A History of the Church in Africa*, p. 719.

²¹ Sundkler and Steed, *A History of the Church in Africa*, pp. 721, 724; J. S. Pobee, *The Anglican Story in Ghana: From Mission Beginnings to Province of Ghana* (Oxford, 2009), p. 162.

²² Daniel O’Connor and others, *Three Centuries of Mission: The United Society for the Propagation of the Gospel 1701–2000* (London, 2000), p. 125.

years of the mission due to the presence of ‘recaptives’—freed slaves—among whom there were large numbers of uprooted and traumatized young people.²³ Expansion outside of the colony by the Sierra Leone Anglican mission and by the US Episcopal Church in Liberia did not begin until the 1890s. Churches operated essentially among the recaptives and expatriates. The Susu and Temne people remained untouched, despite Anglicans’ brief start among them in 1808. The Krio, Western-educated recaptives of Sierra Leone, were largely responsible for the initial mid-nineteenth-century evangelization outreach that spread Protestant Christianity to other parts of West Africa, among the Yoruba on the Niger and, to a limited extent, the Niger Delta.²⁴ In Sierra Leone, following the extension of the railway northward in 1914, some expansion occurred but it was among emigrant ‘small groups of Krio traders and civil servants that have established themselves in these northern centres’.²⁵

In 1924, the deposed Asantehene, Prempeh I, returned to Ghana as a devout Anglican convert. He died in 1931 a patron of the Church, succeeded by Prempeh II, who was crowned in St Cyprian’s (Anglican) Church, Kumase. All this boosted the movement to join the Church, so that the parish the king attended became the second largest Anglican congregation of any in the region.²⁶ Prior to this royal development, between 1901 and 1914, two groups of migrants had independently pioneered Anglican congregations in Ghana.²⁷ The first was a nucleus of Anglican Yoruba migrants to the Gold Coast gold mines and the second group arose from the Wade Harris movement, a non-denominational prophetic movement initiated by William Wade Harris who claimed to have been commissioned as a prophet by the Archangel Gabriel. From Liberia, Harris crossed over to Ivory Coast and Ghana in 1913–14, and in two years made 100,000 converts. But he did not establish a Church and his converts either formed their own independent Harrist churches or joined existing mission churches.²⁸

But wherever the educational strategy in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries ran into trouble, the prospect of the formation of relatively large early congregations of Anglican adherents were slim. Sierra Leone protectorate’s financial problems prevented it sustaining viable school and evangelistic programmes until 1926, when the CMS mission resumed those responsibilities.²⁹ In the Gambia too, the CMS’s school strategy also failed. Though

²³ R. W. July, *The Origins of Modern African Thought: Its Development in West Africa during the Nineteenth and Twentieth Centuries* (Trenton, NJ, 2004), p. 131.

²⁴ Sundkler and Steed, *A History of the Church in Africa*, p. 706; Hewitt, *The Problems of Success*, pp. 10–11; Adrian Hastings, *The Church in Africa 1450–1950* (Oxford, 2004), p. 341.

²⁵ Sundkler and Steed, *A History of the Church in Africa*, p. 714.

²⁶ Sundkler and Steed, *A History of the Church in Africa*, pp. 219, 725–6.

²⁷ Sundkler and Steed, *A History of the Church in Africa*, pp. 218–19.

²⁸ Sundkler and Steed, *A History of the Church in Africa*, pp. 197–200.

²⁹ Sundkler and Steed, *A History of the Church in Africa*, p. 709.

Bishop John Daly established an Anglican Training Centre in Kristi Kunda in 1940, it was shut down as much for lack of converts as for lack of local financial sustainability.³⁰ This resulted, first, in too few local children recruited or reached, implying a lack of influence among the larger community. Second, the Gambian mission thereby lacked the capacity to produce (and reproduce) its own clergy and Christian elite to serve, like the elite in Nigeria, as early local translators of the foreign to the local. The Gambian Anglican congregations relied on importing Sierra Leonian Krio and British or European priests to serve them.³¹

In the case of Liberia, membership in the established mainline Churches, including the Episcopal Church which became part of the Anglican Diocese of West Africa in 1975, has been identified as a marker of upper class status, especially for the American-Liberians. The extent to which the Episcopal Church, before it merged with the Anglicans, functioned as an institution to reproduce and conserve elite status within the settler group is not clear, and probably only manifested later as the Anglican Church was not initially popular with the colonists (settlers). But by 1917 it was the most influential Evangelical denomination, and up until the 1960s it remained the 'favoured Church of the elite'.³²

WEST AFRICAN ANGLICANISM AND THE ALADURA/PROPHETIC MOVEMENT

Ethiopianism, the challenge of European missionary hegemony, and ethno-centrism in the Church, survived into the twentieth century. Ethiopianism morphed and diversified into local, cultural, and nationalist questioning of foreignness, not only in governance, but also in church rituals, structures, and theology. It thus 'provided the seed-plot for the emergence of Prophet-Healing movements in West Africa'.³³ In Nigeria, the Anglican Church found itself facing a storm of cultural and theological rebellion which eventually produced the Aladura (or prophetic) Church movement. Largely a development in Nigeria's missionary Christianity, the breakaway movements soon registered their presence in colonial Ghana, Sierra Leone, and the Gambia as branch

³⁰ Christine Elizabeth Curley, 'Anglican Stagnation and Growth in West Africa: The Case of St. Paul's Church, Fajara, the Gambia', Master's thesis, Faculty of Wycliffe College and the History Department of the Toronto School of Theology, 2012.

³¹ Curley, 'Anglican Stagnation', pp. 40, 48.

³² Paul Gifford, *Christianity and Politics in Doe's Liberia* (Cambridge, 2002), p. 53, quoting Merran Fraenkel, *Tribes and Class in Monrovia* (London, 1964), pp. 159–61.

³³ Hanciles, 'Conversion and Social Change', p. 169.

congregations of mostly, but not exclusively, Nigerian expatriates. This was an important dynamic that shaped Anglicanism in Nigeria and West Africa.

The Aladura phenomenon originated in the context of an epidemiological crisis before which the Church stood powerless. The traditional Yoruba religion combined both the religious and the medical spheres, with many priests and diviners also knowledgeable as herbalists. They prescribed for health, and linked their clients to their gods, as well as providing the medical solutions to ill-health. Religion was thus a tangible element in the local understanding of causes and solutions to ills and misfortunes. The CMS and SPG clinics and hospitals, though instruments in evangelism, were nonetheless held by the Church to be exterior to spirituality. The 1918 Spanish influenza pandemic quickly exposed the weakness of this type of spirituality to the Africans. An outbreak of bubonic plague and an economic crash soon followed in Lagos. Both the Church and its clinics proved unable to offer solutions to the calamities of this period. Those Nigerian Anglican Christians who held on to a traditional view of the role of religion felt themselves justified in asking for and expecting results from their devotion to the new Christian God. They expected cures to flow from the ritual and liturgy of the Church.³⁴ They thus formed praying bands to secure divine healing at a time of pandemics.

Thus began the rise of the prophetic movement within the Anglican Churches with its enchanted view of Christianity. The leaders of these praying associations gave serious consideration to dreams and visions, and to a literal commitment to, and understanding of, the miraculous in the Bible. Thus Anglican convert Moses Orimolade, who had been ill for many years, was healed following instructions he received from dreams and visions of angels that accompanied fervent and persistent prayers. Similarly, Abiodun Akinson went into a trance in which she saw angels and received instructions for evangelism. These new lay African leaders within the local Anglican churches eventually asserted their equal right to (re)interpret the Bible and to administer their new liturgy. They claimed authority from the angelic realm, thus bypassing the official Church hierarchy and theological certification. The emergence of these lay leaders, prophets, and visionaries, developing 'authority rivalling that of the Church' was clearly a worrying development for the Church.³⁵ The prophets and their supporters therefore were either driven from or left the Anglican Church. Thus began the Aladura/prophetic and faith-healing movement and the consequent extension of Christianity it brought to Nigeria.

The Anglican Church was successful, perhaps inadvertently, in the development of social capital by producing a dynamic local leadership able to mobilize large sections of their people towards a vision of an Africanized

³⁴ Sundkler and Steed, *A History of the Church in Africa*, pp. 674–5, 732.

³⁵ Sundkler and Steed, *A History of the Church in Africa*, p. 515.

Church and theology. It was a victim of its own success, however. It was tardy in accommodating their vision and demand for indigenous ownership and leadership, and it was unable to meet the people's spiritual demand for a Church ritually relevant to their health, wealth, and well-being. Out of this failure within the Anglican Church there emerged a number of breakaway prophetic Churches like the Christ Army Church (1916), the Christ Apostolic Church movement (1918), the Cherubim and Seraphim Church (1925), and the Church of the Lord (1925), led by Anglican laymen and women like Moses Orimolade, Joseph Shadare, Bamatope, Isaac Akinyele, Josiah Oshitelu, and Babalola.³⁶

Garrick Braide's prophetic movement and the eventual rise of his Christ Army Church occurred in an Anglican archdeaconry that had itself witnessed a powerful Ethiopianist secession about twenty years before. Garrick Sokari Braide (c.1882–1918) was baptized in 1910 and confirmed by Archdeacon James Johnson, a leading Ethiopianist, and Braide was accepted as a lay Anglican preacher by the Church hierarchy.³⁷ He de-emphasized an elitist need for lengthy drawn out instructions. Proclamation of belief in Jesus Christ, renunciation of local gods, and surrender and destruction of local idols and images, were all he demanded before immediately baptizing his converts. The theological and cosmological contexts that produced the movement were comparable to those for the Aladura movement of Western Nigeria. Because in his lifetime he refused to start a Church, Braide's revival meetings produced converts that thronged the Anglican as well as other missionary Churches among the Ijaw, Kalabari, and southern Igbo communities.³⁸ Braide's theology and his charismatic authority deriving from angelic revelations antagonized and alarmed the Anglican leadership. The crowds he drew also alarmed a jittery colonial government. Antipathy by both led to Braide's arrest and imprisonment. This triggered the secession of his followers from the Anglican Church to the Christ Army Church. It rivalled the Anglican Church, reduced its membership base, but also challenged it to greater exertions.³⁹

How did the European and African leadership of the Anglican mission react to the Aladura movement? According to Thomas Higgins, initially very temperately.⁴⁰ In reality, this moderate opposition was because they feared further loss of Church members to these groups. In addition, they soon

³⁶ Hewitt, *The Problems of Success*, pp. 38–9.

³⁷ Hanciles, 'Conversion and Social Change', pp. 168–9.

³⁸ G. O. M. Tasié, *Christian Missionary Enterprise: In the Niger Delta 1864–1918* (Leiden, 1978).

³⁹ Hanciles, 'Conversion and Social Change', p. 170; Sundkler and Steed, *A History of the Church in Africa*, p. 233.

⁴⁰ Thomas W. Higgins, 'Prophet, Priest and King in Colonial Africa: Anglican and Colonial Political Responses to African Independent Churches in Nigeria and Kenya, 1918–1960', PhD thesis, University of Edinburgh, 2010, 'Motion No. 8'; Toyin Falola and Matthew M. Heaton, *A History of Nigeria* (Cambridge, 2008), p. 19.

realized that their own missionary Church did not satisfy the congregants' legitimate spiritual aspirations and goals. The members craved a Christian religious expression that spoke meaningfully and in local cultural terms, like the traditional religions and gods did, to domestic health and well-being, business, and political or social life issues. The mission Church leadership observed that the theology and rituals of the prayer clubs within the Anglican Church, which eventually transformed into the Aladura church groups, were so empowering as to convince long-time Anglican Africans that this prayer-band Christianity, unlike their regular mission Christianity, afforded a spirituality that superseded what local gods, charms, and charm makers and sellers could offer. The diocesan Anglican bishop, Melville Jones, commented:

We should in the first place clean our own houses. When the Diamond Society [a praying band] in Ijebu Ode started, I went there to address them. I took from them all the idols and charms etc. taken from members of our [Anglican] church there. When Seraphim [praying movement] just started, one prominent member of our [Anglican] Church brought two large baskets full of charms to my courtyard taken [at a Seraphim religious meeting] from [mainline missionary church] Christians. When they [the Cherubim and Seraphim] started, they showed... the corruptions in the [Anglican] Church. Let the [Anglican Church] pastors teach the people not to place their confidence in charms.⁴¹

The bishop thus noted that one way to stem the crisis of confidence in the Anglican Church shown by members exiting into the new movements was to work out a spirituality that could match that of the praying bands.

It should be noted also that the prophetic movement, first within the Anglican Church and later autonomously, was produced out of the restricted leadership opportunities that the emerging lay, and at times clerical, educated Africans elites faced, compared with the narrow rank of ordained Europeans and their few African peers. In some instances, this played out as competition or, worse, antipathy between a 'rebellious' lay leader and a 'high-handed' Anglican cleric, or situations in which the opposition was accused of being 'jealous of the increasing popularity of the new African leaders' with their prophetic appeal.⁴²

Analogous to the rise of the praying bands was the formation of women's guilds and societies within the Anglican Church. They were the most common avenue for women to express their aspirations, demonstrate their devotion and skills, and otherwise to express their Christian female self-identity and leadership abilities. Sierra Leone's Martha Davies Confidential Benevolent Association was founded after its leader, Mrs Martha Davies, an Anglican, saw Jesus Christ in a dream in 1910. Many more organizations were established

⁴¹ Higgins, 'Prophet, Priest, and King in Colonial Africa', pp. 19–20.

⁴² Higgins, 'Prophet, Priest, and King in Colonial Africa', pp. 14–17.

as 'prayer and hymn-singing groups', with an emphasis on faith-healing and 'feeding the soul'.⁴³ Similar Anglican women's associations in Ghana included the Women's Guild of St Mary, the Guild of the Good Shepherd, the Rosary Guild, and the Guild of St Anne's created in the 1920s, all engaging in social work, church work, and organizing Christmas or Easter festivities.⁴⁴ These developments were significant responses to the patriarchal ethos that guided the Church, which was clearly discriminatory against the female. Women were significant players as leaders in the prophetic movement in Nigeria and in the various guilds they established in which they channelled their creativity and aspirations.

LOCAL CLERGY AND THE PROSPECTS OF THE CHURCH

In the Gold Coast and Sierra Leone, the Anglican mission was slow in developing capable and sufficient indigenous clerical leadership. The Anglican Church in Ghana had consecrated only three native clergy by 1924.⁴⁵ This lapse meant that its lightly educated catechists, who were better suited for work in the rural areas, lacked the capacity and competence to expand the Church in the burgeoning urban communities.⁴⁶ In fact, much early twentieth-century Church development in Ghana was done 'largely independently of the missionaries' and was work that 'maintained itself, to a great extent, by its own [local] leadership'.⁴⁷ The failure in dealing with Church structure, however, was coupled with and reinforced failure in transforming the culture into an indigenous Ghanaian one. John Pobee noted that the Anglican Church 'in Fante... was and continues to be called *abanmu asor*, the Church of the Castle, the government's Church, a privileged Church', noting that 'for nearly 250 years, the Prayer Book services prayed for the English sovereign but not for local kings and chiefs'.⁴⁸ It therefore did not develop capacity to expand beyond 'Accra, Winneba, Sekondi and Kumasi', where its missionaries and its churches were all located.⁴⁹ The Ghanaian

⁴³ Sundkler and Steed, *A History of the Church in Africa*, p. 712; Hewitt, *The Problems of Success*, p. 13.

⁴⁴ Sundkler and Steed, *A History of the Church in Africa*, pp. 710, 725.

⁴⁵ Paul Jenkins, 'The Anglican Church in Ghana, 1905-24 (I)', *Transactions of the Historical Society of Ghana*, 15 (1974): 23-39 (p. 35).

⁴⁶ John S. Pobee, 'The Anglican Church in Ghana and the SPG', in O'Connor and others, *Three Centuries of Mission*, pp. 409-22 (p. 415).

⁴⁷ Jenkins, 'The Anglican Church (I)', p. 35.

⁴⁸ Pobee, 'The Anglican Church in Ghana and the SPG', p. 411.

⁴⁹ Pobee, 'The Anglican Church in Ghana and the SPG', p. 411.

Anglican churches' mode of worship during this period, beyond the introduction of 'drums, Kente or adinkra symbols', was a 'regurgitating of the received English tradition'.⁵⁰ The principle of local self-support was not developed either, compounding the failure of the Church in Ghana. Pobeé argued that African successors to the European leadership have, even now, been unable to transcend the received English tradition to effectively stamp a local native Ghanaian tradition on their Anglican Christianity.⁵¹

Much of the expansion within the CMS was thus birthed through the tireless work of African lay and clerical agents, catechists, teachers, and other devout men and women. By 1917, in competition with the Roman Catholics, the Anglican mission had established quite a few mission stations in Western Igboland of Nigeria. Conversion surged and congregations slowly multiplied once the initial stigmatization of Christian converts as saboteurs, colonial collaborators, and as slaves or ex-slaves died out.⁵² The growth of colonial urban, industrial, and transportation infrastructure in north-east Igboland also helped to structure the spread. The local hero of the Anglican effort was Isaac Ejindu, who operated as a CMS agent unsupervised directly by a white superior until about 1928. In the late 1910s, he suffered persecution and his school and church planting efforts were thwarted in western and south-western Igboland by chief Onyeama of Eke who switched his patronage over to the Catholics because they were willing to open schools that provided instruction in English rather than in vernacular as the Anglicans did. Ejindu's tireless efforts paid off in north-eastern Igboland which he secured for the Anglicans by the mid-1920s.⁵³

While the issue of racism was always close to the surface and affected the European missionaries' treatment or recognition of hard-working African agents like Ejindu, competition and jealousies occurred among the European CMS missionaries too. The impact this had on the rate and quality of evangelistic expansion is not too clear, but it seems to have furthered the competitive establishment of missions and schools and boosted the egos of the European agents and missionaries who quickly established oversight of the emerging centres started by local leaders. On the other hand, it might also have dampened the enthusiasm of the African agents.⁵⁴ However, neither among the western nor the northern Igbo was there any schismatic movement as in Yorubaland, perhaps because Anglican success was slower and occurred later

⁵⁰ Pobeé, 'The Anglican Church in Ghana and the SPG', pp. 418–19.

⁵¹ Pobeé, 'The Anglican Church in Ghana and the SPG', p. 418.

⁵² Ogbu Kalu, *The Embattled Gods: Christianization of Igboland, 1841–1991* (Minaj, 1996), pp. 100–4.

⁵³ Kalu, *The Embattled Gods*, pp. 115, 123–4.

⁵⁴ This unfortunately is not clearly developed in either Ekechi, *Missionary Enterprise* or in M. Bassey, 'Missionary Rivalry and Educational Expansion in Southern Nigeria, 1885–1932', *Journal of Negro Education*, 60 (1991): 36–46.

here than in Yorubaland. Southern Igboland though, welcomed the prophetic and revivalist movement of Garrick Braide. The origin of the Church here was also based on local initiatives. As a prime commercial zone, migrating and itinerant Anglican converts and local (Ubani) merchants established chapels along the waterside in communities with which they traded, all of which the bishop was quick to consecrate.⁵⁵ In Central Igboland, chiefs like Nwaturuocha and many more became great advocates for the establishment of schools and of the Christian missions who supplied them, all producing a rapid spread of Anglicanism during the colonial period.

THE ANGLICAN CHURCH AND THE OTHER WEST AFRICAN RELIGIONS

The enchanted nature of traditional religions retained influence on some Anglican converts. Mission leadership, African and European, expressed concerns that their converts remained attracted and attached to 'charms and amulets, and the consultation of oracles, and the offering of road-side sacrifices and traditional burial rites'.⁵⁶ It is noteworthy that the proverbial success of the Aladura and other prophetic movements, especially in Nigeria of the 1920s and 1930s, was partly based on their offer of a power-based Christian spirituality able to match and outdo traditional religions. It was also based on their strong traditionalism, i.e. the reinterpretation of the Bible, liturgy, and general churchmanship within a traditional African context. Their practices promised adherents the ability to completely do away with charms, amulets, and references to ancestors, or the need for propitiation through animal sacrifice. Some embraced a practice that did away with any use of medicine, traditional or Western, and rather relied on divine healing. Thus, their revival programmes produced among members of the Anglican Church such deep spiritual and emphatic responses that saw Anglican members surrender their charms, amulets, and other objects of traditional religious significance to bonfires at meetings held by the prophetic Churches.⁵⁷

In Muslim northern Nigeria, the Anglican mission faced a persistent wall of opposition from the Muslim rulers, resulting in the virtual absence of converts. Believing missionary activities could stir up resentment and revolt against colonial rule, the government was cold towards the missions. The priority to maintain law and order was the chief justification used by Frederick Lugard for his anti-missionary policy:

⁵⁵ Ekechi, *Missionary Enterprise*, pp. 140–2. ⁵⁶ Hewitt, *The Problems of Success*, p. 5.

⁵⁷ Hewitt, *The Problems of Success*, p. 5; and Higgins, 'Prophet, Priest and King in Colonial Africa', pp. 19–20.

as the officer entrusted by His Majesty with the maintenance of peace and good order in Northern Nigeria, I am of opinion that the establishment of Christian Missions in Mohammedan centres only recently brought under the control of the Administration constitutes a cause of distrust among such of the population as are devout Mohammedans.⁵⁸

This became the precedent for subsequent hostile policy positions towards Christian missions by all colonial administrations in northern Nigeria. As Ayandele argued, ‘The customs and institutions of the people [Muslims] began to receive at first sympathy, then sentimentality and ultimately veneration . . . [T]he missions were not encouraged to do institutional work.’⁵⁹ CMS missionary Dr Walter Miller advocated a school-based evangelistic programme, which by 1917 met a brick wall of government opposition.⁶⁰ Hence the sentiment in the literature is that in Muslim northern Nigeria the colonial administration gave Islam an advantage over missionary Christianity. In addition, the pagans to whom the missions were permitted free access were placed politically under Muslim Fulani district heads.⁶¹ Muslim citizens in non-Muslim-majority states in pre-colonial Nigeria were also much more effectively resistant to mission Christianity, and Anglican agents had taken note of this long before Lugard’s hostile stance.⁶²

When Miller’s brainchild, the church school and hospital, came on-stream in 1929, it was at Wusasa village, outside the emirate capital city, Zaria. Here, the local mission workers were not natives of Zaria but expatriates from among the Ngas of the plateau region of Nigeria. The Church start-up here thus lacked local translators, and consequently did not prosper as a local church rooted in its immediate locality.⁶³

Immigrant quarters, called Sabon Gari, in the Muslim cities of Kano, Kaduna, or Zaria, populated predominantly by Western-educated and literate Christians, and traders and civil servants from southern Nigeria, fared better. In the late 1920s and early 1930s, immigrants built churches in their quarters, Anglicans among them, to cater to their Christian southern migrant constituents in this way.⁶⁴ In the Nigerian Middle Belt, on the central plateau, at Panyam and Kabwir, the foundation of the Anglican Church was laid in CMS partnership with the Cambridge University Missionary Party (CUMP) agents.

⁵⁸ F. D. Lugard to the CMS Committee, Abinger Commons, Surrey, London, 27 Oct. 1903. G3A3LS Letter Book, 1898–1905. Church Missionary Society (CMS) Nigeria: Niger Mission 1880–1934. Microfilm, Adam Matthew Digital, UK.

⁵⁹ E. A. Ayandele, *Nigerian Historical Studies* (London, 2005), p. 101.

⁶⁰ Ayandele, *Nigerian Historical Studies*, pp. 165–7.

⁶¹ Benjamin A. Kwashi, ‘The Church of Nigeria (Anglican Communion)’, in Ian S. Markham, J. Barney Hawkins IV, Justyn Terry, and Leslie Nuñez Steffensen (eds.), *The Wiley-Blackwell Companion to the Anglican Communion* (Chichester, 2013), pp. 165–83 (p. 169).

⁶² Kwashi, ‘The Church of Nigeria’, p. 168.

⁶³ Kwashi, ‘The Church of Nigeria’, p. 170.

⁶⁴ Sundkler and Steed, *A History of the Church in Africa*, p. 649.

The European missionaries did translation work, built the first hospital in the area, and evangelized. But they also began to recruit local Nigerian agents, who then went ahead to assist in furthering the pioneering evangelistic work among the Ngas.⁶⁵

The Anglican experience in Muslim-dominated Gambia was not much different from their northern Nigerian one, where growth was paltry. The minimal impact on a largely Muslim country was already evident during the early colonial period. The formation of an autonomous Gambia and the Rio Pongas Diocese in 1935 turned out to be no more than an Anglican chaplaincy that ministered to European settlers and already-converted Krio.⁶⁶ Sierra Leone too never ceased to be a Muslim-majority society. Once the early Anglican mission work of Henry Brunton from 1797–8 and of Peter Hartwig, Melchior Renner, Leopold Butschet, Gustavus Nylander, and Johann Prasse between 1808 and 1817 among the Susu was called off to focus on the recaptives in the colony, evangelism in the interior of Sierra Leone virtually ceased.⁶⁷ On the contrary, colonialism saw Islam expand there. The strength of Islam was equally obvious in Lagos in western Nigeria, and by the turn of the century, apart from the overwhelming preponderance of devotees of traditional religions, Muslims had grown to about one-third of Lagos's population.⁶⁸ The Anglican Church thus had a powerful competitor in the Muslims (and in the Methodists).

ON THE EVE OF INDEPENDENCE AND AFTER

John Pobee argued that up to the eve of independence, in the 1950s, the Anglican Church in Ghana espoused a narrowly pro-imperialist view—largely because it remained under European leadership. The slogan reportedly employed by Bishop John Aglionby (1924–51) for his expansion plan was 'Join your King's Church'. Though seeking to woo and patronize African elites, it bred a view among many Ghanaians that the Anglican Church was elitist, colonialist, and its African members consequently co-opted imperialist supporters.⁶⁹ The Anglican leadership condemned the leading nationalist

⁶⁵ Kwashi, 'The Church of Nigeria', pp. 171–3.

⁶⁶ Curley, 'Anglican Stagnation and Growth', pp. 33–5, 44–5.

⁶⁷ Bruce L. Mouser, 'Origins of Church Missionary Society Accommodation to Imperial Policy: The Sierra Leone Quagmire and the Closing of the Susu Mission, 1804–17', *Journal of Religion in Africa*, 39 (2009): 375–402 (pp. 379–80); Hewitt, *The Problems of Success*, p. 10.

⁶⁸ Ayandele, *Nigerian Historical Studies*, p. 149.

⁶⁹ Pobee, 'The Anglican Church in Ghana and the SPG', pp. 418–19. For a partial concession to this view, see also William L. Sachs, *The Transformation of Anglicanism: From State Church to Global Communion* (Cambridge, 1993), pp. 179–80.

party ideology and was said to have persecuted Anglican priests who supported the radical nationalist Convention People's Party (CPP).⁷⁰ Tardier than other missions, the Church in Ghana failed to appoint an African successor to the European bishops John Aglionby (1924–51) and John Charles Sydney Daly (1951–5), at a crucial time of fervent nationalism in the 1950s and global transition from colonial rule to political independence. Though European clergy within the Ghanaian Anglican establishment were in the minority, by independence, as O'Connor noted, the retention of a white leadership at the top generated some 'anti-colonial... feeling' in and towards the Church.⁷¹ When in 1962 Bishop Reginald Richard Roseveare, obviously reflecting the era's Cold War sensibilities, criticized the 'dictatorial tendencies' in the self-declared communist government of Nkrumah who won the transition election, he was expelled. As the CPP was the most popular nationalist party in Ghana and West Africa, it was logical that the government and the elite allied with Nkrumah concluded that the Church was a partisan on the side of the opposition United Gold Coast Convention at best; and at worst, was against the liberation of Ghana from imperialism.⁷²

After independence and since the 1970s, issues of development, poverty, falling standards of living, poor governance, youth unemployment, war, and religious violence came to preoccupy Christian West Africans, just like they preoccupied their colleagues of other beliefs. Unfortunately, not much research has been done on how local Anglican Churches engaged with these issues.

As the Anglican Church grew in the 1970s and 1980s in Nigeria, consolidation of parishes into administrative dioceses became politicized, and the location or relocation of diocesan headquarters became contentious. Discord, rifts, and litigations, all blights that Iheanyi Enwerem says afflicted Nigerian Churches in general, came into play.⁷³ Ecclesiastical authority within the Church came under contention between lay and clergy, tempers flared, and secular law and lawyers took centre stage in the definition and organization of Church life. In a troubled Lagos Diocese, Enwerem concluded that its problems were 'centered around the affluent Anglicans' who 'wanted their wishes to prevail over those of the constituted Anglican authority'.⁷⁴ Analogous trends in Sierra Leone predated independence. There, as early as the 1880s, the elite lay membership of the Pastorate had demanded a meaningful say in plotting the direction of the Church and in its administration. They continued

⁷⁰ Pobe, 'The Anglican Church in Ghana and the SPG', p. 412.

⁷¹ O'Connor and others, *Three Centuries of Mission*, p. 125; Pobe, 'The Anglican Church in Ghana and the SPG', pp. 413–14.

⁷² O'Connor and others, *Three Centuries of Mission*, p. 135.

⁷³ Iheanyi M. Enwerem, *A Dangerous Awakening: The Politicization of Religion in Nigeria* (Ibadan, 1995), pp. 160–1.

⁷⁴ Enwerem, *A Dangerous Awakening*, p. 161.

to challenge the ‘preponderance of clerical influence’ and denounced ‘clerical authoritarianism’. As the financiers of the Church they demanded to have their voice heard.⁷⁵

In 1980 the Christian Association of Nigeria (CAN) officially emerged as the umbrella group for all Church denominations in the country. It became the champion of Christians’ rights nationally, but especially in the Muslim north where an Islamic agenda that suppressed, oppressed, and discriminated against Christians of northern Nigerian origin was felt to operate.⁷⁶ Henceforth, CAN, rather than each individual Church and denomination, was the most important body to engage government and the Muslim establishment in discussions that increasingly were defined as much in religious as in geopolitical terms.

Between 1945 and 1980, the growth of Christianity in West Africa, with Anglican membership being in top position, was phenomenal.⁷⁷ Even more dramatic since the 1970s was the efflorescence of the neo-Pentecostal movement.⁷⁸ In enticing very substantial youth membership, Pentecostalism has posed a major challenge to Churches like the Anglican.⁷⁹ The Pentecostal Churches engage in rhetoric and liturgy that subsumes material social, economic, and political structures under spiritual authority. Their charismatic praxis, and the attendant pneumatic capacities, have endowed them with authority claims to resolve all problems by spiritual means. They profess thoroughly enchanted theologies that enable them to conceive of any problem—social or domestic, micro or macro—as subject to resolution through Pentecostal spiritual practice. Like the Aladura before them, they lay claim to prompt access to God’s power to miraculously empower people for economic, material, political, and spiritual success. This was good news in the context of the trauma of social, economic, and political crises that afflicted individuals, families, and the nations of West Africa in recent years. The desertion from the European-formed denominations to the neo-Pentecostal movement has been unprecedented.⁸⁰

In addition to the contextually relevant theology, Pentecostals replaced the ‘dignified and solemn worship’ style of the mainline Churches with loud and ecstatic worship and singing.⁸¹ They spoke in tongues (glossolalia) and imbibed literal biblicism which allowed the wielding of scriptural authority by the

⁷⁵ J. J. Hanciles, *Euthanasia of a Mission: African Church Autonomy in a Colonial Context* (Westport, CT, 2002), pp. 210–11.

⁷⁶ Enwerem, *A Dangerous Awakening*, pp. 75–88.

⁷⁷ J. D. Y. Peel, ‘Religious Change in Yorubaland’, *Africa: Journal of the International African Institute*, 37 (1967): 292–306.

⁷⁸ Ruth Marshall, *Political Spiritualities: The Pentecostal Revolution in Nigeria* (Chicago, IL, 2009).

⁷⁹ Archbishop of Lokoja, Nigeria, email communication with author, 22 July 2015.

⁸⁰ Philip Jenkins, *The Next Christendom: The Coming of Global Christianity* (Oxford, 2002).

⁸¹ Jesse Zink, ‘“Anglocostalism” in Nigeria: Neo-Pentecostalism and Obstacles to Anglican Unity’, *Journal of Anglican Studies*, 10 (2012): 231–50 (p. 239).

convert who could engage in performative scriptural declarations that are powerfully motivational.⁸² Much like the Roman Catholics' response to Charismatism, the Anglican leadership was opposed to this new trend. However, rather than lose their young members to the neo-Pentecostal Churches, they have had to concede to the introduction of charismatic or Pentecostal elements in worship and other Church practices. Jesse Zink has called this development 'Anglocostalism', and believes that it is moving Nigerian and Ghanaian Anglican Churches away from the essence of Anglicanism.⁸³

The Pentecostal surge did not miss Sierra Leone and Liberia either. During the civil wars in Liberia (1986–99) and Sierra Leone (1991–2002), churches and mosques were not exempt from destruction nor their members from massacre, even within the precincts of the holy places where civilians had taken refuge. Ultimately though, the Churches were a significant player in the peace process in these countries. In April 1997, religious leaders in Sierra Leone came together to establish the Inter-Religious Council of Sierra Leone (IRCSL). The Liberian equivalent was the Inter-Faith Mediation Committee. These united all religions and every denomination of the Christians. The specific roles played by the Anglican and other Churches in these bodies, including in the Truth and Reconciliation Committee, remain unspecified. But these organizations undoubtedly helped to get the governments and the rebels to talk to each other and to broker the 1999 Lomé Peace Accord. The Churches in these countries were active in the rehabilitation of men and women who suffered psychological dislocation and post-traumatic stress disorder as a result of the civil wars. Many ex-soldiers and militants who perpetrated or suffered from horrendous atrocities have been restored by the Christian Churches' positive social intervention programmes. However, a close reading of the materials for Liberia and Sierra Leone highlights the important charismatic or Pentecostal 'born-again' character of the experiences of most of such rehabilitated veterans.⁸⁴ The Pentecostal technique has been so successful in the reconstitution of the self and of a new peaceful, useful, and responsible identity that hordes of fakes and charlatans have emerged in Liberia to copy these techniques and turn them into money-making religious business.⁸⁵

The mainline Churches in Liberia, presumably including the Anglican, have therefore been under pressure to engage with some Pentecostal techniques and ideas to remain competitive. Methodist bishop Arthur Kulah admonished the

⁸² Zink, "Anglocostalism" in Nigeria', pp. 237–8.

⁸³ Zink, "Anglocostalism" in Nigeria', pp. 241–2.

⁸⁴ Stephen Ellis, *The Mask of Anarchy: The Destruction of Liberia and the Religious Dimension of an African Civil War* (London, 1999), pp. 266–9.

⁸⁵ Ellis, *Mask of Anarchy*, pp. 268–9.

mainline seminaries to equip their students with the tools needed to make them as competitive as the Pentecostals:

the older and wealthier missionary churches must learn to use techniques valued in traditional Liberian society such as 'dream interpretations, making sacrifices, healing, handling fear, and dealing with the concept of the exercise of power and the place of freedom'. They should teach 'the theology of witchcraft, fear, dreams and human sacrifice' with a view, of course, to eradicating evil wherever they find it.⁸⁶

As economic crisis broke out in West Africa from the 1970s, Church programme funding, including for clergy remuneration, building and upgrading church buildings, and training institutes became an issue. Until the 1960s the richest and most powerful members of the political and economic class were Anglican, Methodist, or Roman Catholic Church members. There has been a shift towards the prosperity-believing and economic-networking suave Pentecostal Churches, whose prosperity doctrine promotes wealth and riches, and the rich and powerful, as indications of divine blessing. Consequently, this is where the upwardly mobile middle class are now mostly concentrated rather than in the Anglican Churches.⁸⁷ Though provincial and diocesan experiences differed, one effect of the Pentecostal efflorescence on the mainline Churches was to challenge them to also innovate in regard, for example, to fundraising. This has 'driven the Church into investments and other business concerns with the attendant concerns about integrity and faithful stewardship'.⁸⁸

Some scholars have maintained that decolonization of the Church in West Africa is yet to be completed, with much left to accomplish in terms of contextualization of theology and inculturation.⁸⁹ How should the Church handle traditional life experiences like rites of passage, agricultural seasons, naming ceremonies, puberty rites, secret societies, and funerary rites for its members on a solid biblical ground? For Kalu Ogbu, the Anglican and Catholic churches in Nigeria handled this by having baptism and confirmation ceremonies so 'girded with rituals' as to effectively 'substitute for puberty rites'.⁹⁰ Among the Igbo, for instance, the issue of Christians taking the Ozo title had proved a challenge since before 1900. This institution provided rights and privileges to its members and constituted the highest social and political status that could be achieved by individual men in the community based on merit rather than birth. However, this institution and its responsibilities and

⁸⁶ Ellis, *Mask of Anarchy*, p. 302.

⁸⁷ 'Keeping up with the Pentecostals', Jesse Zink, *Mission Minded*, <<http://jessezink.com/2011/06/>> (accessed 11 June 2015); Asonzeh F.-K. Ukah, 'Those Who Trade with God Never Lose: The Economics of Pentecostal Activism in Nigeria', in Toyin Falola (ed.), *Christianity and Social Change in Africa: Essays in Honor of J. D. Y. Peel* (Durham, NC, 2005), pp. 253–74.

⁸⁸ Archbishop Egbunu, email communication with the author, 22 July 2015.

⁸⁹ Pobee, 'The Anglican Church in Ghana and the SPG', pp. 409–21.

⁹⁰ Kalu, *The Embattled Gods*, p. 317.

privileges were woven into traditional religious rituals. The pioneer Igbo Anglican leader, the Revd J. C. Taylor, in the 1860s, formed a Christian Relief Company as a mutual trust society to substitute for the Ozo title that Anglican converts felt excluded from. This was based on the partial view that Ozo title-taking was a social insurance system that could be recreated as a Christianized substitute. However as noted by Ogbu, it was more than this. Ozo-titling served as 'a means of sacralizing power'. It involved 'a ritual of covenanting with ancestral spirits and guardian spirits of the land conferring on the bearer the right to be present at the family shrine', overriding 'gerontocratic rights' and giving to the beneficiary, 'access to [a] decision making role in the community'. The title holder had to 'build a shrine and sacrifice blood'.⁹¹ Throughout the colonial period therefore, the Anglican Church was resistant to its Igbo members taking the Ozo title. Persistent pressure, however, prompted the Anglican (and Roman Catholic) Churches to create knight-hoods that members joined to earn comparable social status, and for the support and dignity they provided at burials which the traditional Ozo title conferred on its holders.⁹²

In the Yoruba Anglican Church, a cultural nationalist and Anglican clergyman, the Revd T. A. J. Ogunbiyi, supported by other Nigerian Christian elites, in 1914 founded the Christian Ogboni Society to Christianize the ancient Yoruba institution of Ogboni, which among the Egba was the ruling council, to which even the king was subject.⁹³ It wielded ritualized judicial and executive powers, and Ogunbiyi became convinced that the Ogboni cult, in a Christianized form, would produce a more binding fellowship than the rather loose brotherhood of the normal church congregation; and that the 'six degrees' of the Christian Ogboni Society would provide a more satisfying hierarchy than either the foreign Masonic lodges or the orders of ministry in the Anglican Church.⁹⁴ The Church remained unpersuaded of the possibility of assimilating the institution into Anglican Christian practice and stood steadfastly against it, withdrawing Ogunbiyi's licence as an Anglican clergyman on its account. Consequently, Ogunbiyi seceded to found his own independent Church.⁹⁵

In Sierra Leone and Liberia, the Poro Society remained the equivalent of the Ozo title-taking or Ogboni Society membership, and posed similar challenges to the Church.⁹⁶ Settlers in Liberia were said to have come with a Masonic and

⁹¹ Kalu, *The Embattled Gods*, pp. 85–6; see also, Azuka A. Dike, *The Resilience of Igbo Culture: A Case Study of Awka Town* (Enugu, 1985), pp. 98–116.

⁹² Kalu, *The Embattled Gods*, p. 318.

⁹³ Samuel Johnson, *The History of the Yorubas: From the Earliest Times to the Beginning of the British Protectorate* (Lagos, 1921), pp. 77–8.

⁹⁴ Hewitt, *The Problems of Success*, pp. 64–5.

⁹⁵ Hewitt, *The Problems of Success*, pp. 64–5.

⁹⁶ C. Fyfe, *A History of Sierra Leone* (Oxford, 1962), pp. 3, 11.

secret lodge society membership culture and, long before the Church was established in the colonies, European and Euro-African slave traders were known to have joined the Poro societies to improve their economic and socio-political prospects.⁹⁷ Up until the civil war of the 1990s, the Americo-Liberian political elite were able to assimilate into these traditional Poro societies. Leading politicians, including presidents who were Christians, and preachers, lay and clergy, were noted to have been leaders in the Poro (and for women, Sande) societies. The Poro Society was also very popular in Sierra Leone, but it is not clear in the existing literature the extent to which the Anglican Church allowed its theology to be traditionalized by the possible inclusion of Poro secret initiations and cultic rituals and practices that also involved blood sacrifices.⁹⁸ The Anglican and other missions had to deal with similar problems of whether or how to forbid, allow, or Christianize initiation, puberty, and circumcision rites in East Africa—rights that defined traditional man and womanhood.⁹⁹

In West Africa, the Church continued to grapple with the demand that it engage with some African social traditions that were critical to social identity and has responded, for example in Igboland, cautiously but creatively by substituting the traditional for a Church-designed institution. However, it has been difficult to accommodate social traditions and rituals that were themselves derived from and reinforcing of traditional religion in Church culture.

POPULAR MASS MEDIA TECHNOLOGIES

Nothing comparable to the studies on religion and the turn to the media by West African Pentecostal Churches has been done for the Anglican Church.¹⁰⁰ Mainline Churches approach media advertising and the use of media for income generation with wariness and reluctance. They are concerned not to breach the ethics of the free gospel. Their financial situation compared with

⁹⁷ Fyfe, *A History of Sierra Leone*, pp. 10, 11.

⁹⁸ Ellis, *Mask of Anarchy*, pp. 203, 225.

⁹⁹ Sundkler and Steed, *A History of the Church*, pp. 870–1, 887–90.

¹⁰⁰ Marleen de Witte, 'Modes of Binding, Moments of Bonding: Mediating Divine Touch in Ghanaian Pentecostalism and Traditionalism', in Birgit Meyer (ed.), *Aesthetic Formations: Media, Religion, and the Senses* (London, 2009), pp. 183–206; Ogbu U. Kalu, 'The Big Man of the Big God: Popular Culture, Media, and the Marketability of Religion', *New Theology Review*, 20 (2007): 15–26; Birgit Meyer and Annelies Moors (eds.), *Religion, Media, and Public Sphere* (Bloomington, IN, 2006); R. I. J. Hackett, 'Charismatic/Pentecostal Appropriation of Media Technologies in Nigeria and Ghana', *Journal of Religion in Africa*, 28 (1998): 258–77.

the big Pentecostal Churches also encourages parsimony in regards to the deployment of modern broadcast media technologies. Archbishop E. Egbunu of the diocese of Lokoja in central Nigeria stressed the necessity for the Church to guard against compromising its integrity and not commercializing religion by engaging unthinkingly with media technologies and advertisement.

Such guardedness in the Anglican missions dated to the 1900s and 1920s when the mission opened its hugely successful bookshop in Lagos. The CMS then pioneered in printing, largely for religious purposes, but also provided public commercial services for the production of pamphlets, notices, and advertisements. The Lagos bookshop, the first bookshop in West Africa, soon sprouted branches throughout Nigeria in Ebute Meta, Onitsha, Ilesha, Oshogbo; Egbu, Awka, Port Harcourt; Kano, Kaduna, and Zaria, and Freetown, Sierra Leone. The bookshop became the major supplier of educational print materials, generating considerable profit. It became the largest retail establishment in Lagos during this time, underwriting mission expenses.¹⁰¹ However, even its champions expressed wariness about its representation as a money-making business, and kept emphasizing its role as a tool of the gospel.¹⁰²

By the 1980s, the Pentecostal revolution saw Churches, especially the new Pentecostal ones, committing huge resources to the use of print, electronic, and audio-visual media to promote their image and message and to generate income. While the Anglican and other mainline Churches also used some broadcast media, including colourful posters and handbills, and placed advertisements on radio and television, they remained constrained by the fear that the use of popular media would compromise their message and identity and make their profession into a commodity. Nonetheless Anglican and other mainline Churches contested the dominance of the Pentecostal media cachet. Many, some of which this author has personal experience of, embraced the need to shake their worship free of boredom and transform their rituals through the use of sophisticated musical and audio-visual technologies in and outside the Church so as to tap into the restless energy of the youth.

CONCLUSION

The Anglican Church, like other Churches in West Africa, has had to deal with the issues surrounding cultural transformation—the Africanization of what was originally an English export. This history inevitably gave rise to the

¹⁰¹ Hewitt, *The Problems of Success*, pp. 58, 60–2.

¹⁰² Hewitt, *The Problems of Success*, p. 162.

question of how African Anglicans express their African culture through Anglicanism and Anglicanism through their culture and what was the nature of the balance. The boundaries of the Africanization project within the West African Anglican Church over the past century have involved a great deal of variation and contestation, including the embrace of the Ethiopianist and prophetic Church movements. The first period of this development before colonization and until about 1917 challenged, contested, and objected to European dictatorship over the Church, resisted the marginalization of African voices within it, denounced religious colonialism, and engaged with a motivational message of African spiritual and administrative capability. Development during the second period built on the gains of the first to demand a Church that fully expressed local West African cultural identity. However, it should be noted that more members remained in the Anglican Church than went into secession to realize these Africanization goals. The sudden and dramatic rise of the neo-Pentecostal movement beginning in the 1970s and its successful, if paradoxical, relationship to modernity and tradition, at the expense of the Anglican and other mainline Churches, has given the issue of indigenization and modernization continuing, even urgent, relevance. Overall, most West African Anglican Church members have been wary of the increasing prominence of charismatism in modern African expression of Christianity when it seems to challenge the administrative structures of the Church and its membership base. The movement towards prophets, dreamers, and Pentecostal faith-healing and the attendant disorderly democratization have put off many older members. However, by the 1980s, the increasing loss of their youth membership to a re-enchanted vision of the Church has encouraged Anglicans to experiment with Pentecostal-style methods and techniques, as a sop to the modernist sense of religious self that youths craved for when they decamped to Pentecostal Churches.

At the global level, West African Anglican Churches are among the many denominations deriving from the two-thirds world that hold strongly to the idea of maintaining biblicism as one of the marks of Anglican orthodoxy in the face of an increasingly liberal Euro-American Anglicanism. The local struggles to define the limit and boundaries of relevance for culture, custom, and local rites and practices in the Church are exactly reflected in the global struggle that William Sachs, Rosalind Hackett, and others have argued is tearing the global Anglican Communion apart. It is both a struggle over how much of the heritage of the past the Church should embrace, and how much of contemporary and trending fashions of the modern now, especially as defined by the West, the Church should embrace. In engaging with these issues, West African Anglicanism has inserted itself into the global religious politics of the global Anglican Communion as a member, and as a leader, and is increasingly considering itself the gate-keeper of orthodoxy.

SELECT BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Bassey, M. O., 'Missionary Rivalry and Educational Expansion in Southern Nigeria, 1885–1932', *Journal of Negro Education*, 60 (1991): 36–46.
- Curley, C. E., 'Anglican Stagnation and Growth in West Africa: The Case of St. Paul's Church, Fajara, the Gambia', Master's thesis, Faculty of Wycliffe College and the History Department of the Toronto School of Theology, 2012.
- Ekechi, F. K., *Missionary Enterprise and Rivalry in Igboland, 1857–1914* (New York, 1972).
- Ellis, S., *The Mask of Anarchy: The Destruction of Liberia and the Religious Dimension of an African Civil War* (London, 1999).
- Enwerem, I. M., *A Dangerous Awakening: The Politicization of Religion in Nigeria* (Ibadan, 1995).
- Fyfe, C., *A History of Sierra Leone* (Oxford, 1962).
- Hanciles, J. J., *Euthanasia of a Mission: African Church Autonomy in a Colonial Context* (Westport, CT, 2002).
- Hassett, M. K., *Anglican Communion in Crisis: How Episcopal Dissidents and Their African Allies are Reshaping Anglicanism* (Princeton, NJ, 2009).
- Hewitt, G., *The Problems of Success: A History of the Church Missionary Society 1910–1942*, vol. I: *In Tropical Africa. The Middle East. At Home* (London, 1971).
- Higgins, T. W., 'Prophet, Priest and King in Colonial Africa: Anglican and Colonial Political Responses to African Independent Churches in Nigeria and Kenya, 1918–1960', PhD thesis, University of Edinburgh, 2010.
- Jenkins, P., 'The Anglican Church in Ghana, 1905–24 (I)', *Transactions of the Historical Society of Ghana*, 15 (1974): 23–39.
- Jenkins, P., 'The Anglican Church in Ghana, 1905–24 (II)', *Transactions of the Historical Society of Ghana*, 15 (1974): 177–200.
- Kaye, B., *An Introduction to World Anglicanism* (Cambridge, 2008).
- Kwashi, B. A., 'The Church of Nigeria (Anglican Communion)', in Ian S. Markham, J. Barney Hawkins IV, Justyn Terry, and Leslie Nuñez Steffensen (eds.), *The Wiley-Blackwell Companion to the Anglican Communion* (Chichester, 2013), pp. 165–83.
- Meyer, B. and A. Moors (eds.), *Religion, Media, and Public Sphere* (Bloomington, IN, 2006).
- Pobee, J. S., *The Anglican Story in Ghana: From Mission Beginnings to Province of Ghana* (Oxford, 2009).
- Sanneh, L., *Translating the Message: The Missionary Impact on Culture* (Maryknoll, NY, 1990).
- Tasie, G. O. M., *Christian Missionary Enterprise: In the Niger Delta 1864–1918* (Leiden, 1978).

The Vicissitudes of Anglicanism in China, 1912–Present

Philip L. Wickeri

When the Chung Hua Sheng Kung Hui (CHSKH, ‘the Holy Catholic Church of China’) was founded in 1912, Protestant (or non-Roman) Christianity had been in China for just a little over one hundred years.¹ British, Canadian, and American Anglicans had come together to establish the CHSKH, what they hoped would become an indigenous Church, the first of its kind in China. In this endeavour, they would make some progress over the next decades, but have limited overall success. In 1912, the CHSKH was largely a Western institution. All the bishops were from abroad, as were most of the senior clergy. Funding also came from abroad, and the pattern of Church development was modelled after patterns in the West. Church-related universities and schools, hospitals, and social welfare centres were mostly under foreign leadership, though Henry Venn’s vision for an indigenous Church based on the principles of self-government, self-support, and self-extension was still in place.

THE CHUNG HUA SHENG KUNG HUI, 1912–37

The General Synod of the CHSKH met nine times between 1912 and 1937, and this was a significant period for its development. The most important decision at the second General Synod in 1915 was the establishment of a Board of Missions, staffed, financed, and largely controlled by Chinese Anglicans. This committee would in theory set the terms for all future mission work in

¹ I wish to express my thanks to Dr Rowena Ruiwen Chen, Ms Michelle Lin, and Ms Katie Webb for their research assistance in the preparation of this chapter.

China, at the diocesan level and beyond. The committee's first decision was to begin mission work in the poor and remote province of Shensi (Shaanxi) in the north-west. Two Shanghai priests, D. M. Koeh (Ge Piliu) and Paul Pu Huaren, volunteered to undertake the difficult task of opening a new mission area, and their work bore fruit. In 1934, at the eighth General Synod, the Church established the new diocese of Shensi (Shaanxi).² T. K. Shen (Shen Zigao, 1895–1982), a prominent Shanghai churchman, was elected bishop, and became the first Chinese diocesan bishop in the CHSKH.

The second General Synod also took steps towards the formation of a theological college, which was formally established as the Central Theological School (CTS) at the next General Synod in 1918.³ In the nineteenth century, the training of local clergy had begun as individual mentoring and catechetical instruction. Theological training centres were later set up, with varying degrees of success, in Shanghai (St John's School of Theology), Hong Kong (St Paul's College), Ningpo (Ningpo Clergy Training College), and Hankow (St Paul's Divinity School).⁴ The first faculty members of the CTS were appointed in 1920, two missionaries and one Chinese. The school was opened in 1922, in a facility of the Protestant Episcopal China Mission (PECM) on the outskirts of Nanjing. Mandarin was the language of instruction. The CTS was modelled on the Central Theological School in Japan, which was seen as a great success. In China as in Japan it was difficult to recruit qualified students for the priesthood. But the context in China was very different. Japan was smaller, without many dioceses, and there were no dialect issues. Although the CHSKH had a centralized structure, dioceses tended to function independently, and were related to different Churches and mission boards, with different understandings of theology and churchmanship. Moreover, not all ordinands spoke Mandarin, and English (which was also taught at the college) was difficult for students from rural areas.

The constitution approved at the eighth General Synod in 1934 stated: 'the purpose of the C.T.S. shall be the promotion of theological learning and especially the training of men for Holy Orders in the C.H.S.K.H.'⁵ It was designed to be the main training institution for the Church, but this never happened. There were never very many students at the college, and only five or six dioceses sent ordinands to the CTS. Most dioceses gave no financial support and sent their ordinands elsewhere, or trained them locally. Writing

² *Shensi: China's Mission to the Chinese* (London, 1935).

³ 'Report of the Committee on a Central Theological College for the Chung Hua Sheng Kung Hui', 1918, Shanghai Municipal Archives, U-104-0-65.

⁴ Philip L. Wickeri, 'Clergy Training and Theological Education: The Anglican-Episcopal Experience in China', unpublished conference paper, Yale-Edinburgh Conference, 'History of the Missionary Movement and World Christianity', 30 June–2 July 2011.

⁵ 'The Constitution of C.T.S.', HKBU Archives of History of Christianity in China, CMS Archives, Reel 384 'CHSKH, 1937–1950'.

from Peking in 1938, Bishop Frank L. Norris of North China observed that the history of the CTS had 'been one long struggle against adversity'.⁶ A Society for the Propagation of the Gospel (SPG) churchman, he wanted more attention to be given to devotional life and practical training. Evangelical bishops were suspicious of the CTS. It was seen as too liberal and academic, and not appropriate for students from rural areas. Other theological training centres did attract CHSKH students. The few university graduates from urban areas who presented themselves as candidates for the priesthood preferred to go to a university-based college such as the Yenching School of Religion in Peking, or St John's School of Theology in Shanghai. The diocese of South China sent candidates to Canton Union Theological College, for reasons of language and proximity to Hong Kong and Canton, and the diocese of Fukien did something similar in sending students to Fukien Union Theological College in Foochow. There continued to be a number of small diocesan training centres as well.

Because the Church could not come together on the matter of theological training, there was too much overlapping effort. St John's University School of Theology and the CTS were both under the bishop of Jiangsu, although they had different governing boards. St John's was by far the stronger institution. The fact that it offered a combined college and theological course, using English as the medium of instruction, meant that St John's, unlike the CTS, graduated a number of highly educated clergy and lay leaders. From 1896 to 1946 St John's had about sixty graduates, including eleven CHSKH bishops.⁷ It should be added that beginning in the 1920s, many priests received some of their theological education in the United States and Canada, and to a lesser extent in England. This underscored the importance of English in training for the priesthood.

The Yenching School of Religion was always the pre-eminent graduate school of theology in China, in terms of the quality of its faculty and international reputation. It was ecumenical, but no Anglican missionary societies were a part of its structure. However, Yenching did have two important CHSKH theologians on its faculty, Wu Lei-ch'uan and T. C. Chao (Zhao Zichen, 1888–1979), and other Anglicans taught there at different times. Some bishops regarded the school as disconnected from the Church because it trained few priests. Yenching was in the odd position of being the most contextualized 'theological college' in China, but it arguably had the least visible impact on any denomination, including the CHSKH. This was because

⁶ Frank L. Norris, 'The C.T.S. and Its Future', *The Chinese Churchman* (1938), p. 69, HKBU Archives of History of Christianity in China, CMS Archives, Reel 384 'CHSKH, 1937–1950'.

⁷ Edward Yihua Xu, 'St. John's University, Shanghai as an Evangelising Agency', *Studies in World Christianity*, 12 (2006): 23–49 (pp. 36–7).

Yenching was a school of religion, emphasizing the academic study of theology and religion, more than preparation for the ministry.

T. C. Chao, who became a CHSKH deacon and priest in 1941, was the most important Chinese theologian of his day.⁸ He was an early advocate of indigenization, seeking to bring Chinese culture and Christianity into dialogue. Chao wrote on many subjects, relating theology to culture, politics, and society. His theology also addressed subjects in the Bible and Christian tradition. He emphasized the connection between creation and redemption, and expressed this relationship in his poetry and hymns, as well as in his theology.⁹ Chao had a sacramental sense of the world, although he wrote very little about the sacraments. In all of these ways, we can see him as ‘Anglican’, but we should not claim too much in saying this. Chao was broadly ecumenical in his thinking, and went beyond theological traditions that had been inherited from the West, including Anglicanism. This was also true of other Anglican religious thinkers of the time including Wu Lei-ch’uan and Francis Wei Cho-min.

CHSKH intellectuals supported small theological publications such as *Truth and Life (Zhenli yu shengming)* published in Peking in the 1920s and 1930s, which debated the important theological issues of the day. Like other mainline Churches, the CHSKH also published Christian literature for a wide variety of constituencies, but primarily for the well-educated. These included translations of important theological books from English, devotional guides, and Chinese theological works by missionaries and Chinese priests.

Already in 1908 the Church began publication of *Sheng Kung Hui Bao (The Chinese Churchman)* in Wuchang, with the support of the PECM. (A monthly magazine *The Chinese Churchman* in English came out irregularly beginning a few years later.) *Sheng Kung Hui Bao* became the official journal of the CHSKH from February 1912 to June 1951. Its purpose was to promote the unity of Chinese Anglicans.

Our prayer is for the unity of the Church. However, Christians in the Sheng Kung Hui (Anglican Church) have not realized that there are many other Anglican Christians in the other parts of China, just as there were in the early Church in apostolic times. At the same time, although they probably know something about the propagation of our doctrines, the reading of the Apostles’ Creed, and our ancient liturgy, they still have no idea about our charitable work, the spreading of the Gospel in China, the construction of hospitals as well as the ordination of the priests. What’s more, they appear to be only vaguely aware of the joy and sorrows (from around the country) that have come to us through the grace of God. This

⁸ Winfried Glüer, *Christliche Theologie in China: T. C. Chao, 1918–1956* (Missionswissenschaftliche Forschungen, Gütersloh, 1979); T. C. Chao, *Zhao Zichen Wenji [The Collected Works of T. C. Chao]*, 5 vols., ed. Yenching Graduate Institute (Beijing, 2003–10).

⁹ Ruiwen Chen, *Fragrant Flowers Bloom: T. C. Chao and Bliss Wiant and the Contextualization of Chinese Hymns* (Leipzig, 2015).

magazine aims to improve communication and strengthen mutual concern for greater unity in our prayers for one another.¹⁰

This publication maintained a very high standard and contained literary contributions and general essays, as well as Church statements and theological reflections. It became the longest-running Church publication of any denomination in the first part of the twentieth century.

At the time of its founding, at least five different versions of the Book of Common Prayer (BCP) were in use in different dioceses of the CHSKH. After 1912, there were renewed efforts to write a Prayer Book in Chinese, rather than use a translated version of one of the foreign Prayer Books. This proved to be difficult, however, because of regional language variations and the mission societies' use of different Prayer Books in their own dioceses.¹¹ English dioceses continued to use translated versions of the 1662 BCP, while American dioceses used translations of their own 1789 version. The differences were of course also reflected in the liturgies. At the fourth General Synod (1921), the House of Delegates voted to authorize one standard version of a Chinese BCP, but the House of Bishops argued that this would inevitably be too much based on a Western model. Although the issue continued to be discussed, it was not until the tenth and final General Synod in 1947, that a resolution calling for a draft BCP to be used by the whole Church was approved.¹² Yet this was already too late. The BCP, which was designed to hold Anglicans together, proved to be a continuing source of division in China.

A feature of the Anglican Episcopalian mission work not found in other Protestant denominations was the orders of religious women. Two orders of nuns, both related to the American Church, were present in China: the Community of the Transfiguration (1915) in Wuhu and Hankow; and the Order of St Anne (1909), a small order found only in Shashi, near Hankow, and about which very little is known.¹³ The convent of the Community of the

¹⁰ 'Why this Magazine', *Sheng Kung Hui Bao*, 1 (2 Feb. 1908). The *Sheng Kung Hui Bao* was published monthly and sometimes bi-monthly, except during the years of the war against Japan (1937–45).

¹¹ Michael Poon, 'Prayer Book Translation and the Birth of the "Sheng Gong Hui"' (in Chinese), <<http://anglicanhistory.org/asia/skh/>> (accessed 23 Mar. 2015); Chlôe Starr, 'Rethinking Church through the Book of Common Prayer in Late Qing and Early Republican China', and Feng Guo, 'An Analysis of the Compilation and Writing of the Book of Common Prayer in the Chung Hua Sheng Kung Hui', both in Philip L. Wickeri (ed.), *Christian Encounters with Chinese Culture: Essays on Anglican and Episcopal History in China* (Hong Kong, 2015), pp. 81–102 and pp. 103–16 respectively.

¹² Shen Zigao (T. K. Shen), *Chung Hua Sheng Gong Hui Xin Gongdaoshu de chuyi* [*On the Principles of New Prayer Book Revision*] (Shanghai, 1947); Michael Bruce, 'China: Chung Hua Sheng Kung Hui', in J. W. C. Wand (ed.), *The Anglican Communion: A Survey* (London, New York, and Toronto, 1948), pp. 173–4.

¹³ R. G. Tiedemann, *Reference Guide to Christian Missionary Societies in China* (Armonk, NY and London, 2009), pp. 151, 195.

Transfiguration was in Wuhu, at St Lioba's School for Girls. In addition to St Lioba's, the community ran a day care centre, a kindergarten, a dispensary, a foundling home for infants, and the True Light Industrial Work mission for working-class people. This order remained in China until 1950, and there were at least twelve American nuns associated with the community during this time. Both orders worked under the authority of the CHSKH bishop, not the PECM leadership.

The fourth General Synod in 1921 changed the canons so that women could be elected to the House of Delegates, a decision that was far ahead of its time in comparison with either England or the United States. At the next General Synod in 1924 it was resolved that deaconesses should be included among the clergy (an idea that was explicitly rejected at the 1930 Lambeth Conference). In China, women were allowed to lead in prayer, and deaconesses could preach and assist in the sacraments at church services. At the 1934 General Synod, the laity were authorized to administer the chalice at the Eucharist. The CHSKH was recognized at the seventh Lambeth Conference in 1930 as a separate province, as was the Nippon Se Ko Kai (NSKK) in Japan. Both Churches were now, in principle, independent and part of the world-wide Anglican Communion. However, the different missionary organizations from England, the United States, and Canada and other countries continued alongside the Church structure, and they were much more powerful and better organized. In China, foreign missionaries and missionary bishops held the purse-strings and retained most of the important positions of leadership in the larger Church institutions.

Although there was little precedent in the Chinese cultural or religious tradition of anything resembling the ordained Christian ministry, there was clear progress in the development of the Chinese priesthood. At the founding of the CHSKH, there were twice as many foreign priests as Chinese. All of the bishops were still from overseas. By 1933, there were 235 Chinese priests compared to 87 foreigners, and by 1937, 284 Chinese clergy and 104 foreign clergy. It should be added that by 1937, there were 50 per cent more Chinese women than men working for the CHSKH, including more than double the number of women than men among foreign missionaries. Although there had been a Chinese assistant bishop since 1918, the first CHSKH diocesan bishop was not elected until 1934, and it was not until the 1940s that it became common to elect Chinese bishops over their Western missionary counterparts.

CHSKH missionary bishops had considerable social and political standing in China. Bishop Frederick Rogers Graves (1858–1940) of Shanghai was the longest-serving bishop in the CHSKH. He had played an important role in the founding of the Church, and was a force to be reckoned with. However, he was consistently opposed to the devolution of leadership to Chinese Christians, and, oblivious to growing nationalism, he opposed the registration of Church

Table 6.1 General Statistics for the CHSKH, 1937

Church constituency	80,521
Churches	712
Preaching halls	154
Chinese clergy	284
Foreign clergy	102

Source: 'General Statistics of the Chung Hua Sheng Kung Hui for the Year of Our Lord 1937', *Report of the Tenth General Synod, Chung Hua Sheng Gong Hui*, Shanghai, 23–31 Aug. 1947, pp. 18–19.

schools and St John's University with the government.¹⁴ By the time he left China in 1937 he was seen by many as an obstacle to reform movements in Church and society. Fellow American Bishop Logan Herbert Roots (1870–1945) of Hankow was a different kind of bishop. Active in the Moral Rearmament Movement and in the National Christian Council of China, he also played a role in Chinese politics and in negotiating relationships between the Nationalists (KMT) and the Communists. He became a friend of Communist leader Zhou Enlai, after sheltering him when he was sought by the KMT in 1927. He had high-ranking friends among both the Nationalists and the Communists, and his residence became a place to debate the issues of the day. Bishop Roots balanced his political involvement to help the CHSKH identify with the movement for national salvation in the years leading up to the war against Japan, and he was remembered as a progressive voice for change.¹⁵

The CHSKH grew in numbers as it developed as a Church, but modestly. This can be seen in the growth in the number of Chinese priests and the emergence of a strong and well-educated laity. From 1937, on the eve of the Japanese invasion, the statistics for CHSKH can be seen in Table 6.1.

By 1938, the total constituency had grown to 85,769, which is the highest number of CHSKH adherents there have ever been.¹⁶ South and East China had many more churches, priests, and members than the northern and western dioceses. In 1936, the diocese of West China was divided into Sichuan East and Sichuan West. Sichuan was far removed from the dioceses on the east coast, and had relatively few Anglicans. In the 1930s, the province was unsettled by banditry, lawlessness, and widespread poverty. In contrast, Fukien always had the largest number of Church members, followed by

¹⁴ Peter Chen-Main Wang, 'Bishop Frederick R. Graves and the Changing Context of China in the 1920s', in his *Contextualization of Christianity in China: An Evaluation in Modern Perspective* (Sankt Augustin, 2007), pp. 153–81.

¹⁵ Edward Yihua Xu, 'The Protestant Episcopal China Mission and Chinese Society', in Wickeri (ed.), *Christian Encounters with Chinese Culture*, pp. 25–46.

¹⁶ 'General Statistics of the Chung Hua Sheng Kung Hui for the Year of Our Lord 1937', *Report of the Tenth General Synod, Chung Hua Sheng Gong Hui*, Shanghai, 23–31 Aug. 1947, p. 19.

Kiangsu (Jiangsu, the former diocese of Shanghai) and Chekiang. The diocese of Victoria (South China) was the smallest of the southern dioceses. The diocese of Shensi, the smallest and the weakest of all the dioceses, had only 549 members in 1937, but this was a diocese and a mission founded by the Chinese themselves. In comparison with the Protestant (or non-Roman) Christian population as a whole, Anglicans were a small proportion statistically, less than 10 per cent in 1937. Their influence, however, far exceeded their numbers.

This influence was evident in CHSKH work in hospitals, social welfare, schools, and universities. Anglicans concentrated on building up institutions for education and social welfare which were then in short supply in China. In this work, the Church was supported by mission boards in England, the United States, and Canada. Up until the 1910s, the training of doctors and nurses in Western medicine mainly took place in mission hospitals. St Luke's Hospital in Shanghai and St Peter's Hospital in Wuchang had medical training classes in the nineteenth century, which later merged into the St John's University Medical School. The Church Missionary Society (CMS) pioneered in work with leprosy in China, and established modern hospitals in the dioceses of South China, Chekiang, and Fukien. Anglicans also started many primary and secondary schools for girls and for boys. St Hilda's School for Girls (Wuchang), St Mary's Hall (Shanghai), and St Stephen's College (Hong Kong) were among the best-known girls' schools in China during this period. Anglicans also established lesser-known schools in cities and towns that contributed to the growing demand for education at the grassroots. As a Church the CHSKH was involved in literacy programmes and the Mass Education Movement, designed to extend literacy programmes to towns and villages in the countryside, in the 1920s and 1930s.

Many outstanding intellectuals, clergy and laity, Christian and non-Christian, were drawn to CHSKH institutions of higher learning. Two major Episcopalian universities—Boone University (after 1924, it became Central China Normal University) and St John's University—were committed to an American liberal arts approach to higher education. There were few Christians among the graduates of these or any of the Christian colleges and universities in China, but the schools had a deep influence on intellectual life and on educational reform in the country as a whole.¹⁷

Among the Christian colleges in China, St John's University stood out because of its education in the English medium and its training of a political and social elite.¹⁸ It did not accept the government regulation that all schools

¹⁷ Daniel H. Bays and Ellen Widmer (eds.), *China's Christian Colleges: Cross-Cultural Connections, 1900–1950* (Stanford, CA, 2009).

¹⁸ Xu, 'St. John's University, Shanghai as an Evangelising Agency'; Xiong Yuezhi and Zhou Wu (eds.), *Sheng Yuehan Daxue Shi [History of St John's University]* (Shanghai, 2007).

and colleges must have Chinese heads and a Chinese majority on the board of trustees (1926), and so it was denied government recognition. But because of its reputation, St John's still was able to attract very high-calibre students and faculty, although its standing was diminished. Among the Christian graduates, there were prominent officials in the republican government and the Nationalist Kuomintang, as well as leading educators, business people, and churchmen. These included V. K. Wellington Koo (Gu Weijun), who served as Chinese foreign minister on different occasions; K. C. Wu (Wu Guozheng), the powerful mayor of Shanghai; Yen Hui-ching (Yan Huiqing), who served as Chinese premier in the 1920s; and T. V. Soong (Song Ziwen). Other prominent graduates included Lin Yutang, one of China's best-known writers; Zhou Youguang, the prominent linguist; and Rong Yiren, China's most famous 'Red Capitalist'.

The CHSKH was a leader in ecumenical cooperation among Chinese Protestants. Before 1912 Anglicans and Episcopalians had prominent positions of leadership at several missionary gatherings, in interdenominational publications, and in ecumenical translation work. They were also active in the Student Volunteer Movement, and the Young Men's and Young Women's Christian Associations (YMCA and YWCA). Anglican layman T. Z. Koo (Gu Ziren, 1887–1971) became one of the most prominent leaders of the student Christian movement of his day, in which capacity he travelled to more than forty-five countries. In 1922 the CHSKH became a founding member of the National Christian Council of China (NCCC), and many NCCC officers were prominent Church members, both clergy and laity. The Church decided not to join the Church of Christ in China in 1927, a union of largely Presbyterian and Congregational churches and missions, because this was not a union that made space for the historic episcopate or other Anglican particulars. The CHSKH was a leader in the 'Five Year Movement', sponsored by the NCCC in 1930, a movement for Church renewal and evangelism. It was also part of the committee that produced *Hymns of Universal Praise*, an ecumenical hymnal first published in 1936, and still in use in many Chinese churches today. The CHSKH eventually adopted this hymnal in preference to its own Anglican hymnal produced a few years earlier, to demonstrate its commitment to ecumenism. Louise Hammond, Ernest Yang, and Bishop T. K. Shen were CHSKH representatives on the hymnal committee. CHSKH leaders, both Chinese and foreign, played important roles in national and international ecumenical organizations. T. C. Chao was one of the first presidents of the World Council of Churches (WCC), representing the Anglican family of Churches.¹⁹

¹⁹ Philip L. Wickeri, *Reconstructing Christianity in China: K. H. Ting and the Chinese Church* (Maryknoll, NY, 2007), p. 83.

THE CHSKH DURING THE WAR AGAINST
JAPAN, 1937–45

Japan invaded Manchuria in September 1931, and the following year it established the puppet state of Manchukuo, with China's last emperor, Puyi, as the nominal ruler. This began six years of increasing tension with China, mainly in the north-eastern part of the country. Contacts between religious groups in both countries continued during this time in the hope of reducing tensions and strengthening international fellowship.

The ninth General Synod met in Foochow in April 1937, the silver jubilee of the CHSKH.²⁰ This was the high point in terms of its development as a Church, as well as its deepening and broadening response to the social and cultural challenges of China. The Bible Churchmen's Missionary Society, working in the new missionary district of Nanning, was approved as the twelfth (and ultimately the last) missionary society related to the CHSKH. The other eleven societies were: the PECM; CMS; SPG; the China Inland Mission (CIM); the Church of England in Canada; the Anglican Church of Australia; Australian CMS; the New Zealand Board of Missions; the Church of England Zenana Mission; the Dublin University Mission; and the Society for Promoting Christian Knowledge (SPCK). The pastoral letter from the Synod emphasized the need to 'be in constant contact with the poor' and seek to serve them; to 'cultivate the powers of thought' by developing a theology that was broad in outlook (and therefore indigenous); and to 'nourish our own spiritual life' so as to reach out to others. The Synod also sent a congratulatory message to the NSKK, which was celebrating its golden jubilee. Bishop Linden Tsen (Zheng Hefu, 1885–1954) of Henan went directly from the Foochow meeting to attend the meeting of the Japanese Church in Tokyo and bring fraternal greetings. But within three months, however, all communication and exchanges between the Churches came to an end.

The Xi'an incident (December 1936) was an important turning point in the period leading up to the war, and the CHSKH played a small but important role in providing a site for the resolution of the crisis. Nationalist General Chiang Kai-shek was arrested by Marshal Zhang Xueliang in Xi'an, because he wanted to force Chiang to negotiate with the Communists and form a united front against Japan. Bishop T. K. Shen was approached by the Communists to play an intermediary role with the Western press. His church was a place in Xi'an where both sides could meet. Details of the incident are still shrouded in mystery, but the result was a temporary truce between the Nationalists and the Communists, and a common commitment to resist Japanese aggression.

²⁰ *Report of the Ninth Meeting of the General Synod of the Chung Hua Sheng Kung Hui, held at Foochow, April 17 to 25, 1937.*

On 7 July 1937 the Japanese launched a full-scale invasion of China. Within a few months its armies had taken Shanghai and Nanjing, and by 1941 they were in control of most of the eastern part of the country. The invasion itself and subsequent War of Resistance Against Japan (1937–45) were times of great suffering and hardship for the Chinese people, and this took its toll on the Churches. Many Church leaders and Christian institutions moved west to Chunking and Yunnan in ‘Free China’, including Christian colleges and some schools from the north and south, as well as denominational and ecumenical offices. Manchuria, Taiwan, and most coastal cities were under Japanese occupation. Although churches in occupied areas continued to function, attendance declined and churches were put to other uses. Some church buildings were taken over by the Japanese, or damaged in the war effort. St John’s University and Church schools in Shanghai remained open throughout the war. American and British missionaries remaining in occupied China were interned in 1943. Others had already returned to their home countries or moved to the West. When Yu Ensi became assistant bishop of Kiangsu in 1942 he was the only CHSKH bishop in Japanese-occupied territory. Overall, communication within China was difficult: there could be no regular church meetings and many activities ceased.

CHSKH churches and associated mission societies contributed a great deal to relief efforts in ‘Free China’. Students and faculty from some of the universities in Peking (Beijing) made the decision to move west, first to Changsha and then to Yunnan where they set up the National South-West Associated University (known in Chinese as Lian Da, or united university).²¹ The diocese of South China established a hostel and sent missionaries and Chinese priests to look after the needs of the students and organize fellowships and worship services. In cooperation with the Red Cross and other relief agencies, the Church opened hospitals and medical centres to care for the wounded. Churches also helped in refugee camps, caring for displaced persons, and raising funds for basic support.

During the war, the Church deepened its cooperation with Chiang Kai-shek and his Nationalist government, based in Chungking. This was in one sense natural, because of the number of prominent Anglican laymen in the government, the presence of many CHSKH bishops in ‘Free China’, and the need for the coordination of relief efforts. Church publications in English publicized the Nationalist cause abroad.²² Even though there were Anglican Churches in Japan as well as China, Anglicans in England and North America focused their attention on China during the war years. Y. Y. Tsu (Zhu Youyu, 1886–1986), assistant bishop of South China, in charge of Yunnan and Kweichow (Guizhou), became known as the ‘Bishop of the Burma Road’. He rallied the

²¹ John Israel, *Lianda: A Chinese University in War and Revolution* (Stanford, CA, 1999).

²² R. O. Hall, *China’s Fight for Freedom* (London, 1941).

Chinese troops and attended to the work of the Church along the supply route, sometimes donning an American military uniform.

In contrast, some CHSKH priests and laypeople supported the Communist Party in their anti-Japanese resistance efforts. In the Communists' Yenan base area, within the diocese of Shensi, Pu Huaren and Dong Jianwu did propaganda work and helped with relief efforts; both later joined the Communist Party. In occupied Shanghai, CHSKH priests including K. H. Ting (Ding Guangxun) and C. T. Chen (Zheng Jianye), organized an interdenominational 'Student Church', to work with university students. Ting was pastor of the English-speaking Community Church where the students met. The Student Church served as a cover for anti-Japanese resistance efforts, and secretly cooperated with the Communist Party underground that was active in Shanghai. The relationships built between CHSKH priests and Chinese Communists during the war years became important for the Church in the 1950s.

A little-known aspect of Anglican Episcopalian work in China outside the CHSKH was the mission of the NSKK in Japanese-controlled areas. The NSKK, which, like the CHSKH, had American, English, and Canadian roots, had also been recognized as an independent Anglican province in 1930. After the first Sino-Japanese War (1894–5), the Japanese Church began to do missionary work in Taiwan (1897) and in Manchuria (1914).²³ This began as work among Japanese Church members, but it was extended to include evangelism among the Chinese. The diocese of Osaka, supported by the English missionary societies, was responsible for Manchuria, and the diocese of Tokyo, supported by the Protestant Episcopal Church in the United States, was responsible for Taiwan. In September, 1931, following the Japanese invasion of Manchuria, the bishop of Tokyo consecrated a new church in Mukden. This mission work continued through the war years, but came to an abrupt end shortly after the surrender of Japan in 1945.

Hong Kong fell to the Japanese on Christmas Day 1941. All of the important centres of Chinese Anglicanism were now under Japanese control. In Hong Kong, Canton, Foochow, Shanghai, Hankow, and Peking, the foreign missionaries had either fled or were interned. In Hong Kong, St John's Cathedral was closed, as were the two other Anglican churches for foreigners. But the Chinese churches continued to function, with some restrictions.

Across the Pearl River delta, the Portuguese colony of Macau remained a free port, and Anglican work continued in Morrison Chapel, with Deaconess Florence Li Tim Oi (Li Tianai, 1907–92) in charge. Because of the inability of priests from Hong Kong or Guangdong to travel easily to Macau, assistant bishop Mok Shau Tsang (Mo Shouceng, 1866–1943) gave her permission to celebrate the Eucharist in 1942. Bishop R. O. Hall (1895–1975) approved of

²³ Tiedemann, *Reference Guide to Christian Missionary Societies in China*, p. 120.

this action and went a step further. In January 1944, on the feast of the conversion of St Paul, Bishop Hall, acting on his own, took the extraordinary step of ordaining Florence Li to the priesthood. She thus became the first ordained woman in the Anglican Communion.

When he was informed of her ordination, Archbishop William Temple said that Bishop Hall's action had been *ultra vires*. Archbishop Geoffrey Fisher subsequently urged him to suspend her licence as a priest. Bishop Hall agreed to refer the question to the House of Bishops of the CHSKH and to accept their advice on the matter. He did so as soon as practicable after the end of the war. Florence Li's ordination was taken up at the meeting of the CHSKH House of Bishops in February 1946 and the bishops voted to repudiate Hall's action, although four bishops (all Chinese) stood with him. She could no longer function as a priest, but continued Church work in a remote area of the diocese.²⁴ It would be almost twenty-eight years before two other women were ordained, also in Hong Kong. In 1984, Li's priestly orders were restored, and she was honoured by the archbishop of Canterbury in a ceremony at Westminster Abbey.

CHINA IN REVOLUTION, 1945–58

When the war ended in August 1945 the Church entered a time of rebuilding and reorganization. But the CHSKH never really recovered. The bishops returned to their dioceses, Church schools and other institutions reopened, and some of the missionaries returned. In 1946 the total CHSKH constituency had declined to 66,651, although it had grown to 77,741 by the end of 1949.²⁵ The House of Bishops had met only four times in the years between 1937 and 1947, and no Synod committees met at all. Church membership had declined by more than 20 per cent, and the CHSKH lost almost all of its endowments. It was estimated that nearly half of Church property, buildings, and equipment was either lost or destroyed. The Chinese clergy faced serious financial hardships, and some were forced to find other employment.

The withdrawal or internment of missionaries during the war years had hastened an end to missionary dominance of the Church, but the CHSKH continued to be dependent on foreign funding. In 1946, the Church of England began raising £100,000 for the Archbishop's China Appeal Fund, and this was made available to the General Synod to use as it wished. Some of this money was put towards immediate relief of dioceses related to the British

²⁴ Florence Tim-Oi Li, *Raindrops of My Life: The Memoir of Florence Tim Oi Li, First Woman Priest in the Anglican Communion* (Toronto, 1996).

²⁵ *Sheng Kung Hui Bao*, 39 (15 Oct. 1950), p. 14.

missionary societies, but much was used for clergy endowments and living stipends. The Episcopal Church in the United States gave \$2.75 million to various special projects decided upon by a visiting commission from the United States.²⁶ Resources from other Churches and societies were much more limited after the end of the war. The dioceses of Kiangsu, South China, Hankow, and Fukien were relatively better off financially, but as with all the other dioceses they faced enormous challenges in rebuilding.

The tenth General Synod of the CHSKH met in Shanghai at the end of August 1947, its first meeting in ten years.²⁷ It set up a new central office and Bishop Y. Y. Tsu became general secretary. The new Yun-Kwei diocese was separated from South China, for work in the provinces of Yunnan and Kweichow (Guizhou). These were two south-western provinces where Anglican work had grown during the war years. This brought the total number of dioceses to fourteen. The CTS was reopened on the campus of St John's University, but it had few faculty members or students. Bishop T. K. Shen was appointed dean of the theological school, and he was also put in charge of the drafting of a Prayer Book that could be used by all CHSKH churches.

In light of the earlier decision repudiating the ordination of Florence Li, the diocese of South China proposed a resolution that deaconesses could be advanced to the priesthood under the same conditions as deacons (who were exclusively male) for an experimental period of twenty years. Rather than act on the resolution, the Synod referred the matter to the Lambeth Conference that would meet the following year. The Lambeth Conference decided that 'such an experiment would be against the tradition and order and would gravely affect the internal and external relations of the Anglican Communion' (Resolution Number 113). According to the Revd Chung Yan-Lap, Florence Li's colleague and friend from Hong Kong, the Synod's referral had revealed a 'lack of moral courage'.²⁸ He was speaking for many in Hong Kong when he said this.

In China as a whole the political situation was changing very quickly. Even as the General Synod was meeting, full-scale civil war had resumed between the Nationalist government of Chiang Kai-shek and the Communists. Rampant inflation, corruption from within, and dissatisfaction with Nationalist policies eroded support for them, while many Chinese were impressed by the land reform policies and the discipline of the Communist armies. Shanghai came under Communist rule in May 1949 and on 1 October Mao Zedong proclaimed the establishment of the People's Republic of China (PRC) in

²⁶ G. F. S. Gray. 'Anglicans in China: A History of the Chung Hua Sheng Kung Hui'. Unpublished manuscript deposited in Yale Divinity School Archives, c.1960, p. 190.

²⁷ *Report of the Tenth General Synod, Chung Hua Sheng Gong Hui*, Shanghai, 23–31 Aug. 1947.

²⁸ *Kongyuet Jiao Sheng* [South China Diocesan Echo], 11 Jan. 1948, pp. 3–4.

Beijing. The Nationalists fled to Taiwan, Hong Kong and Macau remained separate colonies, and the Communist Party of China soon consolidated its rule over the rest of China.

Like all other Churches, the CHSKH was unprepared for the new order. As it became apparent that the Western connections of the Church would have to be cut, mission societies signed over land deeds and transferred other assets to the CHSKH. All of the remaining Western bishops resigned, except for the bishop of South China in Hong Kong. They were replaced by Chinese assistant bishops or newly elected priests. Bishop Lindel Tsen resigned as chairman of the House of Bishops because of ill health, and Bishop Robin Chen (Chen Jianzhen, 1894–1969) was elected in his place. Grants and subsidies from abroad could no longer be received after December 1950, and all Church hospitals, schools, and welfare centres were handed over to the government. Foreign missionaries and staff were asked by the Chinese bishops to leave China for the sake of the Church, and within a year most of them had done so. The missionary era in China was at an end.

In May 1950, a group of Chinese Christians gathered around Y. T. Wu, a well-known Christian social activist and future leader of the Chinese Christian Three-Self Patriotic Movement of the Protestant Churches of China (TSPM). They met with Premier Zhou Enlai, and drafted the 'Christian Manifesto', a document which committed Christians to 'sever their links' with Western imperialism and support the new order. The TSPM began a campaign for signatures of endorsement, and many left-leaning CHSKH priests and lay-people actively expressed their support. The House of Bishops and the standing committee of the CHSKH met in Shanghai in July and made the decision not to support the 'Christian Manifesto'. Instead, they issued a pastoral letter affirming support for the PRC and the independence of the Church from foreign control.²⁹ Over the next eighteen months, however, all the bishops signed the 'Christian Manifesto', often under great political pressure.

The following June, the House of Bishops and the standing committee met again and decided that the diocese of South China would be separated into two, Hong Kong and Macau, and Guangdong now under Bishop Nathaniel Xian Murong. Bishop Hall had resigned from the House of Bishops, but he remained as bishop of the new diocese of Hong Kong and Macau, which would be a detached diocese of the CHSKH with oversight from the arch-bishop of Canterbury.

Later that summer, the CHSKH conducted an 'accusation meeting' criticizing itself for its ties to America and the West. Bishops Y. Y. Tsu and Quentin Huang (1902–73), both of whom had gone to America, were singled

²⁹ 'Sheng Kung Hui Pastoral Letter', in Wallace C. Merwin and Francis P. Jones (eds.), *Documents of the Three-Self Movement: Source Materials for the Study of the Protestant Church in Communist China* (New York, 1963), p. 21.

out for attack.³⁰ T. C. Chao resigned his presidency of the WCC because of its support for the Americans in the Korean War, and at least one report asserted that the CHSKH had withdrawn from the WCC.³¹ Chao also lost his position as dean of the Yenching School of Religion. The early 1950s were a difficult time for all Churches in China, as Christians came under attack in these and other mass movements. These intensified during the Korean War. Some Anglicans (such as Bishop Kimber Den, also known as Deng Shukun) were imprisoned; many more in positions of ecclesiastical authority lost their jobs.

But this was not the whole story. Many Anglicans supported the Communists and assumed important positions in the PRC. They maintained ties with friends and colleagues in the CHSKH, the YMCA and YWCA, and other Churches. The most important of these individuals was Pu Huaren (1887–1974), who became prominent in educational and cultural circles in the 1950s; he had once been a priest, and had been one of the first to volunteer to do missionary work in Shensi.³² Some CHSKH leaders played important leadership roles in the newly formed TSPM. They were socially and politically progressive Christians, and attempted to bring to the TSPM a sense of churchmanship, over against those who wanted to emphasize politics alone. In addition, some Church members held prominent positions in society, and were elected representatives in government bodies at different levels.

After the end of the Korean War the situation in China became more relaxed, and there was a modest revival of the CHSKH. Some of the dioceses were strengthened, and there were new baptisms, confirmations, and ordinations of priests. Bishop Robin Chen and general secretary Bishop Zheng Jianye (1919–91) visited dioceses in East China to assess the situation. In June 1955 three new bishops were consecrated, including K. H. Ting (1915–2012). Ting had returned to China in 1951, and became principal of the newly established Nanjing Union Theological Seminary. He would play an important role in Chinese Christianity over the next fifty years.³³ A new Church publication, *Sheng Gong*, reported on ecclesiastical developments. In May 1956, the House of Bishops and the standing committee of the General Synod met in Shanghai, with all seventeen bishops in attendance. The Church was much weaker than it had been, but the bishops had ambitious plans for the future, including the drafting of a new Book of Common Prayer and the establishment of Shanghai's Holy Trinity Church as the new national cathedral. This occasion, however, turned out to be the last meeting of the CHSKH.

³⁰ Quentin Huang, *Now I Can Tell: The Strange and Terrifying Story of the First Bishop to Be Imprisoned by the Chinese Communists* (New York, 1954); Andrew Y. Y. Tsu, *Friend of Fishermen* (Ambler, PA, 1953).

³¹ 'Chung Hua Sheng Kung Hui Announces Permanent Withdrawal from World Council of Churches', *Ta Kung Pao*, 5 Aug. 1951.

³² <<http://baike.baidu.com/view/1422794.htm?noadapt=1>> (accessed 29 Nov. 2013).

³³ Wickeri, *Reconstructing Christianity*.

Within two years, the Church was overtaken by new political events. With the onset of the Anti-Rightist movement in 1958, an initiative of Mao Zedong whose purpose was to criticize intellectuals who did not support his radical policies, the political climate grew increasingly severe. Local parishes were all unified, and the denominations now worshipped together in the few churches that remained. The CHSKH was never formally dissolved, but it effectively came to an end in 1958, as did all other denominational bodies. With the onset of the Cultural Revolution (1966–76), all Churches and religious bodies were shut down. ‘Post-denominational’ Churches were reopened beginning in 1978, but by this time there was no longer an institutional Anglican presence.

In its forty-six-year history (1912–58) the CHSKH never became an indigenous Chinese Church as its founders had hoped. It made contributions to contextualization, but it was largely an institution cast in an Anglo-American form. Today, there is no longer an Anglican Church in mainland China, although churches of the former CHSKH are part of the China Christian Council. In different parts of China, a few older church members will say they are Anglicans. Some younger clergy on the mainland embrace aspects of the Anglican liturgy, the Book of Common Prayer, and the ideas of Anglican theologians. The Anglican and Episcopal Churches of Hong Kong, Macau, and Taiwan—as well as Chinese churches in Singapore, Southeast Asia, and other parts of the world—are descended from the CHSKH, hold fast to their Chinese and Anglican heritage, and make distinct contributions to the Anglican Communion. This is the historical legacy of the Chung Hua Sheng Kung Hui.

THE HONG KONG SHENG KUNG HUI, 1951–PRESENT

In June 1951 the standing committee of the CHSKH had petitioned the House of Bishops to create a new diocese of South China within the jurisdiction of the PRC, and to allow a new diocese of Hong Kong and Macau to become a detached diocese, faithful in its order and worship to the canons and constitutions of the CHSKH. This was an indication that despite the political difficulties, the new diocese and the CHSKH were still one Church in spirit. The standing committee of the South China diocese accepted the separation of Hong Kong and Macau from the original diocese and established the new diocese of Hong Kong and Macau. This was done with a concern for proper Anglican order and religious sensibilities.

Bishop Hall asked Archbishop Geoffrey Fisher to serve as trustee of the diocese, in his capacity as head of the Anglican Communion. In consenting to this request Fisher indicated that the new diocese was ‘for the time being’ detached from the CHSKH and that he would be guided in his role as

metropolitan by the constitution and canons of the CHSKH.³⁴ In the late 1940s and early 1950s refugees from the mainland were pouring into Hong Kong, and the city was overwhelmed. With support from the colonial government, Churches responded with new programmes of outreach, education, and mission.

With all his energy now focused on Hong Kong, Bishop Hall more than doubled the number of Anglican churches in the post-war decades, and ordained some fifty new clergymen. His approach was to pair each church with a school and welfare centre, so that mission would embrace the three areas of evangelism, education, and social service. Hall started housing programmes, girls' and boys' clubs, and the St James Settlement (1949), and was a key leader in starting Chung Chi College (1954) and the Hong Kong Christian Council. The 1950s and early 1960s were a time of tremendous economic development in Hong Kong, and Bishop Hall became one of the most influential social figures of his day. Under his leadership the diocese of Hong Kong and Macau assumed a higher profile than ever before.

There was little contact with the Church in China during this time, but Bishop Hall was very supportive of the new Communist government. He helped keep channels of communication open between China and the Anglican Communion. In 1956 he became the only Hong Kong Church leader to visit the mainland during this period, and there he met with Premier Zhou Enlai and Church leaders. Because of his political sympathies, he became known as the 'Pink Bishop', as Bishop Logan Roots of Hankow had also been known as a 'Pink Bishop' in the 1930s.

Gilbert Baker (1910–86) became the first elected bishop of Hong Kong in 1966, and the last Englishman to hold that office. He continued the tradition of linking the Church to education and social welfare, during a time when 'Hong Kongers' were emerging with their own sense of identity.³⁵ Hong Kong is remembered for ordaining the first woman priest, but Bishop Baker also ordained the second, third, and fourth women to the Anglican priesthood as well: Jane Hwang and Joyce Bennett were ordained in 1971, and Pauline Shek in 1973. All three were priested after prior approval had been sought and obtained from the Anglican Consultative Council. Unlike his predecessor, Bishop Gilbert Baker was low key and soft-spoken, known for his pastoral concern, community involvement, and support for the newly emerging Churches of China.

Peter Kong-kit Kwong became the first Chinese bishop of the diocese in 1981. He was elected just as Hong Kong was entering the period of transition to Chinese rule, and he guided the Church over the next twenty-five years. He

³⁴ 'Correspondence with the Archbishop of Canterbury', *South China*, 8 (Oct. 1951): 11–13.

³⁵ Stephen Tsang, *A Modern History of Hong Kong* (Hong Kong, 2004), esp. ch. 13, 'The Rise of Hong Kongers', pp. 180–97.

played a prominent role in Hong Kong society and also helped to build new relationships with the Chinese government in the decades of transition leading up to 1997, and the establishment of the territory as a Special Administrative Region (SAR) of the People's Republic of China. His episcopate coincided with the time of 'reform and openness' in China, and Bishop Kwong worked closely with the TSPM and the newly established China Christian Council (CCC), structural expressions of the re-emerging Church on the mainland. The post-denominational CCC was in some sense a successor to the CHSKH and other Chinese denominations on the mainland. After 1997, the Hong Kong Sheng Kung Hui (HKSKH, the Hong Kong Anglican Church) would be under a different social system and retain its own structures and traditions, but would work with the TSPM and the CCC in mission. Both organizations were led by Bishop K. H. Ting (1915–2012) until 1996, who himself was interested in establishing some form of relationship with the HKSKH and the wider Anglican Communion.

The major achievement of Kwong's episcopate was the creation of a new province. He saw that a detached diocese, operating under the constitution and canons of a Church—the former CHSKH—that no longer existed, was an anomaly. Hong Kong remained part of the Council of Churches in East Asia, together with other smaller dioceses in the region. However, facing the end of British colonial rule in 1997 the Church needed a more formal institutional grounding. On 25 October 1998, after seven years of planning, the HKSKH was established as the thirty-eighth province in the Anglican Communion. Bishop Kwong became bishop of Hong Kong Island and the missionary area of Macau, as well as the first archbishop and primate of the new province. He worked with Bishop Thomas Yee-po Soo (b. 1941) of the diocese of Western Kowloon and Bishop Louis Tsan-sang Tsui (b. 1943) of the diocese of Eastern Kowloon.

Archbishop Peter Kwong retired at the end of 2006, and his successor is Archbishop Paul Kwong. As a province, a new Book of Common Prayer is currently in preparation; the HKSKH is increasingly involved in the Anglican Communion; and with the Church on the mainland, the Christian community has continued to grow, as can be seen in this brief statistical summary (2014):³⁶

Clergy:	105 (including 21 retired clergy)
Members:	approximately 30,000
Churches:	52 (including five in Macau)
Schools:	134
Welfare Council:	95 service units

³⁶ 'HKSKH Church Statistics, 2014', HKSKH Archives, unpublished, 1 Dec. 2014.

THE EPISCOPAL CHURCH IN TAIWAN

After the end of the mission of the NSKK to Taiwan in 1945, Episcopalian work emerged in response to the needs of the members of the CHSKH who fled to the island after 1949.³⁷ The early 1950s were difficult times for the people of Taiwan, because of the devastation of war and the lack of an industrial base. The American Episcopal Church started work on the island during these years, with leadership initially provided by American military chaplains. The Americans set up military bases in Taiwan to protect the government of Chiang Kai-shek from a possible invasion from the mainland. Later, missionaries were sent to Taiwan from the Episcopal Church in the United States who were involved in theological education and parish ministry. The diocese of Taiwan was established as part of Province VIII of the Episcopal Church in 1954. Bishop Harry S. Kennedy was from the United States, as was his successor. There followed three bishops from Hong Kong and China before John Chien (1940–2013) from Taiwan was elected the sixth diocesan bishop. The present bishop, David Jung Hsin Lai, presides over sixteen churches, serving both the local people and foreign residents.

SELECT BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Chan-Yeung, Moira M. W., *The Practical Prophet: Bishop Ronald O. Hall and His Legacies* (Hong Kong, 2015).
- Chao, T. C. (Zhao Zichen), *Zhao Zichen Wenji [The Collected Works of T. C. Chao]*, 5 vols., ed. Yenching Graduate Institute (Beijing, 2003–10). [Volume 5 contains Chao's English writings.]
- Chen, Ruiwen, *Fragrant Flowers Bloom: T. C. Chao and Bliss Wiant and the Contextualization of Chinese Hymns* (Leipzig, 2015).
- Gray, G. F. S., 'Anglicans in China: A History of the Chung Hua Sheng Kung Hui'. Unpublished manuscript deposited in Yale Divinity School Archives, undated, c.1960.
- Gray, G. F. S. with Martha Lund Smalley, *Anglicans in China: A History of the Zhonghua Shenggong Hui (Chung Hua Sheng Kung Hui)* (New Haven, CT, 1996).
- Huang, Quentin K. Y., *Now I Can Tell: The Strange and Terrifying Story of the First Bishop to Be Imprisoned by the Chinese Communists* (New York, 1954).
- Li, Florence Tim-Oi, *Raindrops of My Life: The Memoir of Florence Tim Oi Li, First Woman Priest in the Anglican Communion* (Toronto, 1996).

³⁷ Mei-mei Lin, 'How to Search, Establish and Continue an Indigenous, National, Anglican Missionary Bishopric Leadership from Mainland China to Taiwan: Taking Four Missionary Bishops of American Episcopal Church as an Example' (in Chinese), unpublished conference paper presented at 'Learning from the Past, Looking to the Future: Anglican-Episcopal History in China and Its Impact on the Church Today', Hong Kong, 7–9 June 2012.

- Manross, William Wilson, *A History of the American Episcopal Church* (New York, 1950).
- Paton, David M., 'R. O.': *The Life and Times of Bishop Hall of Hong Kong* (Hong Kong, 1985).
- Poon, Michael Nai Chiu, 'CSCA Chung Hua Sheng Kung Hui Source Documents'. <<http://anglicanhistory.org/asia/skh/>> (accessed 23 March 2016).
- Stock, Eugene, *The History of the Church Missionary Society: Supplementary Volume the Fourth* (London, 1916).
- Tiedemann, R. G., *Reference Guide to Christian Missionary Societies in China: From the Sixteenth to the Twentieth Century* (Armonk, NY and London, 2009).
- Tsu, Andrew Y. Y., *Friend of Fishermen* (Ambler, PA, 1953).
- Wang, Peter Chen-Main, 'Bishop Frederick R. Graves and the Changing Context of China in the 1920s', in Peter Chen-Main Wang, *Contextualization of Christianity in China: An Evaluation in Modern Perspective* (Sankt Augustin, 2007), pp. 153–81.
- Wickeri, Philip L., *Christian Encounters with Chinese Culture: Essays on Anglican and Episcopal History in China* (Hong Kong, 2015).
- Wickeri, Philip L., *Reconstructing Christianity in China: K. H. Ting and the Chinese Church* (Maryknoll, NY, 2007).
- Xu, Edward Yihua, 'St. John's University, Shanghai as an Evangelising Agency', *Studies in World Christianity*, 12 (2006): 23–49.

Part II

Building the Church Culturally

The Cultural Origins of the Anglican Church in Kenya

John Karanja

There are two possible ways of viewing the Church. First, there is the more conspicuous, formal, perspective, which sees the Church as an organized institution with its own regulations, doctrine, liturgy, and form of ministry. From this perspective, the Anglican Church of Kenya resembles its English mother Church, adhering to the Book of Common Prayer, the Thirty-Nine Articles, and the threefold order of ministry. Second, there is the less obvious grassroots perspective, which sees the Church as an aggregate of Christian communities struggling to come to terms with their total environment. This struggle involves a creative response to the tensions produced by the encounter between Christianity and indigenous cultural beliefs and practices.

In this chapter, I adopt the grassroots approach to show that in its response to, and appropriation of, Christianity, the Anglican Church in Kenya was heavily indebted to indigenous models and experiences for its impetus, dynamism, and direction. This approach has two advantages. First, it takes seriously the interaction of the Church with its local environment. The Church in Kenya has never existed in a vacuum. It has developed in an environment which has impinged upon it, and which it has sought to transform. To cite Richard Gray, 'it is only at this level that one can begin to examine in detail the interaction between Christianity and the specific network of tribal beliefs and social institutions'.¹ Second, this approach enables me to compare my findings with related studies elsewhere in Africa, especially in Uganda, to ask why the Anglican Church in Kenya was different, and to point to what was distinctively its own. The study focuses on central Kenya because it is inhabited by a relatively homogeneous people; the sources, oral and written, are readily obtainable; and

¹ R. Gray, 'Problems of Historical Perspectives: The Planting of Christianity in Africa in the Nineteenth and Twentieth Centuries', in C. G. Baeta (ed.), *Christianity in Tropical Africa* (London, 1968), pp. 18–31 (p. 27).

I possess the necessary linguistic skills to interpret them. I focus on three elements of central Kenya's culture that shaped its interaction with Christianity in its Anglican form: its pragmatic and mobile nature, its conflict resolution mechanism, and its desire to master and exercise power. The period of study starts with the arrival of the first Anglican missionary in 1900 and ends in 1932 with the young Church having overcome its first major crisis.

THE SETTING

Kikuyu, who are the main subject of this chapter, constitute the largest group of Bantu-speaking people in the Central Province of Kenya. The definite article is deliberately left out before the word Kikuyu to signify the diverse nature of the tribe. This study covers Kikuyu proper and their eastern cousins, Embu. At the turn of the twentieth century, they numbered about half a million. Their ancestral land is a highland area measuring about 100 miles north to south and 50 miles east to west. The altitude ranges from 3,000 to 9,000 feet.² The Kikuyu hills are traversed by numerous streams and rivers that have created a distinctive topography of high, narrow ridges and deep valleys. Central Kenya enjoys heavy and reliable rainfall. Mean annual rainfall ranges from 40 inches in the low-lying areas to 70 inches in the higher areas. The temperatures are generally moderate, ranging from 45 to 85 degrees Fahrenheit.

Kikuyu social organization was based on two fundamental principles: kinship and age-grading. The principle of kinship found direct expression in *mbari*. This was a descent group extending to several known generations, named after its founder and jointly owning a piece of land. Each *mbari* selected from among its most able members a *muramati* (trustee of family land), whose primary responsibility was to control the allocation and use of the land. The *muramati* was usually the senior member of the *mbari*. All male, circumcised, and married members of the *mbari* formed a council that, under the *muramati*'s leadership, regulated *mbari* affairs.³ The principle of age-grading⁴ cut across clan and lineage affiliations. Through circumcision, all Kikuyu were admitted to membership of an age grade at some suitable time after reaching adolescence. Each age grade was given a name relating to some outstanding event of the year (a war, famine, or a new dance). Membership of an age grade carried with it powerful obligations of brotherhood and sisterhood towards all other members.

² *The National Atlas of Kenya* (Nairobi, 1970 edn.).

³ J. Kenyatta, *Facing Mount Kenya* (London, 1938), ch. 1; J. Middleton and G. Kershaw, *The Central Tribes of the North-Eastern Bantu: The Kikuyu and Kamba of Kenya*, Ethnographic Survey of Africa, East Central Africa, Part 5 (London, 1965), pp. 23–9.

⁴ Kenyatta, *Facing Mount Kenya*, pp. 115–16; L. S. B. Leakey, *Southern Kikuyu* (London, 1977), vol. II, ch. 18.

In this way, it unified the clan and family groups of that particular age grade throughout the whole territorial unit.

Kikuyu religious beliefs may be classified into two separate but related areas: belief in *Ngai* (the High God) and belief in ancestral spirits. *Ngai* was regarded as omnipotent and omniscient. He was the creator and sustainer of all things. Kikuyu believed that the ancestors, though physically dead, continued to exercise their influence over the living through their *ngoma* (spirits). Kikuyu recognized three types of spirits: the spirits of the immediate forebears, the spirits of the clan, and the age-group spirits. Sacrifices were the most solemn form of worship. Their chief function was to maintain a healthy relationship between the physical and spiritual worlds.⁵

MISSIONARY OCCUPATION OF CENTRAL KENYA

The establishment of colonial rule⁶ and, more importantly, the building of the Uganda railway, paved the way for extensive missionary up-country penetration.⁷ The Church Missionary Society (CMS) was at the forefront of this expansion. Between 1900 and 1913, the society set up seven stations in central Kenya: Kabete (1900), Weithaga (1903), Kahuhia (1906), Kabare (1910), Kigari (1910), Mutira (1911), and Gathukeine (1913). Kabete was always seen as the mother church. Its close proximity to Nairobi and the Kikuyu station of the Church of Scotland Mission, together with its sponsorship by the remarkable chiefs Koinange and Njonjo, ensured that it would never be far from political controversy. Weithaga was characterized by the early vigour of its immigrant converts but was soon overtaken as an educational centre by the more easily accessible Kahuhia farther down the hill. The last four stations were founded in a second wave of expansion in which to some extent the CMS found itself overstretched. In subsequent years, these younger stations were less often staffed than older ones. All these contrasts are relevant to later discussion.

Three other Protestant missions established work in the area: the Church of Scotland Mission (CSM), the Africa Inland Mission (AIM), and the Gospel Missionary Society (GMS). The CSM was the first to open a station in the Kikuyu country in 1898. The AIM set up its headquarters at Kijabe on the Southern Kikuyu Escarpment in 1901. The GMS, which was initially affiliated with the AIM, established its first station in Kikuyuland in 1902.⁸

⁵ J. S. Mbiti, *African Religions and Philosophy* (London, 1969), p. 59.

⁶ G. H. Mungeam, *British Rule in Kenya 1895–1912* (Oxford, 1966).

⁷ M. G. Mill, *The Permanent Way*, 2 vols. (Nairobi, n.d.).

⁸ R. MacPherson, *The Presbyterian Church in Kenya* (Nairobi, 1970), chs. 3 and 5; R. Oliver, *The Missionary Factor in East Africa* (London, 1952), p. 171.

Thus by 1915 there were four Protestant missions working in central Kenya, with a total of fifteen stations. The CMS stations and those of the GMS and AIM (with the exception of Kijabe) were 'one-man' stations, three or four missionaries being the most ever resident. The CSM missions operated along different lines. The aim of the CSM leaders was to found fewer but larger stations, each complete with medical facilities and with a relatively large staff of missionaries.⁹ The location of four Protestant missions in close proximity to each other was bound to produce friction and cause overlapping and confusion. Hence in 1902, the CMS and CSM agreed to divide the Kikuyu area into two spheres, with the CMS getting the territory to the east of a line from Ngong to Mount Kenya and the CSM the area to the west. Similar arrangements were eventually worked out with the other Protestant missions operating in the area.¹⁰ For many years, the policy of mission spheres succeeded in removing competition in evangelism among Protestant missions. However, the policy could only continue to work satisfactorily, after Kikuyu began to move about and to learn other ways, if in general the same methods of work were followed by all the missions. Once Africans realized that some missions with less advanced schools happened to insist on stricter standards of personal living among their adherents, they began to call for freedom of choice in religion. This chapter explores why many chose to become Anglican and how they made Anglicanism Kikuyu.

CULTURAL DYNAMISM AND ENCOUNTER WITH CHRISTIANITY

Like many African societies, Kikuyu were a dynamic and mobile people. The society consisted of immigrant groups who settled in Murang'a in the sixteenth century and later spread northward into Nyeri and southward into Kiambu. The southward movement was still in progress at the time of the British occupation.¹¹ As they sought to come to terms with their new environment, the immigrants evolved a highly innovative and adaptive culture. Kikuyu culture was flexible enough to accommodate varied practices. The society consisted of two distinct ritual sections with significant variation in customs: *Ukabi* and *Kikuyu* guilds. The former regarded themselves as akin to

⁹ M. G. Capon, *Towards Unity in Kenya: The Story of Co-operation between Missions and Churches in Kenya, 1913-1947* (Nairobi, 1962), p. 6.

¹⁰ CMS Archives, Birmingham, England: G3A5/1902/111, Minutes of the Executive Committee, 6-7 Aug. 1902; G3A5/1909/134, Peel to Baylis, 8 Nov. 1909; Capon, *Towards Unity*, chs. 2 and 3.

¹¹ G. Muriuki, *A History of the Kikuyu* (Oxford, 1974).

Maasai. Their ceremonies were less rigid and more simplified than those of Kikuyu proper. Movement from one guild to another was allowed provided all the necessary preliminary ceremonies were observed.¹² At times of prolonged crises, individuals or families were willing to change from one guild to another in the hope of ending their misfortunes.¹³ It was not unprecedented that when missionaries arrived at a time of great personal or social crisis that some people should join the newcomers' guild. This reaction suggests that 'conversion represented an experimental search for religious power rather than a psychological crisis of guilt and forgiveness'.¹⁴

This pragmatic and adaptive nature of Kikuyu culture often served to enhance the missionary cause. Individuals who lost confidence in traditional beliefs and practices sometimes joined the missions in search of a better alternative. A case in point is Nuhu Kanyingi, who was born at Kiambuthia in Murang'a in 1890.¹⁵ In 1918, he settled in Nyandarua, where he was employed as a forest ranger. His problems started in 1923, the year he became a medicine man. Between 1923 and 1928, his wife gave birth to several children, all of whom died soon after birth. Each time this happened, he consulted with a fellow medicine man, who assured him that the tragedy would not be repeated. The fact that misfortunes continued dogging him despite the medicine man's assurances shook his confidence in the efficacy of Kikuyu religion. One day in 1928, on his way to consult another medicine man, Kanyingi encountered a group of Christians holding an open-air meeting. He drew near to listen to them. In their message, they emphasized that faith in Christ removed all worries and cares. They singled out the fears of witchcraft, superstitions, and persistent misfortunes as some of the problems from which their audience needed deliverance. The message had an instant impact on Kanyingi. He cancelled his visit to the medicine man, gave up his own practice, and joined the new faith. The following year he returned to Kiambuthia and enrolled as a baptismal candidate. He was baptized in 1936. Thus Kanyingi joined the mission as a result of disappointment with Kikuyu traditional religion and out of a desire to test the new faith. Mission Christianity passed his test: his subsequent children survived. This may have been due to improvement in medical science or other physical factors. However, Kanyingi was convinced that Christianity had ended his misfortunes.

¹² L. J. Beecher, *The Kikuyu* (Nairobi, 1944), pp. 5–6; C. W. Hobley, *Bantu Beliefs and Magic, with Particular Reference to the Kikuyu and Kamba Tribes of Kenya Colony* (London, 1922), p. 77; M. N. Kabetu, *Kirira Kia Ugikuyu* (Nairobi, 1966), pp. 74–7.

¹³ S. G. Kibicho, 'The Continuity of the African Conception of God into and through Christianity: A Kikuyu Case-Study', in E. Fasholé-Luke, R. Gray, A. Hastings, and G. Tasié (eds.), *Christianity in Independent Africa* (Bloomington and London, 1978), pp. 370–88 (p. 386).

¹⁴ R. W. Strayer, *The Making of Mission Communities in East Africa* (London, 1978), p. 83.

¹⁵ Interview with Isaac Kamau and Stanley Kagiri, 22 May 1991; 'A History of St Mark's Church, Kiambuthia, 1935–90', unpublished manuscript, n.d.

He remained a staunch Anglican until his death in 1983. Kanyingi's decision to abandon his profession and become a Christian might seem strange considering his special status in traditional Kikuyu society. It should be seen, however, as an illustration of the fact that even for people who were committed to old beliefs and derived their livelihood from them, Kikuyu culture was adaptive enough to overcome their vested interests.

The pragmatic nature of Kikuyu culture was not only manifest in personal crisis; it was also evident during times of social crisis. Natural disasters often 'activated a search for an appropriate religious technology which could not exclude the resources of resident missionaries'.¹⁶ There is the celebrated case of Herbert Butcher, the resident missionary at Mutira in present-day Kirinyaga district.¹⁷ Missionary work at this CMS station was greatly hindered by three factors: absence of a European missionary for a considerable period of time, opposition from local chiefs, and competition from medicine men. During Butcher's incumbency, Mutira experienced two severe droughts—1921 and 1924—that threatened animal and human life. Efforts of ritual experts failed to bring down the rain. On both occasions, Butcher successfully prayed for the rain, thus helping the community to avert a major crisis. His successful prayers produced instantaneous results. Large numbers of people streamed into Mutira mission. Among them were several prominent medicine men, who renounced their practice and surrendered their divining equipment to be burnt. People flocked to the mission because they began to see Butcher as a formidable medicine man with a potent set of rituals. The reaction of the medicine men is difficult to understand considering their status in society. Perhaps they gave up their profession and joined the mission in recognition of Butcher's superior power and from fear that the new faith would soon make them redundant. Both considerations again emphasize the pragmatic and adaptive nature of Kikuyu culture.

THE MISSION STATION AS A SOLUTION TO FAMILY CONFLICTS

Family conflicts were common in Kikuyu society. They were caused by growing pressure on land after several generations, unevenness of achievement (especially where one branch of the *mbari* had prospered and grown while another branch had remained relatively stationary), and accusations of

¹⁶ Strayer, *Mission Communities*, p. 4.

¹⁷ Interview with Canon Johana Njumbi, 19 Apr. 1991; Mariko Kangi, 26 Apr. 1991; Kenya National Archives: Mutira Log Book, entry for 19 Dec. 1921; CMS Archives: G3AL 1917–34, Annual Letter from Butcher, 1924.

witchcraft. Periodically, quarrels arose between parents and their children over taboo violations.¹⁸ Another source of family quarrels was arranged marriages. The commonest means of resolving those conflicts was through one party seeking an alternative home. After the arrival of Christianity, the mission station became one such alternative home. But this relocation also produced new tensions, to be resolved through compromise and negotiation, a process which was at the heart of the making of a specifically Kikuyu Church.

The story of Emily Mumbi illustrates how the desire to avoid arranged marriages led some Kikuyu girls to join the missions. At first, Kikuyu were opposed to girls attending the missions for two reasons. It conflicted with the role assigned to women by society. While it was men's responsibility to protect the home, women were essentially homemakers.¹⁹ While the men were on war raids, it was the women's duty to care for the home. Mission attendance was fiercely resisted because it tended to divert women from this role. Kikuyu also feared that mission attendance would offer the girls unwarranted freedom that might express itself in their going to Nairobi to become prostitutes.²⁰ This act would both bring shame to the girls' parents and upset their chances of a good bride price.²¹

Mumbi was born c.1888 at Kabete in Kiambu district. Her parents died during the great famine of 1900.²² According to Kikuyu custom, the responsibility for providing for her passed on to her paternal uncle, Chege Kanyi, a rich village headman. Mumbi found life at her paternal uncle's home hard and difficult to cope with. She felt overworked and not sufficiently rewarded for her labour. She thought that Chege's biological children did far less work than she and got far better rewards for it. Mumbi attributed this supposed discrimination to the fact that Chege was not her biological father and therefore had no affection for her. The latent conflict between Mumbi and Chege came into the open over the issue of marriage. In theory, Kikuyu did not practise forced marriages; young men and women were left to choose their partners without undue parental pressure. In practice, however, this was not always the case. There were times when parents, in search of good connections and wealth, arranged for their daughters to marry wealthy and famous individuals without considering the girls' wishes.²³

¹⁸ E.g. J. Karanja, *Founding an African Faith: Kikuyu Anglican Christianity, 1900–1945* (Nairobi, 1999), pp. 17–19.

¹⁹ W. S. Routledge, *With a Prehistoric People* (London, 1910), p. 121.

²⁰ Interview with Emily Mumbi Shadrach, 23 Aug. 1989; George Kaniaru and Evanson Mureithi, 24 Aug. 1989; K. Ward, 'The Development of Protestant Christianity in Kenya', PhD thesis, University of Cambridge, 1976, p. 117.

²¹ St Michael's Church, Gathukeine: CMS Gathukeine Station Log Book.

²² The great famine of 1899–1900 acquired the name *Ng'aragu ya Ruraya* (Famine of Europe) because most of the relief was understood to have come from abroad. See E. N. Wanyoike, *An African Pastor* (Nairobi, 1974), pp. 19–20.

²³ Routledge, *With a Prehistoric People*, pp. 124–5; Leakey, *Southern Kikuyu*, vol. I, p. 10; Kenyatta, *Facing Mount Kenya*, p. 165.

In 1907, Chege made arrangements with an old wealthy polygamist to marry his foster daughter. The arrangements were made behind Mumbi's back. To Chege's embarrassment, she rejected the man chosen for her. This reaction provoked open hostility between Mumbi and her uncle since custom allowed Chege to make marriage arrangements for his foster daughter without consulting her. Mumbi was well aware of this. What she questioned were her paternal uncle's motives in arranging for her marriage. Since she had grown to mistrust Chege's attitude to her, she could not help believing this to be another instance of exploitation by an unscrupulous foster father. In refusing to marry the old man, Mumbi was rebelling against what she perceived as her uncle's perpetual exploitation. For Chege, Mumbi's behaviour was an act of insubordination intended to humiliate him and to deny him a hefty bride price. Their conflict was therefore inevitable.

While living with her relatives away from Chege, Mumbi met Shadrach Njuguna, her future husband. He was among the first Kikuyu to join the CMS Kabete station. At the time Mumbi met him, Njuguna was a pupil-teacher at the CMS Kabete school.²⁴ Non-Christian girls wishing to marry male mission adherents were required first to enrol for baptism. To fulfil this requirement, Mumbi enrolled as an inquirer. She was married to Njuguna in 1910, theirs being the first African Christian wedding at Kabete mission.²⁵ In accordance with Kikuyu custom, Njuguna paid bride price to Chege. This act served to bring reconciliation between Mumbi and her foster father.²⁶

MISSION CHRISTIANITY AND THE QUEST FOR POWER

Pre-Christian Kikuyu society was marked by competition for power and wealth. In particular, large landowning *mbaris* competed vigorously with each other to increase their landholdings, the number of wives they married, the children they produced, and the number of tenants they supported and hence were economically and politically allied to them.²⁷ With the arrival of Christianity, a new form of power emerged. Missionaries introduced literacy, which greatly fascinated Kikuyu. The new skill was important because it seemed to give special power to an individual that other members of society

²⁴ A pupil-teacher was a student selected and engaged by the management of an elementary school to assist the teachers in maintaining discipline and imparting instruction. The pupil-teacher also received instruction in subjects of general education.

²⁵ St Paul's Church Kabete, *Diocese of Mount Kenya South: Partners in Mission Consultation Report, 1987*, p. 4. The document erroneously states that their wedding took place in 1905.

²⁶ Interview with Emily Mumbi Shadrach, 23 Aug. 1989.

²⁷ R. Tignor, *The Colonial Transformation of Kenya* (Princeton, NJ, 1976), p. 12.

did not possess. In fact, some Kikuyu were drawn to the missions by a quest for literacy, which was widely perceived as the 'white man's magic'. Gideon Mugo, a leading evangelist and politician from Kahuhia, joined the local CMS mission in order to learn the 'miracle' of reading and writing.²⁸ This happened after his younger brother, who had joined the school before him, sent him a letter from Embu. Gideon's brother, Mariko, had settled at the CMS Kigari mission as one of the assistants to T. W. W. Crawford,²⁹ the pioneer missionary there. At that time Gideon was preliterate, so he asked Livai Gachanja, the head of the mission adherents at Kahuhia, to read the letter for him. The subject matter of the letter was only known to the two brothers and Gideon was greatly surprised to hear Livai reading it from the paper. At that moment he resolved to join the mission and learn 'to talk to a paper'.

In describing literacy as the white man's magic, Kikuyu were placing the new skill within the scope of their cultural experience. They believed that there was an inherent power pervading the universe that could be tapped in various ways to the advantage or disadvantage of the individual or community.³⁰ Literacy, though originating with the 'white man', was seen as a manifestation of that mystical power. Just as ritual experts had to undergo a formal training before they were fully admitted into their professions, so Gideon had to go through a period of instruction in mission schools before he could secure the new power.

Later, when the Church grew in numbers and respectability, it also became a new arena for the exercise of power. The out-schools—village schools founded and run by African Christians several miles away from the central mission station—came to symbolize the Kikuyu quest for power and prosperity. *Mbaris* competed in establishing out-schools in their areas. Individuals and clans vied for the control of their local churches and schools. Indeed some *mbaris* insisted on being served by ordained ministers from their own family. Thus since the Church offered the opportunity to exercise power, it became part of Kikuyu politics.

A SLUGGISH START, 1900–14

The evidence of early Kikuyu response to Christianity challenges one and affirms another theory of African Church growth. It challenges the social

²⁸ 'Rugano rwa Gideon Mugo Kagika' [A Profile of Gideon Mugo Kagika], typescript, n.d., privately held by this writer.

²⁹ Dr T. W. Crawford belonged to the Canadian CMS. He joined the CMS Kenya mission in 1904. Crawford was the pioneer missionary at Kahuhia (1906–9). When he left Kahuhia in 1909 to begin a mission at Kigari, he was accompanied by five assistants among whom was Mariko Kuhutha.

³⁰ Macpherson, *Presbyterian Church in Kenya*, pp. 9–10. This belief was widespread in Africa. See Mbiti, *African Religions and Philosophy*, pp. 197–8.

disruption theory³¹ and affirms Robin Horton's 'intellectualist' theory.³² The former correlates African response to Christianity with the level of social disruption caused by socio-economic crises. It asserts that individuals and societies whose old order had collapsed and not been replaced by a new one were especially open to Christianity. The social disruption theory seems to be only partially applicable to central Kenya. It is true that colonial occupation and the natural disasters of the late nineteenth century significantly disrupted Kikuyu society, rendering it more open to missionary teaching. Nevertheless, the theory seems to overlook the dynamic nature of African societies. Even before the coming of Europeans, Kikuyu were socially differentiated; obvious distinctions existed between wealthy landowners and *ahoi* (tenants), men and women, young and old. As seen earlier, conflicts within pre-Christian Kikuyu society forced individuals to seek an alternative home. Kikuyu society was less authoritarian than many African societies,³³ and this gave opportunity for dissenting individuals to leave their original home and settle elsewhere. Thus even without colonial occupation and natural disasters, Kikuyu society had enough internal differences and conflicts, and was flexible enough, to create some potential mission adherents.

Horton's theory avers that in small-scale societies, lesser spirits underpin the events and processes of the microcosm of the local community. However, as social relationships widen through trade or migrant labour, the significance of lesser spirits (which are relevant only to a specific locality) fades and the High God appears of greater importance.³⁴ And indeed it was the case that young Kikuyu migrant labourers working in Mombasa and Nairobi were more open to Christianity than the less mobile members of rural society. Nevertheless, for some years they remained a small minority. The question is whether Horton's theory can be used to explain the comparatively slow growth of the Kikuyu Church before 1915.

By 1914, after fourteen years of vigorous missionary activity, the CMS had set up seven mission stations and three out-stations in central Kenya. Within those stations there were 419 adherents, out of whom 186 were baptized, 66 were regular communicants, and 233 were under definite instruction. In 1914, attendance at the society's thirteen schools averaged 682 and native teachers

³¹ Scholars who allude to this theory include J. F. Ajayi, *Christian Missions in Nigeria 1841-91: The Making of a New Elite* (London, 1965), pp. 19-23; J. McCracken, *Politics and Christianity in Malawi 1875-1940* (Cambridge, 1977), pp. 58-61; J. Iliffe, *A Modern History of Tanganyika* (Cambridge, 1979), pp. 86-7, 221.

³² For a full exposition of this theory, see R. Horton, 'African Conversion', *Africa*, 41 (1971): 85-108.

³³ Centralized societies like Buganda had little room for dissenting individuals. Everyone was expected to conform to the wishes of the rulers.

³⁴ Horton, 'African Conversion', pp. 101-2.

numbered twelve.³⁵ These statistics compared unfavourably with those of western Kenya. The CMS began missionary work in western Kenya in 1906, six years after the start of work in central Kenya.³⁶ By 1914, western Kenya had three mission stations, 27 out-stations, and 1,403 adherents, out of whom 369 were baptized, 90 were regular communicants, and 1,034 were under definite instruction. There were 3,240 pupils attending nine mission schools whose teaching staff included nine Africans.³⁷

The rapid growth of missionary work in western compared with central Kenya was mainly due to three factors. First, there seems to have been a greater sense of mutual purpose between colonial administrators, missionaries, and local chiefs in western than in central Kenya. This was largely due to John Ainsworth, the Nyanza Provincial Commissioner between 1907 and 1917.³⁸ Ainsworth had a better idea of setting up colonial administration than any of his counterparts in central Kenya. His policy of promoting enlightened local leadership coincided with missionary desire to recruit their first adherents from the households of chiefs.³⁹ Perhaps due to their close proximity to the increasingly Christian kingdom of Buganda, Luo⁴⁰ chiefs quickly realized the advantages of this European educational strategy and were therefore more cooperative in recruiting schoolchildren than their Kikuyu counterparts.

Second, Luo chiefs carried more natural authority over their subjects than their Kikuyu counterparts. Kikuyu chiefs owed their positions not to Kikuyu society, which was acephalous, but to colonial administrators. By contrast, most of the Luo had been clan heads or war leaders at the time they became chiefs.⁴¹ Thus Luo chiefs combined both traditional and modern roles and were therefore acceptable and not seen as mere upstarts. Any programme that they supported was likely to receive public support. Thus their support of missionary work gave it a tremendous boost.

Third, the labour market provided a greater incentive for Luo to acquire Western education than for Kikuyu. Young Luo migrated down the railway—which reached Kisumu in western Kenya in 1901—in search of employment. The railway offered either very heavy unskilled work or jobs that required a relatively high degree of training. So among Luo, the idea of learning a new skill in order to get a more rewarding job came quite early. On the other hand, loss of land to European settlers led many Kikuyu to settle as squatters on

³⁵ *Proceedings of the CMS, 1914–1915*, p. xxiii.

³⁶ *Proceedings of the CMS, 1906–1907*, pp. 102–3.

³⁷ *Proceedings of the CMS, 1914–1915*, p. xxiii.

³⁸ F. J. M. Lonsdale, 'Western Kenya, 1883–1958: A Political History', unpublished manuscript, ch. 4.

³⁹ Lonsdale, 'Western Kenya', pp. 266ff.

⁴⁰ Western Kenya is inhabited by two large ethnic communities, Luo and Luhya.

⁴¹ Lonsdale, 'Western Kenya', pp. 235–6.

European farms. Unlike railway work, squatting did not require a new skill.⁴² Thus for Kikuyu, it appears that there was less of an intellectual challenge from colonization and less of an intellectual response until the crisis of the First World War.

Before 1915, few Kikuyu were attracted to missions, for four main reasons. First and foremost, due to the acephalous nature of their society, Kikuyu felt more free to act as individuals than, for example, the more highly centralized Baganda or even Luo. This tendency was reflected in the freedom with which Kikuyu *ahoi* (tenants) selected their patrons. It was as individuals that the early Kikuyu went to missions, and individual decisions were bound to be reflected in slower statistical growth than group ones. Second, the benefits of Western education had not yet been realized. That had to wait until after the First World War. Third, many parents were reluctant to send their children to school because schooling conflicted with the latter's role in society. Moreover, mission attendance seemed to foster a spirit of rebellion against traditional authority.⁴³ Fourth, since many mission adherents were marginal people, sending one's child to school was seen as 'an admission of poverty shunned by those more fortunate'.⁴⁴

TAKE-OFF, 1915–24

In stark contrast to the earlier period of relatively slow growth, the period between 1915 and 1924 witnessed phenomenal growth within the Kikuyu Anglican Church. The number of mission adherents rose sharply, many out-schools were started to meet the rising demand for Western education, Africans began to play a greater role in the running of their Church, and there was a remarkable improvement in relationships between Christians and the non-Christian population. Two developments seem to have brought about these changes. First, the boundaries that formerly insulated Kikuyu society from the wider world were weakening through increased interaction with other communities.⁴⁵ In particular, many Kikuyu men served as carrier corps during the First World War. For those young men, Kikuyu traditional religion with its emphasis on ancestral spirits (which were only relevant to

⁴² I am indebted to Dr John Lonsdale for this point. Lonsdale has undertaken extensive scholarly research on these two communities.

⁴³ E.g. the stories of Paul Mbatia and Aram Ndaari in Karanja, *Founding an African Faith*, pp. 22–8.

⁴⁴ Strayer, *Mission Communities*, p. 60; interview with George Kaniaru and Evanson Mur-eithi, 19 Mar. 1991.

⁴⁵ This interpretation, which is based on Horton's theory of African conversion, was confirmed by my interviewees during my field research in Kenya.

their home locality) was incapable of explaining the wider world in which they suddenly found themselves.⁴⁶ On the other hand Christianity, with its emphasis on the High God who directs the affairs of the whole world, seemed best placed to explain the larger world. The experimentalist and adaptive nature of Kikuyu culture facilitated the transition from Kikuyu religion to Christianity.

Second, the war experience, coupled with the increase in white settler population immediately after the war,⁴⁷ heightened Kikuyu awareness of the permanence of European rule and of the new social system created by that rule. Realizing that their interests could no longer be safeguarded by continued resistance to that system, they began to explore the best means of exploiting the opportunities provided by it. Western education provided the answer. Literacy resulted not only in relatively well-paid employment in government and private sectors; it also guaranteed a new social status, both respected and feared. Since education was controlled largely by missionaries, those wishing to acquire it enrolled in mission schools. This accounts for the dramatic rise in mission attendance after the war. At the same time, relationships between mission adherents and non-Christians began to improve as the latter realized that the former had something important to offer—education.

This new interest in Western education manifested itself in the establishment of out-schools. Since the CMS lacked sufficient funds to buy all the land required, or build and maintain schools over wide areas, it had to depend on the cooperation of the local people in the provision of land and construction and maintenance of buildings. By 1924, a definite pattern of establishing and running out-schools had emerged. After the local elders had agreed to start a school, a local resident provided the land on which to build it. In most cases the land was given by a mission adherent; in other cases it was provided by a *muramati*. The plot often remained part of that family's property and could be reclaimed when needed.⁴⁸ Building materials and labour were all donated and the erection of the building was carried out communally. Sometimes the community paid the teachers' salaries and provided them with a house. The mission was mainly responsible for training, allocation, and supervision of teachers. The *raison d'être* of the out-schools was promotion of evangelism.

⁴⁶ One evidence of the weakening hold of Kikuyu religion on society after the First World War was the declining fear of ritual pollution and with it the old restraints, resulting in all manner of crimes 'from which the old heathen beliefs had been a remarkable safeguard'. CMS Archives: G3AL/1917-34, Annual Letter from H. D. Hooper, 1918. See also Annual Letter from Harry Leakey, 1917: Macpherson, *Presbyterian Church in Kenya*, p. 72.

⁴⁷ Immediately after the war, a large group of ex-servicemen settled in Kenya under the colonial government's soldier settlement scheme. Tignor, *Colonial Transformation*, pp. 23-4; C. G. Rosberg and J. Nottingham, *The Myth of Mau Mau: Nationalism in Kenya* (New York, 1966), pp. 33-4.

⁴⁸ In the absence of written agreement between *muramati* and the missionary, it is impossible to be more precise over the legal status of school plots and buildings. In subsequent years, the uncertain status assumed considerable importance as will be seen later.

They provided basic literacy to enable the students to read Christian literature in the vernacular. On weekdays, the schools served as centres for literacy and religious instruction. On Sundays they were used as prayer houses.

The importance of the out-schools cannot be overestimated. They were the chief means through which Christianity spread in Kikuyuland after the First World War. They provided the bulk of the early mission adherents. In 1924, McGregor at Weithaga reported that the sixteen out-schools within his district 'provide 75% of our converts'.⁴⁹ The out-school system led also to an increase in the number of female mission adherents. This was mainly because the schools served the needs of 'women and children who cannot be reached from a distance, but will respond to work in their immediate neighborhood'.⁵⁰ The out-schools offered great scope for African Christians to exercise Church leadership without too much missionary supervision. According to Handley Hooper, 'the school provides for them the first vision of a native church and it engenders a native enthusiasm which was not possible while the control and direction of the church was immediately in the hands of a benevolent foreigner'.⁵¹

SETBACK AND RECOVERY, 1925–32

Between 1925 and 1932, all the Protestant Churches in central Kenya experienced unprecedented upheaval. This section focuses on the impact of that upheaval on the young Kikuyu Anglican Church. The *athomi*⁵² (mission adherents) clashed both with missionaries, with one another, and with non-Christians, over the issue of acceptable and unacceptable customs and ceremonies. They disagreed with missionaries over Kikuyu customs and participation in politics. Mission adherents who refused to renounce 'barbaric' customs antagonized their mentors. The *athomi* participation in movements of political protest against colonial rule created serious tensions partly because it challenged the missionaries' claim to be the sole spokesmen of African interests, but more importantly because the more radical Kikuyu political associations were openly critical of aspects of missionary activity. Some of these conflicts were so serious that they led to irreconcilable divisions. However, as we shall see later, they were themselves a natural consequence of growth. The extent of conflict within the affected areas varied according to three main factors: the level of social

⁴⁹ CMS Archives: Annual Letter from McGregor, 1924.

⁵⁰ CMS Archives: Annual Letter from Hooper, 1919.

⁵¹ CMS Archives: Annual Letter from Hooper, 1919.

⁵² The Kikuyu word *athomi* means readers. The early mission adherents came to be known as *athomi* due to their ability to read.

discontent, the attitude of the resident missionary to African customs and aspirations, and the calibre of African Church leadership. It was greatest in areas where a large number of grievances existed, where missionaries assumed an uncompromising attitude towards African culture and aspirations, and where African Church leaders lacked the necessary diplomacy to reconcile the warring factions.

The period under review was dominated by two controversies: the disagreement over *ituika* and the 'female circumcision' crisis.⁵³ Pre-colonial Kikuyu society practised gerontocracy. Alternate generation sets held judicial authority for thirty to forty years. The responsibilities of the senior generation included conducting religious ceremonies, administration of justice, making new laws, and maintenance of internal peace. The handing over of power from one generation set to the next took place in a prolonged ceremony known as *ituika*.⁵⁴ Scholarly evidence points to the existence not of one ceremony for the whole 'tribe', but of several *ituikas* held at different times in different areas. The last complete *ituika* took place between 1890 and 1898, when the Maina generation handed over to Mwangi. Details of *ituika* are not clear mainly because it was a largely secret ceremony. But it seemed to consist of three basic elements.⁵⁵ First, there was the payment of *ituika* fees in the form of goats and sheep by the incoming generation to the outgoing one. Handing over could not take place until every male member of the incoming generation had paid the necessary fees to the senior generation. Second, there was the building of temporary huts in which members of the ruling generation would instruct the younger generation in tradition. Third, there was the ceremony of plucking the tail hair from a mysterious and dangerous river monster having the characteristics of a snake.⁵⁶ The *ituika* ceremony concluded with dancing, feasting, and a public proclamation of the new government.

The next *ituika* ceremony was due to be held in the mid-1920s. The Maina or Irungu generation, whose turn it was to take over the leadership from the Mwangi generation, travelled throughout the Kikuyu districts announcing that it was time to 'buy' the country (take over the leadership). With the exception of Kahuhia, where *athomi* opinion was divided, African Christians objected to the ceremony on three grounds. First, they noted that the goats paid to the outgoing generation were used for 'pagan sacrifices'. Second, they

⁵³ Although the correct term for the operation is clitoridectomy, the practice is commonly known as female circumcision.

⁵⁴ For more information on *ituika* ceremonies, see A. W. McGregor, 'Kikuyu and Its People', *Church Missionary Review* (1909); Leakey, *Southern Kikuyu*, vol. III, pp. 1278–84; Kenyatta, *Facing Mount Kenya*, pp. 186–94.

⁵⁵ This account is largely based on Leakey's *Southern Kikuyu*, vol. III, pp. 1278–84.

⁵⁶ For an in-depth study of *ndamathia*, the mysterious snake, and its place in Kikuyu worldview, see J. Lonsdale, in B. Berman and J. Lonsdale, *Unhappy Valley: Conflict in Kenya & Africa* (London, 1992), pp. 334–6, 369–77.

claimed that the ceremonies were blatantly immoral, a reference to ritual sex acts carried out in the daytime by a specially selected elder with his senior wife, and in the presence of the assembled delegates.⁵⁷ Third, Christians argued that *ituika* ceremonies were relevant only during the pre-colonial period, when Kikuyu practised gerontocracy. With the advent of ‘the present rule of the country by the government-appointed chiefs’, the ceremonies had lost their significance.⁵⁸

The reaction of non-Christians to *athomi*’s renunciation of *ituika* varied according to the duration of missionary presence in a given area and the attitude of the local chiefs to missionary work. At Kabete, the oldest CMS station in Kikuyuland, mission adherents’ repudiation of the ceremony did not provoke conflict with non-Christians, mainly for two reasons. First, because of their long exposure to forces of change the non-Christian community at Kabete was exceptionally tolerant of nonconformity. Second, the presence of two Christian chiefs in south Kiambu—Koinange wa Mbiyu and Josiah Njonjo—ensured that Christians were not harassed for refusing to take part in objectionable customs.⁵⁹ Unlike their counterparts at Kabete, mission adherents at Kabare, Mutira, and Kigari were harassed by their non-Christian neighbours for renouncing *ituika* mainly for two reasons. First, the three districts had experienced a relatively brief period of exposure to forces of change. Moreover, their geographical location away from urban influences encouraged non-Christians both to cling to their customs and to attempt to enforce conformity. Second, the three districts were ruled by chiefs who were so hostile to missionary work that they jumped on every occasion to embarrass *athomi*, including seizing their goats for non-payment of *ituika* fees. While at Kabare, Mutira, and Kigari the issue of *ituika* pitted *athomi* against non-Christians, at Kahuhia it was a source of conflict among *athomi* themselves. Mission adherents at Kahuhia adopted an exceptionally liberal attitude towards Kikuyu customs. However, they differed on how far they should go in embracing those customs. They accepted the government’s ruling that all should pay *ituika* goats, but disagreed on whom the payment should be made to. While some felt that the fees should be paid to non-Christian members of the Mwangi generation, others argued that they should be paid to Christians of the outgoing generation.⁶⁰ In the end, however, the forces of change prevailed and the crisis petered out. *Ituika* was abandoned after it was deemed irrelevant to the new

⁵⁷ Leakey, *Southern Kikuyu*, vol. III, p. 1283. This was quite extraordinary because among Kikuyu, it was a taboo for a man and a woman to have sexual intercourse in the daytime. On Kikuyu taboos, see C. R. Dundas, ‘Organization and Laws of Some Bantu Tribes in East Africa’, *Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute*, 45 (1915): 234–306.

⁵⁸ Kenya National Archives: CMS 1/639: Kabare Station Log Book, entry for Oct. 1925.

⁵⁹ Interview with George Kaniaru and Evanson Mureithi, 19 Mar. 1991; James Kamau Ndegwa, 27 Mar. 1991; James Kuria and Silvanus Kihui, 28 Mar. 1991.

⁶⁰ Kahuhia Church Council Minutes (KCCM), April 1929 to February 1932.

social order created by colonial rule. Nevertheless, the controversy severely shook the young Kikuyu Church.

The Kikuyu female circumcision controversy is one of the most researched themes in Kenyan history.⁶¹ The existing literature tends to attribute the crisis to imprudent missionary policies and African reactions to those policies. It is true that the controversy was triggered by Protestant missionaries' attempts to make their adherents renounce an age-old Kikuyu custom, and that the extent of the crisis varied according to the attitude of the resident missionary to Kikuyu cultural practices. However, to portray African Christians as mere recipients of missionary policies is to overlook an important point. The crisis gave African Church leaders an opportunity to exercise their judgement on a delicate issue and to negotiate with missionaries and their fellow Africans. The success of Church elders, those on the vestry or parochial church council, in this task depended on their negotiating abilities. Sensitivity and flexibility were especially vital. Rigid Church elders who attempted to implement missionary policies without regard to local conditions not only clashed with local Christians; they also widened the rift between missionaries and African Christians. By contrast, sensitive and flexible leaders who modified missionary policies according to local conditions managed both to avoid clashes with ordinary Christians, and to maintain a good relationship between the *athomi* and their mentors. Thus, besides being a disagreement between African Christians and missionaries over an old custom, the crisis provided a test for *athomi* leadership abilities.

Kikuyu regarded male and female circumcision as functionally equivalent. Both operations were rites of passage signifying the transition from childhood to adulthood and eligibility for marriage. Female circumcision was supposed to be essential for childbearing. It took place before the onset of the first menses and entailed the removal of the clitoris. Local variations in the extent of cutting had persuaded government officials and some missionaries that there were two forms of the operation, a minor one limited to the excision of the clitoris, and a 'brutal' form involving cutting off the *labia manora* and *majora*.⁶² The operation was embedded in a symbolic set of rituals accompanied by much singing and dancing. While male circumcision was a public affair which was witnessed by spectators of both sexes, the girls' ceremony was confined to women and girls.

Missionaries objected to clitoridectomy on medical and religious grounds. Medically, they were appalled by the pain and suffering caused by the operation and its aftermath. Clitoridectomy was performed without anaesthetic

⁶¹ J. M. Murray, 'The Kikuyu Female Circumcision Controversy, with special Reference to the Church Missionary Society's Sphere of Influence', PhD thesis, University of California, Los Angeles, 1974.

⁶² Strayer, *Mission Communities*, pp. 136–7.

(although the body was numbed by sitting in cold water), and without modern antiseptics (although healing leaves were customarily applied after the operation).⁶³ Although healing normally proceeded without complications, in some cases scar tissues formed which made childbirth difficult. These were the cases that missionaries encountered when women were taken to mission hospitals after the efforts of Kikuyu midwives had failed.⁶⁴ The deaths of the children, and occasionally mothers, convinced mission doctors that the practice should be opposed altogether on medical grounds.⁶⁵ Religiously, missionaries were horrified by the rituals and festivities which preceded the operation. The dances and songs were sexually suggestive, and the missionaries thought them obscene and corrupting to young minds.⁶⁶

In nearly every station there had been teaching against the practice and efforts to strengthen the resolve of girls and their families against it. From the start, the CSM had led the attack on clitoridectomy and by the early 1920s, it was a rule that baptized Church members undergoing the operation or allowing their daughters to do so would be temporarily suspended from Church membership.⁶⁷ The AIM soon followed suit. While the CMS supported resolutions condemning the custom, none of its stations had imposed such a law on its adherents.⁶⁸ Throughout their campaign against female circumcision, Protestant missions endeavoured to obtain the support of their African congregations. Each decision to ban the custom was endorsed by some African elders.⁶⁹ Missionaries also made constant appeals for government support in stamping out the custom. But the government's response was cautious. While recognizing the harmful effects of female circumcision, it held that such an ancient custom would disappear only through gradual education. However, the government sought to restrict the practice by encouraging a return to what it considered to be the original, less brutal, form.⁷⁰

The female circumcision crisis reached its peak in 1929, when the CSM devised the momentous vow, or 'promise paper', demanding all its adherents

⁶³ M. S. Clough, 'Chiefs and Politicians: Local Politics and Social Change in Kiambu, Kenya, 1918–1936', PhD thesis, Stanford University, 1978, p. 307.

⁶⁴ L. S. B. Leakey, 'The Kikuyu Problem of the Initiation of Girls', *Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute*, 61 (1931): 277–85 (p. 278).

⁶⁵ *Memorandum Prepared by the Kikuyu Mission Council on Female Circumcision*, 1 Dec. 1931, p. 1.

⁶⁶ *Memorandum*, p. 6.

⁶⁷ Presbyterian Church of East Africa (PCEA) Archives: G/2, Gikuyu Native Church Laws, June 1922.

⁶⁸ Strayer, *Mission Communities*, p. 137.

⁶⁹ In 'Female Circumcision Controversy', p. 8, Murray rightly observes that without the support of African Christians, 'even the most determined Scottish missionary crusaders could not have been able to carry the campaign through'.

⁷⁰ The government did this mainly through the Local Native Councils, district-level advisory bodies set up in 1925 mainly 'to channel African political expression into acceptable directions'. Strayer, *Mission Communities*, p. 113.

to renounce the custom.⁷¹ The AIM and GMS followed a similar procedure.⁷² This uncompromising approach led to a sharp drop in Church membership. At the height of the controversy, 90 per cent of the *athomi* at the CSM Kikuyu station withdrew from the mission. The AIM and GMS suffered similar declines. David Sandgren observes that following the AIM missionaries' requirement of a loyalty pledge from all their adherents, that Church almost disappeared.⁷³ Among the Protestant missions, the CMS was least affected by the crisis because it did not fully endorse the anti-circumcision campaign. But even within this mission, the effects of the crisis varied according to the attitude of the resident missionary, the calibre of African Church leadership, and local conditions. A close examination of the impact of the crisis on Kabare and Kigari stations confirms this point. Kabare was located far from any major centre of European settlement and had experienced a relatively brief period of missionary occupation. Hence it tended to cling to Kikuyu customs. However, the station was not seriously hit by the crisis due to the sensitivity of the resident missionary and his church elders. W. J. Rampley and his assistants knew that any attempt to ban the custom would split the Church. Hence in July 1931, he convened a meeting of all mission adherents to discuss the matter. The meeting decided to allow a moderate version of female circumcision to be conducted under the auspices of the Church. Two Christian women were chosen as operators. No publicity was to be allowed whatsoever, and the only people allowed to witness the ceremony were those directly concerned. All 'repugnant customs' associated with the rite were forbidden except the payment of 'the usual goats due to the uncle of the girl initiated into womanhood'.⁷⁴ Christian circumcision for girls continued at Kabare until the 1950s. The compromise solution proved successful. The station did not lose any members over the issue of female circumcision.

Like Kabare, Kigari was located far from a major centre of European settlement. Like Kabare too, the station had experienced a relatively brief period of missionary occupation. However, Kigari differed from Kabare in two respects. First, John Comely, the missionary in charge of the district, showed an uncompromising attitude towards African customs and aspirations. An intensely spiritual man, he had been 'led by prayer' in 1929 to exclude members of Kikuyu Central Association⁷⁵ from the pastorate

⁷¹ On the events leading to the 1929 crisis, see *Memorandum*, section V; Murray, 'Female Circumcision Controversy', ch. VI; Tignor, *Colonial Transformation*, pp. 241ff.

⁷² Strayer, *Mission Communities*, p. 140.

⁷³ D. P. Sandgren, *Christianity and the Kikuyu: Religious Divisions and Social Conflict* (New York, 1989), p. 88.

⁷⁴ Kenya National Archives: CMS1/639, Kabare Station Log Book, entry for 21 July 1931.

⁷⁵ The Kikuyu Central Association (KCA) was founded in 1924 to articulate Kikuyu grievances against colonial rule.

committee at Kigari.⁷⁶ Second, the pastorate's senior elders lacked sensitivity and diplomacy, and encouraged Comely to proceed with his campaign against female circumcision. Thus in January 1931, knowing that he had the elders' support, Comely announced that he was, again, 'led by prayer to see that either circumcision must go in its present form or the church will lose its power and disappear'.⁷⁷ Comely and his assisting elders decided that any communicant allowing female circumcision in their family would be excommunicated, and that all candidates for baptism and confirmation had to renounce the custom.⁷⁸ Since the decision lacked the support of ordinary Christians, it provoked a negative reaction. Within a month, 13 out of 38 out-schools were closed and 18 out of 68 teachers left the mission. School attendance fell from 1,734 in 1930 to 346 in 1931. Adult baptisms dropped from 107 in 1930 to 54 in 1931 and 14 in 1932.⁷⁹ Thus Comely's adamant refusal to compromise, coupled with the failure of the Church elders to act as effective mediators between missionaries and ordinary Christians, plunged Kigari pastorate into a serious crisis.

Nevertheless, a compromise was finally reached between Comely and his elders on the one hand and some critics of his policy on the other. In a meeting in December 1932, the latter agreed to give up female circumcision 'if God should lead them to do so; not in obedience to the law of man, but at such time as God showed them that it was his will that they should give up'.⁸⁰ They also agreed to work in harmony with those who had fully endorsed the missionary's policy. Comely on his part allowed their children to be baptized. He had come to realize the danger of pressing the issue further. He recorded in his mission's log-book: 'One realizes that it is the strongest position to take up on such a controversial matter.'⁸¹ Comely was late in realizing the danger of his uncompromising policy, though his subsequent concessions did prevent some from leaving his Church. Also, it does seem that some *athomi* had come to realize that they could not advance economically or socially without the resources available at the missions. Membership of a mission community provided Kikuyu with respectability, employment opportunities, and the most advanced education available in the colony. Hence, despite their disagreements with their mentors, many *athomi* refused to leave the Anglican Church at the height of the controversy.

⁷⁶ Kenya National Archives: CMS/637, Embu Medical Mission Log Book, entry for 5 July 1929.

⁷⁷ Embu Medical Mission Log Book, entry for 7 Jan. 1931.

⁷⁸ Embu Medical Mission Log Book, entry for 23 Jan. 1931.

⁷⁹ Kenya National Archives: DC/EBU/1/2, Embu District Annual Reports, 1930, 1931-4; Embu Medical Mission Log Book, Dec. 1931.

⁸⁰ Embu Medical Mission Log Book, entry for 8 Dec. 1932.

⁸¹ Embu Medical Mission Log Book, entry for 8 Dec. 1932.

These points stand out the more clearly if one compares the fate of the Anglican Church with that of the AIM, which virtually collapsed as a result of the circumcision crisis. Reference to Sandgren's study suggests that because the American AIM missionaries were theologically more fundamentalist than the British Anglicans, they were less inclined to embrace compromise. On the other hand, because the education offered by the AIM was notoriously poor, the mission's Kikuyu followers had much less to lose by secession. The experience of the CSM at the same time suggests the importance of the educational factor. Its attitude to female circumcision was as uncompromising as that of the AIM, and it lost almost as many members during the initial crisis. However, it more than recovered them in the next few years.⁸² While one would expect Kabete pastorate to have suffered the fate of its CSM neighbours, the softening and mediating role of its African clergy is a sharp reminder that one cannot talk of the European missionary policy alone.⁸³

Thus by 1932, after seven years of turmoil, the Kikuyu Anglican Church had reached a new kind of synthesis based on liberty of conscience. Except at Kabete and Kigari, where temporary suspension was practised, those who allowed their daughters to undergo circumcision were not excluded from the Church.

CONCLUSION

The growth of the Kikuyu Anglican Church was similar to that of mission-founded Churches elsewhere in Africa. This was because Kikuyu society shared common features with other African communities, such as a dynamic and competitive culture and a desire to master and exercise power. Nevertheless, the African experience of Christianity varied from place to place. This was partly because of the different institutions that African communities brought into Christianity and through which they appropriated the new faith, and because of their varying colonial experience. To illustrate this variation, I briefly compare the growth of the Kikuyu Anglican Church with that of the Buganda Church. The latter has been chosen because John Taylor's classic study, *The Growth of the Church in Buganda*, provides an excellent framework for comparison.⁸⁴ Two points of contrast between these two contexts need to be noted. First, the structures of the two societies were different and this had implications for the spread of the gospel. To quote M. P. K. Sorrenson, a

⁸² See the graph in Macpherson's *Presbyterian Church*, p. 115.

⁸³ For the mediating role of the Kabete clergy, see Karanja, *Founding an African Faith*, pp. 185–7.

⁸⁴ J. V. Taylor, *The Growth of the Church in Buganda* (London, 1958).

New Zealand historian, 'Unlike the Ganda, the Kikuyu were an extremely segmented society, with no centralized political institutions. There was no Kikuyu Constantine—or Kabaka—to capture and thus no possibility of conversion from the top. In the Kikuyu country and elsewhere in the British East Africa Protectorate the missionaries had to start from the bottom.'⁸⁵ Second, while in Buganda Christianity preceded colonial rule, in Kikuyuland colonial rule preceded Christianity. This means that in Buganda in the pioneering period, missionaries were more dependent on African rulers than in the Kikuyu country. Moreover, since the Baganda chiefs were the natural leaders of their people, they commanded more respect from both society and missionaries than their Kikuyu counterparts. The first Baganda deacons, who were recruited from the ranks of chiefs, were treated by missionaries as colleagues and not as protégés. By contrast, the first generation of Kikuyu pastors remained more subservient to their mentors.

Two aspects of Taylor's work are especially relevant to this study: his analysis of the processes of Church growth, and his examination of the Baganda contribution to the evangelization of neighbouring areas. Regarding the processes of Church growth in Buganda, Taylor identifies four consecutive components: congruence, detachment, demand, and crisis.⁸⁶ Congruence involved 'a fitting together and contact of the new community and the new teaching with the old structure and the complex of ideas which already existed'. Detachment meant the gradual loosening of the ties that bound people to the old ways. Demand meant the challenge that people felt the gospel made upon them. Crisis referred to the conflict of loyalties among Baganda Christians resulting from the upheavals of 1879–92. I focus on the first and the last of these components because they show clearly the difference in the development of the two Anglican Churches in Kikuyuland and Buganda.

Within Baganda society, some institutions proved to be congruent with the structure of a mission station. On the other hand, within Kikuyu society, this congruence was less obvious. In Buganda, the mission resembled the Kabaka's palace and chiefs' households with their clusters of retainers and dependants. In Taylor's words, 'the new thing could, apparently, be described in familiar categories and therefore, recognized and accepted. It belonged, and therefore one could belong to it.'⁸⁷ By contrast, there was no Kikuyu social equivalent of a mission station. Perhaps the closest parallel was an *mbari*, but the similarity between local Kikuyu Church organization and *mbari* did not become obvious until the Church gained respectability. Moreover, while it was common practice for ambitious Baganda parents to send their sons away to be servants

⁸⁵ M. P. K. Sorrenson, *Origins of European Settlement in Kenya* (Oxford, 1958), p. 254.

⁸⁶ Taylor, *Growth*, pp. 43–59; J. V. Taylor, *Processes of Church Growth in an African Church* (London, 1958).

⁸⁷ Taylor, *Processes*, p. 8.

of chiefs or of the Kabaka, Kikuyu did not have a similar custom. Poor Kikuyu adults (*ahoi*) did attach themselves to wealthy patrons, but they did this primarily out of poverty and misfortune rather than out of ambition. This lack of obvious congruence may initially have hindered the growth of the Kikuyu Church. Both Baganda and Kikuyu Christians experienced crises that called for a definition of their stand in relation to society. These crises, however, were far from identical because of the difference in social structures and in the two societies' experience of colonial rule. The crisis of the Buganda Church was political. It challenged Christians to decide where their primary loyalty lay; whether with the Kabaka or with the new community, which was both political and religious. 'Some adhered to the new community, endured persecution and gripped more tightly to the Church. Others flew back to the old allegiance.'⁸⁸ After years of civil war in the 1890s, the Baganda found a political solution by turning Christianity into two political religions, one 'English' and the other 'French'.

In Kikuyuland, by contrast, indigenous rulers could not demand absolute loyalty from Christians, partly because such a demand would have had no cultural justification (Kikuyu society was acephalous), but more importantly because Kikuyu chiefs operated within the restricted context of colonial rule. Thus when the crisis of the Kikuyu Church eventually came, it was cultural and not political. It involved conflict between the need to obey the missionary ruling against female circumcision and the desire to maintain solidarity with non-Christian society by continuing with the practice. As we have seen, within the CMS communities the crisis was resolved through the typically Kikuyu process of compromise and negotiation. Indeed the circumcision crisis enabled Kikuyu Christians to distinguish between the inherent demands of the gospel and the extraneous demands of the missionaries. In this way, the crisis enabled the *athomi* to resolve the tension between individual demands of Christianity and social demands of Kikuyu culture.

Baganda Christians were more committed to the evangelization of the neighbouring districts than their Kikuyu counterparts. This fact can be explained in political terms. First, pre-colonial Baganda society extended its influence to neighbouring areas through military conquests, while Kikuyu society did not embark on expansionist programmes. Among the Baganda, evangelization of the neighbouring districts resembled the extension of the Baganda supremacy. In her book *Black Evangelists* Louise Pirouet observes that the places to which Baganda catechists went, with the exception of Sukumaland in modern Tanzania, were places in which Buganda had political interests.⁸⁹ By contrast, Kikuyu did not attempt to extend their

⁸⁸ Taylor, *Processes*, p. 10.

⁸⁹ M. L. Pirouet, *Black Evangelists: The Spread of Christianity in Uganda, 1891-1914* (London, 1978), p. 36.

supremacy over their neighbours. It is true that Kikuyu individuals migrated to new areas, but the process of settlement in those areas involved negotiations with their new neighbours. Nor did Kikuyu immigrants impose their beliefs and values. Among Kikuyu, the concept of evangelization lacked a cultural equivalent.

Second, while Baganda Christians were appointed to chieftaincies outside Buganda, the *athomi* were rarely appointed chiefs to areas in central Kenya other than their own. Baganda chiefs working in other districts invited Christian evangelists to minister within their realms of jurisdiction. On the other hand, Kikuyu, who were mainly confined to central Kenya during the period of this study, could not evangelize elsewhere with the same freedom. There were exceptions. Notable evangelists like Mwangi wa Nyarari and Misheck Murage preached beyond their immediate neighbourhoods. It is true also that some Kikuyu Christians settled as squatters in the Rift Valley and took the gospel to their new settlement. But they preached only to their fellow Kikuyu there. After the coming of the East African Revival, however, the Kikuyu Anglican Church became as evangelistic as its Buganda counterpart.

This final discussion has centred on differences in the growth of the Buganda and Kikuyu Churches to bring out the distinctive features of the Kikuyu Anglican Church. It is my conviction that the uniqueness of Kikuyu Christianity lay in the institutions that Kikuyu brought into Christianity. Such institutions included *ituika* and circumcision. *Ituika* was peculiar to Kikuyu. After a prolonged period of controversy, it was abandoned because it was considered irrelevant to the new social order. Male circumcision continued in a modified form after missionary protest. The significance of this study lies in the light it casts on Kikuyu society's ability to negotiate and compromise over specifically Kikuyu institutions. It was this readiness to consider and, if necessary, renounce objectionable and irrelevant customs, and to modify the adaptable ones, that gave the Kikuyu Anglican Church its indigenous character. There was also the synchronicity between mission organization and Kikuyu social patterns. While the Buganda Church faced a moment of martyrdom, the Kikuyu Anglican Church wrestled with its conscience for years.⁹⁰

⁹⁰ Two major crises of Christian faith and patriotic identity faced the Kikuyu Anglican Church after 1932: the rise of Mau Mau in the early 1950s, and the conflict between Kikuyu and Kenyan patriotisms behind the 'tribal oath-taking' crisis of 1969. But those are matters for future scholarship.

SELECT BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Berman, B. and J. M. Lonsdale, *Unhappy Valley: Conflict in Kenya & Africa* (London, 1992).
- Capon, M. G., *Towards Unity in Kenya: The Story of Cooperation between Missions and Churches in Kenya, 1913–1947* (Nairobi, 1962).
- Dundas, C. R., 'The Organization and Laws of Some Bantu Tribes in East Africa', *Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute*, 45 (1915): 234–306.
- Gray, R., 'Problems of Historical Perspectives: The Planting of Christianity in Africa in the Nineteenth and Twentieth Centuries', in C. G. Baeta (ed.), *Christianity in Tropical Africa* (London, 1968), pp. 18–31.
- Horton, R., 'African Conversion', *Africa*, 41 (1971): 85–108.
- Karanja, J., *Founding an African Faith: Kikuyu Anglican Christianity, 1900–1945* (Nairobi, 1999).
- Kenyatta, J., *Facing Mount Kenya* (London, 1938).
- Kibicho, S. G., 'The Continuity of the African Conception of God into and through Christianity: A Kikuyu Case-Study', in E. Fasholé-Luke, R. Gray, A. Hastings, and G. Tasié (eds.), *Christianity in Independent Africa* (London, 1978), pp. 370–88.
- Leakey, L. S. B., 'The Kikuyu Problem of the Initiation of Girls', *Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute*, 61 (1931): 277–85.
- Leakey, L. S. B., *The Southern Kikuyu*, 3 vols. (London, 1979).
- Lonsdale, J. M., 'Western Kenya, 1883–1958: A Political History', unpublished manuscript.
- Macpherson, R., *The Presbyterian Church in Kenya* (Nairobi, 1970).
- Mbiti, J. S., *African Religions and Philosophy* (Nairobi, 1969).
- Muriuki, G., *A History of the Kikuyu* (Oxford, 1974).
- Murray, J. M., 'The Kikuyu Female Circumcision Controversy, with Special Reference to the Church Missionary Society's Sphere of Influence', PhD thesis, University of California, Los Angeles, 1974.
- Pirouet, M. L., *Black Evangelists: The Spread of Christianity in Uganda 1891–1914* (London, 1978).
- Sandgren, D. P., *Christianity and the Kikuyu: Religious Divisions and Social Conflict* (New York, 1989).
- Strayer, R. W., *The Making of Mission Communities in East Africa* (Nairobi, 1978).
- Taylor, J. V., *The Growth of the Church in Buganda* (London, 1958).
- Taylor, J. V., *Processes of Church Growth in an African Church* (London, 1958).
- Tignor, R., *The Colonial Transformation of Kenya* (Princeton, NJ, 1976).
- Wanyoike, E., *An African Pastor* (Nairobi, 1974).
- Ward, K., 'The Development of Protestant Christianity in Kenya', PhD thesis, University of Cambridge, 1976.

Anglicans in the Horn of Africa

From Missionaries and Chaplains to a Missionary Church

Grant LeMarquand

In the contemporary period, the Horn of Africa usually refers to at least four political entities: Eritrea, Djibouti, Somalia (including the semi-autonomous regions of Somaliland and Puntland), and Ethiopia. In Anglican terms, the Horn of Africa is now one of two 'Episcopal Areas' under the authority of the diocese of Egypt, the other being North Africa (Algeria, Tunisia, and Libya), 'The Diocese of Egypt with North Africa and the Horn of Africa' itself being one of four dioceses in the Province of Jerusalem and the Middle East.

Although Anglicans have been active in the Horn since the early nineteenth century, there was little attempt to plant Anglican Churches in the region until very recently. Anglican presence was characterized largely by chaplaincies for British expatriates. Indeed the sparsity of Anglican congregations until the late twentieth century probably explains why so little has been written about Anglicanism in this portion of Africa. For example, even recent surveys of the Anglican Communion say almost nothing about Anglicanism in the Horn: Mouneer Hanna Anis's article has one or two paragraphs dealing with the Horn of Africa. Kevin Ward's *A History of Global Anglicanism* (2006), a full-length review of the history of the Communion, says nothing about the region. The massive survey of the Anglican Prayer Book, edited by Charles Hefling and Cynthia Shattuck, *The Oxford Guide to the Book of Common Prayer: A Worldwide Survey* (2006) makes no mention of the Horn. William Sachs's *The Transformation of Anglicanism: From State Church to Global Communion* (1993) also makes no reference to Anglicanism in any of the countries of the Horn. David N. Griffiths's encyclopaedic study, *The Bibliography of the Book of Common Prayer 1549–1999* (2002) does list the two Amharic versions of the Prayer Book, Amharic being the dominant language of the region.

Significantly for the contemporary period, Anglican refugees from South Sudan began planting churches in the western regions of Ethiopia during the latter part of the twentieth century, in Asosa and especially in Gambella. These refugee churches, at first mostly confined to refugee camps, have now spread into local villages. This chapter examines these recent developments alongside the historical story of the Church in the Horn of Africa as part of one Anglican story.

When Anglicans first came to the Horn of Africa, they found an ancient Church with its own ecclesiastical organization, architecture, liturgy (including ancient music chanted and sung in an ancient language), Bible, tradition, and theology.¹ The Ethiopian Orthodox Tewahedo Church has its roots in the early fourth century.² In addition to a long (and not always happy) relationship with the Coptic Church in Egypt, the Ethiopian Church was also influenced by Syrian Orthodox traditions, Ethiopian tradition tracing the translation of the Bible, the introduction of monasticism and the widespread evangelization of the highlands of the Horn of Africa to the period of the ‘Nine Saints’, Syrian Orthodox missionaries who came to Ethiopia at the end of the fifth and the beginning of the sixth centuries. Distinctive traditions include the keeping of purity laws and the Sabbath (Saturday as well as Sunday), a focus on the Ark of the Covenant (believed to reside in Axum) as central to Ethiopian Orthodox worship, unique musical traditions, and a much larger canon of Scripture.

The story of the ancient Ethiopian Orthodox Church provides an important backdrop to the story of Anglicans in the Horn since, for most of the two hundred years that Anglicans have worked in this region, they have had to do so with the permission of and in cooperation with the Orthodox. Also, Anglicans have worked for the renewal of that Church—or at least for the renewal of the Church as various Anglican mission societies have understood renewal.

THE NINETEENTH CENTURY

The first Church Missionary Society (CMS) missionaries arrived in what was then known as Abyssinia in 1830. Samuel Gobat was Swiss and Christian Kugler was German, both having been prepared at the Basel Mission training

¹ For general introductions in English see: Stuart Munro-Hay, ‘Christianity’, in *Encyclopaedia Aethiopica* [EA], vol. I, pp. 717–23 and Ugo Zanetti, ‘Christianity in the Ethiopian Society’, EA, vol. I, pp. 723–8. Emmanuel Fritsch, ‘The Liturgical Year of the Ethiopian Church’, *Ethiopian Review of Cultures*, Special Issue, IX–X (2001).

² Gianfranco Fiaccadori, ‘Salama (Kasate Berhan)’ [the Ethiopian name of Frumentius], EA, vol. IV, pp. 484–8. See the primary source: Rufinus of Aquileia, *The Church History of Rufinus of Aquileia*, Books 10 and 11, trans. Philip R. Amidon (Oxford, 1997); Getatchew Haile, ‘The Homily in Honour of St Frumentius, Bishop of Axum (EMML 1763, ff. 84v–86r)’, *Analecta Bollandiana*, 97 (1979): 309–18.

school, then entering into CMS service. Kugler's missionary work was cut short when he died of wounds suffered in a hunting accident late in 1830. Gobat had clear Protestant convictions and was not afraid to express his opinions when he differed with Ethiopian clergy. Political disturbances within a divided country forced Gobat to leave Ethiopia in December 1832. Gobat returned to Ethiopia in 1834 accompanied by Carl Wilhelm Isenberg.³ He noticed a distinct difference between himself and Isenberg, Isenberg apparently believed that European standards in such things as clothing and food should be maintained, while Gobat believed that the missionaries should put as few cultural barriers between themselves and the Ethiopians as possible. Two young men, Hadara and Kidana Maryam, were converted in the 1830s. When one of the young men began to refer to Orthodox worship as idolatrous, however, confrontation was inevitable. Sickness precluded Gobat from being much further help in Ethiopia and he left in 1836. At the end of 1837, Johann Ludwig Krapf joined the mission, but a scant three months later, in March 1838, following a heated confrontation with the Adwa clergy, all the missionaries withdrew.⁴ These several rapid changes in personnel, as well as differences in philosophy and in personality, hampered the progress of the mission.

Banned by the leadership of the Ethiopian Orthodox Church from Adwa, Krapf and Isenberg moved to Shoa at the invitation of the local *ras* (prince) in 1839. In 1840 Isenberg went to London to help the process of getting the books he had translated into Amharic, including the Book of Common Prayer, through the press. The publications opened up the study of Amharic in Europe. Upon his return Isenberg found himself barred by the Ethiopian Orthodox Church from re-entering Shoa. Krapf remained in Shoa until March 1842 learning the language of the Oromo (often referred to in the texts of the day as the Galla, certainly now considered a derogatory term). The Oromo were—and are—the dominant people throughout much of central and southern Ethiopia and since most were not Orthodox, but African traditionalists, evangelistic work among them was not opposed by the Ethiopian Church. But due to doctrinal struggles with the Orthodox clergy, in November 1842 the mission ended, and with it CMS involvement in Ethiopia. The main problem dividing the missionaries seems to have been that Gobat believed that the best policy was to work for the reformation of the Orthodox Church. Krapf and Isenberg, however, believed that the Church was too corrupt and ignorant to be reformed. The language of the liturgy, like the Bible, was Ge'ez and although the clergy memorized it and were able to chant it, Ge'ez was an unknown language to them. The Church also had traditions which these

³ James MacQueen, *Journals of the Rev. Messrs. Isenberg and Krapf, missionaries of the Church missionary society: detailing their proceedings in the kingdom of Shoa, and journeys in other parts of Abyssinia, in the years 1839, 1840, 1841, and 1842* (London, 1843).

⁴ Donald Crummey, 'Church Missionary Society', *EA*, vol. I, p. 740.

Protestant missionaries found heretical: namely too high a view of Mary, too large a biblical canon,⁵ and too much emphasis on angels and saints. Although the CMS seems to have believed the renewal of the Orthodox Church to be possible, along CMS lines, it is likely that Krapf, and certainly Isenberg, believed a Protestant Church should be established in the country. Why else would Isenberg have gone to the immense trouble to translate the Book of Common Prayer into Amharic?⁶ Although translated and published, the book was never used on a regular basis, if at all, and today very few copies exist.⁷

By the mid-nineteenth century Ethiopia had been suffering from civil war for many years. Meanwhile, Samuel Gobat, now bishop in Jerusalem, conceived a new approach to mission in Ethiopia. He believed that craftsmen, artisans with practical skills, would be better able to convert Ethiopians than would ordained pastors. Emperor Tewodros accepted Gobat's offer of help and missionary work, but in hope of thereby acquiring modern weapons, not missionaries. He wished to unify the country by military force, as well as defend his country from the Ottoman Turks. Denied British assistance in this programme of military modernization Tewodros imprisoned the missionary artisans in Maqdala. British military intervention followed after the emperor imprisoned British envoys sent to deal with the situation. A military expedition of about 30,000 was organized and sent to Ethiopia. They travelled through the country (on a railroad they built for the occasion!) unopposed, a sign that Tewodros's enemies saw the British troops as an opportunity for them to gain power. They reached Maqdala in April 1868. On Good Friday, 10 April, Ethiopian troops attacked the British but stood no chance against General Sir Charles Napier's superior arms. Clearly defeated, the emperor committed suicide. The British burned the Maqdala fortress, destroyed most of the weapons, retrieved hundreds of ancient manuscripts (now to be found in the British Museum), and withdrew from the country. If the first Anglican missionaries failed due to their own lack of a cohesive vision, the second failed by being caught up in contemporary political intrigue.

MISSION TO THE *BETE ISRAEL*

In England during the nineteenth century there was a noticeable increase of interest in post-millennial eschatology and consequently in the land of Israel

⁵ On the Ethiopian canon, see Peter Brandt, 'Bible Canon', *EA*, vol. I, pp. 571–3.

⁶ Isenberg's Amharic translation of the Book of Common Prayer was printed in 1842 by Richard Watts for SPCK. A digitized copy of this Amharic translation can be found at <<http://mammana.org/bcp/amharic/>>.

⁷ See David N. Griffiths, *The Bibliography of the Book of Common Prayer, 1549–1999* (London, 2002).

and in the Jewish people, as the conversion of the Jews was expected to precede the second coming of Christ. The 'discovery' of Ethiopian Judaism soon generated interest within the Anglican mission organization called the London Society for Promoting Christianity amongst the Jews. The 'London Jews Society' (LJS), as it was sometimes known, was founded in 1809 by some of the same people who founded the CMS. The society's stated goals included declaring the messiahship of Jesus to Jews, and restoring the Jewish people to the land of Israel. The so-called 'Falashas' who have lived in northern Ethiopia near the city of Gondar for many centuries are known among themselves as *Bete Israel* (House of Israel).⁸ The origins of *Bete Israel* are unknown, but the community has been a factor in Ethiopian history and politics. The LJS missionaries who arrived in 1860 and 1861, led by Martin Flad, soon found their work ended when they were imprisoned by the emperor until freed by the British expedition. With the Europeans effectively cut off from work among *Bete Israel* in subsequent years, most of the work of the LJS was untaken by Flad's Ethiopian converts (sometimes known as the *daqqa Flad*: children of Flad), especially Berru Webe (1831–90) and Mikael Aragawi (c.1848–1931). Although the LJS was an Anglican organization, the converts reached by their work did not become Anglican, but rather were baptized into the Orthodox Church.

Tragedy struck when the Dervishes, followers of the messianic Mahdi in Sudan invaded north-western Ethiopia in 1884. By 1888, much of that area had been devastated by war and then by famine. Gondar was burned; Christians who refused to convert to Islam were massacred and their children sold as slaves. About a third of the Ethiopian population died. In the early part of the twentieth century all contact between the LJS in London and the Ethiopian mission had been lost and so Frederick Flad, the son of Martin Flad, travelled to Ethiopia in 1922 to gather information and to assess future mission possibilities. He learned that only about 500 of the 2,000 *Bete Israel* converts had survived the devastation of the Dervishes and the famine. The fortunes of the mission changed in 1928, however, when Ras Tefari became regent and in 1930, when his mother Empress Zewditu died, he was crowned emperor taking the name Haile Selassie: 'The Power of the Trinity'. While still regent, Tefari asked Frederick Flad to oversee the education of his daughter in Switzerland, a task which was given to Flad's daughter Lola. When Princess Tsechai returned to Ethiopia in 1930, Lola accompanied her to Addis Ababa where she married one of Flad's fellow-missionaries. When the Italians

⁸ The term 'Falasha' is a derogatory term given to Ethiopian Jews by others. The implication may be that such a person is an outsider, one who does not belong. In this chapter we will use the self-designation, *Bete Israel*. Cf. Hagar Solomon, *The Hyena People: Ethiopian Jews in Christian Ethiopia* (Berkeley, CA, 1999); David Kessler, *The Falashas: The Forgotten Jews of Ethiopia* (New York, 1982).

invaded in 1935, the missionaries withdrew once again, leaving an Ethiopian convert, Alek'a Fett'ena, in charge of the mission station at Jenga.

In 1948 the LJS returned, this time as 'The Church's Mission to the Jews' (CMJ). In 1952, restrictions were placed on the missionaries in Dabat forbidding them to preach outside of the compound at Dabat where a clinic and a school had been started. The government placed restrictions on missionaries because the Ethiopian Orthodox Church felt threatened by the presence of non-Orthodox churches and their personnel. As well as government restrictions on preaching, some of the staff left, some objecting to infant baptism, others to receive higher paying positions at a Seventh Day Adventist mission. There was also a Jewish counter-mission against the CMJ's vision of working for the conversion of Ethiopian Jews to Christianity. From the time of the 1974 military coup CMJ work became severely restricted. The mission handed over its work to Ethiopian colleagues in 1978 and CMJ property was given to the Ethiopian Orthodox Church. Although this phase of Anglican mission had some success, it never did have the goal of planting Anglican churches.

THE BIBLE CHURCHMEN'S MISSIONARY SOCIETY AND MINISTRY WITH THE ETHIOPIAN ORTHODOX

Founded in 1922 from a split with the CMS out of a perceived move of that society in a liberal direction, the Bible Churchmen's Missionary Society (BCMS) sent Alfred Buxton (1892–1955) to Ethiopia to survey the situation of the Ethiopian Orthodox Church. Buxton was not critical of the work of other missions, most of which were working for the conversion of non-Christians at the circumference of the Ethiopian Empire. The BCMS hoped that the Orthodox Church could be reformed along Protestant lines—that if the Scriptures (that is according to the Western canon) were provided and taught in the vernacular the Church, and the nation itself, would experience a spiritual revival. Buxton affirmed that the Ethiopian Orthodox Church was a genuine member of Christ's body, an authentically Christian organization, and this in spite of the obvious differences between the reality of the Ethiopian Orthodox Church as Buxton found it and the vision of what an Evangelical churchman thought a Church should look like. Nevertheless, he and the other BCMS missionaries certainly hoped for a radical change in the theology and practice of the Ethiopian Church.

BCMS missionaries were involved (with others) in a new translation of the Bible into Amharic, a significant work if for no other reason than it was authorized by the emperor. Bible schools for the Orthodox Church, open to

both men and women, provided biblical instruction in a way that was sympathetic to the Orthodox. That is, these schools affirmed the Orthodox Church as part of the body of Christ while not criticizing their high view of Mary and not condemning their definition of canonical books of the Bible. The Orthodox canon includes books not included in the Protestant and Catholic versions of the Bible. In addition to Christian periodical literature, correspondence courses, and children's Bible stories, significant commentaries on biblical books were produced, and an Amharic Bible dictionary by Colin Maunsell, a BCMS missionary. Perhaps most important was a three-volume systematic theology written by Maunsell which is still being used in Orthodox seminaries.

ANGLICAN CHAPLAINCIES

In the 1920s the number of British nationals working in Ethiopia grew, as the regent and then emperor, Ras Tafari encouraged merchants and teachers to settle in Addis Ababa. In 1926 the Society for the Propagation of the Gospel (SPG) invited the Revd Ethelstan Cheese, then serving in Beirut, to come to Addis as a temporary chaplain to British expatriates in the country until a more permanent appointment could be made. In 1928, Cheese was appointed to British Somaliland, a place where he felt called. At that time, the area dominated by Somali peoples was divided into five political entities based on the colonial rule of the region. Djibouti was French Somaliland, the northern part of Somalia was British Somaliland, the southern part, Italian Somaliland, the Somali-speaking Ogaden region belonged to Abyssinia, and the Somali-speaking Northern Frontier District was a part of Kenya. Cheese's duties included working with others on translating the Bible into Somali—Cheese himself also translated Bunyan's *Pilgrim's Progress*, perhaps the book most widely translated into African languages after the Bible itself. During the Second World War, Cheese was commissioned as a chaplain to the troops in British Somaliland, and a tiny church had been built in Hargeisa, British Somaliland, for the British troops, apparently opened in the early 1930s.

In October 1928, the SPG appointed the first ever permanent chaplain to Addis Ababa, the Revd Austen Fredric Matthew, to minister to the needs of the growing British and Commonwealth community, and to develop strong links with the Ethiopian Orthodox Tewahedo Church. Matthew had previously served with the Universities Mission to Central Africa in the area of Nyasaland (the area of what is now southern Tanzania, northern Malawi, and northern Mozambique). In 1926 he resigned from his work in Central Africa and moved to Cairo to study Islam and Arabic with a view to mission work among Muslims. However, in 1928 he was appointed to 'Abyssinia' and

switched his study to Amharic.⁹ Matthew served for the longest period of any Addis chaplain to date (1928–54).

During this period, the Anglican Church received some royal favour in Ethiopia due to the political events of the time. In 1935 the Italian fascists invaded Ethiopia. Their weaponry, including aerial bombardment and the use of poison gas, was vastly superior to that of the Ethiopian forces. Haile Selassie, who had acceded to the throne as emperor in 1930, was driven into exile in 1936 and found asylum in Great Britain. The British not only provided refuge, they were also instrumental in returning the emperor to power. After Italy entered the Second World War in June 1940, the British flew the emperor to Khartoum, where he was able to foster resistance to the fascist regime occupying Ethiopia. He re-entered Ethiopia with British troops who, together with battalions made up of Ethiopian refugees, were able to drive the Italians from power. The emperor reached Addis Ababa in May 1941 and resumed his reign. Haile Selassie's experience in Great Britain had a profound impact on the way non-Orthodox Churches and missions were treated in Ethiopia in the subsequent years. The emperor welcomed missions who wanted to be involved in charitable and development work, and even allowed Christian missionaries to do evangelism and church-planting in areas where the Orthodox Church had not been active, especially in the south and the west of the country.¹⁰ The emperor gave the Anglican community a piece of land on the road leading to the British embassy, on which the present church was completed in 1954.¹¹ Matthew's knowledge of Amharic led to him being invited by the emperor to

⁹ Unpublished typescript of A. F. Matthew entitled 'Padre Matthew', written by Philippa Langdon, in the files of St Matthew's Anglican Church, Addis Ababa.

¹⁰ The law allowing missions to proselytize in 'Open Areas' and to do non-proselytizing work in 'Ethiopian Church Areas' was decreed on 27 Aug. 1944. 'Decree No. 3 of 1944' of the 'Conquering Lion of the Tribe of Judah Haile Selassie I Elect of God Emperor of Ethiopia' can be found as Appendix B of J. Spencer Trimmingham's *The Christian Church and Missions in Ethiopia, including Eritrea and the Somalilands* (London, 1950). The copy of this book found in the library of St Frumentius' Anglican Theological College in Gambella, Ethiopia was the personal copy of A. F. Matthew. According to the note on the inside front cover, Matthew received the book 'from the author' on 19 March 1957. It says much about Matthew's knowledge of the Ethiopian churches and missions (and perhaps something of his personality) that this copy of the book has frequent marginal notations correcting the details of Trimmingham's work. Recently the literature on the churches which have been born from Protestant missionary activity, and from the indigenous converts of the first missionaries, is expanding quickly. See, for example, Girma Bekele, *The In-Between People: A Reading of David Bosch through the Lens of Mission History and Contemporary Challenges in Ethiopia* (Eugene, OR, 2011); E. Paul Balisky, *Wolaitta Evangelists: A Study of Religious Innovation in Southern Ethiopia, 1937–1975* (Eugene, OR, 2009); Tibebe Eshete, *The Evangelical Movement in Ethiopia: Resistance and Resilience* (Waco, TX, 2009).

¹¹ There is an ancient Ethiopian tradition that Ethiopia was first evangelized by St Matthew, which probably accounts for the choice of the name of the Anglican church. One wonders whether the name of the chaplain at the time the church was built and dedicated may have also had an influence on the choice. It is quite possible that the Revd A. F. Matthew would have enjoyed answering the phone: 'St Matthew's Church, St Matthew speaking'.

work with the committee producing a new translation of the Bible from Ge'ez into Amharic. This translation was finally published in 1960 when Matthew was aged 85.

In 1967, the United Society for the Propagation of the Gospel (USPG) sent Philip Cousins to Addis as chaplain. The four Anglican churches in the region—in Addis Ababa, Asmara,¹² Mogadishu, and the small church in Hargeissa Somaliland, were a part of the diocese of the Sudan, based in Khartoum. The diocese itself came within the jurisdiction of the archbishopric of Jerusalem. Towards the end of Cousins's time in Addis, in 1971, the churches in Ethiopia, together with those in Somalia and Yemen, were transferred to the diocese of Egypt.¹³

Ethiopia was thrown into political turmoil in 1974 by a Marxist revolution, led by Mengistu Hayle Maryam. The period known as the 'Dergue' (Amharic for 'Council' or 'Committee') lasted until 1991 and has been characterized since as the time of the 'Red Terror'. Coming to Addis shortly after the 'Dergue' came to power, the Revd Colin Battell, another USPG missionary, served as chaplain of St Matthew's for eighteen years (1976–94), remaining in Ethiopia throughout the communist period. Battell had direct experience of the 'Red Terror', as one account of many of his Sunday mornings illustrates.

He would emerge from the Chaplaincy bungalow to find the bodies of many, shot during the night, laid out against the compound wall, on the street. Soldiers, guarding the bodies, refused to let family take the bodies away for burial until they paid for the cost of the bullet. On the road leading to the British Embassy, the heads of others, executed elsewhere, were displayed on spikes.¹⁴

During Battell's time, the policy of non-proselytization of the Orthodox was inscribed in the by-laws of St Matthew's Church: 'The Church of St. Matthew, following the historic Anglican policy towards the ancient Churches of the East, respects the Ethiopian Orthodox Church as the established Church of the country and therefore refrains from all spiritual work amongst Ethiopian nationals.' Earlier versions of the constitution contained the same wording.¹⁵

¹² The precarious political situation in Eritrea at the time of writing makes it unwise to say much about St George's Church in Asmara.

¹³ Letter from Oliver Allison to Philip Cousins, 7 Aug. 1971, in the 'Diocese of the Sudan' file at St Matthew's Anglican Church, Addis Ababa. On Allison and the period of his ministry in the Diocese of the Sudan, see Oliver Allison, *A Pilgrim Church's Progress* (London, 1966). Kenneth Cragg, of course, is renowned for his scholarly and sympathetic treatment of Islam and Muslim-Christian relations. Among his many books, *Call of the Minaret* (3rd edn., Oxford, 2000), is the most well known.

¹⁴ Andrew Proud, unpublished article on the history of the Anglican Church in the Horn of Africa, on file at St Matthew's Church, Addis Ababa.

¹⁵ Versions of the constitution of St Matthew's Church are on file at the church. Colin Battell was quite involved in maintaining good relations with the Orthodox and became something of a scholar on the Orthodox Church. He wrote the chapter on 'The Ethiopians', pp. 62–81 in the important book edited by Henry Hill, *Light from the East: A Symposium on the Oriental*

Battell endeavoured to maintain Anglican work in Mogadishu where the church was always an expatriate congregation. In the 1980s an important sense of mission developed in the congregation. For a short period, beginning in 1986, John Benwell served as the staff person for the church running a programme called 'Operation Outreach' which had as its goal to establish a developmental project acceptable to the Somali government authority serving both the expatriate and Somali churches in various ways. Benwell was ordained a priest and served in Mogadishu until it became too dangerous to remain. The church has not survived.

During the time of the Revd Huw Thomas (USPG missionary in Addis from 1995–6), the Revd John Jock Chuol, a Sudanese Nuer-speaking priest visited the refugee camps in the Gambella Regional State at the height of the civil war in South Sudan. While in Ethiopia he visited Addis Ababa, to appeal to Thomas to build a church to serve the refugees living in Gambella town. Thomas was at first sceptical of this idea, believing it inappropriate to plant non-English-speaking Anglican churches in Ethiopia. Together with another Sudanese minister, John Jol, and a future priest, Deng Mark Khor, they went to visit the Ethiopian Orthodox patriarch, Abuna Paulos. To their delight the patriarch not only supported the idea of Anglican churches for refugees, but gave the group a letter to that effect. The result was the establishment of a church in Gambella town under the leadership of the Revd John Malesh, an Anglican priest from southern Sudan. Later, the church trained lay readers from the refugee camp at Pinyudu.

In 2002, after a fourteen-month vacancy, the Revd Andrew Proud was sent by the USPG as chaplain of St Matthew's. Proud challenged the congregation to be more mission-oriented and began several outreach activities. Proud visited Gambella regularly, to support John Malesh and to put systems and procedures in place for monitoring finances and helping churches to grow. During Proud's tenure there was for a time a thriving ministry at St Matthew's among Somali-speaking believers. This work was led by a gifted young man named David Mohammed. Approximately 120 members came together for worship on Sunday afternoons under his leadership. At one point Mohammed decided to risk returning to Somalia to visit his family, but was shot for being a Christian. The immediate result was the scattering of this Somali community.

Orthodox and Assyrian Churches (Toronto, 1988), one of the few serious explorations of the Oriental churches produced by Anglicans. In his essay, Battell writes that the Anglican Church 'is committed to supporting and working to strengthen the life of the ancient and indigenous church and, thus, there are no Ethiopian Anglicans' (p. 79). It might be added that at that time any Ethiopians who ventured into St Matthew's were asked not to return but to go back to the Orthodox Church. Over the last years this policy, which can only be considered exclusionary, has not been followed, and a good number of people at St Matthew's on any Sunday are Ethiopians, both highlander and Nilotic.

A significant revision to St Matthew's constitution took place during Proud's time. The words 'and therefore refrains from all spiritual work amongst Ethiopian nationals' were deleted from the constitution's Preamble. The minutes of the St Matthew's Church council, dated 11 April 2006, gives the rationale for the change.

This step was taken because the preamble to the constitution of St. Matthew's prohibits undertaking spiritual work among Ethiopian nationals. This is problematic since it is difficult to distinguish between persons who are nationals and non-nationals. In addition, this provision does not reflect realities now prevailing in Ethiopia, now that the Ethiopian Orthodox Church is no longer the established church of the country. This is a reflection of the situation that existed in the country at the time of the establishment of St. Matthew's Church. Since the Anglican Church has been operational in Ethiopia for such a long time, it cannot turn down persons who wish to worship in the Church. It was therefore decided to amend the preamble as follows: 'The Church of St. Matthew's, Addis Ababa, is a chaplaincy within the Anglican Communion. Its purpose is to serve the spiritual needs of Anglicans of whatever nationality temporarily or permanently resident in the area and of such other expatriate Christians as choose to attend. Its worship and work shall as far as possible reflect this international and ecumenical diversity. The Church of St. Matthew's following the historic Anglican policy towards the ancient churches of the East respects the Ethiopian Orthodox Church. It seeks to cooperate with the Ethiopian Orthodox Church in all possible ways and at the same time to play a positive role in the overall life of the local community.'¹⁶

In other words, Ethiopians were now free to worship at St Matthew's Church. With approximately 10,000 members, Anglicans could be seen as compatible with, and no threat to, the Ethiopian Orthodox Church with over thirty million members.

GAMBELLA: FROM REFUGEES TO MISSIONARIES

Although little effort was made to establish Anglican churches in the highlands of Ethiopia, the western regions of Gambella and Asosa saw a rapid and unexpected emergence of Anglicanism in the last decades of the twentieth century. The occasion for this sudden materialization of Anglican churches was the horrific war between the Islamist regime in Khartoum against the peoples of southern Sudan following Sudan's imposition of Shari'a law in 1983. The ensuing twenty years of civil war resulted in the deaths of millions of (mostly southern) Sudanese and in the flight of many hundreds of thousands

¹⁶ Minutes of the Church Council of St Matthew's Church, Addis Ababa, 11 Apr. 2006.

into refugee camps both within Sudan and in neighbouring countries, especially Uganda, Kenya, and Ethiopia. In the mid-1980s refugee camps for southern Sudanese fleeing the slaughter were established in the Gambella region in western Ethiopia, the largest of these camps being near the towns of Itang, Pinyudu, and Dima. The largest of these, the Itang camp, was at one point in the late 1980s the largest refugee camp in the world, numbering about 400,000 people.

One of the most distinctive characteristics of the Anglican Christianity which spread through these camps was the attraction which the Christian message had, especially for young men. The camps were sites where the Sudan People's Liberation Army (SPLA) carried out recruiting for its war against the Muslim north. Christian boys and young men also thought of themselves in martial terms. Perhaps promoted by their dislocation, the camps became places of mass Christian conversion. One Jieng man named John Awan told me that after he was converted, he had an intense desire to be baptized, but there was no priest in the camp at the time. When news began to spread that a priest had arrived in the camp he went to the 'church'—a grove of trees, surrounded by a makeshift grass wall, with pews made of hardened mud. Thousands were already there. He could not get in. The priest baptized people all day until it became dark. The next day he returned and this time he gained entrance but, once again, darkness fell before his turn to be baptized. So he came back in the middle of the night and slept in the church and was finally baptized on the third day.¹⁷

The present churches in the Gambella and Asosa regions of Ethiopia derive from this refugee presence dating back to the 1980s, principally Jieng refugees in 1991. The Jieng are the largest ethnic group in South Sudan. They tend to be known in the Western world as 'Dinka', but they call themselves Jieng. When they left the camps, many of the Jieng Christians handed their churches over to local people. The Jieng churches in both Dima and Bonga were given to local Anuak Christians who were introduced to Anglican Christianity for the first time by these Jieng refugees. As well as 'inheriting' refugee church buildings and learning about Anglicanism from Jieng refugees in Bonga and Dima, Anuak Anglicanism has another root. In the early years of the new millennium some Anuak students living in Addis Ababa had discovered St Matthew's Church. Returning to Gambella town, they helped to found an Anglican church.

Unlike the Jieng who were expelled from Ethiopia, many Nuer refugees were able to remain in Gambella.¹⁸ Since the Nuer had always had a presence

¹⁷ John Awan, at the time resident in Nashville but now a theological teacher in South Sudan, related this story to me in April 2005 in Pittsburgh.

¹⁸ Two Jieng Anglican churches remain in western Ethiopia—both in refugee camps. Good Shepherd Anglican Church is a Jieng-speaking church within a predominantly Nuer community

in Gambella, they were able to blend into the local communities. Many remained in Pinyudu, which became a 'permanent' camp. The Anglican Church there became the mother Church of the Nuer Anglicans as from the late 1980s Nuer churches developed in the wider region. Few of these churches have remained culturally isolated. The Mabaan church in Sherkole has reached out to Jum-Jum-speaking neighbours. The Anuak congregation in Dima has had an outreach to a small, semi-nomadic hunter-gatherer group called the Tama-Koi. The Anuak church in the Abobo area has begun to reach out to the Mezhenger people.

The most successful cross-cultural mission within Gambella was the Nuer outreach to the Opo people. The Opo (or Opuuo) are a small ethnic group of approximately 5,000 people, most living in Ethiopia, but a few hundred in South Sudan. Around 2006 an Anglican deacon, Gordon Roc, travelled to the Opo area, north-east of Itang. The region is isolated, not so much by long distances, but because a shallow but wide river cuts the Opo off from the rest of the Gambella community for at least six months every year. When Roc reached the Opo he was able to find some who spoke Nuer but found they had heard elements of Christianity already from Seventh-Day Adventist missionaries. While listening to the Adventists explain their message, coffee was prepared for the visitors. When the coffee was presented the Adventists declined, saying that they could not take caffeine. The Opo rejected the Adventists' message. So when the Anglican deacon came speaking about Jesus, the Opo had just one question: 'Can we drink coffee?' Being assured that they could, they decided that they would be Anglicans. The Opo initially had no written language, and Anglican worship is liturgical. The Opo language was soon formalized to written form and the first thing translated into the language was a small booklet containing Morning Prayer and Holy Communion. Since most of the Opo cannot yet read, however, most Christians have memorized the liturgy.

CONCLUSION

The history of Anglicanism in the Horn of Africa seems, in one sense, to have come full circle. The first missionaries were apparently hoping to establish Anglican churches. Having been rebuffed, new generations of missionaries refocused their energies to helping reform the ancient Orthodox Church. But

in Pinyudu refugee camp (there are nine Nuer churches in the Pinyudu area, as well as an Anuak church); Christ the King Anglican Church is one of two Anglican churches in Sherkole refugee camp in Asosa, north of Gambella; the other church, John the Baptist Anglican Church is Mabaan-speaking, but also has a small and growing group of Jum-Jum-speaking Anglicans.

the Orthodox Church had never established itself through the Horn. The margins of the east, south, and west of the Horn were left unevangelized until Protestants and Roman Catholics began mission work in those areas. And now, with a secular government, churches and missions are no longer restricted in their evangelistic work. Today perhaps a third of the Christians in Ethiopia are outside of the Orthodox fold. Many, at the centre of the region as well as at its edges, are attracted to Anglicanism. The Episcopal Area of the Horn of Africa has moved from being a small English-speaking church, some of whose members did 'missionary' work unrelated to the possible growth of their own denomination, to a poor, still very dependent but mostly indigenous 'missionary church'.

SELECT BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Cousins, Philip, *Ethelstan Cheese: Saint of No Fixed Abode* (Worthing, 1986).
- Crowley, Roger, *Ethiopian Biblical Interpretation: A Study in Exegetical Tradition and Hermeneutics* (Cambridge, 1988).
- Crowley, Roger, 'New Testament Introduction in the Andemta Commentary Tradition', *Ostkirchliche Studien*, 26 (1977): 144–92.
- Crowley, Roger, 'Old Testament Introduction in the Andemta Commentary Tradition', *Journal of Ethiopian Studies*, 12 (1974): 133–75.
- Crowley, Roger, 'Patristic Introduction in the Ethiopian Andemta Commentary Tradition', *Ostkirchlichen Studien*, 29 (1980): 39–49.
- Crowley, Roger, *The Traditional Interpretation of the Apocalypse of St John in the Ethiopian Orthodox Church* (Cambridge, 1983).
- Crummey, Donald, *Priests and Politicians: Protestant and Catholic Missions in Orthodox Ethiopia, 1830–1868* (2nd edn., Hollywood, CA, 2007).
- Daoud, Marcos (trans.), *The Liturgy of the Ethiopian Church*, rev. H. E. Blatta Marsie Hazen (n.p., 1959).
- Fritsch, Emmanuel, 'The Liturgical Year of the Ethiopian Church', *Ethiopian Review of Cultures*, Special Issue, IX–X (2001).
- Gidney, W. T., *The History of the London Society for Promoting Christianity Amongst the Jews from 1809 to 1908* (London, 1908).
- Gobat, Samuel, *Journal of a Three Years' Residence in Abyssinia in Furtherance of the Objects of the Church Missionary Society. Accompanied with a Biographical Sketch of Bishop Gobat by Robert Baird* (New York, 1834).
- Isaac, Ephraim, *The Ethiopian Orthodox Täwahido Church* (Trenton, NJ, 2013).
- Jenkins, Paul, 'The Church Missionary Society and the Basel Mission: An Early Experiment in Inter-European Cooperation', in Kevin Ward and Brian Stanley (eds.), *The Church Missionary Society and World Christianity, 1799–1999* (Grand Rapids, MI, 2000), pp. 43–65.
- Knibb, Michael A., *Translating the Bible: The Ethiopic Versions of the Old Testament* (Oxford, 1999).

- LeMarquand, Grant, 'Solemn Euphoria: The Consecration of Saint Mary Ethiopian Orthodox Tewahedo Church, North York, Ontario, February 21–22, 1997' [Church Review], *Anglican and Episcopal History*, 67 (1997): 113–19.
- MacQueen, James, *Journals of the Rev. Messrs. Isenberg and Krapf, missionaries of the Church missionary society: detailing their proceedings in the kingdom of Shoa, and journeys in other parts of Abyssinia, in the years 1839, 1840, 1841, and 1842* (London, 1843).
- Phillipson, David W., *Ancient Churches of Ethiopia: Fourth to Fourteenth Centuries* (New Haven, CT and London, 2009).
- Spencer Trimingham, J., *The Christian Church and Missions in Ethiopia, including Eritrea and the Somalilands* (London, 1950).
- Stern, Henry Aaron, *Wanderings among the Falashas in Abyssinia* (2nd edn., London, 1968).
- Stokes, David E., *Ethiopia: Land of the Outstretched Hand* (London, 1948).
- Uhlig, Siegbert (ed.), *Encyclopaedia Aethiopica* (Wiesbaden, 2003).
- Ullendorff, Edward, *Ethiopia and the Bible* (Oxford, 1968).
- Uqbit, Tesfazghi, *Current Christological Positions of Ethiopian Orthodox Theologians* (Rome, 1973).
- Werner, Roland, William Anderson, and Andrew Wheeler, *Day of Devastation, Day of Contentment: The History of the Sudanese Church across 2000 Years* (Nairobi, 2000).

The East African Revival

Derek R. Peterson

The East African Revival was a Christian conversion movement that began in an Anglican mission station in northern Rwanda in the mid-1930s and spread throughout eastern and central Africa during the 1940s and 1950s.¹ The Revival was an engine for the production of testimonial literature, and there are now dozens of books that present revivalists' autobiographies as evidence of God's work in eastern Africa. That is how converts described their experience. Their testimonies compressed the long and conflicted course of time, rendering complicated local dynamics into a predetermined narrative about religious and personal transformation. Today as at the time of their composition, it is easy to lift revivalists' testimonies out of the polemical context in which they were composed. The back cover of one collection invites readers to 'sense the freedom from bondage to heathen practices as [God's people] prove by their lives the God of the Bible to be the only true God'.² Framed in this way, converts' autobiographies become inspirational literature, placeless affirmations of the universal truths of Christianity.

But there was a second, less visible, more contentious Revival that developed alongside and in tension with the authorized version. This subterranean Revival was largely a movement of women, especially young women. Their religious experience was not decorous. Theirs was an eschatological Christianity, composed in expectation of the imminent end of the world. This millenarian Revival was prompted by terror. It entailed vivid displays of emotion and the exercise of charismatic gifts. It obliged converts to open up the most private corners of their lives to public inspection, narrate instances of

¹ Derek R. Peterson, *Ethnic Patriotism and the East African Revival: A History of Dissent* (Cambridge, 2012).

² Dorothy Smoker, *Ambushed by Love: God's Triumph in Kenya's Terror* (Fort Washington, PA, 1993).

sexual deviance, name names, and assassinate characters. The leadership of the Anglican Church did not know what to do about it. They actively sought to suppress this second Revival, imposing rules that limited the latitude of converts' confessions.

In neither its decorous nor its millenarian aspect was the Revival straightforwardly an Anglican movement. In Tanganyika Lutherans were in the leading role; in Kenya Presbyterians had an important part to play. In Uganda—where Anglicanism was the established Church—the Revival's leaders had a tense relationship with the bishop, and in the early 1940s they contemplated taking the Revival out of the Anglican Church altogether. What made the Revival Anglican was its literature. It was the literature of English Nonconformism—especially Bunyan's *The Pilgrim's Progress*—that gave African revivalists a template on which to orient their life stories. *The Pilgrim's Progress* was the defining literature of the British evangelical missionary movement. After the New Testament, it was the second book that British missionaries published in Africa's vernacular languages. The first translation of *Pilgrim's Progress* in eastern Africa was the Swahili edition, which appeared in 1888, only five years after the New Testament was published.³ Uganda missionaries brought out a Luganda edition in 1900.⁴ The Kinyarwanda translation—published in 1933—was composed in the years immediately preceding the beginning of the Revival. Rendered in DhoLuo, Swahili, Lunyankole, or Kinyarwanda by a cadre of earnest translators, Bunyan's text became standard reading material for students across Anglophone eastern Africa.⁵ It was a primer on ontology. The story invited revivalists to see sin in material form, as a weighty bundle of possessions, deeds, and dispositions that could—like the bundle on Christian's back—be separated from the whole fabric of their lives and disposed of. *The Pilgrim's Progress* thereby encouraged converts to renounce people and possessions, to disencumber themselves of their old lives.

The Revival was a machinery for self-editing. It entailed disavowal, the severing of relationships, slander, and other anti-social acts. Only later—after a contentious process that is the subject of this chapter—were revivalists domesticated and made members of civil society. There was, in short, a great amount of disciplinary work that had to occur before the Revival could become a source of inspiration in the field of World Christianity.

³ *Msafiri: Kitabu hiki Kimefasirika katika Kitabu cha Kiingereza kitiwacho 'Pilgrim's Progress'* (London, 1888).

⁴ *Omutambuze* (London, 1900).

⁵ Isabel Hofmeyr, *The Portable Bunyan: A Transnational History of the Pilgrim's Progress* (Princeton, NJ, 2004), ch. 5.

TECHNOLOGIES OF THE SELF

In the early hours of Sunday, 2 July 1936 Dora Skipper, an Anglican missionary at Gahini in northern Rwanda, awoke to a cacophony. The noise coming from the girls' school near Skipper's residence sounded like a 'Bank Holiday crowd on Hampstead Heath'. She and another missionary forced the school's door open. There was bedlam.

The girls seemed to have gone mad and some were on the floor, they were all throwing themselves about, they were absolutely uncontrolled, some were laughing, some weeping, most were shaking very very much and they seemed to have supernatural strength. The powers of darkness seemed to be right on us. It felt like being in hell, as though Satan had loosed his armies.

Skipper dragged one of the girls to one side. 'I am so frightened, I am so frightened', she repeatedly said. The next morning the girls were awake at 3:30 a.m. They had such shattering revelations that they broke the windows and desks in the school. Some of them were writhing 'like the maniac when Christ came down from the Mount of Transfiguration', Skipper wrote, and all of them said that they were 'conscious of thick darkness and the hopelessness of their sins'. It was not until Wednesday evening that Skipper and her colleague brought the girls to their senses. At 7 p.m. they went to the school with as many lamps as they could find. When one of the girls began to cry and shake, she was taken out of the dormitory and made to be quiet. The night thereafter passed in a clinical peace. But over the ensuing weeks the events at the girls' school were replayed in dozens of village churches around Gahini. People gathered in the early hours of the morning; one of them would suddenly begin shouting out all of the awful sins he had committed, and thereafter some people would start 'shrieking to God to have mercy, others rolling about on the floor and tearing their clothes and foaming at the mouth in a regular fit', reported Skipper.

This kind of behaviour seemed like insanity. Only five years earlier, in August 1931, Dora Skipper had written in her diary about the sad case of Yudesi Mukarurubuga, a schoolgirl who had 'gone off her head'.⁶ Mukarurubuga had fallen into a 'sort of religious mania': during a confirmation service she had begun to weep copiously, despairing, she said, over the eternal damnation of her fellow students. She believed herself to be so unimpeachably holy that she refused to sleep in the dormitory with other girls, whom she thought to be 'wicked'. Skipper hoped to cure the girl by isolating her from her fellows, and for some time Mukarurubuga slept on the missionary's floor at night. But by September Skipper was convinced that she was 'terribly mad'.

⁶ Dora Skipper, diary entry for 30 Aug. 1931, Church Mission Society Oxford archives (hereafter CMS Oxon), Skipper papers, folio 1/3.

Mukarurubuga was sent back to her family home, where she lived in confinement under her brother's care.

The schoolgirls of July 1936 were very much like Yudesi Mukarurubuga. Like her, they were terrified by a judgemental God; and like her, they made dramatic evaluations about sin and self. But where Yudesi Mukarurubuga went insane, the schoolgirls in 1936 were the starting point for a new Christian movement: the East African Revival. They knew how to transform their terror into a form of discipline. There were new techniques at their disposal. In the days that followed the events of 2 July Dora Skipper was besieged by a constant flow of students wishing to return things that they had stolen from the school. One girl confessed to having stolen two sewing needles: she had thoughtlessly placed them in her bible before the Christmas holiday. Another girl confessed to stealing a piece of soap. A third returned one and a half francs to the missionary, explaining that she had stolen a hinge from the school storeroom to mend her locker. 'Streams are coming', returning 'pencils, soap, francs and bits of cloth all stolen at some time or another', wrote Skipper. 'It is amazing to me how they carefully diagnose their spiritual condition.'⁷

The Gahini girls had at their disposal a technique of self-editing that allowed them to transform their terror into a new way of living. The Religious Tract Society had published *The Pilgrim's Progress* in Kinyarwanda in 1933, three years before the events at Gahini. It sold at one shilling a copy. The book is an allegory about the protagonist Christian, who as the story opens bears a heavy burden that 'lieth hard' upon his back.⁸ Guided by the character Evangelist—who advises him to 'Fly from the Wrath to come'—Christian sets out on a long pilgrimage, blocking his ears to the entreaties of his wife and children. Along his way to the Celestial City Christian reaches the 'place of deliverance', where the straps that bind his burden to his back are broken and it rolls into an open sepulchre. The translation was conducted at Gahini by missionary Harold Guillebaud and Samsoni Nyarubuga. Guillebaud made a habit of reading each week's work aloud in the sermons he delivered at Gahini's church.⁹ The book vitally shaped Gahini people's sense of their destiny. Dora Skipper's cook, a man named Isaaka, was reading *The Pilgrim's Progress* in May 1936 when he was suddenly convinced of his 'unpreparedness to meet Christ'. He made a long confession to Skipper, describing how he had pilfered coffee, milk, salt, and sugar from her kitchen store, and offering to compensate her for the costs from his wages.¹⁰ Samsoni Nyarubuga, the translator of the book, felt obliged to conform his life to its directions.

⁷ Skipper, diary entry for 19 Apr. 1937, CMS Oxon, Skipper papers, folio 1/3.

⁸ John Bunyan, *The Pilgrim's Progress from This World to That Which is to Come* (Uhrichsville, OH, n.d. [1678]).

⁹ H. Guillebaud, 'The Crowning Joy of Six Years' Work', *Ruanda Notes*, 39 (Jan. 1932).

¹⁰ Skipper, diary entry for 7 May 1936, CMS Oxon, Skipper papers, folio 1/3.

In April 1937 he confessed before a church assembly to having practised witchcraft in secret. ‘He couldn’t get a word out for sobbing, he got up and sat down weeping unrestrainedly’, Skipper reported. ‘Then his wife had a try but she wasn’t much better, but gradually they both got out what they wanted to say; most heartrending confessions and finally they produced his charms.’¹¹

The Pilgrim’s Progress was a manual in self-management. It showed Rwandans and other East Africans how to put a distance between themselves and their old lives. It demanded that converts edit their lives, renouncing dispositions and possessions that belonged to the past, sloughing them off, like the pack that had fallen from Christian’s back. Here was a procedure for the creation of new life. Here, in its earliest days, the Revival can be seen not as a movement—with a leadership, an organization—but as a technique for the production of new forms of selfhood. When the Gahini schoolgirl named Abisagi converted, she burned virtually all of her possessions—pillow, blanket, dresses, and photos—before an audience of her peers, explaining ‘why each thing had to go’.¹² As the Gahini converts travelled further afield they taught other people these procedures for self-management. By 1937 people were pressing into Anglican churches in Kigezi, just across the Ugandan border from Gahini. Missionaries found a thousand people gathered at one church centre. ‘Some were beside themselves with grief’, wrote a missionary. ‘In many places the floor was wet below their faces, and the bodies of many were convulsed with shaking which went on and on, apparently quite uncontrollably.’¹³ Their grief led them to dramatic acts of disavowal. Amos Mbitama, a schoolteacher in southern Uganda, converted around this time. He remembered seeing ‘flames, flames, flames, and all things would be revealed one after another after another’. Mbitama felt himself obliged to confess the most embarrassing things. ‘I would be standing publicly’, he told me, ‘confessing openly that this woman is the one who I have been involved with sinful acts, and indeed I would repent, and I would not go back. Aah!’¹⁴

The East African Revival entailed the popularization of new forms of self-accounting. Revivalist technologies moved through the scholastic networks that the Anglican Church had opened up. The first Revival preachers to reach Amadi, in southern Sudan, were students from the Anglican school at Loka.¹⁵ They had been converted when they heard revivalists preach, and walked

¹¹ Skipper to Joe Church, 25 Apr. 1937, Henry Martyn Centre (hereafter HMC) Joe Church (hereafter JEC) archives 3/4.

¹² Skipper, diary entry for 18 Apr. 1937, CMS Oxon, Skipper papers, folio 2; Skipper to Church, 25 Apr. 1937, HMC JEC 3/4.

¹³ Joe Church, circular letter, 13 Mar. 1939, HMC JEC 3/4.

¹⁴ Interview with Amos Mbitama, Kagarama, Ndorwa, 27 June 2004.

¹⁵ This paragraph is derived from Arthur Casson, circular letter, 29 Nov. 1938; and from Joe Church, circular letter, 28 Mar. 1939, in HMC JEC 1/4. Andrew Wheeler, ‘Richard Jones and the Sudan Revival of 1938’, *Anglican and Episcopal History*, 71 (2002): 168–86.

overland from Loka to Amadi in August 1938, a distance of over a hundred miles. British missionaries at Amadi found the Loka schoolboys ‘almost maniacal’. So ‘fierce and provocative were their words that most of the station staff... thought the boys were mad and possibly dangerous’. Within days crowds of Christians in Amadi were in hysteria, awaiting the imminent return of Jesus. Many people ceased cultivating their fields, and at one church converts met for four or five services every day. In Amadi as in Gahini and Kigezi converts felt obliged to make restitution for the smallest things. On Sunday mornings the altar at the Anglican church was piled high with bags of sugar, tea, pillows, pillowcases, blankets, and money. On one occasion there was a bicycle assembled from spare parts. All of these articles had been produced by people who had renounced the encumbrances of their former lives of sin.

What was it that terrified the people of Amadi? Why were converts in southern Uganda and northern Rwanda struck down with fear? Revivalists were sure that their contemporary world was coming to an end. They saw the evidence of an impending doom in their contemporary world. Joe Church, the most influential missionary advocate of the Revival, was in 1938 convinced that ‘Armageddon is very near’.¹⁶ ‘These are the last days’, wrote Church, with the war in Europe on his mind. ‘The Lord Jesus is calling us to a total war in this last battle before he returns.’¹⁷ African converts did not need to look so far afield for evidence of the impending end of time. The evidence was all around them. ‘I never cease to have sorrow for my friends who are still on the road that leads to destruction’, wrote the evangelist Yosiya Kinuka in 1938. ‘I keep on telling them that they are in a land like the land of Sodom and they must come out of it and be born again.’¹⁸ Kinuka thought his contemporary world was soon to be destroyed. His conviction was widely shared. At Shyira, in Burundi, Anglican missionaries reported that ‘many people began to have dreams warning them of the nearness of the Second Coming, and of their unpreparedness for meeting Christ’.¹⁹ One convert, a teacher from Gahini, dreamt that he was standing before God’s throne in a long line of people. As their names were read out, some people passed upwards to heaven, while others ‘with terrible cries’ fell into an abyss.²⁰ Dreams like these were proleptic. They attenuated time, trimmed life’s span, and brought dreamers face to face with a judgemental God.

¹⁶ Joe Church to Miss Hall, 29 Dec. 1938, HMC JEC 3/4.

¹⁷ Joe Church, circular letter, 9 Mar. 1942, Mid-Africa Ministry archives (hereafter MAM), University of Birmingham A3.

¹⁸ Yosiya Kinuka to ‘Ruanda friends’, n.d. (but 1938), HMC JEC 6/3.

¹⁹ Ms L. Forbes, Annual Letter, 28 Aug. 1936, Church Missionary Society archives, University of Birmingham (hereafter CMS), Annual Letters file.

²⁰ ‘Reports of African Conventions’, *Revival News*, 1(2) (1950), MAM E 1/9.

For these converts the eschaton—the end of time—was not an arid theological concept. They experienced the end times as a visual, emotional, visceral encounter. The Revival in one part of southern Uganda is said to have begun when a visiting convert preached to an assembled group of women about Revelation 20:12–13, which depicts God’s judgement. The preacher dramatized the text with illustrations of the fires of hell, then called for conversions. His message received a powerful reinforcement when a woman living an immoral life immolated herself in her house. Her body made an audible pop as it burst open, and on hearing the noise, people who previously had doubted the revivalists’ message were convinced of their impending doom.²¹ People were prompted to think about the eschaton by the evidence around them. One woman converted in 1936 because ‘she feared Hell which was waiting those who died before they repent and confess their sins’. Whenever a drop of hot water or a spark from the cooking fire touched her body, it reminded her of the ‘horrible fire of Hell’.²²

For the first revivalists, God’s judgement was a lived experience. One of my interviewees, a man named Asanasiyo Rwandare, seems to have lived much of his life while standing in judgement. He has had dozens of visions over the course of his life, many of them summoning him to account for his sins.²³ In April 1936, Rwandare was lying in bed when he heard a voice telling him ‘The end is at hand’. On opening his eyes Rwandare saw a man standing beside his bed, dressed in white robes and carrying a lamp. ‘Why don’t you allow me time to repent of my sins?’, Rwandare cried. He was drawn to his feet, and just as he was leaving his family’s compound, the man turned and said ‘Go immediately and repent’. The following morning, Rwandare stood up in a church assembly and confessed his sins, but his dreams did not come to an end. Three years after his encounter with the white-robed man, Rwandare was again accosted. Rwandare was walking along a familiar path when, quite unexpectedly, he came upon a man leaning against a piece of wood. ‘His hands were outstretched’, Rwandare remembered, ‘and when I looked, there were nails in the hands, and even through the legs’. Crying, Rwandare followed the crucifix as he walked homeward. ‘He went over the pieces of wood that had been used to close the gate’, Rwandare remembered. ‘When I went into the enclosure, I found him standing right at the door of my

²¹ John Muhanguzi, ‘The Spread of the Revival Movement at Burunga in Nyabushozi County, East Ankole’, Dip. Theo. thesis, Makerere University, 1985; E. Maari, ‘The Balokole Movement in Nyabushozi County of Ankole’, in A. Byaruhanga-Akiiki (ed.), *Occasional Research Papers in African Religions and Philosophies*, vol. 22 (Kampala, 1974).

²² N. Magambo, ‘The Balokole Movement in Mitooma Parish’, Dip. Theo. thesis, Makerere University, 1974.

²³ Interview with Asanasiyo Rwandare, Rwenyunza, Rukiga, Kabale, 26 June 2004; and Kabale town, 21 Aug. 2005.

mother's house.' The spectral Christ only disappeared when Rwandare 'realized what I had caused the Lord to go through'.

Revivalists like Rwandare were face to face with an impending judgement. Driven by the doom they witnessed, men and women made an inventory of their deeds and their goods. One man, a government chief, converted in 1936, confessing to a terrible temper. He made a list of his sins in columns on a piece of paper, and for each sin he promised to make restitution to those he had wronged.²⁴ A teacher at an Anglican school listed his sins in a letter to the school's board of governors, describing how he had purchased two shirts with money that had been given him as a travelling allowance. In an earlier confession he had forgotten about that particular sin, he wrote, 'but now the Holy Ghost revealed it to me, it was really a big sin which should throw me into Hell'.²⁵ Converts thought their eternal welfare was at stake in even the most inconsequential of things. One of my interviewees was lying in bed one evening in February 1942 when a voice told him 'you stole your brother's handkerchief'. He had thoughtlessly put the handkerchief in his pocket while doing the family's washing.²⁶

Their assuredness about the imminent end of the world drove some people to despair, and led others to act in a radical manner. Eschatology was the drill sergeant marshalling early converts to behave in anti-social ways. Wilson Komunda remembered that in 1935 he and other people in Kigezi began to 'hear voices in our minds about how God could kill us'.²⁷ On hearing the voice, he said, 'I would actually get out of bed, and . . . I would raise my voice and tell them to run away from hell, because anyone who is not saved is bound for hell'. The favourite hymn which he sang during his night-time preaching sessions went:

You people of this world which is being condemned,
what are you thinking about the end?
Why don't you think about what we have in store,
to talk about the bad parts of our lives, thieving and other sins?
We are going to leave you in your stupidity.

HONOUR AND SHAME

From the start all of this was deeply controversial. East Africa's diverse peoples observed different models of social discipline, but everyone agreed that an honourable reputation was built at home. Honourable people needed to

²⁴ Butlin, Annual Letter, 1936–7, CMS Annual Letters file.

²⁵ Master, CMS High School, Mbarara, to Clement Pain, 25 May 1942, CMS G3 A7/5.

²⁶ Interview with Enoch Lugimbirwa, Ruharo, Kigezi, 8 July 2004.

²⁷ Interview with Wilson Komunda, Bukinda, Rukiga, Kigezi, 25 June 2004.

present a good face to the public.²⁸ They had to manage appearances. Rwanda's Tutsi aristocrats took care to wall their families off from outsiders' observation. Their homesteads were enclosed with thick hedges, twenty or thirty feet in height.²⁹ When a Tutsi woman wished to venture outside her home, wrote a missionary observer, 'everyone is chased out of the courtyard and a mat is held in front of the gateway, while another beautifully woven mat is held carefully round her so that she walks as it were wrapped up from the outer gaze'.³⁰ These screens and fences organized human sociability, separating private life off from the prying eyes of outsiders. When in 1935 a curious missionary paid an unexpected visit to a chief's homestead in northern Rwanda, she surprised the lady of the house, who disconcertedly brushed past her visitor and hurriedly entered into her compartment. Only there would she agree to greet her guests.³¹ Respectable men were obliged to mask their interests and emotions, to cultivate, in the words of one anthropologist, 'the art of astutely disguising one's thoughts with consummate deception, of not seeing, not understanding, not reacting'.³²

Revivalists, in contrast, lived in the open. They would not stay behind the screens that respectable people erected. Mariya Kamondo, the aunt of Rwanda's king, was an early convert to the Revival. Like other elite women, she had spent much of her life out of the public eye: when missionaries visited her they described her household as a 'complete maze', surrounded by a large hedge and subdivided with smaller fences. But on the occasion of her conversion in May 1937 Kamondo stood, in the open, before a congregation and announced that 'the wrongs she had done to the various of her tenants and others she was going to put right, and in front of her children, servants and various Roman Catholics who were sitting round the door of the church she, the King's aunt, made a full confession of her past life, and finished up by saying, "And everything else as God shows me I am going to speak of it that I may have it out from my heart".'³³ After her confession Kamondo made a show of walking—without a screen or a veil—in missionaries' company.

Conversion entailed disclosure. It opened things up, breaking private life out of its containments. I interviewed Julaina Mufuko in 2004 at her home in a remote part of southern Uganda.³⁴ In answer to my first question—How were

²⁸ John Iliffe's *Honour in African History* (Cambridge, 2005) offers a full assessment of Africans' overlapping theories of honour.

²⁹ Dora Skipper, Annual Letter, 31 Aug. 1930, CMS Annual Letters, 1917–34 file.

³⁰ Margaret Guillebaud, quoted in Meg Guillebaud, *Rwanda: The Land God Forgot? Revival, Genocide and Hope* (London, 2002), p. 41.

³¹ Skipper, diary entry for 29 Sept. 1935, CMS Oxon, Skipper papers, folio 2.

³² F. M. Rodegem, *Anthologie Rundi* (Paris, 1973), pp. 17–20. Quoted in Iliffe, *Honour in African History*, p. 163.

³³ Skipper, diary entry for 22 May 1937, CMS Oxon, Skipper papers, folio 2/2.

³⁴ Interview with Julaina Mufuko, Kandago, 25 June 2004.

you converted?—she talked, preached, and sang for over thirty minutes. So deeply was she invested in her testimony that at certain points she began to cry, while at other times her conviction was so intense that my translator held up his hands, trying to cool her ardour. Julaina had converted in 1936. She and a group of other girls had made a habit of playing sexually while herding the goats, but one morning, Julaina remembered, a voice told her ‘That habit that you were in is sin’. The next day, Julaina stood up in a church assembly and confessed her sins, describing the deeds in which she had formerly been involved. In those days, Julaina remembered, she and other converts would sometimes see flames licking the tops of the hills, or the sun in the heavens shaking. And then, she remembered, they

used to shake, and there would be jumping and falling on the ground, and from that time we started cutting off the ornaments we used to wear, and we poured out the beer we were keeping at homes, and at night we went into churches, and we made a lot of noise, both men and women . . . So there would be screaming! People would climb to the tops of these mountains, and would begin exclaiming that the end of the world was coming!

Julaina did not stay on the hilltops. Her attention was particularly focused on Paulo Ngologoza, the county chief in Rukiga, in the heart of the highlands of southern Uganda. Ngologoza, a Catholic, thought Julaina to be a threat to public order. He summoned Julaina and three other girls to his headquarters, lined them up, and complained that ‘everyone has been caught into this salvation, and women are disobeying husbands, and husbands are complaining everywhere’. He interrogated Julaina, whip in hand, asking ‘How did you receive this Luther to come here?’ For weeks his police came to Julaina’s home, summoning her to the county headquarters. Julaina tearfully told me how she and her friends were whipped on six occasions. ‘They would beat me during the night, and that morning, I would be on top of the mountain, preaching’, she remembered. ‘The Lord was forcing us to go and speak, speak, speak!’ Her favourite song, which she made a habit of singing outside Chief Ngologoza’s headquarters, went:

You are now beating us with wooden sticks,
But when Jesus returns, he will whip you with iron sticks.
You have beaten us with these wooden canes,
But you will be beaten with iron canes.
So why don’t you think about what you are seeing?

At Gahini in Rwanda, two converts camped outside the home of their chief, singing and preaching against his sins. When the chief ordered them to desist, one of them replied ‘We are not under the orders of the Government or you . . . We are commanded by the Holy Spirit.’³⁵ The chief had the converts

³⁵ Skipper, diary entry for 29 May 1937, CMS Oxon, Skipper papers, folio 2/2.

imprisoned, but neither Gahini's chief nor the embattled Paulo Ngologoza could get a grip on troublesome revivalists. Not even Rujumbura county's formidable Chief Karegyesa—six feet nine inches tall—could put revivalists under his feet. During the late 1930s several of Karegyesa's lovers converted, confessing in public to their liaisons with the chief. Converts stationed themselves outside his home, singing songs condemning his sexual profligacy.³⁶ One convert, a schoolteacher, was so persistent that Karegyesa had him beaten, jailed, and exiled from the county. Karegyesa warned his nephew that 'This new kind of religion is dangerous. It invades your privacy. You have nothing left.'³⁷ In their public appearances revivalists spoke openly about subjects that men like Chief Karegyesa sought to keep secret.

The indiscriminate character of revivalists' testimonies endangered other people's reputations. Many people—not only chiefs—found themselves drawn, willy-nilly, into converts' self-justifying discourses. Julaina Mufuko described how female converts would 'confess in public, right in front of the men they had committed adultery with!' Snapping her fingers to the rhythm of her words, Julaina described how the 'Holy Spirit would show you spontaneously, say this, say this, say this! If you have met Jesus, you have got to confess this!'³⁸ When the anthropologist Derrick Stenning attended a revival meeting in Ankole, he listened as the parish chief's wife described how she had committed adultery with no less than fifty men.³⁹ In their loud confessions revivalists threw their respectability to the winds. Even as they confessed, converts felt themselves acting immorally. Asanasiyo Rwandare, the convert who seems always to have been dreaming about an impending judgement, was terrified when in 1935 he stood to confess his sins. 'If I say all these things I have committed', Rwandare worried, 'won't these people stone me to death? Because I had committed incest, I had intercourse with my close relatives, I used sometimes to destroy other people's gardens.'⁴⁰ In their denunciations of other people's behaviour, converts laid down their civic responsibilities. Critics were convinced that converts were consumed with self-interest. In one part of Uganda converts were known as *Abatarukukwatanisa*, 'Those who do not cooperate'.⁴¹ In another part of Uganda converts were known as *Binkwa-tiireki*, 'I am not concerned with whatever', as *Tinfayo*, 'I am not bothered', or

³⁶ Catherine Robins, 'Tukutendereza: A Study of Social Change and Sectarian Withdrawal in the Balokole Revival of Uganda', PhD thesis, Columbia University, 1975, pp. 248–9.

³⁷ Quoted in Festo Kivengere with Dorothy Smoker, *Revolutionary Love* (Fort Washington, PA, 1983), p. 10.

³⁸ Interview with Julaina Mufuko, Kandago, Kigezi, 25 June 2004.

³⁹ Notes on a service at Kiruhura, 20 Oct. 1957, Cambridge University Library Add. 7916, file B.5.

⁴⁰ Interview with Asanasiyo Rwandare, Rwenyunza, Rukiga, Kigezi, 26 June 2004.

⁴¹ Derrick Stenning, 'Preliminary Observations on the Balokoli Movement, Particularly Among Bahima in Ankole District', seminar paper, East African Institute of Social Research, 1957.

as *Bafaki*, 'Don't worry about me'.⁴² The nicknames are a form of criticism, given to converts by their offended neighbours. They showed converts to be both callous and uncommitted. Converts would not comport themselves in a way that upheld sociable communities.

DOMESTICATING THE REVIVAL

Many people doubted converts' sanity. That is what Dora Skipper was worried about during that cacophonous morning at Gahini in July 1936. Within the space of a few weeks she was insisting that girls who wished to offer long and revealing testimonies of conversion would confine themselves to a simple formula: 'Once I was blind but now I see'. When a convert at the Gahini school went into a 'long rigmarole of how she had been saved', Skipper would cut her off, telling her to 'only say those words I told them'.⁴³ Here we can see, in its earliest form, the emergence of forms of social control that were designed to limit converts' latitude. The Revival's spread generated anxious efforts to reinforce confinements, defend standards of decorum, and domesticate conversion.

One of the turning points in the domestication of the Revival came in 1940, when noisy and untoward converts in Bugufi, in north-western Tanganyika, occasioned the movement's first crisis. In April 1939 a group of revivalists from northern Rwanda and southern Uganda spent six days preaching at an Anglican school on the northern edge of Bugufi. The Ten Commandments had been translated into LuHangaza, the language of Bugufi's people, a few years before. The preachers spent their time going through them line by line. Their programme focused consecutively on 'sin', 'repentance', 'the blood of Jesus', 'the new birth', and 'judgment'.⁴⁴ On the day the revivalists departed, the schoolmaster Lionel Bakewell found a steady stream of students at his door, returning goods that they had pilfered from the school's store. Bakewell's own cook presented him with a gallon of oil and a cushion that he had stolen, and repaid a debt that he owed to the school. A schoolboy confessed to tearing a piece of paper out of a school exercise book.⁴⁵ By June, all the schoolteachers, twenty-nine schoolboys, and many of the school's labourers had confessed to formerly hidden sins. Chapel services ran into the early hours of the morning.

⁴² Ndambuki Peace, 'The Impact of the 1935–1937 Revival Movement on the Church of Uganda with Particular Reference to Kihanga Archdeaconry in Kigezi Diocese', Dip. Theo. thesis, Makerere University, 1990.

⁴³ Skipper, diary entry for 14 Sept. 1936, CMS Oxon, Skipper papers, folio 2.

⁴⁴ Lionel Bakewell, circular letter, 29 Apr. 1939, HMC JEC 1/3.

⁴⁵ Lionel Bakewell, 'Revival in Tanganyika in East Africa', n.d. Typescript seen courtesy of Kathy Kozlowski.

'Boys and teachers vie with one another to get up and make some confession or further confession', Bakewell reported. One young man's confession lasted for all of fifty-five minutes. Many people were overwhelmed by the evidence of their sin. At a chapel service early in 1940, Bakewell reported, the school-teacher Denys Balonzi 'raised a scream of "Dhambi, dhambi, dhambi" ["sin, sin, sin"], and rushed out of the church and went screaming among the trees "Sin, sin has entered the church and is ruining it!" Later he came to our house and almost like one possessed preached to us for forty minutes, until I stopped him and insisted that we must have our meal.'⁴⁶

By February 1940, converts in Bugufi were gripped in what one missionary later called an 'African Pentecost'.⁴⁷ Lionel Bakewell reported that some people were 'bowed over, almost as if they had fainted or had an electric shock or a fit'. They 'fell to the floor, often rolling about, sometimes calling out inarticulately, sometimes with words of praise to the Lord Jesus, sometimes laughing in what in other circumstances one would describe in a demented sort of way'.⁴⁸ A visiting missionary was disturbed to find that converts were 'falling to the ground, groaning and laughing accompanied by heavy breathing'.⁴⁹ The schoolmaster Bakewell was seized by the Holy Spirit in October 1939, and thereafter he joined his students and fellow-teachers, kneeling in their midst and speaking in tongues.⁵⁰ When in February 1940 a contingent of African revivalists from Burundi and Rwanda visited Bugufi, their leader complained about the Bugufi Anglicans' demonstrative Christianity: 'They think that if a man has not fallen down and lost consciousness several times he is not born again... They shouted and laughed until they were carried outside... and when you meet him or her outside you find them taking off clothes or other things. Among the girls you see a girl just fallen and her friend trying to stop her crying like a baby.'⁵¹

In April 1940 Tanganyika's Anglican bishop, George Chambers, travelled to Bugufi to investigate. In a furious report, Chambers called the service he attended 'pandemonium let loose'.

As darkness drew near, the waving hands and arms increased to the rhythm of profane hymn tunes and choruses. The clapping of hands took place, people began to sing different hymns at the same time and persisted in doing so, some finished their hymn with a rocking laugh, and then followed cryings, screamings, shoutings, making noises like those of animals such as catcalls, the yelping of dogs and the snorting of wild beasts. Two women groveled and wailed on the grass

⁴⁶ Bakewell to Church, 22 Mar. 1940, HMC JEC 1/3.

⁴⁷ Joe Church, *Quest for the Highest: An Autobiographical Account of the East African Revival* (Exeter, 1981), p. 169.

⁴⁸ Bakewell to Church, 22 Mar. 1940, HMC JEC 1/3.

⁴⁹ Bill Butler to Church, 19 Feb. 1940, HMC JEC 1/3.

⁵⁰ Capt. W. McKee to Church, 25 Mar. 1940, HMC JEC 1/3.

⁵¹ J. Omusoke to Church, 19 Feb. 1940, HMC JEC 1/3.

floor of the church, another woman crawled on the floor like a [snake], a girl kept up an incessant shouting and crying for an hour, in a kneeling posture, with her face three inches from the wall . . . There were loud utterances and unintelligible to others, mutterings and murmurings . . . When exhausted and there was a lull in the noise, some one would rise to read the scripture. Immediately another would sing and drown the hearing of God's word or would pray aloud.⁵²

Chambers was convinced that the Pentecostal practices of Bugufi's Anglicans had sent them to the edge of madness. He ordered missionaries to immediately 'cease such forms of devotion'. Lionel Bakewell initially refused to accept his bishop's instruction. But shortly after Bishop Chambers's departure he consulted a medical book, and found that 'the descriptions given there fitted what was going on here almost exactly'. The next day, Bakewell told the Sunday congregation that their ecstatic experiences were in fact a 'pestilence', *maradhi*, a wasting disease that was sucking out their lives.⁵³ He preached on 1 Corinthians 12, which described the fruits of the Holy Spirit as peace and self-control, and instituted new rules to control converts' enthusiasm. Services at the school chapel were to be limited to one hour, and lights were to be out by nine in the evening. When one evening a group of students gathered at one o'clock in the morning to preach and sing, Bakewell called them into his office and caned them, one by one.

The controversy that followed went to the core of the matter. In the wake of Bakewell's change of heart, revivalists spent long hours on the football field, preaching loudly. Bakewell described their invective: 'My name is mud, I'm unsaved, a blasphemer, quenching the spirit, seeking rank and position etc. etc.'⁵⁴ There was more to this debate than name-calling. Bugufi's Anglicans were contending with missionaries over the very definition of Christian behaviour. Bakewell told a correspondent that 'the Bible has been combed for texts about people falling down on their faces, and these have been used to justify rolling about when one receives the Holy Spirit, irrespective of whether it was angels in heaven who fell down or sinners like Saul or Balaam in Numbers 22:31'. The teacher Denys Balonzi composed a ten-page epistle and read it aloud in the chapel. It condemned missionaries for 'daring to pass judgment on what was God's business alone'. He cited as a defence of Pentecostal practice Hebrews 2:4, which described how God ministered to people 'both by signs and wonders and by manifold powers and by the gifts of the Holy Ghost'.

All of this scriptural exegesis had little effect. In August 1940, four months after Bishop Chambers's ill-tempered directive, missionary Lionel Bakewell was transferred to another station. His replacement, a man named Charles

⁵² Chambers to Church, 5 Apr. 1940, HMC JEC 1/3.

⁵³ Bakewell to Church, 18 May 1940, HMC JEC 1/3.

⁵⁴ Bakewell to Church, 15 May 1940, HMC JEC 1/3.

Maling, could by 1941 report that the 'excesses' of the Revival had died away.⁵⁵ Maling replaced converts' night-time chapel services with a more sedate, and ill-attended, Bible study. In the absence of charismatic fervour, the missionary was struck by converts' probity and discretion. Where formerly 'lying, theft and laziness were prevalent', Maling wrote, 'honesty and hard work are now accepted principles'.

Here, in a remote corner of north-western Tanganyika, we can see the operation of a machinery for the reinforcement of probity. Church authorities worked to domesticate the Revival by imposing an editorial authority over converts' testimonies. They sought to separate private life from public affairs, to quiet converts' disclosures and promote decorum and comportment. Church and secular authorities across eastern Africa employed the same procedures. Like Bishop Chambers, African chiefs sought to impose confinements on converts, setting timetables to control the duration and location of revivalists' enunciations. In northern Rwanda, chiefs adopted by-laws in 1937 mandating that church services were to end at nightfall.⁵⁶ In southern Uganda, Chief Karegyesa barred noisy revivalists from gathering anywhere outside the precincts of the local church. Revivalists who sang as they walked along the road were liable to be fined. In July 1942, the district commissioner extended Chief Karegyesa's war against revivalists: revivalists gathered in private homes were obliged to disband by 8:30 p.m., and singing was by government writ to cease by 9:30 p.m. Eighteen Anglican teachers and forty unmarried girls were arrested in September for violating the curfew. In May 1943 government authorities in Kigezi banned drum-beating in churches, made singing on the roadways illegal, and ruled that religious services could not be convened outside registered churches.⁵⁷ But even in the face of these draconian rules, converts kept singing. The irrepressible Julaina Mufuko told me how, when passing a Catholic priest on the road, she and other converts would sing 'Hmm, hmm, hmm' to the tune of 'You have whipped us with wooden bars, but when the Lord returns he will whip you with iron bars'.⁵⁸

By 1944 police in Uganda were convinced that revivalists posed a threat to good government. Under wartime censorship regulations the Special Branch began opening revivalists' mail, and undercover agents attended Revival meetings and reported on the proceedings. The intelligence they produced was alarming. The governor of Uganda worried that revivalists 'engage in abusive attacks on chiefs and impugn their moral characters in public, in church and in law courts. Their attitude to authorities, even Europeans, is

⁵⁵ Maling to Church, 12 June 1941, HMC JEC 1/3.

⁵⁶ Skipper, letter for 29 May 1937, CMS Oxon, Skipper papers, folio 2/2.

⁵⁷ These rules are discussed in KigDA bundle 129, 'Church Missionary Society' file.

⁵⁸ Interview with Julaina Mufuko, Kandago, Kigezi, 25 June 2004.

disrespectful and impertinent.⁵⁹ Uganda's Director of Intelligence and Security worried that the converts were 'openly attacking persons in authority in the established church, and the next step may easily be against the authority of the state'.⁶⁰ The chief secretary was concerned that 'the incitement of the African to indiscipline and contempt of authority is extremely dangerous in its potential repercussions'. And the governor darkly worried that the 'purely religious stage of the revival has practically passed, and a second and far more dangerous stage, in which violence between the [converts] and non-[converts] in the name of religion may occur... From the second stage to the third stage—violence against the state—is the logical sequence, and in fact we have already the beginnings in Kigezi.'⁶¹

The file that the Uganda government sent to the Colonial Office in London listed the names and addresses of all of eastern Africa's Revival leaders. The chief secretary in the Colonial Office thought it to be a 'tale of morbid religion and hysteria'. The Colonial Secretary in Churchill's government, Oliver Stanley, was moved to write to the secretary of the Church Missionary Society, describing how the Revival had begun 'to manifest less agreeable symptoms: dissension... accompanied by hysterical forms of public confession'. There was evidence, he warned, that the Revival had 'deteriorated to congregational rowdyism, indirect encouragement of immorality and an unwholesome atmosphere in certain Church schools'.⁶² Privately, the governor worried that Uganda's Anglican bishop had 'lost his grip', and contemplated asking the archbishop of Canterbury to replace him with a stronger man.⁶³

Prompted in part by the paranoia of the wartime colonial state, prompted also by the anxieties of African local government officials, Anglican missionaries moved to impose order on troublesome revivalists. In Rujumbura—Chief Karegyesa's county—the bishop was appalled when, during a confirmation service, people began 'popping up all over the congregation to hold forth'.⁶⁴ 'I felt as if I was on the edge of a volcano', he wrote. At the bishop's urging, church officials in Rwanda agreed in May 1942 to suppress both 'dancing under the impulse of the Spirit' and 'uncontrolled emotionalism in greetings, especially... between the sexes'.⁶⁵ By 1943 missionaries gathered at Ibuye in Burundi were prepared to go further: they passed a rule that 'no interruption

⁵⁹ DC Kigezi's report of May 1942, quoted in Governor of Uganda to Secretary of State for the Colonies, 4 May 1944, BNA CO 536/215/4.

⁶⁰ Director of Intelligence and Security, 13 June 1944, Kenya National Archives DC/Kisumu 1/36/88.

⁶¹ Governor of Uganda to Secretary of State for the Colonies, 4 May 1944, BNA CO 536/215/4.

⁶² Secretary of State for the Colonies to Hooper, June 1944, BNA CO 536/215/4.

⁶³ C. Cox, minute, 1 May 1944, BNA CO 536/215/4.

⁶⁴ Stuart to Webster, 21 Mar. 1942, CMS G3 A7/1.

⁶⁵ 'Text of an Understanding Arrived at Between the Missions Assembled at Muyebe, May 1942', HMC JEC 1/8.

of divine service can be allowed by unauthorized speaking, singing, drumming etc.', and that 'the public confession of shameful sins is not allowed' in church buildings.⁶⁶ In 1944 the missionary council in Rwanda had ruled that 'the principle of walking in the light through the public or private confession of sins is unscriptural'. Fellowship that 'demands continual confession and the public denunciation of other Christians is error, and not of God, and must cease in the Mission'.⁶⁷ And in 1946 the bishop of Uganda, Rwanda, and Burundi ruled that priests—not laypeople—were to pronounce the absolution; that the Ganda term 'pastori' was to be reserved for the exclusive use of ordained people; and that all churches were to celebrate Holy Communion at least once a month.⁶⁸

CONCLUSION

Here was a path not taken in eastern Africa's history of Anglicanism. The Anglican establishment hoped to promote a Revival that was consonant with the requirements of the secular colonial government. They wanted revivalists to be decorous, obedient to those in authority, composed, and careful about slander. In suppressing the millenarian Revival of the 1930s and early 1940s Church authorities also made charisma appear to be foreign to Anglican Christianity. That is why, in later years, Pentecostal Christianity was seen as a threat to Anglicanism. In 1960 Pentecostal missionaries from Canada and Kenya began to hold daily services under a tent in Kampala, near Makerere College. They claimed to be able to heal the sick and cure blindness. Hundreds of people attended their services. The bishop of Uganda wrote a letter of complaint to the governor, and the governor agreed to deny visas to Pentecostal missionaries applying to enter Uganda. 'We don't want any other sects, especially of the American hot-gospel variety', he averred.⁶⁹ The commissioner of police called it 'rather hysterical charlatanry'.⁷⁰ Official disapproval notwithstanding, Pentecostal churches grew at a moderate pace in the 1960s—in 1968 a survey found 650 people attending services weekly under the tent at Makerere, with 200 people at a suburban church in Nakawa.⁷¹ By the

⁶⁶ Bishop Stuart to Webster, 18 Jan. 1944, CMS G3 A11/1.

⁶⁷ Letter to field missionaries from the Ruanda Council, 7 Feb. 1944, CMS G3 A11/1.

⁶⁸ Bishop to Uganda to Talbot Hindley, 18 May 1946, CMS G3 A11/8.

⁶⁹ Leslie Brown to Governor, 7 Feb. 1961, BNA FCO 141/18252.

⁷⁰ Commissioner of Police to Permanent Secretary, Security and External Relations, 15 Mar. 1961, BNA FCO 141/18252.

⁷¹ Greater Kampala Project, 'Report on Fact-Finding Questionnaire for all Churches and Congregations', 1968, SOAS Ms. 46.

1980s, after a decade of repression by Idi Amin, Pentecostal Christianity was again on the rise.

But revivalists regarded Pentecostals with scorn. One of Buganda's leading revivalists complained that Pentecostals had 'brought a lot of confusion and difficulty into salvation because they all say they are saved, but the works of salvation are very few'. The revivalist critic stressed Pentecostals' lack of composure. 'They lay emphasis on healing, miracles, being filled with the Spirit, tongues, fasting etc.', he wrote, 'but repentance, restitution, being cleansed with the Blood, walking in the Light—they don't emphasize at all'.⁷² Revivalists in the 1960s and 1970s were preoccupied with proving their own righteousness. They had little sympathy for Pentecostal charisma. They made increasingly tendentious distinctions between sin and right living, rendering whole aspects of life out-of-bounds. In the mid-1960s a prominent convert named Yona Mondo began to preach that people who had once been converted now needed to be 're-awakened' in order to gain salvation. Mondo and his followers—they were called the *abazukufu* (awakened people) in the Ganda language—thought it sinful to purchase life insurance, as it thwarted God's provision; they thought illness and disease to be acts of providence; they thought it wrong to borrow money, since converts should be beholden only to God.⁷³ Joe Church, who attended *abazukufu* meetings, listened for hours as converts repented of their hairstyles and other fashionable encumbrances.⁷⁴ They made a point of highlighting other people's sin: when Yona Mondo met with a delegation of leading revivalists in 1971, he reminded one woman of a child she had born out of wedlock.⁷⁵ 'This is the hardest time we have ever had in Uganda', Joe Church commented. He put 28,000 miles on his car as he sought to reconcile the two factions.⁷⁶ In 1971 the Revival leader Simeon Nsibambi wrote a circular letter accusing Mondo and his followers of planting the 'seed of hatred untold and a spirit of dissention, followed with such legalism which cannot be found in the teaching of our Lord'.⁷⁷ Mondo ignored him: directly after receiving Nsibambi's remonstrance he opened up a new evangelistic centre.⁷⁸

The inflationary impulse to multiply sin, to look for obscure wrongdoings that could be confessed, had always been intrinsic to revivalist ontology.

⁷² Peter Kigozi to Malcolm and Barbara, 20 Feb. 1985, HMC JEC 15/2.

⁷³ Apolo Nsibambi, 'The Early Life of Mr. Semion Nsibambi', n.d., Jocelyn Murray papers, London Mennonite Centre.

⁷⁴ Joe Church to Bill Butler, 3 May 1966, HMC JEC 5/6.

⁷⁵ Simeon Nsibambi to Mondo, 12 Feb. 1971, Anglican Church of Kenya archives, 'Brethren, 1971-74' file.

⁷⁶ Joe Church to Harold Adeney, 24 Oct. 1966, HMC JEC 5/6.

⁷⁷ Nsibambi to 'All the Bishops of the Church of Uganda', n.d. (but 1971), Church of Uganda archives 02 Bp 24/1.

⁷⁸ Nsibambi to Yona Mondo, 12 Feb. 1971, Anglican Church of Kenya archives, 'Brethren, 1971-74' file.

Shaped in the image of *The Pilgrim's Progress*, revivalists were prisoners to literary form. In order to convert they needed to author a testimony that could distance them from their old lives of sin. That is why the schoolgirls at Gahini confessed to such small things—a misplaced needle, a stolen handkerchief. That is why Julaina Mufuko had so much to say about Chief Ngologoza. That is why the noisy converts at Bugufi were so terrified. The revelations that converts made were shocking. They undermined reputations and destroyed concord. Yona Mondo's self-righteous denunciations went further than others had done. But he, too, was the product of the revivalist impulse to sort through life, to open things up.

In the end it was the foreclosure of eastern Africa's communications network that undermined revivalist Christianity. In Rwanda, the Hutu Revolution resulted in the displacement of tens of thousands of people, among them the Anglican evangelists who had been the Revival's first converts. By 1965 missionaries at Gahini, the Revival's birthplace, could report that their entire community consisted of women and children.⁷⁹ In Uganda, Idi Amin's disastrous 'economic war' resulted in serious shortages of paper. The telephone service collapsed after the Kenyan employees of the telephone company fled the country. Revivalists' networks shrank as travel became difficult. In 1972 the police interned several busloads of Ugandan revivalists who were on their way to a convention in central Tanzania.⁸⁰ When Amin was overthrown in 1979 converts composed a wave of circular letters, seeking to re-energize dormant ties of sentiment and fellowship. 'It has been so long a time without proper and free communication between us', wrote revivalist Andereya Sabune in May 1979. In an earlier time Sabune had been one among the many converts whose testimony of conversion was piped into print and distributed through the circuitry of the Revival.⁸¹ In the 1970s Sabune and his colleagues were preoccupied with more basic things. 'Our leaders have been uneducated people, what they know better was killing and taking away Ugandans' peace', wrote Sabune. 'During that time we were like Daniel in the flaming fire.'⁸²

There have been a great many Daniels in the history of the Revival, for revivalism feeds on stories of Christian endurance in the face of privation, pain, and loss. But Idi Amin's Uganda has generated an exceedingly small hagiography.⁸³ Janani Luwum, the archbishop who was killed by Idi Amin in

⁷⁹ Beryl and Ted, circular letter from Gahini, 18 Jan. 1965, HMC JEC 8/2.

⁸⁰ Peggy and Andrew Ked to Joe Church, 30 July 1972, HMC JEC 15/2.

⁸¹ Phyllis Hindley, 'The Conversion of M... , a Young Mututsi', *Front Line News*, 2 (Nov. 1944), MAM E 1/7.

⁸² Andereya Sabune, circular letter, 25 May 1979, HMC JEC 15/2.

⁸³ Patricia Haward (ed.), *Looking Back: Personal Memories of Uganda's Troubled Past, 1970–2000* (Kampala, 2009); Margaret Ford, *Even Unto Death: The Story of Uganda Martyr Janani Luwum* (Elgin, IL, 1978); Dan Wooding and Ray Barnett, *Uganda Holocaust* (London, 1980).

1977, has been recognized as a martyr by the world-wide Anglican Communion, and in 1998 a statue of Luwun was unveiled in Westminster Abbey. But in Uganda itself it has been difficult for revivalists—or anyone else—to put the 1970s behind them. There are no public memorials to Luwun or any other martyr; there are no museums where the victims of Idi Amin can be remembered.⁸⁴ The Amin dictatorship is not yet settled. It cannot be the forcing-house for the formation of Christian testimonies.

In the absence of discursive momentum the Revival had lost much of its power in the 1980s. It was for a new generation to plot a path forward. Yoweri Museveni, from southern Uganda, was the son of an Anglican revivalist, and as a schoolboy he himself converted. He was deeply impressed with converts' probity and discipline.⁸⁵ During the early 1980s Museveni was leading a guerrilla insurrection against Milton Obote's corrupt regime. In a circular distributed in Uganda and in England, he argued that the 'moral fabric of our society is all but destroyed'. He planned to constitute a 'Directorate of National Guidance' and charge it with 'promoting a general revival of moral values in society'.⁸⁶ When Museveni's National Resistance Army came to power in 1986 cadres were convinced that a new epoch had begun. They thought themselves 'completely disencumbered of a shameful past', and free therefore to 'think and act'. The political theory of Museveni's revolution was formed in the image of Christian conversion. Where converts had once disencumbered themselves of a sinful past through acts of renunciation, Museveni found in the apparatus of government a means of authoring other people's salvation.

That is what the domestication of the Revival has wrought for eastern Africa's politics. Where once the Revival posed a mortal threat to colonial authority, it now furnishes the discursive architecture for tendentious and inhumane programmes of moral and social reform.⁸⁷

SELECT BIBLIOGRAPHY

Butler, Bill, *Hill Ablaze* (London, 1976).

Church, Joe, *Quest for the Highest: An Autobiographical Account of the East African Revival* (Exeter, 1981).

Ford, Margaret, *Even Unto Death: The Story of Uganda Martyr Janani Luwum* (Elgin, IL, 1978).

⁸⁴ Derek R. Peterson and Edgar Taylor, 'Rethinking the State in Idi Amin's Uganda: The Politics of Exhortation', *Journal of Eastern African Studies*, 7 (2013): 58–82.

⁸⁵ Yoweri Museveni, *Sowing the Mustard Seed* (London: Macmillan, 1997), pp. 14–15.

⁸⁶ National Resistance Movement, 'Toward a Free and Democratic Uganda' (Kampala, n.d. [but 1982]), SOAS 'Liberation' box 15.

⁸⁷ Kevin Ward, 'The Role of the Anglican and Catholic Churches in Uganda in Public Discourse on Homosexuality and Ethics', *Journal of Eastern African Studies*, 9 (2015): 127–44.

- Gatu, John, *Joyfully Christian, Truly African* (Nairobi, 2006).
- Guillebaud, Meg, *Rwanda: The Land God Forgot? Revival, Genocide and Hope* (London, 2002).
- Hofmeyr, Isabel, *The Portable Bunyan: A Transnational History of the Pilgrim's Progress* (Princeton, NJ, 2004).
- Illife, John, *Honour in African History* (Cambridge, 2005).
- Kariuki, Obadiah, *A Bishop Facing Mount Kenya: An Autobiography, 1902–1978* (Nairobi, 1985).
- Maari, E., 'The Balokole Movement in Nyabushozi County of Ankole', in A. Byaruhanga-Akiiki (ed.), *Occasional Research Papers in African Religions and Philosophies*, vol. 22 (Kampala, 1974).
- Museveni, Yoweri, *Sowing the Mustard Seed* (London: Macmillan, 1997).
- Olang', Festo, *Festo Olang': An Autobiography* (Nairobi, 1991).
- Osborn, Herbert, *Pioneers in the East African Revival* (Eastbourne, 2000).
- Osborn, Herbert, *Revival: A Precious Heritage* (Eastbourne, 1995).
- Peterson, Derek R., *Ethnic Patriotism and the East African Revival: A History of Dissent* (Cambridge, 2012).
- Peterson, Derek R. and Edgar Taylor, 'Rethinking the State in Idi Amin's Uganda: The Politics of Exhortation', *Journal of Eastern African Studies*, 7 (2013): 58–82.
- Reed, Colin, *Walking in the Light: Reflections on the East African Revival and its Link to Australia* (Victoria, 2007).
- Robins, Catherine, 'Tukutendereza: A Study of Social Change and Sectarian Withdrawal in the Balokole Revival of Uganda', PhD thesis, Columbia University, 1975.
- Ward, Kevin, 'The Role of the Anglican and Catholic Churches in Uganda in Public Discourse on Homosexuality and Ethics', *Journal of Eastern African Studies*, 9 (2015): 127–44.
- Wheeler, Andrew, 'Richard Jones and the Sudan Revival of 1938', *Anglican and Episcopal History*, 71 (2002): 168–86.
- Wiseman, Edith, *Kikuyu Martyrs* (London, 1958).

Anglican Mission in Twentieth-Century Africa

Elizabeth E. Prevost

The history of modern Anglican mission in Africa is inextricable from the larger history of the global twentieth century. Just as in the nineteenth century, missions were the metropolitan products and global agents of Evangelicalism, liberalism, and their discontents, in the twentieth, missions both shaped and were shaped by the larger currents of global warfare, colonial development, nationalism, ecumenism, and the rapid expansion and disintegration of the imperial world order. To ameliorate the traumas of total war at home and economic modernization in Africa, Anglican missionaries tried to institute a neo-traditional rural society while paradoxically building the material institutions that would marshal those aspects of modernity necessary to realize that dream. Yet while the goals and intentions of missionary organizations mattered to the shape of Anglicanism in the mission field, mission communities were equally shaped by elite and grassroots control of the Christian message, institutions, and personnel on the ground—some of whom were partners in the missionary endeavour, and some of whom did not share missionaries' vision. What it meant to be Anglican in the mission field accordingly shifted over time as missionaries struggled to accommodate and control the local, colonial, metropolitan, and transnational 'winds of change'.

The varieties of Anglican expression introduced to sub-Saharan Africa during the nineteenth-century missionary movement became entrenched in the twentieth century. Missionary societies defied the *via media* individually even if they embodied it collectively, espousing Anglo-Catholic (Universities' Mission to Central Africa; UMCA), High Church (Society for the Propagation of the Gospel; SPG), and Evangelical (Church Missionary Society; CMS) confessionalism as well as the maternalism of the Mothers' Union, and mapping their doctrinal priorities onto the geography of the mission field. On the rare occasions they had to coexist, as in POW camps in German East Africa, the differences were thrown into stark contrast, as one UMCA

woman's disparaging characterization of the social class as well as Protestant identity of her CMS compatriots illustrates:

We have Mass every day and all the hours, and of course matins and evensong. On Sunday we have a terrible united service, matins and sermon at 9.0 and evensong after tea. Four hymns, Anglican chants, and, on CMS days, a never-ending sermon, one long string of words with a cockney accent. They have a small harmonium, 'Dismal James' we call it, and several enormous voices, so the effect is quite beyond words.¹

Yet even as Anglican missionaries resided in particular liturgical and theological camps, they also took a Broad Church approach to colonial and nationalist politics and collectively steered many a middle way between the demands of metropole and locality, state and Church needs, British and African cultural iterations, local and global pressures. In fact, 'churchmanship' provided crucial sites of meaning for missionaries and Africans to navigate the relationship of Christianity to the changing world around them.

This chapter considers how twentieth-century movements in colonial statecraft, welfare and development, anti-colonial nationalism, and decolonization found local expression in Anglican missions in Africa. Specifically, it looks at how the commitment of Anglican missions to indigenization played out in government and society, education and knowledge production, ritual and spirituality, political dissent, and devolution. Across the variations of space, time, and theological spectrum, the constant goal of Anglican missions and missionaries was one of Africanization: of personnel, institutions, and practice. Unlike their nineteenth-century predecessors who sought a cultural transformation as both a precedent and product of conversion, by the early twentieth century Anglican missions in Africa had shifted towards a very deliberate policy of indigenizing Christian thought and practice. This premise allowed a wide space for missionaries, catechists, adherents, and opponents alike to use Anglicanism as the basis of social capital, cultural expression, and political dissent. But indigenizing projects necessarily privileged certain groups, leaders, and identities, and some aspects and practitioners of Anglicanism more readily accommodated indigenous social institutions and cultural expressions than others. Likewise, Africans did not always share missionaries' concepts of Africanization. And while Anglicanism was not transplanted to Africa as the established Church of its British roots, its missions were no less implicated in dynamics of power and politics. Thus, Anglican missions in twentieth-century Africa had the capacity to challenge and unseat social, political, and religious hierarchies and identities as much as to create and reinforce them.

¹ Daisy V. Perrott to UMCA home office, Kiboriani, 13 June 1915, Bodleian Library, Oxford, USPG UX 33/14.

ANGLICAN MISSION, STATECRAFT, AND SOCIETY

The CMS in Uganda illustrates the fraught relationship of mission, Church, and state in the colonial period, and the attending opportunities and constraints for missionaries and Africans. Anglicanism carried a privileged status in Uganda that it did not enjoy in most other parts of British Africa. The late nineteenth-century politico-religious revolutions in Buganda, the victory of the Ganda Protestant oligarchy over Muslims, Catholics, traditionalists, and neighbouring states, the growing reach of Ganda evangelism in the other kingdoms, and the formalization of colonialism in the Uganda Agreement gave the CMS a special prominence within the simultaneously traditionalist, Christian, and colonial foundations of the protectorate. Further, the Uganda Agreement sealed the ascendant position of Buganda's appointed territorial *saza* chiefs (*Bakungu*), who curbed the relative power of both the ruling *kabaka* and the parallel complex of clan lineages (*Bataka*), and tied trans-territorial office-holders (*Batongole*) and their religious affiliation to landholdings in a more fixed and permanent way. The Anglican mission and Church thus became inextricable from a very particular system of Indirect Rule—the practice of colonial governance through pre-existing African authority—that at once entrenched the political structures of an indigenous state and transformed its social basis of legitimacy. Symbolically as well as institutionally, Anglican Protestantism became synonymous with the colonial and traditionalist hierarchy throughout the diocese and protectorate of Uganda. Ecclesiastical titles emulated political ones, with churchwardens designated *katikiro* (prime minister), and bishops *kabaka*. The bishop of Uganda appeared alongside the governor and Buganda's *kabaka* at all official functions and ceremonials. Anglicans thus assumed an influence disproportionate to their numbers, which comprised a minority of Uganda's 'readers' (followers of Christianity or Islam) throughout the colonial period.²

Uganda became the paradigm of the advance of African Christianity in mission teleology, encompassing the vast majority of East Africa's Christians and providing a blueprint for other corporate conversion narratives. Following the Evangelical tradition of the CMS, the mission and indigenous Church was characterized by its emphasis on textuality, spiritual conversion, revival and confession, and holiness. The mission Church developed on the initiative of Ganda evangelists, and by 1938 there were more ordained black clergy than white operating in the diocese—a growing reality that the Anglican hierarchy

² John V. Taylor, *The Growth of the Church in Buganda* (Westport, CT, 1958); D. A. Low, *Buganda in Modern History* (London, 1971); Louise Pirouet, *Black Evangelists: The Spread of Christianity in Uganda, 1891–1914* (London, 1978); Holger Bernt Hansen, *Mission, Church, and State in a Colonial Setting: Uganda 1890–1925* (London, 1984); Zablon Nthamburi (ed.), *From Mission to Church: A Handbook of Christianity in East Africa* (Nairobi, 1991); Benjamin C. Ray, *Myth, Ritual and Kingship in Buganda* (New York, 1991).

acknowledged and accommodated very unevenly in its ecclesiastical structure. Bishop Alfred Tucker made an early attempt to devolve mission and diocesan authority to a Native Church of Uganda through a formal constitution, but missionary opposition resulted in a compromise in the 1907 constitution that kept missionaries under CMS authority in Britain, thus enshrining the very distinction between mission and Church that Tucker had sought to eliminate through the constitution. The new Church structure followed the 'native lines' of the ideal of Henry Venn, but privileged European status by allowing missionaries to freely cross mission and church lines while keeping Africans firmly localized on one side of that boundary.³ Further, Anglican mission centres and their European personnel received a much higher proportion of mission resources, while African catechists and clergy remained in a subsidiary position, usually underpaid and less educated, and confined to peripheral or itinerant functions of evangelism. On the other hand, the mission outstations also enjoyed a certain autonomy from the centres, allowing a high degree of freedom for non-white and non-male mission labourers to shape the message and the institutions of Christianity.

Anglican structures and leadership also evolved in an uneven relationship to state and society throughout the colonial period. The twentieth-century cementing of Christianity in Uganda's public life, as the nineteenth-century revolutions had done, both furthered the Ganda oligarchy's political designs and created new social configurations that challenged that political order. The CMS was instrumental in introducing the cotton export market, which helped detach peasant producers from older bonds of clientage and patronage with their *Bakungu* landlords, and created tensions with those in the South Asian community who functioned as commercial intermediaries in Uganda. From the 1910s through the 1950s several major waves of agrarian unrest and political protest brought Ganda Anglican elites into conflict variously with the peasantry (*Bakopi*), younger generations of mission-educated youth, and the *Bataka*, whose attempts to recover clan land claims lost in the Uganda Agreement often played out in Church politics and schisms. The Anglican breakaway *Bamalaki* movement, founded in 1914 by clan head Joswa Kate and his compatriot Malaki Mussajjakaawa, constituted both a religious protest against the educational and medical work of the CMS and the colonial government, and a political protest against the *Katikiro*. Likewise, some of the *Bataka* grievances that surfaced against the colonial state in the late 1940s circulated through Anglican mission channels.⁴

³ H. B. Hansen, 'European Ideas, Colonial Attitudes and African Realities: The Introduction of a Church Constitution in Uganda, 1898–1909', *International Journal of African Historical Studies*, 13 (1980): 240–80.

⁴ Arthur Clarke to Handley Hooper, 28 Aug. 1948, University of Birmingham Library (UBL), CMS G 3 A 7/1.

Broader trends of social realignment thus produced a concurrent ‘disengagement’, as John Taylor called it, between higher and lower rungs of the Church body, and between the mission institutions and Christian society at the grassroots. Uganda produced relatively fewer independent Churches and separatist movements than what developed in west, southern, and other parts of East Africa; this difference has been explained as a combination of the Anglican and Catholic monopolies over the mission enterprise, the internal integration of Ganda social structures, the close relationship of religious identity to personal and corporate identity and political formation, and the success of revivals within formal Church structures. However, the revivals within the Church, as well as in breakaway movements, reveal the discontent with and the opportunity presented by the political basis of Anglican mission, and the potential for fragmentation even within a relatively stable colonial society built on the confluence of Church and state. In the inter-war period, mission schools provided some of the missing fabric lost by the older social bonds, particularly as education gained increasing social capital and demand; however, the mission schools also became strongholds of Ganda, Ugandan, and pan-African nationalism and critiques of the traditionalist and colonial order between and after the two world wars. In 1953, popular demands for constitutional reform and democratization, and widespread opposition to the East African Federation reached a crisis with the call by the *Lukiko* (Parliament) for Buganda’s independence from the colonial and Ugandan state and the British deposition and deportation of Kabaka Mutesa II. Historians agree on the key role of the CMS and the Churches of England and Uganda in negotiating the settlement that resolved the deportation crisis in the short term, although the strength of the mission and Church’s position relative to the Ganda Protestant community and the colonial and post-colonial state is more debated.⁵

This late colonial crisis exposed some of the underlying tensions between the indigenous state and the Anglican Church, which on the surface had always promoted a close relationship and reciprocal authority. At the same time, such tensions also confirmed the historic role of Anglican mission in forging a Ganda cultural and national consciousness, preserving Bugandan political economy within the colonial state, keeping the *Bankungu* order intact despite its challenges, and giving voice to competing versions of tradition and legitimacy.

⁵ Kevin Ward, ‘The Church of Uganda and the Exile of Kabaka Muteesa II, 1953–55’, *Journal of Religion in Africa*, 28 (1998): 411–49; Caroline Howell, ‘Church and State in Crisis: The Deposition of the Kabaka of Buganda, 1932–1955’, in Brian Stanley (ed.), *Missions, Nationalism, and the End of Empire* (Grand Rapids, MI, 2003), pp. 194–211; Kevin Ward, ‘The Church of Uganda Amidst Conflict: The Interplay between Church & Politics in Uganda since 1962’, in Holger Bernt Hansen and Michael Twaddle (eds.), *Religion & Politics in East Africa: The Period since Independence* (London, 1995), pp. 72–105.

BUILDING INSTITUTIONS AND PRODUCING
KNOWLEDGE

Anglican indigenization took on a particular meaning in Uganda's configuration of state, society, and Church, but the spread of institutions that accompanied and enabled that process typified the Anglican mission project. The inter-war and post-war periods saw shifts in missions' relationship with the colonial state over time, which also reshaped relationships within mission communities, between missions and local communities, and between metropolitan, colonial, and international spheres of Anglicanism. Increasingly working as a conjoined enterprise, missions and colonial states cultivated new brands of education, welfare, and medical programming to fulfil the charge of trusteeship and improvement prescribed by Britain's 'dual mandate' in Africa. Fostering indigenous leadership, knowledge, and expertise in Anglican mission institutions thus involved continuous reassessments and definitions of African authenticity.

Indigenization, or 'adaptation' in contemporary parlance, became the hallmark of education reform, state welfare, and mission institution-building in the inter-war years, although this policy had characterized many Anglican mission objectives since well before the war. Although 'indigenization' is a contested concept for explaining the globalization of Christianity, it is still germane for historicizing the intent of Anglican missions in this period.⁶ The philanthropic dedication of the Phelps Stokes and Carnegie Foundations to reforming colonial education along technical lines, popularized by several massive studies of African education in the 1920s and 1930s, was instrumental in disseminating this model in mission and government circles. Using the principles of African American education reform developed by Booker T. Washington, these philanthropists exported 'the need for an education adapted to the conditions under which the majority of the African people live today'.⁷ Adaptive education reflected the broader trends of Indirect Rule that historians have characterized (and challenged) as the 'invented traditions' that both underpinned and constrained the colonial state.⁸ Projecting an ideal of industrial education as the basis of rural, village-based communities

⁶ Jeffrey Cox, 'Global Christianity in the Contact Zone', in Judith Becker (ed.), *European Missions in Contact Zones: Transformation Through Interaction in a (Post-)Colonial World* (Göttingen, 2015), pp. 27–44.

⁷ Thomas Jesse Jones, *Education in East Africa* (New York, 1925), p. 8.

⁸ John Iliffe, *A Modern History of Tanganyika* (Cambridge, 1979), ch. 10; Terence Ranger, 'The Invention of Tradition in Colonial Africa', in Eric Hobsbawm and Terence Ranger (eds.), *The Invention of Tradition* (Cambridge, 1983), pp. 21–62; Terence Ranger, 'The Invention of Tradition Revisited: The Case of Africa', in Terence Ranger and Olufemi Vaughan (eds.), *Legitimacy and the State in Twentieth-Century Africa* (London, 1993), pp. 62–111; Thomas Spear, 'Neo-Traditionalism and the Limits of Invention in British Colonial Africa', *Journal of African History*, 44 (2003): 3–27.

governed by chiefs and bounded by ethnic units, adaptive education aimed to create a two-tiered system of education, cultivating the masses as a productive rural peasantry in the village primary schools, and a small elite who would carry out the more skilled labour of improvement through teacher and technical training. The principal of Maseno Central School, Kisumu, an early model of adaptive education in Kenya, stressed that both tiers contributed equally to constructing and maintaining a rural African ideal: 'Healthy, happy and useful village life is the objective. Village industries, hygiene, improved dwellings, healthy games, general improvement all round in their daily life are to be inculcated. The teachers are not to be great scholars so much as sound all round practical men and women.'⁹ The language of instruction in the village schools, like the language of evangelism, required of missionaries, was always in the vernacular, exclusively at the primary level and sometimes in conjunction with English at the secondary level.

The CMS in East Africa was at the forefront of instituting adaptive education, as the government on the one hand continued to rely on mission schools, but on the other sought to standardize the education they provided. The Phelps Stokes reports resulted in new levels of government and mission cooperation in school administration, through the formation of advisory committees and the grants-in-aid system. The CMS saw a special role for missions in general, and Anglican missions in particular, in using this expansion of education to Africanize Christianity through professional and vocational means, building on the work already done through informal efforts. Archdeacon Walter Owen paid 'all honour to the African Catechists and Evangelists through whose efforts the Kingdom of God is being extended. They have organized the erection of some 225 little wattle and daub village schools or churches and they are not only Evangelists, but the pioneer Educationalists of their race. And both we and they are becoming more and more alive to the vital importance of education in the task of establishing the Kingdom of God in Africa.' But beyond this grassroots initiative, the Kenya Education Ordinance of 1924, which required government certification of all teachers and registration of all schools, 'allows full facility for stamping the instructions given with the full teaching of the Gospel' in the 220 schools that were run by the CMS.¹⁰ Teachers, clergy, and catechists were to be trained in central institutes, initially under European but eventually under African directors, and then fan out across the rural districts.

Mission health care followed similar principles of adaptation and was meant to complement educational and evangelistic initiatives. Central training institutions were established to train doctors, nurses, midwives, and health workers, who would then set up their own clinics or conduct home visits in

⁹ The Rev. J. Button, Maseno Central School Report, 1924, UBL, CMS G3/A5/0/48.

¹⁰ CMS Kavirondo Report, 1924, UBL, CMS G3/A5/0/48.

rural out-stations and village communities. The work of Dr Albert and Katherine Cook in Mengo Hospital and the Lady Coryndon Maternity Training School epitomized this approach, fuelled by colonial public health programmes to curb venereal disease and infant mortality rates in both urban and rural areas of Uganda. The Cooks' work was widely publicized in East Africa and Britain, in many different venues and mediums.¹¹ In East Africa, it is clear that Evangelical standards of caring for minds, souls, and bodies made use of the new colonial culture of improvement to entrench a radial landscape of institutional evangelism.

At the same time, Anglican missions were not entirely at liberty to preserve their schools as bastions of Anglicanism. The increasing role of colonial governments in the administration and funding of education, which had previously been left to missions as free agents, and the inability of individual mission societies to meet rising African demands for education through their own limited resources, meant that Anglicans' increasing cooperation with other bodies required certain accommodation to state and ecumenical requirements. This trend was particularly evident in the schools founded during the 1920s at the secondary level and above. Kenya's first secondary school, the prestigious Alliance High School in Kikuyu district, was a joint enterprise of the CMS, the Church of Scotland, the International Missionary Council, and the government of Kenya. In the Gold Coast, Achimota College was founded under the tripartite initiative of former CMS Uganda missionary the Revd A. G. Fraser, Governor Guggisberg, and the Methodist-educated ecumenist and pan-Africanist J. E. K. Aggrey, in partnership with local elites.

In Uganda, Makerere College began as a government technical institute but grew into a more comprehensive system of higher education under the pressure of Ganda elites; the select pupils prepared in CMS mission schools experienced no small disjuncture between the adaptive curricula of their early years and the more expansive education at 'Mak'. Fourah Bay College in Sierra Leone, a much older institution with a long tradition of educating West Africa's political, intellectual, and Church leaders, had to struggle to maintain its Anglican heritage after progressive stages of absorbing Wesleyan and government administration. These schools incorporated 'conscience clauses' that enabled accommodation of any practising Christian students, and in some cases non-Christians, and they constituted uneasy amalgams of the vocational principles of adaptive education and the scholastic tradition of the British education system. Achimota, for example, provided teacher training and agricultural courses as well as maths, natural science, English literature, and African history and geography, all formulated within a framework of an elite British public school, with houses named Aggrey, Livingstone, Lugard,

¹¹ *Mengo Hospital* (film, CMS, Great Britain, 1930).

Guggisberg, and Cadbury. Achimota trained the children of rural chiefs as well as those of the urban professional classes of coastal Atlantic society, a confluence which made it difficult to encompass the varieties of Christianity and traditionalism in its curriculum.

Anglican edifices of learning, therefore, both contributed to and had to accommodate the changing paradigms of 'authenticity' in inter-war Africa, and Anglican mission became increasingly integrated into larger structures of colonial welfare and development, and local and international ecumenism. The shifting realities and demands of colonial bureaucracies and economies also meant that Anglicans, like other missions, increasingly had to address urban industrial populations, and professionalize a wider range of personnel to expand the mission Church and its institutions. In Northern Rhodesia, for example, the UMCA took part in the United Missions in the Copperbelt to minister to and provide education for migrant workers and their families—a project that both blurred and redefined the parameters of traditional and Christian marriage practices and social organization.¹² Yet, partly as a reaction to these unwelcome trends in modernization and 'detrribalization' many missionaries held fast to idylls of an African rural past, and engaged in their own brands of neo-traditionalism in the fields of history, ethnography, and folk culture. John Roscoe and Leonard Beecher produced amateur but influential transcriptions of Ganda and Kikuyu oral tradition.¹³ Georgina Gollock, an administrator and editor for the CMS and the International Missionary Council, who had reconceived missionary vocation and training as a simultaneously spiritual and modern endeavour, used her missionary contacts to research oral histories and publish hagiographies of prominent African men and women whom she felt epitomized the new Africa.¹⁴ Gollock had become interested in African education through the Phelps Stokes investigations, and was a close friend of James Aggrey, with whom she shared a commitment to propagating a kind of Christian pan-Africanism. Convinced that education should comprise a bottom-up grassroots approach rather than a top-down European one, she worked to promote meaningful African academic subjects for African students beyond the limits of technical education.

Although these efforts did their part in mythologizing a pre-colonial African past that served a fictive and functional purpose in codifying Indirect Rule, Anglican missionaries and associates also contributed to the growing legitimacy of African Studies as an academic discipline. Throughout the twentieth century, many Anglican missionaries or missionary children went on to

¹² Jane L. Parpart, "'Where Is Your Mother?': Gender, Urban Marriage, and Colonial Discourse on the Zambian Copperbelt, 1924–1945", *International Journal of African Historical Studies*, 27 (1994): 241–71.

¹³ John Roscoe, *The Baganda: An Account of their Native Customs and Beliefs* (London, 1911); Leonard J. Beecher, 'Stories of the Kikuyu', *Africa*, 11 (1938): 80–7.

¹⁴ G. A. Gollock, *Daughters of Africa* (London, 1932), and *Sons of Africa* (London, 1938).

practise African history or anthropology, including Hannah Stanton, Jocelyn Murray, Louise Pirouet, Louis Leakey, and John Taylor. In the inter-war period, the evolving relationship of colonial science, philanthropy, anthropology, and missionary knowledge was enshrined particularly in the International African Institute in London.¹⁵ Its journal, *Africa*, exposed the unevenness of this cooperation by offering a venue for these constituencies to take one another to task. Upon reading a critical assessment of mission Christianity as ‘denationalizing’ Africans, the Sierra Leonean émigré Bishop Isaac Oluwole of Lagos responded that ‘it is too late for the day to speak of withholding Christianity from Africa. The International Institute of African Languages and Cultures . . . is the outcome of missionary initiative, and it is highly spoken of by men whom we trust and respect. One is therefore anxious that its good object is strictly kept in view by the learned members, and that they pursue their researches in a way that will further the interests of the peoples whose progress is at stake.’¹⁶ Yet while many African Anglicans may have agreed on the positive role of missionary knowledge in constructing an ‘Africa for Africans’, others found mission education and missionary constructions of ethnicity and nationhood destructive to African identities, expression, and self-worth. Early leaders of the African literary intelligentsia included sons of Anglican missions like Chinua Achebe and Wole Soyinka, whose memories of childhoods spent in the mission schools and clergy families of colonial Nigeria fuelled post-colonial projects of recovering the subaltern voices whom Christianity (missionary and indigenous) had silenced and denigrated.¹⁷

Anglican mission thus played a complicated but important role in the transnational development of African education reform, Western academic networks, and nationalist intellectual culture. The inter-war ‘triumph of bricks and mortar’,¹⁸ as Jeffrey Cox has called it, also had far-reaching effects in the realm of knowledge production, in projects of biblical translation, history, ethnography, and ethnogenesis that transpired in and emerged from Anglican mission communities. Equally important to this process were the shifting theological, ritual, ecclesiastical, and social boundaries that developed in creative dialogue between missionaries and Africans in the same period.

¹⁵ Patrick Harries and David Maxwell (eds.), *The Spiritual in the Secular: Missionaries and Knowledge About Africa* (Grand Rapids, MI, 2012); Patrick Harries, ‘Anthropology’, in Norman Etherington (ed.), *Missions and Empire* (Oxford, 2005), pp. 238–60.

¹⁶ Address to the Fourth Synod of the diocese of Lagos, September 1929, in Klaus Koschorke, Frieder Ludwig, and Mariano Delgado (eds.), *A History of Christianity in Asia, Africa, and Latin America, 1450–1990: A Documentary Sourcebook* (Grand Rapids, MI, 2007), p. 233.

¹⁷ J. D. Y. Peel, ‘Christianity and the Logic of Nationalist Assertion in Wole Soyinka’s *Ìsarà*’, in David Maxwell with Ingrid Lawrie (eds.), *Christianity and the African Imagination: Essays in Honour of Adrian Hastings* (Leiden, 2002), pp. 127–55.

¹⁸ Jeffrey Cox, *The British Missionary Enterprise since 1700* (New York, 2008), ch. 10.

CONSTRUCTING ANGLICAN IDENTITIES
IN FAITH AND PRACTICE

The mission lexicon of adaptation both defied and upheld Indirect Rule, through a commitment to the spread of Christianity that insisted on its authentic African character. Critics and nationalists, then and since, criticized this policy for its condescension and lack of responsiveness to the aspirations of African youth who desired education in English rather than vernacular languages, a more literary than technical mode of education, and advancement through the urban and professional channels of colonial and cosmopolitan society rather than through the 'traditional' channels controlled by chiefs and rural elites. Furthermore, the logic of adaptation often belied and shrouded the profound cultural transformation rendered by the mission establishment. Yet the premise of indigeneity also created important spaces for missionaries, catechists, and adherents to articulate and contest Anglicanism as a necessarily African cosmology, spirituality, and ritual practice.

Marriage and the social mores governing sexual codes of conduct presented particularly acute sites of negotiation. All missionary societies constantly wrestled with whether and how to construct boundaries of inclusion and exclusion in the Christian community based on marriage practices (particularly polygamy and divorce). But it was the Mothers' Union (MU), with its three objects of cultivating a shared responsibility for marriage, motherhood, and prayer, that found itself on the front lines of this struggle, which was waged not only within mission locales but also between London and the periphery. In missionary dioceses such as Uganda, Madagascar, and St John's South Africa, the MU's teaching on the Christian family presumed a monogamous nuclear family structure, which missionaries' personal encounters with African women belied on a daily basis. From 1913 the central MU adopted a policy to make membership contingent upon communicant status for non-white women, but different dioceses used different standards for determining that status, some of which did not include monogamy—discrepancies which did not escape the notice of African women who resented being subjected to a double standard of morality. Such fault-lines of indigenization emerged in full force when the MU began hosting its decennial world-wide conference in London beginning in 1930, an occasion for missionary and indigenous leaders of the MU to learn just how little conformity characterized the Anglican mission field.¹⁹

By contrast, the *manyano* movement that developed in Southern and Central Africa formed a point of consensus between the indigenous and missionary MU for policing morality, but sparked conflict around the

¹⁹ Cordelia Moyses, *A History of the Mothers' Union: Women, Anglicanism and Globalisation, 1876–2008* (Woodbridge, 2009); Elizabeth Prevost, *The Communion of Women: Missions and Gender in Colonial Africa and the British Metropole* (Oxford, 2010).

normative gender functions of religious expression and authority. *Manyano* 'Women's Meetings' were characterized by extemporaneous, corporate, and vocal prayer (rather than the individual and doctrinal prayer traditions of the mission Church) and marked by their distinctive uniforms—reflective of a desire not to be either 'excluded' from or co-opted by Church bodies. In the diocese of St John's (now Mthatha) in the Eastern Cape, *manyano* 'preaching and praying of a rather unspiritual sort' became such a defining feature of MU meetings that the 1929 Synod took steps to dissolve the organization across the entire diocese. The bishop responded by reforming rather than abolishing the MU, first by appointing a sister at St Cuthbert's to manage the situation, and then by forming a formal MU council and constitution to whose authority the standards of individual meetings would be subject—thus reinstating the 'real purpose of the MU' as a vehicle for instructing and supporting women in marriage, homecraft, and childcare.²⁰

This response by diocesan bodies, and the attempt to subjugate potentially devious standards of spirituality and preaching, shows the *manyano*'s potential to subvert conventional ecclesiastical and gender authority. At the same time, *manyano* elsewhere in southern Africa meshed effectively with more orthodox feminized dimensions of Anglican mission work. In St Faith Mission, Rusape, Manicaland, Rhodesia, a long-standing 'Gathering of Women' precipitated and facilitated the establishment of a Mothers' Union by UMCA missionaries, who appropriated these *Gungano* and made their membership more restrictive by virtue of requiring marriage by 'Christian rite' as the criterion for membership. An anonymous devotional journal and roll-book by an MU missionary in 1933 gives some insight into how Anglo-Catholic spirituality was manifested in women's meetings which functioned simultaneously as prayer gatherings and instructional forums, always following a common format of hymns, readings, prayers and meditations, dismissal, and commission. Using exercises derived from mystic traditions, the meditations would take the day's text and apply it to women's lives, presenting the stories in such a way as to allow women to identify with scriptural narratives in affective and personal ways. The meditation centred on imagining being in the presence of biblical figures as events took place, assuming the identity of these figures while mentally enacting the narrative, and emulating women such as the Virgin Mary, Mary Magdalene, and Susanna as 'the teachers of teachers, priests, as well as kings—mothers. You have great work before you. Yes, so was S. Mary the Mother of God a teacher to O.B.L. [Our Blessed Lord]!' Other

²⁰ Sheila Maspero, 'Mothers' Union: The Early Years of the MU for Christian Family Life in the Church of the Province of Southern Africa', Cape Town, 1997, kindness of Cordelia Moyses; Deborah Gaitskell, 'Devout Domesticity? A Century of African Women's Christianity in South Africa', in Cherry Walker (ed.), *Women and Gender in Southern Africa to 1945* (Cape Town, 1990), pp. 251–72.

scriptural meditations focused on similarly missionary roles for Shona women, who were intended to assume responsibility for evangelizing not only their children but also their husbands.²¹ Both British and African women's leadership in the Anglican missionary enterprise developed on domestic and familial sites through explicitly spiritual mediums.

In this context, the UMCA's contemplative and ritual bent helped MU missionaries to create a vehicle for feminizing Scripture. Its focus on cultivating Christian marriage, family, and maturity also bred attempts by the MU to manage the sexual education and initiation practices encompassed by indigenous 'tribal rites', 'instructions', and 'customs' in mothers' meetings across southern and Central Africa, with varying degrees of commitment and success.²² Nor were these designs limited to women. In the diocese of Masasi in southern Tanganyika, the Universities' Mission developed a famously fruitful attempt to incorporate African initiation ceremonies into Anglican liturgy by fashioning the *Jando* rite: a hybridized form of the local coming-of-age initiation ceremony for male youth that was embedded in Anglican worship services. Bishop Vincent Lucas, known for his advocacy of African education and Church leadership, pioneered the *Jando* out of a concern that missionaries' tendency to denigrate the coming-of-age rituals practised in local communities would eradicate their educational value and corporate fabric and create an artificial and socially dysfunctional individualism among a new generation of youth.²³ Yet the resulting popularity of the *Jando* in the local community as a deeply meaningful institution, as Terence Ranger has emphasized, cannot be attributed to Lucas's vision alone, but also to the points of consensus it established with the political and religious aspirations of African elites and Christians within a longer history of struggles for control over initiation practices. As such, 'the *Jando* came to be a key point of *interaction* between Christian and "traditional" ideas, between modern and traditional roles, rather than merely an experiment in adaptation'.²⁴ Similarly, in Manika district, Rhodesia (including St Faith's), Ranger has shown how the Anglo-Catholic sensibilities of early missionaries like Lloyd who venerated antiquity and agrarian folk culture mingled with Shona cosmology and prophesy (epitomized particularly by Francis Nyabadza) to Anglicanize burial and pilgrimage sites and create a popular Anglicanism

²¹ 'Thoughts' recorded on exercise book, Nov. 1933, Lambeth Palace Library, MU/MSS/001/10.

²² *The Mothers Union with UMCA in Africa* (London, 1956); Moyses, *History of the Mothers' Union*, pp. 151–2.

²³ W. Vincent Lucas, 'The Educational Value of Initiatory Rites', *International Review of Missions*, 16 (1927): 192–8.

²⁴ T. O. Ranger, 'Missionary Adaptation of African Religious Institutions: The Masasi Case', in T. O. Ranger and I. M. Kimambo (eds.), *The Historical Study of African Religion* (Berkeley, CA, 1972), pp. 221–51 (p. 247).

that survived the backlashes by the more rigid ecclesiastical regime of their successors.²⁵

This multi-sided approach of selective appropriation and creative transformation generated much scepticism in the missionary and anthropological communities.²⁶ But it also occasioned much admiration and emulation, and was often cited as a model for adaptive education as well as missiology. The CMS in Kenya took note of the *Jando* precedent and used it to inform its response to the clitoridectomy controversy of 1929–31, which centred on mission schools and hospitals as sites of conflict and caused a huge rift within and between mission communities and Kikuyu political culture. Navigating a tightrope between the polarizing demands of opponents and proponents of the *irua* ceremony, the CMS constructed an accommodationist policy that insulated Anglicans from the large-scale defection to independent Churches experienced by the Church of Scotland Mission (CSM) and the Africa Inland Mission (AIM) and even made Anglicans the recipients of some of these dissidents. The CSM and AIM took a more hardline approach of denying baptism and membership to those who did not denounce the practice or pass the loyalty test—a policy which some Anglican elders would have preferred. But with the exception of Kigari mission, which adopted an uncompromising position under the leadership of John Comely (and suffered a similar fate as non-CMS missions), CMS missions generally managed to steer a middle ground, with individual missions adopting various points on the spectrum ranging from condemning but not outright prohibiting the practice, to co-opting it and regulating it in mission hospitals and initiation schools, to allowing *irua* to continue its traditional form and recognizing an intrinsic compatibility between Kikuyu and Christian ritual observation.²⁷ In the concomitant growth of East African political associations, the CMS also committed not to deny Church membership on any explicit ‘political’ grounds, although some individual missionaries broke rank on this issue.²⁸

Thus, marriage practices, spiritual expression, and initiation rites presented ongoing points of negotiation between missionaries and adherents, between the Anglican centre and periphery, and between local mission communities, with the power to cleave old bonds of association and forge new ones.

²⁵ Terence Ranger, ‘Taking Hold of the Land: Holy Places and Pilgrimages in Twentieth-Century Zimbabwe’, *Past & Present*, 117 (1987): 158–94; Terence Ranger, ‘Taking on the Missionary’s Task: African Spirituality and the Mission Churches in the 1930s’, in Maxwell and Lawrie (eds.), *Christianity and the African Imagination*, pp. 93–126.

²⁶ T. Cullen Young, ‘How Far Can African Ceremonial be Incorporated in the Christian System?’, *Africa*, 8 (1935): 210–17.

²⁷ Jocelyn Murray and Robert Strayer, ‘The CMS and Female Circumcision’, in Robert Strayer, *The Making of Mission Communities in East Africa: Anglicans and Africans in Colonial Kenya, 1875–1935* (London, 1978), pp. 136–55.

²⁸ Bishop of Mombasa to Handley Hooper, 6 Feb. 1930, UBL, CMS G3/A5/0/12.

Dissenting and apostate movements often centred on these very hallmarks of Anglican mission, but were always contextualized within local realities of contested resources, inequality, and social and political aspirations. Independent Churches, spirit movements, and charismatic revivals often had their roots in Anglican mission, and/or tried to deploy and emulate its resources, importing certain elements of Anglican theology, spirituality, and revivalist traditions like Keswick into the life of both complementary and breakaway communities. Examples of this trend can be seen in Alfayo Odongo Mango's Roho movement, the Gakarara Church, and the Joremo & Johera Churches in Kenya; Jackson Ogunbiyi's Ogoni movement and the Aladura Churches in western Nigeria; the Mchape witch-finding movement and the Shona prophetic Churches in Central Africa; and most of all in the *Balokole* (East African Revival) and its many strains and offshoots.²⁹ Reuben Spartas claimed an ancient mantle for his African Greek Orthodox Church as a reaction against the Evangelical doctrines of the CMS and a desire to return to 'an older and truer church': 'My breaking with the Anglican Church was not inconsistent with my desire for the reunion of the Christian Church . . . I could not lead the whole of Anglicanism into the Orthodox faith, but I could myself leave Anglicanism and join Orthodoxy. Once inside Orthodoxy, and a leader of an Orthodox Church, I could with propriety draw the attention of the whole of Anglicanism to the need for reunion.'³⁰ In South Africa, the Order of Ethiopia provided a venue for an indigenous Anglican movement of revival and mission to gain recognition within the Anglican Communion.³¹

The independent Churches have rightly been treated as bastions of protest in colonial and post-colonial Africa. However, the older Churches, including the Anglican mission Church, also contained their own seeds of dissent that shaped attempts to redefine the racialized basis of state and society. In the era of African nationalism and freedom struggles between and after the world wars, British missionaries and African Anglicans variously became the agents and subjects of nationalist expression.

²⁹ F. B. Welbourn, *East African Rebels* (London, 1961); Cynthia Hoehler-Fadden, *Women of Fire and Spirit: History, Faith, and Gender in Roho Religion in Western Kenya* (New York, 1996); David Sandgren, *Christianity and the Kikuyu: Religious Divisions and Social Conflict* (New York, 1989); J. D. Y. Peel, 'The Aladura Movement in Western Nigeria', *Tarikh*, 3 (1969): 48–55; T. O. Ranger, 'Medical Science and Pentecost: The Dilemma of Anglicanism in Africa', in W. J. Shiels (ed.), *The Church and Healing* (Oxford, 1982), pp. 333–65; Kevin Ward and Emma Wild-Wood (eds.), *The East African Revival: History and Legacies* (Farnham, 2012); Derek Peterson, *Ethnic Patriotism and the East African Revival: A History of Dissent c.1935–72* (Cambridge, 2014).

³⁰ Welbourn, *East African Rebels*, p. 84.

³¹ Mandy Goedhals, '"Ethiopia shall soon stretch out her hands to God": The Order of Ethiopia and the Church of the Province of Southern Africa, 1899–1999', in Daniel O'Connor and others, *Three Centuries of Mission: The United Society for the Propagation of the Gospel, 1701–2000* (London, 2000), pp. 382–94.

ANGLICAN POLITICS OF PROTEST

Early nationalist leaders and freedom fighters had been educated in mission schools, and their mission contacts often helped facilitate further education abroad. Although Anglicans could not, perhaps, claim as many of these pedigrees as Methodist or Catholic missions, Anglican mission communities formed a key site for building wider circuits of anti-colonial dissent and political mobilization, through social networks, ideological consciousness-raising, and cultural brokering around religious identities. Historians have generally agreed that missions both gave birth to nationalism and became its key target, particularly by virtue of their divergent preaching and practice of Christianity. While missions may have provided nationalists with the aspirations, skills, and social and intellectual capital to protest against colonialism, many African politicians came increasingly to detach Christianity from missions and turned to other nodes of association and collective action. As David Maxwell has put it, 'missions had been central to the creation of nationalist elites but their legacy was ambivalent'.³²

On the eve of independence, certainly many local Anglican mission communities had not created either the structures or the mentality necessary for devolution.³³ Yet some scholarship has begun to question the universal applicability of that premise, by showing the relevance of missions not just as the initial training grounds or the ideological foils of nationalism, but as continuously germane ideological models and social partnerships for forging collective unity. In the Anglican women's circuits of education and associational life that developed in Tanganyika and Zanzibar, African women constructed their own brand of supra-ethnic identities that both preceded and precipitated the more formal political articulation of nationalism and pan-Africanism by their husbands and sons.³⁴ Nationalists, furthermore, like numerous African Christians, did not see any inherent conflict between practising elements of Christianity and traditional religions simultaneously—a position defended by Bishop Samuel Crowther's grandson Herbert Macaulay.³⁵

The surge of African political activity in the wake of the Great War was initially hailed by Anglican missionaries as positive evidence of the influence of Christianity in African nation-building and 'race consciousness'; accordingly, missionaries staked a claim for mission Christianity in the formation of

³² David Maxwell, 'Decolonization', in Etherington (ed.), *Missions and Empire*, pp. 285–306 (p. 297).

³³ T. O. Beidelman, *Colonial Evangelism: A Socio-Historical Study of an East African Mission at the Grassroots* (Bloomington, IN, 1982).

³⁴ Andreana Prichard, 'African Christian Women and the Emergence of Nationalist Subjectivities in Tanzania, 1860–1960s', PhD thesis, Northwestern University, 2011.

³⁵ Herbert Macaulay, 'Religion and Native Customs', *Lagos Daily News*, 18 Jan. 1932, in Koschorke et al. (eds.), *History of Christianity*, p. 239.

early African pressure groups like the Young Baganda Association, Kikuyu Association, Young Kavirondo Association, and the National Congress of British West Africa.³⁶ Yet these groups exposed the limits of mission control as they mobilized and appropriated mission resources. The Kikuyu Association, formed in 1919 to protest against taxation, land alienation, and other manifestations of settler capitalism, emerged from the collaborative efforts of CMS missionaries and prominent Anglican chiefs like Koinange Mbiu and Josiah Njonjo. Its rural and traditionalist base clashed with the urban base and militant tactics of Harry Thuku's breakaway East African Association (EAA), but Thuku's adherents were no less a product of mission society in their turn against it. Educated largely in CMS schools and manifesting the goals of an emerging cosmopolitan Anglophone intelligentsia, Thuku's followers problematized Indirect Rule and adaptive ideology and epitomized the restless discontent with the neo-traditionalist order that developed in political associations across inter-war British Africa. Although the EAA sparked extensive anxiety within the CMS and ensured a reactive deference to the chiefs, Handley Hooper shared a grudging mutual respect with Thuku and engaged in a productive correspondence with him and his successors in the Kikuyu Central Association (KCA), notably Gideon Mugo and Kenyatta. Indeed, the Kahuhia CMS mission formed a major base of KCA support, incorporating its political activity into mission life when most other CMS missions had spurned the organization. As Strayer has detailed, 'The absorption of the politics of assertion into the mission community at Kahuhia was clearly facilitated by the reputation of its resident missionaries for a willingness actively to advocate African points of view even at the risk of open disagreement with the colonial government.'³⁷

In the diocese of Kavirondo, western Kenya, Archdeacon Walter Owen launched a relentless crusade against arbitrary taxation, forced labour, 'tribal' reserves, the *kipande* pass-law system, and other aspects of land reform and labour control.³⁸ His lobbying led to frequent spars with the government as well as with fellow CMS missionaries, who preferred to work with rather than against the state to ameliorate the abuses of colonialism. Indeed, other missionaries found Owen's political organizing and consciousness-raising through the Kavirondo Taxpayers Welfare Association, which by 1927 had come under more radical young African leadership, disruptive to the mission project and its necessary alliance with chiefs. Yet Owen also championed African empowerment through a patronizing lens of victimization, representing Luo

³⁶ Albert B. Lloyd, *Dayspring in Uganda* (London, 1921).

³⁷ Strayer, *Making of Mission Communities*, p. 131; see also John Casson, '“To Plant a Garden City in the Slums of Paganism”: Handley Hooper, the Kikuyu and the Future of Africa', *Religion in Africa*, 28 (1998): 387–410.

³⁸ Leon P. Spencer, 'Christianity and Colonial Protest: Perceptions of W. E. Owen, Archdeacon of Kavirondo', *Journal of Religion in Africa*, 13 (1982): 42–60.

subjects as 'ignorant', 'primitive', passive recipients of an arbitrary legal system and exploitative taxation, using liberal discourse to protest against 'the injustices... which make me blush for the callousness of those in which hands are entrusted powers over the liberties of defenceless Natives'.³⁹ In Central Africa, Arthur Shearly Cripps (SPG) of Rhodesia and Bishop Alston May (UMCA) of Northern Rhodesia earned similar reputations for anti-colonialism and advocacy of African politics in settler areas, and were likewise products of their times and world-views in assuming trusteeship over African dependants. These examples illustrate the simultaneously paternalist and radical capacity for white dissent that emerged from inter-war Anglican mission communities.⁴⁰

After the war, missions, like all state and non-government development agencies, were forced to contend with the failure of Indirect Rule as urbanization and labour organization intensified. Anglicans increasingly worked not to stem this tide but to manage it through Christian vehicles of learning and welfare. The labour disturbances, nationalism, and colonial development that characterized the 'second colonial occupation' after the war continued to reshape missionary thinking and its relationship to the colonial state. The same kind of constructive ambiguity that characterized the Anglican missionary response to nationalist politicization between the wars resurfaced a generation later in Kenya. Anglican responses to Mau Mau were inconsistent, with official statements denouncing the forest fighters and defending Kikuyu Christians, but also numerous individual reflections and actions condemning the brutality of British military reprisals and the rehabilitation system. Further, the metropolitan and colonial, Church and mission zones of Anglican influence did not agree on the implications of Mau Mau for Christian evangelism and coalition-building; this lack of consensus hampered Anglican relations with the state and, thus, the effectiveness of their response to the crisis.⁴¹ Historians have understandably wrestled with these ambiguities and their implications for Anglican responses to white settler politics and colonial liberation struggles in East and Central Africa, tracing the fraught relationship between the post-colonial Church and state to the historic ambivalence of missions to settler colonialism.⁴² However, what does seem clear is that Mau

³⁹ Owen to Kisumu Senior Commissioner, 28 June 1927, UBL, CMS G3/A5/O.

⁴⁰ Murray Steele, 'Arthur Shearly Cripps', in O'Connor and others, *Three Centuries of Mission*, pp. 371–81; John Weller, 'The Influence on National Affairs of Alston May, Bishop of Northern Rhodesia, 1914–40', in T. O. Ranger and John Weller (eds.), *Themes in the Christian History of Central Africa* (Berkeley, CA, 1975), pp. 195–211.

⁴¹ John Stuart, *British Missionaries and the End of Empire: East, Central, and Southern Africa, 1939–1964* (Grand Rapids, MI, 2011), ch. 5.

⁴² John Lonsdale, 'Mission Christianity and Settler Colonialism in Eastern Africa', in Holger Bernt Hansen and Michael Twaddle (eds.), *Christian Missionaries and the State in the Third World* (Oxford, 2002), pp. 194–211.

Mau occasioned a reconsideration of the basis of Anglican mission in Kenya and creative attempts to revitalize its methods.

Even official denouncements of Mau Mau acknowledged the responsibility borne by European missions, settlers, and the state for the grievances that fuelled the insurgency, pointing to the mission Church's culpability in perpetuating larger structures of inequality that had alienated and disempowered a generation of 'disgruntled youth'.⁴³ To recompense these shortcomings (and halt the spread of Mau Mau), Anglican missionary bodies opened their own counter-insurgency campaign on five fronts. In the Kikuyu reserves, the primary objectives were bolstering evangelism, rural development schemes in agriculture and husbandry, literacy programmes, and education. In Nairobi, the primary task was providing welfare services, with plans for city missions modelled on the urban settlements of the east end of London. In the 'White Highlands' of Central Province and the Rift Valley, the goal was to create a new parish structure that would facilitate African clergy and catechists' leadership and inter-mission cooperation. Finally, the mission Church tried to shape the process of confession and rehabilitation. The confessional premise that legitimized the so-called 'Pipeline' of detention and rehabilitation camps was initially conceptualized and spearheaded by Kikuyu clergy, and appropriated by the state as the driving force behind the classification, relocation, and repatriation of political prisoners. The CMS installed missionaries like Stanley Booth-Clibborn and Howard Church in the detention and rehabilitation camps to provide chaplaincy services, and ensure that the confessional process was carried out consistently with Christian principles (the failure of which was embodied in Church's dismissal).⁴⁴ Across all of these areas, missions targeted homes and families with new intensity, as women were attributed with the potential to either intensify or curb Mau Mau.

The CMS also turned the confessional premise on itself, seeking 'to assess our responsibility for past failures' and to make 'church leaders and missionaries, in calling to repentance and confession Christian Africans who have succumbed to Mau Mau...keenly aware of their own sin and need of renewal'.⁴⁵ Missionaries subscribed to the wider social scientific diagnoses of Mau Mau as a social rupture and psychological trauma, a product of disaffected Kikuyus' failed integration into agrarian or urban society and their consequent suspension between 'tribal' and 'modern' worlds.⁴⁶ Missionaries

⁴³ Bishop Leonard Beecher, 'The Church's response to the challenges of Mau Mau' (confidential circular), 6 Feb. 1953, Lambeth Palace Library (LPL), MU/OS/5/13/19.

⁴⁴ Caroline Elkins, *Imperial Reckoning: The Untold Story of Britain's Gulag in Kenya* (New York, 2005), p. 296.

⁴⁵ CMS Special Bulletin, 'Mau Mau', Henry Martyn Library, Cambridge (HML), Leech Papers (LEE) 5/1&2; L. S. B. Leakey, *Mau Mau and the Kikuyu* (London, 1953) and *Defeating Mau Mau* (London, 1954).

⁴⁶ CMS Special Bulletin, 'Mau Mau', HML, LEE 5/1&2.

and colonial administrators were each apt to blame one another for this dislocation: if the colonial state and settler capitalism had produced land grievances, missionaries had squelched indigenous forms of cultural expression, creating an ‘emotional vacuum’ that required seeking out ‘other outlets’ of esoteric knowledge and oath-taking.⁴⁷ But missionary testimonials also admitted that, ‘Whether we like it or not, throughout Asia and Africa the Christian faith and the Christian Church are emotionally linked with European domination’, and that ‘mission work as a whole is deeply suspect by African political leaders at present’.⁴⁸ Such conflation of mission work and colonialism made the CMS place its ultimate faith for resolving the emergency not in the state’s rehabilitation policy but in the grassroots East African Revival—a position reinforced, or perhaps inspired, by the complex intellectual appropriation of revivalism by inmates *within* the detention camps.⁴⁹ As one bulletin put it, ‘Only an African Church, firmly rooted in . . . the life of the people, will survive the troublous times which still lie ahead.’⁵⁰ These efforts were initiated by the CMS, the Kikuyu Native Church, and the diocese of Mombasa, but also tried to synchronize the work of other Anglican bodies like the Church Army, the Society for Promoting Christian Knowledge (SPCK), and the MU—all carried out under the cooperative ecumenical auspices of the Christian Council of Kenya (an acknowledgement of the limited resources of the CMS to respond effectively to the crisis). In the end, Mau Mau illustrated to Anglicans the need for a new organizing principle to structure the transition from mission to African Church.

Such initiatives show the creative responses to reinventing and reconceiving what constituted the ‘mission field’ in the era of development and decolonization in East Africa. Anglicans represented Evangelicals more broadly in approaching welfare and development as an occasion for rethinking the relationship of mission strategy with the colonial state. The CMS deployed incarnational theology to reconcile the scientific expertise of development with the spiritual service of mission work and maintain its relevance in the midst of nationalist challenges to missionary legitimacy.⁵¹ Such efforts were rather fleeting and ultimately unsuccessful in asserting missionary control over the direction of the developmentalist state, but the primacy of ecumenism and the blurring of mission, relief work, and development proved more enduring legacies.

South Africa increasingly seemed to follow the opposite trajectory from the rest of sub-Saharan Africa’s move towards devolution and decolonization, and

⁴⁷ Colonial Secretary (Oliver Lyttelton) to Canon Bewes, (?) 1954, HML, LEE 5/4.

⁴⁸ CMS Home Bulletin, Overseas Supplement, Oct. 1952, HML, LEE 5/3.

⁴⁹ Peterson, *Ethnic Patriotism*, ch. 10. ⁵⁰ CMS Home Bulletin, Oct. 1952.

⁵¹ Rebecca C. Hughes, “Science in the Hands of Love”: British Evangelical Missionaries and Colonial Development in Africa, 1940–1960’, *Journal of Imperial and Commonwealth History*, 41 (2013): 823–42.

missionaries there had to contend with a different history of settler society and colonialism. But from the 1910s to the 1950s the segregation and early apartheid state proved an unavoidable context for wrestling with race in the development of Anglican mission and global Anglicanism. Missions were responsible for the vast majority of education in South Africa until the Bantu Education Act (1953) nationalized education along 'tribal' lines administered by the Department of Native Affairs, forcing all but a very few mission schools to close. Yet notwithstanding the brief moment of opportunity during the Second World War when Canons Broomfield and Grace spearheaded a missionary stance against the 'colour bar' in Africa, the reluctant accommodation of Lambeth, the SPG, and the Church of South Africa to South African state policy contrasted sharply with the activist work of many individual clergy and laity.⁵² Critiques of segregation and apartheid often had an Anglican mission base, particularly in the urban Anglo-Catholic missions of the Community of the Resurrection. Desmond Tutu was himself the product of these connections as a student at Harry Madibane's School and St Peter's Theological College. The missionary activism of Dorothy Maud, Trevor Huddleston, Hannah Stanton, Michael Scott, and Graham Chadwick show how Anglican sites of protest ranged from the localized context of Sophiatown to the international arena of the United Nations. Nor was Anglican dissent confined to white liberals, as shown by the work of James Calata, who combined ANC politics with the fashioning of an indigenous Anglican identity (the liturgical music he composed for the Defiance Campaign being just one example).⁵³

Looking back at the dissenting voices and politics of Anglican missionaries over the course of the evolution of African nationalism shows that their theological predispositions may have given them a better means of articulating the abuses of power than of effecting change. In Ukaguru, Tanganyika, Evangelical theology and its insistence on separating the spiritual fruits of conversion from material concerns or expression hampered both CMS institution-building and the successful fostering of an African Church.⁵⁴ In Central Africa, by comparison, Andrew Porter has argued that Anglo-Catholics were among the Anglican missionaries worst equipped to deal with the challenges of modernity, because of their romanticization of apostolic and African authenticity.⁵⁵ Perhaps churchmanship proved a more adept lens for challenging colonialism

⁵² Stuart, *British Missionaries*, chs. 1 and 2; Michael E. Worsnip, *Between the Two Fires: The Anglican Church and Apartheid, 1948–57* (Pietermaritzburg, 1991).

⁵³ Mandy Goedhals, 'African Nationalism and Indigenous Christianity: A Study in the Life of James Calata (1895–1983)', *Journal of Religion in Africa*, 33 (2003): 63–82.

⁵⁴ Beidelman, *Colonial Evangelism*.

⁵⁵ Andrew Porter, 'The Universities' Mission to Central Africa: Anglo-Catholicism and the Twentieth-Century Colonial Encounter', in Stanley (ed.), *Missions, Nationalism, and the End of Empire*, pp. 79–108.

than ending it. In the post-colonial world, Anglicanism required new formulations of universalism to accommodate the shifting centres of gravity.

FROM THE DEVOLUTION TO GLOBALIZATION OF AFRICAN MISSION

The huge surge in African Christianity over the course of the twentieth century helps explain the entrenchment of organized religion in African national formation and nationalist politics.⁵⁶ According to Maxwell, by the middle of the century ‘a shift in the balance of power between black and white Christians’ had diminished the formal but not the cultural associations between European religion and empire. ‘African Christians had done more than seize the religious initiative; they had learned that religious idioms could both legitimize and condemn political systems’—a connection that ‘profoundly shaped the decolonization process’.⁵⁷

For Anglican missions, however, reckoning with African nationalism and the imminence of independence did pose a potential identity crisis.⁵⁸ Church and mission leaders responded by taking steps to devolve British mission authority to African Church authority in 1950s and 1960s through the creation of the new African provinces. The Church of the Province of West Africa was formed in 1951, the Province of Central Africa in 1955, and the Provinces of East Africa (initially proposed by Walter Owen around 1920 to no avail) and Uganda in 1960, all joining the older diocese of Cape Town. These configurations can be attributed to the efforts of Archbishop Geoffrey Fisher and CMS General Secretary Max Warren, both of whom tried to steer the decolonization of African Church and mission towards a paradigm of mutual cooperation within the Anglican Communion that loosely paralleled the political and diplomatic function of the Commonwealth and the transitional experiments of federation. But the federal structures of the Anglican provinces arguably had more success and support than the political federations that preceded decolonization in East and Central Africa and across the late colonial British Empire. The endurance of these structures is all the more remarkable given that the new provinces brought previously segregated traditions of mission into shared ecclesiastical borders (for example, the SPG in the Gold Coast/Ghana

⁵⁶ Adrian Hastings, *The Construction of Nationhood: Ethnicity, Religion, and Nationalism* (Cambridge, 1997), ch. 6.

⁵⁷ Maxwell, ‘Decolonization’, p. 296.

⁵⁸ John Stuart, ‘“Speaking for the Unvoiced?” British Missionaries and Aspects of African Nationalism, 1949–1959’, in Stanley (ed.), *Missions, Nationalism and the End of Empire*, pp. 183–93.

merged with the CMS in the rest of West Africa, and the CMS and UMCA missions in Tanganyika combined in the Province of East Africa)—conflations that persisted even after the further division of the East African Province in 1970 and the West African Province in 1979.⁵⁹

In this climate, ‘partnership’ became the watchword of the day. Both the Lambeth Conference of 1958 and the Anglican Congress of 1963 had a notable focus on mission, but these were framed explicitly through a discourse of universality and ‘mutual responsibility and interdependence’, rather than a hierarchy of centre and periphery: ‘The mission of the Church . . . is a mission to the whole world, not only in area but in all the concerns of mankind. It has no frontiers between “home” and “foreign” but is concerned to present Christ to people everywhere.’⁶⁰ Warren and others tried to channel missionary impulses into newer cooperative opportunities for voluntary service like Christian Aid and the Voluntary Service Organization, thereby changing the nature of ‘vocation’ from a lifelong career to a temporary sojourn in Africa.⁶¹ The missionaries of the older British Anglican societies, as well as the aid and development agencies of the Western Churches of the Anglican Communion, engaged primarily in social and relief work in Africa as opposed to building up the Church. National Churches like Uganda, however, engaged in their own African evangelism in West Africa, and regional diasporas carried Anglican mission across colonial and national borders at a grassroots level, such as in Congo/Zaire, whose Anglican Church is an organic product of evangelism (starting with the mission of the indefatigable Apolo Kivebulaya) and migration (both forced and voluntary) from Uganda, Zambia, and Rwanda throughout the twentieth century.⁶²

But ‘partnership’, like earlier iterations of indigenization, had its limits. African clergy had been appointed as suffragan bishops beginning in the 1940s, but their appointment as diocesan bishops did not begin until 1960; and their appointment as provincial archbishops was slower still, indicating the very uneven progression of ecclesiastical decolonization. The MU committed to fostering African women’s leadership as a central objective of its mission strategy throughout the colonial period. Yet by the early 1970s a

⁵⁹ Sarah Stockwell, ‘“Splendidly Leading the Way”? Archbishop Fisher and Decolonisation in British Colonial Africa’, *Journal of Imperial & Commonwealth History*, 36 (2008): 545–64; John S. Pobee, ‘The Anglican Church in Ghana and the SPG’, in O’Connor and others, *Three Centuries of Mission*, pp. 409–21; Stuart, *British Missionaries*; Jocelyn Murray, *Proclaim the Good News: A Short History of the Church Missionary Society* (London, 1985).

⁶⁰ Anglican Consultative Council, *Lambeth Conference Resolutions Archive from 1958* (London: Anglican Communion Office, 2005), Resolution 58, <<http://www.lambethconference.org/resolutions/1958/>> (accessed 29 Mar. 2014).

⁶¹ John Stuart, ‘Overseas Mission, Voluntary Service and Aid to Africa: Max Warren, the Church Missionary Society and Kenya, 1945–63’, *Journal of Imperial & Commonwealth History*, 36 (2008): 527–43; Stuart, *British Missionaries*, ch. 6.

⁶² ‘The Church in Zaire, 1896–1996’, HML, RID 1.

comprehensive report showed that the MU was lagging far behind the other missionary bodies in making the devolution of Anglican associational life consistent with the devolution of Church and state during the early years of independence.⁶³ In recent decades, the MU has accordingly decentralized its structures of authority to accord more autonomy to its members in the global South while continuing to cultivate the ties of association and Anglican universalism through its world-wide conference.

Possibly the most striking aspect of the story of post-colonial Anglican mission in Africa has been the inversion of the currents of indigenization and partnership across the religious topography of global North and South. From the 1970s to the 1990s the CMS developed a policy of making Britain the subject of overseas mission, bringing foreign nationals and overseas experts from Asia and Africa to serve as the Church's intermediaries in brokering Britain's multi-cultural society.⁶⁴ And since the 1990s, conservative Evangelical churches in West and East Africa have served as hosts to the American parishes and dioceses who have broken with the Episcopal Church of the United States over contested issues of sexuality, and have put pressure on the Anglican Communion and its instruments of unity to acknowledge the potential for schism. These new hierarchies and partnerships have enabled a particular strain of African Anglicanism to assert its doctrinal and social authority on a global scale, even as it continues to operate within the constraints of the unequal material resources that favour the Western Churches.⁶⁵

CONCLUSION

The long history of the shift from mission to Church shows that evangelism and establishment, 'voluntarism' and 'confessionalism', as Cox terms them, were overlapping rather than linear or sequential facets of Anglicanism in Africa.⁶⁶ Further, the indigenization of Anglican Christianity happened very much in and through missionary institutions, supporting Cox's assertion that the so-called 'multiracial Christian commonwealth of missionary fantasy' was sincere, tenacious, and not always unsuccessful. If empire was the contingency that rendered a gap between missionary dreams and reality, the collaborative

⁶³ *New Dimensions: The Report of the Bishop of Willesden's Commission on the Objects and Policy of the Mothers' Union* (London, 1972).

⁶⁴ John Clark, 'CMS and Mission in Britain: The Evolution of a Policy', in Kevin Ward and Brian Stanley (eds.), *The Church Mission Society and World Christianity, 1799–1999* (Grand Rapids, MI, 2000), pp. 319–43.

⁶⁵ Miranda K. Hassett, *Anglican Communion in Crisis: How Episcopal Dissidents and Their African Allies are Reshaping Anglicanism* (Princeton, NJ, 2007).

⁶⁶ Cox, *British Missionary Enterprise*.

indigenization of Christianity had the potential to close that gap. But local realities shaped the Anglican mission project as much as global ones, and the broad historical debates about the relative European and subaltern ownership of missionary and colonial projects can be applied appropriately here as well. Indeed, this chapter has suggested that Anglican mission in twentieth-century Africa was not a one-sided dynamic of either European invention and coercion or subaltern seizure of control, but rather an active, multi-sided interplay of appropriation, negotiation, transformation, and identity formation, contextualized always within the designs and desires of particular communities.

Indeed, the very concept of 'Anglican mission' belies the diversity that took root across the colonies, states, and locales of twentieth-century sub-Saharan Africa. But certain trends can be discerned nonetheless. The venues of state-building, knowledge production and transmission, worship and spirituality, social and political movements, devolution and partnership reflected missions' changing approach to Anglican evangelism, indigenization, and self-determination against the currents of change in the twentieth century. Moreover, the varieties of Anglican tradition helped locate, mediate, and contest the contested identities that emerged in the colonial and post-colonial state, marketplace, and society. Missionaries' own spiritual and material goals made them wrestle with their place relative to the British, indigenous, and transnational facets of the globalization of Christianity, but always while attempting to make Anglican identity capable of negotiating and encapsulating the others.

SELECT BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Beidelman, T. O., *Colonial Evangelism: A Socio-Historical Study of an East African Mission at the Grassroots* (Bloomington, IN, 1982).
- Cox, Jeffrey, *The British Missionary Enterprise since 1700* (New York, 2008).
- Etherington, Norman, *Missions and Empire* (Oxford, 2005).
- Hastings, Adrian, *A History of African Christianity, 1950–1975* (Cambridge, 1979).
- Isichei, Elizabeth, *A History of Christianity in Africa* (London, 1995).
- Koschorke, Klaus, Ludwig Frieder, and Mariano Delgado (eds.), *A History of Christianity in Asia, Africa, and Latin America, 1450–1990: A Documentary Sourcebook* (Grand Rapids, MI, 2007).
- McLeod, Hugh (ed.), *The Cambridge History of Christianity*, vol. V: *World Christianities, c.1914–2000* (Cambridge, 2006).
- Moyse, Cordelia, *A History of the Mothers' Union: Women, Anglicanism and Globalisation, 1876–2008* (Woodbridge, 2009).
- Murray, Jocelyn, *Proclaim the Good News: A Short History of the Church Missionary Society* (London, 1985).

- O'Connor, Daniel and others, *Three Centuries of Mission: The United Society for the Propagation of the Gospel, 1701–2000* (London, 2000).
- Oliver, Roland, *The Missionary Factor in East Africa* (London, 1952).
- Peterson, Derek, *Ethnic Patriotism and the East African Revival: A History of Dissent c.1935–72* (Cambridge, 2014).
- Prevost, Elizabeth, *The Communion of Women: Missions and Gender in Colonial Africa and the British Metropole* (Oxford, 2010).
- Stanley, Brian (ed.), *Missions, Nationalism, and the End of Empire* (Grand Rapids, MI, 2003).
- Strayer, Robert, *The Making of Mission Communities in East Africa: Anglicans and Africans in Colonial Kenya, 1875–1935* (London, 1978).
- Stuart, John, *British Missionaries and the End of Empire: East, Central, and Southern Africa, 1939–1964* (Grand Rapids, MI, 2011).
- Sundkler, Bengt and Christopher Steed, *A History of the Church in Africa* (Cambridge, 2000).
- Ward, Kevin, *A History of Global Anglicanism* (Cambridge, 2006).
- Ward, Kevin and Brian Stanley (eds.), *The Church Mission Society and World Christianity, 1799–1999* (Grand Rapids, MI, 2000).
- Ward, Kevin and Emma Wild-Wood (eds.), *The East African Revival: History and Legacies* (Farnham, 2012).

Anglican Liturgical Developments in New Contexts

The Challenges of Inculturation

Louis Weil

At a meeting of the International Anglican Liturgical Consultation (IALC) in Toronto in 1991, late one evening I had a conversation with a parish priest of that diocese who spoke of the difficulty facing the Anglican Church of Canada with regard to the cultural pluralism in the diocese of Toronto. At that time, he said, there were more than a dozen different linguistic groups representing a broad spectrum of cultural diversity. He then said that ‘Anglicanism cannot adapt to that much diversity and still remain Anglican.’ His words surprised me since I had served as a missionary priest in Latin America for a decade, and had observed hopeful signs of cultural adaptation in that context. My own pastoral experience made it impossible for me to accept his point of view.

Questions of Anglican liturgical inculturation were, in fact, being addressed at that time. The subject had been engaged, at least at a semi-official level, at the previous meeting of the IALC in York, England, in 1989. The primary focus of that meeting was the preparation of a document on the subject of Anglican liturgical inculturation. This document was later published with the significant address ‘to all those who worship God throughout the Anglican Communion; and for the special consideration of bishops, teachers of liturgy, and members of Liturgical Commissions’.¹ The importance of the subject has been confirmed in the more than two decades which have passed since that conversation in Toronto, as the question of inculturation has come to be more

¹ The document was first published in *Findings of the Third International Anglican Liturgical Consultation* (Nottingham, 1989), and subsequently reissued as ‘The York Statement: Down to Earth Worship’, in David R. Holeton (ed.), *Liturgical Inculturation in the Anglican Communion* (Nottingham, 1990), pp. 8–13.

seriously addressed at several levels in the Anglican Communion, both locally and internationally.

For Anglicans, 'inculturation' raises some basic questions. My friend in Toronto believed that English culture is essential to what had been known as Anglicanism. He is by no means alone in that opinion. The word itself—'Anglicanism'—points inevitably to the English cultural and historical origins of our religious tradition, and this continued as long as the largest provinces were associated with that English heritage. Until the 1960s the membership of the Anglican Communion was made up primarily of Anglophone and Anglophile Churches.

Although Anglicanism remains the most commonly used term in reference to the Anglican Communion, since the mid-twentieth century this link with British history and culture has become less characteristic of the Communion as a whole, and is often a source of confusion in encounters with Christians of other traditions. It is thus understandable that there are provinces that have chosen a different name for their national Church, such as the Nippon Sei Ko Kai—'the Holy Catholic Church of Japan'. So an important question remains: to what degree is Anglicanism's English cultural origins essential to those provinces whose identity is markedly *other*?

The question is further complicated by the fact that in some areas of the Anglican world, English religious culture has planted deep roots in the religious practices of other provinces of the Communion, religious practices which reflect the diversity of matters of 'churchmanship' which were brought in by the missionaries. Christian faith was presented by missions in an English garb, even to the point of strong differences of emphasis. If we consider Africa by way of example, although liturgical adaptation has certainly taken place there, such external signs as ritual practices, architecture, and clerical garb have proven to be quite tenacious in their hold upon an Anglican identity which reflects the religious culture of those first missionaries.

This issue is not confined only to Anglican religious practice. For all of the Western liturgical Churches, the missionary extension of a tradition was planted along with the rituals and artefacts of a particular European cultural tradition. That cultural 'dress' often became an integral aspect of the religious identity of those local communities. This link to the 'mother' tradition is affirmed in the official ritual texts. We see this, for example, in the Vatican stipulation that for all translations of the liturgy it is the Latin *editio typica* which is the only officially authorized version of a liturgical text, and is thus required as the absolute and literal source for any translation. In effect, this means, at least officially, that new liturgical texts and rites must not *originate* in the vernacular. The primary text is the one in Latin, and all translations must be made from it.

The view implied is that the official language is in some sense 'transcultural', not wedded to any culture, but rather standing above the particularities of

culture as a sacred language required for sacred rites. This has not been true only in the Roman Catholic tradition. In Anglicanism there is no such canonical requirement, but nevertheless the Prayer Book texts of Archbishop Thomas Cranmer dating from the middle of the sixteenth century maintained a similar authority during the first four centuries of Anglican liturgical developments. It was only in the mid-twentieth century that this normative character of Cranmer's texts came to be questioned during the process of Prayer Book reform in some Anglican provinces. This could happen because of the contributions of sociologists towards an emerging awareness that no language or rite can be claimed as transcultural. They are inevitably shaped within a particular historical and cultural context. In the case of the Latin rite, this was primarily in the culture of mid-to-late medieval society with its understanding of the Church in that society. Similarly, the Anglican liturgical heritage was initiated in the context of sixteenth-century England, its cultural world, and its language. In retrospect, we can see that the origins of all the liturgical families have emerged and developed in this way. All liturgical rites are inculturated. The question is whether or not this inculturation embodies the culture of the people who are expected to express their faith in those rites.

THE TERM 'INCULTURATION'

The use of the word 'inculturation' requires attention. With regard to liturgical rites, other terms are sometimes used, specifically the terms 'adaptation' and 'indigenization'.

The implications of these terms, however, are significantly different when applied to liturgical developments in diverse cultural contexts.² Although the term 'inculturation' would not have been used by Archbishop Cranmer for his liturgical projects, in retrospect that work can certainly be interpreted as an example of liturgical inculturation. The liturgical priorities of all of the sixteenth-century reformers embodied a range of reactions to the dominant transcultural understanding of liturgical rites which were imposed by the ordained leadership of the Western Church.

It is not difficult to discern the reasons for which this transcultural understanding had arisen. As the various vernacular adaptations of Latin began to emerge, the Church was faced with a new situation regarding any future developments of its liturgical rites. Whereas the shift from Greek to Latin, usually associated with the early fourth century, had been precisely a move *towards* the liturgical use of the dominant vernacular, the reaction of Church

² Cf. Victor R. Atta-Bafoe and Phillip Tovey, 'What Does Inculturation Mean?' in Holeton (ed.), *Liturgical Inculturation in the Anglican Communion*, pp. 14–16.

leadership in later medieval culture was the exact opposite—it was a rejection of the use of the vernacular with the reservation of Latin as the sacred liturgical language.

Nor did this issue of language stand alone. This was one facet of a world-view in which all aspects of the ‘sacred’, including liturgical rites, were distinguished by their separation from the ‘secular’.³ A profound cleavage had developed between the realms of the sacred and the secular, with the ordained clergy identified with the former and the laity with the latter. This can be seen in several aspects of the celebration of the Eucharist which had developed with a changing mentality about the nature of the ‘sacred’: the table of the eucharistic meal became a retable at which the consecrated gifts might be lifted up for adoration; the audible proclamation of the Eucharistic Prayer became a text considered so sacred that it must be whispered, not even heard by the secular ears of the laity; and the Eucharist itself a sacred meal at which, usually, only the presider would eat and drink.

In the Anglican tradition the texts of Archbishop Cranmer appeared at a time when the English language, influenced by a heritage of great poets and writers, was enjoying what would come to be seen as a ‘golden age’ in British history and culture. This wider cultural context influenced the quality of the new vernacular liturgical language which became the foundation for ‘our incomparable liturgy’. Cranmer’s work may be seen as a significant example of liturgical inculturation in the Tudor world of that time. As a presider, priests are perhaps in a privileged role in this regard: when the language of Archbishop Cranmer is used today, as continues to be the case in many authorized versions of the Book of Common Prayer, one cannot help but be aware that the literary quality of Cranmer’s collects and his Eucharistic Prayer is extraordinary, albeit at times somewhat removed from current normative discourse.

Yet the reality is that this authoritative text for Anglicans, and particularly in its 1662 version which was carried all over the world by English traders and missionaries, exerted a powerful restraint against change or variation. The liturgical tradition of Anglicanism has been conservative in this regard, yet this is true as well of all the various Protestant traditions. As a consequence of the intense doctrinal debates, and with perhaps particular regard to the debates concerning the meaning of the Eucharist, from the time of the Reformation the liturgy often embodied the teaching of that tradition, and thus implied an adversarial dimension towards those of another tradition who did not agree. Further, because printing permitted an absolute fixity of text, these two conditions created a context in which liturgical change was inhibited. In Latin America in the 1960s Anglicans in some places used the then-current Spanish version of the American Book of Common Prayer (BCP) of 1928.

³ Cf. Louis Bouyer, *Rite and Man* (Notre Dame, IN, 1963), pp. 63–77.

The American book had been translated into a quite literal Spanish in which translators had attempted to preserve the word order and even the idioms of Cranmer's English. The result was a book which was in very poor, even nonsensical, Spanish.

This problem results when an authoritative source is taken as the model for a very different cultural context and language. It was perhaps because of England's geographical insularity with its use of a single dominant language that the situation was so different from that of the Lutherans on the continent. In less than a century after Luther's death, more than fifty different liturgical forms had been published in various languages, based upon Luther's liturgical principles but varying in language and content that is without the obligatory use of authorized forms. Developments within the various Lutheran Churches offer an interesting contrast to developments in England. Whereas in England the authorized BCP held unique authority as the basis for all public worship, a different type of document developed among the Lutherans—the Church Order, in German *Kirchenordnung*. This type of document played a more general role in the life of the Church than the Prayer Book did in England. It served as the ecclesiastical constitution of a state, and thus these Orders varied from one state to another. Whereas the reformers in general rejected the elaborate official ritual forms of the Roman Church, the English Church kept to the medieval tradition of having an official ritual book, including, of course, the texts that were authorized for use in Church services. This distinction between the Anglican and the Lutheran models also applied to language. Here again we see how the geographical insularity of England contributed to its authorization of a single liturgical language, but as the Lutheran movement expanded into Scandinavia, its rites used diverse vernacular languages from the earliest times. In this sense, they embodied diverse forms of inculturation from the start, whereas in the British Isles there was a single model of inculturation. These various Church Orders, however, were not restricted to liturgical matters—they outlined all aspects of Church life, including dogmatic teaching based upon the Lutheran Confessions, the organization of Church government, the appointment of Church officers, discipline, marriage, education, salaries of Church and school officials, management of property, care for the poor, and, of course, regulations concerning the liturgy.⁴

In the British context, the BCP served as an embodiment of what the English Church is as a religious tradition. Even when the British colonies in America revolted and declared their independence from British authority, the first Prayer Book of 1789 in the new nation was virtually identical to that of 1662, with the obvious exception that prayers for the king, for example, were

⁴ Cf. Hans-Christoph Schmidt-Lauber, 'The Lutheran Tradition in the German Lands', in G. Wainwright and K. B. Westerfield Tucker (eds.), *The Oxford History of Christian Worship* (Oxford, 2006), pp. 305–421.

replaced with prayers for the president. In this regard, if one may even speak of Prayer Book inculturation in the new American context, it was minimal in the extreme. The cultural presuppositions upon which the American Prayer Book of 1789 were based remained essentially British.

As late as the 1980s in the United States, the people appointed to prepare new Spanish and French translations of the 1979 BCP were obliged to maintain strict conformity with the American book. The only exception was that for the somewhat later timing of the French translation, the committee was permitted to use already authorized versions of the common liturgical texts in use by the Roman Catholic Church in France, such as, for example, the texts of the Ordinary of the Mass: *Kyrie*, *Gloria in excelsis*, *Sanctus-Benedictus*, and *Agnus Dei*. Thus, within the lapse of only a few years' time between the two projects, the absolute imposition of the American model gave way to imperatives which sprang from the ecumenical movement.

It is important to remember this background to the issue of the inculturation at the time of the Reformation. By the close of the Middle Ages, the liturgical rites of Western Christendom had become fixed and clericalized to an unprecedented degree. All liturgical rites were meticulously controlled by the rubrics, and the participation of the laity amounted to little more than physical presence at the celebration of the mass, generally without the reception of communion. It was these issues in liturgical practice which the reformers felt compelled to address. Thus the developments which we now see as the first stages of inculturation were a response to the official stance of the Western Roman Church which had during the Renaissance reacted to the profound changes at many levels of European culture with a static transcultural understanding of the place of the liturgy in the life of the Church. As the reformers in various ways confronted this situation, significant change in the models of liturgical practice became a primary way in which the laity could, through participation in transformed models of corporate worship and particularly in the hearing of Scripture proclaimed in their own language, embrace a renewed understanding of the nature of the Church and of their place in it.

THE YORK STATEMENT

A wide range of views may be found among Anglicans as to what inculturation means or should mean, and what impact it should have within the Anglican liturgical tradition. In this perspective, the 1989 York Statement issued by the IALC does not set forth a definitive teaching regarding the ways in which liturgy and culture are appropriately related, and how inculturation might appropriately unfold in diverse contexts. The document did not command, but it did commend. The statement is, however, the most authoritative

Anglican source available on the issue of inculturation among the culturally diverse provinces of the Communion.

With that in mind, we shall analyse the statement with regard to its implications throughout the Communion, promoting as it does the imperative that liturgical developments be rooted in the local cultures in which they will be generated. What principles regarding inculturation may we draw from the Statement as the Anglican Church shapes future liturgical practice throughout the entire Communion? The statement begins with reference to two resolutions from the 1988 Lambeth Conference which specifically address the appropriate interdependence of liturgy and culture. The first, titled 'Liturgy and Culture', affirms that:

This Conference (a) recognizes that culture is the context in which people find their identity; (b) affirms that . . . the gospel judges every culture . . . challenging some aspects of the culture while endorsing others for the benefit of the Church and the society; (c) urges the church everywhere to work at expressing the unchanging gospel of Christ in words, actions, names, customs, liturgies which communicate relevantly in each society.⁵

The non-proscriptive character of this Anglican model for inculturation was presented in a second resolution, titled 'Liturgical Freedom', which stated that 'This Conference resolves that each Province should be free, subject to essential universal Anglican norms of worship, and to a valuing of traditional liturgical materials, to seek that expression of worship which is appropriate to the Christian people in their cultural context.'⁶

These two resolutions create a context of remarkable openness to the cultural diversity that characterizes the provinces of the Anglican Communion. We must acknowledge, however, that in practical application both resolutions are open to a range of more conservative to more liberal interpretations. The earlier observation that Thomas Cranmer's liturgical work may be understood as an example of inculturation is given even more force when the York Statement asserted that the Incarnation is itself 'God's inculturation in this world, and in a particular cultural context'.⁷ This was a fundamental theological claim which in Christian history has often been betrayed when the missionary expansion of the Church has not only involved the proclamation of God's saving action in the life and ministry of Jesus Christ, but also the identification of that proclamation with a particular cultural model taken to be 'normative'. This became the basis of the claim that the ecclesial structures of ministry and authority are in some sense 'trans-historical'. This was possible because of a failure to recognize and acknowledge that all aspects of the Church's life, including its most sacred sacramental rituals, originated and developed within particular cultural and historical

⁵ Resolution 22.

⁶ Resolution 47.

⁷ Paragraph 3: First Principles.

contexts, and that these contexts played a fundamental role in shaping how those rituals were experienced and understood.

The primary issue here is that a religious faith based upon belief in an incarnation can never be understood in trans-historical terms. Perhaps the most obvious example of this is the radically inculturated nature of language. Language theorists assert that a language is an embodiment of a people's cultural identity. When a person makes the effort to learn a new language, that is, in addition to the language heard from birth, one soon realizes that an authentic translation from one language into another involves far more than a word for word transliteration.

ANGLICAN STARTING POINTS

The brief fourth paragraph of the Statement made a fundamental connection regarding inculturation from within the Anglican context. It made the observation that at the time of the break between the English Church and Rome in the sixteenth century the development of new liturgical forms embodied two important aspects: first, the principle that liturgical prayer is the common prayer of the entire assembly, as contrasted with the clerically dominated model of the later Middle Ages, and that thus the new liturgy 'was appropriately expressed in the culture of its own times, not least in the use of Tudor English'. Equally significant was 'a general assertion of the freedom of Churches and Provinces in different places to develop their own distinctive forms'. We see in this an echo of the Articles of Religion, where it is taught that:

It is not necessary that Traditions and Ceremonies be in all places one, or utterly like; for at all times they have been divers, and may be changed according to the diversity of countries, times, and men's manners, so that nothing be ordained against God's Word... Every particular or national Church hath authority to ordain, change, and abolish, Ceremonies or Rites of the Church ordained only by man's authority, so that all things be done to edifying.⁸

We see in this the Anglican response to a much-debated issue among the reformers, namely, the inclusion in liturgical practice of elements which do not have their basis in Scripture. In this the approach in England was similar to that of the Lutherans, that 'traditional practices' which are not found in Scripture but which have a place in the piety of the people may be preserved if 'nothing be ordained against God's Word'. So it is that Article XXXIV does not reject liturgical traditions and ceremonies which have developed in the life of

⁸ Article XXXIV.

the Church, and thus through human authority, but placed them, as it were, under the judgement that practices 'ordained only by man's authority' can be changed or abolished. Such practices were considered to be *adiaphora*. The standard is not based upon an inevitably vain attempt to develop forms for public corporate prayer based uniquely upon the Scriptures, but rather to recognize the fallibility of all forms which have developed under human authority. Not that they should be eliminated from the liturgy, but that they should remain under scrutiny as such forms develop that they not be 'against God's Word'. This distinction explains the significant role that the BCP has played in Anglican identity, and at the same time why the Prayer Book has remained subject to revision in new cultural and pastoral contexts, and in the light of new insight into the Christian faith. Implied here is an ecclesiology in which both development and culture play significant roles in the evolution of the Church's life and its fidelity to the gospel of Christ.

There is also an ecumenical aspect to be gained from a serious engagement with the local culture. The cultural framework which is shared with Christians of other traditions gives a common contextual ground to the experience of faith in Christ. Ecumenical reflection on the nature of the Church has nourished an awareness that often what we share in one Christian tradition with the members of another Christian tradition is greater than the historically shaped differences which have separated us for centuries. This has given to many Christians who have participated at one level or another in ecumenical dialogue a deepened sense of unity in Christ that transcends denominational identities. Such an experience shapes an awareness of the richness of the Church's life that is greater than that of any one Christian tradition.

Denominationalism has been so much of a part of the Christian experience of what it means to be 'Church' that it is easy to see it as normative. A study of the history of the Church reveals that diversity has been characteristic of the Christian movement from its beginnings as recorded in the New Testament. Disagreement even with regard to fundamental questions has also been an abiding reality. One has only to consider the disagreement about whether circumcision should be maintained among Christians as indicative of such disagreement. The gift which a baptismal ecclesiology brings to our contemporary experience is an affirmation of what it means to see all Christians in the Church as grounded in 'one Lord, one faith, one Baptism'.

Yet with centuries of denominationalism dominating our experience of the Church, it is inevitable that for countless Anglicans, and not only those who are members of the Church of England, various aspects of Anglican identity have frequently been interpreted as 'necessary'. The BCP probably played the major role in this, but other factors derived from 'Englishness' also formed part of the equation. Bishop Daniel Corrigan, a former suffragan bishop of the diocese of Colorado from 1958 to 1970, told the story of his being sent as a newly ordained priest to a remote town in his diocese where the Episcopal

Church had never formed a congregation. His bishop asked him to assess if this might be possible. Corrigan put up a sign inviting anyone interested in the Episcopal Church to meet with him at a given time, and quite a number of people came. He soon realized that none of these people had ever had contact with the Episcopal Church, and they asked him what it was. Corrigan, being flustered, replied that it was 'related to the Church of England'. In response one of the people asked, 'Then what are you doing over here?'

Although amusing, this incident is indicative of a kind of English ethos which has often characterized the American Episcopal Church, not only for many clergy but also for laity who have seen the connection with English history and culture as very appealing. What has been variously understood as the culture of Anglicanism has generally placed enormous emphasis on both textual conformity and the even more complex matter of style—of architecture, of vesture, of church decoration, and, of course, literary style. For many members of the Episcopal Church, this English heritage continues to be a treasured aspect of their identity as a religious tradition. In the context of increasing cultural complexity, the challenging issue is what it means to be Anglican in contexts in which those characteristics are thoroughly foreign to the culture of the local community. This creates a kind of cultural alienation: is it appropriate to expect people to live most of the time in the real world of their daily lives, but with regard to the practice of religious faith to shift briefly on Sundays into a different world, a world shaped by a different culture?

IMPLEMENTATION

An authentic implementation of Anglican diverse cultural horizon cannot be achieved simply by incorporating some local artefacts which are, as it were, grafted on to what has remained essentially a different religious culture rooted in its traditional Anglican soil. With respect to those nations—the so-called 'third world'—that were colonized during the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries, and in that process received not only the gospel but also the gospel in an English garb, the York Statement indicated that what was now required was a decolonization of worship. However, in many cases the process of religious colonization has been so thorough that for the local people their own religious experience of Christian faith has been shaped to a significant degree within the cultural mode of the colonizers. But a solution did not lie simply in the abolition of all the imported expressions of the liturgical artefacts of the colonizers. Aspects of that model which was imported by the early missionaries had, over time, become at least in part integrated aspects of the local Church's spirituality, about what was understood 'to be Anglican'.

The presence of the Anglican Church in Latin America, whether we have in mind the dioceses established by the Church of England or those established by the American Episcopal Church, did not originate as a missionary outreach to the indigenous peoples who had been missionized earlier by Roman Catholic missionaries whose efforts varied enormously in the widely diverse contexts. The presence of most Anglican clergy in these areas was initially as a service to the Anglicans who were for various reasons living in Latin America. The reasons for their presence varied. Often this amounted to little more than a diplomatic presence, but when commercial interests were involved, this could lead in some cases to a larger community who saw the importance of the presence of Anglican clergy as a service to their own religious needs. This meant that services were in English and, of course, taken from the Prayer Book. Although situations varied enormously, this presence of Anglican and other non-Roman traditions, whether for diplomatic, commercial, or academic reasons, led to an awareness of the presence of Christian religious traditions other than the dominant Roman Catholic form which had long permeated the local culture. In this context, initially among the educated but eventually touching all levels of the society, an alternative form of Christianity became attractive to some, especially for people who found in the non-Roman Churches patterns of Christian community in which laity might assume a larger role in the life of the Church than had been open to them in the generally clergy-dominated pattern they had experienced as members of the Roman Church.

With regard to our subject of inculturation, however, these alternative forms of Christianity tended to maintain the cultural ethos of the 'mother Church' with regard to the patterns of worship. Often the language of worship continued to be that of the vernacular of the foreigner culture, so that participation with them in corporate worship involved a kind of immersion in a different religious ethos from that of the Roman Catholic Church whose influence stretched beyond the religious domain into the fabric of the culture itself. During the early decades of this development, the adoption of a different religious ethos was often accepted uncritically. When hymnals were prepared for publication, although the texts were in the local vernacular, the hymn tunes were drawn generally from Anglican or other English-language hymnals. Although on the surface it appeared that the local vernacular was being sung, the texts were generally transliterations of the original English text associated with the hymn. The liturgical texts of Archbishop Cranmer and the hymn texts of the Wesleys, for example, were imposed upon the local vernacular rather than authentically translated and embodied in the idiomatic use of the local vernacular. Thus, with regard to hymnody as well as to the early translations of the liturgical rites, although in some sense in the vernacular, the result was an impoverished use of that language. Gradually authentic inculturation became the goal.

INCULTURATION IN HAITI

In some instances, as with the design of the new church building and its fittings, it has been a person from the 'mother Church', who has brought the insight to reveal this wider cultural horizon which the local members had never known in their practice of the Christian faith, the horizon in which they would find their own culture engaged in the proclamation of Christian faith. A particularly powerful example of this opening up of a wider cultural horizon was effected through the prophetic leadership of a white, North American bishop who was appointed to be the bishop of Haiti in 1943. His name was Charles Alfred Voegeli (1905–84). Voegeli fostered a remarkable indigenization of the Haitian Church which shaped all dimensions of its life within its own cultural framework.

In the 1940s, a group of Haitian artists began to earn a living by creating paintings of Haitian life, primarily for sale to tourists. These vibrant, small canvasses became well known since their quality was far greater than what one would expect of 'tourist art'. In the late 1940s, the leader of the group approached the local Roman Catholic archbishop with a proposal that the artists be permitted to paint murals on the walls of a newly built gymnasium next door to the cathedral. The archbishop rejected the offer. In general, the attitude of Roman Catholic authorities was that Haitian art was pagan and thus a prohibited medium for art based upon Christian subjects. One must immediately acknowledge that this view was not merely that of a traditionalist black Haitian bishop. French missionaries had imported as a normative model for Christian art what was known in France as 'Sulpician art', being associated with the area in Paris near the Église de St Sulpice. In other words, the art of these missionaries was that which they knew from their formative years in France. It is now generally acknowledged that this was a religious art marked by a degenerate sentimentality, but it had gained a secure place in Franco-phone piety, including in areas far distant from France. So the rejection by the Roman Catholic archbishop was by no means exceptional.

Bishop Voegeli heard of the exchange between the archbishop and the leader of the artists' group, and he invited the latter to come for a conversation. The bishop took the artist into the Anglican Cathedral of the Holy Trinity. The building was in the traditional Gothic design so common in Europe, but the whitewashed walls had been left completely plain. As the bishop stood with the artist, he offered him the walls of the cathedral for the group to paint enormous murals of the life of Christ. Regarding the subject, Bishop Voegeli expressed his expectation that the murals would be appropriate in a house of Christian prayer. The result was one of the most important examples of indigenous religious art in the Western hemisphere. In those murals, the Christian mysteries of salvation were presented before the eyes of people gathered for worship in the cathedral. The entire Christian story encircled

the people when they assembled to celebrate the Eucharist: among them were depictions of the nativity of Jesus, the Last Supper, the Crucifixion, and Christ's ascension to God the Father—fourteen murals in all were produced in 1950–1 by nine of the best-known so-called 'primitive' painters of the twentieth century. Jesus is crucified in Port-au-Prince and rises from a tomb in Haiti. The gospel events had become radically inculturated.⁹

For his part Bishop Voegeli was widely criticized. The bishop encouraged the artists to place the biblical scenes in the authentic context of Haitian life, which meant that in these paintings could be found indications of the presence of Voodoo in Haitian culture. Yet this art was both an acknowledgement of the pervasive presence of Voodoo in Haiti and also a suggestion that it too, even gross superstition, must be caught up into the redemptive work of Christ. But the witness made by these paintings ended on 12 January 2010 when a magnitude 7 earthquake struck the nation. Only three of the murals survived: the baptism of Christ, the Last Supper, and that of a religious procession. It was decided that these three murals would be carefully preserved so that they might be incorporated into a new cathedral.

In spite of the destruction of many of the murals, their significance has continued to influence the self-understanding of the people and clergy of the diocese in relation to the events of salvation history. For all Haitians, the murals are remembered as a profound expression of Haiti's cultural identity and heritage. In that regard, their importance also reaches far beyond Haiti as a sign that the indigenization of the gospel of Jesus Christ is fundamental to the Church's work around the world as an embodiment of the Incarnation—that God is revealed and known in the widely diverse cultures of our world.

IMPLICATIONS

The implications of authentic inculturation extend, of course, beyond questions of music, architecture, and religious art. Given the role that the BCP has taken in regard to Anglican identity, the question of indigenous liturgical rites has inevitably been quite sensitive. Once we move beyond texts based upon a 'transliteration' of those of Archbishop Cranmer, just how far can we move and yet remain recognizably 'Anglican'? The York Statement called into question earlier Lambeth resolutions which implied that the liturgical texts of Thomas Cranmer would continue to be the normative reference point for the development of new texts in the course of Prayer Book revision. The statement rejects

⁹ Cf. John Scofield, 'Haiti: West Africa in the West Indies', *National Geographic*, 119 (Feb. 1961): 227–59.

attempts to identify Anglicanism, whether locally or worldwide, through any common liturgical texts, ethos or style... We believe the use of vernacular language to be foundational to inculturation, and within that value highly the 'traditional liturgical materials' to which Resolution 47 also refers. Our common liturgical heritage in items such as the Lord's Prayer promotes common prayer, sustains a dialogue with the scriptures, and conserves an element of the universal among the particulars of inculturated worship.¹⁰

This was a truly remarkable statement with regard to its minimalist expectations concerning Prayer Book conformity. A few decades earlier, as in the Spanish Prayer Book which was in use in Puerto Rico in the 1960s, even the layout of the texts on the printed page conformed to that of the American BCP of 1928, and, as we have noted, the translation was a slavishly literal version of Archbishop Cranmer's texts.

Yet what we find in the York Statement reflected a radical change in perspective, and a striking contrast to the generally accepted view which had shaped Anglican liturgical revision. When we read in the resolutions of the 1908 Lambeth Conference 'that liturgical uniformity should not be regarded as a necessity throughout the Anglican Communion',¹¹ we must remember that issues which were to become significant aspects of inculturation were not at that time even considered with regard to 'liturgical uniformity'. In the early twentieth century there was a well-established common ethos which was reflected in the fact that the official Prayer Books were characterized by relatively minor textual and rubrical differences. In other words, there was a unity in the English cultural roots of most Anglican provinces. This aspect of the inculturation issue was still very much in force at the time of the Lambeth Conference of 1948 at which the following resolution was affirmed: 'The Conference holds that the Book of Common Prayer has been, and is, so strong a bond of unity throughout the Anglican Communion that great care must be taken to ensure that revisions of the Book be in accordance with the doctrine and accepted liturgical worship of the Anglican Communion.'¹² The texts of Archbishop Cranmer still maintained a secure place on the horizon of Prayer Book reform. In retrospect the 1948 Lambeth Conference appears as the last gasp of a point of view which had operated and been uncritically accepted in the evolution of the BCP up until that time.

Likewise in the late eighteenth century when the independent young Episcopal Church in the then newly established United States of America authorized its first BCP, and in spite of its having incorporated into that Prayer Book a eucharistic prayer which was not that of the Church of England in structure

¹⁰ Paragraph 8, 'Down to Earth Worship', p. 12.

¹¹ Resolution 36.

¹² Resolution 78(a). See my essay, 'A Perspective on the Relation of the Prayer Book to Anglican Unity', in J. Neil Alexander (ed.), *With Ever Joyful Hearts: Essays on Liturgy and Music Honoring Marion J. Hatchett* (New York, 1999), pp. 321–32 (pp. 321–2).

or theology, it was claimed in the preface to that book that ‘this Church is far from intending to depart from the Church of England in any essential point of doctrine, discipline, or worship’.¹³ Can we see in this an early instance of what the British liturgist Phillip Tovey has named a Prayer Book myth? As Tovey observed in an oft-quoted passage in his book on inculturation: ‘Anglicans are only just beginning to realize that a Communion of one form of worship is in fact a myth which has never existed.’¹⁴

The word ‘myth’, however, must not be interpreted in a negative sense. In the history of Anglicanism the BCP has been an effective myth as a fundamental expression of Anglican identity, and has played an important role in the cohesion of the Communion throughout the world. No matter what local variations might be, whether in the official text or in local usage, the Prayer Book was the embodiment of Anglican unity in prayer. That mark of identity, however, from the middle of the twentieth century and in various ways throughout the Communion, has undergone a radical change.

Paul Gibson, the former Liturgical Officer of the Anglican Church of Canada, raised a question which is closely related to the citation from Phillip Tovey, asking, ‘Now that provincial and contemporary liturgies are replacing the Book of Common Prayer... what will hold Anglicanism together?’¹⁵ Gibson’s response to his question was to suggest that the real issue is that of authority and how it is understood to function in Anglicanism with regard to ecclesial unity. New issues have emerged quite apart from questions of Prayer Book conformity, issues about which leaders from around the Anglican world are sharply divided. Among them are how the teaching of Scripture is to be interpreted with regard to moral questions, the ordination of women, and the marriage of persons of the same sex. These questions have arisen in widely divergent cultural contexts, with the result that there is a crisis in the Communion as to how ecclesiastical authority can offer responses to them when they are viewed so differently in the various provinces and even within a single province. The differences with regard to moral issues are not, of course, limited to the Anglican Communion, nor even to religious institutions; they are a mirror to a world characterized by breathtaking diversity. Yet within the various Christian traditions, there are members who want their Church to take a clear and unequivocal position on one issue or another—a positive approach in some contexts, or a firmly negative one in others.

Gibson observed that the inherited Prayer Book tradition was under pressure from three important perspectives. He noted that, first, there are social realities with which we live today that the Prayer Book tradition has generally

¹³ Reprinted in the 1979 Book of Common Prayer of the United States of America, p. 11.

¹⁴ Phillip Tovey, *Inculturation: The Eucharist in Africa* (Nottingham, 1988), pp. 39–40.

¹⁵ Paul Gibson, ‘What is the Future Role of Liturgy in Anglican Unity?’ in Holeton (ed.), *Liturgical Inculturation in the Anglican Communion*, pp. 17–22 (p. 17).

ignored because it was imbued with the perspective of an elitist and ordered society. Second, ecumenical convergence is a major factor which impels us towards new models of corporate prayer and a deepened sense of the commonality of Christian prayer. Third, there is the impact of cultural pluralism not only upon our world but specifically upon our Anglican models of liturgical prayer. All three of these factors, he maintained, required that the Church look at its inherited liturgical traditions and bring needed insight to the various aspects of future liturgical developments. It is the third of these—liturgical inculturation in a world of unprecedented cultural pluralism—which has been our focus here. A single universal model for common prayer, even within one Christian tradition, is an impossible goal in our complex world.

Gibson maintained that the past cannot be our model. 'We cannot go back on developments in our view of the world and our responsibility within it; we cannot go back to a clerical ecclesiology; we cannot go back to the suppression of cultural distinctions; we cannot go back to the denial of the overwhelming creativity of the ecumenical experience. In short, we cannot go back.'¹⁶ If liturgical inculturation is as imperative as is claimed here, then it will require the incorporation of an unprecedented level of diversity into the Anglican liturgical horizon. It will mean an end of the BCP as we have known it, but not an end to the understanding of corporate prayer that Anglicanism has embodied for over four centuries in its liturgical tradition. If that heritage can no longer offer us definitive models for the liturgies of the future, it remains a treasury from which we may draw insight for the imperatives of our own time. To say this is to claim that what has been essential in that tradition has not been its 'Englishness', but rather its understanding of vernacular corporate prayer as *liturgy—as the work of the whole people of God*.

When Christians have worshipped in a particular pattern of prayer, in many cases for their entire lives, that pattern roots itself in a fundamental way into their experience of faith. This forms in them a dynamic of resistance to liturgical change which is completely understandable as a sign that their faith operates not only at a rational level but even more deeply at a visceral level. Embodied rituals have been integral to who they are. The praying of those liturgical forms Sunday after Sunday and year after year is a formative experience which at times has not been taken seriously enough by a certain type of liturgical reformer. This will mean that liturgical renewal must include an awareness that the liturgy always serves the payer life of God's people. Yet even in this service, the methods will vary since our congregations reflect the diversity of the human family.

While more radical experiments may be more appropriate at the periphery of the Church, where they will ultimately serve the larger Christian

¹⁶ Gibson, 'Future Role', p. 21.

community by expanding the horizon for liturgical development, the stable but not static focus of Christian liturgical prayer will be embodied in the primary place of Christian assembly on the day of the Lord's resurrection.

Liturgical development involves much more than merely the exchange of a traditional rite for a new form. By its nature, liturgical prayer is a rather conservative aspect of a person's practice of their faith. The expansion of the Anglican liturgical horizon which has been suggested here is thus also a pastoral issue which will unfold differently in different cultural contexts, and for which crucial pastoral and catechetical skills will be required of both lay and ordained liturgical leaders. Yet the imperatives which Paul Gibson has named require us to move forward in this work of liturgical renewal. Does such profound change indicate an end to the Reformed Catholicism which Anglicanism has embodied? Or will an authentic inculturation of Anglican ways of 'being Church' bring the strengths of that tradition into the common Christian experience to which the ecumenical movement has invited us? If so, then certainly our experience of corporate prayer will be one of the primary gifts which we shall bring to the table.

The Liturgical Movement has brought a profound challenge to all the liturgical Churches, not least to the Anglican Prayer Book tradition. The remarkable stability and unity which was characteristic of its historical evolution has given way, under the impact of cultural and social forces which have assumed a dominant place in modern society, to what many people experience as a disturbing instability. This is a profound development affecting all dimensions of human experience. Given the stability of Anglican inherited forms of liturgical prayer, it was inevitable that the tradition of corporate prayer would encounter disorienting challenges in this new world—challenges which also affect Anglican understanding of the unity of the Church. The inculturation of liturgical prayer which has been proposed here is based upon its significance as the embodiment of Christian faith.

The inculturation of the liturgical prayer in the Anglican tradition began, as we have suggested, with the extraordinary work of Thomas Cranmer with the cultural resources of his time. The challenge today is to accomplish this task in the very different cultural context of our multi-cultural world—but with the same goal: to unite Anglican voices in praise of God, the One to whom all prayer, whatever its cultural form, is offered.

SELECT BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Atta-Bafoe, Victor R. and Phillip Tovey, 'What Does Inculturation Mean?' in David R. Holeton (ed.), *Liturgical Inculturation in the Anglican Communion* (Nottingham, 1990), pp. 14–16.
- Chupungco, Anscar J., *Cultural Adaptation of the Liturgy* (New York, 1982).

- Chupungco, Anscar J., *Liturgies of the Future: The Process and Methods of Inculturation* (New York, 1989).
- Collins, Paul M., *Christian Initiation in India* (Burlington, VT, 2007).
- Gibson, Paul, 'What is the Future Role of Liturgy in Anglican Unity?' in David R. Holeton (ed.), *Liturgical Inculturation in the Anglican Communion* (Nottingham, 1990), pp. 17–22.
- Gitari, David (ed.), *Anglican Liturgical Inculturation in Africa: The Kanamai Statement* (Nottingham, 1994).
- Irvine, Christopher (ed.), *Anglican Liturgical Identity*. Papers from the Prague Meeting of the International Anglican Liturgical Consultation, 2005. Joint Liturgical Studies 65 (Norwich, 2008).
- Peters, Bosco, *The Anglican Eucharist in New Zealand, 1814–1989* (Nottingham, 1992).
- Puglisi, James F. (ed.), *Liturgical Renewal as a Way to Christian Unity* (Collegeville, MN, 2005).
- Tovey, Phillip, *Inculturation of Christian Worship: Exploring the Eucharist* (Burlington, VT, 2003).
- Tovey, Phillip, *Inculturation: The Eucharist in Africa* (Nottingham, 1988).
- Weil, Louis, 'A Perspective on the Relation of the Prayer Book to Anglican Unity', in J. Neil Alexander (ed.), *With Ever Joyful Hearts: Essays on Liturgy and Music Honoring Marion J. Hatchett* (New York, 1999), pp. 321–32.
- The York Statement, 'Down to Earth Worship'. First published in *Findings of the Third International Anglican Liturgical Consultation* (Nottingham, 1989), and subsequently reissued as 'The York Statement: Down to Earth Worship', in David R. Holeton (ed.), *Liturgical Inculturation in the Anglican Communion* (Nottingham, 1990), pp. 8–13.

An Exilic Church

The Episcopal Church of South Sudan and Sudan, 1899–2014

Jesse A. Zink

The wooden benches in the front rows of St Andrew's Episcopal Cathedral in Bor, South Sudan, have a simple marking on their side: 'ECS Zone 1 Parish'. ECS is the Episcopal Church of the Sudan, and Zone 1 refers to the zones in Kakuma, one of several refugee camps that became home for tens of thousands of southern Sudanese during the civil war that lasted from 1983 to 2005. That war is now over, and many people have returned home, bringing their belongings—and benches—with them. As in Kakuma, the benches in Bor hold some of the throngs of people that crowd into St Andrew's Cathedral every Sunday for worship.

The benches testify to a simple fact: Sudanese Anglicanism has been shaped by displacement. A half-century of Anglican mission engagement produced a Church that commanded the allegiance of a minority of Sudanese and struggled to stand on its own. The abrupt end of the mission period in 1964 coincided with the beginning of nearly a half-century of civil war that pitted southern Sudan against the Khartoum government and divided southerners against themselves. The wars displaced hundreds of thousands of southern Sudanese, disrupted and destroyed their traditional life, and left behind one of the poorest countries in the world. It was in the midst of these wars that Sudanese Anglicanism began to flourish. In displacement camps both within and outside the country, the Church took a central role in ministering to refugees and interpreting the experience of displacement, prompting Sudanese to look at Christianity afresh. More so than any other African Anglican Church, in Sudan and South Sudan Anglican identity is rooted in the experience of exile. It is in Anglican Christianity that many Sudanese have found the strength to persevere and endure two generations of war. Now, with the war

over, the Episcopal Church of South Sudan and Sudan (ECSSS) faces the challenge of finding new sources of Christian identity.

MISSION BEGINNINGS IN SOUTHERN SUDAN, 1899–1964

General Kitchener's defeat of the Mahdi's army in 1898 opened the way for missionaries, merchants, and a host of others to come to Khartoum under the aegis of joint Anglo-Egyptian rule known as the Condominium. Among these new arrivals was Llewellyn Gwynne of the Church Missionary Society (CMS), who arrived in Khartoum in 1899. Lord Cromer, the senior British official, was reluctant to allow Christian missionaries to proselytize in Muslim-dominated northern Sudan, fearing it could stir up religious feeling that was still latent after the overthrow of the *Mahdiyya*. Gwynne and a handful of others operated a medical clinic and school in Khartoum. But Cromer welcomed Christian mission in southern Sudan, a remote region that was only loosely controlled by the Condominium and where Islam had made few inroads. To prevent competition between denominations, he established separate spheres for the CMS, an American Presbyterian mission, and Catholic missionaries of the Verona Fathers.

Funding shortfalls and inexperience made the CMS relatively slow to establish itself in southern Sudan. But in 1906, a team of six missionaries—none with any previous international experience, and none older than thirty—established the first Anglican mission station in southern Sudan at Malek, a site on the east bank of the Nile River among the Dinka people not far from the government outpost of Bor. The Dinka (who know themselves as Jieng) were Nilotic agropastoralists, whose dispersed society and religion centred on their cattle. Foreigners had found them to be a 'proud' people, who were convinced that their way of life provided them the answers they needed to survive in the difficult environment. In the generations prior to the CMS's arrival, Turkish slave-traders, European ivory merchants, and the Mahdi's army had all had varying degrees of impact on the Dinka, but the Dinka had outlasted all of them, leaving them suspicious of outsiders and convinced of the superiority of their way of life. Condominium policy in the first two decades centred on brutally 'pacifying' the Dinka and other southern Sudanese, which compounded the suspicion.

The missionaries offered an Evangelical piety focused on individual conversion and eternal salvation, a contrast with the approach to religion in Dinka culture that was both communal and had little understanding of life after death. Like other missions in sub-Saharan Africa, the CMS strategy was to attract Dinka to the station through a combination of education and health

care, and then use these encounters as opportunities for evangelism. But the CMS struggled to maintain its dispensary, and the Dinka saw little need for the education the CMS offered. Even if they did, older Dinka were unlikely to heed the religious innovations of any children who did convert while at school. Condominium officials were reluctant to permit the missionaries to travel far beyond the station, fearing for their safety in a region where the Condominium's writ would remain weak for several decades more. Although the Dinka were one of the largest people groups in southern Sudan, shortly after their arrival the members of the Malek mission found themselves reduced to the few thousand Dinka within easy distance of their station, none, seemingly, interested in the mission. By 1909, a combination of illness and requests for transfer to more productive missions meant the initial team of six had dwindled to one, Archibald Shaw. The mission teetered on the edge of extinction. There was no church and no Dinka Christians.

Shaw's attention was soon captured by the Lado Enclave, a region that bordered Congo and was to revert to British control upon the death of King Leopold of Belgium. Shaw was determined to forestall Catholic 'control' of the area and implored his superiors for more resources to establish new stations in the region. A station was opened at Yambio in 1913 among the Zande people. By 1917, missionaries reported that at Yambio, there were 'thirty Catechumens and nineteen Enquirers. . . . Among those who live on the Mission Stations, readiness to learn is as marked in the case of the Azande as it is absent in that of the Jieng [Dinka].'¹ Shaw had conducted the first baptism at Malek only in 1916, a decade after the station opened. The school had a handful of students and struggled to remain open. To the missionaries, the Dinka was 'completely satisfied with himself and his attainments, and with no apparent wish for, or interest in, anything higher'. Zande, by contrast, were 'a go-ahead race, anxious to become civilized'.²

These dynamics established in the first decade of the CMS mission remained largely in place until the 1950s. The CMS was strongest and found the most receptive audience among the peoples of the Equatoria region, the far southern part of Sudan that borders Congo and Uganda. Meanwhile, work among the Dinka languished. The CMS continued to open stations in Equatoria—at Yei, Lui, Juba, Maridi, and Kajo-Kaji—before opening another Dinka station, at Akot, in 1929. A 1925 fundraising publication exhaustively detailing the work of the Sudan mission does not use the word Dinka once, or mention Malek.³ The work in Equatoria was the more promising story.

¹ C. A. Lea-Wilson and A. G. King joint report of Gordon Memorial Sudan Mission (GMSM), 1917, CMS Archives G3/S/O/1916–1919, University of Birmingham, UK.

² CMS, *Among the Pagans of the Southern Sudan* (London, 1922), pp. 6, 9.

³ Diocese of Egypt and Sudan, *Our Church's Work for the People of the Sudan* (Khartoum, 1925).

It was a constant struggle for the CMS to maintain its mission triad of education, health care, and evangelism. There was an impressive hospital in Lui, but otherwise the medical work was concentrated in limited dispensaries. Education remained central to its work, but only because of the support provided by the Condominium, which invested few resources in southern governance and virtually none in education until the 1940s. Instead, the Condominium subsidized the missions to run schools in its place. The CMS came to rely heavily on these subsidies, which allowed the Condominium to dictate where the CMS would open its stations. Unlike the Verona Fathers mission, which showed a deliberate strategy in the placing of missions, the placement of CMS stations by the late 1930s showed no such coherence, other than the Condominium's desire to 'enlist inexpensive European auxiliaries' for the work of managing southern Sudan.⁴

Although its dependence on the Condominium provoked debate among missionaries, the CMS accepted the arrangement. A network of village schools around each mission station fed students into a primary school on the station. Indigenous evangelists were trained at government-funded teacher training institutes and sent to villages where they were expected not only to teach, but also to preach and prepare students for baptism. A major part of this preparation was literacy education, as CMS policy essentially required a person be able to read the Bible before baptism. These young Christians, missionaries hoped, would return to their homes as Christian evangelists and so convert their elders and build the Church. It was an emphasis that dovetailed with the Condominium's own policies. Officials were looking for educated leaders through whom they could control the south. If such education also made them Christian, both the CMS and the Condominium had reason to be satisfied. Both the Condominium and the CMS emphasized educating boys, which meant that as the Church grew in southern Sudan it was primarily male. The CMS recognized that women struggled to meet the literacy requirement for baptism, and that the corresponding lack of women in the Church was a problem in that new male converts struggled to find Christian wives. Nonetheless, efforts in women's education always lagged.

The CMS's continual financial difficulties meant it often had far more educationalist missionaries than pastoral ones. Its personnel for direct evangelism and the running of churches was always limited. As in many other contexts in sub-Saharan Africa, the true work of transmitting the Christian message was left in the hands of the lay evangelists who ran village schools and parish out-stations. Beginning in the late 1930s, the CMS began to emphasize indigenous ordained leadership as well. The first ordinations were in 1940, when Anderia Apaya and Daniel Deng Atong were ordained deacons. Both

⁴ Lillian Passmore Sanderson and Neville Sanderson, *Education, Religion & Politics in Southern Sudan 1899-1964* (London, 1981), p. 189.

were former houseboys of missionaries, whom the missionaries had taken a special interest in and ensured they were raised in the Church. A training college for ministerial candidates was founded in Yei. It was moved to Mundri in 1947 and named after Bishop Gwynne. By 1954, all four southern deaneries had Sudanese clergy in charge, and in 1955 Daniel Deng Atong was consecrated the first Sudanese bishop.

CMS policy emphasized the importance of vernacular languages, which meant that Anglicanism in southern Sudan developed along several distinct paths simultaneously. Missionaries and some educated southerners worked on translating the Bible, Prayer Book, and other resources into six major vernacular languages. The differential pace of this work meant that some people groups in Sudan had more resources than others. The unity in the Church was through the clergy, all of whom, as school graduates, spoke English. Laypeople remained distant from one another. The impact of the vernacular emphasis was most notable in a 1939 revival in western Equatoria. Shortly after his arrival in Yambio, CMS missionary Richard Jones began confronting teachers and calling, inaccurately, the Christian community a ‘sink of iniquity and a haunt of drunkards and adulterers’.⁵ Teachers and other Christians were called to repentance and new life. Jones left Sudan after only three months, but the influence of the revival was significant, particularly among the Zande and Moru.⁶ One or two Dinka teachers sought to share the revival message with their people, and for a brief period the Church swelled in size at the Akot mission station. But among the Dinka the growth quickly receded. Later, cross-border movement between Uganda and southern Sudan brought the influence of the East African Revival—from which the Jones movement was separate—as far as some Bari-speaking people in central Equatoria but no further.⁷

The differential growth of the Church was clear by the end of the Second World War. In 1946 missionaries articulated two goals to focus their effort: training Sudanese for ministry and ‘pioneer evangelism’ among Dinka and other Nilotic peoples. The Church in Equatoria was left almost entirely in the hands of indigenous pastors. The shift in focus came at a time when some Dinka were beginning to understand the importance of education in the new dispensation that was emerging in Sudan. Still, the new focus of the CMS failed to generate widespread movement towards Christianity. Dinka students who were baptized during the course of their studies often found jobs in the Condominium government. As a result, they did not return to their home

⁵ Abe Enosa, ‘Revival in the Episcopal Church of the Sudan’, in Samuel E. Kayanga and Andrew C. Wheeler (eds.), *“But God is Not Defeated!” Celebrating the Centenary of The Episcopal Church of the Sudan, 1899–1999* (Nairobi, 1999), p. 132.

⁶ Andrew Wheeler, ‘Richard Jones and the Sudan Revival of 1938’, *Anglican and Episcopal History*, 71 (2002): 168–86.

⁷ Abe Enosa, *The East African Revival Movement Among the Kakwa in Sudan* (Nairobi, n.d.).

villages as evangelists, as the CMS hoped. Those who did not finish school often became disillusioned, neither returning home nor finding work but becoming part of a growing group of what Morris Gelsthorpe, a missionary bishop, called 'nothing less than detribalized moral casualties'.⁸ The Dinka Christianity that was developing was isolated and separate from the villages and cattle camps that were central to Dinka existence.

In the late 1950s, as the mission period came to a close, a half-century of sustained Anglican mission in southern Sudan had produced mixed results. On the one hand, Bishops Oliver Allison and Daniel Deng Atong could report ever-increasing numbers of confirmations—in places, hundreds at a time and thousands in a year. But their concentration was significant. In 1960, Allison did 4,028 confirmations on a single tour, but over half were Zande, more than a quarter Bari-speaking, and only 329 Dinka, nearly the same as the Moru, a much smaller ethnicity. Distribution of village churches told a similar story. In 1959, there were 500 village churches and out-schools surrounding the various stations in Equatoria, and only 25 in the Nilotic Bahr el Ghazal.⁹ It was these village churches which laid the groundwork for future parishes, and their concentration said much about the strength of the Church. In 1961, the geographically vast Dinka deanery had the same number of Sudanese clergy—six—as the much smaller Zande deanery and fewer than the even smaller Bari deanery.¹⁰ In 1964, the independent government of Sudan expelled all foreign missionaries. The news disappointed the CMS, but at that point they had barely a dozen missionaries in the country, compared to more than 200 Catholics. The expatriate Anglican missionaries were in a support role. Pastoral and evangelism work was in the hands of Sudanese clergy and laypeople. However, in parts of southern Sudan, an indigenous Church was beginning to take root.

DISPLACED BY WAR, 1955–83

Independent Sudan had a rocky beginning. In 1955—prior to formal independence—a mutiny that began in Torit in southern Sudan revealed the fraught nature of relations between Khartoum and the south. The Condominium had concentrated its energy and resources on the north. As a result, northerners were relatively well educated and economically self-sustaining. As the Condominium pursued a policy of 'Sudanization', an overwhelming

⁸ Morris Gelsthorpe, letter to friends, 11 Feb. 1942, CMS Archives AF/35/59/G3/S1/sub-file 3/1940–1943.

⁹ Oliver Allison, 'The Bishop's Letter', *Sudan Diocesan Review* [SDR], 13.36 (1960), p. 5.

¹⁰ Oliver Allison, 'The Bishop's Letter', *SDR*, 14.40 (1961), p. 9.

number of government positions went to northerners; southerners' lack of education left them excluded from decision-making. Religious and cultural differences exacerbated these divisions.

By the early 1960s, parts of the south were in open rebellion against the Khartoum government. The Anya-nya rebel movement drew its primary support from Equatorians, and the government army concentrated its reprisals in the region. The Church was not immune from the war. In 1965, Yeremaya Dotiro, recently consecrated as an assistant bishop for the south, reported that the number of confirmations he was able to do on tours of the region had fallen off sharply. Some parishes were deserted, and others were barely functioning. 'The reason for there being so few Christians present was because many people had left their homes and disappeared, and others had been killed. There are few prayer centres in Yei Parish which are now at work, as so many parts have been deserted.'¹¹ Bishop Gwynne College, the training centre, was destroyed by the government army in 1965. Later that year, Dotiro and the other Sudanese bishop, Elinana Ngalamu, were forced to flee the country for their safety, eventually arriving at the home of Archbishop Leslie Brown of Uganda. Brown wrote to diocesan bishop, Oliver Allison, who had been allowed to stay on in Khartoum, to inform him his assistants were still alive and had come bearing exercise books that listed which parishes still had a building, vicarage, communion vessels, and bibles. 'They had ticked in the columns everything which remained intact in each parish. As each man handed me his paper and showed me the scale of almost complete devastation, I saw there were four or five ticks only. In every other case all had been destroyed or looted and the Christian people had been scattered with the coming of the Sudanese army.'¹²

Dotiro and Ngalamu were two of the tens of thousands of southerners who were displaced by the war. Some were displaced externally to refugee camps in Uganda, Congo, and the Central African Republic. In the midst of the strain of refugee life, the Church reconstituted itself, assigning pastors to the refugee camps and, as much as possible, continuing sacramental life. Dotiro reported 1,300 confirmations in Congo in 1968.¹³ The well-established Anglican Church in Uganda supported Sudanese Christians and made for a strong Anglican presence in refugee camps. By contrast, the Sudanese Church had only tenuous links with refugees in the Central African Republic, who were difficult to reach. Wherever they were, the refugee camps became places in which Christian adherence grew rapidly. A Sudanese pastor in a camp in Congo wrote to Bishop Allison that 'God is doing wonderful things among the people here. Many who were not previously worshippers have become true

¹¹ 'Items of News from the Rt. Rev. Yeremaya K. Dotiro', *SDR*, 18.51 (1965), p. 9.

¹² Quoted in Oliver Allison, *Through Fire and Water* (London, 1976), p. 14.

¹³ Reported in Patrick Blair, 'The Provost's Report', *SDR*, 20.60 (1969), p. 11.

worshippers. The Refugee years have proved a blessing to many who are coming to the Lord's side.¹⁴

A far greater number of southerners remained in Sudan during the war, but were displaced nonetheless. Whole communities left towns and villages along the roads and sought safety deeper into the bush. Here, too, the Church was present. Stories began to trickle back to Church leaders about new village churches that were being established among the displaced. A Moru pastor reported to Allison that he thought he had done 10,000 baptisms during the course of his itinerant ministry in the war. 'Do not be sad for us', the pastor wrote to Allison, 'we are still going on with our work, and the Church is still growing in this area. We have no leader or bishops to help us but here we have our great Bishop. He is leading us in the great difficulties of our work.' Another Moru pastor visited Allison and listed 102 new preaching centres that had been established in his parish during the war.¹⁵

The wartime transformation of the Church in southern Sudan was paralleled by a changing Church in the north. An original purpose of the CMS mission had been to proselytize Muslims, though this was stymied by the Condominium. As a result, the Church in the north was primarily a chaplaincy to British expatriates. As early as the 1940s, however, Church leaders noticed that southerners were coming to Khartoum and other northern cities in an incipient process of labour migration. The movement intensified in the early 1960s when a variety of factors began to induce some of the previously isolated Dinka and other Nilotic peoples to migrate. The growing numbers of southerners in the north filled the CMS with the hope that these southerners would be able to evangelize Muslims. Even if Muslims could not be converted, there was a gradual awareness that ministry in the north was moving away from being a chaplaincy. At the 1958 synod in Khartoum, an archdeacon noted there were over 300,000 southerners in the cities of the north and 'challenged the members from the South to see the need for helping the Church in the North to witness to these increasing numbers of Southerners'.¹⁶ By 1963, there were two southern Sudanese priests working in the northern archdeaconry.

The ministry in the north had a dual focus on evangelism and education. The latter was particularly important. In a foreign context, Nilotic young men were realizing the importance of education, and finding it in evening classes run by churches. But it was not only education they found in these clubs. In the midst of the Muslim-dominated north, they found in the clubs a place 'where they could speak their vernacular language, sing in their own idioms

¹⁴ Quoted in Oliver Allison, 'The Bishop's Letter', *SDR*, 19.59 (1968), p. 6.

¹⁵ Allison, *Through Fire and Water*, pp. 20-2.

¹⁶ 'Snapshots of the Episcopal Church in the Sudan', *SDR*, 11.32 (1958), p. 20.

and so affirm, or assert, their identity in an alien environment'.¹⁷ When the Dinka congregation in Khartoum began in 1966, it had ten people; by 1983, there were more than 500 people at its main service, and thousands more who were connected through prayer centres and out-stations in other parts of the urban area.¹⁸ Like conversion movements elsewhere in sub-Saharan Africa, it was young people at the forefront of the change. A foreign visitor reported a conversation with one of the clergy in the Dinka congregation, who said with a downcast look, 'We have a problem. We have failed completely to get old people into church.'¹⁹ Evangelism became a primary focus of these new Christians. The congregation organized periodic door-to-door evangelism campaigns. In the 1950s, CMS missionaries among the Dinka had despaired that there would ever be a church that could reach out to non-Christians. Now, in Khartoum, that very thing was happening—after the missionaries had left and without significant expatriate involvement.

The 1972 Addis Ababa Peace Agreement ended the civil war, established a regional government for the south, and brought about a decade of relative calm. In an indication of the legacy of the mission period, eight of the first eleven members of the regional government's executive council were graduates of the CMS's intermediate school. The Church used the period to establish new institutions to cope with the recent growth. In 1976, the single diocese of Sudan divided into four and was launched as the Episcopal Church of the Sudan, an independent province of the Anglican Communion. Bishop Allison retired and Ngalamu became the first archbishop. But the truth was that a *de facto* indigenous hierarchy had existed for at least a decade prior. Although Allison had been able to maintain sporadic contact with clergy in the south during the war, his movement was restricted to towns and cities and he was unable to exercise any meaningful oversight of the Church among the displaced.

As had been true during the mission period, the Church had developed in different fashions among different peoples of the south. There was no mistaking the new significance of the Church among Equatorians. Prior to the war, Christian commitment had not commanded a majority of the people. Now, it was clear, it did. No single factor was responsible for this growth. Rather, the war brought together a variety of reasons. First, Christianity gave these southerners the means to interpret their experience. A picture of refugees returning to Sudan shows them carrying a banner with a quotation from Jeremiah: 'Then I shall gather the remnant of my flock out of all the countries

¹⁷ Marc Nikkel, 'Aspects of Contemporary Religious Change among the Dinka', *Journal of Religion in Africa*, 22 (1992): 78–94 (p. 80).

¹⁸ 'Dinka Congregation—Khartoum: Annual Report for 1983', University of Durham?, Sudan Archive Durham (SAD), 812/9/15.

¹⁹ Reported by Bishop John Baker of Salisbury in *Sudan Church Review* [SCR], 9.29 (1984), p. 5.

where I have driven them. The returnees.²⁰ Biblical narratives and the experience of southerners came to be seen as closely aligned. But it also seems that many Equatorians were attracted to Christianity because of the new resources available through the faith. The war had demonstrated the need for additional power to ensure a community's continued existence. The link between education and Christianity meant that as many people sought the power of education they also turned to Christianity.

Rebuilding the Church became one of the first tasks of the returnees. On his last tour of the south, Bishop Allison saw children in Church-run schools under trees and congregations that overflowed out of the mud and thatch churches. The most vivid impression, he wrote, was 'of a deeper spiritual life in the Church... at least partly due to the experience of suffering and hardship courageously endured over the past ten years'.²¹ Notwithstanding the growth in Christian adherence, the war had also done significant damage to the Church. Prior to the war among Equatorians, the CMS had been largely successful in ensuring an area could support its clergy before it was formally established as a parish. But the war destroyed this system of self-support, forcing parishes to look to the diocese for additional funds. This, in turn, meant the diocese launched the first of several international appeals for aid, a process that has continued to this day.

The situation was different among the Nilotic Dinka. There was a growing Church in the cities of the north, and some of these new Christians were returning home. In many cases, they were met with confusion or dismissed as crazy. For Dinka in rural villages and cattle camps Christianity was still something that was associated with towns and education. Older Dinka, many of whom had been isolated from the war, continued to resist the religious innovations of their young people and were not convinced of the new resources available in the faith. As the decade of relative peace came to an end in 1983, there were only a handful of churches among the Dinka on the east bank of the Nile where the CMS had first begun its work. One archdeacon, in reflecting on this period in 1991, recalled that the Dinka churches 'were only along the road and they were not inside, in the villages. And they did not take in the chiefs and elders'.²² The difference was apparent in the distribution of clergy as well. Bishop Benjamina Yugusuk of Rumbek could report that in his Moru archdeaconry, there were 39 pastors, 41 lay readers, and 40 commissioned women workers. In the distant Dinka archdeaconry centred on Bor, by contrast, there were only eight pastors.²³ Christianity in southern Sudan

²⁰ The picture appears in several sources and is mentioned in Allison, *Through Fire and Water*, pp. 81–2.

²¹ Oliver Allison, 'Bishop's Letter', *SDR*, 24.70 (1974), p. 10.

²² Interview with Abraham Mayom Athian conducted by Marc Nikkel, Sept. 1991, New Sudan Council of Churches [NSCC] Archive.

²³ *SCR*, 9.29 (1984), p. 11.

continued to develop along individual and unique paths, shaped by the different conditions and contexts in which each people group lived.

DINKA REVIVAL IN SOUTHERN SUDAN, 1983–2005

Regional tensions led to Sudan's second civil war, which began in May 1983 with an army mutiny at a barracks outside Bor, a few miles from where CMS missionaries had founded their first station. Rebels gathered in south-western Ethiopia and, under the leadership of a Dinka, John Garang, formed the Sudan People's Liberation Army (SPLA). Like the first one, the second civil war had a major impact on the Church. Unlike the first war, however, the burden of the displacement in the second war fell most heavily on the Nilotic peoples, the Dinka in particular. The displacement came in multiple forms. Southern towns turned into garrisons for the Sudan armed forces and many Dinka living in them fled. The violence of the war and the policies of the SPLA drove many people into exile in refugee camps in south-western Ethiopia. Many others fled violence and famine and sought refuge in Khartoum and other cities in northern Sudan. Still others were internally displaced and sought safety farther from the road system and in more remote villages.

Dinka living in towns at the outbreak of the war were disproportionately educated compared with their rural counterparts and Christian. When they fled, they often returned to their home village, creating the first sustained encounter between Christian and non-Christian Dinka in locations that were central to Dinka life. As one archdeacon recalled: '[People listened] because they are their own people. Before they [had] said that he was . . . the God of the students. But nobody [had] taught them starting from their own cultures.'²⁴ The primary communicators of the Christian message were displaced lay-people who brought the insights of their faith to bear on the new situations which the Dinka confronted in the war. They found a particularly receptive audience in young people, who were attracted by the novelty of Christianity and the social connections it afforded them. As one young convert from the 1980s remembered, 'the activities in the church were new. So we were excited to dance as a Sunday School . . . That's why many kids went to the church and played. They didn't go for the prayers, but they just go for the entertainment during the dancing of Sunday School.'²⁵ But many others were praying. As he travelled among Dinka, Bishop Nathaniel Garang Anyieth found something

²⁴ Interview with Abraham Mayom Athian conducted by Marc Nikkel, Sept. 1991, NSCC Archive.

²⁵ Interview with James Nhial Maler by author, Bor, South Sudan, 6 Apr. 2013.

that had rarely been seen in the past: ‘now you find [young] people praying in the [cattle] camp. They go to that [cattle] camp and then make their prayers.’²⁶

Christianity also offered a new opening to many women. Traditional Dinka life left many women confined to their homes. Religious ceremony brought them together, but only in a limited and sporadic way. Christian worship changed this by providing regular avenues for women to socialize at church services. Women—and men—were drawn to the Church’s emphasis on healing prayer. As the war curtailed access to bio-medical healing, Christian healing prayer came to be seen as efficacious. Christians were turned to with increasing frequency to offer prayers for healing for the sick. Women were particularly drawn to this healing prayer and many women, in turn, became some of the most significant evangelists of the Church. Mary Aruay Majak, an unmarried, childless woman became the key figure in the growth of the Church in her home region north of the town of Rumbek. Before the war began, she had trouble interesting people in Christianity. But once the war started, the situation changed. In particular, people came to believe that Christians were being protected in the war. She recalled that non-Christians would say, ‘OK, if those parts of Christians, if they are safe, why don’t we believe in God such that we will ask God for protection?’²⁷

A 1991 report from the diocese of Bor—its first attempt since the outbreak of the war to document the growth of the Church—listed 62 male clergy, 72 male evangelists, but 30 Mothers’ Union staff and 101 ‘Women Workers with Badges’, that is, commissioned women in the Church.²⁸ It is important not to overstate the authority of women—women could not be ordained in the Episcopal Church of the Sudan until the early 2000s—but the numbers are a striking contrast to the dominance of traditional religious leadership by men.

To become Christian, converts had to destroy the items in their homes that represented their *jak*, the local deities of the traditional religion. Dinka historically had a complex and varied relationship with these divinities, seeing some as protective, and others as destructive who needed propitiation to be kept on side. As the war intensified, however, the latter view came to predominate. Rather than protecting believers, Christians believed the *jak* were now undermining Dinka welfare and failing to protect them from the war. But destroying the shrines did not mean the *jak* ceased to exist. Rather, the destruction of the shrines was believed to enrage the *jak* and invite their retribution. The only protection was the power of the Holy Spirit made known in baptism. To become Christian, Dinka had to repudiate their belief in the efficacy of the *jak*, but not repudiate the belief that the *jak* actually did exist.

²⁶ Interview with Nathaniel Garang Anyieth by Marc Nikkel, London, England, Mar. 1990, NSCC Archive.

²⁷ Interview with Mary Aruay Majak by author, Rumbek, South Sudan, 13 Sept. 2013.

²⁸ Nathaniel Garang Anyieth, ‘Diocese of Bor 1991 Report’, NSCC Archive.

Although conversion happened through lay evangelists, the Church hierarchy stayed closely involved. The war forced Bishop Nathaniel Garang Anyieth to flee Bor in 1984. He went to live in the rural areas where he had no contact with the outside world until late 1989. But he persisted in itinerant evangelism in areas that were controlled by the SPLA. Across the Nile River around Rumbek a key leader was Rueben Maciir Makoi, who had worked with the Khartoum Dinka congregations in the 1960s and 1970s. He was asked to become bishop of the area around Rumbek in 1988 but refused because being consecrated would have meant leaving his people, and he was unsure when or if he would be able to return. It was not until 1995 that he was finally able to travel to Nairobi for consecration.

Garang and Maciir were contrasting figures. Although Garang had been educated at Malek mission school in the 1950s, a major influence on his religious formation was his time at a Pentecostal college in Nairobi in the 1970s. Maciir, by contrast, represented continuity with the CMS. He had been educated at a teacher training college and Bishop Gwynne College in the 1950s and was ordained in 1961. He had a deep sense of the wider Anglican tradition to which the growing Church belonged. Both men, however, shared the determination to see Christianity flourish among their people.

One of the most significant figures in the conversion movement had little connection to the Church hierarchy. When the war began, Kon Ajith was the farthest thing from the then-dominant stereotype of a Dinka Christian.²⁹ He was not educated, could neither read nor write, and tended to his cattle in a cattle camp. He was, in other words, a traditional Dinka man—and not a Christian. In 1986, however, after a series of disturbing dreams and reports of miraculous activity, he was baptized by Nathaniel Garang and began an itinerant preaching ministry that ranged widely across Dinka territory. His messages were consistent. The Dinka had disobeyed God by worshipping *jak*. They needed to destroy their *jak* and be baptized; if not, God would punish them. Kon also began working on a major new church at a cattle camp called Pakeo. He named the church Zion, a reference to a passage in Isaiah 18—a chapter many Dinka believe refers to them and predicts the civil war—that says people will offer their gifts and worship God at Zion. The church was in the shape of a cross with an entrance at each of the four ends. The church needed multiple entrances, Kon said, because it would draw people from all ethnic groups and from all points of the compass. It was a message of inter-ethnic harmony at a time when the war was creating significant tensions and violence between the peoples of southern Sudan.

²⁹ Kon Ajith presents particular historiographic challenges because no contemporaneous written documentation of his activities has survived the war. What follows has been reconstructed from extensive interviews with people who worked with him, as well as the brief summaries in the *Faith in Sudan* series and elsewhere.

Kon Ajith's message had a mixed reception. At first, many ECS clergy suspected his message and his method. He marched around beating a drum, carrying a flag, and wrapped only in a blanket, if he was wearing anything at all. Kon took his message directly to the SPLA, asking for their support in collecting *jak* from the region and destroying them. He was largely rebuffed and dismissed. But in 1991, Nuer forces from a breakaway SPLA faction turned on Dinka civilians on the east bank of the Nile, inflicting catastrophic devastation in an event remembered as the Bor Massacre. Many Dinka interpreted the destruction as the fulfilment of Kon's prophesying and so sought baptism. The defeat also changed the minds of SPLA leaders. The SPLA soldiers cooperated in seizing *jak* and gathering the items at Pakeo. Rumours of the activity reached the garrison of the Sudan armed forces in Bor. On 26 December 1992, a force from Bor sought out and killed Kon. Since Nathaniel Garang and many clergy had been forced to flee the east bank after the Bor Massacre, the most senior Episcopal clergyman left was John Kelei. The SPLA promised protection to Kelei and on 6 February 1993 Kelei presided over a mass burning of the *jak* that had been collected, nearly 3,000 in total. Kelei told the crowd that had gathered: 'Let us put our fire on these symbols here. But the real *jak*, God will send fire on them and will burn them there [i.e. heaven].'³⁰ The *jak* were real, but they were no longer trustworthy. The Dinka were putting their faith in God as revealed in Jesus Christ.

The rapid growth of the Church was not uniform or consistent. At first, for instance, many older men resisted Christianity and sought to prevent their children and wives from converting. Still, by the early 1990s it was clear that there was significant growth, so significant that it was overwhelming the available number of clergy. By 1991, there were about 75 pastors, most of whom 'were ordained without full bible [*sic*] school training'.³¹ In an effort to address this problem, Ruben Maciir created Dhiaukuei, a Dinka village that became a centre for education. Dhiaukuei was far from the road system and so safe from potential attack by northern forces. Dinka Christians would gather for training courses during the dry season in January to March and be taught basic literacy, as well as Bible, evangelism, and other skills. The connection between education and Christianity dated to the mission period. The destruction of the war, however, meant that many Dinka of all ages now saw education as a powerful tool and eagerly sought to gain what knowledge they could.

However, the educational effort at Dhiaukuei was crippled by a profound lack of resources. There were virtually no books and teachers used dried cow hides and cassava in place of blackboards and chalk. As a result, Dhiaukuei's

³⁰ Interview with John Kelei by author, Bor, South Sudan, 16 Apr. 2013.

³¹ Diocese of Bor, 'Project Proposal: C.M.S. Bible Institute, Malek, 1992 Programme' (10 Dec. 1991), NSCC Archive.

primary importance was that it became a central gathering point for Christians on the west bank of the Nile River. Large Christmas celebrations were held there, which invigorated Christians and connected them to a larger community. When archbishop of Canterbury George Carey visited Dhiaukuei in early 1994 he reflected that ‘the people have no social structure left except the Church’.³² The comparative strength of the Church in the midst of societal breakdown and the new resources available in it encouraged people to convert.

REVIVAL AND REFUGEES

Most Dinka who were displaced during the second civil war remained in southern Sudan. But the war also forced hundreds of thousands of Dinka and others to flee first to refugee camps in Ethiopia and then to camps in Uganda, Kenya, and elsewhere. Among the refugees was a large group of young boys who had fled the violence of the war or been recruited by the SPLA. This group became known as ‘unaccompanied minors’ and although the group was a small minority of the hundreds of thousands of refugees, they garnered disproportionate international attention, eventually becoming known as ‘The Lost Boys of Sudan’. They also became a key part of the growing Dinka Church.

Although several international organizations were active in the refugee camps in south-western Ethiopia, the camps were not far from SPLA training camps, which meant that the rebel movement, in concert with the Ethiopian government, had effective control over the area. The refugees became prime targets for military recruitment—indeed, this is why many had been directed to Ethiopia in the first place. The training was brutal and resulted in an atmosphere that was ‘characterised by general fear, apathy, indifference and self-insurance’.³³ Separated from their families and traditional upbringing, the ‘unaccompanied minors’ were trained in a way that was designed to destroy any mediating structures of community. But as the SPLA broke down social networks, the Church emerged as a counterweight. Some of the young people who ended up in the Ethiopian camps had converted to Christianity before leaving southern Sudan and began to evangelize their peers. As one former refugee recalled of these evangelists: ‘They organize[d] rallies in the evening. They [taught] songs. They [taught] the Bible. And most of the people get acquainted with [Christianity].’³⁴ The evangelism led to the development of

³² James M. Rosenthal, ‘Forgotten Sudan: A Pastoral Visit’, *Anglican World*, 73 (1994): 15–18.

³³ Peter Adwok Nyaba, *Politics of Liberation in South Sudan: An Insider’s View* (Kampala, 1997), p. 67.

³⁴ Interview with Daniel Kon Malwal by author, Bor, South Sudan, 5 Apr. 2013.

prayer centres in different parts of the camp. Clergy leaders would train senior children to lead worship and teach the Bible.

The other factor influencing Christian conversion was the close relationship between education and Christianity. While some minors went to Ethiopia fleeing the violence of war, others had been drawn or sent to Ethiopia with the promise of education. As in Dhiaukuei and elsewhere, however, the resources for education were few. The primary educational tool was the Bible. The dynamic in the camps was the same as what had been established by European missionaries—education was linked to conversion—only now the Dinka youth were eager for education, instead of suspicious of it. Education became ‘virtually inseparable’ from membership in the Church because of the legacy of the missionary movement.³⁵

The new Christian energy among the Dinka was expressed in hymn-writing. Song composition had long been central to Dinka culture. Now, as Dinka adopted Christianity, they turned to hymns to express their theology.³⁶ One hymn put voice to the experience of exile: ‘We suffer in the wilderness, we suffer in the forest without homes, enduring thirst and hunger.’ Hymns also became an important evangelistic tool. As one priest recalled: ‘spiritual songs which quote the Bible cement in what the evangelist says. The sermon happens but then the song makes it stay.’³⁷ Writing and sharing hymns became a major activity of Church members and the hymns became the primary form of Christian catechesis. The result of this primary lay evangelical activity is that when Episcopal priest Andrew Mayol Ajak arrived in one of the refugee camps in 1988 he found thousands of young people who had been prepared for baptism, and were waiting for a priest to administer the rite. Shortly after he arrived, Mayol baptized 1,601 people in two days.³⁸ It was part of widespread Church growth in the refugee camps. As one leader wrote to a friend, ‘Our Lord Jesus is recreating his work in the refugee camps . . . there are many big churches in which one can accommodate over three thousand people.’³⁹

In addition to the handful of Anglican clergy, Presbyterian, Catholic, and other clergy were also active in the refugee camps, and worked closely together. Occasionally, this made itself known in unusual ways. In 1989, Episcopal leaders in one of the camps asked Nathaniel Garang to come and

³⁵ African Rights, *Food and Power in Sudan: A Critique of Humanitarianism* (London, 1997), p. 80.

³⁶ Quoted in Marc Nikkel, ‘Songs of Hope and Lamentation from Sudan’s “Unaccompanied Minors”’, *Sewanee Theological Review*, 40 (1997): 486–98 (p. 490).

³⁷ Interview with Andrew Mayol Ajak by author, Juba, South Sudan, 25 Apr. 2013.

³⁸ This mass baptism service is widely remembered and there are several accounts given of how many people were baptized, with numbers ranging up to 12,000. The number given here is that reported by Andrew Mayol Ajak in a letter written shortly after the baptisms and independently confirmed in an interview with him on 25 Apr. 2013 in Juba.

³⁹ Letter of Abraham Mayom Athiang to Marc Nikkel, 13 June 1989, NSCC Archive.

ordain Peter Bol Arok, a layman who had been trained for ministry but never ordained. Garang replied that he was unable to travel to Ethiopia but that Bol Arok should be ordained by a Presbyterian moderator who was in the camps. He was duly ordained—with no thought of apostolic succession—and became a senior pastor of one of the new Anglican congregations.⁴⁰

When the Ethiopian government was overthrown in 1991 and the refugees expelled, some returned to their homes or joined camps for internally displaced people in southern Sudan. But many ended up in a new network of camps in Uganda and Kenya. A focal point for the Church's energy became Kakuma, a refugee camp in an arid section of north-western Kenya that was founded in 1992. Kakuma was more a stable environment than Ethiopia had been and that stability proved beneficial to the Church. Before long, each of the zones into which Kakuma was divided had a central church, often just an open-air meeting place. On Sundays, people began arriving before dawn to reserve a place for themselves in the overflowing services. In 1993 Bishop Nathaniel Garang confirmed several thousand people in a service that stretched over several days. Christianity was becoming a more central part of Dinka life and new Christians were now willing—even eager—to make an adult affirmation of faith. Beyond confirmation, the Church worked to consolidate the growth of the past decade and build institutions.

The central institution for young people was known as *Jo Wo Liech*, a Dinka phrase that means 'turn back on us'. The name reveals something of Dinka theology. It was offered as a prayer, imploring God not to abandon the Dinka but turn back and acknowledge that they had rejected the *jak* and were now following God. The members of *Jo Wo Liech* became central to the functioning of the Church. They organized a system for collecting and distributing new hymns, produced Dinka-language literacy resources, led Bible teaching sessions, and coordinated the network of individual prayer centres that supported the central churches in each zone. Beyond these practical steps, for many youth who were without families in Kakuma *Jo Wo Liech* became a substitute social network.

An affinity group for women emerged as well. *Thiech Nhialic*—in Dinka, 'ask God'—was an intercessory prayer group. It became important in the years after 1997 when difficult inter-ethnic relations in Kakuma led to violence. At the same time, international organizations were reducing rations, even though refugees had no opportunities for self-support. *Thiech Nhialic* became the focus of efforts to respond to these crises. In a series of prayer protests around Kakuma in 1997, for instance, members of *Thiech Nhialic* beseeched God to remember them and address their concerns. They walked around the camp every day for a week, praying, wailing, and singing in

⁴⁰ This account is given in a letter from Abraham Mayom to Marc Nikkel, 25 Dec. 1989 and a letter of clergy to Robert Runcie, 27 Dec. 1989, both in the NSCC Archive.

full-body protest. Mary Achol Deng, who led these marches, recalled that the supplications were effective. 'After praying, the UN [United Nations] invited us and asked us why we are crying. We said we are crying for ourselves. We are under you and we are dying. We ran away from killing and now we are getting killed. We are asking God what we shall do.'⁴¹ The marches that combined prayer and protest became a more regular feature of life in Kakuma as the war continued. Nikkel, who observed several of these prayer protests, wrote that 'masses of marching women, singing buoyantly, crosses thrusting in rhythm, have a military flavor. For them, however, their processions are literal battles of the spirit in which they are supplanting the powers of death and oppression.'⁴² *Thiech Nhialic* meant its name literally. The women were beseeching God to defend the Dinka from the evil in the world, and secure their existence in an insecure and unstable environment.

A key 'institution' of the Dinka Church was a new hymnal, published in 1998 after an extensive drafting process. The bulk of the hymnal's 660 hymns had been composed since the outbreak of the war, an indication of the growth of Christianity in this period. But the hymnal also helped further that growth in that it became a tool for catechetical and literacy education. As new Christians learned to read by working with the hymnal, they also learned more about the Christian faith. One of the most significant aspects of the hymnal is the prominent role it accords women. More than a third of the short choruses which make up the bulk of the hymnal were composed by women. Of the longer, more complex hymns, women composed nearly half.⁴³ This is in contrast to Dinka religion, in which women sang and joined in worship and sacrifice but composition was a task for men. The comparatively large role of female composers meant that it was women who were emerging as the theologians of the new Church. The emphasis of many of these new hymns was on commitment to Christ in the midst of destruction and displacement. One of the most popular hymns was composed shortly after the 1991 Bor Massacre and exhorts believers to 'give thanks to the Lord in the day of devastation and in the day of containment . . . God has not forgotten us'.⁴⁴

Refugee camps are frequently seen as places of stasis as an immobile population bides its time until it can return home. But just as Kakuma and other displaced camps had been created by migration, they remained places of movement—and the movement led to Church growth. The northern Bahr el-Ghazal region had been in the Roman Catholic mission sphere. But it was also the home of some of the young refugees who had been baptized as

⁴¹ Interview with Mary Achol Deng by author, Juba, South Sudan, 28 Apr. 2013.

⁴² Marc Nikkel, letter to supporters, 1 Nov. 1997, in Grant LeMarquand (ed.), *Why Haven't You Left? Letters from the Sudan* (New York, 2006), p. 160.

⁴³ The numbers are based on the author's analysis of the hymnal's index.

⁴⁴ *Bung de Diet ke Duoor*, No. 4. The translation is taken from Marc Nikkel, *Dinka Christianity* (Nairobi, 2001), p. 314.

Anglicans. In the 1990s some began to return home, whether because they thought it was safe to do so, as members of the SPLA, or because they were sent by the Church. Whatever the reason, on their return they began to function as lay evangelists and preach about the need to burn the *jak* and seek baptism. The Anglican Church began to grow in the rural areas, which the SPLA controlled and where the Catholic Church had historically been weak. The success of the Anglican effort was seen in the ire it raised among some Catholics, who resented the intrusion in what they perceived to be their territory. When Nathaniel Garang visited the region in April 1998, he ordained twenty-one men, eleven of whom had spent time in Ethiopia and/or Kakuma. The displacement of the war had come full circle. Young men were returning home as Christian evangelists.

CHURCH IN THE MIDST OF WAR

Although the energy and growth of the Dinka Church during the second civil war is remarkable, for the Episcopal Church of the Sudan as a whole the war remained a deeply challenging period. One major issue was the relationship between the Church and the SPLA, particularly in the first decade of the war. The SPLA began as an avowedly Marxist army, and its leaders were, if not hostile, certainly not sympathetic to the work of the Church. Still, that did not prevent ECS Bishop Seme Solomona from working with the SPLA in 1990 to evacuate Yei in central Equatoria and move first to Kaya and then, ultimately, across the border to Uganda. The story was explicitly interpreted in terms of the Exodus narrative, and when Bishop Solomona and his people celebrated Easter in Yei in 1997 it was seen as a confirmation of God's faithfulness. But other parts of the Church struggled with the SPLA. In western Equatoria, where the Church was well established prior to the war, the Dinka-dominated SPLA was seen more as an occupying force than a liberating one. The distance between the two organizations was heightened by the physical distance between their leaders. Many ECS bishops were forced to seek refuge in Juba and Khartoum, and were unable to access their dioceses for many years. Since the SPLA's strength was in the rural, 'liberated areas', it had little contact with—and looked with suspicion on—those bishops who were confined to urban areas. The split between urban and rural also affected the Church's structures. In 1990, the New Sudan Council of Churches (NSCC) was founded as an ecumenical organization to advocate for areas of the country which the Khartoum-based Sudan Council of Churches was unable to access.

The gathering of bishops in urban areas contributed to the debilitating split in the ECS that lasted from 1987 and 1992. That split, which saw two

competing archbishops and a proliferation of other bishops, some irregularly ordained, diverted Church leaders' attention from the war, disappointed international supporters, and left many people confused, angry, and upset. Although the two sides reconciled in 1992, one practical result was the proliferation of dioceses in the Church, as each bishop who had been ordained in the split needed a diocesan home. Church structures began to grow faster than the Church had the ability to support, which meant some dioceses became dioceses in name only with little in the way of meaningful ecclesiastical infrastructure.

Even as the Church was changing, the SPLA was changing as well. The end of the Cold War and the overthrow of the sympathetic Marxist Ethiopian regime meant that the SPLA began to move away from some of its Marxist rhetoric. At the same time, a split between SPLA leaders crippled the organization and allowed human rights concerns to be aired. One result was that the SPLA became a moderately more open and transparent organization, convening a series of conferences in the 1990s about its future direction. For the Church the most significant of these was the 1997 conference between the SPLA and the NSCC. Each side was able to air its grievances with the other. The SPLA felt the NSCC did not do enough to support its ends. The NSCC criticized the SPLA for failing to provide effective governance. The significance of the conference was not so much the outcomes, as that each recognized the other as a legitimate actor in the southern Sudan that was being created. The Church also agreed to provide chaplains for the SPLA, a step that recognized the growth of Christianity among members of the SPLA and showed the distance the former Marxist rebels had moved in the course of the war.

Church leaders, particularly through the NSCC, placed a major emphasis on peace and advocacy work. For a time, NSCC leaders tried to facilitate dialogue between leaders of various SPLA factions. But the organization's greatest contribution was the innovative people-to-people peace process that brought together leaders of different people groups for dialogue, reconciliation, and peace-building. The focus was on the Dinka and Nuer, who had been victims and perpetrators of significant inter-communal violence following the 1991 split in the SPLA. It was a measure of how far the Church had come. Far from being the weak, minority institution it was at independence in 1955, the Church was now the only organization that had the credibility to speak to differing parties and bring them together in a non-confrontational manner. It was a credibility that was manifest in concrete ways. ECS Archbishop Benjamina Yugusuk and Catholic Archbishop Paulino Lukudu, both based in Juba, agreed that whenever one had to travel abroad, the other would remain in the government-held town as archbishop of all Christians as a symbol of solidarity with the suffering population.

FROM EXILE TO RETURN, 2005 TO THE PRESENT

Since the end of the second civil war in 2005, many of those who were displaced have returned home. The post-war Church is led by a complement of indigenous bishops who oversee, following a further expansion in 2014 and 2015, more than forty dioceses. South Sudan's churches are often referred to as the country's largest non-governmental organization as it is often only the Church that has a presence in small and remote communities across the country. In 2011, after southerners voted overwhelmingly in favour of secession, South Sudan became the world's newest nation. But the government is weak, overwhelmed, and prone to division. Violence between leaders of government factions began in December 2013, displacing hundreds of thousands and leading to the return to civil war in parts of the country.

In the context of such governmental weakness and violence, the Church took on an even more outsized role, reflected in the growing public role of many Church leaders. President Salva Kiir Mayardit has frequently turned to Archbishop Daniel Deng Bul to mediate ceasefires between dissident groups and the government of South Sudan. These agreements have been critical in reducing violence in the new country, though not preventing new outbreaks. In 2013 Kiir appointed Deng Bul to chair a national reconciliation commission designed to address continued grievances. A significant part of the work of this commission has been the training of grassroots 'peace mobilizers', a return to the work begun in the people-to-people process. On a local level, some bishops are emerging as significant actors in a civil society that apart from the Church is undeveloped and devoid of leadership. Rather than identifying with exile, some bishops in the Church are shifting to emphasize the rebuilding work related in books of the Bible such as Ezra and Nehemiah.⁴⁵

Even as the Church takes on a new role, many old issues remain salient. Just as 'tribalism' has shaped relations in South Sudan, it has continued to shape relations in the ECS. The Church remains, in large measure, a 'federation of vernacular Churches' with different growth, structure, and leadership among different ethnic groups. For instance, as a result of the war, many Dinka continue to live outside traditional Dinka areas. In some cases this has created friction between a diocesan bishop who may not speak Dinka, and Dinka congregations that look to Nathaniel Garang and other Dinka bishops as their true leaders. Orienting the Church along geographic divisions, rather than ethnic ones, remains a significant challenge. The division sometimes happens within ethnic groups as well. Candidates who lose episcopal elections sometimes establish their own Churches. The breakaway Anglican Church of South

⁴⁵ Anthony Poggio, *Come Let Us Rebuild: Lessons from Nehemiah* (Hertford, 2013).

Sudan is likely the largest of these schismatic bodies with two dozen bishops and a disputed number of members, though as with many such breakaway groups it has a much higher than usual episcopal-to-lay ratio. The continued assertion of an Anglican identity by these breakaway groups indicates the way in which Anglicanism exercises a significant attraction for South Sudanese, even though the mission and colonial periods have long since passed. Part of the appeal is the ongoing partnerships between Sudanese Anglicans and partners in the Anglican Communion, such as the diocese of Salisbury in the Church of England. As it is elsewhere in the world, Anglicanism is seen as inextricably bound up in these international and beneficial relationships.

An overriding challenge for the Church is education for its clergy and lay leaders. The rapid growth during the war quickly exhausted the supply of educated leaders. Many priests were ordained with little education during the war to ensure the sacramental life of the Church could continue. A small number of clergy now have an opportunity for theological education in South Sudan, but for many, particularly female clergy, the demands of daily life in a subsistence culture make such education impossible. Diocesan continuing education sessions are one possibility, but there is a lack of educated people to lead them.

With the division of Sudan in 2011, the Episcopal Church of South Sudan and Sudan (ECSSS) a new name taken in 2013, now spans two countries. A majority of Church members are in South Sudan, but Sudan itself has five dioceses and a not insignificant number of Christians. These Christians have found life in Khartoum and other cities of the north to be particularly difficult since separation. Ongoing violence in the Nuba Mountains and Blue Nile threatens many Christian communities. The two-country reality also means that Church leaders have difficulty communicating with one another because of visa and other travel restrictions. In 2017, it was announced that the dioceses in Sudan would be created as a new province of the Anglican Communion to help combat the continued isolation of Sudanese Christians from the rest of the Church and from the wider Anglican Communion.

Warfare has been a recurrent and distressing feature of the history of independence in sub-Saharan Africa. For Sudanese and South Sudanese Anglicans the devastation of war and its consequent displacement have been keenly felt. But what the history of the ECSSS shows is that Christians were not passive actors in the face of war. Rather, the Christian narrative has provided many South Sudanese with the tools they need to make sense of, and actively respond to, the wars that have engulfed their country. The devastation of war and its consequent displacement—exile—have become integral to the Church's understanding of itself. The challenge for Sudanese and South Sudanese Anglicans is to assert an identity that no longer depends on such devastation. In other words, the challenge is to move from being a Church of the exiled to a Church of the returned.

SELECT BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Ashworth, J. and M. Ryan, “‘One Nation from Every Tribe, Tongue, and People’: The Church and Strategic Peacebuilding in South Sudan’, *Journal of Catholic Social Thought*, 10 (2013): 47–67.
- Collins, R. O., *Shadows in the Grass: Britain in the Southern Sudan, 1918–1956* (New Haven, CT, 1983).
- Holton, M. J., *Building the Resilient Community: Lessons from the Lost Boys of Sudan* (Eugene, OR, 2011).
- Hutchinson, S., ‘Spiritual Fragments of an Unfinished War’, in Niels Kastfelt (ed.), *Religion and African Civil Wars* (London, 2005), pp. 28–53.
- Kayanga, S. E. and Andrew Wheeler (eds.), “*But God is Not Defeated!*” *Celebrating the Centenary of The Episcopal Church of the Sudan* (Nairobi, 1999).
- Lienhardt, G., ‘The Dinka and Catholicism’, in J. Davis (ed.), *Religious Organization and Religious Experience* (New York, 1982), pp. 81–95.
- Nikkel, M., ‘The Cross of Bor Dinka Christians: A Working Christology in Face of Displacement and Death’, *Studies in World Christianity*, 1 (1996): 160–85.
- Nikkel, M., *Dinka Christianity: The Origins and Development of Christianity among the Dinka of Sudan, with Special Reference to the Songs of Dinka Christians* (Nairobi, 2001).
- Nikkel, M., ‘Jieng “Songs of Suffering” and the Nature of God’, *Anglican and Episcopal History*, 71 (2002): 223–40.
- Werner, R., W. Anderson, and A. Wheeler, *Day of Devastation, Day of Contentment: The History of the Sudanese Church across 2000 Years* (Nairobi, 2000).
- Wheeler, Andrew C., ‘Finding Meaning Amid the Chaos: Narratives of Significance in the Sudanese Church’, in Niels Kastfelt (ed.), *Religion and African Civil Wars* (London, 2005), pp. 54–81.
- Wheeler, Andrew C., ‘Richard Jones and the Sudan Revival of 1938’, *Anglican and Episcopal History*, 71 (2002): 168–86.

Part III

Contextual and Religious Challenges

Relations between the Churches of the Anglican Communion and the Churches of Eastern Christianity

Peter Eaton

‘And who,’ quoth the Patriarch of Constantinople, the supreme head and primate of the Greek Church of Asia,—‘is the Archbishop of Canterbury?’
‘What?’ said I, a little astonished at the question.
‘Who,’ said he, ‘is this Archbishop?’
‘Why, the Archbishop of Canterbury.’
‘Archbishop of what?’ said the Patriarch.
‘Of Canterbury,’ said I.
‘Oh,’ said the Patriarch. ‘Ah, yes! And who is he?’

Robert Curzon, *Visits to Monasteries in the Levant* (1849)

INTRODUCTION

The encounter between Robert Curzon and Patriarch Gregory VI on 13 July 1837 that Curzon describes in his *Visits to Monasteries in the Levant* has taken its rightful place among the stories that are woven into the history of the relations between Anglicanism and the Churches of the Eastern Christian world.¹ The history of these relations, which have been sustained during times of terrible difficulties for the Eastern Churches—difficulties that often threatened reputations and relationships, and cost lives—has been significant.

¹ Robert Curzon, *Visits to Monasteries in the Levant* (London, 1849), ch. 12. See also Jack Fairey, *The Great Powers and Orthodox Christendom: The Crisis over the Eastern Church in the Era of the Crimean War* (London, 2015), esp. ch. 2.

The relationship between Anglicanism and the Churches of the Christian East gained unprecedented substance during the course of the twentieth century, and I shall show something of this significance by the end of this chapter with reference to representative episodes in the relationship between the Episcopal Church and the Russian Orthodox Church, from among the Byzantine Orthodox, and between the Episcopal Church and the Armenian Apostolic Orthodox Church, from among the Oriental Orthodox (those Churches which formed a separate group of Eastern Churches after the Council of Chalcedon in AD 451). This is to make a hard choice, for Anglicanism has had rich relationships with the Eastern Christian world, and these relationships have ranged across the spectrum from the Byzantine Churches in communion with Constantinople to the Churches that are called Oriental Orthodox. The Anglican Communion has also had a significant history with the (Assyrian) Church of the East, which has its own separate identity among Eastern Churches, and to those Churches of the Saint Thomas tradition in India, with one of which the Anglican Communion is in full communion.

It is also true that, by the end of the twentieth century, relations between the Anglican Communion and the Eastern Churches had changed considerably: a hopeful beginning in the first two-thirds of the century gave way in some circles to indifference and sometimes hostility. In several cases official dialogue has been suspended. This was new; Anglican relations with Eastern Christians had never suffered before from such disconnection. Changes in the political circumstances for some Eastern Churches after the end of communism and the Soviet Union in the early 1990s, with a rise in suspicion of all things Western, coupled with a number of theological and ecclesiological developments in Anglicanism after the mid-1970s, have contributed to this ecumenical change of pace.

While it was the case that the early Anglican pioneers in relations with the Eastern Churches were Anglo-Catholics, and evangelical Anglicans were suspicious of both Eastern theology and liturgical practice, this did not remain so as the twentieth century progressed. Official activity and commissions came to include Low and Broad Church leaders as well as those from the Anglo-Catholic tradition. Relations became much more mainstream, as the resolutions of successive Lambeth Conferences from 1888 onwards relating to relations with the Eastern Churches attest, and it was the Church of England, the Episcopal Church, and the Church of Canada who provided most of the leadership in Anglican relations with Eastern Christianity. By the beginning of the twenty-first century, other factors, such as a preoccupation of the Churches with their own internal politics and life generally, as well as the conflicts within Anglicanism over liturgical renewal, the ordination of women, and human sexuality, were more determinative of ecumenical relationships than older questions of Anglican churchmanship.

A complete history of these relationships has yet to be written, and this chapter makes no attempt at comprehensiveness. Rather it catches glimpses of the relations between Anglicanism and the Byzantine and Oriental Orthodox communities from the end of the nineteenth century to the beginning of the twenty-first. In spite of more recent developments and distance, the picture that emerges here supports the view that these relations have been formative for the respective traditions.

It is easy, from the changing circumstances of both Eastern Christianity and world Anglicanism in the first decades of the twenty-first century, to be dismissive of this history or to look back on it with an air of superiority. There are those who considered the work of the first half of the twentieth century to have been naïve, or provoked chiefly by political necessity rather than by theological exploration and a genuine desire for unity and attention to the necessary and real obstacles that existed then, and continue to exist today.² While there is some truth to these judgements, to be too dismissive of this history, or to relegate it to the side-lines as a preoccupation of a few eccentrics and those who were not representative of their Churches, is to misjudge the enduring achievement of these relationships. The Anglican Communion and the Churches of Eastern Christianity are not the same after their long encounter in the twentieth century,³ and it is arguable that this change has percolated even to the grassroots of the life of the Churches.⁴ That evidence is clear in the revision of the Book of Common Prayer of the Episcopal Church in 1979, which contains significant influence from the Byzantine liturgical tradition, and one of the earliest and most influential translations of the Byzantine

² Bryn Geffert, *Eastern Orthodox and Anglicans: Diplomacy, Theology, and the Politics of Interwar Ecumenism* (Notre Dame, IN, 2010), pp. 248–72; Mark Chapman, *The Fantasy of Reunion: Anglicans, Catholics, and Ecumenism, 1833–1882* (Oxford, 2014); Vassiliki El. Stathokosta, 'Relations between the Orthodox and the Anglicans in the Twentieth Century: A Reason to Consider the Present and Future of the Theological Dialogue', *Ecclesiology*, 8 (2012): 350–74; Dimitris Salapatas, *Anglican–Orthodox Relations: A Dead End or a Way Forward?*, <http://www.academia.edu/7531814/Anglican-Orthodox_Relations_A_Dead-End_or_a_Way_Forward> (accessed 19 Jan. 2016); Charlotte Methuen, 'Ecumenism', in Mark Chapman, Sathianathan Clarke, and Martyr Percy (eds.) *The Oxford Handbook of Anglican Studies* (Oxford, 2015), pp. 464–78 (p. 473).

³ See Metropolitan Anthony Bloom, 'Lent as a Journey', <<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=voFxD4LztJU>> (accessed 19 Jan. 2016); Nicholas Stephen Weber, 'Reflections on Orthodoxy and Christian Fellowship in England (1975–1979)', *Saint Vladimir's Theological Quarterly*, 24 (1980): 128–39.

⁴ See Metropolitan Anthony Bloom, "'Ecumenism", "Encounter", and "Sermon": Church Divided and United', *Sobornost*, 37 (2015): 7–30; Michael Ramsey, *The Church of England and the Eastern Orthodox Church: Why Their Unity is Important* (London, 1946), and 'Three Phases of the Ecumenical Movement', and the response by Dumitru Staniloae, *Sobornost*, Series 6, No. 5 (Summer 1972): 292–300; A. M. Allchin, 'Michael Ramsey and the Orthodox World', *Sobornost*, 10 (1988): 49–52; A. M. Allchin, *The Kingdom of Love and Knowledge: The Encounter between Orthodoxy and the West* (London, 1979); E. C. Miller, *Toward a Fuller Vision: Orthodoxy and the Anglican Experience* (Wilton, CT, 1984); Derwas Chitty, *Orthodoxy and the Conversion of England* (London, 1990, originally delivered as a lecture in 1947 and later revised); H. A. Hodges, *Anglicanism and Orthodoxy: A Study in Dialectical Churchmanship* (London, 1955).

liturgy was by an Episcopalian layperson, Isabel Hapgood. Cranmerian English and the King James Version of the Bible, gifts of Anglicanism to the English-speaking Christian world, dominated English translations of Orthodox liturgical texts until the new and influential translations by the late Archimandrite Ephrem Lash in the early twenty-first century.⁵ In 1888, the Lambeth Conference had been hesitant about relations with the Orthodox, not least because of the Orthodox veneration of icons; by the twenty-first century that hesitancy had vanished almost completely, and many Anglican churches across the Communion contained an icon or two. In 1985, in anticipation of the Millennium of the Baptism of Rus', the General Convention of the Episcopal Church passed a resolution to create educational materials for Episcopalians about the Russian Church, resulting in excellent resources; and in 1987 the House of Bishops passed a resolution calling the Episcopal Church to observe the Feast of Saint Sergius of Radonezh in 1988 as a way of expressing solidarity with the Church of Russia, which was still living under communism. Forms for Evening Prayer and the Eucharist, deeply shaped by the Russian liturgy, were authorized for use in the Episcopal Church on 25 September 1988, the day on which Saint Sergius is commemorated in the calendar of the Episcopal Church.⁶

Within the Anglican Communion as a whole, several of its member Churches, most particularly the Church of England and the Episcopal Church of the United States, stand out in this ecumenical journey with the Churches of the Christian East. In some cases these relationships have been maintained in times of national and political crisis and uncertainty, in which the Anglican Communion has played a decisive role in the well-being of Eastern Christian communities. Whether it has been during periods of ethnic cleansing or genocide, as with the Armenians, or persecution, as with the Orthodox Churches behind the Iron Curtain and in the Middle East; whether it has been in giving homes in local Anglican parish churches to fledgling Eastern congregations, or in admitting Eastern Christian ordinands to Anglican seminaries; or whether it has been in other practical assistance, the Churches of the Anglican Communion have tried to be 'a friend in need and danger'⁷ to the

⁵ Isabel Florence Hapgood, *The Service Book of the Holy Orthodox-Catholic Apostolic Church* (4th edn., New York, 1965); Archimandrite Ephrem Lash, *The Divine Liturgy of Saint John Chrysostom* (London, 2011).

⁶ James C. McReynolds, *Christ is Risen: A Study Guide about Russian Orthodox Christianity* (New York, 1986); The Churches' Center for Theology and Public Policy, *A Soviet Studies Program for the Episcopal Church* (Washington, DC, 1986); The Episcopal Church Center, *An Order of Worship for the Holy Eucharist and Evening Prayer in Commemoration of Sergius, Abbot of Holy Trinity, Moscow, 1392, according to the use of The Episcopal Church* (New York, 1988).

⁷ Metropolitan Antonii (Khrapovistskii), 'Druz'ia poznaiutsia v bedakh i opasnostiakh', *Tserkovnaya vedomosti* (1/14–15/28 Jan. 1924), pp. 9–10, quoted in Deacon Andrei Psarov, "The Soul and Heart of a Faithful Englishman is not Limited by Utilitarian Goals and Plans": The Relations of Metropolitan Antonii Khrapovitskii with the Anglican Church', in Vladimir

Churches of the Christian East. These long-standing relationships have produced a significant theological literature of enduring worth. Among Anglicans who have made significant contributions to ecumenical theology in the twentieth century are A. M. Allchin, Paul Anderson, Charles Brent, Henry Chadwick, Charles Gore, E. R. Hardy, H. A. Hodges, Leonard Hodgson, John Macquarrie, E. L. Mascall, Michael Ramsey, Mary Tanner, William Temple, Rowan Williams, and J. Robert Wright. Among the Orthodox are Elisabeth Behr-Siegel, Anthony Bloom, Sergei Bulgakov, Olivier Clément, Georges Florovsky, Vladimir and Nicholas Lossky, Chrysostomos Papadopoulos, Alexander Schmemmann, Dumitru Staniloae, Germanos Strenopoulos, Kallistos Ware, Nicolas Zernov, and the Russian and Greek theologians who wrote important studies of Anglican Orders when that subject was of central concern in the first half of the twentieth century. Even this incomplete list could not be described as narrow or blinkered in the breadth of their commitments and concerns for the life of the Church.

AN OUTLINE OF RELATIONS TO 1900

The modern history of Anglican relations with the Eastern Churches begins with the contacts between Cyril Loukaris, successively patriarch of Alexandria (1601–20) and then patriarch of Constantinople (for five periods interrupted by depositions from 1620 to 1638, when he was murdered on orders from the Sultan) and George Abbot, archbishop of Canterbury (1611–33).⁸ This was the period of the beginning of a Greek presence in Oxford, in the persons of Christophoros Angelos, Metrophanes Kritopoulos (later a successor of his patron Loukaris as patriarch of Alexandria), and Nathaniel Konopios (later metropolitan of Smyrna). These early contacts led both to the establishment of a Greek parish in Soho in London in 1677, and the short-lived Greek College at Oxford (1699–1705).⁹ The Greek parish did not last long, and it was not till the early nineteenth century that the Greek community in London was able to secure its own place of worship.

Tsurikov (ed.), *Metropolitan Antonii (Khrapovitskii): Archpastor of the Russian Diaspora* (Jordanville, NY, 2014), pp. 92–113, esp. p. 100. This article is also available in both Russian and English at <<http://www.rocorstudies.org>>.

⁸ See George A. Hadjiantoniou, *Protestant Patriarch: The Life of Cyril Lucaris (1572–1638), Patriarch of Constantinople* (Richmond, 1961); Paul Welsby, *George Abbot: The Unwanted Archbishop, 1562–1633* (London, 1962); W. B. Patterson, 'Cyril Lukaris, George Abbot, James VI and I, and the Beginning of Anglican–Orthodox Relations', in Peter M. Doll (ed.), *Anglicanism and Orthodoxy: 300 Years after the 'Greek College' in Oxford* (Oxford, 2006), pp. 39–56.

⁹ See E. D. Tappe, 'The Greek College at Oxford, 1699–1705', in Doll (ed.), *Anglicanism and Orthodoxy*, pp. 153–74.

The most remarkable of the early incidents of Anglican–Eastern Christian rapprochement were negotiations between the non-jurors and the Orthodox patriarchs in the first quarter of the eighteenth century. The non-juring bishops took advantage of the presence in England of Arsenios, the bishop of Thebias of the patriarchate of Antioch, to see if there was an opportunity to approach the Orthodox Church for support and, perhaps, union.¹⁰ A correspondence ensued between the non-juring and Orthodox bishops from 1716 to 1725, when Archbishop Wake of Canterbury learned of the negotiations and wrote to the patriarch of Jerusalem to expose the non-jurors as schismatics.

Contacts from the time of the non-jurors to the mid-nineteenth century continued in various ways.¹¹ Of particular interest in this period were the establishment of the Hill School in Athens and the short-lived mission to Constantinople, both having their origin from the Episcopal Church of the United States.¹² There was an aspect of the work in Athens that was both crucial and controversial and which came to characterize so much of Anglican involvement with Eastern Churches and communities in subsequent times. The missionaries, the Revds John Robertson and John Hill and their wives, were given the clear instruction that: ‘you are by no means to say, or write, or do anything which may justly give rise to the impression that you have visited the Greeks for the purpose of introducing another form of Christianity, or establishing another Church, than that in which they have been nurtured. Let it be everywhere known that the Church of which you are presbyters distinctly and fully recognizes the validity of ordination by Greek bishops.’¹³ In contrast, the early years of the Anglican bishopric in Jerusalem were affected by proselytizing attitudes, especially during the episcopate of the second bishop, Samuel Gobat; but these changed under pressure from influential Anglo-Catholics in England during the episcopate of Bishop Blyth. In 1885 Patriarch Nikodemos of Jerusalem had established the Chapel of Abraham, which is next to Golgotha in the Greek monastery adjoining the Church of the Holy

¹⁰ See Ann Shukman, ‘The Non-Jurors, Peter the Great, and the Eastern Patriarchs’, in Doll (ed.), *Anglicanism and Orthodoxy*, pp. 175–92, and correspondence of Arsenios in *The Church Quarterly Review*, 225 (Oct. 1931): 1–11.

¹¹ See V. T. Istavridis, *Orthodoxy and Anglicanism* (London, 1966), especially Part I, pp. 1ff.; V. T. Istavridis, ‘Orthodoxy and Anglicanism in the Twentieth Century’, *Greek Orthodox Theological Review*, 5 (1959): 9–26; Geffert, *Eastern Orthodox and Anglicans*, ch. 1, pp. 9ff.; Metropolitan Germanos of Thyatira, ‘Progress towards the Re-Union of the Orthodox and Anglican Churches’, *The Christian East* (Spring 1929): 20–31.

¹² See David M. Dean, ‘The Greece Papers, 1829–1909’, and Karen Marshall Booth, ‘The Constantinople Papers, 1835–1850’, *The Historical Magazine of the Protestant Episcopal Church*, 40 (Mar. 1971): 101–8.

¹³ S. D. Denison, *A History of the Foreign Missionary Work of the Protestant Episcopal Church*, vol. 1 (New York, 1871), quoted in E. R. Hardy, ‘The Greek Mission of the Episcopal Church, 1828–1899’, *The Historical Magazine of the Protestant Episcopal Church*, 10 (Sept. 1941): 183–201.

Sepulchre, as a place for Anglicans to celebrate the Eucharist, an arrangement that continues to the present day. More than anything else, this reluctance to proselytize and to honour the indigenous Church greatly helped Anglican–Eastern Church relations throughout the twentieth century, especially in the face of the threat that the Eastern Churches felt historically from Roman Catholicism, and which were to come to fear the proselytizing endeavours of Evangelical Protestants and other Western religious movements.

The Oxford Movement, the expanding missionary activity especially of the Church of England and the Episcopal Church around the globe, and, later, the Ecumenical Movement, lay behind more established relations between Anglicanism and the Churches of the Eastern Christian world in the modern period.

In 1864, the Anglican and Eastern Churches Association was formed, from an Anglo-Catholic constituency on the Anglican side, and this organization deepened the knowledge of the Christian East especially among Anglicans in Britain. By the late nineteenth century, leaders of the Anglo-Catholic movement were paying considerable attention to the Eastern Churches, and that interest increased with the promulgation of the papal bull, *Apostolicae curae*, in 1896, which in declaring Anglican orders ‘null and void’ was a blow to those Anglicans who had hoped for union with the Roman Catholic Church. As far back as Archbishop Abbott, Anglicans found in Orthodox conversation partners a mutual mistrust of the Roman Catholic Church and the Vatican. This shared suspicion of Rome played a part in developing relations between the two Communion, not least in deepening some Orthodox sympathy for Anglicans.¹⁴

THE QUESTION OF ANGLICAN ORDERS

Following *Apostolicae curae* the issue of the validity of Anglican Orders created a new urgency for Anglicans in their conversations with the Orthodox.¹⁵ The validity of Anglican orders and Anglicanism’s status as a Church seem not to have been an issue with the Orthodox in some previous encounters, so from an Anglican perspective the relationship was expected to be positive.¹⁶ In the 1890s there were Russian studies of Anglicanism and its ordinations, and Greek contributions in 1903 and 1921, and they were generally encouraging to those Anglicans concerned with this question.¹⁷ There

¹⁴ E. R. Hardy, *Orthodox Statements on Anglican Orders* (New York, 1946), p. xii.

¹⁵ Istavridis, *Orthodoxy and Anglicanism*, pp. 26, 121–31.

¹⁶ See Istavridis, *Orthodoxy and Anglicanism*, p. 124, esp. n. 74.

¹⁷ V. Sokoloff, *One Chapter from An Enquiry into the Hierarchy of the Anglican Episcopal Church* (London, 1897); A. Bulgakoff, *The Question of Anglican Orders* (London, 1899) (both translated by W. J. Birkbeck); Chrestos Androutsos, *The Validity of English Ordinations from an*

followed statements from the Churches of Constantinople (1922), Jerusalem (1923), Cyprus (1923), Alexandria (1930), Romania (1936), and Greece (1939), in which they asserted the validity of Anglican Orders.¹⁸

However, Orthodox recognition of Anglican Orders was a complicated matter at every stage. Anglicans tended to hope that the question could be decided as a stand-alone issue; but the Orthodox were more often convinced that the question of sacraments in general, and of Orders in particular, had to be considered in the larger framework of the unity of the faith and order of the Church as a whole. Here was a gulf of understanding that was hard to bridge. On the one hand, some Orthodox theologians said that it might be possible to judge whether Anglicanism had preserved the historic succession of the episcopate (and some, like the Russian Sokolov, said that the succession had been maintained), or that there was an intent on the part of Anglican bishops to do what the Orthodox do when they administer the mystery of Holy Order. Still others, most notably Father Sergei Bulgakov, thought that intercommunion between Anglicans and Orthodox was possible, indeed desirable, in limited and defined circumstances. On the other hand, most Orthodox theologians also said that it is only possible to conceive of recognition and union on the basis of the full acceptance of the faith of the undivided Church.

This proved to be the principle that governed all such conversations. The statements from the Orthodox on the validity of Anglican Orders in the 1920s and 1930s said rather carefully that the 'ordination of the Anglican Episcopal Confession . . . possesses the same validity as those of the Roman, Old Catholic, and Armenian Churches possess'.¹⁹ This meant at best that Anglican clergy who wished to convert to Orthodoxy would not have to be re-baptized and re-ordained, but such policies were never formalized or tested. And while this was an encouragement, this was not all that their Anglican friends were wanting, which was a clear recognition of Anglican Orders and the consequent reality of intercommunion.

To the dismay of many Anglo-Catholics especially, but also of many other Anglicans of broader theological views who were becoming increasingly influenced by a growing ecumenical attitude, the conversations about the recognition of Anglican Orders in the twentieth century did not reach the goal for which they had hoped. However, the debate created a significant body of important theological literature which has not been fully examined, and the consequences of which are still to be clearly understood. The Orthodox

Orthodox Point of View, trans. F. W. Groves Campbell (London, 1909), published originally in Greek in Constantinople in 1903; P. Comnenos, 'Anglican Ordinations', trans. J. A. Douglas, in *The Christian East*, 2 (Sept. 1921), and subsequently reprinted as Appendix 1 in Archbishop Chrysostom Papadopoulos, *The Validity of Anglican Ordinations*, trans. and prefaced by J. A. Douglas (London, 1930).

¹⁸ See Hardy, *Orthodox Statements*.

¹⁹ Hardy, *Orthodox Statements*, p. 2.

perspective was perhaps best articulated by the Orthodox theologian, V. T. Istavridis: 'the way in which the problem of the validity of Anglican Orders came to the foreground in discussions on inter-church relations is evidence of the seriousness with which the Orthodox Church and her theologians began to regard the question'.²⁰

THE FELLOWSHIP OF SAINT ALBAN AND SAINT SERGIUS

In the mid-nineteenth century an organization was formed to promote closer relations between the Church of England and the Eastern Churches. As we have noted, in 1863, John Mason Neale and other Anglo-Catholics founded the Eastern Church Association. Subsequently the Anglican and Eastern Orthodox Churches Union was founded in 1906, which also had a branch in the United States. These two organizations merged in 1914 to form the Anglican and Eastern Churches Association, which exists to this day. Among their chief contributions was the short-lived journal, *The Christian East*, published from 1920 to 1937 and again from 1950 to 1954, which is full of primary documents for the study of Anglican–Orthodox relations during the period.

In 1928 a further group came into being, the Fellowship of Saint Alban and Saint Sergius.²¹ The fellowship would involve a new generation of Anglican clergy and laity: Michael Ramsey and A. M. Allchin would be two of those who would be involved in the fellowship whose writings brought Orthodox theology into the orbit of many Anglican clergy and laity. The fellowship also shaped a fresh sensibility in the Orthodox community in the British Isles, especially among émigré Russians living there, and individuals like Nicolas Zernov, Metropolitan Anthony Bloom, and Metropolitan Kallistos Ware became both strong supporters of the fellowship and effective communicators of Orthodoxy to an increasingly interested Anglican constituency.²²

²⁰ Istavridis, *Orthodoxy and Anglicanism*, p. 25.

²¹ See Nicolas and Militza Zernov, *Fellowship of St. Alban and St. Sergius: A Historical Memoir* (Oxford, 1979); Nicolas Zernov, *Sunset Years: A Russian Pilgrim in the West* (London, 1983); Paul Anderson, 'The Fellowship's Origins: A Charter Member's Notes', *Sobornost*, Series 7, No. 7 (Summer 1978): 612–13.

²² See Marc Raeff, *Russia Abroad: A Cultural History of the Russian Emigration 1919–1939* (Oxford, 1990); Antoine Arjakovsky, *The Way: Religious Thinkers of the Russian Emigration in Paris and Their Journal 1925–1940*, trans. Jerry Ryan, ed. John Jillions and Michael Plekon, with a Foreword by Rowan Williams (Notre Dame, IN, 2013); Christopher Birchall, *Embassy, Emigrants, and Englishmen: The Three Hundred Year History of a Russian Orthodox Church in London* (Jordanville, NY, 2014).

The Fellowship would also have an influence in Anglican–Orthodox relations in the Episcopal Church, and over the years the Fellowship grew to have chapters around the world. It has achieved its most enduring work through annual conferences and publications, especially its theological journal, *Sobornost*. Of particular note was the decision early on at the annual conference for there to be daily celebrations of the Eucharist, alternating Anglican and Orthodox rites, and when the new home for the Fellowship, Saint Basil's House, was acquired in London in 1949, the chapel was ordered so as to have two altars, one Orthodox and one Anglican, where the Eucharist was celebrated in both traditions.

This period of liturgical generosity lasted well into the primacy of Archbishop Michael Ramsey in the 1970s. During this time, it was not uncommon for Orthodox and Anglican bishops to attend each other's churches and worship in more than simple choir habit, to take a significant part in each other's liturgies, and to give blessings together. An early occasion of such liturgical hospitality was the celebration at Westminster Abbey in 1925 of the 1,600th anniversary of the Council of Nicaea, when two patriarchs, four metropolitans, and assorted Orthodox priests vested and took part in the procession. Significant also was presence of Bishop (later Patriarch) Tikhon and other Orthodox clerics at the ordination of the Right Reverend Reginald Weller to be the Bishop Coadjutor of Fond du Lac in the Episcopal Church in 1900. The extent of the practice of liturgical hospitality can be seen in the extensive photographs in the pamphlet edited by Henry Brandreth and Basil Minchin, *The Church of England and the Rumanian Orthodox Church*, published jointly by the Fellowship and the Anglican and Eastern Churches Association to commemorate the visit of Patriarch Justinian of Romania to the archbishop of Canterbury in June 1966. There was even an occasion, early in the twentieth century, when an English priest, Father Henry Joy Fynes-Clinton, who was a prime mover in the establishment of the Anglican and Eastern Orthodox Churches Association, and particularly close to the Serbian bishop, Saint Nikolaj Velimirović, was invited by the Patriarch of Serbia to celebrate an Anglican Eucharist on an Orthodox altar and an Orthodox 'antimension' using Orthodox communion vessels.²³ This remains an event of great significance: in the Orthodox tradition an 'antimension', a special corporal consecrated by the bishop and often containing relics, is a sign of ecclesial recognition and communion, and only the ordained are permitted contact with an Orthodox altar and its furnishings, especially its sacred vessels.

²³ See *The Christian East*, 2 (Dec. 1921), p. 162.

INTERNATIONAL THEOLOGICAL DIALOGUES

While the formal international theological dialogue between the Anglican Communion and the Orthodox Church did not begin until 1973, and a similar Anglican–Oriental Orthodox dialogue was not established until 2001, there had been significant meetings between the Anglican Communion and both these Eastern traditions for the previous half century.²⁴ But earlier meetings and dialogues, while making significant progress in many areas, had not always been representative of all the Churches of the Anglican Communion or of the autocephalous Orthodox Churches.

With respect to ecumenical dialogue in general, in 1920 there were two publications that helped to change attitudes. The first was an encyclical, issued in January, by the Ecumenical Patriarchate ‘to all the Churches of Christ wherever they may be’. The second was the *Appeal to All Christian People* in the same year from the bishops of the Lambeth Conference, sending out a call to a new commitment to unity among Christians and outlining the resolutions to that end of the recently concluded Lambeth Conference. Following on from these two letters and the Lambeth Conference of 1920, in the 1920s and 1930s committees were established by both Anglicans and Orthodox and there was a series of official conversations of various kinds, resulting in important meetings in Bucharest in 1935 and in Moscow in 1956.²⁵ In 1921 a document entitled *Terms of Intercommunion suggested between the Church of England and the Churches in Communion with her and the Eastern Orthodox Church* was published.²⁶ While these terms never found formal agreement, they were an effort to reach in the Orthodox direction. The Orthodox theologian Istavridis said of the *Terms*, that ‘this exceptionally important document has formed the basis for virtually all subsequent discussions between the Orthodox and the Anglicans’.²⁷ This document was of significance right up to the beginning of the international dialogue in 1973. It is clear that the deepening influence of the Catholic movement in Anglicanism and the displacement of

²⁴ The official reports are: *The Moscow Agreed Statement* (1976); the *Dublin Agreed Statement* (1984); the *Cyprus Agreed Statement* (2006); and the *Buffalo (Agreed) Statement* (2015). See also Herbert Waddams (ed.), *The Anglo-Russian Conference Moscow, July 1956* (London, 1958); the papers of the Episcopal-Russian Orthodox consultation in Moscow, *On Being a Bishop*, ed. J. Robert Wright (New York, 1993). Anglican–Oriental Orthodox dialogue produced its Agreed Statement, *Christology. Agreed Statement* (London, 2014). Further documents are available at the website of the Anglican Communion Office, <<http://www.anglicancommunion.org>>. See also Henry Hill (ed.), *Light from the East: A Symposium on the Oriental Orthodox and Assyrian Churches* (Toronto, 1988).

²⁵ *Lambeth Occasional Reports 1931–1935* (London, 1938); Herbert Waddams (ed.), *The Anglo-Russian Conference Moscow, July 1956* (London, 1958); Geffert, *Eastern Orthodox and Anglicans*, esp. chs. 12 and 13.

²⁶ In G. K. A. Bell, *Documents in Christian Unity 1920–1924* (London, 1924).

²⁷ Istavridis, *Orthodoxy and Anglicanism*, p. 35.

many Orthodox to the West during the political upheavals after the Bolshevik Revolution and the Second World War contributed to this activity. But it is also true that there was a growing understanding between senior leadership both in Anglicanism and Orthodoxy that, in the words of Patriarch Justinian of Romania in 1966, between the two Churches there is ‘the least doctrinal and spiritual difference’.²⁸

It was significant that the official dialogue with the Byzantine Orthodox began in 1973, during the primacy of Michael Ramsey as archbishop of Canterbury, for whom closer relations with the Orthodox had been a prominent aspect of his work for many years: as the new archbishop of York, he had been at the Moscow meeting in 1956. There had been careful preparation for the official dialogue beforehand on both sides. It was on Ramsey’s visit to the ecumenically minded Patriarch Athenagoras of Constantinople in 1962, not long after his translation to Canterbury, that the two bishops resolved to begin a process towards a joint commission that would include Anglicans and Orthodox representatives from all the member Churches of both communions. The first meeting of the Commission for Anglican–Orthodox Joint Doctrinal Discussion took place at Hertford College, Oxford, in July 1973. This dialogue lasted until the Moscow conference in 1976, and the commission produced its report, covering such subjects as ‘The Knowledge of God’, the Scriptures and tradition, the *Filioque* clause in the Creed, and the Eucharist. There was also discussion of the ordination of women to the priesthood, which was becoming a reality in parts of the Anglican Communion.

In spite of the major difficulty that the ordination of women posed for relations between the Churches, it was decided to continue a second phase of the dialogue to build on the work of the Moscow conference. By 1984, this second phase had completed its work, and had produced *The Dublin Agreed Statement*.²⁹ It would be five years before the third dialogue would meet in 1989 in Finland, with a new name—the International Commission for Anglican–Orthodox Theological Dialogue. After six years, in 2006 the dialogue issued its most significant document to date, *The Church of the Triune God*, which dealt with ecclesiology and the ordained ministry.³⁰ The dialogue has continued in the twenty-first century with a fourth phase, focused on theological anthropology.³¹

²⁸ Quoted in Hugh Wybrew, ‘Anglican–Romanian Orthodox Relations’, *Religion in Communist Lands*, 16 (1988): 329–44.

²⁹ *Anglican-Orthodox Dialogue: The Dublin Agreed Statement 1984* (London, 1985).

³⁰ *The Church of the Triune God: The Cyprus Agreed Statement of the International Commission for Anglican-Orthodox Theological Dialogue 2006* (London, 2006).

³¹ *In the Image and Likeness of God: A Hope-Filled Anthropology. The Buffalo Statement Agreed by the International Commission for Anglican-Orthodox Theological Dialogue 2005* (London, 2015). See the website of the Anglican Communion Office, <<http://www.anglicancommunion.org>>.

A FORGOTTEN CHAPTER IN EPISCOPAL-ARMENIAN
RELATIONS

The relations of the Anglican Communion with the Armenian Apostolic Church, a member of the family of Oriental Orthodox Churches, came into focus in the twentieth century. These two Churches have enjoyed a close relationship for almost 150 years, especially in the United States, where so many Armenians have found a new home during the course of the long and troubled history of their nation in modern times.

Most recently that close relationship has been in evidence in the ecumenical commemoration of the centenary of the Armenian Genocide at the Washington National Cathedral on 7 May 2015, and the celebration of the newly sainted martyrs of Armenia at Westminster Abbey on 28 October 2015. Also of interest is the custom, going back to the early twentieth century, for the Anglican bishop in Jerusalem to attend the Maundy Thursday Liturgy at Saint James Cathedral in the Armenian Patriarchate, where the Anglican bishop is vested in the vestments of an Armenian bishop and reads the gospel. The origins of this practice are uncertain. During the latter part of the twentieth century there was often an Anglican priest among the teachers at the Armenian seminary in Jerusalem.

As has been the case for so many Churches with an episcopal order and polity, including Anglicans and Roman Catholics, there were Armenian laity and priests in the United States before there were resident bishops. In the case of the Armenian Church, the question arose in the late 1890s whether an Episcopal bishop might ordain Armenian candidates to the diaconate and the priesthood, with the knowledge and consent of the Catholicos in Etchmiadzin. Such clergy would, should they return to Armenia, be recognized in the Orders to which they had been admitted by an Episcopal bishop. There is an incomplete correspondence on this issue in the archives of the diocese of Washington.³² Although this was only a limited correspondence, because those involved were a senior Episcopal bishop and the Catholicos of All Armenia, the episode has wider significance. For it articulates an understanding of the relationship between the Armenian Church and the Anglican Communion which was both intimate and unambiguous.

The then bishop of Washington, Henry Satterlee, had developed a keen interest in the well-being of Armenia, especially the Armenian community in the United States.³³ He had visited the tsar in Russia to plead the cause of Armenia and its persecuted population, and in the course of this work he

³² The papers are in Box 11, Folder 2-11-19 of the Satterlee Papers. I am grateful to the Revd Dr Gardiner Shattuck and Ms Susan Stonesifer for information about these documents.

³³ See Charles Brent, *A Master Builder: Being the Life and Letters of Henry Yates Satterlee, First Bishop of Washington* (New York, 1916).

forged a number of important relationships. In 1897 Satterlee had a correspondence with Prince Bebutoff. Bebutoff was an Armenian and member of the Russian nobility, though it is not clear how he and Bishop Satterlee came into contact. The bishop's letter does not survive in the archives, but we have the prince's reply, written on 6/18 June. After thanking the bishop for his efforts on behalf of the Armenian people generally, he turns to the question of providing for their spiritual needs in the United States:

I find no words to express my recognition to the great Anglican Church in America for her care in maintaining the American Armenians in their historical Church. As regards furnishing them with priests, it seems to me that the most rapid solution of this question would be to send worthy candidates to England, where they could be ordained by the Armenian bishop, resident in Manchester . . . personally I fully concur to the affirmation of [the] entire apostolic succession of Anglican priesthood. I should be happy if the head of our Church considered it virtuous to express the same opinion.

The second document in the file is a long letter from His Holiness Mgrdich (or Mkrtich) Khrimian, the Supreme Catholicos of All Armenia,³⁴ dated 19 June 1897, in both the Armenian original and an English translation. The Catholicos responds to the question of the ordination of Armenian candidates for the priesthood by an Episcopal bishop:

In view of the fact that there are no bishops of the Armenian Church in America, who, for the purpose of meeting the spiritual necessities of their countrymen, could perform the office of ordaining priests or monks, you, like a compassionate father, setting aside the differences of religion, which are foreign to Christ, and with all the readiness of affectionate good-will, have expressed a wish to ordain educated and worthy Scripture readers or lectors from among the Armenians in your diocese, and establish them in the Armenian Church, thus following the word of our Lord,—‘Freely ye have received, freely give’.

The Armenian Catholicos is pleased to find in Your Grace a frank appreciation of the unfettered and loving ministration of the Armenian Church which is not wishful to see differences in the one Catholic Church of Christ. In recognizing this, you attest the fact that the Armenian Church is the sister of your own Church, and you do not hesitate, Brother, to add that she is the elder and first sister, founded by the Apostle Thaddeus³⁵ and Saint Gregory the Evangelist of Armenia.³⁶ And as from ancient times the holy fathers of the Armenian Church have established the right of the Armenian people by mutual accord to elect their own pastors, we consider it a sacred matter to leave to the communities that right

³⁴ Mkrtich Khrimian (1820–1907), successively Armenian Patriarch in Constantinople (1869–73), Bishop of Van (1880–5), and Catholicos of All Armenia (1892–1907).

³⁵ By tradition, the Armenian Church claims the apostles Bartholomew and Thaddeus as their founders.

³⁶ Saint Gregory the Illuminator (c.257–c.331 CE) presided over the Armenian Church when the nation adopted Christianity. He established the Mother See at Etchmiadzin.

of election. Therefore the Armenian congregations in America may always choose their own pastors and priests. And when we receive the assurance and confirmation of their election, we shall be ready to accept, and to write and ask Your Grace to consecrate the chosen ones to the service of the Armenian Church. In regard to your question as to whether those ordained by bishops of the Anglican Church would have the right of retaining their rank in the event of leaving America for their native country of Armenia or any other place, I must inform you, most reverend Brother, that the Armenian Church neither would nor could do anything to violate the freedom of the Christian soul. As she has acted down to the present time, so will she continue to act in the future not permitting a second baptism or fresh ordination, in proof of which there are many examples and facts on record.

There is then a letter from Satterlee from his summer residence in the Catskills to the bishop of New York, Henry Codman Potter, dated 13 September 1897. This letter is interesting in that it gives a more complete view of Satterlee's concerns, some of which may also have been expressed in his initial letters to Bebutoff and the Catholicos.

On the one hand, if in response to a request from an Armenian congregation in America, the Catholicos requests one of our bishops to ordain an Armenian Ordinand, to minister as priest to the Armenians; and, if he will recognize our Orders should this Armenian priest return to his home, this will be a matter of some importance in the East. Whatever pledges have been made by the late Archbishop of Canterbury to the Assyrian Church would not touch the case of the Armenian Church.³⁷ On the other hand we would not compromise our own Church in the slightest degree as this Armenian Ordinand would be ordained by our own Rite, he would profess belief in the Nicene Creed as we accept and recite it (including even the Filioque). If the objection is made that the Armenian Church is Monophysite (which I do not believe for all the most intelligent Armenians I have met deny it) or that it accepts only three General Councils (which is true), then we are perfectly safe. We have not committed ourselves to any uncatholic or unorthodox position.³⁸

Finally, there is a fourth letter in the box from the Reverend John Lindsay, the rector of Saint Paul's Church, Boston, to Bishop Satterlee, dated either 12 or 13 October 1897, in which he enquires about the correspondence with the Catholicos, and in which he expresses the view that such ordinations represent 'a great opportunity'.

The precise story is hard to piece together from the evidence that remains, but the documents raise the fundamental matter of the way in which the

³⁷ See J. F. Coakley, *The Church of the East and the Church of England: A History of the Archbishop of Canterbury's Assyrian Mission* (Oxford, 1992); J. F. Coakley, 'The Orthodoxy of the Church of the East: Some Early Voices', *The Messenger* (the official publication of the Church of the East), 11 (Mar. 1995): 32-5.

³⁸ See n. 32.

Catholicos viewed the Anglican Church as a sister Church—albeit a younger sister Church. This correspondence took place a quarter of a century before there was discussion among the Byzantine Orthodox about Anglican Orders. As it happened, other developments occurred before any such ordinations took place, so the views that were expressed by Bebutoff and the Catholicos were never tested. By 1898 there was a resident Armenian bishop in the United States, and though it took some time to establish a regular diocesan administration, the crisis of the supply of clergy for the Armenian communities had passed.

This is a highly significant correspondence in the history of Anglican–Armenian relations. The letter of the Catholicos is clear enough: should anyone be ordained by an Episcopal bishop, there would be no ‘fresh ordination’. Such ordinations would have been recognized in the same way that previous ordinations by the Roman Catholic Church had been recognized. According to this correspondence, this recognition was a matter of course by one ancient, catholic tradition of another, and although there were no ordinations under these conditions, the fact that the Armenian Orthodox Church so recognized the Episcopal Church—and by extension the Anglican Communion—in this way at this time, before the age of ecumenical dialogue and any academic study of Anglican Orders, is of profound significance for the history of Anglican–Oriental Orthodox relations. This would be the view also, for a time, of the leading bishop of the Russian Church in Exile in the early twentieth century, Metropolitan Antonii Khrapovitsky, who came to the conclusion in the late 1920s on the basis of the work of the Russian theologian V. A. Sokolov that Anglican clergy could be received into Orthodoxy in their orders after confession and absolution.³⁹

THE REBUILDING OF THE CATHEDRAL OF CHRIST THE SAVIOUR, MOSCOW

A second significant episode in the history of Anglican relations with the Churches and Christians of the East ‘to be a friend in need and danger’ in the twentieth century was the role of the Episcopal diocese of New York in the rebuilding of the Cathedral of Christ the Saviour in Moscow. The cathedral, established by imperial decree to commemorate the victory of Russia over Napoleon in 1812, took over forty years to build, and was consecrated on 26 May 1883, at the time of the coronation of Tsar Alexander III. It stood near

³⁹ Metropolitan Anthony Khrapovitsky, ‘Why Anglican Clergy Could be Received in their Orders’, *The Christian East* (Mar. 1927): 60–9.

the Kremlin and became a centre for church and civic life in the city. Here there were celebrations for the 500th anniversary of the death of Saint Sergius of Radonezh, the centenary of the War of 1812, and the 300th anniversary of the Romanov dynasty in 1913. It was inevitable that this church building would become the special focus of the attention of the Soviet government after the Revolution, and Patriarch Tikhon tried in vain to keep the cathedral open and functioning after 1918. Eventually Stalin decided to demolish the building to make way for a new Palace of the Soviets, with the expectation that this secular temple would replace the cathedral in the hearts and minds of the people. The projected Palace of the Soviets was never built, and eventually a largely unused public swimming pool, the Moskva Basin, was constructed on the site. The newsreel footage of the dynamiting of the church is one of the most famous images of Stalin's campaign against the Church.⁴⁰

With the beginnings of *glasnost* and *perestroika* in the late 1980s during the leadership of Mikhail Gorbachev, and the final dismantling of the Soviet Union on 26 December 1991, a new day dawned for the Russian Orthodox Church. In February 1990 the Holy Synod voted to rebuild the cathedral and the Church appealed to the government for permission to reconstruct the church on its original site. In 1994 the Moscow municipal government gave the necessary permission, and on the Feast of the Transfiguration, 19 August 2000, the patriarch, in the presence of hundreds of bishops, clergy, and faithful, consecrated the new Cathedral of Christ the Saviour, 117 years after the consecration of the original church. At that service of consecration were four Anglican clerics, two bishops and two priests of the Episcopal Church, the only representatives of any Western Church to be invited to the celebrations.⁴¹ They were there because the Episcopal Church played a crucial role in making the reconstruction of the cathedral possible.

In the summer of 1992, a joint consultation on episcopacy, composed of members of the Episcopal Church and the Russian Orthodox Church, met at the recently restored Danilovsky Monastery in Moscow. Present at that consultation were, among others, Bishop Richard Grein of New York and the Reverend Canon Professor J. Robert Wright, long-time professor of Church History at the General Theological Seminary in New York, one of that Church's most experienced ecumenists.⁴² In an apparent attempt to ensure that the cathedral could never be rebuilt, Stalin sent all plans and photographs of the first church out of the country. Why Stalin sent the material out of the country rather than destroying it is not known, but the collection was sold to an unknown purchaser in Berlin, and eventually made

⁴⁰ The video is available at <<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=YFlx55OANG8>> (accessed 1 Apr. 2014).

⁴¹ *The Episcopal New Yorker [ENY]* (Oct./Nov. 2000), pp. 1, 6.

⁴² See J. Robert Wright (ed.), *On Being a Bishop* (New York, 1993).

its way to the New York Public Library's unique Slavic Collection. Wright knew of the existence of the drawings and photographs, and with a grant from Saint Thomas Episcopal Church, Fifth Avenue, an album of reproductions was made as a gift to the Russian Church. At the lunch after the consecration of the cathedral, Patriarch Alexei singled out Bishop Grein for special thanks, and remarked, 'If you want a model for ecumenical relations, look at the relationship between the Orthodox and the Anglican Church, especially the one forged by the Bishop of New York.'⁴³

However, in less than a decade after this event, the Church of Russia would break off all official relations with the Episcopal Church and relations with the rest of the Anglican Communion, including the Church of England, would be significantly imperilled. After the end of communism, anti-Western attitudes in Russia grew generally, and this affected relations between the Churches. Also, developments in Anglicanism concerning the ordination of women, human sexuality, and the theological views of some Anglican bishops, became hindrances. So the involvement of the Episcopal Church in the rebuilding of the Cathedral of Christ the Saviour now finds no mention in any of the official reports of the events.

The participation of the Episcopal Church in helping to restore the Cathedral of Christ the Saviour was but a more obvious and visible example of other activities, both large and small, extending back before 1917, between Anglicans and Orthodox in Middle Eastern, Eastern European, and former Soviet countries that seem to have been forgotten since the fall of the Soviet system and the subsequent freedom of the Russian Church in particular to rebuild itself and expand its reach.

CONCLUSION

'I entered the ranks of the ecumenical movement in its early pioneering, when it was headed by broad-minded and strong-willed men and women who dedicated themselves selflessly and disinterestedly to this sacred cause . . . Their labours were not in vain.'⁴⁴ These words of the Russian Orthodox layman and ecumenist Nicolas Zernov sum up the efforts of the many in the twentieth century who worked indefatigably to open the life, theology, spirituality, and worship of the Anglican and Eastern traditions each to the other.

While it remains true that both the Anglican Communion and the Eastern Churches stood to gain from their relations during the twentieth century, it is

⁴³ See <<http://www.xxc.ru/english/index.htm>>; *ENY* (Sept./Oct. 1992), pp. 2, 6–7; *ENY* (Oct./Nov. 2000), pp. 1, 6.

⁴⁴ Zernov, *Sunset Years*, p. 58.

not correct to attribute to the relationship political or even ecclesiastical advantage alone. The significant theological literature that has been written as a consequence of these relationships and in service to their official and unofficial dialogue is witness to the fundamental truth of Zernov's assertion: on the subject of Anglican Orders alone the published work is extensive and important, and this does not take into consideration a range of arguably more crucial issues like the nature of God, ecclesiology, the care of creation, and anthropology.

In a sermon that Metropolitan Anthony Bloom preached in 1972,⁴⁵ he asked whether the fruits of the eucharistic life had become evident in the Churches, and whether those fruits might be evidence of a deeper communion than that of which Christians are aware. The history shared by the Anglican Communion and the Churches of the Christian East in the twentieth century provides ample evidence of just such deeper communion.

SELECT BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Allchin, A. M., *The Kingdom of Love and Knowledge: The Encounter between Orthodoxy and the West* (London, 1979).
- Anglican–Orthodox Joint Doctrinal Commission, *Anglican–Orthodox Dialogue: The Dublin Agreed Statement 1984* (London, 1984).
- Bell, G. K. A., *Documents in Christian Unity 1920–1924* (London, 1924).
- Brown, Leslie W., *The Indian Christians of St Thomas* (Cambridge, 1983).
- Coakley, J. F., *The Church of the East and the Church of England: A History of the Archbishop of Canterbury's Assyrian Mission* (Oxford, 1992).
- Doll, Peter M. (ed.), *Anglicanism and Orthodoxy: 300 Years after the 'Greek College' in Oxford* (Oxford, 2006).
- Douglas, J. A., *The Relations of the Anglican Churches with the Eastern-Orthodox especially in regard to Anglican Orders* (London, 1921).
- Fouyas, Methodios, *Orthodoxy, Roman Catholicism and Anglicanism* (London, 1972).
- Geffert, Bryn, *Eastern Orthodox and Anglicans: Diplomacy, Theology, and the Politics of Interwar Ecumenism* (Notre Dame, IN, 2010).
- Hardy, E. R., *Orthodox Statements on Anglican Orders* (New York, 1946).
- Hill, Henry (ed.), *Light from the East: A Symposium on the Oriental Orthodox and Assyrian Churches* (Toronto, 1988).
- International Commission for Anglican–Orthodox Theological Dialogue, *The Church of the Triune God: The Cyprus Agreed Statement of the International Commission for Anglican–Orthodox Theological Dialogue 2006* (London, 2006).

⁴⁵ Metropolitan Anthony Bloom, 'Church Divided and United, 10 November 1972', *Sobornost*, 37 (2015): 28–30.

- International Commission for Anglican–Orthodox Theological Dialogue, *In the Image and Likeness of God: A Hope-Filled Anthropology. The Buffalo Statement agreed by the International Commission for Anglican-Orthodox Dialogue* (London 2015).
- Istavridis, V. T., *Orthodoxy and Anglicanism*, trans. Colin Davey (London, 1966).
- Litvack, Leon, *J. M. Neale and the Quest for Sobornost* (Oxford, 1994).
- Pennington, Judith, *Anglicans and Orthodox: Unity and Subversion 1559–1725* (Leominster, 2003).
- Taylor, William, *Antioch and Canterbury: The Syrian Orthodox Church and the Church of England 1874–1928* (Piscataway, NJ, 2005).
- Taylor, William, *Narratives of Identity: The Syrian Orthodox Church and the Church of England 1895–1914* (Newcastle-upon-Tyne, 2013).
- Waddams, Herbert (ed.), *The Anglo-Russian Conference Moscow, July 1956* (London, 1958).
- Ware, Kallistos and Colin Davey (eds.), *Anglican–Orthodox Dialogue: The Moscow Agreed Statement* (London, 1977).
- Zernov, Nicolas, *Orthodox Encounter: The Christian East and the Ecumenical Movement* (London, 1961).

Anglicanism in Southern Africa during the Twentieth Century

Robert S. Heaney

The South Africa War of 1899–1902 meant that the twentieth century dawned on a southern Africa in conflict. The twentieth century set on a free southern Africa celebrating the completion of Nelson Mandela's term as South Africa's first black president. Three distinct periods define twentieth-century southern Africa and each bears testimony to the mission of the Church to be a life-giving community amid conflict.

From 1900 to 1947 Anglicans, as the 'English Church', operated with an establishment mentality. They supported British rule and expected that it would support them against the hegemonic intent of the Afrikaners. The era of apartheid South Africa (1948–89) witnessed, at first, an Anglicanism that did not question the legitimacy of the state. The Church focused on its pastoral ministry in the hope of encouraging gradual change. Individual leaders foreshadowed the more oppositional Anglicanism that would contribute to an ecumenical movement that was key in the overthrow of apartheid. In post-apartheid southern Africa (1990–9) questions of peace and reconciliation for the sake of nation-building were prominent and Anglican leaders played significant roles in these issues. Along with the changes this chapter addresses, there also were constants in this century including: race relations, ecumenical relations, and contextualization.

ANGLICANISM IN PRE-APARTHEID SOUTHERN AFRICA, 1900–47

The first half of the twentieth century in southern Africa was dominated by war, industrialization, and increased racial segregation. It was a time when the Union of South Africa came into being. It also was an era of foreign missionary

expansion and an era of growth for African Initiated Churches (AICs). During this period the Afrikaner Churches became inward-looking, sowing the seeds for separatist theologizing. At the same time, a growing ecumenical consciousness was emerging within southern Africa. It was a time when English-speaking Churches, influenced by developments in Britain, became associated with liberal causes. However, liberalism did not challenge the status quo which gave rise to African concern for an Africanized faith.

The South African War had deep impact on Church relations. Anglicans in southern Africa largely supported British policies that challenged Boer hegemony. As a result, the Anglican Church was considered an enemy in the Boer republics and many Anglicans were forced to flee. Beyond the republics, the impact on the Church was varied with areas closer to the fighting being affected the most. The resistance of the Boer republics was broken and by 1902 the Peace of Vereeniging was signed. Throughout the war and in its aftermath Anglican leaders were caught between supporting a social order that would enable the Church to carry out its ministerial functions and speaking out against injustice. This would be a tension that the Church would face in each decade of the twentieth century.

Prior to the war, Anglicans recognized the need for provincial missionary conferences to organize further growth. The first conference of the twentieth century met at Johannesburg in 1906.¹ The missionary conferences were multi-racial with a particular focus on outreach. Topics for consideration included the relationship of Christian faith to African traditions, the salary of black clergy, and liturgy in indigenous languages. In 1906, against a background of so-called 'Ethiopianism', some African delegates sought 'special bishops for Native work' and a separate mission organization. African-led Christian movements and AICs emerged rapidly in the early years of the twentieth century. The concern of such Churches and movements was for greater contextualization, that is, agitation for a more critical theological and ecclesiastical agency, distinct from imported thought and practice, that drew from the particularity of African traditions, cultures, and lived realities. The South African Native Affairs Commission investigated 'the Natives and Native administration' prior to the federation of the colonies.² Along with a Euro-centric reading of southern African history, land tenure, tribal organization, and so-called native culture and politics, the commission addressed the spread of 'Ethiopianism'. The investigation (1903–4) found that 'separatist'

¹ The other twentieth-century conferences were held in 1909 (Bloemfontein), 1913 (Johannesburg), and 1923 (Grahamstown). They were discontinued in 1949. O. M. Suberg, *The Anglican Tradition in South Africa: A Historical Overview* (Pretoria, 1999), p. 72; Cecil Lewis and G. E. Edwards, *Historical Records of the Church of Province of South Africa* (London, 1934), pp. 209–13.

² N.a., *Report of the South African Native Affairs Commission 1903–1905* (Cape Town, 1905), Annexure No. 1.

and 'schismatic' movements, while not a threat to the government, could not be dissociated from political agitation. Among such movements was the Order of Ethiopia.³

The Order originated in 1892 with Methodist minister Mangena Mokena. Its second leader, James Dwane, had a vision for an African and Catholic Church that led him to Anglicanism. In 1900 the Order became an extra-parochial organization within the Province. Dwane became its first Provincial, having been admitted into the Church, confirmed by Archbishop William West Jones, and later ordained deacon by the bishop of Grahamstown, C. E. Cornish.⁴ He was ordained a priest in 1910. Dwane's grandson was made the Order's first bishop in 1982.

Anglicanism has both attracted adherents and prompted local hybridization where the tradition is expressed according to the particularities of social, cultural, and linguistic factors. However, its peculiar relationship to an English legacy has, as with the Order of Ethiopia, raised the question of the extent to which a contextualized faith can still be Anglican. At Johannesburg in 1906, the conference decided that assistant bishops to specifically oversee African mission would not be appointed. Bishop William Carter of Pretoria (to be made archbishop in 1909) was 'cheered when he said that diocesan bishops had no desire to cease to be Fathers in God of all Christians, black and white'.⁵ Such sentiment forestalled any notion that African Anglican Christian formation needed to develop separately.

The Union of South Africa (1910) cast aside concern for African well-being in a discriminatory compromise between the four colonies (the Cape, Natal, the Orange Free State, and the Transvaal). As a concession to the Transvaal and the Orange Free State the constitution discriminated against so-called coloureds and blacks. In 1910, comprised of so-called whites only, the first Parliament sat in Cape Town. This settlement, along with the 1913 Natives Land Act that restricted African purchase or lease of land to 7 per cent of the land area of the Union, sought to further consolidate power in the hands of white people.⁶

³ N.a., *Report*, pp. 63–5; G. J. Pillay, 'Christianity', in J. W. Hofmeyr and G. J. Pillay (eds.), *A History of Christianity in South Africa, Volume 1* (Pretoria, 1994), p. 183; John W. de Gruchy and Steve de Gruchy, *The Church Struggle in South Africa* (25th edn., London, 2004), pp. 43–9.

⁴ Alan Gregor Coble, 'The "African National Church": Self-Determination and Political Struggle Among Black Christians in South Africa to 1948', *Church History*, 60 (1991): 356–71 (pp. 359–61); Lewis and Edwards, *Historical Records*, pp. 217–26. Pillay, 'Christianity', pp. 182–3; n.a., *First General Missionary Conference Held at Johannesburg, July 13–20, 1904* (Johannesburg, 1905), pp. 163–83.

⁵ Lewis and Edwards, *Historical Records*, p. 213.

⁶ Nigel Worden, *The Making of Modern South Africa: Conquest, Apartheid, Democracy* (5th edn., Malden, MA, 2012), pp. 50–7; Khoza Mgojo, 'The Church in History: Struggle and Challenge', in Barney N. Pityana and Charles Villa-Vicencio (eds.), *Being the Church in South Africa Today* (Johannesburg, 1995), pp. 3–11 (p. 4).

Despite the hesitancy of some of their leaders in associating with British ambitions in the war of 1899–1902 and the Great War, Anglicans did not distinguish themselves from the Afrikaans-speaking Churches by eschewing civil religion prior to the Union. On the contrary, Anglican cathedrals were festooned with the memorabilia and memorials of the apparent victories of God through the agency of the British. Imperial theologies have a long pedigree in Anglicanism and while challenged by the Enlightenment, they were not extinguished by it.⁷ It was widely assumed that a benign empire could be a means of blessing. In 1910, English-speaking South Africa was dominant in the civil service, the economy, industry, and education. The normative assumption in both civil society and in the Anglican Church in the post-Union pre-apartheid era was that whites would act as the moral guardians of other races. The Church did speak out against injustices in relation to land distribution, African education, the need for consultative processes, and the need for better housing and living conditions. But given that white guardianship was the basis for such protest, it did not threaten the status quo. Synod resolutions on equality and inclusiveness, and the emergence of leaders like the renowned intellectual Z. K. Matthews (1901–68), had influence but little social change resulted. Resolutions and rising African leaders did nonetheless signal the direction Anglicans would travel as they continued to disagree with the Afrikaner Churches on the ‘native question’.

With the outbreak of the First World War (1914–18), some Anglican clergy from southern Africa served as military chaplains. Bishop Michael Furse of Pretoria, to the displeasure of Archbishop Carter, encouraged his young clergy to do this and by 1917 nearly fifty had become army chaplains leaving twenty-nine to carry out the mission of the diocese.⁸ This led to more lay involvement in the dioceses. The diocese of Pretoria licensed 125 laymen as lay readers and catechists during the war. In the aftermath of the war, returning clergy found engaged lay ministers, some of whom were paid by the diocese. The payment of clergy was also regularized in the post-war era. Hitherto, individual dioceses had different systems of paying clergy. Now, clergy would be paid a fixed sum, increasing after stated periods of service. Despite this, the inter-war depression hit South Africa hard. Many people fell into destitution and, according to a rather sanguine Peter Hinchliff, ‘the Church really discovered what its function was in social and political affairs’ through the lens of an Anglo-Catholic and ‘vaguely socialist’ Christianity.⁹

⁷ Rowan Strong, *Anglicanism and the British Empire c.1700–1850* (Oxford, 2007).

⁸ Michael E. Worsnip, *Between the Two Fires: The Anglican Church and Apartheid, 1948–1957* (Pietermaritzburg, 1991), p. 12.

⁹ Peter Hinchliff, *The Anglican Church in South Africa: An Account of the History and Development of the Church of the Province of South Africa* (London, 1963), pp. 206–32; Shannon Ty Bontrager, ‘The Imagined Crusade: The Church of England and the Mythology of Nationalism and Christianity during the Great War’, *Church History*, 71 (2002): 780–93 (pp. 778–9).

The 1920s was a period of uneasy and uneven transition. Industry and commercial agriculture began to grow resulting in a process that would see the urban workforce expand and the marginalization of farm tenants. A world-wide agricultural depression meant that produce prices dropped and wages decreased. Militancy increased as protest and violence broke out along racial as well as class lines. Into this context the Church welcomed the arrival of bishops from England such as Neville Talbot (Pretoria), Arthur Karney (Johannesburg), and Walter Carey (Bloemfontein) who, while ministering in the 'strongholds of the Nationalist north', would be committed to 'fair play'.¹⁰ Such a description epitomizes the liberalism at work within southern African Anglicanism for much of the twentieth century. Anglican liberalism emphasized the dignity of the individual regardless of colour, and the need for freedom of thought, conscience, speech, movement, and association. The belief that good will and concerted effort would build political stability, economic development, and social justice was prominent.¹¹

Such liberalism did not face the reality that successive governments could not advance a more just future because they were the source of injustice. Anglicanism, an imported tradition with a tendency to support the status quo, at this juncture did not align itself with the aspirations for equality and justice of its African membership. Situated between rising Afrikaner nationalism and African nationalism, the Anglican Church pursued a qualified liberal stance emphasizing civil liberties, the rule of law, the independence of the judiciary, and the potential of democratic means for change. The Church spoke out against unjust land and labour legislation; but it sought good relations with Afrikaner Churches and the government.¹²

Against the background of the Great Depression of the early 1930s, the Englishman Geoffrey Clayton was consecrated bishop of Johannesburg. In his first charge in 1934 he preached, 'We are not going to be all alike in Heaven . . . But we all alike have an equal right to our membership in the Church of God.'¹³ At this 1934 synod a resolution stating, 'Synod expresses its conviction that the only true solution of the Native question is the Christian basis of the *ultimate* right of individuals and nations to full citizenship' was passed

¹⁰ Worden, *Making of Modern South Africa*, pp. 58–64; Hinchliff, *Anglican Church*, p. 232.

¹¹ Mandy Goedhals, 'From Paternalism to Partnership? The Church of the Province of Southern Africa and Mission 1848–1988', in Frank England and Torguil Paterson (eds.), *Bounty in Bondage: The Anglican Church in Southern Africa* (Johannesburg, 1989), pp. 111–21.

¹² Mandy Goedhals, 'African Nationalism and Indigenous Christianity: A Study in the Life of James Calata (1895–1983)', *Journal of Religion in Africa*, 33 (2003): 63–82 (p. 64); John de Gruchy, 'Grappling with a Colonial Heritage: The English-Speaking Churches under Imperialism and Apartheid', in Richard Elphick and Rodney Davenport (eds.), *Christianity in South Africa: A Political, Social, and Cultural History* (Berkeley and Los Angeles, CA, 1997), pp. 155–72 (pp. 156–7).

¹³ Alan Paton, *Apartheid and the Archbishop: The Life and Times of Geoffrey Clayton Archbishop of Cape Town* (New York, 1973), pp. 50–1.

unanimously.¹⁴ Despite such pronouncements, Clayton epitomized the Anglican gradualist liberalism of the time and would be critical of clergy that adopted an activist stance. Ultimately, the Church's stance would shift through the influence of activists within the Church and with its role in an emerging ecumenical movement.

From the General Missionary Conference (GMC), and with founding members coming from the English-speaking Churches, and the Cape and the Transvaal synods of the Dutch Reformed Church (DRC), the Christian Council of South Africa (CCSA) was founded in 1936 focusing on evangelism, study, and service. Hoping to attract Dutch Reformed participation, and against the will of some of its African members, the CCSA avoided addressing the abolition of the limited Cape voting franchise in April 1936, and wider political and racial subjects. In 1968 it would be renamed as the South African Council of Churches (SACC).¹⁵

Even though the CCSA largely avoided divisive racial issues, Afrikaner church leaders considered the gulf between them and the CCSA to be too wide to bridge and, in 1941, the Cape and Transvaal synods withdrew.¹⁶ The gulf between English-speaking and Afrikaans-speaking Churches had been evident prior to the war. In 1938 Afrikaners celebrated the centenary of the so-called Great Trek of the 1830s when disillusionment with the British prompted at least 14,000 Boers to migrate beyond British control. Not a small number of the *Voortrekkers* depicted the trek in terms of the biblical Exodus.¹⁷ Amid such nationalist passion it was not at all clear where South Africa would stand at the outbreak of the Second World War. However, as with the First World War, Anglicans had no doubts about their loyalties. While an 'inseparable relationship between God and Empire' existed for many in the Anglican Church, Afrikaners saw themselves as victims of such conviction and were divided on the question of the war. In September 1939, on the basis of an all-white parliamentary vote of 80 to 67, the Union entered the war on the side of Britain.¹⁸

Black Anglican leadership is often associated with the emergence of key figures in the 1960s and 1970s. However, this is but part of the story and, among other Christians, there were earlier Anglican figures who became

¹⁴ Paton, *Apartheid*, p. 53; Worden, *Making of Modern South Africa*, pp. 76–9.

¹⁵ de Gruchy, 'Grappling with a Colonial Heritage', p. 158; Richard Elphick, 'The Benevolent Empire and the Social Gospel: Missionaries and South African Christians in the Age of Segregation', in Elphick and Davenport (eds.), *Christianity in South Africa*, pp. 347–69 (p. 363).

¹⁶ de Gruchy and de Gruchy, *Church Struggle*, pp. 27–8; Elphick, 'Benevolent Empire', pp. 355–64.

¹⁷ F. A. van Jaarsveld, 'The Afrikaner's Idea of his Calling and Mission in South African History', *Journal of Theology for Southern Africa*, 19 (1977): 16–28; Alton Templin, *Ideology on a Frontier* (Westport, CT, 1984), pp. 99–148.

¹⁸ de Gruchy and de Gruchy, *Church Struggle*, pp. 33–40.

important foci of resistance. Revd James Calata's move to the town of Cradock in 1928 and his exposure to the unemployment, labour conditions, and poverty of the people propelled him into a life of activism. Calata joined the African National Congress (ANC) in 1930, becoming Cape president in the same year and ANC secretary-general in 1936. The 1940s ANC was an organization that espoused 'liberal social and political goals and an evolutionary approach to change'.¹⁹ Despite this, it was not clear to Calata that the Church hierarchy would support him. 'I cannot give up the Church for National work. But I shall do my best to combine the two if the Bishop will permit me.'²⁰ While his bishop, Archibald Cullen, was not sympathetic to Calata's work he received support from Cullen's predecessor in 1930. Francis Robinson Phelps, bishop of Grahamstown, who became archbishop in 1931, referred Calata to the work of Charles Gore (bishop of Oxford and first superior of the Community of the Resurrection) and gave him his blessing on the condition that he not neglect his parish ministry. Cullen, however, pressured Calata to resign from leadership in the ANC and he did so in 1949 just as a more vigorous spirit of militancy within the ANC was emerging. This did not mean that Calata retreated from his commitment to liberation. On the contrary, he continued to support the ANC and had an organizational role during the Defiance Campaign of 1952. As a result, under the Suppression of Communism Act, he was banned from attending any gathering, including church services, for six months. Cullen wrote, 'The Revd. J. A. Calata is not easy to defend.' He was harassed by the police, under suspicion by his bishop, and berated by white Anglicans. Yet it was only in 1961 that the state convicted him, under the Unlawful Organizations Act, for displaying two photographs of ANC members.²¹

Calata understood that racial segregation was a reality both in the country and in his own Church. In the 1940s he advanced the idea of an African Catholic Church within the Province. The proposal was for the election of African bishops and the institution of structures for black Anglicans within the Church. In 1943 the bishops rejected the scheme. Through the ecumenical Interdenominational African Minister's Federation (IDAMF), founded in 1945, Calata sought a thoroughgoing contextualization of the faith. The IDAMF worked with the ANC and Calata chaired its first conference in 1956 as it considered the Tomlinson Commission (1954). The commission was a report on conditions in the so-called Native Reserves and paved the way for the government's creation of homelands for different ethnic groups. The conference rejected the commission's findings and reiterated support

¹⁹ Goedhals, 'African Nationalism and Indigenous Christianity', p. 67.

²⁰ Quoted in Goedhals, 'African Nationalism and Indigenous Christianity', p. 68.

²¹ Goedhals, 'African Nationalism and Indigenous Christianity', pp. 64-72; Bob Clarke, *Anglicans against Apartheid, 1936-1996* (Pietermaritzburg, 2008), pp. 69-73.

for an inter-racial and interdependent South Africa. That same vision fuelled Calata's hopes for an Africanized Church. Citing the example of St Augustine's mission to England, in his 1950 presidential address to the IDAMF he argued, 'the customs of the people were not condemned but allowed to be practised... until the people were educated to see the difference between them and Christ... The process of Christianity evolved from the known to the unknown.'²²

In the 1940s another contextualized, and also charismatic, group within Anglicanism emerged. The group was suspected of being another 'Zionist' group and thus a potential threat to social cohesion and Anglican order. Zionist churches, unlike Ethiopian churches that did not apparently depart far from denominational roots, tended to develop distinct ecclesial cultures that adopted and adapted African beliefs and African prophetic voices alongside received Christian teaching. However, the Legion of Christ's Witnesses (*Iviyo loFakazi bakaKristu*) was Anglican and emerged as one of the earliest forms of charismatic Anglicanism in the world.²³

The movement began in the mid-1940s under the leadership of two Zulu priests, Alpheus Zulu, who eventually became the bishop of Zululand in 1966, and Philip Mbatha. These leaders were concerned with the lack of impact the Christian faith was having in the lives of Church members. The group adapted the rule of life from the Community of the Resurrection with an emphasis on sexual purity and personal evangelism. As in other charismatic groups, some members spoke in tongues, discerned spirits, and performed healings. Though a majority Zulu movement, it reflected a wider charismatic movement within southern African Anglicanism. Indeed, by the 1970s the archbishop of Cape Town (Bill Burnett) was teaching a charismatic faith that the Iviyo movement had begun teaching three decades earlier.²⁴

In 1941, under the editorship of Clayton, a commission of thirty-one white people and two black people produced the *Church and Nation* report. While the document questioned enforced occupational, educational, geographical, social, and political segregation, it failed to declare discrimination on the basis of race a sin. One might call such a position pragmatic or gradualist in that the report reflected an Anglican position that removal of the colour bar was unrealistic at that time. But not all Anglicans could be classified as gradualists. Among those that criticized the report were the Revd Trevor Huddleston

²² Quoted by Goedhals, 'African Nationalism and Indigenous Christianity', pp. 73–5.

²³ Norman Etherington, 'Kingdoms of This World and the Next: Christian Beginnings among Zulu and Swazi', in Elphick and Davenport (eds.), *Christianity in South Africa*, pp. 89–106 (p. 100); Paul Kollman, 'Classifying African Christianities: Past, Present, and Future: Part One', *Journal of Religion in Africa*, 40 (2010): 3–32 (pp. 7–8); Stephen Hayes, *Black Charismatic Anglicans: The Iviyo loFakazi bakaKristu and its Relations with Other Renewal Movements* (Pretoria, 1990), pp. ix–x.

²⁴ Hayes, *Black Charismatic Anglicans*, pp. ix, 8–17; Clarke, *Anglicans*, pp. 303–35.

(Community of the Resurrection) and the Revd Michael Scott (St Alban's Coloured Mission). They represented the minority activist position that was dubious both about government policies changing in light of Church pronouncements, and about the Church's readiness to question the legitimacy of the government. Gradualists such as Clayton reasoned that the activist stance was counterproductive. Such an assessment would be challenged with the introduction of the Native Laws Amendment Bill in 1957.²⁵

In 1944 Scott was involved in the organization of a Johannesburg-based committee that would develop into the Campaign for Right and Justice (CRJ). The short-lived CRJ sought to go further than the *Church and Nation*. A multi-racial committee laid down a programme for justice that included the abolition of racially discriminatory laws and the provision of land for those who remained landless. At the 1944 diocesan synod of Johannesburg Scott's request for support for the CRJ was unsuccessful. His relationship with his Church was further strained when in 1946 he was imprisoned for three months for protesting in Durban against laws passed to restrict the sale of property to Indians, and to limit their political representation to two white senators and three white members of Parliament. In denying the right of clergy to abandon their cures in favour of civil disobedience at the Johannesburg synod in 1946, Clayton opposed Scott.²⁶

In summary, during this period the dominant Anglican narrative on race was 'pragmatic' and gradualist. It argued that it was God's intention for equality and that meant a colour bar could not operate within the body of Christ. However, the Church existed in the world. It must be realistic about what could be achieved and work towards incremental change through public pronouncements addressing government policies. Individual activists had recognized that this approach often resulted in complicity with a racist agenda, and distracted believers from the *de facto* divisions within the Church along lines that mirrored the DRC. Ecumenical relations during the period were focused on Protestant cooperation. There was, in the wake of the 1899–1902 war, an ongoing desire to include the DRC in ecumenical thinking and strategizing. This meant that addressing racism and policies of segregation was set aside in favour of ecumenism involving Dutch Reformed Christians. Given the dominance of white concerns and white leadership within the Church, contextualization in this period was associated with the rise of AICs. The Anglican Church had limited success in incorporating contextualized

²⁵ Worsnip, *Between the Two Fires*, pp. 22–37, 134–53; Paton, *Apartheid*, pp. 113–22; Trevor Huddleston, *Naught for Your Comfort* (London, 1956), p. 78.

²⁶ Rob Skinner, 'Michael Scott and the Campaign for Right and Justice', Workshop on South Africa in the 1940s, Southern Africa Research Center, Kingston (Sept. 2003), <<http://www.sahistory.org.za/sites/default/files/Michael%20Scott%2C%20by%20Rob%20Skinner.pdf>> (accessed 6 July 2016); Worsnip, *Between the Two Fires*, pp. 73–84.

spiritual expressions. While African spirituality existed within the Church it failed to effect policy changes in a Church dominated by white leadership.²⁷

ANGLICANISM AND APARTHEID SOUTH AFRICA, 1948–89

Under the leadership of D. F. Malan, the National Party made apartheid the basis of its campaign in the 1948 election campaign. It won a narrow majority promising protection of distinct cultures, a decisive 'native policy', curtailment of the influx of Africans to urban areas, control of labour mobility, and the abolition of white representatives for Africans in Parliament. The National Party would retain control of the government from 1948 until 1994. On 17 November 1948 Bishop Clayton was elected archbishop of Cape Town and enthroned on 2 February 1949. It would be during his tenure (1949–57) that the Church would move towards direct confrontation with the state.

During the 1950s apartheid was constructed through a series of legislative measures. For example, the Population Registration Act that classified people as either 'white', coloured, 'Asiatic' (Indian), or 'Native' ('Bantu' or 'African') was passed in 1950. The Group Areas Act (1950) required separate residential areas based on race. The Abolition of Passes and Coordination of Documents Act (1952) required Africans at the age of sixteen to carry a reference book stating they had the right to be in a particular area. Further measures to quash resistance to the state were also set in place. The Suppression of Communism Act (1950) and the Criminal Law Amendment Act (1953) gave the state powers to ban those involved in resisting apartheid, and to impose penalties for those involved in civil disobedience. The 1954 Natives Resettlement Act gave power to the state to remove Africans to designated townships. The Promotion of Bantu Self-Government Act (1959) created 'Bantu Homelands' that granted a degree of self-government designed to embed localized 'ethnic' loyalty over against national political ambitions.

The series of segregationist acts that Malan's government introduced provoked the growing militancy of the ANC, along with the South African Indian Congress (SAIC). The Defiance Campaign of 1952, accompanied by days of prayer, was the first countrywide movement of civil disobedience to challenge the regime of apartheid by flaunting laws that segregated facilities and residential areas. While the Anglican Church leadership stayed aloof, the civil servant and Anglican layman Patrick Duncan, who resigned from the civil service, made headlines by joining the campaign and was imprisoned briefly at

²⁷ Worsnip, *Between the Two Fires*, p. 54.

the beginning of 1953. In private correspondence, and in contrast to how he responded to Huddleston's involvement in defiance, Clayton, though doubting the effects of the campaign, praised Duncan as being 'on the side of the angels'.²⁸

The Bantu Education Act (1953) threatened Church schools by bringing them under the auspices of the Department of Native Affairs and introducing a curriculum 'suited' to 'Bantu culture'. The Church was opposed to such a proposal but Anglicans were divided over how to respond to it. Meeting in 1954 the bishops came to a majority view that the Church should not 'make itself responsible for taking part in such an educational system'. However, they were prepared to lease buildings to the state lest teachers lose their jobs and many children receive no formal education. Bishop Reeves refused to choose this path, meaning the schools in his diocese of Johannesburg closed.²⁹

The Native Laws Amendment Bill of 1957 contained the so-called 'Church Clause'. This required churches established from 1938 in 'white' areas that admitted African worshippers to receive the permission of the Minister of Native Affairs to continue. Further, any 'meeting, assembly or gathering' that included Africans in such areas also needed state permission. After consultation with the Emergency Committee of the Episcopal Synod, made up of Bishops Cullen (Grahamstown), Ambrose Reeves (Johannesburg), Thomas Inman (Natal), and Selby Taylor (Pretoria), Clayton drafted a letter to the Prime Minister. The Church could not recognize the right of the government to determine how believers worshipped. No outcome but the removal of this clause would be acceptable. The clause was later amended so that the penalty for breaking the law would not fall on the Church or clergy but on the African attending the gathering. It was passed on 17 May.³⁰ This 1957 direct defiance of the government in light of the 'Church Clause', in many respects marked a watershed in the Church's relationship with the government and apartheid. In the midst of organized and grassroots protests by parents organizing 'freedom schools' to displace Bantu education, and by women protesting against pass laws, the Church had reached a turning point.³¹ The gradualism of Clayton's earlier career was overtaken by an oppositional posture already present in the ministries of Anglicans such as Scott, Duncan, Huddleston, Reeves, Calata, and Matthews. On 7 March 1957, the day that Clayton signed the letter to the Prime Minister, and after writing another letter to the archbishop of Canterbury explaining this new stance for the Church, he was found dead in his study. Archbishop Joost de Blank, enthroned in October 1957, would lead the

²⁸ Worsnip, *Between the Two Fires*, pp. 87–92; Clarke, *Anglicans*, pp. 68–71.

²⁹ Clarke, *Anglicans*, pp. 81–4.

³⁰ Worsnip, *Between the Two Fires*, pp. 135–7; Clarke, *Anglicans*, pp. 26, 128–31; Paton, *Apartheid*, pp. 275–82.

³¹ Shrieen Hassim, *Women's Organizations and Democracy in South Africa: Contesting Authority* (Madison, WI, 2006), pp. 47–84.

Church from 1957 to 1963. According to a diary entry that he wrote in December 1957, he intended to maintain 'the Buddha's "noble silence" ... as long as possible'.³² As it turned out, the possibility of silence was short-lived.

During the 1960s apartheid was further entrenched through increased state control and new strategies for dealing with resistance. For example, allowed to serve out their terms, the Natives Representatives left Parliament in 1960. The size of the police force was increased through an influx of Afrikaner recruits, and the General Law Amendment Act (1963) gave the police power to detain suspects without trial. The Pan Africanist Congress (PAC) was founded in 1959 opposing the ANC's multi-racial vision in favour of a black nationalism. Both the PAC and the ANC were banned in 1960. In 1964 the Bantu Labour Act forbade Africans from applying for employment in towns, or employers accepting them unless they were approved by a state labour bureau. Despite such laws and the brutality of the security forces, the wider context seemed to point to change. Revolutions in Angola (1961–74) and Mozambique (1964–74), as well as independence for Zambia (1964), along with the increased militancy of the ANC and PAC highlighted the unsustainability of minority white governments.³³ Notwithstanding these developments, and the British Prime Minister Harold Macmillan's famous 1960 'winds of change' speech in South Africa, conflict intensified in the country.

In March 1960 the police opened fire in Sharpeville on an anti-pass demonstration. This was a protest against the reference book that Africans were required to carry which included an employer's signature authorizing the carrier to be in a particular area. The Sharpeville demonstration was part of a day of wider resistance where protesters presented themselves to police stations without passes for arrest thus overwhelming the jails. In Sharpeville 20,000 protested against the pass laws. Sixty-nine people were killed. It resulted in international condemnation and the government's banning of the ANC and PAC. In response, the archbishop condemned the DRC, demanding that they repudiate apartheid or be expelled from the WCC. He further demanded that the WCC send a 'fact-finding' team to South Africa. De Blank's strident condemnation and rejection of the DRC alarmed the archbishop of Canterbury, the WCC, and some of his own clergy. In the end, the WCC sent Robert Bilheimer, an associated general secretary and minister of the United Presbyterian Church in the USA.³⁴

Facilitated by the WCC and the CCSA, an ecumenical consultation was held in Johannesburg (Cottesloe) from 7–14 December 1960. All but two of the

³² John S. Peart-Binns, *Archbishop Joost de Blank: Scourge of Apartheid* (London, 1987), p. 108.

³³ Frederick Cooper, *Africa since 1940: The Past of the Present* (Cambridge, 2007), p. 133; Elizabeth Isichei, *A History of Christianity in Africa: From Antiquity to the Present* (Grand Rapids, MI, 1995), pp. 299–322.

³⁴ Peart-Binns, *Archbishop Joost de Blank*, pp. 164–8.

delegations at the Cottesloe Consultation were inter-racial and the Anglican delegation, led by de Blank, included black leaders Bishop Alphaeus Zulu (assistant bishop of St John's) and Professor Z. K. Matthews. Representatives of the DRC included Beyers Naudé who in 1963 would found the non-racial and ecumenical Christian Institute. The concluding statement of the consultation rejected all forms of unjust discrimination. It affirmed that spiritual unity in Christ must be expressed in visible expressions of worship and common work across cultures and races. The consultation detailed specific issues that would require action in relation to just trials, Asians in South Africa, multi-racial worship, freedom to preach, and methods of further cooperation. However, just as the proposals were broad-ranging so was the government's response. The consultation was condemned by Prime Minister Verwoerd, conservative groups within the DRC, and eventually by the DRC more broadly. In April 1961, a month after South Africa became a republic, the DRC left the WCC.³⁵

Even with the apparent failure of Cottesloe, ecumenical opposition and Anglican leadership within the South African ecumenical movement continued. In 1967, a theological commission founded by the South African Council of Churches was set up, and in 1968 produced the *Message to the People of South Africa*. The *Message* sought to explicate the repercussions for South Africa of the reconciling work of God found in Christ. De Gruchy summarizes the central theme of a text that garnered the signature of 600 Christian ministers: 'apartheid and separate development attacked the church at its center; they denied the work of Christ'.³⁶ The *Message*, drafted by future archbishop Bill Burnett and DRC theologian Beyers Naudé, declared that apartheid was 'a false faith' and 'a novel gospel'. The Anglican Provincial Synod responded with full support for the *Message*.³⁷

By 1969 the Church of the Province of South Africa had sixteen dioceses and twenty-three bishops, and three black bishops—Alphaeus Zulu (Zululand), Ernest Sobukwe (suffragan of St John's), and Fortescue Makheta (suffragan of Lesotho)—455 white priests, 324 African priests, and twenty-seven coloured priests. Figures for the laity were estimated to be over 800,000 with almost 300,000 being African and another 400,000 not classified in any racial group. There were just over 60,000 white members of the Church, and about the same number who were classified as coloured. Robert Selby Taylor became archbishop in 1964 with a focus on realizing an Anglicanism that was inter-racial and ecumenical. He would come to the conclusion, in 1970, that the Church

³⁵ de Gruchy and de Gruchy, *Church Struggle*, pp. 58–67, 124; J. W. de Gruchy and W. B. de Villiers (eds.), *The Message in Perspective: A Book about 'A Message to the People of South Africa'* (Braamfontein, 1968), pp. 8–11; Peart-Binns, *Archbishop Joost de Blank*, pp. 182–91.

³⁶ de Gruchy and de Gruchy, *Church Struggle*, p. 117.

³⁷ de Gruchy and de Villiers (eds.), *Message in Perspective*, pp. 13, 38; Clarke, *Anglicans*, pp. 303–9.

was being persecuted by the state. This oppositional stance taken by Anglicans at the end of Clayton's life and throughout de Blank's episcopal ministry could not, however, hide the fact that there was still a gap between the Church's rhetoric and the reality of a Church of racial inequality in its own life. During Selby Taylor's time as archbishop parity of clergy stipends between black and white clergy would be achieved and 'challenge groups' initiated at diocesan and parish levels in an attempt to build greater diversity in leadership roles.³⁸

Black Christians and leaders, including Anglicans, were involved in grassroots movements for liberation during the twentieth century. While episcopal Anglican leadership was important in the twentieth century, grassroots resistance, contextualization, and theologizing that equipped such resistance were equally important. Even in the most brutal of circumstances, those most disadvantaged and disenfranchised in apartheid South Africa theologized and resisted. Black Consciousness was one movement that became foundational to such effective resistance. It recognized and affirmed the inherent worth, potential, and power of the black community. Drawing on, for example, language from the American civil rights and Black Power movements, as well as the work of Frantz Fanon, its significance is well expressed by Mamphela Ramphele as, 'conscientizing Black people to fight . . . dehumanization'. Such dehumanization was both physical and psychological and the 'latter form of oppression is . . . more virulent than the former, given the fact that it inhibits the capacity of the oppressed to organize and resist oppression'.³⁹ The movement emerged from the South African Student's Organization (SASO), founded in 1967 under the leadership of Steve Biko, and included Anglican voices such as Ramphele (medical doctor and academic) and Barney Pityana (lawyer and theologian). The movement was rooted in black communities for the service of those communities. For example, while running a health clinic, Ramphele coordinated black community programmes that delivered literary classes, dressmaking, and health education. Of the period and the movement Pityana writes, 'the oppressed people must give themselves the freedom to rebel against oppression and to so free themselves and their thinking that they would dare to imagine another possibility'.⁴⁰

Given the religious commitment of most people in oppressed communities, imagining another future would not be conceived by circumventing religion

³⁸ Clarke, *Anglicans*, pp. 230–96.

³⁹ Mamphela Ramphele, 'On Being Anglican: The Pain and the Privilege', in England and Paterson (eds.), *Bounty in Bondage*, pp. 177–90 (p. 180); William Beinart, *Twentieth-Century South Africa* (2nd edn., Oxford, 2001), pp. 233–4.

⁴⁰ N. Barney Pityana, 'Black Consciousness, Black Theology, Student Activism, and the Shaping of the New South Africa', The Inaugural Steve Biko Memorial Lecture, London School of Economics and Political Science (9 Oct. 2012), <<http://www.sahistory.org.za/sites/default/files/Steve%20Biko%20Memorial%20Lecture-Europe%202012.pdf>> (accessed 19 July 2016), p. 6; Clarke, *Anglicans*, pp. 280, 544.

but by reinterpreting it in relation to African cultures and under African leadership. Thus, the movement of black theology became important to the Church's mission. Institutionally, the movement began in 1970 with the Black Theology Project (BTP) of the University Christian Movement (UCM) under the direction of an Anglican student leader, later priest, Sabelo Ntwasa, and Methodist minister Basil Moore. In 1973, under Moore's editorship and as a result of a series of seminars on the theme in 1971, *Black Theology: The South African Voice* was published. It provoked strong political backlash by the government resulting in its banning and the banning of Moore and Ntwasa.⁴¹

The future archbishop Desmond Tutu helped to shape black theology in southern Africa. Writing in the 1970s, Tutu reflected, 'We blacks have been defined too often in the white man's terms—we are non-white, non-European-negatives.' Defining black theology, he wrote that it is 'not... academic... It is a gut level theology, relating to real concerns.' Black theology seeks 'to make sense of the life experience of the black man, which is largely black suffering at the hands of rampant white racism'. Further, 'No permission is being requested for it to come into being... the time has passed when we will wait for the white man to give us permission to do our thing.'⁴² Tutu's appointment as the first black dean of a South African cathedral would ensure that black theology would beat close to the heart of the Anglican Church beyond the disbandment of the UCM in 1972.

Tutu was installed as dean of Johannesburg on 31 August 1975. Less than a year later, in June 1976, an event took place that would overshadow even the Sharpeville massacre. According to government policy, African secondary schoolchildren were to be taught in both Afrikaans and English. Despite the fact that there were not enough teachers in Soweto qualified to teach in Afrikaans, the Bantu education department demanded that the policy be implemented. The dean of Johannesburg lived in Soweto and peaceful protests began near his home on 16 June. The police met the protesters with intimidation and then violence. Further violence soon erupted across the country. In the ten months after 16 June, at least 575 were dead and 2,389 wounded.⁴³ The Soweto uprising provoked further resistance and fuelled a movement towards liberation. Inspiration also was found beyond South Africa as white rule collapsed in Angola (1974), Mozambique (1975), and Zimbabwe (1979). Tutu knew, however, that deep changes would need to take place in South Africa before freedom would be realized. Just before becoming bishop of

⁴¹ Mokgethi Motlhabi, 'Phases of Black Theology in South Africa: A Historical Review', *Religion and Theology*, 16 (2009): 162–80 (p. 165); Gerald West, 'The Legacy of Liberation Theologies in South Africa, with an Emphasis on Biblical Hermeneutics', *Studia Historiae Ecclesiasticae* 36 (2016): 157–83 (p. 161); Clarke, *Anglicans*, pp. 281–2.

⁴² Quoted in John Allen, *Rabble-Rouser for Peace: The Authorized Biography of Desmond Tutu* (New York, 2006), pp. 135–9.

⁴³ Worden, *Making of Modern South Africa*, pp. 129–30; Cooper, *Africa since 1940*, p. 148.

Lesotho, Tutu wrote in his parish newsletter, 'Tell [your fellow whites] that peace and order which are found at the end of a gun barrel will be brittle... Tell them there can be no lasting security there. Tell them that unless radical changes are effected in the ordering of society, then South Africa cannot survive.' After Soweto, outraged at the muted response of white Anglicans to the murder of schoolchildren, he preached a sermon to his congregation on 20 June 1976. Tutu asked his hearers if they would have reacted differently if the children had been white. He told them their silence was 'deafening'.⁴⁴

Tutu was elected bishop of Lesotho before the Soweto uprising and agonized over whether to leave. He was consecrated bishop on 11 July 1976 and enthroned in the Cathedral of St Mary and St James in Maseru, Lesotho three weeks later. In March 1978, Tutu returned to South Africa as head of the South African Council of Churches. This was a position he held until he was elected bishop of Johannesburg in November 1984. He would become archbishop of Cape Town in 1986. For the next twenty years, due to his prominence in the Anglican episcopate, Tutu would become 'the lens through which the world witnessed the South African struggle'.⁴⁵

The 1980s was a time of 'virtual civil war' with the military occupying black townships and an increase in detentions and repressive actions on the part of the state.⁴⁶ Under the chairmanship of Archbishop Philip Russell, the provincial synod in November 1982 declared apartheid to be totally 'unchristian, evil and a heresy'.⁴⁷ As opposition against apartheid grew stronger, repression continued with the well-resourced State Security Council coordinating propaganda, disinformation, and assassinations against those adjudged to be destabilizing the state. All the while Prime Minister P. W. Botha presented himself as a reformer. Part of Botha's 'reforms' included the 1983 'tricameral' constitution introduced under the guise of power-sharing. Separate assemblies for white, coloured, and Indian representatives were created giving each group control over education, health, and community administration. Africans, still considered citizens of the homelands, were not given any representation in this version of 'power-sharing'. Rather, the Black Local Authorities Act (1982) gave township Community Councils more power. Neither the tricameral constitution nor increased grassroots administrative power commanded any widespread support and only 13 per cent of Indians and 18 per cent of so-called coloured voters participated. The United Democratic Front, a coalition of more than 600 organizations, arose in direct opposition to the new constitution in 1983. They worked secretly with leaders of the exiled ANC and adopted the Freedom Charter of 1955. The charter had emerged from a

⁴⁴ Allen, *Rabble-Rouser*, pp. 145–58.

⁴⁵ David Taylor quoted by Clarke, *Anglicans*, p. 556.

⁴⁶ Worden, *Making of Modern South Africa*, p. 131.

⁴⁷ Clarke, *Anglicans*, p. 384.

broad-based movement in the wake of the 1952 Defiance Campaign and declared that 'South Africa belongs to all who live in it, black and white.' Under the leadership of Tutu and Allan Boesak, an internationally renowned minister and scholar in the black Reformed Church, the movement embraced all who stood against apartheid. It orchestrated and supported school boycotts, boycotts of white businesses, rent strikes, set up child care and rape crisis support, and produced anti-apartheid theatre.⁴⁸

As political movements and fellowship proved vital in combating apartheid so too the ecumenical movement and the Anglican role in it continued to be an important link to wider protest movements. On 13 September 1985 a group of theologians published the so-called 'Kairos document'. It identified three types of theology at work in the Churches: 'state theology', 'Church theology', and 'prophetic theology'. State theology justified the status quo by equating the language of 'law and order' with justice. The document declared that the 'god of the South African State is . . . the antichrist'.⁴⁹ Church theology belonged to the English-speaking Churches and stood for reconciliation without repentance, gave in to justice determined by the oppressor, and was predicated on a notion of non-violence that did not distinguish between repression and resistance. The authors called for a prophetic theology characterized by an ability in light of the gospel to read 'the signs of the times'. The authors called Christians who found themselves 'on the side of the oppressor or sitting on the fence, to cross over to the other side to be united in faith and action with those who are oppressed'. This meant participating in 'the struggle for liberation', though the document did not give explicit support for armed resistance. It would mean participating in boycotts and 'naming' the particularities of South African evils in Church liturgies and activities. It would mean involvement with those involved in the struggle, and it would mean involvement in civil disobedience. Thirty of the ministers and theologians that signed it, a fifth of the signatories, were Anglican. Though Tutu 'supported its thrust', and his two suffragans (Edward Mackenzie and Geoff Quinlan) signed it, he did not sign it. He felt it was 'abrasive and too easily dismissive of the white leadership of the multiracial churches'.⁵⁰

In December 1985, the SACC called an emergency meeting with the WCC in Harare, Zimbabwe. Bishop Tutu along with Archbishop Russell and Bishop Kenneth Oram (Grahamstown) represented the province. The 'Harare statement' would meet with Tutu's approval when he judged it 'as important to our struggle as the Barmen Declaration was to the Confessing Churches in

⁴⁸ Worden, *Making of Modern South Africa*, pp. 134–6; Beinart, *Twentieth-Century South Africa*, p. 255.

⁴⁹ Gary S. D. Leonard (ed.), *Kairos: The Moment of Truth—The Kairos Documents* (KwaZulu-Natal, 2010), pp. 49–54.

⁵⁰ Allen, *Rabble-Rouser*, p. 288.

Germany'. The statement identified the end of 1985 as the 'kairos moment' and the 'last hour for non-violent means to deal with apartheid'. It called for an end to the state of emergency, the withdrawal of the army from townships, the release of political prisoners and those detained, the safe return of those exiled, the unbanning of organizations, and political negotiations.⁵¹

In May 1987, the 'Lusaka Statement' was produced as a result of a meeting of the WCC's Programme to Combat Racism. Among the Anglicans present at the meeting were Barney Pityana, Michael Lapsley (an Anglican priest and member of the ANC), and Sheena Duncan (teacher, member of the anti-apartheid women's movement called the Black Sash, and chairperson of 'Gun Free South Africa'). This statement went beyond even the radical tone of the 'Kairos document' by stating that the oppression of apartheid 'compelled' those involved in the liberation movement to take up arms. Controversially, in November 1987 the provincial standing committee of the Church 'accepted' the 'Lusaka Statement'. This acceptance alarmed many white Anglicans and demonstrated that while the Anglican Church leadership took an oppositional stance against the apartheid government there were still key issues, such as justifying armed resistance and imposing economic sanctions, that divided the Church and more particularly divided white and black Anglicans. Not least through the skilful diplomatic work of Tutu, the episcopal synod meeting in November 1988 passed a motion that supported 'carefully selected and specifically targeted forms of pressure, including economic and diplomatic pressure'.⁵²

The 1980s was a decade marked by faux-reform on the part of the government, brutal repression on the part of the security forces, and widespread solidarity on the part of civic and ecumenical resistance movements. In August 1989, Botha resigned and F. W. de Klerk, as new leader, took the party into the general elections of September. A more pragmatic Afrikaner than Botha, but equally committed to white dominance, the new president promised a new era of 'power-sharing'. Mass marches across the country in September, often with Anglican bishops at the head of them, protested against apartheid and police brutality. The majority of people in the country, as well as Church leaders, needed to be convinced that de Klerk was serious about change. In October Archbishop Tutu, along with Frank Chikane (General Secretary of the SACC) and Allan Boesak, met the Prime Minister and laid out what was necessary. The message was clear: set prisoners free, allow exiles to return home, and free the people to speak and meet. In short, dismantle apartheid.

In summary, the decades between 1950 and 1990 marked a shift in the Church's position on apartheid. The ecumenical movement within southern Africa provided a broad base for Anglicans to put their oppositional stance

⁵¹ Clarke, *Anglicans*, p. 398.

⁵² Allen, *Rabble-Rouser*, pp. 288–90; de Gruchy and de Gruchy, *Church Struggle*, pp. 199–207.

into practice. The ecumenical movement was further empowered because of the international network, structures, and resources that organizations like the WCC could put at the disposal of the anti-apartheid movement. This internationalism also gave southern African leaders, including key Anglican leaders, a stage and voice that meant they reached far beyond their context. This could make it potentially counterproductive, in the full glare of publicity, for the government to suppress them. While this period continued to be marked by a *de facto* segregation within the Church, the contextualized voice of black theology became influential not only in the expression of faith in local settings, but through the witness of black Anglicans as they took prominent leadership positions nationally and internationally.

ANGLICANISM AND NATION-BUILDING, 1990–9

On 2 February 1990 in his opening speech to Parliament de Klerk announced that the ANC, PAC, and the South African Communist Party would be unbanned. A week later he announced that Mandela and other political prisoners would be released. State support for apartheid was ending and what Tutu, Chikane, and Boesak defined as necessary change seemed to be happening. In the same month, the Anglican bishops were to meet in synod in Soweto. Tutu invited the recently released Nelson Mandela to address them. Mandela praised Anglicans for their ministries and referred to Tutu as ‘the people’s archbishop’. He also took the opportunity to charge the bishops with the task of uniting black communities and reassuring white communities; a work that accorded with the position of activist Anglicans like Huddleston who believed that unity for liberation would be achieved only with solidarity across political and religious distinctions.⁵³

The ecumenical Rustenburg consultation meeting on 5–9 November 1990 drew 230 delegates representing over ninety different denominations. Archbishop Tutu opened the consultation, calling the conference ‘a miracle’. A remarkable moment in the proceedings was when Professor Willie Jonker, of the DRC, publicly confessed their guilt in participating in apartheid. Tutu responded by pronouncing absolution. The declaration defined the future according to ‘biblical and ethical values’ enshrined in a constitution that would include the value of all human life, exclude all types of discrimination, guarantee an independent judiciary, recognize that human rights have a divine source, and install a democratic process based on one-person one-vote. Restitution, the declaration stated, was the practical outworking of confession and

⁵³ Allen, *Rabble-Rouser*, p. 316.

forgiveness and would mean addressing the Churches' relationship to land ownership; the integration of all schools; the inauguration of a National Day of Prayer; the disbursement of Church funds for 'reconstruction' and 'renewal'; and the need for Christian organizations to work for a new economic order, women's rights, and programmes to combat health issues including AIDS. The declaration stated that the participants believed the country was 'on the threshold of new things'. The Church leaders demanded the repeal of all apartheid laws and called upon 'every South African to be positively involved in nation-building'.⁵⁴ The challenge facing Anglicans was to discern their witness in a post-apartheid southern Africa.

After two years of negotiations an interim constitution was established and in April 1994 (the new constitution was adopted on 8 May 1996) all races in South Africa voted in an election that would decide the government and future of their country. However, between February and April much blood was shed in South Africa. Violence instigated by what was called a 'third force' linked to the security forces was at work. Violence between ANC and the Inkhata Freedom Party (a Zulu nationalist movement) was common, and the leader of the South African Communist Party, Chris Hani, was assassinated by a right-wing group in March 1993. Between 1990 and 1994 15,000 people were killed in South Africa. Amidst the brutality and uncertainty, Church leaders and Christian activists mediated between opposing sides. Key at this time were the peace-making work of Anglicans in KwaZulu-Natal led by Michael Nuttal, and Tutu's dialogue with the Anglican Zulu chief, Mangosuthu Gatsha. It is doubtful if democratic elections would ever have taken place without the mediatory effectiveness of Christian leaders such as Chikane, Boesak, and Tutu. Beyond the elections, however, as Anglicans turned to the constructive task of nation-building, clarity was difficult to find. The Anglican Church knew what it was against. Now it would have to discover what it was for. Bragalia Hlope Bam, first female General Secretary of the SACC and an Anglican, captured the challenge for all the Christian Churches in the country when she said:

In the days of apartheid we knew *exactly* what we were doing—we were fighting the evil of legalized racism. We now face hidden racism, the need for truth and reconciliation, a demand for housing and jobs, healing and hope. We face fear in many, continued hatred in others, and a desperate need for a new sense of being.⁵⁵

⁵⁴ The Rustenburg Declaration (Nov. 1990), 1.2, 3.2, 3.3, 4.2, 5.1–5.8, <<http://sacbc.org.za/wp-content/uploads/2013/05/APPENDIX-1-THE-RUSTENBURG-DECLARATION.pdf>> (accessed 21 July 2016).

⁵⁵ Bragalia Hlope Bam, 'The Church in South Africa', in Pityana and Villa-Vicencio (eds.), *Being the Church*, p. 43.

The Truth and Reconciliation Commission (TRC) was approved by the first session of the new South African Parliament in October 1994, and commissioned at St George's Cathedral in Cape Town in February 1996. The purpose of the TRC was to record human rights violations, identify victims, recommend possible reparations, process amnesty and indemnity, and create measures to prevent future human rights violations. Anglicanism remained at the forefront of the TRC in the person of Archbishop Tutu. He presided over what has been called a 'civic sacrament' as oppressed people sought to bring to birth a new nation through finding grace in confession and forgiveness. Tutu, very often dressed in cassock and wearing his pectoral cross, chaired the TRC within an (Anglican) liturgical frame seeming to take the role of 'national confessor'.⁵⁶ The commission was evocative of a confessional. There was a call to penitence, opportunity for confession, the promise of absolution, and the charge to an amended life. Hymn singing, often initiated by the archbishop, rang out and each day began and ended with prayer.⁵⁷

The TRC was tasked with promoting reconciliation and reconciliatory practices. Christian leaders saw reconciliation as a religious calling, though they were not clear on what unique perspective or practice religious commitment brought. They were confident that the Christian presence on the TRC made the process more humane by providing empathetic engagement and practices of repentance and forgiveness. However, a focus on 'healing' and empathy centred on the retelling of personal experiences meant the TRC was not as effective as it might have been in establishing 'historical truth'. While some commissioners on the TRC evinced a complex understanding of forgiveness, this was not always the case and resulted in a confusion between 'law' and 'morality'. Some commissioners 'conflated the legal process of amnesty with the religious concept of forgiveness', suggesting that amnesty implied

⁵⁶ Michael Battle, 'A Theology of Community: The *Ubuntu* Theology of Desmond Tutu', *Interpretation*, 54 (2000): 173–82 (p. 174).

⁵⁷ Stephen William Martin, 'Civic Sacrament and Social Imaginaries in Transition: The Case of the South African Churches and the Truth and Reconciliation Commission', *Political Theology*, 12 (2001): 363–95; P. G. J. Meiring, 'Pastors or Lawyers? The Role of Religion in the South African Truth and Reconciliation Process', *HTS Teologiese Studies/Theological Studies*, 58 (2002): 328–39. The religious nature of the proceedings was contested. For example, an Afrikaner commissioner of the TRC, Wynand Malan, submitted a minority report. He wrote: 'Religions, by their nature, are most often essentially dogmatic and absolutist. The juxtaposition of forces of light and forces of darkness, good and evil is inherent to religious thought... The imposition of this framework on the political scene was probably the single greatest contributor to the escalation of the conflict through the Commission's mandate period. The Bible was used not as canon but cannon.' In identifying the theological genesis of apartheid he argued, 'Problems will never be solved at the level at which they are created.' Wynand Malan, 'Minority Position', in Dr Biki Minyuku (Chief Executive Officer), *Truth and Reconciliation Commission of South Africa Report, Volume Five* (Cape Town, 1998), pp. 436–56, <<http://www.justice.gov.za/trc/report/finalreport/Volume5.pdf>> (accessed 28 June 2016).

forgiveness. For victims who were ready to forgive this might have been helpful, but for those who were not ready to forgive, or who opposed amnesty, this conflation seemed to quash their sense of justice.⁵⁸

As with the defeat of apartheid the long-term realization of truth and reconciliation would be sought through an ecumenical movement with the Anglican Church playing its part. This is where southern African Anglicans found themselves at the end of the twentieth century. What the TRC achieved—and that is contested—needed to be grounded in local communities. The challenges of environmental degradation, poverty and its attendant ills, ongoing racism and sexism, the need for deeper contextualization and integrated congregations, the desire for new models and curricula for theological education, and how to memorialize the past were issues that the South African Churches all needed to face. The twentieth century closed with Anglicans belonging to a free and democratic nation birthed in part by the leadership and sacrifice of their Church. The next step was for the Church to discern and grow into its new calling for a new century. Luke Lungile Pato, founding principal of the College of the Transfiguration, Grahamstown, reflected that 150 years after its first archbishop the Church ‘has remained largely alien and alienating to the diverse people of this land and continues to be a source of pain to many of us today’.⁵⁹ Bishop Patrick Matalengoe (SACC) submitted: ‘Each church needs a truth commission of its own—to speak to one another and get at its truth. We must *be* an alternate society to show it in action rather than in words judging others.’⁶⁰ Both these leaders saw that while Anglicans in southern Africa had changed in the twentieth century, a gap between rhetoric and reality in the Church still existed.

The closing years of the twentieth century witnessed the expression of deep animosity across tribal and racial lines that resulted in bloodshed. Anglican leaders were key in preventing violent forces from extinguishing all hope for a new nation. This leadership reached across deep divides and painful histories in an effort to contextualize and ground Christian hope in political processes that would even invite Afrikaner Christianity into a shared future. A nation seeking truth and reconciliation was led through a commission, not without controversy, by an archbishop rooted in an African Anglicanism he helped create.

⁵⁸ Hugo van der Merwe, ‘The Role of the Church in Promoting Reconciliation’, in Audrey R. Chapman and Bernard Spong (eds.), *Religion and Reconciliation in South Africa: Voices of Religious Leaders* (Philadelphia, PA, 2003), pp. 269–77.

⁵⁹ Luke Lungile Pato, ‘Anglicanism and Africanisation: The Legacy of Robert Gray’, *Journal of Theology for Southern Africa*, 101 (1998): 49–57 (p. 49).

⁶⁰ Bernard Spong, ‘Interviews, Conducted and Edited by Brian Spong: Protestants’, in Chapman and Spong (eds.), *Religion and Reconciliation in South Africa*, pp. 19–174 (p. 116).

CONCLUSION

Any historical periodization is problematic. Nonetheless, each of the periods considered here reflects turning points in southern African history. Violence and racism mark much of the history of southern Africa as does the search for effective Anglican peace-making and resistance. Amidst the vicissitudes of each of the twentieth century's decades the constants of race, ecumenical relations, and contextualization remain and are addressed in different ways by Anglicans. A Church that was, at the beginning of the century, the 'English Church' and committed to the status quo hoping for gradual change through liberal means was transformed into a Church that took up an oppositional stance against apartheid. Amid broad civic and political resistance to apartheid, the ecumenical movement demonstrated that an alternative spirituality and sociality was more powerful than apartheid. Anglicans played key roles in this ecumenical solidarity by staffing ecumenical bodies within and beyond southern Africa, and by providing key theological and practical direction. Such direction was defined by the need for contextual theological analyses and resources.

Such commitment was lacking in the Anglican Church for much of the twentieth century as culturally distinct groups remained distant from each other existentially and spiritually. It was largely black vision and leadership that changed the foreignness of Anglicanism through bringing the tradition into dialogue with linguistic, cultural, and political concerns. As the century opened in hostility and war, it closed with an African archbishop leading the nation into what truth and reconciliation might mean. Anglicans in southern Africa set before the Anglican Communion and wider world the possibility of redemption even in the face of compromised theology, separated communities, and state terrorism.

SELECT BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Allen, John, *Rabble-Rouser for Peace: The Authorized Biography of Desmond Tutu* (New York, 2006).
- Battle, Michael, *Reconciliation: The Ubuntu Theology of Desmond Tutu* (Cleveland, OH, 1997).
- Chapman, Audrey R. and Bernard Spong (eds.), *Religion and Reconciliation in South Africa: Voices of Religious Leaders* (Philadelphia, PA, 2003).
- Clarke, Bob, *Anglicans against Apartheid, 1936–1996* (Pietermaritzburg, 2008).
- Cook, Calvin W., 'Any Alternative to Complicity or Conspiracy? Some Aspects of the Development of the English-Speaking Churches in South Africa since World War II', *Journal of Theology for Southern Africa*, 27 (1979): 4–19.
- de Gruchy, John W. and Steve de Gruchy, *The Church Struggle in South Africa* (25th edn., London, 2004).

- Elphick, Richard and Rodney Davenport (eds.), *Christianity in South Africa: A Political, Social, and Cultural History* (Berkeley and Los Angeles, CA, 1997).
- England, Frank and Torguil Paterson (eds.), *Bounty in Bondage: The Anglican Church in Southern Africa* (Johannesburg, 1989).
- Hayes, Stephen, *Black Charismatic Anglicans: The Iviyo loFakazi bakaKristu and its Relations with Other Renewal Movements* (Pretoria, 1990).
- Honorè, Deborah Duncan, *Trevor Huddleston: Essays on his Life and Work* (Oxford, 1988).
- Huddleston, Trevor, *Naught for Your Comfort* (London, 1956).
- Lee, Peter, *Compromise and Courage: Anglicans in Johannesburg 1864–1999: A Divided Church in Search of Integrity* (Pietermaritzburg, 2005).
- Lewis, Harold T., *A Church for the Future: South Africa as the Crucible for Anglicanism in a New Century* (New York, 2007).
- Paton, Alan, *Apartheid and the Archbishop: The Life and Times of Geoffrey Clayton* (New York, 1973).
- Peart-Binns, John S., *Archbishop Joost De Blank: Scourge of Apartheid* (London, 1987).
- Pityana, Barney and Charles Villa-Vicencio, *Being the Church in South Africa Today* (Johannesburg, 1995).
- Suberg, O. M., *The Anglican Tradition in South Africa: A Historical Overview* (Pretoria, 1999).
- Tutu, Desmond, *No Future without Forgiveness* (New York, 1999).
- Worsnip, Michael E., *Between the Two Fires: The Anglican Church and Apartheid, 1948–1957* (Pietermaritzburg, 1991).

Anglican Schools in Muslim-Majority Societies, 1910–2010

Richard J. Jones

Whether aiming to prepare Bible readers and clergy, or to proffer Western civilization's general knowledge, schools for children and younger adults were a prominent vehicle of Anglican mission in the twentieth century. In societies where Islam dominated or was reviving, Christian schools, of any tradition, had to win and maintain acceptance from local parents as well as from political authorities. These authorities were indigenous and traditional rulers as well as, in many places, British, Australian, or American outsiders. While teachers in Anglican schools struggled to accommodate recent post-Enlightenment ideas about history, natural science, and psychology, their counterparts in Islamic schools had their own struggles with local loyalties, Western learning, and visions of a pan-Islamic social order. As social institutions of a world-wide missionary movement starting to lose its nerve, some local Anglican schools found a niche serving marginal social groups, others thrived by preparing elites, while the majority were absorbed into the educational systems of post-colonial sovereign states.

By the time of the World Mission Conference at Edinburgh in 1910, Anglican schools had been firmly established in British-administered parts of India; in Egypt, Sudan, and Palestine; in East Africa, southern Africa, and West Africa; and in the Philippines the Episcopal Church of the United States had encountered the Muslim population of Mindanao. Enough Anglicans had learned Arabic, Persian, Urdu, Swahili, and Moro that methodical work could be envisioned. Charles Freer Andrews, a member of the Cambridge Mission in Delhi and a friend of M. K. Gandhi, was building on the work of his predecessors and on the belief that Muslims were now ready to consider well-informed, respectful discussion of their religion in their native tongue.¹

¹ C. F. Andrews, *North India* (Oxford, 1908), p. 131.

Assessors necessarily disagree concerning the outcomes of such a diverse endeavour. In the 1930s a British schoolmaster in central India could affirm that a Christian school 'will include all the values that secular education stands for; it will also . . . help the growing individual to adjust himself to the extra-human or divine environment . . . it will in addition stand for certain unique values that are the fruit and essence of a personal allegiance to Christ'.² In 1960, as national independence was gaining in jurisdictions formerly dependent on European governments and Churches, the ecumenical scholar Hans-Ruedi Weber judged that Christian schools had chiefly served as an 'object lesson in social service, in modern ways of living and hygiene, but their spiritual mission was on the whole, by the vast majority, unheeded'.³ In the light of the latest half-century of growth and tribulation for indigenous-led Churches, a fresh assessment is needed.

NORTH INDIA—PAKISTAN

On the vast screen of British engagement beginning in 1611 with the peoples and political institutions of the Indian subcontinent, Anglican schools appeared only as tiny dots. When at Delhi in 1911 King George V crowned himself emperor of India in a massive open-air rite with elephants and princes, borrowed from the long-defunct Muslim Mughal dynasty, British scholars had already acquired considerable knowledge of the Islamic culture which overlay and in many locations had displaced ancient Hindu and tribal cultures. Scholarship in the sacred languages of Arabic and Persian, as well as such spoken languages as Punjabi, Urdu, and Bengali, had enabled British authorities in Muslim-majority regions to create courts which followed Islamic law in some areas of life, while prescribing English common law and Indian colonial government statutes for other matters.

The success of British administrators and educators in dominating so much of the economic and political processes of the former Mughal Empire had evoked two self-critical reactions among Muslim intellectuals.⁴ Followers of Shah Wali Ullah believed that Islam might become extinct in India unless it could purify itself. Purification called for immersion in the Arabic Qur'an, in the traditions of the Prophet, and in the science of applying these to every

² International Missionary Council, *The Life of the Church*, vol. IV of 'The Madras Series'. Papers from the December 1938 meeting of the International Missionary Council, Madras (New York, 1939), pp. 75–82.

³ C. P. Fitzgerald, *Revolution in China* (London, 1952), p. 143, cited by Hans-Ruedi Weber in Stephen Charles Neill and Hans-Ruedi Weber (eds.), *The Layman in Christian History* (Philadelphia, PA, 1963), p. 354.

⁴ Akbar Ahmed, *Journey into Islam* (Washington, DC, 2007), pp. 73, 94.

detail of living. Mosque-related schools at Deoband and elsewhere pursued this curriculum through the twentieth century, later adding computers and English for purposes of better spreading the message of Islam. The school head in 2006 was a cleric who directed an all-India organization of Muslim religious scholars.

In contrast, Seyyed Ahmed Khan believed that the only way for Muslims to achieve success was to engage with the British, learn their language, and play by their rules in business and politics. His Anglo-Muhammadan College at Aligarh, now Aligarh University and organized on the lines of Cambridge University, set the pattern for numerous secondary schools and universities in India where English is the medium, Western subjects are pursued, and leaders for business and government are groomed.

When the Anglo-Catholic Cambridge Mission to India arrived in Delhi in 1904, C. F. Andrews found at Agra the 'centre of the New Islam'. He admired the large mosque, where he compared the attendance to college chapels in a British university. He noted 600 students enrolled in the school and 400 in the college. Andrews made friends with two scholarly Muslims in Delhi and found in them 'the power of Islam at its best in moulding character and creating an atmosphere of reverence... a very great and real treasure which we need to regain within the Church'.⁵

ST STEPHEN'S COLLEGE

Encouraged in this kind of appreciative engagement by B. F. Wescott of Cambridge University, three young Cambridge Brotherhood scholars had founded St Stephen's College, Delhi, in 1881 with five students in a small house near Kinari Bazar in Chandni Chowk. The first Indian principal, S. K. Rudra, a Bengali Christian, was appointed in 1907. From 1891 to 1941 the college was housed in a building now occupied by Delhi College of Engineering, near St James Church inside Kashmere Gate. In 1941 it shifted to its present site in the enclave of Delhi University, of which it was a founding component in 1922, alongside Hindu College (1899) and Ramias College (1917).⁶

St Stephen's founders had a vision of making Christianity in India as deeply conversant with Hindu, and perhaps Islamic, culture as the early Church in Alexandria, Egypt, had been conversant with Greek culture. Its arcaded,

⁵ Andrews, *North India*, pp. 131ff.

⁶ Daniel O'Connor and others, *Three Centuries of Mission: The United Society for the Propagation of the Gospel 1701–2000* (London and New York, 2000), p. 191; Jeffrey Cox, 'Independent English Women in Delhi and Lahore, 1860–1947', in R. W. Davis and R. J. Helmstadter (eds.), *Religion and Irreligion in Victorian Society* (London, 1992), pp. 166–84 (p. 167).

red-brick 1930s buildings, by a British architect who stayed on after completing the layout for New Delhi as the capital of the British Raj, embody an eclectic appreciation of Hindu and Islamic architecture. During the violence accompanying the 1947 Partition of Pakistan from India, college staff helped provide necessities to Muslim refugee encampments around Delhi. At the end of the twentieth century, in the face of continuing fears, resentments, and outbreaks of urban violence by Islamist and Hindutva groups, plus tensions with Pakistan, the college continued to attract a religiously diverse staff and student body.

A 1975 graduate from Calcutta, son of a Keralite newspaper editor, who became a United Nations employee and fiction writer, recalled study at St Stephen's:

it mattered little where you were from, which Indian language you spoke at home, what version of religious faith you espoused...I did not have to worry about fitting in: we were all minorities at St Stephen's and all part of one eclectic polychrome culture. Five of the preceding ten Union Presidents had been non-Delhite non-Hindus (four Muslims and a Christian), and they had all been fairly elected against candidates from the 'majority' community.⁷

Another 1970s graduate, who became an architectural preservationist, saw the originating Christian missionary impulse as having evolved 'from capital *M* to multiple *ms*' and having prepared students to deal with social change: 'College derailed us from the usual tracks, taught us that the road we walked could perhaps be the one we made for ourselves.'⁸ Mission for this graduate was an historic imperative for the Christian Church that had been appropriated as a personal sense of purpose.

St Stephen's College, with only 350 male and 108 female students in residence, remained demographically minute at the end of the twentieth century, amid the dozens of Christian tertiary educational institutions in India and Pakistan. Receiving 12,000 applications for 400 places in 2007, and 28,000 for the same number of places in 2010, St Stephen's chose to remain small even amid Delhi University, itself one among 8,000 universities and 800,000 schools educating Indian students.

A major goal of the Republic of India's educational effort remained the raising of the literacy rate above the 65 per cent for males and 37 per cent for females reported in 2000, by teaching the use of Hindi (with Devanagari script) and English nationwide—alongside fourteen other languages, including Sindhi, Punjabi, and Urdu, having official status in one or more states.⁹ St Stephen's could make no claim to directly training the labour force required

⁷ Shashi Tharoor, 'Stephania: An Evocation', <<http://www.ststephens.edu/archives/articles/st.htm>> (accessed 13 Jan. 2015).

⁸ Aman Nath, 'A Change of Mission', <<http://www.ststephens.edu/archives/articles/an.htm>> (accessed 13 Jan. 2015).

⁹ David B. Barrett, *World Christian Encyclopedia* (Oxford, 2001), vol. I, pp. 359f.

for economic development. What its principal, Valson Thampu, a presbyter of the Church of North India, did claim in 2010 was that ‘the educational renaissance of India . . . has to be as much a matter of the heart as it is of the head’. Thampu speaks to Indian Christians of a Church of the Poor. To the elite members of his college he affirms the aim of helping them ‘realize spiritual and moral as well as intellectual and aesthetic values’.¹⁰

The college continues to describe itself as ‘a religious foundation drawing inspiration from the life and teachings of Jesus Christ’. Instruction from the life and teachings of Jesus is given to first-year Christian students. The chapel still stands open to all members of the college for worship and meditation. Christian conversation with Hindu and Muslim thought and practice, as well as with Western thought and secularism, continues at St Stephen’s, but the Christian voice is no longer authoritative.

ST JOHN’S COLLEGE, AGRA

Agra was the epicentre in 1857 of what the British called ‘The Mutiny’ and Indian nationalists call ‘The First War of Indian Independence’. As in that bloody time, so during the 1990s riots over militant Hindus’ destruction of a mosque built over a site sacred to Shiva, one place of refuge for numerous people of all religions was St John’s College. This college had been founded by the Evangelical and polyglot Anglican missionary Thomas Valpy French in 1850. The first generations of teachers believed that both Islamic and Hindu traditions contained elements of truth, but that they also carried elements of tyranny—notably the Hindu caste system. Beginning in 1911, the college undertook to house its Hindu, Muslim, and Christian students in a single hostel, where at least the Muslim and Christian students ate together. The principal declared, ‘It is not the function of a Christian college to perpetuate caste restrictions, but rather to promote the Brotherhood of Man.’¹¹

Three generations later, the Church of North India bishop of Agra chaired the board, but parents deemed indigenous clergy ‘unqualified for what is a distinguished professional role’. Under the leadership of active lay Christians, St John’s was rated among the top ten colleges in India on academic achievement and facilities. Excellent English and handsome architecture contribute to prestige. Prestige in turn offers some security to educators keenly aware of their minority status in Uttar Pradesh state, under a shakily religion-neutral

¹⁰ <<http://www.cnisynod.org/>> (accessed 2015).

¹¹ Pervez Deen and Rina Deen, ‘Anglican Educational Institutions and the Mission of the Church’, in Andrew Wingate, Kevin Ward, Carrie Pemberton, and Wilson Sitshebo (eds.), *Anglicanism: A Global Communion* (New York, 1998), pp. 300–4.

federal government. Security in turn allows the college to include and protect Christian students belonging to poor and low-status families. Despite declining in their proportion of the student body, this Christian minority forms the core of daily assemblies with prayer, Bible classes, programmes of moral education, Student Christian Movement activities, and Christian festivals—open to all students.

In regions outside the Ganges and Punjab plains, Anglican schools reached out to smaller populations of Muslims, and not solely with the aim to produce elite leaders. In Bombay (Mumbai), the century-old Robert Money School merged with the Presbyterian Wilson High School in 1925. On the eve of India's independence in 1947, the last British viceroy was on hand to lay the foundation of a technical department for the now-named Wilson College, remarking that this major industrial city had only two technical schools.¹² Wilson College remained a strong private school in 2010, illustrating a typical progression from founders' aims of equipping clerks and leading boys and girls to Jesus, to a curriculum producing self-respecting farmers and technicians, to emphasis on spreading educational opportunity and civic awareness. Along with other schools in Maharashtra sponsored by Church of North India churches, those of Anglican origin sometimes struggled in the early twentieth century to meet the standards imposed by the state education board, which could threaten the withdrawal of official recognition.

Religious conversions remained locally contentious, even half a century after the ending of the Raj and the rise of indigenous heads of schools had removed some grounds of suspicion against Christians. Christians, along with Muslims, had lost any special voice in legislatures. Church schools' inherited resources of land, buildings, and money were, except for the few of highest prestige, precarious assets in the hands of an insecure minority.¹³

In the portions of Punjab and the Indus Valley up to the Himalaya Mountains that became Pakistan in 1947, Anglican schools found themselves working under national laws which assumed a government by and for Muslims, but with tolerance for religious minorities. In many villages and cities, British and American doctors, missionaries, and teachers arriving in the nineteenth century had faced the familiar choice: reach out to the high-born and hope to win their favour, or reach out to the low-born who have obvious needs and less to protect? Mission schools, virtually free of charge in villages, but sometimes charging fees to richer clients in cities, had usually been founded in advance of the creation of the Indian Education Service and

¹² M. D. David, *Missions: Cross-Cultural Encounters and Change in Western India* (Delhi, 2001).

¹³ Judith Brown, 'Who is an Indian? Dilemmas of National Identity at the End of the British Raj in India', in Brian Stanley (ed.), *Missions, Nationalism, and the End of Empire* (Grand Rapids, MI, 2003), pp. 111–31.

government schools in the subcontinent before Partition. In many villages they offered an alternative to the rote instruction in Qur'an and the traditions of the Prophet offered in the schools attached to mosques. In the twentieth century, these schools, both humble and elite, continued to adapt their staffing and their aims to changing government requirements, changing temper in the teaching of mosques, and their own changing Christian theology. The schools were impelled forward as much by changes in the temper of Church life as by shifts in government policy.

The influx of Muslim refugees to cities like Lahore, Rawalpindi, and Karachi at the time of Partition in 1947 produced new towns in which few government services were provided. An American visitor to Lahore in 1960 found the Anglican assistant bishop, Chandu Ray, straining his resources to build six or seven schools in the new settlement of Korangi with the help of a government subsidy. For boys who had lost family and prospects but were drawn to Christian faith the Church developed Selwyn House as a Christian substitute home. Existing Anglican congregations whose younger members went bare-foot remained in villages remote from rail or bus lines. There a thinly stretched member of the clergy might travel by camel or bullock cart to attend to twenty congregations. Under these conditions, the economic incentive to collaborate with other Christian bodies in supporting Christian institutions in the new nation was compelling.¹⁴

EDWARDES COLLEGE

In the nineteenth century the Pashto-speaking city of Peshawar, in the Northwest-West Frontier Province (now Khyber-Pakhtunkwa), attracted Church Missionary Society (CMS) missionaries, along with British archaeologists seeking to uncover the remains of the ancient Graeco-Buddhist kingdom of Gandhara. CMS missionaries, with encouragement from at least one Evangelical Indian civil service governor, founded Edwardes College in 1900 out of an older Urdu-medium school to become the first institution of English-medium secondary education along the Afghan frontier. While elsewhere in the city Anglican churches attracted the poor, and a hospital attracted all ranks, the college flourished by preparing students for admission to British universities. A handsome brick library, classroom building, and student hostel were designed by principal James M. Hoare, with domes, veranda, fenestration, and exterior decoration in Mughal style, and constructed with financial support from the Punjab provincial government and Anglican donors in

¹⁴ Howard A. Johnson, *Global Odyssey* (New York, 1963), pp. 206–8.

England. While the post of principal continued to be filled chiefly by English and Australian clergy, by 2013 the 105-member faculty was 90 per cent Muslim, as was the student body. Student religious life flourished on campus in both chapel and mosque. Both the Bible and Qur'an were taught, along with psychology, philosophy, media, and physical education. Prayers were offered daily in both mosque and chapel, although there was tension over giving precedence to the Bible or Qur'an at all-college events. Some 2,800 students, including 305 women, were enrolled in classes. A grant from the provincial Ministry of Higher Education helped Titus L. Presler, the college's fifteenth principal and an American Episcopal priest, to promote weekly discussions on the purposes of education, discernment of talents, gender respect, and tolerance for diversity. These funds also encouraged faculty to undertake advanced degrees and provided for new physics and chemistry laboratories.¹⁵

At the same time, Edwardes College as a haven for rational critical thinking and a lively community for experiencing opportunity in difference was under increasing pressure. The violent intra-Islamic struggle tearing at both Pakistani and Afghan society since the 1990s threatened this school's survival. When the college proposed to modify its relation to the University of Peshawar and seek authority to award its own degrees, it proposed that the institution's sponsoring body (the diocese of Peshawar) should have a majority on the governing board and the bishop (Humphrey Safaraz Peters, vice-moderator of the Church of Pakistan) be chancellor—thereby reversing an action by the provincial governor during the nationalizing trend of the 1970s which made the governor chairman, the bishop vice-chairman, and a majority of members government appointees. Although reaction was focused on the college's efforts to secure approval for issuing diplomas on its own authority, the whole climate for Western education had been clouded by a strong campaign by militant Islamic elements to reverse emancipation of women and other modern ideas throughout Pakistan. Edwardes College administrators were threatened and beaten by rogue government security agents. In 2013 two suicide bombers blew themselves up in a market area of the city, where Sunday worshippers were coming out of All Saints' Church, killing at least 78 people and injuring more than 120, including students of the college and members of the diocesan staff. In the face of such violence, openness continued to be the norm in campus life, but the expatriate principal was replaced by Professor Nayer Fardows, and legal negotiations continued. Meanwhile mission continues by quieter and more intimate means. The Christian practice of praying for the sick has made a sufficient impression that Muslim students have been known to ask Christian students to pray for friends who are ill.¹⁶

¹⁵ Interview with Titus L. Presler, 9 May 2014, <<http://www.edwardes.edu.pk>> (accessed 10 May 2014).

¹⁶ Titus Presler, 'Persecuted in Pakistan', *Christian Century* (3 Sept. 2014).

PALESTINE–ISRAEL

It would not be until 1950—when the Episcopal Evangelical Church in the diocese of Jordan, Lebanon, and Iraq joined forces with the Presbyterian-Congregationalist Near East School of Theology in Beirut—that this Arabic-speaking diocese settled on schooling as an essential form of its work. However, from the 1880s the impoverished Greek Orthodox patriarch in Jerusalem, on the understanding that Anglicans would not be forming congregations to the detriment of Arabic-speaking Orthodox congregations, had welcomed Anglican support in the form of printing—and schools. The first two Anglican bishops in Jerusalem had focused their efforts on Jewish residents of Jerusalem. Thus an Anglican orphanage for Jewish girls in Jerusalem was the precursor of St George's Anglican School for Boys.¹⁷

Other Anglican schools in the vicinity of Jerusalem were begun with varied intent. In an era when France obtained from the Ottoman Empire consular jurisdiction over Roman Catholics, and Russia over Orthodox Christians, Great Britain in cooperation with Prussia had sought similar entrée via Protestant Christians. An even more burning interest, embodied in the London Jews Society (forerunner of the Church Mission to Jews and Jews for Jesus), was the hope that Jews, in Jerusalem as throughout the world, would embrace Jesus as God's Messiah and in turn repeat the miracle of the first Pentecost by becoming missionaries to the unreached nations of the world. The first Anglican school, called The Hebrew College, was intended to instruct Jewish converts in Christian ideas and train them in woodworking and bookbinding.

More receptive than the Jews in this Ottoman province, however, were the Arabic-speaking Christians of the several ancient Eastern Churches. Whereas Greek patriarchs may have welcomed an Anglican bishopric to offset the influence of the Latin and Russian Orthodox patriarchs in Jerusalem, Arabic-speaking clergy and laity responded to ordained and lay personnel of the London-based CMS when they opened the Bible, offered worship in Arabic, and taught Western arts and science. Anglican evangelism grew naturally as mission was conducted more by Arabs themselves than by Western missionaries.

By the time British administration replaced Ottoman officials under the 1920 League of Nations Mandate, the dispensary, day school, and girls' school originally established to serve poor Jewish children were enlarged into schools for Arab boys and girls. During the Turkish administration, Muslim children had been prevented—by parents or other authorities—from attending Anglican schools. Under British rule, such schools as British Girls High School,

¹⁷ Rafiq A. Farah, *In Troubled Waters: A History of the Anglican Church in Jerusalem, 1841–1998* (Bridport, 2002).

Jerusalem; St George's, by this time a boarding school for a hundred boys on the grounds of the Anglican cathedral; and the boys' and girls' schools in Haifa, proved attractive to Arab families, thanks in part to English-speaking personnel on their staff, and to examinations leading to British university admission, or to careers in business or teaching. Prior to using the Near East School of Theology in Beirut, Arab clergy for Arab Anglican congregations were prepared at the English College in Jerusalem.

As the teaching staff in the schools of the diocese of Jerusalem shifted over the course of the twentieth century from expatriate British to Palestinian, so did the theological emphasis shift from understanding gospel truth to standing for gospel justice. From the time when schools could reopen in 1918 after British forces expelled Ottoman forces from Jerusalem, the first riots by Arabs were erupting in Jaffa against Jewish immigration from Europe, and boundaries between religious groups in Palestine were stiffening. The Anglican bishop who arrived in Jerusalem with the British forces was Rennie M. MacInnes. He was a member of a devout Evangelical Anglican family who had been a CMS missionary in Cairo for a decade, organizing medical and food relief during the famine and epidemics which devastated villages from Gaza to Damascus during the war. Bishop MacInnes believed in Old Testament prophecies of Jewish return to the Promised Land, but also hoped for the turning of Jews to Christ. He opposed Zionist policies and tactics aiming to compel fulfilment of the 1917 declaration of the British government in favour of establishing 'a national home for the Jewish people' in Palestine.

While Jewish immigration from Europe into Palestine accelerated, and Arab opposition to that immigration provoked from the Mandate authorities group deportation and martial law, Anglican schools continued their work, graduating future leaders for Palestine. In 1935, the China-born, Glasgow-raised George Graham-Brown, Anglican bishop in Jerusalem, could claim that the principal secondary schools in the British Mandate territories were Anglican schools. He was referring to: St George's and Bishop Gobat Schools for boys and British Girls High School, in Jerusalem; the coeducational English High School, in Haifa; and the Church Mission to Jews school, at Jaffa (today part of Tel Aviv). When The Bishop's School for Boys was founded in Amman in 1936, followed by St Luke's in Haifa in 1937, the bishop allowed himself to comment, 'The demand for education of a Christian standard is an interesting one, especially among Muslims . . . the main function is that of witness to Jew and Muslim of the Christian way of life.'¹⁸

The diocese had a plan for orderly development. Graham-Brown envisaged developing Sunday schools; unifying day schools created by differing Anglican societies; cooperating with Orthodox and Protestants, including the Young

¹⁸ Farah, *In Troubled Waters*, p. 107.

Men's Christian Association; creating new schools in important cities; and developing rural education. Schools usually preceded the formation of worshipping congregations. One advantage, in contrast to Egypt, Iraq, and Iran, was that non-government schools in Palestine were required to administer public examinations only at the end of the secondary course. This arrangement left teachers more freedom to encourage discovery and creativity in the classroom.

Events overtook plans. Arab populations were displaced in 1948 as a consequence of invasions by neighbouring Arab countries seeking to thwart the new state of Israel. Jewish immigration to Palestine, gradual before the Second World War, accelerated afterwards, leading to a partition of the land between the new state of Israel and the continuing kingdom of Jordan. These momentous events, and the violence that repeatedly erupted over the next half-century, shifted priorities. The work of the diocese, particularly in Gaza and the West Bank of the Jordan, had to focus on the survival of depleted congregations and the multiplication of social services to broken families, the sick and injured, underserved children and old people, and specific populations suffering from deafness, blindness, or mental illness. The ability of graduates of Anglican schools to speak English facilitated Palestinian emigration and the consequent shrinking of Palestinian Anglican congregations. It was particularly difficult for Anglican schools located on the portion of the West Bank of the Jordan River administered by Israel between 1967 and 2000 to affirm Arab culture while also equipping students for Israeli citizenship.

Despite these challenges, St George's School in Jerusalem, founded in 1899, still enrolled 871 boys in 2007, most of whom earned a University of London General Certificate of Education or a Jordanian *tawjihi* and went on to universities in the Middle East, the United Kingdom, or the United States. These boys studied English, sciences, mathematics and computers, and religion (Islam and Christianity). Physical education included soccer, basketball, and handball. The faculty of fifty-six was paid chiefly from student fees, which meant financial distress for the institution when uprisings caused school closings, as occurred in 1987–9.

By contrast, St John's School in Haifa, founded in 1926, ten years prior to the Anglican congregation of St John the Evangelist, inhabited a deprived quarter of the city, from which after 1948 almost the entire Arab citizenry had fled to Beirut, Amman, and elsewhere. One result was that in 1988 the school enrolled 372 boys and girls in pre-kindergarten through eighth grade, but struggled to meet the requirement to upgrade the salaries of its thirteen teachers from 70 per cent to 100 per cent of the national standard set by Israel's Ministry of Education. In 2008 the school reported an increase of nine teachers and sixty students. Also continuing in 2008 in Israel proper was the K-12 Christ School in Nazareth with 1,324 students and 126 teachers. On the West Bank, the K-12 Arab Evangelical Episcopal School in Ramallah

continued with 741 boys and girls. Outreach to Christian and Muslim families was offered in 2008 to twenty preschool children in Raineh, Israel; and to fifty kindergarten children in Nablus, West Bank, in a predominantly Muslim and poor neighbourhood.

East of the Jordan River and in Lebanon, both in villages and cities, Anglican schools developed under slightly less onerous conditions. In Amman, capital of the Hashemite Kingdom of Jordan, the small Bishop's School for Boys (*Madrasa al Mutran*—262 students, 56 teachers in 2007) has in recent years benefited from closer collaboration with the former CMS girls' school, Ahlia School for Girls (1,018 students, 132 teachers). Lacking amenities such as the stadium or swimming pool found at other private schools in Amman, these Anglican schools are known instead for good instructors, good laboratories, and coeducational extracurricular activities including clubs for pursuing personal interests. Other Anglican schools in Jordan and Lebanon, where a large portion of the population are refugees, directed their service to marginalized people. These include a small institute for the deaf in Beirut; a centre for mentally disabled children at Beit Mery, Lebanon; and small schools for the blind and sight-impaired in Irbid and Zarka, Jordan.

In the ancient town of Salt, Jordan, the Holy Land Institute for the Deaf developed a network of service to the deaf with connections in Syria and Yemen.¹⁹ This school has prospered by focusing on audiology and modes of learning effective with deaf children, combined with vocational training for self-sufficient lives. The school was founded in 1964 by J. J. Andeweg, a Dutch Anglican priest, with thirty-two students and four teachers, encouraged by the first Arab bishop of the diocese, Najib Cubain. The site is anchored by a stone hospital constructed during the Ottoman period and known as the Old Evangelical Hospital. In 1987, Brother Andrew de Carpentier, a Dutch architecture student and graduate of the Near East School of Theology, was invited by the bishop of Jerusalem to come from Beirut to direct the school. Under steady leadership and with donations plus occasional visiting teachers from the Netherlands, Switzerland, the United Kingdom, and the United States, the school grew to twenty-seven full-time teachers and eight part-time, with approximately 145 students. Most students came from outside Salt and boarded. The older and stronger were taught to take responsibility for younger and weaker students. Both boys and girls learned basic domestic skills by sharing kitchen, bathroom, and other daily chores. Some students dropped out, unable to abide by the community's discipline. Christian worship is led by the director. Students learn to pray, to sing or sign, and to act out Christian stories.

Beginning in 1998, some deaf students of the Institute were able to take government high school exams, and in 2002 some of these graduated from a

¹⁹ <<http://www.holyland-deaf.org>> (accessed 2016).

local college with Diplomas in Special Education. At the same time, the Institute found ways to reach out to hospitals, schools, and refugee camps, as well as to partner with institutions in neighbouring countries with under-served, marginalized populations. The Institute, like other Anglican schools, receives encouraging ceremonial visits from members of the Jordanian royal family. This visible expression of patronage is consistent with the Hashemite Kingdom's policy of cultivating friendly relations with Western nations and with its own minority Christian population in a fragile society.

EGYPT AND SUDAN

Earlier than those in Lebanon, Palestine, or Sudan, Anglican schools in Egypt for boys and for girls were founded beginning around 1890. Whether in Old Cairo and Helouan, or some thirty miles north-west of Cairo in Menouf, schools for both genders, and both day and boarding, enrolled Christian and Muslim students during the period before the First World War.²⁰ As British administration moved towards a constitutional monarchy after 1923, the principles of freedom of education and the free exercise of every religion contended—in public opinion, in courts of law, and in government regulation of schools—with the principle enunciated in the constitution that 'Islam is the religion of the State'. As Muslim modernizers and conservatives struggled with each other, Christian Churches—whether the large and ancient Coptic, the smaller Greek, or the newer Roman Catholic and Protestant Churches with their schools—had to negotiate the terms of their permitted activities. Tensions arose over expatriate teachers, over Muslims being exposed to Christian religious instruction, and over the occasional convert to Christianity. Earlier representatives of the CMS, including the accomplished Arabists Temple Gairdner and Constance Padwick, had cultivated friendly relations with liberal Muslims, as did Bishop Kenneth Cragg in the 1970s. In 2010, despite violent struggles for control of the national government, the Anglican school in Menouf, with the encouragement of Bishop Mouneer Anis, was continuing to enrol 20 per cent Christian students and 80 per cent Muslim.²¹

Long before the dramatic death in battle of the British governor-general of Sudan Charles 'Chinese' Gordon in Khartoum in 1885 compelled a British-led Anglo-Egyptian military expedition to impose a new government on the Nile Valley between Egypt and Uganda, Greek and Coptic merchants and Roman

²⁰ S. A. Morrison, 'Muslim Lands', in Kenneth G. Grubb (ed.), *The Church and the State* (New York and London, 1939), pp. 90–101.

²¹ <<http://dioceseofegypt.org/explore/ministries/education/episcopal-school-menouf/>> (accessed 23 Feb. 2017).

Catholic missionaries were well established in Sudan. CMS clergy and doctors arriving from Egypt beginning in 1899 were informed that Khartoum was reserved for Anglo-Egyptian government officials and other foreigners; Khartoum North was designated for dockyards; and Omdurman was to remain the home of the varied races of Sudanese.

In a house in Omdurman, the CMS priest Llewellyn H. Gwynne met a Coptic priest who had six Sudanese Christian girls as pupils. That modest school turned out to be a rock-cracking seed in the adamant wall erected by Lord Cromer and Anglo-Egyptian Condominium officials to prohibit preaching Christ to Muslims. Cromer in 1904 articulated his rationale: 'In the northern portion of the Sudan...if free scope were allowed to missionary enterprise it would not only be wholly unproductive, but would also create a feeling of resentment, culminating possibly in actual disturbances which, far from advancing would almost certainly throw back that work of civilization, which all concerned with the country, whether or not connected with missionary enterprise, have so much at heart.'²² Proselytism was seen to interfere with suppressing the export of slaves via Cairo and Alexandria, which was an explicit aim of the fledgling English- and Arabic-speaking government.

However, the education of women in Sudan demanded an exemption. Many slaves freed during the Anglo-Egyptian war of 1898 against the previous anti-Turkish, anti-Christian Islamic revivalist government were women and young girls. Some had converted to Islam during conditions of war. When a British CMS physician and his wife began, without government approval, to see patients in Omdurman, 'some Muslim men, unwilling to endanger themselves, brought women slaves on whom to try out the doctor's skill before they would risk their own bodies'. One response of the physician's wife and her sister to the unsanitary conditions they encountered visiting Omdurman homes was to begin to teach sanitation to the women who cleaned and cooked. English women missionaries, guided by contemporary outreach to rural and urban poor people in Britain, proved to be a force for girls' education which eventually compelled government approval, by way of exception, to this one avenue of outreach to the Muslim population of the north.

Between 1910 and 1930 the curricula in Christian schools in northern Sudan—Coptic, CMS, American Presbyterian, or Roman Catholic—were largely imported from Syria, Egypt, or British East Africa. As the Anglo-Egyptian Condominium began to recruit teachers and establish standards through its Sudan Education Service, Church and government educators sometimes disagreed on a number of issues, including the use of vernacular languages, the employment of Church school graduates in government

²² H. C. Jackson, *Pastor on the Nile: Life and Letters of Llewellyn H. Gwynne* (London, 1960), pp. 49, 73, 198–202; C. Clive Whitehead, *Colonial Educators* (London, 2003).

schools, and the acceptance of government funding for schools in return for conforming to government timetables.

In the capital, Khartoum, several CMS schools gradually gained acceptance from Muslim parents, who began to send their daughters to study alongside Copts, Ethiopians, and the daughters of Anglo-Egyptian army officers. Students of a dozen nationalities filled up the CMS primary school for girls on a site acquired by Gwynne on Victoria Avenue. From 1928 the diocese of Sudan undertook responsibility for growing the school into a secondary school until, from 1937, girls were taking English School Certificate exams and being admitted to Khartoum's Gordon College for Higher Education. The early hope that graduates of the school would become teachers was slow to be realized, because elite Khartoum families saw the girls' accomplishments in needlework and English as qualifications chiefly for marriage. However, by the time the colonial administration was preparing to hand over to Sudanese political leadership in the 1950s, graduates of what was now Unity High School were working in large numbers as secretaries, nurses, teachers, and doctors, as well as, to the approval of their British headmistress, 'enlightened wives and mothers'.

CMS schools made a similar impact in the smaller towns of Port Sudan, Gedaref, and Atbara, where Arabic was the language of business and civic life, and English was the language of government. West of the White Nile, the people of the Nuba Mountains, speaking a variety of indigenous languages, had experienced prolonged raiding and enslavement by Arabized tribes. Some villages embraced Muslim teachers. In some villages Muslim and Christian Nubas intermarried. In other villages Nubas embraced Christian teachers. In 1933, taking advantage of a further exception—beyond girls' education—made by the Anglo-Egyptian Condominium authorities, two British women, a doctor and a nurse, and two British men, a chaplain and a teacher, sent by the CMS arrived at the mountain village of Salara: 'to train Nuba clerks; to provide social services including infant welfare work; to relate education to the practical needs of the people; and to undertake linguistic and anthropological studies'. Unlike the schools of the interdenominational Australian- and New Zealand-sponsored Sudan United Mission which had preceded them, the CMS agreed that reading should be taught using a simplified form of Arabic script, not the Roman alphabet. When Christian schools proved slow to become established, education authorities opted for Arabic rather than English as the medium for secondary schooling. After independence, the Sudanese Ministry of Education replaced the missionary staff at these CMS schools.²³

Thus in the microcosm of the Nuba Mountains Christian schools were eclipsed. What continued, however, were lively worshipping communities

²³ Gordon Hewitt, *The Problems of Success: A History of the Church Missionary Society, 1910–1942*, 2 vols. (London, 1971), I, pp. 329–31.

writing and singing Christian hymns in Arabic. When during the Second World War young Nuba men were drawn to El Obeid, Omdurman, and Khartoum, they were able to find employment and to join in social clubs alongside new Christians arriving in those cities from southern Sudan, where schools had multiplied during the 1930s.

Two years after British control ended in 1956, foreign Christian missionaries were expelled from Sudan. Southern Sudan and the Nuba Mountains endured a decade of violent resistance by groups disaffected from the new national government. Under the terms of the 1972 Addis Ababa north-south peace agreement, the southern region was to enjoy a semi-autonomous government under which Church assistance from abroad could continue. In the northern region, a few Church schools continued to play a role in elite education. Islamic studies were mandatory in all state and private schools, but Christian studies were permitted in the curriculum, provided the latter were approved and adequately staffed.

In the Episcopal Church of Sudan Girls School in Omdurman in the 1970s, Muslims formed the majority of both staff and students. However, Christian Nubas were being sent by the government of Sudan for teacher training at such universities as Leeds and Birmingham in the United Kingdom. Upon returning, if not recruited by the bishop of Khartoum as administrators, they were likely to teach English and religious education.

In 1994 Ismail Badur Kuku Kunda, a government schoolteacher with advanced training at Cairo's Evangelical (Presbyterian) Seminary and the Selly Oak Colleges in Birmingham, became principal of the Episcopal Church of the Sudan (ECS) Girls School. Continuing the practice of holding a prayer meeting for Christians in the school chapel prior to the morning's roll call and march to classrooms, Kunda decided to accompany the daily hymn on his violin. Muslim girls were attracted and began learning hymns and Bible verses alongside the Christians, until their attending was stopped. Kunda responded by inviting Muslims to appoint one girl every morning to recite from the Qur'an, prior to the singing of the Christian hymn. Muslim girls again participated in chapel and Christian girls learned songs praising the prophet Muhammad. At Christmas and Easter, staff were invited to bring their families, and girls to bring their parents, to see the biblical stories acted out, with hymns during the intervals. Muslim staff were given freedom to use the school yard or the auditorium for Ramadan meals, and those evenings became occasions for friendly discussion of school or community affairs. With six friends, Kunda formed a study group, meeting in homes or the school, to study and debate such topics as the sonship of Jesus, the reliability of the Bible, and the origin and reliability of the Qur'an. Kunda kept a copy of both the Bible and the Qur'an on his desk, explaining, 'We are not afraid of either book'. Accused in an Islamist newspaper of proselytizing Muslims, Kunda left Sudan in 2002. Attendance dropped, teachers left, and parents looked for better

schools in their district. The National Islamic Front was making it difficult for Church institutions in the north to thrive.²⁴

After years of internal warfare and conflict, a referendum in 2011 resulted in the separation of South Sudan as a separate republic, and pressure was applied to the large populations displaced to the capital during the 1980s and 1990s to return to the south. The number of families left to support ECS schools shrank. Foreign visitors were discouraged from visiting churches and schools in the north. Growing wealth from the export of oil was now visible not only in new office buildings but also in magnificent schools attracting good teachers. Church-sponsored schools were no longer the most sought after. In Khartoum, one of these did continue to prosper by offering to prepare an international student body for university study in Sudan, the United Kingdom, or the United States. This was Unity High School, using English as its sole medium of instruction. Claiming the heritage of Llewellyn Gwynne's founding in 1902, with the Anglican bishop of Khartoum chairing its board and a son of the previous bishop as director, this school in 2010 boasted 800 students, with a mixed expatriate and Sudanese faculty of some twenty teachers.²⁵

TANZANIA

After three generations of German and British Christian missions based on Zanzibar island or the Indian Ocean coastal cities of Mombasa and Dar-es-Salaam, Anglican schools of several varieties had been established at many locations in the East African interior. The earlier strategy of training freed slaves from the interior at coastal European-led boarding schools had not yielded the hoped-for impact that would lead quickly to an indigenous-led Church. Swahili, the language of Indians and Arabs intermarried with coastal Africans, might be understood by Muslims and by some elders in villages along the inland trade routes, but not by ordinary Bondei, Yao, or Gogo villagers. The newer pattern of Christian primary evangelization had been to establish a residential station for European missionaries, connected to a cluster of village out-stations led by indigenous evangelists. But in what languages could people receive instruction and worship God? Whatever the local answer, under the German administration of Tanganyika prior to 1919 and the British administration ending in 1961, mission schools promised enough reward in enhanced social status to make attendance attractive, even to Muslim parents. Competition between Roman Catholic, Lutheran, Moravian, Church

²⁴ Ismail Badur Kuku Kunda, 'ECS Girls' School Omdurman, Sudan, Administration, 1970–2014' (unpublished paper in possession of the author of this chapter).

²⁵ <<http://www.unityhighschool.org>> (accessed 2013).

Missionary Society, United Society for the Propagation of the Gospel, London Missionary Society, and Muslim teachers resulted in mixed religious loyalties within members of the same tribe and even the same family. Christians differed with Muslims on the permissibility of polygamy and on proper rites of burial. Christians differed among themselves on apostolic succession as a mark of the true Church, on the manner of celebrating Holy Communion and baptism, and on Church governance.

The terms of their League of Nations mandate for Tanganyika and Zanzibar required British government administrators to direct their educational incentives and regulations towards indigenous self-government sooner rather than later. Thus, from 1925 pressure was put on Islamic and Christian village schools to consolidate into larger, better-staffed schools with competitive admission. This process was accelerated after the Second World War when the end date of the mandate was moved up by the United Nations. It continued from 1961 to 1990 under the egalitarian ethos of President Julius K. Nyerere, as shared Christian–Muslim administrations of the united republic of Tanzania continued to press socialist rural development.

Relations between government, church, and mosque took various turns in the twentieth century. From 1908, the Anglican synod had declared the goal that every deanery should have a boarding school. What began as a bush school related to an Anglican mission station might become at some point a government primary and secondary school, just as some Church-founded clinics in rural areas received government funding and were designated district hospitals. Many Church schools were nationalized by the government beginning in 1964, though some were later handed back.

John Ramadhani, the first African principal of Korogwe Teachers College in the mainland coastal town of Tanga, later principal of St Mark's Theological College in Dar-es-Salaam and archbishop, worked on curriculum development for the Tanzanian Ministry of Education prior to his ordination. He recalled being a primary school student from 1943–9 at St Paul's Boys School, Kiungani, on the predominantly Muslim island of Zanzibar with its mixed Arab and African population. The teachers were Christians, and the bulk of the pupils were Christians from the mainland, with only a handful of Muslims admitted by special recommendation. Some students received baptism. From Primary 4 on, instruction was in English, while Swahili was spoken in recreation, in prayer, and in communication with parents. When Ramadhani returned in 1960, near the end of the British protectorate in Zanzibar, to teach in the same school, by far the bulk of the pupils were Muslims.²⁶

Not all the high aspirations of Church schools were fulfilled in practice, and not all part-time teachers of Christian subjects in municipal schools inspired

²⁶ Ramadhani to author, 6 Oct. 2014.

confidence. One student at St Mark's Theological College in 1997 wrote of teachers who received 400 Tanzanian shillings per month as a stipend but in some cases failed to show up to teach. The seminarian commented: 'How often do our Christians or even Muslims say: "You preach and teach love, we cannot see it in your lives; you teach charity, but we cannot see that you practice it; you teach Christian education, your lives do not appear to us devout!"'²⁷

Church schools, like schools funded by the Aga Khan and the Ahmaddiya community, appear to be valued by the government of Tanzania in part for the transfer of capital and income they manage to secure from foreign donors, thereby enhancing the total resources available for schooling, particularly for poor rural populations. Church leaders in rural dioceses in the 1990s found that local Christians were not providing the support necessary to operate local schools, much less to support expatriate personnel or higher education.²⁸

NORTHERN NIGERIA

In the Northern Protectorate imposed on traditional rulers in the Sokoto caliphate and adjacent regions north of the Niger River after 1903 by a Muslim-British force of less than a hundred men and a small number of officers, the British had little choice but to pursue 'colonialism on the cheap'.²⁹ To suppress slave raiding and build roads they governed indirectly through Muslim rulers and Islamic law (Shari'a). Although the CMS was prepared to send evangelists and teachers into this region, the Church schools and congregations created prior to 1970 drew almost exclusively southern Nigerians and European expatriates. Some government schools in northern Nigeria used English as the medium of instruction, others Arabic.

In the period of independent national government beginning in 1951, influential national leaders including Nnamdi Azikiwe desired to include missionary-founded schools among their means of directing attention both to traditional culture and to the value of national identity. In the north, traditional culture was Islamic. Only in 1970, after a devastating civil war in the eastern region of Nigeria and the beginning of new revenues from oil, was the federal government, now under military leadership, able to undertake

²⁷ Edward Martin Komba, 'Christian Education in the Diocese of Zanzibar and Tanga Then and Now', Dip. Theol. research paper, St Mark's Theological College, 1997.

²⁸ James Barnaba Almasi, 'Self-Reliance in the Anglican Diocese of Masasi', unpublished research paper, 1999, Bishop Payne Library, Virginia Theological Seminary, Alexandria, VA, USA.

²⁹ Paul M. Lubeck, 'Nigeria: Mapping a Shari'a Restorationist Movement', in Robert W. Hefner (ed.), *Shari'a Politics: Islamic Law and Society in the Modern World* (Bloomington, IN, 2011), pp. 244–79 (p. 255); Whitehead, *Colonial Educators*.

providing uniform free public primary education. The government required higher pay and better conditions for teachers than had obtained in mission-owned schools, insisting that education no longer be left to 'the whims and caprices of individual choices'. Education was declared a concurrent responsibility of federal and state governments. Under government guidance, Roman Catholic and Protestant Churches collaborated to produce a syllabus and textbook for secondary schools and teachers' colleges in the area of moral education. In media debate over public corruption and student indiscipline, calls to make Nigeria a secular nation were answered by tributes to Christian mission schools for building character. The recognized Islamic authority in Nigeria, Al-hajji Abubakar Gumi, declared moral confusion to be the affliction shared by all segments of the nation, saying 'We are sick.' During the effort to implement nationally uniform education at a time when some Christian Igbos, Yorubas, and others were settling in northern cities, partisans of religion-free education were often at odds with Christian and Muslim groups. Additionally, Christian educators found it anomalous that a Christian might be appointed head of a predominantly Muslim school, while a Muslim might be posted to head a predominantly Christian school. How, they asked, could these mismatched heads serve as models to their students?³⁰

In the vast territory of the former Northern Protectorate, a handful of Anglican buildings such as the impressive St Stephen's Church, Kano, had housed the worship of Christian European and southern Nigerian workers. Only in 1960, however, was the CMS permitted to establish schools open to Hausa, Kalabari, Idoma, and other indigenous groups. Anglican schools launched simultaneously with the organization of Anglican dioceses included St John's College, Jos (1965); St Bartholomew's Secondary School, Wusasa; and St Benedict's Junior Secondary, Pakshin (Diocese of Jos; 1994). To recruit teachers and fund these schools became the work of these new dioceses. Church-owned schools recruited students primarily from Christian families, but in some cases from families of African traditional religions, and even from Muslim families who were becoming Christian, thanks to public preaching, visiting of homes, and intentional personal invitations.³¹ Government schools—like electricity, good roads, and piped water—were non-existent in many towns. When the new bishop of Kano, Benjamin A. Kwashi, informed the governor of Plateau State in 1992 that he intended to establish a number of schools, the governor expressed appreciation. When the same bishop visited a remote settlement called Kawatas, families offered a large tract of land if the diocese would establish a school on it.

³⁰ J. Omosade Awolalu, 'Religious Education and Nigerian Youth', *Religious Education*, 77 (1982): 84–7. On Gumi, see John Azumah, 'Boko Haram in Retrospect', *Islam and Christian-Muslim Relations*, 26 (2015): 33–52.

³¹ Diocese of Jos, *New Times*, IV (1995), 2; IX (2000), No. 1, 6–9, No. 2, 2.

Between 1980 and 2010, the creation of Anglican schools occasionally preceded but usually followed the multiplication of congregations and dioceses. These schools became centres from which biblical knowledge, Christian ethics, and inter-religious tolerance were injected into the public life of northern Nigeria. Their buildings at times also became attractive targets for physical violence when local campaigns for restoration of Islamic law were being waged. Their graduates enjoyed success at government universities, but the schools also became the object of state government interference. Despite these fierce pressures, in no place is it more evident than in the Anglican schools of northern Nigeria that reconciliation remains the agenda of Christian mission.

CONCLUSION

Between 1910 and 2010, schools—some planted as early as the 1880s—always formed a significant and sometimes a principal part of Anglican missionary endeavours in Muslim-majority societies. Under colonial administrations, rising government standards for teacher training pressed Church-initiated and -funded schools towards serving either overlooked social groups who might elicit support from abroad, or groups enjoying financial means. Under national administrations, Anglican schools served variously as loci of Christian evangelism, practice fields for Muslim–Christian encounter, and allies for political efforts to inculcate national unity and civic responsibility. In these schools Christ and culture continued to meet.

SELECT BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Andrews, C. F., *North India* (Oxford, 1908).
- Bodarenko, Dmitri M., ‘The “Fruit of Enlightenment”: Education, Politics, and Muslim–Christian Relations in Contemporary Tanzania’, *Islam and Christian–Muslim Relations*, 15 (2004): 443–68.
- Chesworth, John, ‘Anglicans and Islam in East Africa’, *Islam and Christian–Muslim Relations*, 25 (2014): 231–43.
- Church Missionary Society. <<http://www.birmingham.ac.uk>>.
- Cox, Jeffrey, ‘Independent English Women in Delhi and Lahore, 1860–1947’, in R. W. Davis and R. J. Helmstadter (eds.), *Religion and Irreligion in Victorian Society* (London, 1992), pp. 166–84.
- Cragg, Kenneth, *The Arab Christian* (Louisville, KY, 1991).
- Dodd, William A., *The Teacher at Work* (London, 1970).
- Duku, Oliver M., *A History of the Church in Kajo-Keji* (Khartoum, 2001).

- Farah, Rafiq A., *In Troubled Waters: A History of the Anglican Church in Jerusalem, 1841–1998* (Bridport, 2002).
- Frykenberg, Robert E., *Christians and Missionaries in India* (Grand Rapids, MI, 2003).
- Griffiths, Paul J., 'Student Teachers: Reading Augustine with Muslims', *Christian Century*, 124 (2007).
- Hanciles, Jehu, 'Missionaries Sent and Received, Africa, 1910–2010', in Todd M. Johnson and Kenneth R. Ross (eds.), *Atlas of Global Christianity, 1910–2010* (Edinburgh, 2009), pp. 264–5.
- Hewitt, Gordon, *The Problems of Success: A History of the Church Missionary Society, 1910–1942*, 2 vols. (London, 1971).
- International Missionary Council, *The Life of the Church*, vol. IV of 'The Madras Series'. Papers from the December 1938 meeting of the International Missionary Council, Madras (New York, 1939).
- Jackson, H. C., *Pastor on the Nile: Life and Letters of Llewellyn H. Gwynne* (London, 1960).
- Manus, Chris Ukachukwu, 'The Nigerian Schools: Towards National Morality', *Religious Education*, 79 (1984): 212–28.
- Neill, Stephen Charles and Hans-Ruedi Weber, *The Layman in Christian History* (Philadelphia, PA, 1963).
- Robert, Dana L., 'Missionaries Sent and Received, Worldwide, 1910–2010', in Todd M. Johnson and Kenneth R. Ross (eds.), *Atlas of Global Christianity, 1910–2010* (Edinburgh, 2009), pp. 258–9.
- Sudan Church Association. <<http://www.dur.ac.uk/library/asc/sudan>>.
- Warren, M. A. C., *Social History and Christian Mission* (London, 1965).
- Whitehead, C. Clive, *Colonial Educators* (London, 2003).
- Yahya, Eliasu, 'The Christian Missions and Western Education in Ilorin, Nigeria', *Journal of Muslim Minority Affairs*, 21 (2001): 149–54.

Anglican Mission amongst Muslims, 1900–1940

Catriona Laing

In a collection of essays entitled *Anglican Identities*, Rowan Williams, one of the most careful Anglican thinkers of our time, explores the character of Anglican thought. Williams observes that the subjects of his study are ‘apologists for a theologically informed and spiritually sustained patience... they know that as Christians they live among immensities of meaning, live in the wake of a divine action which defies summary explanation’. Williams wonders whether these Anglicans might encourage us to be ‘reintroduced to passionate patience’, a gift, he suggests, it is the Anglican vocation to give to the world ‘Christian and otherwise’.¹ This exploration of an aspect of Anglican history will suggest that ‘passionate patience’ was the gift proposed to early twentieth-century missionary theology by Anglican missionaries working in the Muslim world of the Middle East.

The focus of this chapter will be on the Anglican contribution to the shift in missiological thinking that occurred in the first half of the twentieth century. This was a moment in the history of Anglican mission that seems to have inspired some particularly unusual thinking about the nature of mission in the Middle East. Specifically, the chapter will highlight the overlapping work of three Anglican missionaries who presented new ways of thinking about Anglican mission in the midst of Islam. They were Douglas Thornton, William Temple Gairdner, and Constance Padwick. Particular attention will be paid to the work of Constance Padwick (1886–1968), whose contribution was the most unusual and is the least well known. A missionary and author, she made pioneering studies of Islamic spirituality based on service in Egypt, Palestine, and Sudan.

The early decades of the twentieth century witnessed a period of change and upheaval in the Middle East following the collapse of the Ottoman Empire.

¹ Rowan Williams, *Anglican Identities* (Cambridge, 2004), p. 7.

These changes, along with developments in anthropological studies and a flourishing in Protestant spirituality, inspired Anglican missionaries working in the Muslim world to reconsider their approach to mission. The contribution these three missionaries made to Anglican missionary thought in the early twentieth century is an example of the way in which Anglican mission has adapted its missiological methods in response to political and religious change; of how it evolved through collaborative engagement with other Christian denominations; and in the approach adopted by Constance Padwick, through collaboration with other religious traditions, notably Islam.

The proposals proffered by Thornton, Gairdner, and Padwick were rooted to a large extent in the developments in early twentieth-century English Christianity. Before moving to consider the outlook in the Muslim world of the period and the changes there to which these missionaries were responding, let us briefly examine the developments in English Christianity at the turn of the century, which were to provide the backdrop to these new Anglican missiological approaches.

PROTESTANT CHRISTIANITY IN ENGLAND IN THE EARLY TWENTIETH CENTURY

At the beginning of the twentieth century Protestant Evangelicalism in Britain was most explicitly expressed through the Holiness Movement, which has been said to have had the single most important influence on English Evangelicalism in the second half of the nineteenth century.² Initially growing out of Methodist and Quaker teachings, the Holiness Movement developed in England through the launch of the Keswick Conventions in 1873 and continued to shape the prevailing English Evangelical faith for much of the twentieth century.

Many of the Protestant Evangelical missionary movements and organizations of the early twentieth century took their colour from the 'Religion of the Heart' teachings of the Holiness Movement, including the Bible Churchmen's Missionary Society (BCMS), the Anglican Evangelical Gentlemen's Movement (AEGM), and the Student Volunteer Movement (SVM). To the question 'how should we obey?' the Holiness Movement response came: 'from the heart, not from our brain, our understanding, but from the heart'.³ The Holiness

² D. W. Bebbington, *Evangelicalism in Modern Britain: A History from the 1730s to the 1980s* (London, 1989), pp. 151–80; Ian M. Randall, *Evangelical Experiences* (Carlisle, 1999).

³ Brighton Convention Record 142 cited in Raymond Brown, 'Evangelical Ideas of Perfection: A Comparative Study of the spirituality of men and movements in 19th century England', PhD thesis, University of Cambridge, 1964.

Movement steered clear of doctrinal arguments because they were deemed divisive and clouded the importance of the ‘higher sense’ of a ‘heartfelt’ response to the gospel. The cross was the fulcrum of a teaching that encouraged a quest for spirituality with an emphasis on the *experience* of religious faith. Keswick teaching encouraged unquestioning faith: ‘faith that wants no props, no guarantee other than the simple naked Word of God’.⁴ Keswick and the Holiness Movement gatherings held there became a vital recruiting ground for Evangelical missionary societies, who were strongly influenced by this experiential Religion of the Heart.

The Church Missionary Society (CMS) was one of the most significant Anglican missionary organizations operating from Britain in the early twentieth century, and members of the CMS were regular participants at the Keswick gatherings. By 1899 the CMS had become one of the largest Protestant missions in terms of resources, personnel, and influence.⁵ Having experienced great missionary success towards the end of the nineteenth century the missionary societies and movements greeted the new century with optimism, and the numbers of missionaries with the CMS doubled in a decade from 630 members in 1889–90 to 1,238 in 1899–1900.⁶ The new watchword for missions, articulated at the Liverpool Conference of the Student Volunteer Union in 1896, was coined: ‘The evangelization of the world in this generation’. It was deemed that the power of the message of the gospel carried by such enthusiastic and inspiring young Christians could not fail to convince people in foreign lands of the truth of Christianity.

In the midst of such optimism there was also awareness of the need for strategy and collaboration. To this end, a number of large-scale ecumenical missionary gatherings occurred in the early twentieth century, including the Edinburgh World Missionary Conference in 1910, which later gave rise to the International Missionary Council. Drawing on the discussions at the conferences the CMS and its ecumenical partners devoted much of their time to reconsidering the nature of missions in light of Western imperial expansion and these changes in English Christian thought. The focus of this chapter is on Anglican approaches to mission in the early twentieth century. However, it is important to note from the outset that Protestant missionary activity has been highly collaborative and ecumenical. For this reason there will be a number of references to missionaries and projects from other denominations, which inspired the Anglican approach discussed here. The collaborative character

⁴ D. W. Bebbington, *Holiness in Nineteenth-Century England* (Carlisle, 2000), p. 81.

⁵ Kevin Ward and Brian Stanley (eds.), *The Church Mission Society and World Christianity, 1799–1999* (Grand Rapids, MI, 2000), p. 2.

⁶ Gordon Hewitt, *The Problems of Success: A History of the Church Missionary Society, 1910–1942*, 2 vols. (London, 1971), I, pp. xiv–xv.

of the development of Anglian approaches is visible from the early years of the twentieth century.

The popularity of the Holiness teaching notwithstanding, early twentieth-century English Protestantism was not without its internal controversies. Divisions arose among Evangelicals within the Church of England between conservatives and liberals, which led to the establishment of two groups. The BCMS was born in 1922 to promote the teaching of the Keswick Movement and took a conservative approach to biblical interpretation. Shortly after, the liberal wing of the Evangelical tradition established the AEGM in 1923. Members of the AEGM, among them missionaries with a vocation to work amongst Muslims, subscribed to the historical critical method of biblical interpretation and sought to emphasize the gift of ecumenical dialogue to missionary theology. They encouraged greater collaboration between the Western and Eastern Churches and issued a call for repentance by the Western Church, which they believed to be guilty of keeping 'its hands too heavily on the Churches of the East'.⁷ Thus the seed was sown for a particular approach to Anglican mission whereby missionaries were encouraged to work *with* the indigenous Churches of the East: 'for it is by different routes and through different experiences that men find their way to that sense of deep personal need, that sense of sin and worthlessness, which must always be the essential condition for the understanding and for the reception of spiritual blessing'.⁸ The emerging foci of the AEGM influenced the theology of mission that was taking shape amongst Anglican missionaries in the Muslim world.

The World Missionary Conference held in Edinburgh in 1910 stands as a pivotal moment in the history of Protestant missions, as missionaries looked back to the success of the past and forward to the possibilities that an ever-expanding mission field yielded for the spread of the gospel. The Anglican missionary William Henry Temple Gairdner, who was responsible for writing some of the reports from the conference, summarized the atmosphere that pervaded the mission boards of the early twentieth century:

[There was] radical change in the situation that faced the Church all over the world... the sense of a difference in atmosphere was too definite, too widespread, too significant to be ignored. In some way the result of one hundred years of missionary endeavour, and the effect produced by the penetration of Asia and Africa with at least the beginning of Western civilisation, have brought the church to a new sense of the vastness and complexity of the work which now lies before it.⁹

⁷ Church of England, *Liberal Evangelicalism: An Interpretation* (London, 1923), p. 280.

⁸ Church of England, *Liberal Evangelicalism*, p. 280.

⁹ William Henry Temple Gairdner, *Edinburgh 1910: An Account and Interpretation of the World Missionary Conference* (London and Edinburgh, 1910), p. 13.

The emphasis on the heartfelt emotional response to faith in Evangelical Christianity in the early twentieth century was accompanied by a growing interest in anthropological studies and the study of ‘ordinary’ people and ‘popular’ religion. Anthropological ideas were formally introduced to the missionary world at the Edinburgh 1910 conference. With the foreign colonial powers established across the world, Anglican missionaries increasingly found themselves in countries where they were confronted by other religious systems such as Islam and Hinduism, as well as what they described as the pagan traditions, which they had initially targeted (the term ‘pagan traditions’ encompassed cultic practices and worship, which could not be identified with what early twentieth-century Western Christians would have described as the major world religions, Judaism, Christianity, Islam, Hinduism, and Buddhism). In response to this new context for overseas missions missionaries began to explore an anthropological method for missionary engagement, and developed an evangelistic approach that prioritized studying the other religions as a means of getting to know and understand the religious other. These ideas were not unique to Anglicans, but had a profound effect on the shaping of Anglican approaches to mission.

Reflecting these new ideas, one of the conference committees at Edinburgh 1910 addressed ‘The Missionary Message in relation to the non-Christian religions’. In his report of that committee Gairdner observed: ‘Clearly, nothing but a very intimate knowledge of [the unbeliever’s] point of view will enable [the missionary] to present to them his message acceptably or even intelligibly.’¹⁰ There was a new desire to learn about other religions, as a first step to understanding the ‘opposition’: ‘[T]here is a general consensus’, Gairdner wrote, ‘that, representing as they do so many attempted solutions of life’s problem, [the non-Christian religions] must be approached with very real sympathy and respect; that they must be studied, if only to bring the evangelist into touch with the minds of his hearers’.¹¹

The new proposals for anthropological approaches to missionary engagement were developed by members of the AEGM and justified theologically by referring to the work of scholars from other Christian traditions. Surprisingly, given his Roman Catholic commitment, the writer and spiritual director Baron von Hügel influenced the theology of the AEGM. Von Hügel claimed that glimpses of God could be found outside the Christian religion, and that traces of the gospel might be uncovered in other religions. This paved the way for a theology of religions which suggested that other religions were systems of belief, which could prepare the way for the gospel.¹² It became known as

¹⁰ Gairdner, *Edinburgh 1910*, p. 138.

¹¹ Gairdner, *Edinburgh 1910*, p. 137.

¹² W. H. R. Rivers, ‘Anthropology and the Missionary’, *Church Missionary Review*, 71 (1920): 208–15.

praeparatio evangelica.¹³ Drawing on the Evangelical emphasis on the religion of the heart, and inspired by the notion that traces of the gospel found in another religion might be revealed to members of other religious traditions through careful relationship building, some of the Anglican missionary world's most respected intellectuals began to explore a 'sympathetic' anthropological approach to evangelism in the midst of Islam. Whilst new ideas for approaches to mission were beginning to take seed, the context for missionary work amongst Muslims in the Middle East was undergoing significant change.

EGYPT AND THE MUSLIM WORLD AT THE TURN OF THE CENTURY

Surveying the political and religious landscape of the Middle East which lay before him in 1925, John R. Mott, the American Methodist leader of the Young Men's Christian Association (YMCA), and organizer of the 1910 Edinburgh conference, declared: 'A Moslem world undergoing such varied, such extensive, such profound, and such momentous changes is of supreme interest and concern to all Christendom. As a matter of fact, the attention of Christians is to-day riveted on Islam as at no time since the Moslem invasion of Europe.'¹⁴ These changes were particularly apparent in Egypt, which was central to the political and economic machinations of the region. The Muslim world, and Egypt especially, was in a state of socio-political and religious upheaval in the early twentieth century.

The collapse of the Ottoman Empire in 1918 had dealt a blow to Muslim unity. It had left the nations of the Middle East unsure of their political and religious identity and cautious about their relationship with the West. This came at the same time as a gradual decline of British imperial power, which introduced further changes to the political and religious climate of the Middle East and, among other things, affected the modus operandi of the missionary organizations. In Egypt the sense of crisis and confusion was compounded by deteriorating Anglo-Egyptian relations during and following the First World War. The economic crisis that followed the war and the sense Egyptians had that they were being neglected by the British, who were engaged in military intervention elsewhere, contributed to growing resentment at the British presence and increasingly determined demands for British withdrawal. By 1922 the British government was forced to agree to end the administrative

¹³ Gavin D'Costa, *The Catholic Church and the World Religions: A Theological and Phenomenological Account* (London, 2011), pp. 3–30.

¹⁴ J. R. Mott (ed.), *The Moslem World of To-Day* (London, 1925), p. iv.

arrangement known as the ‘Veiled Protectorate’ and withdraw its authority in Egypt. This occurred with the exception of four areas known as the Reserved Points: defence, foreign interests in Egypt, Sudan, and communications. As Egypt edged towards full independence opinions were polarized between the view of the Islamic reformists and those of the secular nationalists.¹⁵ The Islamic reformists aimed to reform Islam, but insisted that Egypt remain an Islamic state. The secular nationalists, on the other hand, claimed that it was through their historical and cultural identity as Egyptians first and foremost that the people of Egypt should understand themselves; religion was secondary. Notwithstanding their conflicting political and religious projects, the parties were united in a strong desire to rid Egypt of foreign rule and to expel Western missionary organizations, which they perceived to be an extension of the British imperial project.

The missionary organizations recognized that Egypt was critical to Anglican missionary work in the Muslim world. Egypt held political and economic authority in the region. Its size and impressive transport and communications industries meant that Egyptian political, religious, and cultural influence extended beyond its borders. These developments inspired the missionary organizations to focus their attention on Egypt as they considered new approaches to mission.

During the British occupation, Egypt’s transport and communications services expanded significantly. This made Egypt the hub for a postal service that delivered to the rest of the Middle East. In 1917 the Dutch Reformed American missionary Samuel Zwemer, who worked with Anglicans, observed that ‘what is published in Cairo is carried by the wings of the postal service to the utmost confines of the Arabic-reading world, and the postal system of Egypt is one of the best’.¹⁶ With improved transportation networks there was a marked increase in both imports and exports of literature. Consequently, Egypt replaced Syria and Lebanon as the centre of Middle East literary production. Writing ten years later Padwick recalled how one could ‘wander among the Arabic bookshops beside the Azhar mosque and find parcels made up to go to China or South America’. ‘Cairo books and newspapers’, she wrote, ‘serve the cause of Islam wherever Arabic is read’.¹⁷

¹⁵ For accounts of the work of Egypt’s intellectuals, see Albert Hourani, *Arabic Thought in the Liberal Age, 1798–1939* (London and New York, 1962); Hamid Enayat, *Modern Islamic Political Thought* (Austin, TX, 1982); Israel Gershoni and James P. Jankowski, *Egypt, Islam, and the Arabs: The Search for Egyptian Nationhood, 1900–1939* (New York, 1986). On the Egyptian nationalist image, see Gershoni and Jankowski, *Egypt, Islam, and the Arabs*, pp. 94–101, 111–15.

¹⁶ ‘A New Era and a New Opportunity’, Yale Divinity School Archives, CMS Papers YDS/H1008.

¹⁷ *Report by Constance Padwick to the Near East Christian Council in May 1927*, Anglican Diocese of Egypt Archives/Green Box 34A.

The other important development, which also served the missionary agenda, was the significant rise in Egyptian literacy. The decline of Anglo-Egyptian relations prompted also significant developments in printing and publishing. There was more printed matter; there were also more readers. Improved printing technologies and more efficient communications services led to a rise in literacy rates. This was the period which Muhammad Husayn Haykal, one of Egypt's reformists, later coined as 'Egypt's literary revolution'.¹⁸ While literacy rates remained low throughout the early decades of the twentieth century, with 9.9 per cent of the male population and 0.6 per cent of the female recorded literate in the 1917 census, the *rate* of the rise was significant. Overall literacy across Egypt increased from 8 per cent in 1910 to 14 per cent in 1925.¹⁹ The numbers remained small, but being concentrated in the urban centres they represented the most influential strata of society. Cairo was also home to the internationally renowned Islamic university, al Azhar, and so remained an important hub for the development of religious ideas.

The political and economic disruption which ensued in Egypt had an impact on the missionary organizations. Reports from the CMS throughout the first decades of the twentieth century testify to the fact that the decline of Anglo-Egyptian relations had negative implications for the Anglican missionary organizations, which by virtue of being British were associated with imperial rule. Large open public meetings were banned, it became increasingly difficult for Western missionaries to obtain work permits and visas, and their freedom of movement and expression became more restricted. Despite these changes, in the first decade of the twentieth century the missionary organizations remained optimistic that the political changes heralded new opportunities for the propagation of the gospel, because they predicted the demise of Islam.

Social and political unrest forced missionaries to the Muslim world to reconsider their approach. As John Mott's declaration that the changes to the Middle East were of 'supreme interest and concern to all Christendom' testifies, the missionary societies were convinced that the moment for planting the gospel was upon them. Anglican missionaries considering mission amongst Muslims believed that Cairo was the intellectual and spiritual heart of the Muslim world in the early 1900s. Gaining influence in Egypt consequently became a priority for missionaries seeking to make their mark on Muslim life.

Missionary scholars believed that the emergence of a strident Egyptian nationalism, and the reformists' inability to form a common mind over Egyptian politics and religion, heralded opportunities for the spread of the Christian gospel. They were missionaries who convened international missionary conferences and wrote reports on the shape of mission in the

¹⁸ Gershoni and Jankowski, *Egypt, Islam, and the Arabs*, p. 87.

¹⁹ UNESCO figures, <http://www.unesco.org/education/GMR2006/full/chapt8_eng.pdf>.

aftermath of such gatherings. Their number included such figures as Samuel Zwemer, Temple Gairdner, and John Mott. At the political level these missionary scholars believed that what they dubbed the crumbling of the 'old' Islam associated with Ottoman rule, and the rise of the 'new' Islam, which engaged with Western political thought and called for Islamic reform, would encourage greater public engagement and, they believed, an opportunity to spread a Christian vision for Egypt's future. In hindsight, the CMS report for Egypt in 1923, which predicted, 'everything points to an increase in the number of conversions before very long',²⁰ was overly optimistic and failed to anticipate the increasingly strict conditions under which Western missionaries would find themselves operating in Egypt. As it happened the missionary organizations had to face the consequences of hitherto having been closely aligned with the British colonial authorities. They were viewed with suspicion by the Egyptian authorities, who determined to make it increasingly difficult for the missionaries to maintain the evangelistic freedom they had previously enjoyed. Notwithstanding the naïveté of the CMS 1923 report, it denotes the high levels of enthusiasm for Muslim missions in the early decades of the twentieth century.

The CMS were among those organizations most heavily involved in these changes to missionary activity in this period. A number of conferences took place following on from the work started at Edinburgh in 1910. However, they now had a specific focus on missionary work amongst Muslims. In 1911 the 'conference for workers in Moslem lands' was held in Lucknow, India. Delayed by the war, a second conference to address developing ideas for missions to Muslims was held in Jerusalem in 1924, hosted by the International Missionary Council. The report from the Jerusalem conference predicts the impact of the change to the political landscape resulting from the decline of the Ottoman Empire and the demise of conservative Islam, which was anticipated by participants at the conference. Together, these factors fuelled a sense of opportunity amongst Protestant missionary organizations. There was a push to encourage more engagement in Muslim missions: 'missions to Moslems have received vastly less attention, few missionaries and less adequate financial support than those to any other great non-Christian religion'.²¹

The recommendations made at Jerusalem included the hitherto tried and tested approaches of education, medical care, and social work. To these strategies two new approaches are proposed: Gairdner, with his colleague Samuel Zwemer, issued a call for specialized training in linguistics and Islamics; and Padwick, with the support of the International Missionary Council presented a 300-page report, entitled 'Christian Literature in Moslem Lands', which recommended the establishment of a central literature bureau,

²⁰ CMS Annual Report 1923, p. 21.

²¹ Hewitt, *The Problems of Success*, I, p. 296.

which would coordinate the publication and distribution of Christian literature for the Muslim world.

THE ANGLICAN CONTRIBUTION TO RETHINKING
MISSIONS TO MUSLIMS: THORNTON,
GAIRDNER, AND PADWICK

Having surveyed the political and religious landscape in which the missionary societies were operating, and the growing interest in missions to Muslims from the broad spectrum of Protestant missionary organizations, we turn to an examination of the particular contribution of Anglican missionaries to mission in the Muslim world in the first half of the twentieth century.

Early in this period of crisis and change in Egypt two of the most dynamic and thoughtful Anglican missionaries travelled to Egypt in order to help to re-establish the CMS office in Cairo, which had been the first in the field, having been established in 1825 but closed within forty years due to lack of success in the number of conversions.²² The office was reopened in 1882 by William Henry Temple Gairdner (1873–1928) and Douglas Thornton (1873–1907). Thornton arrived at the end of 1898 and was joined by Gairdner the following year.

Thornton and Gairdner established a new focus for missionary activity in Egypt. Three priorities emerged. The first was to move away from seeking to convert Copts to Anglicanism, but rather support the indigenous Egyptian Church. As Gairdner wrote in his biography of Thornton: ‘there was no thought of trying to form an Anglican body out of Coptic converts; the great object was by literature and theological instruction to enlighten and help the clergy and other educated Copts’.²³ The second goal was to capitalize on Egypt’s literary revolution; and the third was to encourage missionaries to learn colloquial Arabic in an effort to build relationships with one’s Muslim interlocutor, thereby embracing the kind of ‘sympathetic’ dialogical approach that was gathering steam in missiological debates across the missionary-sending nations. In contrast to their repudiation of proselytism among the Christians of the ancient Coptic Church Thornton and Gairdner observed that the American Presbyterian Mission had abandoned the evangelization of Muslims and chosen to focus on the Copts: ‘The Presbyterian missionaries, however, had no objection to raising up a native Presbyterian Church composed of those Copts who responded to their preaching efforts.’²⁴ The new

²² William Henry Temple Gairdner, *D. M. Thornton: A Study of Missionary Ideals and Methods* (Edinburgh, 1908), p. 71.

²³ Gairdner, *D. M. Thornton*, p. 72.

²⁴ Gairdner, *D. M. Thornton*, p. 72.

approach introduced by Thornton and Gairdner lay in a commitment to supporting the Copts and to focus their evangelistic efforts on the Muslims. Writing in 1922, Gairdner encouraged his colleagues to develop a relationship of mutual support and collaboration:

The primary aim of the Anglican Church in Egypt is the evangelization of the non-Christian population, and . . . it does not desire to draw adherents from either the Coptic or the Evangelical Churches. Those who, in sincerity, find the Anglican Church their spiritual home are welcome to join it . . . but the church does not set out to gain their allegiance. Instead, it seeks to extend the right hand of fellowship to the Coptic Church so as to render it every possible form of service, and, at the same time, it strives for closer cooperation and greater unity between all the Churches in Egypt.²⁵

The call for greater support and collaboration with the Copts was reiterated by Padwick in the 1930s up until the 1950s. As she considered the place of the Eastern Churches amid Islam, Padwick suggested that the *tasliya* (the calling down of blessing on the Prophet in Islam) might serve as a prompt to the Christian Church in the Muslim world. She exhorted her readers that where ‘the *tasliya* is on every lip from morning to night’, the Church should ‘hearten herself with greater use of ejaculations of praise’ and restore the Hosanna; the ‘joy-cry which is the closest equivalent to the *tasliya* [to Christian worship]’.²⁶ The challenge to which Padwick felt the missionary societies must respond was to maintain the rich liturgical tradition of the Church whilst making it accessible and relevant to the modern Muslim. This reflected the teaching of the Anglican Evangelical Group Movement, which called the missionary to ‘develop a greater sensitiveness to the feelings of the native Christians among whom his life is cast’.²⁷ The CMS missionaries based in Egypt, who were leading this shift away from evangelizing Copts to focusing on Muslims did not record their success or failure in this regard, but they did engage in an active training programme for Sunday school teachers in the Coptic Church.

The second way in which the Anglican missionaries believed they could better communicate the power of the gospel to Muslims was through literature. This was in keeping with the Protestant belief in the power of the Word to convict and to convert, thereby presenting a strong theological argument for producing more printed matter through which to make God’s Word as widely available and accessible as possible. As literacy levels rose and printed matter became more widespread generally, the demand grew for translations of the Christian Scriptures and other texts. While there were already Arabic translations of the Christian Scriptures, they were in classical Arabic—part of

²⁵ S. A. Morrison, *Near East* (London, 1955), p. 10.

²⁶ Constance E. Padwick, *Muslim Devotions: A Study of Prayer Manuals in Common Use* (London, 1961), p. 165.

²⁷ T. G. Rogers, *The Inner Life: Essays in Liberal Evangelicalism* (London, 1925), pp. 279–80.

Thornton and Gairdner's legacy was to make Christian literature in Arabic more accessible by using a more popular version of the language.

Thornton and Gairdner believed that the increase in the number of readers and the centrality of the printed word in public debate would have repercussions across the Muslim world, which the missionary movement could not afford to ignore. Anticipating the impact of these changes in 1905 they established a new missionary magazine called *Orient and Occident*, which was published without interruption between 1910 and 1942. The magazine sought to replicate the kinds of intellectual discourses that Gairdner and Thornton had enjoyed early in their time in Egypt when they would meet with scholars from al Azhar University in Cairo to discuss points of theological, spiritual, and philosophical interest. The publication also included anecdotal articles and devotional pieces, as well as reports on current affairs and points of Christian and Muslim interest.

The proposal to develop more Christian literature in colloquial Arabic was significant for Egypt's Christian communities. Even the indigenous Christian Churches used Arabic tentatively. This was because of the religious character of Arabic as the language of Islam. It was not until the end of the nineteenth century that some of Eastern Churches, such as the Melkite Church, started using Arabic in their worship, and then the liturgy was said in Classical Arabic.

The CMS missionaries advocated producing Christian literature in the popular vernacular in order to make it more accessible to the growing community of readers. Moreover, they sought to offer a greater variety of literature. Rather than only producing the Scriptures in Arabic, other Christian literary works, such as *The Pilgrim's Progress*, and the vast genre of mission biographies were believed to be an important source of evangelism. In addition, the publication of devotional works, Bible stories for children, monthly periodicals, hymns, poems, and prayers printed in Arabic were encouraged as a means to make the Word present among Muslims.

Douglas Thornton died in Egypt in 1907, and Gairdner remained in Egypt to continue the work they had started together. The focus of Gairdner's work was to develop the missionary's knowledge of colloquial Arabic. Along with his belief in the power of the printed word Gairdner was persuaded that the key to fruitful discussion—in person and through the printed word—lay with the new anthropological ideas circulating at the missionary conferences of the early twentieth century. He believed that effective engagement was above all contingent upon getting to know one's interlocutor and building a relationship with him or her. This necessitated easy communication. Gairdner made it his project to encourage missionaries to become fluent in spoken colloquial Arabic. To this end he sought opportunities to develop colloquial Arabic language courses for the Western missionary. Gairdner was invited to work with Samuel Zwemer to establish the Cairo Study Center, where he developed language courses in spoken Arabic which missionaries to the Arabic-speaking

world were encouraged to take. Zwemer (1867–1952) spent most of his career working for the Reformed Church in America in Basrah, Bahrain, Muscat, and Kuwait. He travelled to Egypt in 1912 when he was commissioned by the American Mission to establish the Cairo Study Center. The language courses at the Study Center soon became the most popular language courses available, and were attended by missionaries stationed across the Arabic-speaking world.

The final and most surprising proposal to complete this study of new approaches to mission amongst Muslims proposed by Anglicans in the first part of the twentieth century came through further collaborative work. This time the proposals were inspired by engagement with Islamic devotion and the work of Roman Catholic contemplatives. These ideas came to fruition in the writings of another Anglican missionary, Constance Padwick, who should be remembered for introducing an approach to evangelical Anglican missionary work which was shaped by an emphasis on Christian presence.

CONSTANCE PADWICK

In an article in which she reflected on the future of mission in the Muslim world, Padwick describes her approach to mission as ‘Presence’. She wrote:

When soil is beaten and hard there has to be a process of digging and mulching before a crop can be sown. The soil at the point of contact between Christianity and Islam is hard-beaten with old hostilities, ignorances and prejudices. Roman Catholic leaders have for years stressed the need for ‘Presence’ amid Islam, referring not to technical ‘missions’ but to the Presence of Christ in His people living out His love amongst their Muslim friends.²⁸

This avenue was to form the crux of Padwick’s proposals for Anglican missions in the Middle East, which stemmed from her encounter with Islamic prayer and her interest in Roman Catholic spirituality.

Constance Evelyn Padwick was imbued through her family with a strong Evangelical faith influenced strongly by the Holiness Movement and the Keswick gatherings, though she branched away from Keswick and became more influenced by the ideas emerging from the liberal wing of the Church of England through the AEGM. Padwick first travelled to Egypt in 1916 in order to work with the Nile Mission Press in their children’s literature department. Following a dispute over theological differences in the biblical criticism debate Padwick left the press in 1922 and returned to London to study at the School

²⁸ Constance E. Padwick, ‘Unpredictable: Impressions of the Life and Work of John Ethelstan Cheese’, *The Muslim World*, 57 (1967): 265–76 (p. 276).

of Oriental Studies (SOS). There she further developed her knowledge of Arabic and undertook an in-depth study of the religious and cultural practices of what she dubbed 'ordinary' Egyptians. The project involved nine months engaged in fieldwork living with Egyptian peasants in Upper Egypt.

The thesis that Padwick wrote following her year in Upper Egypt presented a careful translation and in-depth ethnographic study of the folklore of Egypt's rural population.²⁹ Following her studies at SOS Padwick applied to the CMS and in 1923 travelled to Egypt to join Gairdner's operation in Cairo, where her time was divided between the CMS and the Christian Literature Bureau, which was overseen by the International Missionary Council. Whilst working in Cairo Padwick devoted herself to implementing the ideas for Christian literature for Muslims. Inspired by Zwemer's work with the American Christian Literature Society, which was the leading Christian publication society for the Muslim world, Padwick expanded the work of the Christian Literature Committee; she edited *Orient and Occident*; and worked with the International Missionary Council on a number of missionary literature projects.

Following in the footsteps of Thornton and Gairdner, Padwick became the next Anglican missionary to argue for shifting the focus of mission amongst Muslims. Alongside her editorial work she published articles and books, which served as a platform to convey her ideas. There were two central ideas in her proposals. First, building on the work of Thornton and Gairdner she emphasized the need to make Christian literature more widely available, and to support the Coptic Church. The second idea, which became the hallmark of Padwick's contribution to missionary thought, was centred on a call to build up a praying Christian presence in the Muslim world. This call had its roots in Padwick's own engagement with Islamic devotion and in her interest in Roman Catholic contemplative thought.

Padwick found her way into Islamic devotion through collecting the devotional prayer manuals of Islam. The manuals did not contain the canonical prayers of Sunni Islam; rather they were a treasure trove of devotional prayers and instructions which arose mostly from the Sufi tradition, and they formed an essential element of the daily devotional life of Muslims across the Islamic world. Padwick's study of these prayer books issued eventually, in 1961, in the publication of her most unusual literary work: *Muslim Devotions: A Study of Prayer-Manuals in Common Use*.

Muslim Devotions became part of the preparation for missions to the Muslim world which Padwick sought to offer missionaries. In the introduction to the book Padwick explained: 'this book has grown from a deep sense of the need for better understanding of Islam by Christians as of Christianity by Muslims. It is an attempt to provide for other beginners information that the

²⁹ Constance E. Padwick, 'Notes on the Jinn and the Ghoul in the Peasant Mind of Lower Egypt', *Bulletin of Oriental Studies*, 3 (1924): 421–46.

writer would most gladly have had at her disposal on arriving in Arabic lands.³⁰ Through her commentaries on the devotional life of Islam Padwick conveyed her ideas about Anglican mission amongst Muslims. Reflecting the growing Protestant interest in an anthropological approach to mission, focused on developing relationships with one's interlocutor, Padwick concluded that the key for a more accurate understanding and engagement with the lived religion of Islam lay in identifying what she called 'kinships' between Islam and Christianity. She believed that these kinships were more easily found in the devotional practices of 'ordinary' Muslims and Christians than in the dry theological treatises used in contemporary missionary practice.

Influenced by the Evangelical notion of the importance of the *individual's* turn to Christ and the sense of the personal spiritual journey of each Christian, Padwick was inspired to seek the equivalent in Islam. Padwick used the commentary she offered on the prayer books to move the study of Islam away from 'the deathclothes of doctrine'³¹ and thereby to reveal echoes of the Keswick Movement's focus upon personal holiness. In the Muslim prayers she discovered that the devotional manuals offered 'the religious strength of Islam', and 'an index to the beliefs of the heart rather than a handbook of official theology'.³²

As she became steeped in the prayer of Islam, Padwick became aware of the many misunderstandings of Islam held by Christians. She also understood that missionary organizations based in Egypt would need to change their approach in order to respond to the changes in Egypt's political climate. Before introducing the points of kinship between the religions in a convincing way, Padwick sought to correct common misunderstandings among Western Christians about Muslim religion. Examples taken from *Muslim Devotions* will illustrate this first step in Padwick's project to reimagine the Anglican missionary approach in Egypt.

In a discussion in *Muslim Devotions* about sin Padwick argued against the canon of Christian scholarship which maintained that the Muslim believer had no perception of sin at the level of personal responsibility, except at the external level of sin and salvation. She pointed her reader towards the prayer books which spoke of the all-seeing eye of God, choosing excerpts from the prayer books to illustrate her argument. The following passage, for example, she maintained conveyed a form of penitent worship not dissimilar to the Christian worshipper's sense of self set in a world of temptation and testing.

My God, Thou has created me, a body, and with it hast given to me instruments of obedience or disobedience, and hast appointed for me in my own nature a soul

³⁰ Padwick, *Muslim Devotions*, p. xxix.

³¹ Brown, 'Evangelical Ideas of Perfection', p. 198.

³² Padwick, *Muslim Devotions*, p. 43.

clamant for selfish ends, and after this Thou hast said to me, 'Abstain my servant!' Through Thee (only) can I guard my innocence. Keep me then from evil. Through Thee (only) can I be shielded from sin. Then do Thou keep me.³³

Padwick also challenged the image of the submissive downtrodden Muslim worshipper current in early twentieth-century missionary accounts of Islam. Western scholars regularly contrasted the emphasis in Christian worship on joy and adoration with the sense of awe and fear of God in Islam. In *The Christian Message in a Non-Christian World*,³⁴ one of the most popular missiological publications of the 1930s, the Dutch missionary scholar Hendrik Kraemer wrote that in Islam 'man is a mere slave (*'abd*) who has to do the arbitrary will of Allah'.³⁵ Padwick challenged Kraemer's statement by showing that while the root of the word for slave in Arabic (*'bd*) does give rise to words which refer to the relationship of slave to lord, the root also denotes service to a god and to the spiritual meaning of divine service. Drawing on the prayers in the manuals, Padwick offered an alternative interpretation where the root *'bd* referred to worship rather than servitude: 'God created His servants (or worshippers, *al-'ibād*) for the purpose of worshipping Him'.³⁶ Distinguishing herself from her mentor, Gairdner, who wrote of the Islamic 'hard deistic doctrine of God', and of how 'the Muslim must be freed from the dread of this inscrutable Despot and taught to pray "Our Father"',³⁷ Padwick argued that '*abd* is close to the New Testament *doulos*. In *Muslim Devotions* she suggested that the word illustrated the worshipper 'glorifying in the relationship with something of that passion of devotion with which St Paul declared himself the slave of Christ'.³⁸

Padwick used this kind of linguistic analysis to demonstrate the kinship she perceived between the two religions at the level of devotion. Having established a relationship between the two religions, Padwick developed von Hügel's references to *praeparatio evangelica*, which had also inspired Gairdner, to argue that Muslim prayers could offer a form of preparation for the gospel. Identifying kinships highlights the similarities, but also the significant differences between Muslim and Christian interpretations of the believer's relationship with God. Thus, Padwick implied that Islam was the preparation for Christianity; Islam would find its fulfilment in Christianity: 'They [Muslims

³³ Padwick, *Muslim Devotions*, p. 218.

³⁴ Kraemer was commissioned to write *The Christian Message* by the International Missionary Council on the eve of the 1938 Missionary Conference at Tambaram.

³⁵ Hendrik J. Kraemer, *The Christian Message in a Non-Christian World* (London, 1938), p. 233.

³⁶ Padwick, *Muslim Devotions*, p. 3 (citing the preface to *Wirdu's-sahr* by Muṣṭafā al-Bakri).

³⁷ William Henry Temple Gairdner, 'Christianity and Islam', in *The Christian Life and Message in relation to non-Christian systems: Report of the Jerusalem Meeting of the International Missionary Council, March 24th–April 8th, 1928* (London, 1928), p. 261.

³⁸ Padwick, *Muslim Devotions*, p. 3.

and Christians] shared in this experience' but then the Christian 'comes home to a revelation of the Divine Nature that no longer leaves him a lost child in the midst of vast eternities. "Jesus we know and He is on the Throne". His Muslim brother sees the Throne and the serried ranks of angels, but the Lamb that has been slain is absent from his vision.'³⁹

Through her engagement with popular Islamic spirituality Padwick had discovered what she believed to be a different understanding of Islam, which she used to suggest that the Western missionary might approach missions to Muslims in a different way. It entailed prioritizing developing those kinships with one's Muslim brothers and sisters, rather than simply trying to correct their misguided beliefs. The focus was on being present with Muslims, bearing Christ to them through one's Christian presence, rather than winning them over with Christian apologetics.

Like her predecessors, Padwick was committed to supporting the life of the indigenous Churches in Egypt. Her advocacy for the Arabic-speaking Churches built on the work begun by Thornton and Gairdner. To this she added the influence of her engagement with Islamic devotion. Padwick's study of Muslim prayers led her to appreciate the liturgies and worship of the Eastern Churches. Reflecting collaborative ecumenical approaches encouraged by the Anglican Evangelical Group Movement, she became convinced that the role of the missionary organizations was to work in support of the native Churches of the Arab world. This was one of two kinds of Christian presence she believed Western missions should support. Padwick believed that attention to the liturgies would remind Muslims of the long-established Christian presence in the Middle East. It would also serve to remind the Western missionary organizations of the ancient and long-standing Christian presence in what they called the Muslim world.

We shall turn in the final section to the second form of Christian presence, which Padwick sought to encourage her colleagues to consider and which changed her understanding of the purpose and justification of the Anglican missionary enterprise in the Muslim world. Padwick was writing at a critical juncture for Anglican missions in the Arab world. The great enthusiasm of the early 1900s for work amongst Muslims was beginning to wane in the light of so few conversions.⁴⁰ As missions to Islam became a deepening drain on diminishing resources, missionary societies began to question the value of exhausting missionary funds on 'failing' evangelistic projects in the Middle

³⁹ Padwick, *Muslim Devotions*, p. 69.

⁴⁰ For discussions of the lack of conversions from missions to the Muslim world, see S. A. Morrison, 'The Theory and Practice of Evangelism with Special Reference to Egypt', *International Review of Missions*, 19 (1930): 550–62; Kenneth Cragg, *Muhammad and the Christian: A Question of Response* (London, 1984), p. 313.

East. In his report on 'mission occupation of Egypt' written in 1924, Zwemer offered his analysis of the situation:

The visible result of the missionary work of Moslems is not very great. At the present time we probably could not point to more than 150 converts from Islam in Egypt. If the Moslem converts were distributed among the missionary workers there would be about one convert for every three missionaries . . . every missionary method has been tried and is being tried but until the present neither the missions nor the Evangelical church have whereof to boast in the face of this great and baffling problem.⁴¹

On one level Padwick concurred with Zwemer's account of the failure of missions. In *The Land of Behest*, a written address to a gathering of bishops and CMS members at Lambeth Palace in 1930 to celebrate 131 years since the first meeting of the CMS, Padwick admitted that the greatest missionaries to Islam had died with only a handful of converts reached. She reported that the CMS could record only twenty-five baptisms for the previous year, while the Coptic Church estimated losing 500 members to Islam each year.⁴² In 1935 the CMS Annual Report reiterated these sentiments as it observed that 'Tropical Africa can record hundreds and thousands of baptisms into the Christian Church in a single year, but not so in the Near East.'⁴³

Committed to witnessing to Christ amongst Muslims, Padwick was aware of how different the situation had become for the missionary societies in the Middle East compared to fifty years earlier. In the light of the increasing antipathy towards Western missions, and the scepticism of some of her colleagues in other parts of the world, and spurred by her own interactions with Islamic and Roman Catholic spirituality, Padwick argued for an approach to mission characterized by a praying Christian presence.

ANGLICAN MISSION AS CHRISTIAN PRESENCE

Through her study of the religious language of the Muslim prayer books and of the Qur'an Padwick discovered the work of the French Catholic Orientalist Louis Massignon, who had been a friend and colleague of Gairdner, and whose work on Islamic mysticism and language informed Padwick's thought.

⁴¹ Archives of the Presbyterian Historical Society, Philadelphia, USA: PHS/209/24/2: 'A survey of mission occupation of Egypt', by H. E. Philips with a special section on Cairo by Zwemer. Prepared for the Intermission Council and General Conference of Christian Workers, 1924.

⁴² *The Land of Behest: Being an Account of a Congress Held in the Year 1930* (London, 1930), p. 143.

⁴³ CMS Annual Report 1934–5, p. 9.

Massignon was a highly accomplished linguist and scholar of Islamic Arabic. He had been influential in encouraging Padwick to consider what style of Arabic would be most suitable for the kinds of Christian texts the literature bureau sought to make more widely available. Massignon ascribed his re-conversion to Catholicism to the intercessions of Muslims and of the Persian martyr Mansūr al-Hallāj (857–922): ‘the first flush of God’s mercy for me’, as he wrote to Padwick.⁴⁴ In an interview given in 1948 Massignon described how ‘Islam has awakened the Christian in me for forty years’, and he said: ‘I can admit that my return to the Church is the child of [Muslims’] prayer.’⁴⁵ A further aspect of Massignon’s work which intrigued Padwick was his foundation of a Christian sodality called the Badaliya Movement. The Badaliya was founded on the idea of the universal love of Christ, that God loves first and that it is in Jesus that humankind comes to understand that love. Members of the Badaliya believed in the power of one person’s mystical substitution for the sinfulness of another. They justified their approach by drawing on the biblical models of badal exemplified in Moses, the Suffering Servant of Isaiah, and the Incarnate Word. Thus the members of the Badaliya took it upon themselves to pray, fast, and perform acts of charity for and on behalf of Muslims. They believed that by their prayer and witness they would elicit a deeper ‘conversion’ of Muslims to faith in God, and eventually to Christ as their Redeemer. The idea that prayer could be a powerful form of Christian witness, as well as important for one’s own spiritual formation, appealed to Padwick.

Padwick’s growing interest in prayer as a means of Christian witness to Muslims developed further when, through Massignon, she discovered the work of the Roman Catholic Trappist monk Charles de Foucauld. Like Massignon, de Foucauld attributed his return to Christianity to the prayers and devotions of Muslims. Inspired by this experience, de Foucauld came to believe that the duty of Christian witness was complete surrender to Jesus in order to make him present. De Foucauld believed that the missionary’s primary role was not to instruct unbelievers in the Christian religion so as to lead them to conversion, but rather to work to prepare for it by earning the respect of one’s Muslim neighbours. He maintained that this could be achieved by leading an exemplary prayer-filled life that would dispel the prejudices held by Muslims.⁴⁶ De Foucauld’s approach seems to have inspired Padwick to look for ways in which to infuse the Muslim soil with the spirit of the gospel, so that when the time was right the hostilities of the past would no longer obstruct the Muslim from embracing the Christian message.

Reflecting this shift in missionary approach Padwick published an article in 1938 which discussed the future of mission to the Muslim world. In the article

⁴⁴ Kenneth Cragg, ‘Constance E. Padwick 1886–1968’, *The Muslim World*, 61 (1969): 30–9.

⁴⁵ Cragg, ‘Constance E. Padwick 1886–1968’.

⁴⁶ C. de Foucauld, *Ecrits Spirituels* (Paris, 1923 edn.), p. 262.

Padwick advocated a surprising mission strategy for an Evangelical—religious orders living in Muslim lands. ‘The present writer longs to see praying Orders established alongside of and in union with active mission work in all Muslim lands, their aim to pray in unison with the prayer of the Priest upon his Throne above, to win the battle against the principalities and powers of the invisible world, to create the atmosphere in which the message can be given and received.’⁴⁷ Prompted both by the example of de Foucauld and by her experience of Islam through Muslim prayer, Padwick suggested ‘perhaps those Christians who have to show Christ to Muslims have a harder task than any other Christian . . . for such work we need a deep preparation of prayer’.⁴⁸

Building on the commitment to prayer that she had acquired from the Evangelical tradition, Padwick’s engagement with Roman Catholic spirituality caused her to offer something new: she proposed that prayer should not only inform mission, but it should be a form of mission in and of itself. Protestant spirituality recognized the need for prayer in missionary work, but the two activities tended to remain separate. Protestant Evangelicalism understood prayer to be the means by which to equip oneself for missionary work; it was the armour needed to ‘do battle’ in the world of Islam. By introducing the idea of contemplative presence as mission Padwick was engaged in a more daring ecumenical task as she proposed a form of engagement found in the wider Christian tradition that had yet to penetrate Protestant missions. Padwick exhorted Christians to a bolder and deeper spirituality and prayer as they surrendered to Christ on behalf of Muslims. The experiences of de Foucauld and Massignon testified to the way in which Islam could stimulate and enrich Christian faith. This sense that the Church might encounter God through engagement with Islam builds on von Hügel’s contention that other religions could provide fertile ground for encountering God.

Padwick’s position challenged the Protestant interpretation of the purpose of Christian mission to the Muslim world. Her missionary method provided an appropriate mode of engagement at a time when the Muslim authorities were tightening the restrictions on Western evangelistic projects, and the lack of conversions in Muslim countries was leading to growing scepticism amongst the home boards of the missionary societies. Nevertheless Padwick’s justification of Western missions has had lasting significance. She reframed the question of what constitutes missionary ‘success’.

Padwick reasoned that if the goal of missions to the Muslim world was to make Christ present in the midst of Islam, the number of conversions was no longer a meaningful barometer for ‘success’. Praying for and on behalf of Muslims, and surrendering to Christ in Christian witness, were now the goals.

⁴⁷ Constance E. Padwick, ‘North African Reverie’, *International Review of Missions*, 27 (1938): 341–54 (p. 352).

⁴⁸ Padwick, ‘North African Reverie’, p. 344.

Padwick wrote: ‘the motive of missions is not their successful issue but the surrender of love to God as revealed in Jesus Christ’.⁴⁹ For Padwick, missionary ‘success’ was now as much about the ‘invisible’ as the ‘visible’ results. The men and women who embodied mission as presence (men like the missionary to Africa, John Ethelstan Cheese, whom Padwick described as a ‘Presence-bearer’ in a biographical article she wrote in 1967), could not count vast numbers of converts whom they had ‘won’ for Christ. Padwick observed that Cheese was remembered for the way he was, more than for what he said. In Padwick’s account, Cheese exemplified the ‘unseen’ work of the missionary who bears Christ to the people but in whose work, ‘only rarely do we find a note of what everyone can see as success’.⁵⁰

If numbers were no longer an appropriate measure of ‘success’, this was also because, contrary to conventional Evangelical understandings of conversion, the approach that Padwick now advocated did not identify a specific moment of conversion. In Padwick’s new missiological perspective ‘success stories’ included those whose encounter with Christ was not witnessed in the earthly realm. Padwick suggested that visible and immediate conversion was rightly not the stuff of missions to the Muslim world: ‘we can speak with confidence of those rescued ones whose full number only the next world will show’.⁵¹ It was, she maintained, ‘asking the impossible’ to expect full and open confession of Christian faith by Arab women in Muslim households.⁵² As Padwick argued, it was impossible to know who might have experienced the ‘internal conversion’ of which Massignon spoke, or to understand the different ways and moments that souls in Muslim lands might be ‘won’ for Christ. On Padwick’s account, the task of the Western missionary was to respond to past misunderstandings and aggression between Christians and Muslims by witnessing to Christ through prayer and presence. This was the gift of ‘passionate patience’ Padwick bequeathed to the Anglican missionary world. For Padwick, measuring success in terms of numbers had become irrelevant: ‘only the historical scenery of the Last Judgment will reveal the success or failure of a myriad of daily contact. Who art thou that judgest another man’s servant? To his own Master he standeth or falleth’.⁵³ As Padwick conceived it, mission was concerned with ‘an unqualified surrender to the way of the cross... those burning tides of prayer and yearning that gave no rest have

⁴⁹ Padwick, ‘North African Reverie’, p. 353.

⁵⁰ Padwick, ‘Unpredictable: Impressions of the Life and Work of John Ethelstan Cheese’, p. 265.

⁵¹ Constance E. Padwick, ‘Lilias Trotter of Algiers’, *International Review of Missions*, 21 (1932): 119–28 (p. 126).

⁵² Padwick, ‘Lilias Trotter of Algiers’, p. 126.

⁵³ Padwick, ‘Unpredictable: Impressions of the Life and Work of John Ethelstan Cheese’, p. 276.

their significance not in the visible and immediate success or failure of mission but in the greater than cosmic, in the spiritual warfare'.⁵⁴

Finally, encapsulating Massignon's experience that his renewed Christian faith had been 'provoked' by Islam, Padwick justified mission to the Muslim world because of what it offered the Church as much as whether or not Muslims were converted. Padwick addressed this idea in an article defending the continuation of missions to Muslim countries. She argued that the 'greater reason for pressing on not only doggedly but gladly with prayer and work for Muslims' was that it 'would prove such a gymnastic as would fortify the Church for dealing with all other oppositions'.⁵⁵ Padwick was willing to argue that confronting Islam, where 'stubborn resistance to the claims of Christ' was most 'ingrained' and 'loyal', produced 'a virility, a spiritual dauntlessness that the Church sorely needs'.⁵⁶ Herein lies the paradoxical claim at the heart of Padwick's understanding of mission: Christianity will be strengthened and enriched by Islam as it seeks to perfect it.

Padwick's study of Muslim prayer had enriched her own Christian devotion. It had impelled her to call for the translation of a wider and richer collection of Christian devotional literature into Arabic through which to witness to Christ. Further, it had confirmed her conviction that engagement with Islam would lead Western missions to support and build up the indigenous Churches of the Arab world. Finally, Padwick's experience of Muslim devotion, and her subsequent interaction with Roman Catholic contemplative thought, led her to argue that by being present in the midst of Islam the Church was led to greater holiness as it was called to prayer and repentance on behalf of Islam.

Padwick's writing about Christian presence was developed further by some of her missionary successors, among them Stanley Andrew Morrison (1894–1956) and Kenneth Cragg (1913–2012). While Morrison's book *The Way of Partnership: With the CMS in Egypt and Palestine* developed the notion of Christian presence, it is surprising that Padwick's ideas did not capture the imagination of more of her missionary colleagues at the time. One explanation for how little Padwick's ideas seem to have spread is the lapse of time between the 1930s when she was writing articles advocating a new approach and the publication of her book, which happened twenty years later. It was not until the late Islamic scholar and missionary Kenneth Cragg drew attention to Padwick's contribution to missionary thought that her work really received any recognition. Cragg was strongly influenced by Padwick's work—most notably her study of the Muslim prayer books—which he used

⁵⁴ Padwick, 'Lilias Trotter of Algiers', p. 127.

⁵⁵ Padwick, 'North African Reverie', p. 352.

⁵⁶ Padwick, 'North African Reverie', p. 353.

extensively in his own study of Muslim–Christian relations, *Troubled by Truth: Life Studies in Inter-Faith Concern* (1992).

CONCLUSION

This chapter has explored the contribution of three Anglican missionaries whose work proposed important changes to the Anglican approach to missionary work in the Muslim Middle East between 1900 and 1940. The changes to Anglican missiological approaches introduced by Thornton and Gairdner involved a greater variety and wider accessibility of Christian literature; careful building of relationships with one's Muslim interlocutor, and with that an emphasis on the importance of fluency in colloquial Arabic; and a desire to support and collaborate with the Coptic Church.

The second half of the chapter examined in more depth the work of Constance Padwick and her particular contribution in considering a new role for Western missionaries to the Muslim world as 'Christ bearers', people who would make Christ present amongst Muslims through their prayer. We have seen that Padwick's work remains relatively unknown, notwithstanding the fact that the new approaches which she and her mentors developed for Western missions in the Middle East captured an important moment in the development of Anglican missionary thought. The vision they shared reflects the way in which Anglican theology responded to the political and socio-economic climate in which it found itself; it demonstrates the collaborative nature of the development of Anglican theology; it highlights a willingness to propose new and unconventional ideas; and it stands as a reminder of the gift of passionate patience Rowan Williams has suggested is the Anglican vocation.

SELECT BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Cragg, Kenneth, *Muhammad and the Christian: A Question of Response* (London, 1984).
- Cragg, Kenneth, *Sandals at the Mosque: Christian Presence amid Islam* (London, 1959).
- Cragg, Kenneth, *Troubled by Truth: Life-Studies in Inter-Faith Concern* (Edinburgh, 1992).
- Gairdner, William Henry Temple, *Edinburgh 1910: An Account and Interpretation of the World Missionary Conference* (London and Edinburgh, 1910).
- Hewitt, Gordon, *The Problems of Success: A History of the Church Missionary Society, 1910–1942*, 2 vols. (London, 1971).

- Hourani, Albert, *Arabic Thought in the Liberal Age, 1798–1939* (London and New York, 1962).
- Lia, Brynjar, *The Society of Muslim Brothers in Egypt: The Rise of an Islamic Mass Movement, 1928–1942* (Reading, 1998).
- Padwick, Constance E., *Muslim Devotions: A Study of Prayer Manuals in Common Use* (London, 1961).
- Padwick, Constance E., *Temple Gairdner of Cairo* (London, 1929).
- Sharkey, Heather, *American Evangelicals in Egypt: Missionary Encounters in an Age of Empire* (Princeton, NJ, 2008).
- Ward, Kevin and Brian Stanley (eds.), *The Church Mission Society and World Christianity, 1799–1999* (Grand Rapids, MI, 2000).

Witness, Advocacy, and Union

Anglicanism's Twentieth-Century Contribution to Minority Christianity in South Asia

Titus Presler

Anglicanism in South Asia entered the twentieth century as a Church in which Indians outnumbered foreigners, yet the Church was led by British bishops and missionaries and laboured with the opportunities and disabilities inherent in being administered by the state-established Church of England. Over the course of the century, Anglicanism grew from mass movements, new mission initiatives of Indian Christians, and the continuing work of foreign missionaries. Educational and medical ministries contributed to local communities and regional society. In the initial stage of ecclesial self-determination the Church became an autonomous Anglican province with mostly British leadership. Fully indigenous leadership developed gradually alongside the rising tide of political nationalism on the subcontinent. Concern for the witness of Christians as a small minority in a region of Hindus, Muslims, Sikhs, Buddhists, Jains, and other religionists prompted innovative ecumenical efforts that resulted in four indigenous and autonomous regional Churches in which Anglicans united organically with Protestant church bodies. Yet distinctive Anglican emphases in worship, episcopal leadership, and public advocacy continue in these ecumenical Churches.

ANGLICANISM IN THE EARLY DECADES

At the opening of the twentieth century, Anglican presence was expressed through the Church of England in India and its constituent Church of England in Ceylon, which together encompassed today's nations of India,

Pakistan, Bangladesh, Sri Lanka, and Myanmar. The originating diocese was Calcutta, established as a see in 1814, and through subdivision it had been followed by Madras in 1835, Bombay in 1837, and Colombo in 1845. The latter part of the nineteenth century saw the establishment of the dioceses of Lahore and Rangoon, both in 1877, Travancore and Cochin in 1879, Chota Nagpur in 1890, Lucknow in 1893, and Tinnevely (now Tirunelveli) in 1896. Thus in 1900 the Church had ten dioceses.

Anglicanism was conditioned ecclesiastically, politically, and culturally by its origin in and continuing oversight by the Church of England, and, in India, was supported by the government. Since 1835 the bishop of Calcutta had been *ex officio* the metropolitan of the ecclesiastical province, subject to the oversight of the archbishop of Canterbury. Whereas the Church in India was an established Church, with many aspects of its life regulated by the Indian government, the Church in Ceylon had, on the model of the Churches in New Zealand and Ireland, been disestablished and freed from government control in 1886, while continuing to be part of the Church of India.

Mission work among Indians had long since exceeded in numbers of Christians and staff the chaplaincy work among expatriate Anglicans in the civil service, military, and business communities with which Anglican presence had begun. The decennial government census of 1901 recorded a total population for India of about 238 million, of whom 2.9 million, or 1.2 per cent, were Christians. Among the over 2.6 million 'native Christians', Roman Catholics numbered 1.4 million, Anglicans 306,000, Syrian Christians 250,000, and various Protestant groups 561,000. Christian growth was outpacing general population growth, for the number of indigenous Christians had increased 30 per cent since the 1891 census, and the number of Anglicans had almost doubled. Christianity was strongest in south India, where over 70 per cent of indigenous Christians lived. Overall, Anglicans constituted about 10 per cent of Christians.¹

Numbers of Indian clergy had increased steadily during the nineteenth century, but during the first decades of the twentieth still lagged behind the expatriate numbers. Caring for a reported 527,000 Anglicans in 1907 were 307 indigenous clergy in the ten dioceses, as compared with 495 foreign clergy, but the three southern dioceses had a different profile. In Madras the 70 indigenous clergy were just three short of the foreign 73; in Travancore and Cochin the 34 indigenous were almost triple the 14 foreign; and Tinnevely had 82 indigenous, over six times the 13 foreign clergy.² The Native Church Council

¹ 'Indian Native Christendom: Results of the Census of 1901', *Christian Missionary Intelligencer* (July 1902), pp. 500–2. The government census of 1891 recorded about 2 million 'native Christians', of whom 1,250,000 were Roman Catholic, 200,000 were of the ancient Syrian Church, 360,000 were Protestants, and 200,000 were Anglicans. Charles Elliott, 'Mission Work in India in the Nineteenth Century', *Church Missionary Intelligencer* (Jan. 1901), p. 16.

² *Church of England Yearbook: 1907* (London, 1907), pp. 536–7.

system instituted by the Church Missionary Society (CMS) in south India to nurture local church management accounted for this differential. Overall, ordination preparation was hampered by theological education in seminaries that were small, partisan to mission societies, and inadequately supported. In 1917 Bishop's College in Calcutta, founded in 1820 as the first Anglican theological college, was refocused to offer purely theological education, shifted from management by the Society for the Propagation of the Gospel (SPG) to church-wide oversight, and thereby strengthened to serve the ordination needs of the whole Church. Some theological colleges proved to be temporary, such as St John's Divinity School in Lahore and St Paul's College in Allahabad, yet they made important contributions during their existence.

The predominantly British leadership of Anglicanism in India early in the century had several sectors—bishops, chaplains, and mission society personnel—that worked cooperatively and sometimes in tension with one another. The bishops were British, and some were appointed by the government but with influence from the archbishop of Canterbury, the metropolitan, and, depending on the area concerned, the CMS and SPG, the two major British mission societies, which had long-standing work in India and hundreds of missionaries. Chaplains, by 1900 about 200, ministered to expatriate Anglicans in the military and civil service, often gathered in garrison churches. Though supervised by the bishops, they were appointed through a colonial government office—the Indian Ecclesiastical Establishment—which funded Anglican, Church of Scotland, and Roman Catholic chaplains, and also some of the Anglican bishops and archdeacons.

Evangelistic, pastoral, educational, and medical work among Indians was led by the mission societies: CMS and SPG; the Church of England Zenana Missionary Society (CEZMS), which worked with women; the Society for the Promotion of Christian Knowledge (SPCK), which focused increasingly on publications; and others. The personnel of these societies—lay and ordained, women as well as men, in pastoral, educational, and medical work—probably numbered about 700 in 1900 among a total of 2,538 'foreign and Eurasian agents', who constituted a tenth of the 23,732 Christian workers, both foreign and indigenous.³ The CMS's Evangelical orientation and its long-standing emphasis on developing indigenous churches that would be self-supporting, self-governing, and self-propagating inclined it to promote an ideal of Indian leadership and therefore to be less establishmentarian and more resistant to British episcopal leadership. For instance, by 1900 relations between CMS missionaries and Bishop Reginald Copleston in Ceylon had finally recovered from a long-running dispute about how episcopal authority, clericalism, and

³ 'Statistical Review of Missions in India', *Report of the Fourth Decennial Indian Missionary Conference, Held in Madras, December 11th–18th, 1902* (London and Madras, 1903), p. 222.

the ritualism of the Tractarian movement affected the welfare of Sinhalese and Tamil churches.

A significant subset of the missionary presence were the members of religious communities that began in the late nineteenth century to undertake pastoral and educational work in India: the Society of St John the Evangelist and the All Saints' Community of monastic women, mainly around Bombay; the Community of St Mary the Virgin, or the Wantage Sisters, at Poona; the Cambridge Brotherhood in Delhi, which established St Stephen's College and had among its members Charles Freer Andrews, an associate of Mohandas Gandhi; and the Oxford Missionary Brotherhood and Sisterhood of the Epiphany around Calcutta. While their memberships were small, a disproportionate number of the bishops in the region came from the orders and missionary communities. The Oxford Brotherhood inspired Mohendra Chakravarti to establish the indigenous Brotherhood of St Andrew in Bengal in 1912, which was joined by a Sisterhood of St Mary in 1929.

The educational infrastructure in place under Anglican auspices can be gauged by the institutions managed by the CMS alone by 1895: 21 high schools and colleges, 89 Anglo-vernacular schools, 1,137 vernacular schools, 11 teacher training institutions, 9 divinity schools, and 47 orphanages.⁴ Higher education was well underway at the beginning of the century and continued to expand in numbers and enhance its contribution with more fields of study and higher degrees. Tertiary institutions included St John's College, Agra, affiliated with the University of Allahabad; St Stephen's College, Delhi, affiliated with the University of Punjab; Edwardes College, Peshawar, also affiliated with Punjab; CMS College, Kottayam; St John's College, Palamcottah; Bishop Heber College, Trichinopoly; and Noble College, Masulipatnam. Women's institutions included Sarah Tucker Institution, Palamcottah, and Queen Victoria College, Agra, affiliated with the University of Allahabad. Anglican educational efforts increased vernacular and English literacy, exposed young Indian men and women to the wider world of learning, offered upward mobility to low-caste Christians, provided Christians with professional employment, maintained high standards relative to government institutions, formed relationships between Christian and non-Christian communities, and contributed generations of leaders to government, civil and military service, literature, arts, medicine, and scholarship. Today, in the organization called Colleges and Universities of the Anglican Communion, India is the largest chapter, with over forty institutions enhancing higher education in the region.

Anglican medical mission was less prominent in India than elsewhere in the world because the government's medical service meant that the region

⁴ *The Church Missionary Atlas: An Account of the Various Countries in which the Church Missionary Society Labours and of Its Missionary Operations* (8th edn., London, 1896), p. 105.

was not dependent on missions for the introduction of Western medicine. The difficulty of presenting Christianity to the Pakhtun tribes people along the Afghan border prompted the CMS to found hospitals at Peshawar; Bannu, where Theodore Pennell was a missionary pioneer; Tank, Dehra Ismail Khan; and Quetta in Balochistan. Hospitals for women included St Stephen's in Delhi, St Catherine's at Kanpur, and Dublin University Mission Hospital at Hazaribagh.

Relations between the CMS and the more High Church and establishmentarian SPG were not easy, and bishops had the challenge of bringing the work of the mission societies into a coherent whole within their dioceses. In Tinnevely, for instance, the major accomplishment of Bishop Edward Waller (1915–23) was to reconcile and integrate competing CMS and SPG approaches: one seminary out of separate society-run theological colleges; one diocesan council from two society councils; and the transfer of the societies' funds and properties to a diocesan trust association.

MASS MOVEMENTS AND INDIGENOUS MISSION

Mass movements of Indians—typically rural, poor, illiterate, and of low caste—into Christianity through conversion, baptism, and formation into local congregations occurred in many parts of India from the second half of the nineteenth century to well into the twentieth. Hundreds and sometimes thousands of people, often entire villages, became Christian in a matter of months or several years. The Methodist Episcopal Church was an especially common receiving church, but the movements also occurred in such areas of Anglican work as Chota Nagpur, Tinnevely, Travancore, Santal, and Dornakal. From about 1890, Chuhras, an agricultural caste in the north-west and Punjab, began moving towards Christianity, and SPG missionaries were able to respond. In 1916, CMS missionaries working in the United Provinces said that Christian growth required the immediate deployment of 20 additional pastors, 50 catechists, and 100 teachers.⁵

Factors contributing to Christian growth called for comment. Bishop Henry Whitehead of Madras attributed growth within the Christian community to 'the superior moral discipline of the Christian Church, the greater care of the children, the freedom from caste prejudices and restraints, more rational marriage customs, better medical attendance, and a higher standard of education diffused throughout the whole community especially among the women'.

⁵ *Church Missionary Review* (May 1916), pp. 269–77; quoted in 'A Missionary Survey of the Year 1916', *International Review of Mission*, 6 (1916), p. 33.

It was 'the attractive power of truth' that accounted for conversions from other religions. About the mass movements he said:

In South India the accessions to the Christian Church during this period have been mainly though not exclusively from the humbler ranks of the Hindu population: and there can be little doubt that social causes have very largely co-operated with individual conviction of the truth of Christianity in bringing men and women to Christ. But in admitting that, we do not condemn the movements. The pariah has been kept for centuries by the Hindu religion in a state of hopeless degradation. He knows that the contempt with which he is treated and the hardship he endures are the direct and necessary result of the religion of his forefathers. Suddenly he is confronted with Christianity. He finds for the first time a religion which treats him as a man, tells him of the true dignity of his human nature, sweeps away the barriers which separate him from his kind and proclaims to him that he is in common with the Englishman and the Brahmin a son of God and an inheritor of the kingdom of Heaven. And that Gospel of freedom comes home to his heart with the conviction of truth. He judges Christianity by the fruits that he can see and understand. And who will venture to maintain that he is wrong in doing so?⁶

Such highlighting of the recovery of human dignity through release from religious, social, and economic oppression under the caste system prefigured analyses of Dalit Christianity in India today. Converts' spirituality was often authenticated by their resolve to persevere despite persecution by local landlords and religious establishments. The relative indifference to Christianity among high-caste Hindus, despite missionary efforts to reach them both directly and through enrolment of their children in mission schools, played a role in missionaries and indigenous pastors turning to lower castes. Theological support was cited in Jesus' care for the poor and the apostle Paul's view that in Christ God chose the foolish, weak, and despised to shame the wise and strong (1 Corinthians 1:27-8). 'We have a splendid opportunity of building up among the low caste during the next century, in the Telugu country, a strong and vigorous Christian community of some 4,000,000 people', said Whitehead in 1907.⁷ At the same time the Church struggled with practical matters such as adequate preparation before baptism, pastoral leadership for new congregations, and the competing efforts of other churches.

Indigenous mission initiatives catalysed what became the missional vitality of Indian Anglicanism, especially from the south, throughout the twentieth century. Anglicans in Jaffna, at the northern tip of Ceylon, had long supported their own mission societies. In 1899 the Student Foreign Missionary Society was founded there 'to send the Gospel to Tamil-speaking peoples in neglected districts of other lands', and it sent J. Shinnatamby to India as its first

⁶ *Report of the Fourth Decennial Indian Missionary Conference*, pp. 7-8.

⁷ A. F. Painter, 'The Call of the Indian Outcastes', *Church Missionary Review* (June 1907), p. 349.

missionary. Revivalism during the 1890s among Christians in Tinnevely Diocese prompted the formation of prayer and preaching bands. Meanwhile, international Young Men's Christian Association (YMCA) leaders John R. Mott and Sherwood Eddy were urging Indian Christians to evangelize their own country amid movements of Hindu revival, and the increasing criticism of the role of Western missionaries.

Experienced in these developments, Vedanayagam Samuel Azariah (1874–1945), YMCA secretary for south India, led the founding of the Indian Missionary Society (IMS) at his native Tinnevely (today's Tirunelveli) in Tamil Nadu in 1903. The IMS's founding principles were Indian personnel, Indian funding, Indian management, and a focus on preaching among people groups not yet reached by the gospel. The first missionary, the Tamilian Samuel Pakianathan, began such work among Telegus around Dornakal, south-east of Hyderabad, in 1903, and Azariah and his wife Ambu, also Tamils, joined them in 1906. IMS work grew steadily, and a century later it had about 660 missionaries, mostly from the south, working through 150 branches in 20 Indian states, and planned to initiate work in Tibet, Bhutan, and Nepal. In the ethnic and sociological complexity of the subcontinent, the linguistic and cultural challenges engaged by IMS missionaries were similar to those encountered by their European missionary counterparts.

In 1905 Azariah and K. T. Paul were instrumental in founding at Serampore the more broad-based National Missionary Society, which had ecumenical participation from five denominations across the linguistic areas of India and an agenda similar to that of the IMS: 'The object of the Society shall be to evangelize unoccupied fields in India and adjacent countries, and to lay on Indian Christians the responsibility for the evangelization of their own country and neighboring lands.'⁸ It immediately sent missionaries to various parts of the region.

INDIGENOUS LEADERSHIP AND SELF-GOVERNANCE

With a disposition to favour indigenous leadership for an indigenous church, the CMS had argued since the latter third of the nineteenth century for the appointment of an Indian bishop. The first was V. S. Azariah, consecrated in 1912 for the new Diocese of Dornakal, the area he himself had pioneered. His elevation was momentous for the Anglican Communion, for the only previous indigenous bishop in mission areas had been Samuel Ajayi Crowther, consecrated in 1864 for the Niger Delta, and the first indigenous Anglican bishops

⁸ Susan Billington Harper, *In the Shadow of the Mahatma: Bishop V. S. Azariah and the Travails of Christianity in British India* (Grand Rapids, MI, 2000), pp. 83–5.

for China and Japan came only in 1918 and 1923. It was also notable for the wider Indian Christian community, for the first indigenous Roman Catholic bishop in the modern period was ordained in 1923, the first Methodist Episcopal bishop in 1931, and the first Lutheran bishop not until 1955. Non-episcopal churches were likewise slow to bring Indians to leadership parity with missionaries. It is said that over 400,000 people became Christians in Dornakal Diocese during Azariah's episcopate, which ended with his death in 1945, including a mass movement of about 200,000 outcaste Malas, Madigas, and tribals. Himself from a low-caste background, Azariah had from his student days urged the Church to stand against caste discrimination, a problem that the Indian Church continues to struggle with today.

Sadhu Sundar Singh (1889–1929) was an Indian Christian well known during the first third of the century as an exemplar both of Christian mission and of mystical practice expressed through indigenous patterns of religious life. As a Sikh he had opposed Christians and missionaries, but after receiving a vision he became a Christian and was baptized by an Anglican priest in the Himalayan town of Simla and later confirmed. He adopted the saffron dress and lifestyle of a *sadhu*, a Hindu itinerant and mendicant ascetic, and embarked on evangelistic travels that took him to Kashmir, Punjab, Afghanistan, and, regularly, Tibet. He studied for the Anglican priesthood at St John's College, Lahore, but left after eight months and resumed an ever widening ministry, during which he visited south India, Ceylon, Burma, Malaya, China, Japan, Britain, the United States, and Australia. His spirituality was nurtured by disciplines of prayer and meditation, his talks impressed audiences greatly, and Sundar Singh became well known in many parts of the world. His last journey to Tibet began in 1929 and, never returning, he was presumed to have died. In the hill town of Dalhousie stands a chapel dedicated to his name and facing the high Himalayas. Sundar Singh's adaptation of Hindu religious modes influenced isolated Christian efforts such as the Jyotiniketan Ashram started by Anglicans Murray and Mary Rogers near Bareilly in north India in 1954. While the mendicant *sadhu* lifestyle never took hold among Indian Christians, Sadhu Sundar Singh's mysticism, humility, and evangelistic zeal continue to inspire millions of Indian Christians today.

Progress towards self-governance was a precondition for the indigenization of Indian Anglicanism's life and leadership, and what became its definitive movement towards organic union with other Churches. An Episcopal Synod of bishops began meeting occasionally in the 1870s and met regularly in the first decade of the 1900s. At its 1912–13 meeting it resolved to form a Provincial Synod of bishops, priests, and laypeople, which in turn required the formation of a council in each diocese. Church–state complications prevented immediate implementation, but the 1919 parliamentary Act in England that enabled the Church of England there to have its own Church Assembly paved the way for constituting a Provincial Council for India in 1922. Initiatives in the 1920s by

both the bishops and the missionary societies resulted in greater integration of the societies' semi-independent work with the dioceses. Yet long-standing theological and institutional divisions took decades to overcome. Late in the century, Bishop Mano Rumalshah of Peshawar recalled in exasperation how, even after independence, Anglicans meeting one another would sometimes ask, 'Are you a CMS Christian or an SPG Christian?'

The Indian Church Act adopted by Parliament in 1927 authorized the Indian Church to become an autonomous province of the Anglican Communion. In commending it to the House of Lords, Archbishop Randall Davidson invoked the principle of indigenous self-determination as he highlighted how in 100 years Anglicans in India had grown from 73,000 members, only 10 per cent of whom were Indians, to 540,000 members, with 72 per cent being Indians. Parity of ecclesial status within the Anglican Communion was an ancillary aim. 'We are now part of a great body of Churches, with their own provinces and their own rules, and we want the Church in India to find itself in a similar position to the Church in Australia or in Canada, where English people are subject to Church rule, but Church rule over which they themselves have control.'⁹

The Church of India, Burma, and Ceylon came into existence on 1 March 1930, days before Mahatma Gandhi began his Salt March to the Arabian Sea. The new Church's constitution provided for episcopal leadership and synodical governance in all matters, including worship, diocesan formation, and the episcopate. It had fourteen dioceses, four having been added since 1896: Nagpur in 1903; Dornakal, 1912; Assam, 1915; and Nasik in 1929. Azariah was still the only Indian bishop in the new province. In 1931 John S. C. Bannerji became the second, as assistant bishop in Lahore with responsibility for Amritsar, and in 1935 Sishir Kumar Tarafdar became an assistant bishop in the diocese of Calcutta. It was some time before Indian candidates for bishop became the norm.

MOVEMENTS TOWARDS CHURCH UNION

Meanwhile momentum was developing towards Anglican union with other Churches. Such ecumenical vision was conditioned by awareness of the rising tide of nationalism and a confidence among Indian Christians—and many missionaries as well—that the Church would eventually be truly Indian in both ethos and leadership. The Indian National Congress had been founded in 1885, and Gandhi's return to India from South Africa in 1915 revitalized the movement. A number of leading Indian Christians were enthusiastic about

⁹ *House of Lords Debates* (Hansard), 28 July 1927: vol. 68, cols. 951–2.

independence, but at times they were uneasy about such developments as the identification of nationalism with Hinduism.

As the sole Indian Anglican representative at the World Missionary Conference in Edinburgh in 1910, V. S. Azariah called for a new relationship between Western missionaries and Indian Christians: 'Through all the ages to come the Indian Church will rise up in gratitude to attest the heroism and self-denying labours of the missionary body. You have given your goods to feed the poor; you have given your bodies to be burned; we also ask for *love*. Give us *friends*.'¹⁰ At the 1912–13 Episcopal Synod it was said that 'if the Church in India was to advance along the path which leads to permanence, it must be free to develop a character, institutions and forms of worship congenial to the people of India'.¹¹

The Indian Christian community's position as a small minority in a vast population dominated by Hinduism and Islam prompted conviction that the Church becoming truly Indian required the Churches in India to overcome their divisions and unite as one. In addition to local leadership, genuine indigenization in India was perceived to require the effacement of ecclesial divisions inherited from the missionary Churches and societies of the West. Thus indigenization and Church union became intertwined, although missionaries from the various participating Churches often took leading roles in the unity movement during its early decades.

Anglican participation in organic Church union was part of a wider movement among Western missionaries and Indian Christians. Many mission societies renounced in theory any intent to export the particularities of their Churches. Henry Venn, CMS general secretary for thirty-one years in the nineteenth century, expressed a broad consensus of mission leaders that authentic Church life among newly evangelized peoples would express their cultural particularities and should not be expected to reproduce the Church life of missionaries, whether Anglican or otherwise.¹²

As missionaries of many backgrounds realized that practice had not fulfilled such commitments, cooperation and unity explorations were nurtured by periodic conferences of India missionaries that became organized and official from 1900. At the first General Missionary Conference for all of India in Allahabad in 1872, J. Barton of the CMS in Madras exclaimed rhetorically, 'Look for example at our Congregationalist Missionary Brethren in S. Travancore; I should like to know what they are if not Bishops (*Episcopi*). And what are our Native Church Councils in Tinnevely (CMS) but Presbyteries.'¹³ In 1886 an Indian physician,

¹⁰ Mildred E. Gibbs, *The Anglican Church in India, 1600–1970* (New Delhi, 1972), p. 335.

¹¹ Gibbs, *Anglican Church in India*, p. 340.

¹² Titus Presler, *Horizons of Mission* (Cambridge, MA, 2001), p. 93.

¹³ Bengt Sundkler, *Church of South India: The Movement towards Union, 1900–1947* (Greenwich, CT, 1954), p. 24.

S. Pulney Andy, founded the National Church of India, which, though short-lived, sounded distinctly indigenous and non-sectarian notes. Internationally, the Lambeth Quadrilateral of 1888 signalled Anglican openness to ecumenical efforts on the four bases of the Bible, the Apostles' and Nicene Creeds, the sacraments of baptism and Eucharist, and the historic episcopate, locally adapted. Non-denominational movements such as the Keswick Convention, the Student Volunteer Movement, and the YMCA stimulated ecumenical spirit among missionaries and Indian Christians. At the Fourth Decennial Indian Missionary Conference in 1902 Bishop Whitehead of Madras declared that unity was Christianity's chief need in the India of the new century because disunity 'impaired the force of that moral appeal which the life of the Christian Church should make to the world'.¹⁴ Evoking 'the reunion of Christendom', the 1920 Lambeth Conference called on 'all the separated groups of Christians to agree in forgetting the things which are behind and reaching out towards the goal of a reunited Catholic Church'. Its suggestion that Anglican bishops and clergy be commissioned for their ordained ministries by authorities of other Churches in the process of reunion, and that clergy of other Churches 'accept a commission through episcopal ordination' at Anglican hands set the terms for later controversy and negotiation.¹⁵

Specific union initiatives commenced early in the century. In 1901 several Presbyterian and Reformed groups in south India formed a united Church, which prompted northern Presbyterians to a similar union in 1904; Congregationalist groups in the south united between 1903 and 1905; and in 1908 Congregationalists and Presbyterians joined in the South India United Church (SIUC), which was intended to catalyse union with yet other Churches. The emphasis on unity in mission at the 1910 World Missionary Conference in Edinburgh birthed the Faith and Order Movement, which nurtured visions and consultations about organic union that were followed closely by Anglican leaders and others in India.

In May 1919 Bishop Azariah convened at Tranquebar (today's Tharangambadi in Tamil Nadu) the Conference on Church Union, a gathering of Indian ministers, with just two Westerners, from the SIUC, Wesleyan Methodist, Swedish Lutheran, and Anglican Churches. In the resulting Tranquebar Manifesto, thirty-three Anglican and SIUC representatives agreed unofficially and individually to work towards union on a basis that echoed the Lambeth Quadrilateral and that recognized what were designated the Congregational element of every Christian having access to God, the Presbyterian element of church councils, and the Episcopal element of leadership by bishops. All three elements were cited as necessary and interdependent, 'for we aim not at

¹⁴ *Fourth Decennial Indian Missionary Conference*, pp. 10–11.

¹⁵ Resolution 9, 1920 Lambeth Conference, <<http://www.anglicancommunion.org/resources/document-library/lambeth-conference/1920/resolution-9>> (accessed 18 May 2015).

compromise for the sake of peace, but at comprehension for the sake of truth'. Urgency marked the group's stated rationale for unity:

We believe that the challenge of the present hour in the period of reconstruction after the war [the First World War], in the gathering together of the nations [the League of Nations], and the present critical situation in India itself [the nationalist movement], call us to mourn our past divisions and turn to our Lord Jesus Christ to seek in Him the unity of the body expressed in one visible Church. We face together the titanic task of the winning of India for Christ—one-fifth of the human race. Yet, confronted by such an overwhelming responsibility, we find ourselves rendered weak and relatively impotent by our unhappy divisions—divisions for which we were not responsible, and which have been, as it were, imposed upon us from without; divisions which we did not create, and which we do not desire to perpetuate.¹⁶

The meeting did not have official status, and the Wesleyan and Lutheran representatives were not able to join in the manifesto, but it catalysed five decades of ecumenical labour among Anglicans and other Churches, initially focused on south India and later on the north. It also highlighted issues that required intense historical, theological, and practical discussion in the ensuing negotiations: episcopacy, intercommunion, and mutual recognition of ministries. At Tranquebar Anglicans called for the historic episcopate, which SIUC members affirmed if it would be a constitutional episcopate and if spiritual equality in the universal priesthood of all believers were recognized. The manifesto proposed that SIUC ministers be consecrated as bishops by Anglican bishops and SIUC ministers and that intercommunion be based on a commissioning of officiating ministers by bishops of a united Church.

The Tranquebar Manifesto prompted the Episcopal Synod to appoint a group of its members to meet with SIUC leaders in what came to be known as the Committee, which met periodically from 1920 until, with many changes of membership, the inauguration of the Church of South India in 1947. Bishop Azariah was the initial convener, and other Anglicans prominent in the negotiations over the years included A. J. Appasamy of Bishop's College, R. A. Manuel, Bishop Foss Westcott (Calcutta), Bishop Henry Whitehead, Bishop Harry Waller (Tinnevely, then Madras), Bishop Edwin Palmer (Bombay), and Bishop Stephen Neill (Tinnevely). Anglican opinion about potential union was often divided between Evangelicals associated with the CMS, who were amenable to finding common ground with Congregationalist, Presbyterian, and Methodist interlocutors, and Anglo-Catholics associated with the SPG and the Oxford Mission in Calcutta, who brought a high sacramentalism to their views of Eucharist and ministerial orders. Particularities of the missional challenge of India and intensifying dialogue among all the major parties

¹⁶ Sundkler, *Church of South India*, p. 101. Bracketed clarifications are mine.

often worked changes in participants' views, so that, for instance, some Congregationalists early affirmed episcopacy as an important element, and an Anglo-Catholic such as Edwin Palmer pronounced himself ready for a kind of re-ordination at Protestant hands if that were the price of union.

Various considerations were brought to the fore in the negotiations. Strengthening the evangelistic capacity of the Churches to reach India was an early theme, after which historical and theological issues of Church order became more prominent. Historical appeals to the Catholic tradition of the Church prompted discussion of the balance between New Testament and patristic models, the balance between early and later patristic patterns, and the balance between Catholic and Reformed traditions. Participants struggled to discern what in their inheritance was simply Western and hence dispensable in a genuinely Indian Church; what in their inheritance was intrinsic to the universal life of the Church and therefore vital for the future; and what distinctive dimensions an Indian sensibility could contribute. Using the Hindu model of a spiritual teacher and guide, A. J. Appasamy conceptualized the bishop as a Christian *guru*, and suggested that the Indian stress on *bhakti*, or religious devotion, could facilitate union by transcending the dogmatism of Western Christianity. Azariah saw the role of bishop as especially important amid the diversity and caste consciousness of India: 'In a country with so many tendencies to division and disintegration because of the numerous castes, races and languages, is it not necessary to safeguard unity by the rule in practice for nineteen centuries?'¹⁷ Against a Congregationalist move in the late 1930s to allow lay presidency at the Eucharist, Azariah wrote, 'It is, to my Indian temperament, a most sacrilegious thing to make provision for the performance of a sacramental rite by any person not solemnly set apart to perform the rite.'¹⁸ Church authorities, mission boards, and theologians in Britain and the United States weighed in on the issues, so that, for instance, the 1920 Lambeth Conference's stress on episcopal ordination and the 1930 Lambeth Conference's overall support for the union effort had important roles in the ongoing negotiations.

THE CHURCH OF SOUTH INDIA

In recognition of the shared Dravidian heritage of south India and the fact that the SIUC was the major interlocutor, the Episcopal Synod decided in 1922 to assign the initial stage of union to its four southern dioceses of Madras, Tinnevely, Travancore and Cochin, and Dornakal, which themselves encompassed

¹⁷ Sundkler, *Church of South India*, p. 110.

¹⁸ Sundkler, *Church of South India*, p. 290.

four language areas: Tamil, Malayalam, Kannada, and Telugu. In 1925 the Wesleyan Methodists of the British connection joined the discussions. In 1926 a post-union interim of fifty years (later reduced to thirty) was proposed as a compromise between Anglican concern that clergy be episcopally ordained and Free Church concern to avoid any approximation of re-ordination of existing ministers. A proposed Scheme of Union was published in 1929, and this was followed by six more editions, the last in 1942, all of them affirming Scripture, creeds, sacraments, synods, and the threefold ministry of bishops, presbyters, and deacons, with revisions focused mainly on the thorny issues of episcopacy and parity of ministries. Worship was to continue initially according to the practices of the uniting Churches, with common forms to be developed after union. The scheme was accompanied by the 'Pledge' that the united Church would not knowingly take actions that would offend the consciences of participants, though interpretations of this remained controversial to the end. Crises arose at times in the negotiations, and the outcome was never certain. Manifestos stressing the urgency of Church union were published by Indian Christians in 1930 and 1936. Intercommunion at a Joint Committee meeting in Madras in 1932 as an anticipation of a united Church was regarded as an important turning point in the process, especially for the Anglicans. In 1941 the Joint Committee issued to the Churches an Appeal for Decision by the spring of 1944. A late Anglican proposal for supplemental ordination of non-episcopally ordained clergy was rejected, yet in January 1945 the General Council of the CIBC approved the Scheme of Union. Methodists voted for union in 1943, and SIUC followed in 1946.

The Church of South India (CSI) was inaugurated on 27 September 1947, a month after the political independence of India and Pakistan, with fourteen dioceses and 1.01 million members: 220,000 Methodists, 290,000 SIUC members, and 500,000 Anglicans. The five existing Anglican bishops, including one Indian—Chirakarottu Korula Jacob, the first elected Indian diocesan bishop of the CIBC, who presided at the inaugural liturgy—continued as bishops, having been commissioned by SIUC and Methodist presbyters; hands were laid on ten new bishops by three Anglican bishops, three SIUC, and three Methodist presbyters; and Bishop Arthur Hollis of Madras became moderator. Of the fourteen diocesan bishops, six were Indians and eight were British; seven were ex-Anglicans, three ex-Congregationalists, three ex-Methodists, and one ex-Presbyterian. Bishop Hospet Sumitra, a Congregationalist in background, was elected the second moderator in 1954. In 1958, ten years after inauguration, the CSI approached 1.1 million members. By 1958 75 per cent of the 949 clergy were episcopally ordained, and by 1965 they constituted 85 per cent. At the end of the thirty-year interim period the CSI did not change its constitution *de jure* to require clergy to be episcopally ordained, but episcopal ordination became the *de facto* norm. In worship, the 'CSI Liturgy: The Service of the Lord's Supper' was finalized in 1954 and received international approbation at

the 1954 General Assembly of the World Council of Churches in Evanston, Illinois. The Book of Common Worship, published in 1963, contained material from multiple traditions, but it displayed considerable continuity with Book of Common Prayer patterns, as do later revisions.

The historic first union between an episcopal church and non-episcopal churches raised the question whether the CSI could still be considered Anglican enough to support full communion with the Anglican Communion. Here the full recognition the CSI gave to non-episcopally ordained clergy for the thirty-year interim period was a stumbling block, as was, to a lesser extent, the fact that its liturgy was still in process of formation. Visits were made, studies were commissioned, recommendations were crafted, but, in brief: the Lambeth Conference of 1948 withheld but looked forward to full communion 'with longing'; Lambeth 1958 commended it for study but expressed reservations around ordination issues; Lambeth 1968 recommended that all Anglican provinces enter into full communion with the CSI; CSI bishops, along with those of the other South Asian united Churches, were invited as guests to Lambeth 1978 and 1988; Lambeth 1988 invited the united Churches to join the Anglican Consultative Council and the Primates Meeting as constituent members of the Communion; and the CSI did so in 1990.

The CSI pursued exploratory union discussions with Baptists and Lutherans, but further unions have not taken place. Today the CSI has twenty-four dioceses, all of them headed by indigenous bishops, in five south Indian states and one, Jaffna, in Sri Lanka. The CSI began ordaining women in 1974, and in 2013 Eggoni Pushpa Lalitha became its first woman bishop, in Nandyal Diocese. By the year 2000 CSI had about three million members and was the second-largest church in India, after the Roman Catholic Church's fourteen million members.¹⁹

THE CHURCH OF NORTH INDIA

With the independence of India and Pakistan in 1947, the Anglican Church in the region became the Church of India, Pakistan, Burma, and Ceylon (CIPBC), the four originating dioceses of the CSI having departed and the two sections of Pakistan divided by a thousand miles between east and west. With the political independence of Burma and Sri Lanka in 1948 the CIPBC included four nationalities. Delhi Bishop Aurobindo Nath Mukherjee was the

¹⁹ David B. Barrett, George T. Kurian, and Todd M. Johnson (eds.), *World Christian Encyclopedia: A Comparative Survey of Churches and Religions in the Modern World*, vol. 1 (2nd edn., New York, 2001), pp. 368–9. Many religious demographics in this chapter are derived from this work.

first Indian to become metropolitan when in 1950 he became bishop of Calcutta. In 1946 Nirode Kumar Biswas, a physician-priest, had become the first Indian diocesan bishop in the north as bishop of Assam; he attended the 1948 Lambeth Conference but died shortly thereafter. Mukherjee was succeeded as metropolitan in Calcutta in 1963 by Kurunegala Bishop Lakdasas De Mel, who served until 1970. In 1960 the CIPBC published a provincial version of the Book of Common Prayer which, while carrying much forward from the 1662 and 1928 Prayer Books, included a eucharistic 'Order of 1960', a eucharistic 'Liturgy for India' with a separate lectionary, services of midday prayer and compline, and several missionary litanies.

While all ecumenically oriented Christians in the region point to the 1919 Tranquebar Manifesto as an inspiration for their movements towards church union, the practical starting point for the north was the union in 1924 of north Indian Presbyterians and Congregationalists in the United Church of North India, which then invited other Churches to explore a wider union. A series of seven Round Table Conferences and four Joint Council meetings were held between 1929 and 1948 among churches whose numbers varied from four to eight, with the CIPBC joining the discussions at the second Round Table in 1930. A Negotiating Committee presented the *Plan of Church Union in North India and Pakistan* in 1951, it being understood that North India and Pakistan would become two autonomous Churches from the same plan, and revisions followed in 1954, 1957, and 1965.

Significant unity amid allowance for continuing diversity was the goal highlighted in the 1965 Plan of Union:

We do not desire that any one Church shall absorb other churches, nor that one tradition shall be imposed upon all; but rather that each Church shall bring the true riches of its inheritance into the united Church to which we look forward. We intend that it shall be a Church which, while holding to the fundamental Faith and Order of the Universal Church, shall assure to its members freedom of opinion in all other matters, and also freedom of action in such varieties of practice as are consistent with the life of the Church as one organic body.²⁰

Participating in discussions were Churches from Anglican, Baptist, Congregational, Methodist, and Presbyterian traditions. The experience of the CSI was helpful to the negotiators, and the northern plan echoed the southern in its affirmation of Scripture, creeds, sacraments, synods; and the threefold ministry of bishops, presbyters, and deacons, with a presiding moderator. As in the south, Anglican commitments to the historic episcopate and to episcopal ordination of clergy occasioned much negotiation, and the outcome was similar in affirming the episcopate as both historic and constitutional, with the

²⁰ Negotiating Committee for Church Union in North India and Pakistan, *Plan of Church Union in India and Pakistan* (Madras, 1965 edn.), p. x.

stricture that this entailed no particular theological view of it. In light of the initial reluctance of the Anglican Communion to affirm full communion with the CSI, and the 1958 Lambeth Conference's expressed preference for the Ceylon plan over the CSI plan, the General Council of the CIPBC in 1960 enquired of other Anglican provinces whether they would be willing to enter into full communion with united Churches of North India, Pakistan, and Lanka (as Sri Lanka was termed) at their inauguration.

Ultimately the response was positive, for the plans for Ceylon and North India/Pakistan differed significantly from the CSI plan regarding ministries. Ambiguity about the unification of ministries was to be removed through a laying on of hands for all clergy at the inauguration of the new Churches. The prescribed preface to the 'Bringing Together of the Episcopates' explicitly articulated the intention to supply 'the special link with the Episcopate of the primitive Church which the Anglican Communion claims to have preserved'.²¹ Care was taken to fulfil Anglican requirements while not offending Free Church sensibilities:

These Churches in uniting mutually acknowledge each others' ministries as ministries of Christ in His Word and Sacraments, and acknowledge that all their ministries have been in God's providence manifestly used by the Holy Spirit . . . and acknowledge that owing to their divisions, all their ministries have been limited in scope and authority, not having the seal of the whole Church . . .

While recognizing that there may be different interpretations of this rite of the laying-on of hands, deriving from different Church traditions, it is agreed that the use of this rite does not imply a denial of the reality of the ordination previously received by those now seeking to become presbyters in the Church of North India/Pakistan; it is not reordination.²²

Differences between the participating Churches about infant and believer's baptism prompted the union plan to accept both: infant baptism, to be followed by a later profession of faith, and believer's baptism, to be preceded by presentation and blessing in infancy.

At its inauguration on 29 November 1970 at All Saints' Cathedral in Nagpur, the Church of North India (CNI) united six Churches: the Indian dioceses of the CIPBC, which had 340,000 members; the Indian portion of what was now the United Church of North India and Pakistan, with 188,000 members; the Council of Baptist Churches of North India, with 110,000 members; the Church of the Brethren, with 18,000 members (it withdrew from the CNI in 2006); the Indian portion of the Methodist Church (British and Australian conference), with 10,000 members; and the Disciples of Christ, with 7,500 members; for a total membership of 673,500. Participation by the Methodist

²¹ Stephen F. Bayne, Jr (ed.), *Ceylon, North India, Pakistan: A Study in Ecumenical Decision* (London, 1960), p. 220.

²² Bayne, Jr (ed.), *Ceylon, North India, Pakistan*, pp. 223–4.

Church in Southern Asia (MCSA), which had its origins in the mission work of the Methodist Episcopal Church of the United States and had the largest membership, at 560,000, was expected but did not occur due to a last-minute misunderstanding in 1970; and later negotiations with the MCSA's successor Methodist Church in India did not achieve union. In 1978 the CNI formed a Joint Council with the CSI and the Mar Thoma Syrian Church of Malabar through which the Churches cooperated in various activities, including the consecration of one another's bishops, and in 2003 the bond was strengthened and renamed the Communion of Churches in India.

The CNI Book of Worship, published in 1995, exhibits many continuities with the Anglican Book of Common Prayer tradition. Its three-year lectionary specifies a theme for each Sunday and supplies a separate collect for each Sunday of the three years. The book acknowledges influence from the ecumenical document *Baptism, Eucharist and Ministry*, published in 1982 under the auspices of the World Council of Churches. In 2000 the CNI had 1.3 million members, a bit over a third the size of CSI, in twenty-four dioceses and was headquartered at CNI Bhavan in New Delhi. In addition to local diocesan evangelism, the CNI's growth has been assisted by the continuing evangelism and church-planting of the Indian Missionary Society and the similarly focused Friends Missionary Prayer Band (FMPB), which was founded in south India in 1959 and deploys hundreds of missionaries in the north. When an FMPB-founded church is strong enough to build a sanctuary and support its ministry, FMPB hands the new congregation over to a nearby established denomination, which often is CNI. Among the over fifty theological colleges affiliated with the Senate of Serampore College, the Kolkata-based institution that accredits seminaries in India, only a few have Anglican origins, chief among them Bishop's College in Kolkata.

The CSI and CNI have highly developed internal structures, with extensive departments devoted to most standard ecclesial ministries, including education and health care. Especially notable is the socio-economic outreach, as directed by the Synodical Board of Social Service in the CNI and by Diaconal Concerns in the CSI, which organize communities to work for gender equality, economic empowerment, acceptance of outcastes, and practical provisions such as sanitation and potable water. The Anglican heritage of interaction with state structures has made Church leaders comfortable in such public advocacy. The rise of cultural and religious nationalism in the Hindutva movement in the late twentieth century made all religious minorities vulnerable. While the Indian constitution stipulated religious freedom, anti-conversion laws passed in some states sought to restrict Christian activity, especially as the Christian proportion of the nation's population increased—from 4.2 per cent in 1970 to 6.2 per cent in 2000—and Christians suffered attacks in the form of beatings, killings, and church burnings. The CNI and CSI have worked publicly and behind the scenes to oppose anti-conversion

legislation and have continued to be active in both inter-religious dialogue and in quiet evangelistic initiatives.

THE CHURCH OF PAKISTAN

At its inauguration at the Cathedral of the Resurrection in Lahore on 1 November 1970, the Church of Pakistan (CoP) brought together the Pakistani portions of the CIPBC, which had the largest membership among the uniting Churches; the Methodist Church in the British and Australian conferences; the Church of North India and Pakistan, mainly of the Scottish Presbyterian connection; and the Pakistani Lutheran Church, with origins in Scandinavia. It differed from the CSI and CNI in including Lutherans, but like the CSI did not include Baptists, Brethren, or Disciples. It had five dioceses: Lahore, Karachi, which was established in 1960 with the first Pakistani bishop, Multan, Sialkot, and Dacca, which formed the Church of Bangladesh in 1974. Four more dioceses were added in 1980: Faisalabad, Hyderabad, established to facilitate the evangelization of tribes from primal religious traditions, Peshawar, and Raiwind, for the present eight. In 2000 the CoP's 1.16 million members made it the largest single church body, followed by the Roman Catholics at one million. The total Christian population was 3.85 million, constituting 2.5 per cent of a national population of 156 million, up considerably from the 0.4 per cent that Christians were in 1900. Christians were also the largest religious minority, followed by Hindus at 1.9 million, or 1.2 per cent.

As throughout the subcontinent, Anglicans in what is now Pakistan contributed to society through primary, secondary, and tertiary education and, especially on the Afghan frontier, health care. Clergy formation needs were met by the Church's St Thomas Theological College, Karachi, and at the ecumenically organized Gujranwala Theological Seminary. Two CoP leaders ministered in major positions in the Anglican Communion. After serving as bishop of Raiwind, Michael Nazir-Ali helped organize the 1988 Lambeth Conference, then served as CMS general secretary, and in 1994 became bishop of Rochester, the first non-white bishop of a diocese within England. Munawar Rumalshah co-edited the report of the 1998 Lambeth Conference and, on leave as bishop of Peshawar, was USPG general secretary, 1998–2003.

Although many Christians supported the founding of Pakistan, a major challenge Anglicans and the Church of Pakistan faced was perennial infringement of religious freedom. Pakistan is an Islamic republic, but its constitution provides that 'every citizen shall have the right to profess, practice and propagate his religion', and that 'all religious denominations, and sects thereof, shall have the right to establish, maintain and manage their own religious

institutions'. As a result of societal discrimination and marginalization, however, there is frequent violence against Christians and church buildings, and most Pakistani Christians and CoP members are confined to menial labour with little opportunity for advancement.

A situation difficult since 1947 was aggravated by developments later in the century. A nationalization drive during the 1970s seized from the CoP many of its schools and Kinnaird College for Women in Lahore, and it abridged the Church's oversight of Edwardes College in Peshawar. An Islamization drive during the 1980s put pressure on all religious minorities, most acutely through strengthened blasphemy laws that were used to intimidate Christians, Hindus, and unpopular Muslim sects. Ideological competition between Iranian Shiite Islam and Saudi Wahabi Islam, along with geopolitical struggles in neighbouring Afghanistan, contributed to the growth of Muslim fundamentalism that issued in the Taliban and further pressured Christians. With an ethos of public advocacy, to which Anglican tradition contributed, and strengthened by the institutional heft of ecclesial union, CoP leaders protested publicly and engaged government officials fruitfully about pressing issues. Meanwhile, the CoP both offered leadership in inter-religious dialogue, such as in Faith Friends in Peshawar and the Christian Study Centre in Rawalpindi, and continued efforts in evangelism, always a delicate task in Pakistan.

THE CHURCH OF CEYLON

Buddhism is the majority religion of Sri Lanka, and in 1971 it was designated the state religion. Throughout the twentieth century Christians were, after Hindus, the second largest religious minority, constituting 10.6 per cent of the population in 1900 and 9.4 per cent of the 18.8 million Sri Lankans in 2000, proportions considerably higher than in India and Pakistan. Anglicans in Ceylon, however, have always been few in number, with the 41,000 in 1900 constituting 1.2 per cent of the national population, and increasing only slightly over the century, to 55,000 in 2000, when they constituted just 0.3 per cent. Yet they have been the second largest single Church, after the Roman Catholics, who numbered 1.26 million in 2000.

During the first half of the century the CMS, SPG, and CEZMS continued to be prominent in the pastoral, theological, educational, and social work of the Diocese of Colombo, and indigenous leadership increased among the Sinhalese and Tamil ethno-linguistic groups. In 1950 a second diocese, Kurunegala, was inaugurated with the consecration of the first Sri Lankan bishop, Lakdasa De Mel, who said at his enthronement, 'We are not only Ceylonese Christians, but we are also Christian Ceylonese. If Ceylon goes up,

we go up with her. We will never desert Ceylon.²³ This declaration from the leader who in 1962 became metropolitan of the CIPBC articulated the need Anglicans and Christians throughout South Asia perennially feel to insist on their patriotism in the face of attempts to identify national citizenship with majority religions, whether Hinduism, Islam, or Buddhism. De Mel oversaw significant indigenization of the liturgy and construction of a cathedral in Buddhist and Sinhalese architectural styles.

Anglicanism had been disestablished in Ceylon since 1888, but with Sri Lanka's independence in 1948 many Sri Lankans viewed all Christian groups as having benefited from colonialism and therefore due for limitation, especially in favour of Buddhism. In 1954 foreign religious personnel were discontinued in government hospitals, and in 1961 government subsidies to church schools were cut, which had the intended effect of forcing Anglicans and other Churches to relinquish most, though not all, of their schools to government control. Nevertheless Anglicans have promoted inter-religious understanding through the Congress of Religions, begun in 1961, and the Inter-Religions Council. A number of indigenous religious orders highlight ministries of contemplation, evangelism, social justice, and inter-religious understanding. Anglican theological education was early led by the divinity school originally located at St Thomas College, Mutwal, but this was closed when in 1963 Anglicans joined with Methodists and Baptists to found at Pitimalalawa the Theological College of Lanka, where instruction in indigenous languages as well as English seeks to nurture mutual understanding between Sinhalese and Tamils.

Church union discussions in Ceylon in 1934 resulted in a society termed the Friends of Reunion, and a Joint Committee established in 1940 reported in 1941 that there was sufficient basis to justify formal negotiations. Using the CSI plan as a basis, a Negotiating Committee began work in 1945 with representatives from the five member Churches in the National Christian Council of Ceylon: the Church of Ceylon (the dioceses of Colombo and, later, Kurunegala) as a constituent of the CIPBC, the Baptist Churches in Ceylon (those affiliated with the Sri Lanka Baptist Sangamaya), the Methodist Church in Ceylon, the Presbytery of Lanka, and the Jaffna Diocese of CSI (Congregational in background and previously part of the SIUC). When the third revised edition of the *Proposed Scheme of Church Union in Ceylon* was presented in 1963, the Anglicans' membership, at 48,823, with 124 ministers, well exceeded the combined membership of the other participating Churches: Methodists, 23,597, with 61 ministers; Baptists, 5,140, with 23 ministers; Presbyterians, 1,425, with 2 ministers; and CSI Jaffna diocese, 5,095, with 13 ministers.²⁴

²³ <http://dioceseofkurunegala.com/history_of_kurunegala_diocese.php> (accessed 19 May 2015).

²⁴ Negotiating Committee for Church Union in Ceylon, *Proposed Scheme of Church Union in Ceylon* (Madras, 1964), p. 112.

A union modelled on Jesus' prayer 'that they may all be one' nurtured hope that the Church of Lanka 'may be a true leaven of unity in the life of Ceylon'. As the churches gave thanks for the past work of missionaries, they said a major purpose of union would be that the 'work of evangelization may be the more effectually fulfilled; and the Church of Lanka may be so mindful of its missionary calling that it may be used of God in the evangelization not only of Ceylon but also of other lands'.²⁵ Like the CSI and CNI plans, Ceylon's union plan followed the broad outlines of the Lambeth Quadrilateral, but it was stronger in representing Anglican concerns, and, as in CNI, it provided for both infant and believer's baptism.

All participating Churches approved the scheme, but dissident Anglicans, Baptists, and Methodists persuaded the nation's supreme court to bar the union on the grounds that their disagreement with it meant that union's implementation, scheduled for November 1975, would violate their constitutionally guaranteed freedom of religion.²⁶ Further legal efforts over the decades have not altered the situation, but in 2008 the five Churches formed a Confederation of Churches to strengthen their cooperation. With enduring hope for eventual Church union, the dioceses of Colombo and Kurunegala continue in extra-provincial Anglican status with direct oversight by the archbishop of Canterbury, but since their 2007 incorporation as the Church of Ceylon they have more control over their own affairs.

The war that raged from 1983 to 2009 between the Sri Lankan government and the Liberation Tigers of Tamil Eelam, who sought to establish an independent Tamil state in the north and east of the country, traumatized the nation as a whole and presented Anglicans and other churches with the challenge of ministering effectively among all ethno-linguistic groups in a polarized environment where challenging the tactics of either side exposed the Church to accusations of complicity with the opposite side. With war's end came the tasks of rebuilding relationships, communities, and basic infrastructure.

THE CHURCH OF BANGLADESH

In the region that is now Bangladesh the Diocese of Dhaka was established in 1952 as part of the CIPBC, with Oxford Mission brother James Blair consecrated as its first bishop. With the 1970 union it became part of the Church of Pakistan, its own constituency being mainly Anglican and Presbyterian in

²⁵ *Proposed Scheme of Church Union in Ceylon*, pp. 5–6.

²⁶ Robert Welsh, 'Survey of Church Union Negotiations, 1973–75', *Ecumenical Review*, 28 (1976): 322–4.

background. The 1971 war that separated East Pakistan from West Pakistan and created the new nation of Bangladesh made relations between east and west difficult, and in April 1974 the Church of Bangladesh (CoB) came into being by declaration of the Synod of the Church of Pakistan. Its polity continued and adapted that of the existing CNI/Pakistan pattern. Barnabas Dwijen Mondol became the first indigenous bishop in 1975, and the second was Michael Baroi with the inauguration of the Diocese of Kushtia in the north-west in 1990. A third diocese is planned for the south, to be based at Barisal.

In 2000, Christians, at 934,000 members, constituted 0.7 per cent of the national population of 130 million, of which 86 per cent were Muslim and 12 per cent were Hindu. The Church of Bangladesh had 13,200 members in about ninety congregations, which were organized into five deaneries, which hold several-day revivals on an annual basis. In addition to St Mary's Sisterhood at Haluaghat, which continues from the 1930s, a sisterhood called Christo Sevika Sangha ('handmaids of Christ') was founded in 1970 and currently has twelve members.

OTHER ANGLICAN COMMUNITIES

At the end of the century a new Anglican presence in South Asia coalesced as the evangelically activist Diocese of Singapore, a member of the Church of the Province of South East Asia, accepted a group of independent Nepalese Churches in 1999 and formed the Deanery of Nepal, one of its six deaneries in nations outside Singapore. In 2015 the deanery recorded 9,000 worshippers, including 2,500 confirmed members, in forty-eight churches, most in the rural highlands, two clergy and seventy-six full-time pastors.

While Anglicans and others in Sri Lanka succeeded in preventing Church union, objections to union with Protestants prompted some Anglicans in both south and north India to stay out of the consummated united Churches. Anglicans nurtured by the SPG in Nandyal district in south India insisted on remaining in the CIBC, which, with CSI consent, formed the Diocese of Nandyal for them in 1963, but it finally joined the CSI in 1975. Other dissident Anglican movements continue. In about 1960 some Anglicans in Kerala broke from the CSI and formed the Anglican Church of India, which had about 225,000 members in 2000, and another Kerala group, the CMS Anglican Church of India, had about 120,000 members. In the north, dissident Anglicans organized to retain the designation of the Church of India, Pakistan, Burma, and Ceylon (CIPBC) and launch lawsuits over church property. For instance, the CNI Diocese of Amritsar today is blocked from access to its traditional headquarters as it continues to contend with over sixty property

lawsuits. The CIPBC claims about twenty clergy, a seminary in Lucknow, and diocesan sees in Calcutta, Lucknow, Chota Nagpur, Nagpur, Amritsar, Assam, Delhi, and Lahore (this last one termed the Anglican Catholic Church of Pakistan). In 1983 it affiliated with the US-based Anglican Catholic Church, of which it is the second province. Also claiming the designation of CIPBC is a group that broke away from the Anglican Catholic group in 1991, affiliated with the Traditional Anglican Communion, and claims nine dioceses, some of them in south India. In Pakistan the Anglican Orthodox Church was formed in 1967 and had about 15,000 members in 2000. Not recognized by the see of Canterbury, these dissident Anglican groups are not members of the Anglican Communion, and their motives are sometimes thought to be based on power and property rather than ecclesiology. Nevertheless they represent a minority insistence on a distinctive Anglican identity in the region.

FUTURE PROSPECTS

It is clear that the united Churches of South Asia in which Anglicans had a founding role are strong presences in their respective regions and that Anglican contributions in evangelism, church-planting, liturgy, socio-economic advocacy, and episcopal leadership will continue to be prominent in the twenty-first century, as they will in the specifically Anglican communities in Sri Lanka and Nepal. Now the largest or second-largest Christian bodies in their regions, the united Churches are entities with which governments and other religious leaders must reckon as the Churches advocate for the marginalized and for religious freedom as minority communities. South Asian Anglicans' historic initiative in organic Church union continues to challenge other Anglicans to engage more intensively with Christians of other Churches in their own contexts.

How will the united Churches of South Asia participate in the continuing identity of the communions that relinquished separate ecclesial identities in South Asia? The answer may be that hybrid identities have developed and will continue to do so. On the one hand, the united Churches constitute a distinct ecumenical category within the global Christian movement. On the other hand, a number of factors mean that the Church communions that joined can include the united Churches in their ongoing identities, and this may be especially true of the Anglicans.

The framers of union looked forward to when their members would no longer consider themselves ex-Presbyterians, ex-Congregationalist, ex-Anglicans, or ex-Baptists, but simply members of the CSI, CNI, CoP, and CoB. However, decades after the respective unions the 'ex-' of ecclesial identities is still strong as a result of persistent liturgical traditions, ecclesial lore in

families and congregations, and continuing litigation that perpetuates the past. Anglicans' numerical preponderance in the CSI, CNI, and CoP naturally contributed to a persistent sense of Anglican identity among many in these Churches. The united Churches' Prayer Books exhibit a strong Anglican background alongside other influences. While Congregational and Presbyterian elements were planned to be co-equal with the Episcopal element in church governance, the South Asian episcopate has become as powerful as any other in the Anglican Communion, so that ecclesial life resonates with other Anglican provinces. Finally, just as the united Churches continue affiliation with world Methodist, Reformed, and Lutheran fellowships, they continue as full members of the Anglican Communion and participate in Anglican ministry networks.

The identities of the united Churches will continue to evolve and become more distinctive over time. Yet a hundred years hence, the history of Anglicanism in the twenty-first century will be incomplete without inclusion of the united Churches of South Asia.

SELECT BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Barrett, David B., George T. Kurian, and Todd M. Johnson, *World Christian Encyclopedia: A Comparative Survey of Churches and Religions in the Modern World*, vol. I (2nd edn., New York, 2001).
- Bayne, Stephen F. (ed.), *Ceylon, North India, Pakistan: A Study in Ecumenical Decision* (London, 1960).
- Church of India, Pakistan, Burma, and Ceylon, *The Book of Common Prayer* (Madras, 1961).
- Church of North India, *The Book of Worship of the Church of North India* (New Delhi, 1995).
- Church of South India, *The Book of Common Worship: As Authorised by the Synod, 1962* (London, 1963).
- Commission on Christian Higher Education in India, *The Christian College in India: The Report of the Commission on Christian Higher Education in India* (Oxford, 1931).
- Gibbs, Mildred E., *The Anglican Church in India, 1600–1970* (New Delhi, 1972).
- Harper, Susan Billington, *In the Shadow of the Mahatma: Bishop V. S. Azariah and the Travails of Christianity in British India* (Grand Rapids, MI, 2000).
- Negotiating Committee for Church Union in Ceylon, *Proposed Scheme of Church Union in Ceylon* (3rd rev. edn., Madras, 1964).
- Negotiating Committee for Church Union in North India and Pakistan, *The Plan of Church Union in North India and Pakistan* (4th rev. edn., Madras, 1965).
- Neill, Stephen, *The Story of the Christian Church in India and Pakistan* (Grand Rapids, MI, 1970).
- Newbigin, James Edward Lesslie, *That All May Be One: A South India Diary—The Story of an Experiment in Christian Unity* (New York, 1952).

- Paul, Rajaiah D., *The First Decade: An Account of the Church of South India* (Madras, 1958).
- Sahu, Dharendra Kumar, *The Church of North India: A Historical and Systematic Theological Inquiry into an Ecumenical Ecclesiology* (Frankfurt, 1994).
- Sinha, Sandeep (ed.), *Preach and Heal: A History of the Missionaries in India* (Kolkata, 2008).
- Sookhdeo, Patrick, *A People Betrayed: The Impact of Islamization on the Christian Community in Pakistan* (Fearn, Scotland and Pewsey, England, 2002).
- Talibuddin, Ernest W., *The Anglican Church in North-East India (1845–1970): A Missiological Reflection* (New Delhi, 2002).
- The Convocation of Canterbury and the Church of South India* (London, 1955).
- Webster, John B., *Historiography of Christianity in India* (New Delhi, 2012).

Anglican Social Ministries in East Asia

John Y. H. Yieh

This chapter reviews some of the social ministries that the Anglican Churches in East Asia have conducted since their origins in the mid-nineteenth century, and assesses the theological rationale and social impact of their programmes. We will examine the Anglican Churches in China (1845–1958), Hong Kong (1849–), Japan (1859–), Korea (1890–), and Taiwan (1954–) in four periods of time divided by the two world wars and the economic boom of the 1980s, which affected the entire region, and will conclude with a brief reflection on their contributions to the mission of the Anglican Communion.

PRIOR TO THE FIRST WORLD WAR

The nineteenth century was a violent time of conquest and expansion, during which the industrialized European empires invaded Africa and Asia to seize land and wealth. The Royal Navy sailed to Asia to facilitate the colonization of India and the occupation of Malaysia, and it defeated China. After the so-called Opium Wars (1839–42), the British Empire forced China to open five port cities for foreign trade under the Nanking Treaty (1842). Hong Kong became a British colony and a naval base for its expedition in East Asia. To provide chaplaincy for British citizens and Europeans working for trading companies on the island, the archbishop of Canterbury established the diocese of Victoria in 1849 and consecrated George Smith to be its first bishop. The nineteenth century was also a time of spiritual revival and global mission and many Anglican missionaries travelled to China hoping to save its millions of souls. For example, Bishop William Jones Boone of the American Church Mission started his mission in Shanghai, China in 1845. In 1859, Bishop Channing Moore Williams of the Episcopal Church of the United States landed in Nagasaki, Japan. In 1862, Thomas Stringer of the Church Missionary Society

began to work among Chinese people in Hong Kong. In 1890, Bishop Charles Corfe arrived in Incheon, Korea. By the end of the nineteenth century, the Anglican missions were well established in East Asia.

For the people in East Asia, the nineteenth century was a distressful time of humiliation and exploitation. They were appalled by the incompetence and corruption of their officials, and stunned by the overwhelming power of European military forces. In their eyes, missionaries were self-invited guests forcing their way in on gunboats, who claimed extra-territorial treaty privileges that their diplomats had coerced out of East Asian officials, and preached a new religion quite ironically about a saviour who could not save himself from crucifixion. Suspicion of, and resistance to, the Christian gospel could therefore be expected. The situation in the region was complicated also because Japan went through the Meiji Restoration (1868–1912) to remove the Tokugawa shogunate, and centralize its government, modernize its weaponry, and industrialize its production. This small island country became an imperialist power attempting to colonize its neighbours, first to defeat the Qing Dynasty of China in the First Sino-Japanese War (1894–5), and then annex Taiwan as its colony (1895–1945), and going on to defeat Russia (1904) and occupy Korea (1905). Consequently, missionaries in East Asia often found their evangelistic and service works caught in the uncertainty of diplomatic relationships and the rapid changes of political settlements.

The primary purpose of Anglican missions in East Asia was threefold—to preach the gospel, to convert Asian people, and to establish Churches—but missionaries also offered the local people Western education, medical care, and charitable services. In Shanghai, for instance, Bishop William Jones Boone opened a boys' school in 1846, Emma Jones established a boarding school for girls in 1851, Edward Syle opened a school for the blind in 1857,¹ and Bishop Samuel Isaac Joseph Schereschewsky founded St John's College in 1879, which trained many civil, business, and political leaders for the new China, including Bishop Ding Guangxun (K. H. Ting) the long-time leader of the Three Self Patriotic Movement Church. In Hong Kong, Vincent Stanton founded St Paul's College in 1847, which has trained generations of Chinese elites to serve as the island's political and business leaders. Lady Lydia Smith and the Society for the Promotion of Female Education in the Far East co-founded the Diocesan Native Female Training School in 1860 that became the Diocesan Home and Orphanage in 1869 and which was renamed the Diocesan Boys' School around 1918. Also notable was Dr E. G. Horder's Leper House at Pakhoi in Guangdong Province, founded in 1891 to serve patients shunned by the wider society. In Osaka, Ellen Eddy opened St Agnes' School, the so-called

¹ G. F. S. Gray, *Anglicans in China: A History of the Zhonghua Shengggong Hui* (New Haven, CT, 1996), pp. 5–19.

'Light in Darkness' school, in 1875.² In Tokyo, Bishop Channing Moore Williams founded St Paul's College in 1874, which became Rikkyo University, a major university with an enrolment of 20,000 students. Bishop Williams also founded St Luke's Hospital in 1902, which has grown into a teaching hospital with 539 beds for in-patients. Alice Hoar of the Society for the Propagation of the Gospel (SPG) started St Hilda's School for Girls in 1875.³ Particularly noteworthy were Kaishun Hospital for lepers that Hannah Riddell established in Kumamoto and another clinic for lepers that Mary Cornwall-Legh opened in Kusatsu, Gunma.⁴ Soon after landing in Incheon, Korea, Bishop Corfe opened Sinmyeong (faith and enlightenment) schools. In 1890, he opened the first Mission Hospital of St Matthew in Seoul under Dr Wiles's charge, and the Hospital of St Luke at Chemulpo under Dr Landis's directorship.

To start a mission with social ministries was a wise strategy because, in East Asia as in other places, the Christian gospel was often considered a foreign threat to local religions and traditional cultures and was deeply resented. But the missionaries' efforts to educate the poor and assist the unfortunate were usually appreciated and sustained evangelistic activities. In fact, social ministries were not simply useful tools for evangelistic works, but were practices of the gospel mandate. Christians ought to love God with their whole heart and love neighbours as themselves, especially the poor. It was the love for the poor that prompted Revd Yoshimichi Sugiura, a student of Bishop Channing Moore Williams in Japan, to found the True Light Church in the slums of Honjo and Fukagawa to take care of 'the little ones'—poor coolies, frightened prostitutes, and abandoned children. After forty years of unflinching service among these social outcasts, he wrote, 'I must go forward on the way God points out to me until I die on my own battlefield, for I firmly believe the Lord's Name must be glorified by the poor!'⁵ It was also concern for the poor that prompted Bishop Charles Corfe to bring with him not only priests but also teachers and doctors when he first came to Korea. Even though he had limited resources and felt like a general going to the battle on a small boat,⁶ he said he was ready for a mission of 'holy poverty'.⁷

Jesus was considered a model missionary for the kingdom of God; so Anglican missionaries followed his example to engage in the threefold mission.

² Domestic and Foreign Missionary Society of the Protestant Episcopal Church in the United States of America, *An Historical Sketch of the Japan Mission of the Protestant Episcopal Church in the USA* (3rd edn., New York, 1891), p. 14.

³ Hamish Ion, *The Cross and the Rising Sun: The British Protestant Missionary Movement in Japan, Korea, and Taiwan, 1865–1945*, 2 vols. (Waterloo, ON, 1993), II, pp. 70–1.

⁴ Alfreda Arnold, *Church Work in Japan* (Cambridge, 1905), p. 126.

⁵ National Council of the Protestant Episcopal Church, *Handbooks on the Missions of the Episcopal Church: Japan* (New York, 1934), p. 60.

⁶ Jae-Jeong Lee, *The Centennial History of the Anglican Church of Korea* (Seoul, 1990), p. 32.

⁷ Church of England, Diocese of Korea, *75th Jubilee: Anglican Church in Korea, 1889–1964* (Seoul, 1964), p. 10.

Among the three, school ministry, with free education for the poor and safe schools for girls, was best received. It was an effective way to fight the prevailing poverty because it gave children of poor families, and girls traditionally denied education, a rare chance to learn skills, find employment, and obtain independence. It was an important form of ministry also because it allowed female missionaries to work side by side with male clergy and reach the other half of the population in what were patriarchal societies. School ministry often produced converts and prepared future clergy for native Churches. Good school ministry also brought in advanced knowledge and Western science to train native leaders and industrialize and modernize those nations. The focus on poor children and deprived girls also challenged East Asian societies to change their patriarchal prejudices.

THE FIRST WORLD WAR TO THE SECOND WORLD WAR, 1910–45

Social ministries require human resources such as qualified teachers and trained doctors, as well as significant amounts of cash to buy medicine and food. In the nineteenth century, Europe and the United States were wealthy and progressive. Mission boards were able to recruit professionals and supply funding, and missionaries were given the authority to take charge of church schools, hospitals, and orphanages. After the First World War, however, some European countries were devastated by the conflict and lost revenues from former colonies, so mission boards had to cut their budgets and reduce the numbers of workers. Meanwhile, nationalism in East Asia surged against imperialism and new laws were imposed on church schools, hospitals, and services. Missionaries began to transfer some leadership roles to the locals.

It was a daunting task for native leaders, because, as foreign support decreased, they continued to face the challenges of colonial oppression and civil wars as well as the struggles for nation-building. While European and American empires continued to dominate in East Asia, the empire of Japan became the most aggressive power in the region. Japan annexed Korea as a protectorate (1910–45) before it could celebrate its release from the iron grip of the empire of the Great Qing. The new Republic of China experienced the havoc of fighting between warlords, the civil war between the Communists and the Kuomintang (Nationalists, 1927–50), and the Second Sino-Japanese War (1937–45). The flow of refugees became a major crisis. Service for the displaced was urgently needed, but few resources were available. However, the Anglican Churches in East Asia managed to keep some ministries afloat.

China and Hong Kong

After the founding of the Republic of China in 1911 mission boards from Britain, the United States, Canada, and Australia joined forces to establish the Zhonghua Shengong Hui (Chinese Holy Catholic Church) in 1912, which lasted until 1958 when the Chinese Communists forced its dissolution in the wake of the Anti-Imperialism Movement caused by the Korean War (1951). In those decades the Anglican Church in Hong Kong belonged to the diocese of South China of Zhonghua Shengong Hui.

For Chinese people the first four decades of the Republic (1911–51) turned out to be a time of turmoil and terror. Their hope to become a strong and prosperous nation was dashed by unceasing wars in their land. Millions of lives were lost, numerous families wiped out, many cities bombed, and most rural areas wasted. The whole nation was in ruins, so that refugees and rebuilding were the main concerns. To meet those two urgent needs, Zhonghua Shengong Hui made several contributions. To train doctors in modern medicine, for instance, it combined resources from St Luke's Hospital in Shanghai and St Peter's Hospital in Wuchang to form a medical school in St John's University in 1912. To support the government's effort to promote literacy among uneducated adults, it participated in the Mass Education Movement (1923) to offer night classes of basic education for adults in church facilities. During the second war with Japan (1937–45), Zhonghua Shengong Hui mobilized its medical personnel to care for the wounded in church hospitals and dressing-stations, set up refugee camps, and joined the work of the Red Cross.

In addition to emergency services for war victims, two cases of political advocacy in Hong Kong were noteworthy. The first case concerned the exploitation of child labour. In the early twentieth century, widespread poverty made child labour seem justifiable, but the mistreatment of child workers appalled one London Missionary Society missionary, Miss Ada Pitts, so much that she decided to force the colonial government to make laws to protect child labourers. Her determination rallied some members of the Church and finally gained public support to pass the 'Ordinance to Regulate the Employment of Children in Certain Industries' in 1923. No child under 11 years old should be employed in factories, no more than 54 hours' work allowed per week, and they should be banned from dangerous trades.⁸ The second case had to do with the slavery of young women. In addition to child labour, extreme poverty also forced poor families to sell off their young daughters to rich households. Besides working long hours as maids, these girls were often sexually abused and mentally harmed. They were treated as property and sometimes leased to

⁸ Gavin Ure, *Governors, Politics and the Colonial Office: Public Policy in Hong Kong, 1918–58* (Hong Kong, 2012), pp. 29–43.

other men. Witnessing this inhumane custom, Cornel John Ward and Clara Haslewood returned to London to lead a lobby effort to urge members of the House of Commons to condemn the practice. To fight the rich owners of maid-slaves, Chinese Anglicans Huang Maolin and Huo Qingtang organized a Committee against Maid-Slavery in Hong Kong. Political pressure from London and social protest in Hong Kong, finally led to the passing of the 'Regulations for Domestic Maids' in 1923 providing legal protection to young women and guaranteeing their return to parents when they reached the age of 18. To ensure that the law was implemented, they also campaigned to pass the 'Registration of Domestic Maids' in 1938. The two cases demonstrate that social ministries of the Hong Kong Sheng Kung Hui (HKSKH) were often initiated and led by laypersons who could not turn their eyes away from the plight of the people, British or Chinese, rich or poor, boy or girl. These two cases further indicate that social ministry should not be limited to the rescue of some individual victims or the betterment of a few families, but should extend to the change of law to transform customs.

In this period, the most influential leader in social ministry in East Asia was Bishop Ronald Hall, who guided the HKSKH through its most difficult times before and after the Second World War. In 1935 he founded Tai Po Orphanage in Hong Kong to care for orphans and street children, which became St Christopher's Home that continues to care for children with different needs today. Concerned about the emigration of young people to cities that resulted in the depletion of human resources in farming villages, he encouraged the children in the orphanage to learn farming skills so that some of them might return to the countryside to lead the reconstruction of rural areas.⁹ In 1944, it was to provide urgent sacramental service and pastoral care for war refugees in Macao that Bishop Hall ordained Florence Tim-Oi Li to be the first woman priest in the Anglican Communion. During his tenure as bishop (1932–66), thirty new parishes, fifty primary schools, fifteen secondary schools, and dozens of social services were established, many of which pioneered programmes of social welfare in Hong Kong.¹⁰

Bishop Hall was also a compassionate leader. In 1933, for example, shortly after arriving in Hong Kong and witnessing the misery of homeless people, he organized the Street Sleepers' Shelter Society, which in a period of just three months was ready to provide 10,000 beds and showers for them. In 1937, to take care of the refugees fleeing the Sino-Japanese War, Hall chaired the Emergency Refugee Council in Hong Kong to set up four central kitchens to feed 4,500 people every day and five refugee camps to accommodate 10,000 refugees. His work laid a firm foundation of social ministry for the HKSKH.

⁹ Ronald Hall, 'Training Leaders for Village Life', *South China*, 1 (1 May 1937), p. 2.

¹⁰ David M. Paton, *The Life and Times of Bishop Ronald Hall of Hong Kong* (Hong Kong, 1985), p. xvii.

Japan

As Japan continued to build up national muscle, military leaders seized more political power and began to pursue imperialistic ambition abroad. They manipulated the emperor to start several wars, occupying Manchuria in 1931, invading China in 1937, attacking Pearl Harbor, and invading Southeast Asia in 1941. When the United States joined the war in the Pacific theatre, Japan began to lose its battles and was finally brought to its knees when two atomic bombs were dropped on Hiroshima and Nagasaki in 1945. Throughout this period, life in Japan was distressful because of war efforts. Soldiers were drafted to fight abroad, military industries took priority, and all people were asked to sacrifice and contribute their labour and money for the honour of the emperor and the empire.

School ministry continued to be the focus of Nippon Sei Ko Kai (the Holy Catholic Church of Japan), but one social service is worth noting. During the great earthquake and terrible fire of Tokyo in 1923, St Luke's Hospital provided such efficient emergency care that it won the hearty gratitude and respect of the population, the government, and the Imperial household.

To keep all civil groups under tight control, Japanese military authorities forced foreign bishops to resign and repatriated most missionaries. As a result, financial aid from overseas mission boards stopped. In 1938 the Religious Corporation Law was issued to require all Protestants to be merged as one United Church of Japan (Nihon Kirisuto Kyodan). A schism took place in the young Nippon Sei Ko Kai (NSKK), which had been only recently recognized as an Anglican Province in 1930. Bishop Yasutaro Naide of Osaka led one-third of the congregations to join the Kyodan, but Bishop Hinsuke Yashiro of Kobe and the other two-thirds of the episcopate chose to keep their Anglican identity outside the structure recognized by the government.¹¹ Under the law, each congregation could still function in religious affairs, but no organization at the diocesan or national levels was allowed. Regrettably, the NSKK could do little to serve the deprived and the destitute as the Second World War came to an end and social needs became greater.

Korea

After its annexation by the empire of Japan in 1910 Korea suffered under its colonial rule until the defeated Japan surrendered to the Allies in 1945. To ensure total control, the Japanese authorities compelled Koreans to learn and use the Japanese language in official business and educational systems. They

¹¹ R. N. Whybray, *The Church Serves Japan* (London, 1956), p. 35.

also promoted the Shrine Movement in 1930s, forcing Koreans to worship the Japanese emperor as a god in Shinto shrines. These policies angered many Koreans and ignited the Independence Movement to fight for their freedom and dignity. Most Korean Anglicans, though small in number, were sympathetic to the movement. The British missionaries in Korea had to negotiate the conflict between Japanese authorities and Korean people, but many of them found it difficult to learn Japanese after they had spent much time learning the Korean language.

To maintain its colonial control, the Japanese authorities shut down some missions, but the sisters of St Peter's mission turned out to be a successful example of adaptive ministry. The sisters ran five projects: the orphanage at Souwon, St Mary's Hostel for Christian girls attending the government school, the Yang-Tok-Won (the House for Cultivating Virtue) for training widows and young women, the training of women catechists, and itinerant evangelistic and pastoral work.¹² The first three projects were clearly ministries that served the unfortunate members of society. St Mary's Hostel was notable because it was set up to address a specific need of the time. Under Japanese rule, many Church schools in which the Korean language was used were closed, because most families decided to send their children to government schools in which Japanese was used, and because the Japanese authorities imposed new regulations on schools to implement its colonial policies. The sisters realized that many young girls left their homes in the countryside to study in the government schools in the cities and could be easily preyed on, so they opened the hostel to offer them a safe haven and an experience of Christian life.

One school ministry started in this period turned out to be influential until today. St Michael's Theological Institute was founded in 1923 to train native clergy. It was shut down by Japanese authorities in 1940, but was reopened after 1945. It was upgraded to be a seminary in 1982, and was certified as a university offering liberal arts degrees in 1992. The Sungkonghoe (Anglican) University has trained many clergy and civil leaders, and offers a pioneer programme in graduate NGO Studies to train leaders for civil movements and human rights groups from all over Asia.

In this period of repeated and long-term wars the most urgent ministry was providing war refugees and survivors with food, shelter, jobs, and hope. Medical ministry continued to serve the increasing needs of war victims as well as local patients, and in China and Japan it was upgraded to medical education to train native doctors and nurses. School ministry continued to grow in China, Hong Kong, and Japan, though it was shut down in Korea under Japanese rule. It is noteworthy that colonial power could play a supportive as well as an opposing role. In Hong Kong, Bishop Hall could develop

¹² Charles J. Corfe, *The English Church Mission in Corea: Its Faith and Practice* (London, 1917), ch. 3, <<http://anglicanhistory.org/asia/kr/corea3.html>> (accessed 31 Dec. 2015).

wide-ranging social ministries partly because he had a robust political influence in that British colony. In Japan, on the other hand, the Church's work was constrained by the military government's war efforts to colonize Asia.

POST-SECOND WORLD WAR, 1945–80

The Second World War witnessed a sweeping turnover in leadership, vision, and practice for Anglican ministries in East Asia. After the war, most Western missionaries returned to their home countries and subsidies from mother Churches dwindled to a halt. Local leaders began to take the helm of Church ministries, but often with limited experience and constrained assets under the pressure of post-war reconstruction. They were severely tested by the rapid changes in politics, economy, and society.

Hong Kong

As soon as the Second World War ended in 1945 Hong Kong began its post-war reconstruction. Many labourers from China congregated on the island. The sudden massive influx of labourers created social problems in housing, childcare, education, and medicine. Bishop Hall worked closely with the Workers' Union to take care of their basic needs. He also worked so closely with the Communists to support the labourers that the governor of Hong Kong nicknamed him 'our pink bishop'.¹³ In 1948, while sitting on the Hong Kong Social Welfare Council, Hall proposed to use the mayor of London's donation for post-war restoration in British colonies to establish a Housing Association, which was charged to plan and provide affordable housing to low-income families of workers and refugees. In 1949, in order to provide food, clothes, and basic training to more poor children, he rented a room in a Taoist temple to establish the St James' Boys' and Girls' Club, which turned into one of the most important social services in Hong Kong—St James' Settlement. Since its humble founding in 1949, St James' Settlement has won praise and support for its charitable works from the HKSKH, the government, and many charity groups and private foundations in developing into a multi-service agency serving the various needs of children, young people, the elderly, and those who need rehabilitation. In 2015, it operates in 58 service points across Hong Kong Island, Kowloon, and the New Territory, employing 1,200 full-time and 300 part-time social workers, with an annual budget of HK\$560

¹³ Paton, *Life and Times of Bishop Ronald Hall*, p. 79.

million. This case reminds us that, in a multi-religious society, social ministries are effective when they are based on inter-faith cooperation.

Bishop Hall had subscribed to F. D. Maurice's Christian Socialism since his time as a student at Oxford and as a rector at Newcastle. Besides the conventional ministries of schools, hospitals, and orphanages that cared for individual persons, he wanted to uphold social justice and effect structural changes for all people; and he was not shy in exercising his political influence in the colonial government to advocate legal rights for the deprived class in society, especially women, labourers, and the poor. Under his leadership, the HKSKH did not merely provide emergency care and temporary assistance, but also worked actively to change the legal system and government social policies. In 1966 Hall implemented the establishment of the Diocesan Welfare Council to coordinate the various social ministries carried out by individual clergy and laypersons in order to provide an efficient network of service. That organizational decision resulted in coherence and collaboration, and thus ensured the continuous growth of HKSKH social services.

Japan

After its surrender that ended the Second World War Japan struggled to rebuild its nation from the ruins. There was shortage in everything, but two developments within the NSKK assisted its spiritual restoration. First was the reconciliation between the Churches that remained Anglican and those that joined the Kyodan before the war. In a special General Synod held on 18 October 1945, Bishop Hinsuke Yashiro issued a declaration to invite the seceding Churches to rejoin the NSKK. The other was the reinstatement of the NSKK as a legal corporate body in 1946, a petition quickly approved by the Occupying Authorities. In this period, the NSKK's social ministry was focused on providing care for wartime orphans. The Hakuaisha (Broad Love Society Orphanage) started in Osaka in 1890,¹⁴ and took in 544 orphans in 1946 alone.¹⁵ This number may seem insignificant in comparison to the overwhelming number of orphans in Japan that required assistance in the immediate post-war years, but it was an impressive effort by the NSKK whose membership was tiny. In 1947 it founded a clinic, and in 1952 it was licensed by the government as a social welfare institution. To meet the needs of the poor in Osaka, it also opened a kindergarten in 1969 and a nursing facility for the elderly in 1998.

¹⁴ Robert Andrews, *The Japan Mission of the American Church: Church Works in the Dioceses of Tokyo and Kyoto* (Hartford, CT, 1908), pp. 133–6.

¹⁵ Urachi Hiroshiichi (浦地洪一) (ed.), *日本聖公会宣教 150 年の航跡 [One Hundred and Fifty Years of the Nippon Sei Ko Kai]* (Tokyo, 2012), p. 151.

In 1959 the NSKK celebrated its centenary. One important resolution of the Church was to establish the Lent Offering Campaign for three years (1959–62) to raise three million Japanese yen each year in order to support overseas (0.3 million) and domestic (1 million) missions, and various social ministries (0.6 million) with 0.1 million for campaign expenses. For a small Church of less than 30,000 members, the NSKK exhibited a huge commitment in the post-war era.

Like other ecclesial bodies in the Anglican Communion, the NSKK took seriously the manifesto of ‘Mutual Responsibility and Interdependence in the Body of Christ’ (MRI) passed in the Pan-Anglican Congress held in Toronto in 1963,¹⁶ which encouraged each Church to carry out missions in locally appropriate forms, but bearing witness to the unity of the Anglican Communion. Earlier strategies in Anglican mission had focused on establishing self-sufficient national Churches based on ethnic, cultural, and economic hierarchies, but the MRI pointed to equal relationship among member Churches accountable to and interdependent with each other.¹⁷ Accordingly, the NSKK began to share its personnel and financial resources with the Churches in the Philippines and Papua New Guinea as mission partners, sending Japanese missionaries to teach and serve with them and providing pastoral care and legal service to the Filipino migrant workers in Japan.¹⁸

Korea

After the Second World War Koreans finally gained their independence. Before they could launch post-war reconstruction, however, the Korean War broke out in 1950 between the Democratic People’s Republic of Korea backed by the Soviet Union, and the Republic of Korea supported by the United States. When the war ended, five million lives had been lost, numerous families separated, and the country was divided into the North and the South by the thirty-eighth parallel. The Anglican Church of Korea had run a small house for lepers in Chungju and an orphanage for unwanted girls in Suwon before the Korean War. After the war, it also opened a rescue home for refugee children in Pushan.¹⁹ Facing the daunting tasks of rebuilding and defending the nation, the government of South Korea made industrialization and economic development its top priorities. In the implementation of these policies, however,

¹⁶ Eugene R. Fairweather (ed.), ‘Mutual Responsibility and Interdependence in the Body of Christ’, *Anglican Congress 1963: Report of Proceedings* (Toronto, 1963), p. 118.

¹⁷ Ian T. Douglas, ‘Anglicans Gathering for God’s Mission: A Missiological Ecclesiology for the Anglican Communion’, *Journal of Anglican Studies*, 2 (2004): 9–40, esp. pp. 33–6.

¹⁸ Hiroshiichi (浦地洪一) (ed.), 日本聖公会宣教 150 年の航跡 [*One Hundred and Fifty Years of the Nippon Sei Ko Kai*], pp. 218–28.

¹⁹ Richard Rutt, *The Church Serves Korea* (London, 1956), p. 43.

many corrupt actions were committed, and many injustices were perpetrated against the poor and the disenfranchised. Plots of land were confiscated to build factories without compensation, and numerous peasants lost farmland and jobs. To boost economic growth, taxation policies favoured businesses, while labourers were exploited and no unions were allowed. Bishop John Daly was consecrated in 1935 as bishop of Gambia and the Rio Rongas (1935–51) and of Accra (1951–5), the youngest bishop in the Anglican Communion. He also became the bishop of Korea (1955–65) and then bishop of Taejon (1965–8). To support the hard-pressed labourers he initiated an industrial mission in the mining areas in 1961. He urged the Anglicans in Korea, a small denomination among Korean Christians, not to be satisfied with building a little Church with a little congregation, but to preserve the sense of adventure and zeal for the kingdom of God by showing solidarity with the people living on the margins of society.²⁰ In the same spirit, St Peter's School was opened in 1975 to offer special education for intellectually disabled children.

In the name of national security, the government adopted an authoritarian rule. Of the six presidents in this period (1945–93), three were former military generals, and all had used police forces to suppress protests and demonstrations, citing such laws as the Anti-Communist National Security Law (1948) and the Yushin Constitution (1972).²¹ Many political dissidents and social activists were arrested, tortured, court-martialled, imprisoned, and murdered. Witnessing such injustice, some leaders of the Anglican Church of Korea, which was recognized as an Anglican Province in 1992, joined other Christian and civil leaders to pursue democracy and justice in two particular ways.

The first was support for the Democracy Movement. According to a study conducted by the Stanford Korea Democracy Project (2007), the top three social groups that staged the largest numbers of protest events against the government between 1972 and 1992 were students (1,116 times, 33.54 per cent), labourers (714 times, 21.46 per cent), and Christians (409 times, 12.29 per cent).²² In comparison, social groups that self-identified as other religions only participated 16 times (0.48 per cent). Well-known leaders of the Democracy Movement included Christian clergy such as Revd Mun Ik-hwan, Revd Pak Hyong-kyu, and Cardinal Kim Su-hwan.²³ None of these was Anglican,

²⁰ John Daly, 'Letter from the Bishop', *Morning Calm*, 66 (1963): 3–7.

²¹ Diane Kraft, 'South Korea's National Security Law: A Tool of Oppression in an Insecure World', *Wisconsin International Law Journal*, 24 (2006): 627–59.

²² Gi-Wook Shin, Paul Y. Chang, Jung-eun Lee, and Sookyung Kim, 'South Korea's Democracy Movement (1970–1993): Stanford Korea Democracy Project Report', sponsored by The Korea Democracy Foundation, Shorenstein Asia Pacific Research Center, Stanford University (Stanford, CA, 2007), p. 19.

²³ Paul Yunsik Chang, 'Carrying the Torch in the Darkest Hours: The Socio-Political Origins of Minjung Protestant Movements', in Robert E. Buswell and Timothy S. Lee (eds.), *Christianity in Korea* (Honolulu, 2006), pp. 195–220.

but their leadership received wide support and made a deep impact on many pro-democracy groups, including Anglicans. Their actions were inspired by the liberation theology of Latin America and the *Mingjung* theology of Korea. Liberation theology insisted on God's compassion for the poor, and urged the Church to fulfil its prophetic mission to proclaim God's justice in the world. *Mingjung* theology encouraged the *mingjung* (mass, crowds) to assert their God-given dignity and human rights and warned about the eruption of *Han* (hate, resentment, indignation) that is the result of the unbearable suffering of oppression and exploitation. *Han* can either be a destructive force of violence and revenge, or a creative energy for revolution and transformation. According to Terry Brown, the Christian Socialism of F. D. Maurice espoused the gospel as a jubilee for the poor, and was an Anglican heritage that also encouraged the Anglican Church of Korea to participate in the pro-democracy movements.²⁴ The courageous participation and willing sacrifice of the Christians in the Democracy Movement, according to Archbishop Paul Kim of the Anglican Church of Korea, attracted many Koreans to join the Church.²⁵ Christian contribution to the Democracy Movement did not only take the form of political protests. It also included advocacy for other causes of justice, such as the Anglican priest Cho Hwa-sun of the Urban Industrial Mission (UIM), who helped organize the first woman-led pro-labour union at the Dongil Textile Company in 1972.

The second way in which democratization and justice were advocated was in the Sharing House Movement. Protests were a show of the force of *Han* (hate) against oppressors. The Anglican Church of Korea focused their efforts on the Sharing House Movement in the 1980s to support the victims of industrialization and urbanization.²⁶ Reverend Kim Hong-il, a leader of the movement, believed that a better way to defeat the abuse of power was not to fight it with violence but to change *Han* into *Dan* (self-denial love) and share it with the oppressed.²⁷ The purpose was to restore the image of God in poor people and help them become new persons and new communities grounded in the gospel of love. The mission was to help them solve their own problems and find ways to live in cooperation, solidarity, and love with one another. The staff members of this movement were mainly students, especially seminary students, who moved into slums to provide friendship, counselling, education, and legal support to poor families, orphans, abused women, migrant workers, and the

²⁴ Terry Brown, 'Korea and a Century of Anglican Communion, 1914–2014', Sungkonghoe Theological School 100th Anniversary Lecture, 28 Apr. 2014.

²⁵ Interview with Archbishop Paul Kim, Primate of the Anglican Church in Korea, 24 July 2014.

²⁶ Committee for Sharing Houses, '20 Years Mission History of Sharing Houses', unpublished committee report (Seoul, 2006).

²⁷ Cited in Mark Barry, 'Breaking Korea's Vicious Circle', *Link Letters on CMS*, <<http://churchmissionsociety.org/our-stories/breaking-koreas-vicious-circle>> (accessed 17 May 2017).

homeless. There were about seventy Sharing Houses organized and each was led by a priest who conducted worship for the community and offered assistance to the poor to deal with family, employment, and legal issues. This was a radical model of social ministry, not 'to the people' but 'with the people', and it took a priest's vocation out of a parish of believers into a neighbourhood of all the people.²⁸ Archbishop Paul Kim was a trainer for seminarians to serve in Sharing Houses.²⁹ It is remarkable that even now, one-third of the Anglican Church of Korea's 200 clergy are serving in such social ministry sites.³⁰

Taiwan

The history of the diocese of Taiwan began in 1954 when Bishop Harry Kennedy of Hawaii in the Episcopal Church (USA) sent the priests Theodore Yeh and Charles Gilson to establish St John's parish in Taipei. After fifty years of Japanese occupation (1895–1945) and the devastation of the Pacific War (1941–5), Taiwan had meagre resources for rebuilding. It was also a dangerous time because the Communists in China that defeated the Nationalists under Chiang Kai-shek in 1949 were attempting to launch a cross-strait attack on Taiwan.

In its beginning the diocese was composed of Chinese Anglicans of Zhonghua Shenggong Hui who had fled to Taiwan with Chiang Kai-shek, Episcopalians in the American Army stationed in Taiwan, and some foreign businessmen. In terms of its social ministries, child education was the most successful. The first Chinese bishop, James C. L. Wang, started three kindergartens in 1965, and now the diocese runs eight kindergartens offering such excellent childhood education that many parents compete to send their children. Bishop Wang also founded the Hsin-pu Institute of Technology in 1966, which trained thousands of professional technicians to meet the economic needs of Taiwan in its industrialization programme. In 2005, it was upgraded and renamed as St John's University, as an heir to St John's University in Shanghai founded by Bishop Samuel Isaac Joseph Schereschewsky in 1879.

AFTER THE ECONOMIC BOOM OF THE 1980S

With determination and hard work, the post-war reconstruction in East Asia produced an economic miracle in the 1980s. Hong Kong, Japan, Korea, and

²⁸ Barry, 'Breaking Korea's Vicious Circle'.

²⁹ Interview with Archbishop Paul Kim in Seoul, Korea, 24 July 2014.

³⁰ Yang Guen-Seok, 'The Anglican Church of Korea', in Ian S. Markham, J. Barney Hawkins IV, Justyn Terry, and Leslie N. Steffensen (eds.), *The Wiley-Blackwell Companion to the Anglican Communion* (Chichester, 2013), pp. 289–99 (p. 290).

Taiwan became the so-called 'Four Dragons of Asia' that supplied major capital, high-tech knowledge, and low-priced products to the markets of the world. Life conditions for people living in these countries were greatly improved, but the disparity between the rich and the poor also quickly and hugely increased. The Anglican Churches began to face new challenges of distributive justice and world peace.

Hong Kong

In the late 1970s, Hong Kong offered free trade to attract international banks and businesses, and its economy took off. The colonial government could now afford to finance religious groups to provide educational programmes and social services to residents. With government support, the Anglican Church's social ministries made huge strides. They became institutionalized, their staff professionalized, and their management upgraded.

In 1997, the British government handed Hong Kong over to the People's Republic of China, and in 1998 the HKSKH became the province of Hong Kong and Macao with Bishop Peter Kwong as its first primate. Though the youngest and smallest province in the Anglican Communion with only three dioceses, one missionary area, and a total of 39 parishes, it runs 30 kindergartens, 60 primary schools and 30 secondary schools, manages 400 social welfare agencies, hires 4,000 full-time social workers, and operates on an annual budget of HK\$1.2 billion.³¹ It manages one of the biggest and most effective social ministries in the Anglican Communion. Its wide-ranging social services include innovative programmes for the elderly, clinics for AIDS patients, centres for new immigrants, and agencies to support foreign workers and domestic maids. In order to coordinate hundreds of agencies and programmes with stability and efficiency, the HKSKH incorporated its social ministries under the Hong Kong Sheng Kung Hui Welfare Council Limited in 2001.

What is the new vision of social ministry for the HKSKH? Archbishop Paul Kwong believed that the HKSKH should recognize its hybrid identity in an international city. Hong Kong has become a megalopolis with diverse ethnicities, nationalities, and social classes, so its social services should be open, inclusive, and smart.³² But to ensure that the Church's social services do not lose their Christian foundation its social services work integrally with parishes and schools in what he called a 'three horse drawn carriage'—parish ministry,

³¹ Hong Kong Sheng Kung Hui, *The Sixth General Synod 2nd-6th June 2013 Handbook* (Hong Kong, 2013), p. 16; Hong Kong Sheng Kung Hui Welfare Council Limited, 香港聖公會福利協會有限公司. 步武基督：香港聖公會的社會服務，1849-2013 [*Imitate Christ: The Hong Kong Sheng Kung Hui Social Services, 1849-2013*] (Hong Kong, 2014), p. 1.

³² Paul Kwong, 'The Hong Kong Sheng Kung Hui', in Markham et al. (eds.), *Wiley-Blackwell Companion to the Anglican Communion*, pp. 253-62, esp. p. 257.

school ministry, and social ministry as equally important, seamlessly collaborated, and advancing in the same direction. It is important to note two historically significant documents which explained the theological purpose of the social ministries of the HKSKH: 'The Hong Kong Sheng Kung Hui School Education Policy' and 'The Hong Kong Sheng Kung Hui Social Service Policy', which were discussed and accepted as guidelines in its sixth General Synod (June 2013). The policy paper on school education reconfirmed its mission as to promote the ethos of Christian whole-person education that can be best summarized in Proverbs 22:6 'Train children in the right way, and when old, they will not stray.'³³ The policy paper on social service describes the Church's social service as 'the embodiment of the incarnation, where Godly love is made manifest in the community' and it should 'complement the evangelical and pastoral endeavours of the Church to promote harmonious relationship between God and mankind, and between the world and the individual'.³⁴ It also explicitly stated that the purpose of social service is to help all people to attain abundant life as Jesus promised in John 10:10 and to make sure that the underprivileged can be cared for (Luke 4:18–19).

Japan

In the 1980s Japan became a powerhouse in the global economy whose prosperity improved life conditions, but materialism and consumerism produced serious negative side effects. Pressure in workplaces increased. Family relationships were threatened. Commercial success did reboot Japanese confidence, but it also worried Asian countries that a strong Japan might turn aggressive again. In this economic and social environment, the NSKK continued to excel in ministries of education, medicine, and services. It now operates two theological colleges, five universities, four women's junior colleges, two nursing colleges, ten middle and high schools, sixty-three kindergartens, and two hospitals.³⁵ To address new concerns of Japanese society, it has begun to build retirement homes and nursing facilities to take care of the ageing population and set up programmes to support migrant workers from Southeast Asia.

Having received assistance from the United Kingdom, United States, and Canada to rebuild its churches after the Second World War, the NSKK never forgot the favour and became active in the missions of the Anglican Communion. In 1995 it held a conference on mission recognizing human rights,

³³ Hong Kong Sheng Kung Hui, *The Sixth General Synod (2nd–6th June 2013) Handbook*, p. 34.

³⁴ Hong Kong Sheng Kung Hui, *The Sixth General Synod (2nd–6th June 2013) Handbook*, pp. 17–18.

³⁵ <<http://anglicansonline.org/world/japan.html>> (accessed 23 Mar. 2015).

justice, and the environment as the central issues of mission, and declared, 'We are resolved to become a Church whose purpose is the restoration of their rights and position in society to those who suffer and are despised as "little ones"'.³⁶ It also resolved to change the social order that creates and supports discrimination and oppression. So it partnered with the Anglican Church of Korea, a country Japan once occupied, to convene the First Japan–Korean Mission Conference in Fukuoka in 1984, and signed the Japan–Korea Missionary Exchange in 2004. There are now more than ten priests from the Anglican Church of Korea serving as evangelists and pastors in the NSKK. Besides filling in the shortage of clergy in the NSKK, this is also an impressive witness to equality and unity in the context of the frequent racism against Koreans in Japanese society.

The NSKK has also acknowledged its complicity in the aggression and sporadic support for the Japanese imperial army during the war.³⁷ On the occasion of the fiftieth anniversary of the end of the Second World War, the participants of the 1995 Mission Consultation proposed on 31 August 1995 to the House of Bishops to confess and assume their responsibility for allowing and supporting their government's wartime aggression against other countries.³⁸ Accepting that proposal, the NSKK passed a resolution entitled, 'Statement on War Responsibility of Nippon Sei Ko Kai' (Resolution 34) in its forty-ninth Regular General Synod (1996), which is worth citing:

- (1) The Nippon Sei Ko Kai, after 50 years since the end of World War II, admits its responsibility and confesses its sin for having supported and allowed, before and during the war, the colonial rule and the war of aggression by the State of Japan.
- (2) The Nippon Sei Ko Kai confesses to God and apologises to the people in Asia and the Pacific that we did not admit our fault immediately after the end of the war, were unaware of our responsibility for the past 50 years, and have not actively called for reconciliation and compensation until today.
- (3) The Nippon Sei Ko Kai confesses that, even after the war, it has yet to get rid of discriminatory attitudes. We pray that we will be changed to recognise our mission to do justice as the people of God, and, as the vessels of peace, to listen to the voices of the divisions, pains, cries and sufferings of the world.³⁹

³⁶ Executive Committee of the 1995 Nippon Sei Ko Kai Conference on Mission 1995, *Report of the '95 Conference on Mission* (Tokyo, 1995), cited in Renta Nishihara, 'The Nippon Sei Ko Kai (The Anglican Communion in Japan)', in Markham et al. (eds.), *Wiley-Blackwell Companion to the Anglican Communion*, pp. 263–71 (p. 271).

³⁷ William L. Sachs, "Self Support": The Episcopal Mission and Nationalism in Japan', *Church History*, 58 (1989): 489–501, esp. p. 500.

³⁸ 'Declaration of the Japanese Church: 1995 Nippon Sei Ko Kai Mission Consultation', in Historical Society of the Episcopal Church, *Anglican and Episcopal History*, vol. 65, no. 4: *Nippon Sei Ko Kai: Essays on the Church in Japan* (Austin, TX, 1996), pp. 479–88.

³⁹ 'Nippon Sei Ko Kai: 49th Regular General Synod Excerpt from May 23, 1996 Minutes', in Historical Society of the Episcopal Church, *Anglican and Episcopal History*, vol. 65, no. 4: *Nippon Sei Ko Kai: Essays on the Church in Japan*, pp. 489–91.

To make its confessions public, the NSKK also issued an official document, 'A Declaration Concerning the War Responsibility of Nippon Sei Ko Kai', at the 1998 Lambeth Conference.

The NSKK also made efforts in this period to support the oldest indigenous people in Japan, the Ainu people, as well as Koreans born in Japan, and the *Barukumin* (Japanese social outcasts). To stand in solidarity with the Koreans born in Japan who were denied citizenship and discriminated against, the Sei Ko Kai Ikuno Centre was established in Osaka in 1992 to promote dignity and respect for every person in the society. There are also a few million *Barukumin* who are ethnically Japanese but socially discriminated against because their ancestors were butchers, tanners, and executioners, which Buddhists and Shintoists considered 'unclean'. They were forced to live in segregated neighbourhoods, prohibited from mingling with other social classes, and their children were denied access to education. Some business corporations still keep a secret list of these people, so they continue to be discriminated against in jobs and marriage. In 2014 the General Synod passed a resolution (Resolution 25) asking Japanese legislators to make laws to prohibit hate crimes and hate speech against minorities including the *Barukumin*. This has become one of the major efforts of political and social advocacy of the NSKK.

Japan was caught off guard by the 9.0 Richter scale earthquake of Tohoku on 11 March 2011, resulting in 30,000 people dead or missing. The subsequent breakdown of the Daiichi nuclear power plant polluted a vast area of land and sea. In response to these natural and human disasters, the NSKK began to support the victims with a programme called 'Let Us Walk Together', and to join in protest with other concerned citizens against the danger of nuclear energy. In its 2012 General Synod, the NSKK passed a resolution affirming its opposition to nuclear power generation. Many parishes also organized study groups to educate their parishioners and to challenge the nuclear industry, energy businesses, and government officials to take their ecological responsibility seriously to safeguard the life of citizens and the environment.

Korea

Compared to other Churches in South Korea, the Anglican Church of Korea is a small denomination with only three dioceses, 120 parishes, and 65,000 members, but it has done well in social ministries, and in this period attempted to be an instrument for peace between the divided Koreas. In 1993, Kim Young-sam was elected the first civilian president after thirty years of military dictatorship. On 15 June 2000, President Kim Dae-jung issued a North-South Joint Declaration to allow the two states to begin negotiations towards reunification, starting with humanitarian aid and commercial exchanges. Since 2003, the Six Party Talks (North Korea, South Korea, Russia, China, United

States, and Japan) aimed at ending North Korea's nuclear programme has not accomplished much.

In recent years, the Anglican Church of Korea took proactive measures to seek reconciliation with its sworn enemy Japan and find peace with North Korea. It hosted the First Worldwide Anglican Peace Conference, TOPIK (Towards Peace in Korea), in Paju, 14–20 November 2007. This conference was held pursuant to the 1998 Lambeth Conference (Resolution 26) that called for peace, reunification, and cooperation between the government and people of the divided Koreas. Delegates from more than twenty countries made a peace trip to North Korea to see how South Korean companies support projects in North Korea, convened to hear Korean experiences of war and conflict and its hope for forgiveness and reconciliation, and explored possible ways to establish permanent peace in the region. Its official communiqué agreed with Archbishop Francis Kyong-Jo Park of the Anglican Church of Korea, who said, 'as servant members of the Body of Christ, we are called to be apostles of peace in a world where discord and conflict are prevalent'.⁴⁰ In Archbishop Park's view, to make peace is to transform 'unjust structures of the society', which is one of the five marks of mission of the Anglican Communion.⁴¹ In keeping with the effort to promote reconciliation and peace, the Anglican Church of Korea also co-hosted with the NSKK the Second Worldwide Anglican Peace Conference held in Okinawa, Japan, 16–22 April 2013.

Taiwan

In Taiwan, economic growth also improved the life of the people after 1980. Bishop David Lai continued to place childhood education at the centre of the Episcopal Diocese of Taiwan's social ministry, though he has centralized the earnings from kindergartens to support other ministries in the churches. Two other examples of social ministry in this period also deserve attention.

The Centre of Community Service for the Elderly at the Great Shepherd Church in Taipei since 1999 has provided various classes of interest to healthy

⁴⁰ Official Communiqué by participants of TOPIK, held in Paju, South Korea, 20 Nov. 2007.

⁴¹ The Anglican Consultative Council (ACC) in 1984–90 proposed the 'five marks of the mission' to serve as a practical checklist for the churches in the Communion engaging in missions: (1) to proclaim the Good News of the Kingdom, (2) to teach, baptize, and nurture new believers, (3) to respond to human need by loving service, (4) to transform unjust structures of society, to challenge violence of every kind and to pursue peace and reconciliation, and (5) to strive to safeguard the integrity of creation and sustain and renew the life of the earth. Anglican Consultative Council, *Bonds of Affection* (Sixth Meeting, 1984), p. 49. Anglican Consultative Council, *Mission in a Broken World* (Eighth Meeting, 1990), p. 101.

senior citizens, such as foreign languages, singing, dancing, arts, and medical information. Guided by the priest, and led by trained social workers and staffed by volunteers, this centre has become a place where senior citizens in the neighbourhood can find friendship and learn life skills. Working with a local hospital, volunteers also monitor the health condition of these senior citizens, sending them to the hospital for check-ups or bringing prescription drugs to them. Taiwan is an 'ageing society' where more than 14 per cent of the population is aged over 65 years, and many of the elderly people suffer from chronic diseases and live alone.⁴²

In the port city of Keelung, the After-School Programme of the Holy Trinity Church was established to respond to the needs of many schoolchildren in the neighbourhood who do not have parental guidance after school. Many of these children were failing in school and some had become gang members. The after-school programme was set up at the church in 2005 to help these children study. To invite them in, the young priest Richard Lee knocked down the wall of the church facing the street and built a wide door and a huge transparent window so that children on the street could see what was going on in the church. Volunteers of the church tutored their study and gave them dinner because many of their parents had to work night shifts and could not cook for them. For over ten years, this programme has helped more than 300 children to improve their grades and behaviour at schools. Some went on to study in good colleges and found jobs. As a result, some of the children and their parents became Christian and many others joined the church, so the membership grew sevenfold in ten years. The city government was so impressed with the outcome of this initiative that it now pays social workers to work with this programme in the church.

CONCLUSION

This brief history of the Anglican social ministries in East Asia has shown how Anglican and Episcopal Churches, though small in numbers and, except for the HKSKH that benefited from the British colonial heritage, limited in resources, have tried their best to share the love of God with the disenfranchised and the marginal in their local communities. Starting with early missionaries in the mid-nineteenth century, these Churches have provided aid to refugees, cared for the poor, educated girls, and healed the sick. They introduced Western medicine and education, and worked respectfully and harmoniously with other religious groups in charities and services. In

⁴² Ju-Hsueh Yen, 'A Case Study of Community Care Center Management of The Church of Good Shepherd in Shihlin District', Master's thesis, Soochow University, 2012, p. 1.

overwhelmingly non-Christian societies, their social ministries have been the most effective witness to the Christian gospel. As their countries went through radical changes in politics, society, and the economy brought about by the forces of imperialism, nationalism, militarism, and democracy in the twentieth century, these Churches, now self-supported and self-governed, also responded to many challenges and crises with courage and wisdom. Though still small in numbers, they have won genuine respect from many of their compatriots and neighbours. The foreign religion that came to this area at the heels of imperialism has gained some respect and trust because of these Churches' selfless service to the most vulnerable, their willing sacrifice for social justice, and their earnest call for world peace.

SELECT BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Arnold, Alfreda, *Church Work in Japan* (Cambridge, 1905).
- Brown, Terry, 'Korea and a Century of Anglican Communion (1914–2014)', Sungkonghoe Theological School 100th Anniversary Lecture, 28 Apr. 2014.
- Buswell, Robert E. and Timothy S. Lee (eds.), *Christianity in Korea* (Honolulu, 2006).
- Committee for Sharing Houses, '20 Years Mission History of Sharing Houses', unpublished committee report (Seoul, 2006).
- Corfe, Charles J., *The English Church Mission in Corea: Its Faith and Practice* (London, 1917).
- Domestic and Foreign Missionary Society of the Protestant Episcopal Church of the United States of America, *An Historical Sketch of the Japan Mission of the Protestant Episcopal Church in the USA* (3rd edn., New York, 1891).
- Douglas, Ian T., 'Anglicans Gathering for God's Mission: A Missiological Ecclesiology for the Anglican Communion', *Journal of Anglican Studies*, 2 (2004): 9–40.
- Executive Committee of the 1995 Nippon Sei Ko Kai Conference on Mission, *Report of the '95 Conference on Mission* (Tokyo, 1995).
- Gray, G. F. S., *Anglicans in China: A History of the Zhonghua Shenggong Hui* (New Haven, CT, 1996).
- Historical Society of the Episcopal Church, *Anglican and Episcopal History*, vol. 65, no. 4: *Nippon Sei Ko Kai: Essays on the Church in Japan* (Austin, TX, 1996).
- Hong Kong Sheng Kung Hui, *The Sixth General Synod 2nd–6th June 2013 Handbook* (Hong Kong, 2013).
- Hong Kong Sheng Kung Hui Welfare Council Limited, 香港聖公會福利協會有限公司. 步武基督：香港聖公會的社會服務，1849–2013 [*Imitate Christ: The Hong Kong Sheng Kung Hui Social Services, 1849–2013*] (Hong Kong, 2014).
- Ion, Hamish, *The Cross and the Rising Sun: The British Protestant Missionary Movement in Japan, Korea, and Taiwan, 1865–1945*, 2 vols. (Waterloo, ON, 1993).
- Kwong, Paul, 'The Hong Kong Sheng Kung Hui', in Ian S. Markham, J. Barney Hawkins IV, Justyn Terry, and Leslie N. Steffensen (eds.), *The Wiley-Blackwell Companion to the Anglican Communion* (Chichester, 2013), pp. 253–62.

- Lee, Jae-Jeong, *The Centennial History of the Anglican Church of Korea* (Seoul, 1990).
- Markham, Ian S., J. Barney Hawkins IV, Justyn Terry, and Leslie N. Steffensen (eds.), *The Wiley-Blackwell Companion to the Anglican Communion* (Chichester, 2013).
- Nishihara, Renta, 'The Nippon Sei Ko Kai (The Anglican Communion in Japan)', in Ian S. Markham, J. Barney Hawkins IV, Justyn Terry, and Leslie N. Steffensen (eds.), *The Wiley-Blackwell Companion to the Anglican Communion* (Chichester, 2013), pp. 263–71.
- Paton, David M., *The Life and Times of Bishop Ronald Hall of Hong Kong* (Hong Kong, 1985).
- Rutt, Richard, *The Church Serves Korea* (London, 1956).
- Sachs, William L., '“Self Support”: The Episcopal Mission and Nationalism in Japan', *Church History*, 58 (1989): 489–501.
- Shin, Gi-Wook, Paul Y. Chang, Jung-eun Lee, Jung-eun, and Sookyung Kim, 'South Korea's Democracy Movement (1970–1993): Stanford Korea Democracy Project Report', Shorenstein Asia Pacific Research Center, Stanford University (Stanford, CA, 2007).
- Urachi, Hiroshiichi (浦地洪一) (ed.), 日本聖公会宣教 150 年の航跡 [*One Hundred and Fifty Years of the Nippon Sei Ko Kai*] (Tokyo, 2012).
- Ure, Gavin, *Governors, Politics and the Colonial Office: Public Policy in Hong Kong 1918–58* (Hong Kong, 2012).
- Whybray, R. N., *The Church Serves Japan* (London, 1956).
- Yang, Guen-Seok, 'The Anglican Church of Korea', in Ian S. Markham, J. Barney Hawkins IV, Justyn Terry, and Leslie N. Steffensen (eds.), *The Wiley-Blackwell Companion to the Anglican Communion* (Chichester, 2013), pp. 289–99.

Index

- African Initiated Churches (AICs) 322
African National Congress (ANC) 327, 330, 332, 339
Afrikaner churches 324, 326
Ajiith, Kon 288–9
Aladura Movement 130–3
Anglican Church of Melanesia 51–3
Anglican Church of Mexico 100–1, 116–17, 119–21
Anglican Communion 258–60, 302–4
Anglican conflict 117–21
Anglican orders 307–9
Anglican Province of the Southern Cone 107–8
Anglicanism
 historiography 8–10, 25–30
 identity 5, 7–14, 19–21, 113–17, 242–55
 mission 2–4, 15–16, 62–6, 78–80, 98–102, 173–4, 232–56, 277–81, 322–3, 367, 370–2, 376, 384–9, 392–5, 417–20
 and political struggle 108–13, 138–9, 247–53, 281–6, 294–339, 342
apartheid 330–2
Armenian Apostolic Orthodox Church 313–16
Azariah, Vedanayagam Samuel 43–4, 46–7, 397–8, 400–1, 403
- Bete Israel* (Falashas) 199–201
Bible Churchmen's Missionary Society (BCMS) 201–2
Book of Common Prayer 8–11, 43, 107, 114, 120, 152, 163–4, 166, 198–9, 261–3, 271–4, 303, 406–8
Buddhism 89–91
- Calata, James 327–8
Cathedral of Christ the Saviour, Moscow 316–18
Chambers, George 223–4
China 160–4, 421
Christian presence 384–9
Chung Hua Sheng Kung Hui (CHSKH) 148–64
Church autonomy 104–8, 113–15
Church conflict 139–40, 184–91
Church's Mission to the Jews 200–2
Church Missionary Society (CMS) 34–9, 43–4, 173, 180–2, 197–9, 234–8, 245, 253–5, 277–81, 285, 369, 375, 393–5
Church of Bangladesh 412–13
Church of Ceylon 410–12
Church of England 1–2, 4–5, 7, 26–8, 30, 84, 99, 101–2, 160, 266–8, 304–18, 370, 391
Church of North India 405–9
Church of Pakistan 409–10
Church of South India 403–5
Church of the Southern Cone 107–8
Church schools 17, 127–30, 155–6, 182–4, 238–41
Church–state relations 234–41
Church Union 399–403
colonialism 9–11, 125–7
Comely, John 189–90
contextualization 119–21, 142–4
Coptic Church 376–7
Cottesloe Consultation 332–3
Cragg, Kenneth 93–4
Cuba 108–10
culture 142–4, 174–6
- Dalit Christianity 396
decolonization 9–11
devolution 253–5
Dinka Church 277–8, 280–1, 286–94
diocesanization 42–7
Diocese of Chile 107
domestication, religious revivals 222–7
- ecumenism 80–3
education 64–8, 70, 106, 119–20, 127–9, 155, 165, 181–3, 236–46, 252, 277–80, 283, 285, 289, 291, 297, 331, 346, 348–60, 363, 365, 391, 394–5, 418, 420–1, 428–32
Edwardes College, Peshawar 351–2
Egypt 372–5
enculturation 13–19
Episcopal Church of Brazil 105
Episcopal Church of the South Sudan 296–7
eschaton 216–18
Ethiopia 198–201, 202–6
Ethiopian Orthodox Tewahedo Church 197–9
evangelism 16, 106, 131, 159, 173, 234–5, 238–9, 249–50, 254–6
- Falashas see *Bete Israel*
Fellowship of Saint Alban and Saint Sergius 309–10
female circumcision 185–91, 245

- Gairdner, William Temple 376–8
 Gambella and Asosa regions 206–8
 Gardiner, Allan 99
 Ghana 138–9
 Gibson, Paul 272–3
 Gobat, Samuel 197–9
- Haiti 269–70
 Hall, Ronald Owen 159–60, 164–5, 422, 425–6
 health care 55, 64–7, 155, 238–9, 279, 394–5, 421, 424
 Holiness Movement 368–70
 homosexuality 11–12, 118–19
 Hong Kong Sheng Kung Hui (HKSKH) 164–6, 421–2, 425–6, 431–2
 honour and shame 218–22
 Huddleston, Trevor 328, 339
- inculturation 13, 37, 258–9, 260–4, 267–71
 India 391–9
 indigenous, indigenization 12, 58–61, 237–41, 395–9
 Indirect Rule 240, 249
 institutionalization 35–6, 237–41
 inter-faith relations 16–17, 78–80, 84–6, 136–8, 301–7
 Isenberg, Carl Wilhelm 198
 Islam 91–5, 136–8, 372, 380–3, 385–6
ituika *see* female circumcision
- Jando* rite 244–5
 Japan 423, 426–7, 432–4
 justice 428–30
- Kairois document 337–8
 Kanyingi, Nuhu 175–6
 Kikuyu 172–6
 Kim, Paul 429–30
 Kinsolving, Lucien Lee 100
 Korea 423–4, 427–30, 434–5
 Kwong, Peter Kong-kit 165–6, 431
- Lambeth Conference 5, 46–7, 84, 102–3, 153, 161, 254, 264, 271, 302, 311, 401, 405, 407, 409, 434–5
 Latin America 98–105
 Li Tim Oi, Florence 160–1
 liberalism 127, 322, 325–6
 liberation theology 72, 104, 112, 429
 literature, religious 377–8, 380
 Liturgical Movement 273–4
 local leadership 134–6
 Lusaka Statement 338
- manyano* movement 242–3
 mass media 144–5
- medical mission *see* health care
 Melanesian Brotherhood 53–5, 60–1
 mission 1–13, 21, 25–47, 51–5, 57, 59–67, 78–83, 100–3, 106, 109, 112, 115, 126–30, 134–7, 145, 149, 152, 155, 157–9, 165, 173–4, 176, 179, 181–4, 189–91, 199, 203, 208, 226, 232–56, 276–81, 283–4, 322–4, 335, 345–8, 358–9, 367–89, 392–403, 417–20, 424–9, 432, 435
 mission stations 176–8
 Mothers' Union 46, 59, 67, 74, 242–4
 Mumbi, Emily 177–8
 murals, as religious art 269–70
 Muslims *see* Islam
 Mutual Responsibility and Interdependence (MRI) 427
- nation-building 247, 321, 339–40, 420
 National Congress of British West Africa 126, 248
 nationalism 125–7
 Nigeria 139–40, 142–3, 363–5
 Nippon Sei Ko Kai 423, 426–7, 432–4
 non-proselytization 204
- Order of Ethiopia 323–4
 ordination *see* Anglican orders
 Ottley, James 112
- Padwick, Constance 379–89
 Palestine 353–7
 Pan-Anglican Congress 1, 6, 30, 40–3, 80
 Papua New Guinea 51, 57, 61–8
 Pentecostalism 140–2
Pilgrim's Progress, The 212, 214–15
 Polynesia 68–71
 power 54–5, 178–9
 Pratt, Mary Louise 28–9
 prayer 385–6
- race 31–3, 41–3, 115–16
 Ramsey, Michael 312
 refugees 207–8, 290–4
 religious orders 66–7, 152–3
 revivalism 215–18, 222–7
 Rwanda 211–16, 219–20, 222–7
- St George's Anglican School, Jerusalem 355
 St John's College, Agra 349–51
 St John's School, Haifa 354–5
 St Matthew's Church, Addis Ababa 204–5
 St Stephen's College, Delhi 347–9
 Satterlee, Henry 313–15
 Scott, Michael 329
 Second World War 55–8, 63–4, 157–60
 Singh, Sadhu Sundar 398

- Skipper, Dora 213–14, 222
 slavery 33–4
 Social Ministries 17–18, 155–6, 420–7, 431–2, 435–7
 Society for Promoting Christian Knowledge (SPCK) 30–4
 Society for the Propagation of the Gospel in Foreign Parts (SPG) 30–4, 39, 202, 204
 South American Missionary Society (SAMS) 99, 101, 106
 Sri Lanka 78, 89–91
 Sudan 358–61
 Sudan People's Liberation Army (SPLA) 294–5

 Taiwan 430, 435–6
 Tanzania 361–3
 tasliya 377
 Taylor, John V. 191–3
 theology
 and culture 71–3
 in dialogue 86–9, 311–12
 liberation *see* liberation theology
 Thornton, Douglas 376–8
 Tranquebar Manifesto 401–3

 Truth and Reconciliation Commission 341–2
 Tutu, Desmond 335–8

 Uganda 234–55
 United Society for the Propagation of the Gospel (USPG) 204–5
 Universities Mission to Central Africa (UMCA) 233, 240, 243–4, 254

 Venn, Henry 5, 27–8, 36–7, 39, 400
 Voegeli, Charles Alfred 269–70

 Warren, Max 93, 253
 Wickremesinghe, Lakshman 89–90
 Wiles, Maurice 87–8
 women's ministry 59–60, 70
 women's movements 133–4, 152–3, 243–5
 World Missionary Conference, Edinburgh, 1910 6, 30, 40–1, 44, 53, 77, 80–2, 345, 369–71, 400–1

 York Statement 263–5, 270–1

 zones of contact 19, 29–30, 32, 34, 39, 44–7